CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION AND MOTIVATION

The motivation for this project involved many, complex and conflicting roles. This project represented both opportunities and risks.

First my role as a student. During the pre-registration phase of my Master’s degree in the field of paper sculpture and three-dimensional application of paper, I was approached by Donald Pols Coordinator for FOEI in May 2002 through a referral by Phumani Paper. It was seen as an opportunity to link the design of this project in a way that would benefit my research. In doing so, I was challenged to adapt the project to fit my research idea of introducing a new method of using paper pulp to cast craft products.

Second was my role as an artist. The assignment I was given was to design sketches and produce a clay doll resembling the original prototype supplied by FOEI. The methodology used for this assignment was similar to that used to create new artworks. Available materials were sourced, as was a range of literature on paper sculpture. A week later I presented the designs and sketches, which were accepted by FOEI. Literature such as *Mould Making*, by John Colclough (1999), was useful in providing possibilities of different ways to construct plaster and ceramic moulds.

Third was my role as an organizer, community facilitator and activist at Phumani Paper. For the past two years, I have been involved as Project Manager and Co-ordinator for the Twanano Paper Project at Ivory Park, south-east of Pretoria. Twanano is a project of the Phumani Paper Poverty Alleviation Programme which focuses on papermaking and the jobs that are created as a result. The Twanano Papermaking Project trains local...
unemployed people to make handmade paper and paper products on a commercial basis, using recycled waste paper and locally-sourced milkweed fibre\(^1\) (*Asclepias fruiticosa*). The range of products and skills in the group are focused on packaging and stationary.

Phumani Paper is also an environmental program. Office waste paper is also collected through the Iteke Recycling Centre\(^2\) at the Eco-Cities project which, like Twanano, is located in Ivory Park. There is an abundant supply of the invasive milkweed bordering the sprawling informal settlement of Ivory Park. This plant fibre is processed into beautiful eastern style sheets of paper.

Phumani Paper represents a long-term investment by artists, scholars and students in policies, programs and people. Phumani Paper is based at the University of Johannesburg formerly known as Technikon Witwatersrand (TWR) and headed by Programme Director Kim Berman who is also a senior printmaking lecturer in the Fine Art Department. According to Berman (2002) Phumani Paper, which started off as a research activity, developed over a period of two years into a poverty alleviation programme. During this time, outreach projects were set up in the Winterveld in North West Province. The Department of Art Culture Science and Technology (DACST) – now divided in two ministries known as the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC) and the Department of Science and Technology (DST) – subsequently awarded funds to the then TWR, now known as the University of Johannesburg (UJ), to set up a pilot project in Eshowe, Kwazulu-Natal. Funding was received for a pilot study in Eshowe, Kwazulu-Natal.

As a result of the success of the pilot project, DACST gave Ms Berman and her students a brief to develop packaging for the Zulu pot industry with a view to promoting tourism in that region. Minister Ben Ngubane was impressed with the concept and requested Kim Berman to put in a proposal for a larger national poverty relief programme. That proposal developed into the Papermaking Poverty Relief Programme for hand-made paper

---

\(^1\) The invasive plant that grows alongside the Olifantsfontein road.

\(^2\) A community waste recycling centre in Ivory Park.
processing technologies. Later on, the programme was renamed Phumani Paper which means, “Go out there and reach out”.

![Fig.1.2. David Tshabalala next to Phumani Paper banner. Photograph: Neo Lusiba](image)

The brief of the poverty alleviation project was to establish hand-papermaking as a suitable technology for rural development nationally. In the first phase, Phumani Paper established 21 papermaking projects in several provinces and created 460 jobs. Twanano is one example of local Phumani Paper Projects within Gauteng province.

The project HOV was attractive for several reasons. First, it was initiated by FOEI for the 2002 WSSD in Johannesburg. It was consistent with my role as environmental activist. The HOV Programme was initiated by FOEI as a way of participating in the WSSD. The FOEI sent one of the representatives, Donald Pols, from the Netherlands to identify South African artists and communities who could participate in the manufacture of ten thousand paper dolls and contribute towards the design and the making of the Waste Mechanical Giant.  

The HOV project was consistent with my role as an artist and employee at Phumani Paper. This project was intended for the opening ceremony of the WSSD in the courtyard of Sandton Convention Centre. Phumani Paper, the poverty alleviation programme in which I was involved, nominated me to assist FOEI with this project.

3 An eight metre high figure constructed of waste matter to represent corporate and industrial worlds. A separate commission which forms part of the HOV Programme.
The HOV project was consistent with my role as student. I decided to use this experience as part of my research project in critically examining use of paper pulp as a medium for three-dimensional figurative sculpture and using HOV intervention as a model for similar future projects.

From my perspective as a community facilitator and activist, this research study could also be regarded as a ‘journey’ that documents the situation from the time that the project was implemented by FOEI, through the making of the dolls, to the situation that existed after the WSSD.

The project could also help substantially many people, in many ways. The implementation of the Programme included the employment of two hundred people from disadvantaged communities in and around the Gauteng province. These ten community projects were identified around the north of Pretoria and Johannesburg areas. Eight of these community projects are situated in clinics, which have existing infrastructure, and offer employment opportunities within the communities they serve.

FOEI is an environmental organisation and funded this project which created short-term employment in South African disadvantaged communities for a three-month period. The HOV project achieved some benefits. The organisation managed to partially achieve its objectives of six thousand paper dolls and the Waste Mechanical Giant which provided an impressive display at the opening ceremony for the WSSD. The ten targeted communities received an income during the three month period. Results and outcomes revealed that the HOV Programme implemented by FOEI was a viable project that could be linked to Phumani Paper projects in terms of technology, thereby maximising its potential. Phumani Paper – a project with a considerable track record, a strong infrastructure and a willingness to expand its programme – would also be an ideal vehicle to implement the production of three-dimensional paper pulp sculptures in the future.
The HOV project also had many weaknesses, first was the short employment expectation that had been created in communities resulted in almost no project continuity. Communities began to struggle financially, others left projects for better jobs, while others died of HIV-related illnesses.

From the point of view of my research, the HOV project was not ideal. It should be noted that the HOV project was implemented as part of the WSSD, and not initiated as a research activity. However by using PAR methodology to conduct this research study, I was able to analyse retrospectively the first phase of HOV intervention in 2002. Thereafter, the use of PAR also enabled me to conduct a case study to extract impacts that could be viable. This research study could also be regarded as a ‘journey’ that documents the situation from the time that the project was implemented by FOEI, through the making of the dolls, to the situation that existed after the WSSD.

THE ORGANISATIONAL CONTEXT OF THE PROJECT
The name *Hear Our Voice* was given by FOEI to the programme which was supposed to comprise of an art installation of ten thousand waste paper dolls and a waste mechanical giant, and to include the involvement of ten community projects in the design and production of those dolls. The programme was initiated by FOEI with the aim of “reminding the government officials at the Summit of the real needs that should be central to the negotiation during the WSSD conference” (*Hear Our Voice*, Art for the Summit: online).

The implementation of the HOV Programme included the employment of two hundred people from disadvantaged communities in and around the Gauteng province as well as other groups and individuals by FOEI.

FOEI (2002) is a global federation of four national environmental organisations founded in 1971 by France, Sweden, England and USA. It is highly decentralized and democratic: every two years there is a week-long general meeting where the policies and activities of the federation are decided, in which all members have an equal say. FOEI is also an active member of the Environment Liaison Centre International and the World Conservation Union. It participates in a number of issue-oriented networks and has consultative status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations (ECOSOC) and all relevant UN bodies.

At the first meeting, Donald Pols presented the mission and objectives of the FOEI, which were to implement a project for the opening of World Summit on Sustainable Development in September 2002 to local artists. At his request, I provided him with a proposal for FOEI to assist in initiating several community projects aimed at the mass production of ten thousand bio-degradable waste dolls from waste paper within a period of twelve weeks, rather than FOEI having to organise this through the already-rich corporate companies in South Africa. The proposal used the Phumani Paper model and together with the organisers identified projects that were located locally in Gauteng Province in order to manage implementation effectively.
Aims and Objectives of the HOV Project

The primary aim of FOEI’s proposal for the production of ten thousand dolls was to make a statement about the impact that disadvantaged people have on the planet. The second aim was to educate people on ways of creatively managing waste, and offer them possibilities on how to generate an income from waste. The third was to educate disadvantaged people on conserving the environment. These aims were in line with the objectives of Phumani Paper, and made it possible to establish and maintain the links, both to my work as a Project Co-ordinator for Phumani Paper and to my research interests.

The HOV Programme initiated by FOEI for the WSSD had specific objectives which were, inter alia, to:

- Promote FOEI around the world.
- Welcome delegates to the Summit at the Sandton Convention Centre, Sandton, on 1st August 2002.
- Promote environmental awareness and waste management.
- Take a statement to government that many people are struggling to survive.
- Represent people around the world who could not attend the WSSD (personal communication with Pols, 14 May, 2002).
OVERALL AIMS OF THE RESEARCH PROJECT

Fig.1.5 The Hear Our Voice exhibition at the Sandton Convention Centre, 1 September 2002. Photograph: Donald Pols, FOEI

This study occurred in two stages. The first was an initial assessment to document the HOV programme, and the second a follow-up assessment to evaluate the outcome 18 months after the end of the HOV Programme.

The first phase of my presentation of the HOV Programme has three aims:

- To document the HOV Programme, which was commissioned specifically for the WSSD, as a case study.
- To analyze the amount and type of participation involved in the HOV Programme
- To determine the immediate and short-term accomplishments of the HOV Programme
The follow up assessment of the HOV Programme has four aims:

- To document the activities that occurred after the WSSD;
- To assess the impact the HOV Programme had on the lives of the participants and their communities in a social, economic and educational sense;
- To identify new ideas, methods and resources for improving their quality of life; and
- To identify opportunities for applying the lessons learned for integration into the Phumani Paper Programme.

The importance of this research

This research will address three important aspects regarding the use of paper pulp for the creation of three-dimensional figurative sculptures that may be able to reduce poverty in certain communities.

- The sustainability of a project like HOV as a self-generating community initiative. Sustainability in terms of the social, economic and environmental aspects will be addressed in this regard.
- The transfer of technology and skills involved in the use of paper pulp for casting and for sculptural projects.
- The successful use of indigenous craft knowledge in local communities by improving the already existing craft knowledge.

This research will also assess how PAR can be used effectively to increase the effectiveness of poverty alleviation programs. This method was retrospectively applied to assess the first phase and then used in the second phase.

OVERVIEW OF CHAPTERS

Chapter 1 will introduce the research project and outline the aims and objectives. I will also highlight the context of the study in this chapter, as well as motivating and presenting the importance of the choice of this study.
In Chapter 2, I will present the theory of PAR and view its relevance to this study. I will also present the literature used as a contextual frame of reference for this project, including academic disciplines, government agency policy and programmes, organisations and institutions, and media information on this type of research design and methodology. This includes catalogue sources published during the WSSD. In addition, the three pillars of sustainable developments - social, economic and environmental - will be reviewed against a background of HIV/AIDS, crime, poverty, skills and technology transference, and the recycling of waste. This chapter relates the research to some of the objectives of the 2002 WSSD, and concludes with a discussion of indigenous craft.

In Chapter 3 I will present and contextualize the research design used in this study and present PAR as a research design as used by Caroline Wang and Ernest Stringer. The methodology presented in this chapter refers to the technical methods used to achieve FOEI’s set objectives of producing ten thousand paper dolls.

Chapter 4 will present the findings from the initial assessment. The participation of all stakeholders in the HOV Programme will be presented in table 1. Table 2 will present all HOV projects, their background and participation in the HOV Programme. Table 3 will present the number of men, women, youth and disabled participants involved in HOV during the WSSD. The logistics of the implementation of the project will be discussed, and the immediate and short-term outcomes from the HOV project presented.

Chapter 5 will discuss the questionnaire used and present the assessment of the HOV programme by unpacking and assessing four visited projects. The goals will be measured by assessing aims of the study, data used and the analysis of data.

Chapter 6 is the concluding chapter. It will be divided into three sections, namely; discussion, general findings and conclusion.
Conclusion

Using the lessons of the case study- the project can be adapted/ transferred and used together with existing Phumani Paper projects in various provinces. It could increase income and create further sustainable employment. The conclusion will show that the use of the framework of research, training and experience that have been used by the HOV Project would be advantageous for use by possible new projects. It is my hope that this research paper, apart from its academic fulfilment, can be a case study and working document for practical implementation in relieving poverty and developing skills in many communities.

Fig.1.6 Participants of Twanano Papermanking Project learn about PAR applications. Photograph: Emily Squires
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW
INTRODUCTION

While examining the importance of the wide variety of literature surveyed for this research project, Chapter 2 also explores in some detail the four basic fields that pertain to this dissertation. I have tried to highlight the relationship between these four basic fields namely: sustainable development, technology transfer, indigenous craft and participatory action research (PAR).

**Sustainable Development** will be focused on in respect of recycling and waste management, which the WSSD identified as key objectives. I will also discuss why sustainable development was a challenge in the HOV programme. Sustainable development will be looked at in terms of the following issues:

- Social issues, including HIV, AIDS and crime;
- Economic issues, including poverty relief; and
- Environmental issues, including waste re-use and recycling.

**Technology Transfer**, the second section of this Chapter, introduces paper technology and use of paper pulp as a three-dimensional medium for the production of sculptural forms. Against this background, the HOV programme will be used as a case study to demonstrate the efficiency of a waste management project that creates poverty relief.

**Indigenous Craft** is the subject of the fourth section, which includes how the concept of craft has been seen by government and how craft was introduced into the various HOV projects. In addition, in the fourth section we will discuss the introduction of new designs and products in the Phumani Paper Poverty Alleviation projects.
Participatory Action Research (PAR) or active, community-based research, will be introduced and detailed in this section. PAR was used retrospectively in the initial assessment of the programme, and used in the follow-up assessment of the HOV programme. This section will show how PAR relates to my research and how the methodology was applied to this project.

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT
Sustainable Development has become a challenge in many of the craft projects. I have looked at the issue of sustainability in terms of different types of crafts – such as local, traditional dolls and indigenous craft methods – and in terms of the various different cultures and traditions from which the different HOV project participants come. Even though, from HOV’s inception, sustainability in terms of South African communities was not an anticipated outcome of the programme, I chose to review the literature pertaining to sustainable development in order to inform similar, future programmes.

According to Elliott (1994:5) in An Introduction to Sustainable Development, sustainable development is defined as “development, which meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of the future generations to meet their own needs.” I will examine both aspects of this definition relative to the HOV project. How effectively did it meet the needs of the present? And how effectively did it create the conditions for meeting future needs?

Elliott (1994:4) further defines sustainable development as a “development that is likely to achieve lasting satisfaction of human needs and improvement of the quality of human life”. Elliott extends sustainability to include participatory and democratic qualities:

“Sustainable development requires participatory action which has an identification with the democratic community because it depends on the legitimacy and trust with which governments are perceived and the sense of citizenship which enables individuals to participate. It also requires that poverty is not treated like a disease that some people
have and others do not: it must be seen as a result of conscious political decisions which can be challenged and changed over time” (1994:35).

As mentioned previously, prior research in sustainable development has identified three basic aspects: economic, social and environmental. These will be addressed below.

**Social Aspects**

O’Riordan (1995:41) in *Environmental Science for Environmental Management*, identifies the social aspects of sustainability: “It is economic and social improvement that is continuous and permanent; durable and reliable; proactive and just; enterprising and sharing.” The social aspects of sustainability are especially important in South Africa if they ameliorate two serious problems, the HIV/AIDS epidemic and crime. Both these problems were evident in HOV programmes.

The development of skills and attitudes are two other social aspects of sustainability. Once these took place in the HOV programme, they could be generalized by participants and used in other projects. It was not the original objective to create sustainable social support from the projects due to the fact that many of those targeted are situated in clinics and that most participants were HIV-positive and received medical and social support from those clinics. In these cases however the social objectives were to uplift participants’ self-esteem as well as to involve them in the WSSD activities.

O’Riordan’s definition of sustainability also involves the sustainability, not just of a single project but of the “social fabric”. According to Holden (2003:22) in *Aids on the Agenda*, “AIDS should be seen as a question of human rights, because many of the impediments to behaviour change are linked to the denial of people’s basic right, such as access to food security, health care, and education.” The FOEI showed the WSSD audience and the public how the HOV programme could enhance the lives of HIV-positive people and people living with AIDS.
AIDS, however, also affects social development, because the families of those sick from an AIDS-related disease will likely spend time providing care instead of dealing with family poverty. As a result of the AIDS epidemic, creative abilities are lost because additional effort was required to deal with the disease.

Allen and Thomas (2000:98) in *Poverty and Development*, record a debate about how to treat problems of poverty and disease. “There is a disagreement about the best ways of combating diseases of poverty. In particular, there is a long-standing debate about whether selective biomedical interventions should be the main focus of public health programmes or whether the most effective way forward is to deal with the underlying problem of poverty itself.” The selection of community clinics for the HOV Projects addresses in a small way some of the underlying social problems that HIV/AIDS poses.

The relationship between poverty and crime is also strong. Rogerson (1991:344) highlighted urban crime in the following statement: “Urban crime is now perhaps the most important constraint upon investor confidence; and given also that much urban crime is a product of urban poverty, there is potentially strong complementarities between urban economic growth and poverty alleviation.” To the extent that HOV projects continue to help in alleviating crime, they are also potentially socially sustainable.

**Economic Aspects**

This section will discuss the economic sustainability of the HOV programmes. There is a link between the sustainability of an HOV programme and poverty alleviation: the more sustainable the HOV programme is, the greater the number of ways in which that programme is able to help alleviate poverty.

Poverty can be defined as “a lack of resources to meet basic needs, such as adequate food, clothing, shelter and basic amenities also it represents the inability to meet higher-order of needs, such as the needs for personal fulfilment, recreation and freedom” (DBSA, 1998;37).
The South Africa Ministry for Welfare and Population Development (Moleketi, 1997:online) defined poverty even more broadly than merely lack of means:

“Poverty is about lack of access, lack of power, lack of income and resources to make choices and take advantage of opportunities. In other words, poverty is not about those who are poor in terms of income. It affects everybody, not just those who are its victims. The entire society suffers from loss of people’s creativity.”

The effects of poverty are not uniform and may vary depending on whether people live in urban or rural areas. According to O’Connor (1991:112) in Poverty in Africa: A Geography Approach, “Poverty is affected by expenditure. Income considered adequate in rural areas where people are growing their own food and maintaining their own houses, might be grossly inadequate in a city where accommodation has to be rented and food has to be bought.” He further suggests that the effects of urban poverty are compounded: “Various expenditure surveys show that poor urban dwellers spend most of their income on food, yet in spite of these diets are deficient in both quality and quantity.”

This suggests that HOV projects may be more sustainable because of the differential effects of poverty in urban areas, like townships. Many of the targeted HOV projects are located in townships. Most of the people who live in townships in the HOV projects have demonstrated serious and unmet economic needs.
Environmental Aspects

We have seen how the HOV projects emerged as a result of fundamental concerns about the environment. The more they address the concerns, the more likely HOV projects are to be sustainable.

When the City’s first State of Environment (SoE) was released in 1996 the following priorities were identified through a process called “Land Development Objectives”:

1) Pollution (air, water, land and noise)
2) Waste Management
3) Open Space
4) Conservation
5) Poverty
6) Environmental Health (The Long Walk to Sustainability, 2002: 78).

Environmental sustainability has been measured by the extent that “re-use” of waste occurs. According to O’Riordan (1995:472) “Many countries encourage a hierarchy of waste management, which generally favours waste minimisation, re-use and recycling over landfill and incineration without energy recovery.”

Furthermore, relations exist between poverty and waste recycling. “In developing countries, recovery of recyclable materials is an important source of income for many poor people” (O’Riordan, 1995:474).
TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER

The literature on handmade paper production includes two broad methods: casting paper and sculptural creations. A literature of craft exists in manuals, books and catalogues, and it plays an important role in research, in the acquisition and transfer of skills, in developing ideas and in marketing and managing a project.

Some of the literature on paper craft is conceptual as well. According to Dawson (1995: 106) in *The Art and Craft of Papermaking*, “one of the most dramatic developments to have extended the vocabulary of papermaking is recognition of paper’s sculptural potential.” Its ability to assume almost any form and still be lightweight makes paper a perfect medium for creating three-dimensional works.

Sculptural Aspects

![Sculptural Aspects](image)

Fig.2.2. Papier-mâché sculptures from the SOMOHO group in Soweto. Photograph: David Tshabalala

One of the outcomes of the three-dimensional application of paper-based technology is that it is an exciting new medium with the potential for further development and that it can be used to create and enhance opportunities for income generation. For example, a diversity of craft products such as bowls, lampshades, jewellery and toys can be designed and produced using this cost-effective and accessible technology.
According to Beecroft (1979: 10) in *Casting for Sculptures*, “Papier-mâché is bits of paper soaked in glue, which are then moulded into a new form (as in a sculptural figure) or applied over an existing form (such as a can, jar or box). The finished object is then painted, decorated, and varnished.”

During doll production in the HOV projects, recycled paper would be pulped down to produce hand-made paper that would be dipped into a mixture of flour and water and then layered inside the ceramic moulds to form similar dolls⁴.

Now that I have looked at the different approaches in making paper sculptures, I will present indigenous craft within a South African context.

**INDIGENOUS CRAFT**

Local and indigenous crafts can result in new designs and products that prove to be more sustainable because of different talents that can emerge. Such craft has been seen by government as a means of poverty alleviation in South Africa.

Government departments have shown an interest in community development and poverty alleviation projects by investing millions of rands in art and craft development. Traditional crafts have proved to be one of the keys to socio-economic growth and development. South Africa is blessed with a rich cultural tradition with artistic individuals and communities living in all corners of the country.

“Traditional crafts are products that are adopted from traditional crafts in response to changing circumstances, new materials or the changing demands of markets. An example of these is baskets woven from telephone wire, using traditional techniques and patterns. They are brightly coloured and intricate because of the nature of the industrial material” (Raza and Du Plessis, 2002: 77).

---

⁴ This technology of cast paper pulp was taught to Phumani Paper researchers and trainers in a workshop offered by New York paper artist, Robbin Silverberg in 2000. I adapted her technique to cast the paper dolls. As far as I know this is a new application of this three-dimensional paper technology.
Steven Sack (2003: 15) in *Co-existence: Contemporary Cultural Production in South Africa*, a director in DACST at the time, supports this use of indigenous craft: “It is the tangible resources - the language, stories, songs and craft skills - that constitute a central part of the arsenal in the fight against poverty. It is these resources that government, and in particular the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC), must mobilize.”

He also makes reference to the cultural strategy used by government in addressing poor communities, as he writes;

“For the craft industry, the premise was that contemporary crafts needed to be rooted in traditional crafts, and that the practices of previous generations of crafters, the environment in which they lived and produced, and the meanings and symbols attached to their production, were all vital sources of inspiration and affirmation for contemporary producers” (2003: 14)

It is clear, therefore, that indigenous craft has the potential to exercise a positive influence on socio-economic development and growth in South Africa, and to help alleviate poverty. I will discuss how indigenous craft has been applied in the HOV programme in Chapter 4. Now I will now look at the methodology used in PAR.
PARTICIPATORY ACTION RESEARCH (PAR)

The literature and use of PAR is discussed extensively in the next chapter on methodology since elements of PAR was essential to the HOV projects and my research. Group and individual participation was vitally important to the development of the HOV programme and plays an important part in this research project.

I have used Caroline Wang’s table of participation (1998: 76) in the Photovoice project⁵ as a guideline in mapping the participation in the HOV Programme. Wang has identified four types of participation: contractual, consultative, collaborative and collegiate. Contractual participation refers to the process whereby people agree to take part in the enquiries or experiments of research projects. In consultative participation people are asked for their opinions and consulted by researchers before interventions are made. In collaborative participation researchers and local people work together on projects designed, initiated, and managed by researchers. Collegiate participation occurs when

---

⁵ An innovative participatory action research method in which people photograph their everyday health and work realities and participate in group discussions about their photographs.
researchers and local people work together as colleagues with different skills to offer, in a process of mutual learning where local people have control over the process.

**Conclusion**

This Chapter has looked at the objectives of the HOV Project and related them to available literature sources. I have discussed the potential contribution that the HOV programme has made in the development and marketing of local, traditional crafts. There is no precedent in South Africa of which I am aware, that uses cast three-dimensional paper pulp sculptures as a medium for production in the craft industry. There is also a limited body of literature relevant to the technical aspect of this study. PAR however will be presented in detail in the fourth chapter, which shows in detail the first phase of the HOV project through the use of table formats.
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

INTRODUCTION

This chapter explores how PAR is the most appropriate research design to assess the impact of the HOV Programme. I will discuss different stages of participation by all participants (including disadvantaged communities) in the HOV Programme. Key literature on PAR is directly applicable to the participatory nature of the project, taking into account the extensive network of collaborators. Although FOEI did not intend HOV to be a PAR project, the application of this methodology in analysing this project reveals important strategies and lessons that are directly applicable to the future sustainability of Phumani Paper. I will conclude this chapter with the introduction and discussion of the four projects (out of the original ten) that I chose as case studies to analyse 18 months after they were set up for the WSSD. The chapter will be divided into three sections, namely, research design, methodology and logistics for the implementation of projects.

MOTIVATION FOR RESEARCH DESIGN

Ernest Stringer (1999:72) in *Action Research*, presents a rationale for the naturalistic, PAR approach to research which was used in the design of this study. This approach was guided by the research methodologies of both Stringer and Wang. The research presented here is action-focused and exploratory.

As has been clarified already, the HOV programme was not set up either as a research or a long-term project. The structure of the project was limited and temporary by design. Immediately after the WSSD, the FOEI management team left South Africa for Netherlands. Many HOV-targeted communities had to close as a result. In addition, some of the projects had a significant dropout rate of participants who were affected by deteriorating health conditions from HIV and AIDS-related illnesses.

Despite these limitations, the HOV Programme provided an important opportunity for Participatory Action Research. In addition to the extensive network of participants used
by HOV, an elaborate array of action methods was also used – including skills transfer, production, motivation and culture awareness. Our initial observations revealed that, even though FOEI left no funding or operational provision for continuity, these activities resulted in significant empowerment in term of skills transferred in all the HOV projects.

**Position of the Research facilitator**

![Figure 3.1 David Tshabalala participating in the co-operative inquiry at SOMOHO.](image)

Photograph: Boitumelo Malefo

PAR is a suitable methodology for use by the research as facilitator, because it is a community-based research method in which the researcher is both facilitator and analyst. Since this project involved the collaboration of many people, my research focused on participation by all stakeholders. PAR focuses on active, community-based research. In this section I will introduce the wide range of participants and collaborators, including trainers, station managers, co-ordinators, NGOs, and organisations and institutions. Relevant PAR sources will be listed and reviewed, and the PAR for project implementation and assessment in South African disadvantaged communities will be evident.

As previously stated, I was contracted as a local facilitator for FOEI. My roles included motivating the projects’ participants and checking the quality of dolls produced. In addition, I was tasked with developing the prototype used as a guide to produce paper
doll. In 2004, 18 months after the WSSD, I visited four of the HOV projects as a research facilitator. My roles during these visits were not only to assist these remaining HOV projects, but also to conduct a co-operative inquiry and group interviews with them.

According to Stringer “the researcher may be described as a consultant, resource person, scribe, or co-participant whose role is to assist people, rather than control them” (1999: 174). My role as research facilitator will be discussed in the following chapter.

THEORY OF PAR AS A RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Caroline Wang uses an innovative participatory action research method called Photovoice, in which she uses photography and text to create: “a participatory health promotion strategy in which people photograph their everyday health and work realities and participate in group discussions about their photographs. In this way, they highlight personal and community issues of greatest concern, and reach policy makers, health planners, community leaders, and other people who can be mobilized to make change” (2004: 95).

In the Photovoice process people in the community are provided with cameras “to record and reflect their community’s assets and concerns, to discuss issues of importance to the community in large and small groups to promote critical dialogue and produce shared knowledge and reach policy makers” (Wang, 1998: 560).

In all participatory action research, researchers are also facilitators who contribute richly to group discussions. As a facilitator in the HOV Programme my role was similar to the photovoice facilitation process, although photovoice was not used in this intervention.

PAR was considered as an appropriate methodology to evaluate the HOV programme for several reasons. First it involved the participants as part of the research and was therefore

---

6 A sociologist lecturer in Michigan University in the School of Public Health and deals with health behaviour.
democratic. Secondly participants come from marginalized and financially disadvantaged communities.

The University of Alberta website describes PAR thus: “Participatory Action Research has its roots in a resistance to the dominance of positivistic social science and scientific management. Action research had three features that self-consciously differentiated it from the social research of the time: it was participatory, self reflective and explicitly committed to social change” (An Introduction to Participatory Action Research: online).

According to Mouton (2001:150) in How to succeed in your Master’s & Doctoral Studies, “PAR is the study that involves the subject of research (research participants) as an integral part of the design.” In the HOV programme the subjects of research were all communities involved in the intervention. For this reason, programme participants used different approaches as a way of contributing to the HOV programme.

These ‘common peoples’ are usually perceived as unable to take part in the so-called ‘scientific knowledge, but PAR is a bridge which enabled them to get involved in the research process. By using PAR-type approaches to introduce the HOV programme to existing projects in June 2002, as a researcher and activist I have been able to access the underlying problems and challenges in communities participating in the production of dolls. Reason and Bradbury (2001: 292) in Action Research, asserted that this “… is different to the traditional way of conducting research activity where people are treated as passive subjects rather than as active agents.” Instead PAR conducted with people rather than on people. It also acknowledges that ordinary people are capable of developing their own ideas.

According to Reason and Bradbury (1998: 292), “Co-operative inquiry avoids personal comments but promotes group discussion. It is also important because it provides opportunity for reflection as a key to the maintenance of continuing development of ‘good’ practice.” As a system of investigation, co-operative inquiry has proved more
effective than traditional qualitative approaches in facilitating the production of owned and usable knowledge in the HOV projects.

According to Cornell (1986:10) in *The Glomour of Prospecting*, PAR strategy has a double aim: “The first aim is to produce knowledge and action directly useful to a group of people through research, through adult education, and through socio-political action. The second aim is to empower people at a second and deeper level through the process of constructing and using their own knowledge.”

In the broader context of a South African development programme, PAR is an appropriate research methodology for community-based research within disadvantaged communities because it offers local participants a platform to voice their opinions. The communities know and understand their underlying problems, and it is necessary to involve them in finding solutions.

In the HOV context, PAR is not only about the impoverished participants in the projects: it also includes everyone who contributed during the implementation, the production process and exhibition of the dolls. At the end of the production process, each project within the HOV programme was given a chance to design and produce dolls that represented their particular group culture and identity. The process allowed them to explore new designs and making of other paper products, with a view to possible future income-generating opportunities.

Following my visits to all four HOV projects to evaluate the impact of the HOV programme during the WSSD and in people’s lives, participants were able to find better solutions for their problems.

According to Mouton (2001:150), most types of PAR have a political commitment to the empowerment of participants and to changing their social conditions. During my visits to the various projects the issues of long-term sustainability, as well as the efforts needed to change their social situations, were looked at. The follow-up assessment process looked at
the HOV programme as a whole, its successes and failures in addressing poverty relief and ways in which projects understand long-term sustainability.

This section has provided a brief context and literature survey on PAR and, in Chapter 3, I will expand on how PAR has been applied in the HOV project.

THE TWO PHASES OF THIS RESEARCH PROJECT
As presented above, this research had two stages: the initial assessment (which was initiated by FOEI) and the follow-up assessment of the HOV Programme.

Methods of Data Collection
Several data collection methods were used during the initial and follow-up assessments. These include observation, documents and interviews, and will be discussed below.

Observation
Participant observation was used more during the initial than the follow-up assessment. Observations were shared at weekly meetings by the trainers and co-ordinators and operational adjustments were made according to the programmes.

Documents
During the HOV project intervention in 2002 in which I was conducting training and motivating participants, I kept a daily journal of activities. I also took photographs of activities before and after the WSSD in 2002. In January 2004, I conducted group interviews while my research assistant Christine Lithebe was recording the activities with a video camera. I collected some ceramic moulds and prototypes of dolls immediately after the WSSD exhibition in October 2002 for recording purposes as well as for use in further research and development activities.

At the beginning of 2004, I revisited four of the HOV projects as part of the follow-up evaluation process. The intention behind these visits was to conduct co-operative inquiry to gauge the status quo and the progress the projects had made, as well as to facilitate
group discussions about the project’s problems and possible solutions. In February 2004, with the help of Professor Anton Muller from the Business Faculty at the TWR (now the University of Johannesburg), I designed a questionnaire for use by participants. The questionnaire was used as a tool to collect necessary information in a sample of four of the HOV projects, namely:

- Boikhutsong Support Group in Boikhutsong Village
- Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO) in Soweto
- Laudium Community Clinic Project “New Image” Project in Laudium
- Maitisong Art Centre in Yeoville

These specific projects were selected because, at the time, they were operating as fully functional projects and because a substantial number of their members were able to offer a clear explanation of the changes that occurred in their projects after the WSSD. Also, the conducting of research activities with four projects was an achievable task compared to gathering information from ten of them.

**Interviews**

Fig.3.2 Interviews in Laudium Community Clinic Project.
Photograph: Christine Lithebe

7 Out of these four projects Maitisong Art Centre in Yeoville has since closed down.
The questionnaire was used as a discussion guide for a focus group within each of the four projects. This process is referred to by Stringer as “co-operative inquiry”. It demonstrates people’s knowledge, views, understandings, interpretations and experience and it is a voluntary as well as an informed process.

The respondent questionnaire was designed prior to conducting interviews with the participants of HOV Projects. It was a difficult task to design and formulate the questionnaire that covers all aspects of interviews which will inform the data. My additional written and visual notes have been used to supplement information gathered from the questionnaire.

According to Stringer (1999: 173), “there is useful framework of relatively neutral and non-leading questions that minimize the extent to which participants’ perceptions will be governed by frameworks of meaning inadvertently imposed by researchers. Grand tour questions proved to be global because they enabled participants to describe their situations in their own terms.” Much of the information that was not reflected in the questionnaires was recorded on the tape recorder and provided the more global and general information gleaned from participants. For example I adapted questions like “What factors are needed to improve and expand your current market and income” This question opened a broader discussion that enabled participants to comment openly.

The questionnaire that was designed was used as a discussion guide (Appendix A). Instead of interviewing participants individually, I used group interviews because it enabled them to express their views without feeling threatened. In accordance with the plan for group interviews, each of them took less than three hours. Depending on the preference of participants, interviews were either conducted at project venues, or they were conducted outdoors under the shade of a tree on the site. Instead of applying the traditional qualitative interviews, I chose to use a method of co-operative inquiry because of its relevance to the HOV project. According to Reason and Bradbury (1998: 186) there are three basic areas within the co-operative inquiry process, namely cognitive and
methodological empowerment, political empowerment, and emotional and interpersonal empowerment. This will be expanded on in Chapter 5.

**Data Analysis**

As mentioned previously, out of a total of ten projects in the programme, a sample study of four projects was selected for in-depth examination, discussion and analysis. The analysis of the data will be incorporated into the broad findings discussed in Chapter 5.

**Credibility and Trustworthiness**

To establish the groups’ trust and reassure project participants of my own good faith for purposes of research, I provided each group visited with photographs of their project taken before and after the WSSD. I also sent them copies of the questionnaires used to conduct interviews in January 2004 that could be used to assist them in their planning.

**Limitations of the study**

One of the research limitations was the fact that PAR was applied retrospectively for part of the project. Another limitation was that FOEI did not conceive of HOV as a research project, but rather as a project aimed at awareness of the WSSD. It also became a difficult task to conduct research activities with HOV projects because of the complexity and nature of them. In other projects, such as SOMOHO and Maitisong Art Gallery, there was also a language barrier which made the discussion difficult because translation into three languages slowed down the process. Instability was another feature of the projects because they comprised an unstable population. Maitisong Art Centre is one example: here, two ex-offenders returned to prison immediately after the WSSD, while two others died from drug-related problems. In many of the projects members are affected by HIV/AIDS.

**Ethical Issues**

During the HOV project intervention in 2002, I had created a good relationship with all projects which made it relatively easy to establish a relationship of trust with the four selected projects for the purpose of the follow up interview sessions. In keeping with my
role as community facilitator and research student, I followed appropriate procedure by making telephone inquiries to each of the groups prior to any visits, in order to establish whether the project members would be interested in taking part in the research activity. I then gave each group a period of a month in which to consult and discuss whether they were interested in participating in the research interviews, as well as to propose topics for the discussion.

Typically these things are important:

- Participants agreed to participate voluntarily, and participants could answer any or none of the questions if they wished.
- Anonymity was maintained in that participants’ identities were not revealed in the reports.
- People were encouraged to keep what was said in the group interviews confidential.
- The groups accepted that their participation would be helpful for future projects and worth their effort and the potential risk.
CHAPTER 4
FINDINGS FROM THE INITIAL ASSESSMENT
INTRODUCTION
As indicated earlier, the initial assessment had three aims.

- To document the HOV programme, which was commissioned specifically for the WSSD as a case study.
- To analyze the amount and type of participation involved in HOV Programme.
- To determine the immediate and short-term accomplishments of the HOV Programme.

What follows is a description of the development of the projects, as well as the types of participation involved. I will then analyse the short-term accomplishments of the programme.

Preparing for the WSSD

Fig.4.1 Ceramic moulds were used to cast separate sections of the doll. Photograph: David Tshabalala
Table 1 shows the tasks involved in the programme and the weeks in which they occurred. Table 1 also indicates the participation of the various stakeholders in the activities. I have also divided the table into two sections, which address participation in the HOV Programme before the WSSD in 2002 and during the research phase between January and June 2004. The symbol “X” has been used to highlight the participation of each stakeholder. The TWR (now the UJ) has been included as the institution where this research activity was undertaken.

TABLE 1: ACTIVITIES AND PARTICIPANTS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities for HOV Project</th>
<th>Week</th>
<th>Site participants</th>
<th>Researcher/ training facilitator</th>
<th>Artists/Prod developers</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Trainers</th>
<th>FOEI Co-ordinator</th>
<th>FOEI media officer</th>
<th>FOEI Chairperson</th>
<th>FOEI International partners</th>
<th>Clinic Staff</th>
<th>Station Managers</th>
<th>Ceramicist</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Piki-Tup</th>
<th>Television/ Newspaper</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Ex-offenders</th>
<th>UJ (Research Supervisors)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Conceptualize problem, define broad goals and objectives</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Find local partners – sites</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Design and develop the prototype</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Plan implementation strategy and make budget allocations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Appoint Training Co-ordinator</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Appoint Station Manager</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Locate projects in the Gauteng region</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Develop community/public support</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Construct screens and moulds</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Deliver materials and equipment</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

8 This includes research in mould-making techniques and experiments in the Maitisong Art Gallery
9 Flour, fans and heaters, and paper making kits, A4 wood mesh screens, plastic vats, interfacing, and hard boards

35
### Activities for HOV Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week</th>
<th>Activity Description</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>23</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Train Papermaking in projects</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-7</td>
<td>Deliver moulds to projects</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Train Doll casting</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-9</td>
<td>Follow up training and quality control</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-9</td>
<td>Motivate groups and interviews</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Plan protest rally</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Implement protest rally</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop memorandum for Minister</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Present memorandum to Ministry</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Plan exhibition</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Delivery of dolls to the exhibition site</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Set up exhibition</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Open exhibition</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Activities for HOV Project**

- **Week**: Indicates the week the activity is scheduled for.
- **Participants**: Lists the participants involved in the activity.
- **Media**: Indicates whether the activity involves media participation.
- **Ex-offenders**: Indicates whether the activity is related to ex-offenders.
- **UJ (Research Supervisors)**: Indicates whether the activity is supervised by UJ.

This table outlines the activities planned for the HOV Project, including their specific details and the participants involved.
# Activities for HOV Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week</th>
<th>Site participants</th>
<th>Researcher/ training</th>
<th>Artists/Prod developers</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Trainers</th>
<th>FOEI Co-ordinator</th>
<th>FOEI media officer</th>
<th>FOEI Chairperson</th>
<th>FOEI International partners</th>
<th>Clinic Staff</th>
<th>Station Managers</th>
<th>Ceramicist</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Piki-Tup</th>
<th>Television/</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Ex-offenders</th>
<th>UJ (Research Supervisors)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Follow up Research Assessment Project

1. Conceptualize problem, formulate research questions
   - X

2. Develop methodology
   - X  X

3. Develop measures
   - X

4. Write thesis
   - X

5. Report results/ Data collection
   - X
Project Implementation

The HOV Project, which was used as my case study, began in May 2002, three months before the WSSD took place in Johannesburg. The main aim, according to Donald Pols of FOEI (2002) was to raise awareness of environmental and waste recycling issues, while simultaneously alleviating poverty in disadvantaged communities for a three-months period. Several meetings and presentations on the HOV Project were held with FOEI representatives in Braamfontein, which resulted in a strategic plan of action being drawn up.

PARTICIPANTS

During different stages of the HOV Programme many site people participated both directly and indirectly up to the opening of the WSSD in September 2002. Their participation as shown in Table 1 occurred mostly in the later weeks of the HOV project (starting with week 9), not in the planning and development. In the research, site participants only participated in developing the methodology of the study.

As described previously, Wang has identified four types of participation: contractual, consultative, collaborative and collegiate. The HOV Programme and the research used the first three at varying times during the project.

In the HOV Programme, ten community projects around North Pretoria and Johannesburg areas were contracted by FOEI to be part of the WSSD activities. Several instances of consultative participation occurred. Donald Pols approached Phumani Paper since recycling waste paper and skills development is part of its core business. As a community facilitator, research student and artist, I offered some input and opinion at this stage and was allocated time away from the work responsibilities of Phumani Paper in order to participate in this project.
Collaborative participation also occurred frequently. For example, Stephen Mokoena, Neo Lusiba and David Mogane were involved during the doll prototype design. The community Ceramicist, the waste management company (Piki Tup), trainers, FOEI co-ordinator, FOEI media officer, and the clinics also participated.

Collegiate participation, the most inclusive form of participation, was not a component of the HOV programme.

**Research student**

My role as both research student (pre-registered at the time for M-Tech degree) and community facilitator was a key to the HOV programme. I participated in a number of roles and functions. As a designer for the doll prototype, I visited all participating projects regularly to check the quality of dolls during the production stage and to motivate all participating members. I developed a technique of pulping the raw paper by rolling it on a wet floor.

![Fig.4.2 David Tshabalala with a doll prototype used to reproduce 6000 dolls: Photograph: TWR Audio Visual Unit](image)

**Artists**

The first ‘doll’ prototype was produced with the help of Maitisong artists Stephen Mokoena and Neo Lusiba, who were also on the Phumani Paper team. Mokoena’s role was to work with other rehabilitated offenders in Yeoville and assist in the overall coordination of the HOV Projects, while the primary role of Lusiba was to assist with creative ways of making the prototype with clay.
Trent Priest, a sculptor based in Arcadia in Pretoria, was contracted by the FOEI Co-ordinator to construct the 8-metre-high Waste Mechanical Giant to represent the corporate world. Although Priest did not participate in other community aspects of the programme, the Waste Mechanical Giant he designed was an important part of the march and display of the paper dolls at the opening ceremony of the WSSD.

**Community Ceramicist**

The completed prototype and plaster mould was then taken to ceramicist Julia van Schalkwyk in Pretoria, to be re-produced. Van Schalkwyk owns a community-based ceramics studio in Sunnyside where she produces ceramic products like sculptures, bowls and flower pots. She was contracted to produce 100 moulds within two weeks. Later on, she was contracted to run casting workshops in selected projects. She also attended the opening and farewell parties for the international FOEI members.

**Media**

Radio and newspaper media were invited by Lotte Asveld, FOEI Media Officer, to come to the launch. My role as researcher also required me to record the process. The following media were among those who attended proceedings and conducted interviews: *Sunday Time and, Sowetan*. On 16th July the *Sunday Times* conducted an interview at the Maitisong Art Gallery, which focused on the involvement of both the public and rehabilitated offenders from the project. Some of these participants were interviewed about their involvement with the Gallery and the possible impact the FOEI project would have on their lives.

The title of the newspaper article was *Breaking the Mould* and George Jali (33) was one of the ex-prisoners interviewed. According to the journalist, Nashira Davids (2002:17), “Jali raised his views about the HOV programme, emphasising the difference it had made in his life. Having once led a life of drug abuse, the project gave him the chance to earn an honest living and he had turned his back on crime.” This positive impact was a reason for the Project to continue. As Jali said in his interview: "I am very good with my hands; I used to roll the spliff (dagga cigarette) very well, today I am making sculpture very
well. I used to live on the streets and sell dagga just to buy food for my family, but now I know I don’t have to do that anymore. I am so excited to have my work at the Summit. I hope I will be famous one day” (Davids, 2002: 17).

The Audio Visual Department of the UJ documented some of the projects using video recordings, including Maitisong, while they were in the process of producing dolls. SAFM also conducted and broadcast interviews on the impact that the eight week long project had on people’s lives.

![Photograph: Phumani Paper](Fig.4.3 Casting a sheet of paper.

**Trainers**

During the collaborative stage three trainers – Julia van Schalkwyk, Stephen Mokoena and I – were contracted to train different HOV projects basic papermaking and casting dolls. Trainers’ responsibilities included improvement of production systems, quality control, motivating groups and visiting all projects at least once a week during the production time.
FOEI Co-ordinator (Donald Pols)

Donald Pols’s responsibilities included finding new partners, organising payments for completed dolls, organising weekly meetings with trainers and co-ordinators and inviting the local media to the sites. His responsibilities also included motivating HOV participants to meet the required numbers of dolls, co-ordinating the exhibition set up and organising WSSD entrance cards to the HOV exhibition.

FOEI media Officer (Lotte Asveld)

Lotte Asveld worked as a media officer during the production and exhibition of paper dolls. Some of her responsibilities included newsletters and inviting the media to different sites, as well as the opening and exhibition of six thousand dolls and waste mechanical giant. After the WSSD information gathered, including photographs taken during the WSSD, were made available for my research project.
Clinics
Since eight of the participating HOV projects were located in clinics, from where the dolls were produced, it was evident that the clinics played a major role in the period prior to the establishment of the programme as well as during production. Social workers had to play their part in providing information around history and background of those projects. Although these social workers were not fully part of the intervention process, they participated as group managers, as part of the health clinics.

Station managers
Social workers in other clinics were also contracted as stations managers. They were tasked to report issues like shortages of raw material or any foreseen problems to the co-ordinator telephonically or during site visits. In projects which were not located in clinics, the projects had to choose a station manager.

Public
Members of the public became involved in removing dolls from the Wits University building and packing them on the trucks for delivery to the exhibition space in front of Sandton Convention Centre. Since the HOV was about job creation it was also important to involve people from the city streets in the creation of awareness of the WSSD and to help make a difference.

TABLE 2: SUMMARY OF COMMUNITY PROFILES
Table 2 summarises the ten communities in the HOV programme. I have listed names of HOV Projects and the areas in which they are situated. I have also included their type of sponsoring organisation, a brief description of the HOV participants and whether or not the project existed before the WSSD. I have also included the number of participants already in an existing project and the number of individuals who participated in the HOV Programme.

I will use the following keywords in Table 2 to present the geographical location where HOV projects were based:
• Twp - refers to projects located in Townships and
• I.S. - refers to Informal Settlement.
• E – refers to Existing projects
• N – refers to New projects
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Service Location</th>
<th>Type of sponsoring organization</th>
<th>Description of participants in \textit{Hear Our Voice}</th>
<th>New (N)</th>
<th>Existing (E)</th>
<th># participants in organization</th>
<th># participants in \textit{Hear Our Voice}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soshanguve Community Clinic</td>
<td>Soshanguve Township (Twp.)</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>HIV+/AIDS patients</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boikhutsong Community Clinic</td>
<td>Atteridge Twp.</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>HIV+/AIDS women and patients</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boikhutsong Support Group</td>
<td>Mabopane Twp.</td>
<td>Department of Agriculture</td>
<td>Support group for Clinic, older women, disabled people</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laudium Community Clinic</td>
<td>Laudium Twp.</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>Men and women, some HIV+ patients</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza Bopape Community Clinic</td>
<td>Mamelodi Twp.</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>Middle-aged disabled men and women in a support group</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skinner Community Clinic</td>
<td>Mamelodi Twp.</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>Mentally disabled</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivenhout Community Project</td>
<td>Olivenhoutweg Informal Settlement</td>
<td>Catholic Church</td>
<td>Middle-aged women and young men and women</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boiketlong Community Project</td>
<td>Centurion (I.S.)</td>
<td>Dept. of Health</td>
<td>Middle-aged men and women who visited centre for medication and counselling</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maitisong Art Gallery</td>
<td>Yeoville</td>
<td>Volunteers</td>
<td>Young ex-offenders and youth</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO)</td>
<td>Chiawelo in Soweto Twp.</td>
<td>Dept. of Arts and Culture</td>
<td>Young artists, women, some HIV+ participants of a community craft project</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 shows that most of the projects, namely Soshanguve Community Clinic, Boikhutsong Community Clinic, Laudium Community Clinic, Stanza Bopape Community Clinic, Skinner Community Clinic and Boiketlong Community Project, were in community clinics funded by the Department of Health. Most of the participants were sick or disabled. Two projects namely, Soshanguve Community Clinic and Boikhutsong Community Clinic targeted HIV and AIDS patients. Between May and September 2002 all parties, including local communities and policy-makers, participated in installing the exhibition of the six thousand dolls and the Waste Mechanical Giant. Most of the projects that were identified to participate in this initiative were already in existence; one group was set up specifically to implement FOIE’s objectives for the WSSD. Each project comprised ten to sixteen participants; some involved vegetable gardening projects while others produced various crafts. Most projects in the Pretoria area were located in community clinics, chosen so as to empower disabled patients and those with HIV/AIDS – like those in Soshanguve, Boikhutsong, Laudium, Mamelodi, Centurion and Attridgeville. Maitisong Art Gallery and SOMOHO were the two projects in the greater Johannesburg area. The FOEI team visited all these groups and their leaders. Strategic meetings were held between the participants and leaders of the projects in order to finalise production plans and resolve logistical issues. Below is Table 3, which provides summary of women, men, disabled and youth who were part of the HOV intervention during the initial assessment.
### TABLE 3: SUMMARY OF DATA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HOV Participants Groups</th>
<th># Women</th>
<th># Men</th>
<th># Disabled, women, and youth</th>
<th># Youth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soshanguve Community Clinic</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boikhutsong Community Clinic</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boikhutsong Support Group</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laudium Community Clinic</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza Bopape Community Clinic</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skinner Community Project</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivenhout Community Project</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boiketlong Community Project</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maitisong Art Gallery</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The section on disabled participants above refers to all genders and also includes the youth. The ‘youth’ in this context refers to an age range of 18 to 35 years.

**Table 2:**

- **Service location:** 20% Informal Settlement, 60% in Townships, 20% in Urban settlement.
- **Organisations:** 30% independent projects, 70% affiliated to clinics.
- **Participants:** 40% HIV positive groups, Almost 40% of the remaining 60% HOV participants are HIV positive.

**Table 3:**

- **Participants:** 70% Women, 30% are Men, 35% Youth.
  - 25% women, men and youth are disabled.
OVERVIEW OF PROJECT PROFILES

Soshanguve Community Clinic Project
The Clinic itself was established in 2002 by Mary Kgobokwe, with the aim of empowering HIV-positive members of the community. The Soshanguve Community Clinic project was selected because of the availability of the community members who received their medication there, and to involve the Clinic’s social workers, who form an integral part of the project. In an interview with Mrs. Kgobokwe in 2004, she explained that, after the WSSD, the project ceased to exist because there was no regular income for members.

Boikhutsong Community Clinic Project
Before the advent of the HOV Programme, the women worked on craft products such as beaded AIDS ribbons, bead necklaces and plastic hats. Social worker Paula Du Toit initiated this craft-making project at the clinic in February 2000, with the aim of empowering the HIV positive community members who frequently visited the facility. The Boikhutsong Community Clinic supported the HOV initiative because of the benefits of generating extra income, skills development and exposure to the WSSD. The project won a prize of R2000 from FOEI in the Best Paper Doll of the WSSD competition. The award was handed over at a farewell party held at St. Stithian’s College in Randburg. The project no longer exists due to the fact that many of its members became too ill to work.

Boikhutsong Support Group
The group was established in 1999 by Paulina Molefe, the psychologist at the Soshanguve and Boikhutsong Clinics, with the aim of alleviating the poverty experienced by community members attending the clinics. One of those is George Apane, an elderly group member who is determined to rid the community of poverty and has a positive attitude for the continued development of this project. Older women and disabled participants make up the balance of the Boikhutsong Support Group. A support group attached to the clinic still exists, but with very few of the original members.
Laudium Community Clinic Project

The original project, which focused on pottery and the making of ceramic products such as mugs and clay pots, was established by community members in 2000, on the Clinic premises. The Clinic’s psychologists provide counselling and support free to the HIV positive members of the project.

The main task of Laudium Community Clinic Project is community support, and members participated in the HOV Project with the aim of generating an income and learning new skills such as mould-making and casting. The project still exists, although it is now located in the building of the nearby shopping centre.

Stanza Bopape Community Clinic Project

As with other clinic projects, those making use of the Clinic receive free counselling and support from the facility-based psychologists. In 1998, community members who frequently collected medication from the Clinic established an embroidery and sewing group as a project to enable members to earn an income through the sales of embroidered materials and traditional cloths. This project ceased to exist because some members had personal problems with operating an initiative on clinic premises.

Skinner Community Clinic Project

As with the Soshanguve Community Clinic Project, the Skinner Community Clinic Project was also initiated by a social worker. Her name is Ndumi Phaaahla, and in May 2002 she established this project specifically for the HOV Programme. While the HOV Project was a source of income for its members, the Skinner Community Clinic Project was one of those that did not meet its weekly target of producing 110 dolls. This was
partly attributable to the fact that, because many of the participants were mentally
disabled and it was difficult to try and explain the production process to them, it was not
easy to work with participants. In addition, members had too many expectations from
FOEI and were largely unable to understand the reason for their participation.

**Olivenhout Community Project**

Olivenhout was one of the slowest in terms of its ability to meet the required production
targets. Some members are disadvantaged middle-aged women and others are young men
and women between 20 and 24 years of age. The gardening project is still active today.

**Boiketlong Community Project**

This project participated in the HOV Programme. The Boiketlong Community Project
became one of the Projects to reach the target of 110 dolls per week. Despite the fact that
the income was insufficient to meet members’ needs, the Project has made good progress.
The project still exists today.

**Maitisong Art Gallery Project**

Soul Molobi, a political activist from Hammanskraal in the North West Province,
founded Maitisong Art Gallery in November 2000 in Orlando East, Soweto. Maitisong
Art Gallery recruited young, rehabilitated offenders and youth from the Yeoville, Berea
and Hillbrow areas with the aim of reducing crime in the streets of these suburbs.

Maitisong is a centre that offers youth and young artists an opportunity to practise their
art and showcase their talent. Drawing, painting, silkscreen, sculpture, drama and poetry
were some of the daily activities at the gallery. Together with Stephen Mokoena, I
worked as a part-time facilitator for visual arts classes in the gallery during 2002.

All members of the Maitisong Art Gallery (including management) worked on a
voluntary basis while awaiting the outcome of its funding proposal submitted to the
Department of Arts and Culture. When the HOV Project was introduced to Maitisong, all
members were happy, believing there would be an income for the gallery and its
members. Today Maitisong Art Gallery no longer exists, due to a lack of commitment from members and lack of access to income generation opportunities. Other reasons why this project has ceased to exist is because many of its members returned to crime and got arrested while two other members have since died from drugs overdoses.

Fig.4.6 These two young men from Maitisong Art Gallery managed to avoid crime and prison after the WSSD intervention in 2002. Photograph: David Tshabalala

Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO)
SOMOHO in Soweto offers members seven different activities: music, drama, dancing, arts, crafts, environmental conservation and catering. SOMOHO members took part in the HOV Project with the intention of generating an income as well as learning new papermaking and casting skills.

Mandla Mentoor founded the original project in the early nineties with the intention of addressing poverty and pollution by turning waste into an economic asset.

Initially the project operated from Mandla’s backyard, with youth, men and women volunteers creating beautiful pieces of artwork from newspapers, glass bottles and wood off-cuts. In an interview with Mr. Mentoor (2004) he explained that in August 2002, SOMOHO was given the opportunity to showcase the artistic creations they had produced in the heart of Soweto, to the world audience of the WSSD.
LOGISTICS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE HOV PROGRAMME

Newspapers, namely *The Star*, *City Vision* and *Beeld*, were approached to contribute towards the project and they donated a total of 50 tons of newspaper waste. A truck from the waste management company was hired to collect the waste paper and to deliver it to the different projects.

Before the beginning of the HOV Programme, Donald Pols presented the FOEI budget to trainers and project leaders and clarified its budget limitations. All projects were to be contracted for the period of nine weeks leading to the opening of the WSSD. Each project was required to find partners around Gauteng who could assist with additional materials, such as waste management companies and flour manufacturers. In order to achieve the objectives of HOV, my task also involved approaching different organisations or companies for additional contributions of materials.

In setting up the projects, we met with various groups. The first group was based at Laudium Clinic and consisted of HIV positive young and middle-aged women. This group led to us finding other suitable communities around Pretoria, and to contracting with the mentally disabled youth that frequented the Skinner Street Clinic, to become part of the project. As co-ordinators and trainers, we met with each group at their own venue to do strategic planning motivate participants.
Design and Techniques

As previously mentioned, I was tasked to design a doll measuring 70 cm in height and 30 cm in breadth. Because the doll had to be free standing, the bottom section was made broad to create stability. The structure was simple and hollow, allowing for mass production by the project teams. It was designed without arms to make the casting process easy and practical, and to avoid complications caused by undercutting during production.

The use of thin strips of hand-made paper and newspaper was encouraged to reinforce the casts, as these materials dry quickly; the challenge was to try and dry parts of the doll in one-hour sessions. To achieve this, the doll was cast in separate parts, which took 20 minutes to dry when using sand. Using flour paste, these separate parts would then be attached later to form a complete doll.
Moulds

Mould-making techniques and their suitability were researched for this project. Fired clay moulds were found to be most appropriate because of their strength: they last for long periods and can withstand any weather conditions.

According to Colclough (1999:118) in *Mould-Making*, “The plaster mould helps to prevent any distortion, as the images are impressed on the inside and the mould does not shrink. The disadvantage of plaster moulds is that, when stored in damp places, they lose their life and strength faster than clay moulds do.”

After the completion of the research conducted, the next task was to find the ceramicist who would be able to produce clay moulds to speed up the production. Van Schalkwyk was found to be the appropriate person, since she had time and she was involved with community initiatives in Pretoria. Subsequently after three weeks all projects received their clay moulds and started casting dolls.

![Fig.4.9 The new technique of rolling the paper pulp on a wet floor simplified the process. Photograph: David Tshabalala](image)

Production methods

In order to simplify the process, I introduced a new technique of beating pulp for use in the HOV Projects. The colour of the dolls came from different colour sources in the recycled paper; on occasion, dyes were added during the pulping process and, sometimes, the dolls were painted with pigment after they had dried. Once dried in the sun, the casts
were removed from the moulds and the various parts attached to complete the doll. In this process, participants were encouraged to work in flow production teams. The first team made paper, and when the paper was half-dry the second team cast it in different moulds; the third team then completed the finished parts.

The process for the making of a complete doll entails, firstly, the casting process, which is then followed by covering hand-made paper with a layer of flour paste and thin strips of newspaper. Once the process is completed it is sun dried or fanned, and after ten minutes the cast is removed from the mould. After this, the cast parts can be joined together.

To make sure that the projects met their given target of three months, each project was allocated ten ceramic moulds and had to produce a minimum of 110 dolls a week. Moulds were divided into six different parts of the body, as follows: the back and front parts of the head, back and front of the torso and two parts for the legs. Participants from the projects were paid R30 per doll completed. Each project was provided with five 12.5 kilogram bags of flour every two weeks. The flour was used as a reinforcing agent instead of cold glue to support and maintain the structure. Flour paste is more economically and environmentally friendly than cold glue.

Fig. 4.10 Isaac Mokoena from Maitisong Art Gallery joining two separate sections of the doll. Photograph: David Tshabalala
Stephen Mokoena, trained as a papermaker by Phumani Paper, was contracted as an assistant, and together we conducted weekly visits to each project. Our responsibilities included:

- Motivating the groups and building capacity;
- Finding creative solutions to problems that arose;
- Reporting problems to the FOEI Project Co-ordinator.

**Training and equipping project participants**

Each project was given a basic papermaking kit consisting of screens, deckles, buckets, vats, pressing boards and interfaces. In addition, large quantities of waste paper and flour were delivered to the different venues weekly for the duration of the programme. Weekly targets of 110 dolls were set for each group.

Papermaking training for the HOV Projects took place at the beginning of July 2002 with Stephen Mokoena contracted as a papermaking trainer for the first phase of the production. While Mokoena was providing papermaking demonstrations, I travelled to each project to ensure that production systems were maintained. The processes were documented through photographing and note-taking at each site.

The individuals working on production were motivated to meet and even exceed their targets, to have their dolls on display at the WSSD, to earn an income to support their families and perhaps even win the coveted FOEI cash prize. The participation level and energy involved in this initiative was part of team building strategy.

The methods utilized in the production of the dolls proved to be effective: the quickest of the various processes proved to be the production of handmade sheets, since the quality of each sheet was not important. Doll production slowed down on some days because of moist weather conditions and delays in delivery of materials, such as flour.
During this period, I ran workshops with the groups that were not meeting the target of 110 dolls per week. For example, where production speeds slowed to 90 dolls a week instead of 110, I met with each group in order to identify their specific problems and solve production issues. Increased income was linked to hard work: FOEI paid project members extra for each additional doll completed in excess of the minimum requirement of 110 dolls per week. FOEI hired a truck from an environmental management company to collect completed dolls from the different projects. The Fine Art Department at Wits University offered one of its unoccupied lecture rooms to store completed dolls until the end of August.

The dolls represented the lack of voice experienced by disadvantaged persons during the period of the Summit. This message was relayed directly to project participants, so that they had an understanding of the purpose of the programme as a whole, as well as what was expected of them. Everyone involved was given the opportunity to discuss and comment on the project, and to question the trainers.

The Projects and the financial possibilities they offered for the generation of future income aroused a good deal of enthusiasm among participants. Approximately two hundred income generating opportunities were created by FOEI during the pre-Summit period, which helped individuals feed their families and improve their own quality of life.

HOV also created a healthy spirit of competitiveness among the various projects, especially after FOEI announced a prize of R2000 for the project that produced the most dolls by deadline.

The Maitisong Art Gallery Project is an example of a team that worked very hard to win the award for producing the highest number of dolls. Participants divided themselves into two groups: one worked night shift and the other, day shift. Those who could not make it during the week, worked on weekends to help reach and exceed the target of 110 dolls or more. Each participant had to produce seven dolls or more per week. Each participant took home approximately R200 per week; the more dolls they produced, the higher their
income, and the prize money encouraged them to work even harder. Maitisong Art Gallery received the most media attention of the programme. The official Jo’burg website recorded their activities:

"On visiting the gallery late one afternoon, the place was a hive of activity. Eight young men were busy with damp hand-made paper; clay moulds and heaps of old newspapers. Some of them had their hands dripping with glue as they pasted old papers onto clay moulds" (Mtshelwane, 2002: online).

From the onset of the programme, potential markets for the dolls beyond the special event of the WSSD were investigated. Some of the young artists and rehabilitated offenders of the Maitisong Art Gallery, which was a community facility for the youth of Yeoville, brainstormed the potential markets of these dolls. Their proposal was that the programme should continue after the Summit and that the dolls should be exhibited on World Aids Day, 1st December, at Pretoria’s Union Buildings to symbolise people with HIV/AIDS, and then sold to other organisations interested in supporting AIDS awareness. The money raised through sales would then help AIDS patients in different centres in Gauteng.

For this exhibition to take place, the group had to draft a proposal and present it to the Department of Health, requesting financial assistance to make these initiatives possible (personal communication with Maitisong rehabilitated offenders, 02 July, 2002). The proposal was drafted at the end of WSSD with the help of Saul Molobi but, due to lack of participation, it was not submitted to the Department.

**Technology transfer**

In the HOV Programme, all participants were taught basic skills in making paper by hand from waste paper, such as newspaper and office waste. This process involves acquiring the skill of “casting” – an “appropriate technology"\(^\text{10}\) whereby waste paper is placed into a ceramic mould, or cast. Here a range of books and catalogues proved useful.

\(^{10}\) The most economical and cheapest way of performing a specific function
For example, in the book *Casting for Sculptures* by Glynis Beecroft (1979:10) casting is described as “the mechanical process by which a sculptor makes one or several copies from an original piece of work”.

### Casting

In the HOV Project, the participants of all projects received training in hand-made paper and casting techniques during the period preceding the WSSD. However, the focus was not on the making of high quality paper as an end product, but on casting hand-made recycled sheets which were then transferred to the inside of the mould to produce the separate sections of the ‘dolls’. “Casting usually begins with the duplication of a (positive) form from a (negative) mould. Most cast paper is made by pressing prepared pulp, or by laminating small pieces of lightly pressed paper into a plaster, ceramic or latex mould” (Beecroft, 1979:12) The casting process was made simple so as to be understood by every person involved.

### Sculpture

My research falls under the National Research Foundation (NRF) funded activity area known as: “Hand papermaking for economic development”. The research objectives include the transfer of innovative research to enhance economic development for the Phumani Paper programme. Black Taxi was chosen as an appropriate vehicle for my research.

In February 2004, I conducted a workshop with the members of Black Taxi Design. The aim of the workshop was to share my experience of using pulp to produce three-dimensional craft objects. The Black Taxi design team was inspired by the outcomes of the HOV programme. The research was conducted on the Black Taxi design looking at suitable paper products that could benefit the niche area.
Black Taxi, a product development group established as a result of a Create South Africa (CSA) Learnership, is currently developing and marketing three-dimensional products for implementing into existing Phumani Paper Projects to enhance their market\textsuperscript{11}.

Paper casting was a viable appropriate technology used in the HOV Projects for the making of dolls. The advantages of this process are that it is quick drying, as well as cheap to produce and effective once completed.

I have looked at technology transfer in terms of the casting process and at paper sculpture as a technology transferred to Black Taxi. Now, I will present the Waste Mechanical Giant as an additional gigantic waste sculpture which had significant meaning in the context of the HOV exhibition.

\textsuperscript{11} The group completed a product development learnership with Industrial Designer, Richard Sparks. Four learners were assigned to Phumani Paper to develop new products to diversify existing ranges.
WASTE MECHANICAL GIANT

Purpose
The Waste Mechanical Giant has not been included as part of the Table 2 analysis because it was a separate commission which was awarded to Pretoria sculptor, Trent Priest and formed part of the WSSD. During the WSSD, the giant was designed to make a political statement against the destruction of the planet by major corporations. It represented the power of big corporations such as Shell, Anglo-American, Exxon and Monsanto. “Big corporations exercise their influence on our lives, but they are not always willing to listen to the individuals or communities they affect. They are also the cause of environmental pollution, the destruction of natural habitats, and various social problems that are unacceptable in environmental laws. This also means that these companies sometimes simply do not take existing national regulatory and international codes of conduct seriously” (FOEI, 2002: online). The Waste Mechanical Giant sculpture therefore represented the companies that formed part of the discussions by delegates at the WSSD.

The significance and meaning of the Waste Mechanical Giant
The Waste Mechanical Giant was installed in the centre of the HOV exhibition in such a way that it made a powerful statement about the destruction caused by corporate giants in
the world. Its superior height of eight meters was enhanced by the globe symbolising the world held in the giant’s left hand, as well as its eyes which were represented by computer monitors. One of the giant’s legs was placed in front of the other, representing movement.

The use of waste metals had a powerful significance. The design of the giant incorporated the logos of the different corporations such as Shell, Exxon, Monsanto and Anglo-American.

Fig.4.13 Hear Our Voice participants were excited about launching the programme. Photograph: Donald Pols

LAUNCH OF HOV PROGRAMME

Project teams meet
The projects aimed to launch HOV before the WSSD proceedings got underway, which also created an opportunity for groups to meet with their FOEI partners. Each group was supplied with food and drinks for the project launch, and representatives from FOEI were invited to celebrate with each group at their own venues. The nine rehabilitated offenders of Maitisong Art Gallery, for example, launched this project with members of the public: neighbouring businesses were invited to the launch, which helped increase local community support, enhanced the motivation and readiness of members, and improved important collaborative relationships.
Protest rally at the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism

On the 16th August 2002 a rally was held at the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism. The official march – in which it was planned to present a memorandum and a doll to the then-Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, Vali Moosa – was approved by the South African Police Service (SAPS).

I was given the task of handing the doll to the Minister’s representative, as the Minister was attending other WSSD meetings.

The memorandum stated the needs of disadvantaged people around the country and the event was covered by SABC TV and e-TV. After the rally, the projects held strategy meetings to discuss the issue of completing the dolls in time for the Summit.

Installation and opening of the exhibition

The opening and unveiling of the HOV exhibit took place on 1st September 2002. Projects were not invited to attend the unveiling due to security restrictions for WSSD delegates. All delegates had to go through registering procedures before they could have access to the venue. The media also covered the event at which Dr. Ricardo Navarri, Chairperson of FOEI, made a speech and a musical group from Soshanguve gave a performance.

After the unveiling of the installation, Certificates of Participation were awarded to all members who participated in the WSSD project. Members of FOEI joined the ceremony, and all programme participants had an opportunity to meet their international partners.

IMMEDIATE AND SHORT-TERM OUTCOMES

This section introduces social, economic, environmental empowerment and indigenous craft. It will also show that it was this particular objective that was most effectively and successfully achieved.
Sustainability: Meeting the needs of the present

In the Soshanguve Clinic and the Laudium Clinic north of Pretoria, many of the participants were HIV-positive women who needed a healthy diet to keep them going; the income they made in the project helped them buy healthy food. For example, Boikhutsong Support Group was located in the local clinic and it was here that the clinic’s social workers motivated participants by offering them free counselling and providing them with craft materials to enable them to generate an income.

In Boikhutsong Community Clinic project, however, the project activities were not sustainable on a medium- or long-term basis because of the impact of HIV-and AIDS-related illnesses. Ten participants left the project after the WSSD and another six died from AIDS-related illnesses. As a result the project had to be closed towards the end of 2003. In an interview with one of the participants, Bettinah Molefe, in 2004, she explained: “I left the project because I can’t manage to feed my family with the money I get from it. Right now I’m selling vegetables at Mabopane station.”

The HOV Programme addressed some of the needs of participants. For example, in Maitisong Art Gallery the income generated by the project over a three-month period enabled members to pay their rent and buy food for their families. Before the programme many of the Maitisong Art Centre participants “were moving around the streets of Yeoville selling drugs to the public and committing crime for a living” (Davids, 2002:17).

Social Development

The HOV programme managed to provide an alternative to committing crime for some young ex-offenders. Project activities kept them active and creatively stimulated, and because of these positive changes that had taken place in their lives, they did not feel motivated to commit crime.

The HOV Project supported caregivers of people living with HIV and AIDS which, in turn, increased social sustainability. The noticeable reduction in criminal activities also
enhanced social development. On the 21 July, the *Sunday Times* visited Maitisong Art Gallery and quoted this participant’s assessment of the HOV project: “I was in prison for a long time and when I got out I thought there wouldn’t be any opportunities for me, but this project came up and my life has changed” (Davids, 2002: 17).

In 2004, when I returned to interview participants I had found that around half of the Maitisong participants had returned to the streets and continued with their criminal activities. In an interview with Isaac Mokoena (2004), one of the Maitisong Art Gallery rehabilitated offenders he explained that hanging around Yeoville streets was not a beneficial activity and that they would be very happy to work on any craft project again in the future.

It is evident that, if the HOV programme had been an ongoing project rather than a short-term one, Isaac Mokoena may never have returned to crime. There were a variety of art and craft activities that could have kept him busy; for example, the papermaking skills he learned in the programme could have been expanded in the Creative Inner City Initiative (CICI) papermaking project.

CICI is an art initiative that transfers or imparts different art skills to communities at no cost to those communities. It is funded by Department of Arts and Culture (DAC) to share art and craft skills. Building on the experience of Phumani Paper and the HOV Programme, Stephen Mokoena was subsequently contracted as a skills facilitator for the CICI papermaking unit.

The positive impact that the HOV Programme had on the quality of many people’s lives was not sustainable in terms of guaranteeing a monthly income for participants, but has value in terms of the development and transference of skills gained to other existing or new projects during this period. Elliot (1994:110), says that “It is people who do development, not governments and therefore sustainable development is ultimately a local activity.” In terms of Elliot’s description, the selected HOV Projects developed and uplifted the lives of members and contributed to the economy of this country.
Creative Development
The HOV Programme had a great impact in another, less measurable area of creativity. Creative and artistic work is an effective therapeutic tool which enhances the individual’s sense of wellbeing and helps him or her cope with the stress of traumatic situations. Creative activity has, in fact, a strong link to healing and empowerment. In the case of the HOV Projects, the process of doll making was therapeutic for participants in that it offered them an escape from the difficult realities of their everyday lives: in addition, the final products also offered them a sense of achievement, a feeling of having a measure of control over their own lives, a sense of being part of a team, and a tangible financial reward.

Economic Development
After the completion of the HOV Programme many project participants, mainly women struggled to find alternative jobs because of lack of employment; they are still hoping for the better. Development in the HOV Programme was projected for a three-month period leading to the opening of WSSD. The project was geared to showing what unemployed people are capable of, and to embracing hitherto dormant talents in disadvantaged communities.

At the Soshanguve Clinic, a group of women – who were already working on different craft projects at the Clinic, such as gardening and sewing – were brought together specifically to participate in the HOV Project. The aim was to generate an income from making dolls during the WSSD period that would assist them to maintain their families for the WSSD period from June to September 2002.

As anticipated, this project ended after the Summit. It was hoped, however, that the Project’s activities would stimulate other forms of ongoing craft production to create an income for participants. While FOEI anticipated that the project would disband after the WSSD, the participating groups had expectations of continued job opportunities. When conducting interviews 18 months after the ending of the project I found out that some of
the participants had continued to look for jobs around the Mabopane area, while others were just sitting at home. “The concern is with material poverty with low level of income, whether in terms of cash or of subsistence production, and therefore low level of consumption of goods and services” (O’Connor, 1991: 1).

This can be applied to the HOV programme in that once participants received additional support, they were able to be creative and work towards sustaining their projects. “Female migration has tended to intensify poverty: wherever women, who were formerly fully, occupied doing the bulk of work on farms, move into cities which offer poorer opportunities to them than to men” (O’Connor, 1991: 112).

Participants in the targeted HOV Projects managed to play a part in the development of South Africa through their participation in the WSSD. This, for me, was the beginning of providing disadvantaged communities with a voice in the WSSD, while also acknowledging their creativity and their ability to use their hands.

It was found that many of the targeted HOV Programme participants had migrated from the rural areas of Limpopo and Kwazulu-Natal to seek jobs or find alternative opportunities through development projects that could generate an income. This became evident when I conducted an interview at Laudium Community Clinic project in Laudium. One of the participants, Lesley Mahlangu, said: “I was born in Polokwane, I first came to Gauteng in 1998 looking for any available job then I heard about projects existing within the Laudium clinic, which could help one to learn different skills and to earn an income. I then decided to join this community project” (personal communication, July 14, 2002).

Before the advent of the HOV Programme some of the participants revealed that they were not managing to provide for their basic needs. The income that the targeted projects generated during the WSSD, however, enabled these participants to cover basic needs like food for their families, and rent. The aims of the HOV Programme were to welcome delegates to the opening of the WSSD, to make an economic-political statement, and to
highlight the issues of disadvantaged people. The Programme also became a source of income for the participants involved and their families.

After the completion of the Project, many of these participants could not sustain themselves through this type of activity and needed to search for alternative jobs. Walker Tsholo from Maitisong Art Gallery, for example, expressed that he was no longer interested in the project as it did not provide him with an income; he subsequently works as a sweeper for Zulberg Estate in Yeoville (personal communication, 20 March, 2004).

In the SOMOHO Project, the centre provided participants with food every time they came to work. Founded by Mandla Mentoor and funded by DAC, as well as donations from a Canadian source, this project operated as a charitable organisation. During my visit to SOMOHO in August 2002, it became evident that the food offered by the project organiser was strong motivation for attendance for many participants.

The SOMOHO Project was run as a project for the poor. In an interview with David Mogane, the organisation’s Arts and Craft Manager, he said: “Many of the people who join the project have a limited choice in meeting their basic needs; as a result they join the project as an alternative” (personal communication, 04 March, 2004). Based on this, one could argue that the criteria for self-sustainability in setting up the project in this case were not considered successful. When comparing the HOV Programme with other Phumani Paper projects, for example, it is clear that development in the former was not permanent because the time period of the WSSD was limited, and there was no regular need for dolls after the WSSD. In hindsight, the dolls could have been marketable if there had been more variety in terms of colour and size: many WSSD visitors expressed an interest in buying dolls but their large size made it difficult to take them back to their countries. However, the dolls were not made with a view to marketing them commercially to visitors and tourists.
The long-term objective of the HOV Programme was for project members to acquire skills like papermaking, casting and production, that could be used to improve their lives and maximise their job and income opportunities in the future.

Environmental Development
Environmental education on the re-using and recycling of waste has proved to be the most successful outcomes in the HOV Programme. SOMOHO, which was originally set up as a project producing art and craft work from waste materials, has played a role as an income generator for the poor. Participants benefited significantly from the HOV Programme. One of the FOIE objectives in setting up this project was to address the issues relevant to the WSSD; thus waste management was an essential part of the HOV Programme.

The State of Environment principles, as cited at the WSSD conference, relate closely to the HOV Project in terms of pollution, waste management and poverty. For example, the waste paper scattered around the streets could be collected and recycled into the making of profitable products to help alleviate poverty. The HOV Project thus provided a means of recycling waste and an opportunity to educate communities on environmental management.
Issues of the environment were addressed in the outcomes of the WSSD (2002) as follows:

1. Clear recommendations for taking action with regard to resource protection and resource efficiency, supporting developing countries in the development of environmental compatible technology.
2. Elimination of socially and ecologically problematic subsidies.
3. Strengthening of UN structure for environment and development.

Phumani Paper provides an example of how projects can benefit from using recycled waste paper, such as office waste paper, and invasive or indigenous plant fibres to make beautiful paper, which can then be converted into saleable products for packaging industries and crafts markets. For example, in Phumani Paper Projects, hand-made paper is produced from invasive plant fibre and other fibres which are mixed with waste paper. The first experience of the various HOV Projects in waste recycling, in which waste paper was used to make recycled paper, which was then made into paper ‘dolls’. Although the period of the WSSD was brief, it nevertheless proved that it is possible to generate an income from the recycling of waste products.

The publications and text that developed around the WSSD support the development objectives of the HOV project. The WSSD was a global conference held in Johannesburg, which focused on addressing issues that affect the planet and its natural resources i.e. issues of poverty, sustainable development, environment, and empowerment. For this reason the FOEI organisation used the HOV Programme at the WSSD as a platform to represent itself and its members across the world.

“While government officials gather for the World Summit on Sustainable Development in Johannesburg (26th August - 4th September 2002), South African artists and local communities in deprived areas around Johannesburg will be getting involved, helping each other to make a living through work on Friends of the Earth International’s art installation” (FOEI, 2002: online).
In order to improve environmental health Ibinibini Mara (2002: 23) cited in Long Walk to Sustainability, suggested, “Women’s health should be included in a mainstream gender debate at every level and in the recruitment of women in all employment or development programmes.” The HOV Programme addressed issues of development in women’s lives. Many of the HOV participants have children to look after. Basically, they joined the projects to generate an income. Similarly, with the HIV/AIDS positive participants, they needed an income that could help their families. Their involvement in the Project enabled them to have a ‘voice’ in the WSSD, and HOV became a stepping-stone for the many women involved.

In relation to this, James-Mseme (2002:52), in the Long Walk to Sustainability suggested that, “a macro economic policy must generate sustainable jobs, with particular emphasis on marginalized groups in the public and private sectors, whilst delivering services to the poor.”

FOEI, in particular, utilized waste paper in order to create a large number of jobs for a short period leading to the WSSD. At present, “City of Johannesburg is developing a waste management strategy, which has identified intervention areas for safe handling of waste; the re-use and recycling of waste and awareness campaigns” (James-Mseme, 2002: 73). The participatory approach to waste recycling used in the HOV Programme was a great success. This became evident when one considers the number of people who participated in the HOV Project and other waste recycling projects.

In another publication emanating from the WSSD called Business and Sustainable Development, Gerald Garner (2002: 217) stated that “Johannesburg City spends more than R150 million to collect illegal dumping and littering around the Johannesburg areas. At the same time Piki-Tup is working hard to educate, empower and encourage communities to take responsibility for waste management and to care for their neighbourhoods, so that they remain clean and healthy.”
The initiatives established by *Piki-Tup* could benefit the targeted HOV projects through the creation of sustainable jobs. The targeted projects have acquired creative skills and waste recycling skills and, for these reasons, waste management companies could be interested in a joint venture with them in the future.

In support of the above statement, *Tidy Jozi* showcased a number of projects in its exhibits at the WSSD, to demonstrate its drive towards sustainable waste management practices. Twanano Papermaking Project, one of the Phumani Paper Poverty Alleviation Projects in Gauteng, is an example of an eco-city project which uses recycled waste paper to sustain production. Its exhibit at the Ubuntu Cultural Village during the WSSD showcased its success as a waste recycling project.
Indigenous craft

In HOV, indigenous crafts were adapted to modern, production goals, such as worker motivation. The dolls produced for the HOV Project also had to represent disadvantaged people around the world, who could not attend the WSSD. During the weeks preceding the HOV launch, each project was given the task of designing and producing a unique doll which was representative of that group’s traditional and cultural background. This was a means of motivating the groups and also of maximising their potential for creativity. Donald Pols presented the competition to the groups and requested them to be guided by the following rules and criteria:

- The doll had to be simple but attractive.
- It had to embrace the group’s traditional and cultural background.
- It had to reflect the personal expression of the group.

The project which produced the doll judged to be the most attractive doll based on these criteria would be awarded prize money of R2000 with a second prize of R1000. The Boikhutsong Community Clinic Project won the first prize in the competition, while SOMOHO took the second prize.

The HOV Programme proved to be a success with regard to this because, although the dolls were made of waste paper, they resembled traditional toys and dolls made of clay and wood. In other words, they had the natural look that is characteristic of traditional craft.

Beautiful traditional crafts from all over the country were successfully showcased during the WSSD, and sales benefited many people amongst the poor communities. The Department of Arts and Culture, in partnership with the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI), as a result of the exhibitions at the WSSD have since established two outlets for marketing crafts made in South Africa: one is situated at the Bus Factory in Johannesburg and the other at the EzamaXhoza Shop in Port Elizabeth.
Conclusion

Many strengths and weaknesses of the HOV Programme have been highlighted in this assessment. While the assessment has highlighted the fact that the HOV Programme did bring about a measure of alleviation of poverty and the effects of HIV/AIDS must be said that these were short-term achievements. While they contributed towards the social, economic and environmental sustainability of people living in poverty and those living with HIV/AIDS, these contributions have been limited by the restrictions inherent in the three-month scope of the project. The HOV programmes transferred skills and technology to participants, as well as offering creative applications for traditional crafts.

The use of Table 1 presented in this chapter proved to be useful in providing an in-depth analysis of participation of different stakeholders in the HOV Programme before and after the WSSD event in Johannesburg. The table reflects the greater participation of stakeholders’ in the initial assessment than in the follow-up assessment, which is the research phase. Different stakeholders participated to different degrees: for example, the members of the sites did not participate in the planning of the HOV programmes, but were very active in the creating the paper dolls.
CHAPTER 5
THE RESULTS OF THE FOLLOW-UP ASSESSMENT OF THE
HEAR OUR VOICE PROJECTS

INTRODUCTION
This Chapter will present and discuss the questionnaire which was used and provide a
general assessment of the HOV programme. The assessment will be based on the follow-
up research conducted at the four sample projects that were visited 18 months after the
intervention. The achievement of goals will be measured by analysing the data gleaned
from the study, using the approach of Stringer (1999: 170). Stringer states: “Unlike
experimental research that usually reports on observed relationships between variables,
interpretive research presents narrative accounts that reveal the ways people experience
the issue investigated and the context with which it is held.”

The data from each sample project will present the following projects; SOMOHO,
Maitisong Art Gallery, Boikhutsong Support Group and Laudium Community Clinic
Project. It will also present seven types of information: a brief explanation of the project,
an explanation of the follow-up assessment, biographical information, and social aspects,
skills acquired, economic aspects of the HOV project and a summary. Here, too, I have
relied on Stringer’s experiential and narrative approach of assessing the data.
UNPACKING THE FOUR SAMPLE PROJECTS:
Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO)

The SOMOHO Project is today well-established both nationally and internationally and has formed supportive partnerships with organisations from Canada and United Kingdom, including FOEI. The Department of Arts and Culture (DAC) also provides funding towards the project. In an interview with Mentoor (2004), he advised that SOMOHO had also participated in business training workshops arranged by their international Canadian funding partner.

Many of SOMOHO participants do not have matriculation certificates; however, they hoped that the acquisition of these skills in sculpture would increase their personal marketability. SOMOHO’s products (paper-mâché sculptures) are sold, largely to tourists who visit the showroom in the project’s centre, as well as in local flea-markets. According to Sydney Cindi, the head of the Arts and Craft section, participants still depend on project funding for support:
“The project provides basic food such as bread and butter for our learners and artists in the department. Part of the money raised during exhibitions is used for buying that food. However the artists get 40% in every papier-mâché sculpture sold” (personal communication, 14 May, 2004).

In July 2002 Stephen Mokoena and I conducted a two-day papermaking workshop with the SOMOHO craft group, which was followed by a paper casting workshop. The success of these two events led to the same workshops being held in each of the targeted projects.

It was after the completion of these workshops that the craft section of SOMOHO started manufacturing waste paper dolls for the HOV project, with the intention of generating an income and uplifting their skills in the creative use of papier-mâché.

The purpose of the training at SOMOHO was to introduce participants to basic skills in papermaking and casting. Although we discovered that the project already used waste paper to make sculptures, members welcomed the training opportunities to help improve their technique and style.

Fig. 5.3 Water tower located in a community park created by SOMOHO members. Photograph: David Tshabalala
Follow-up assessment

In deciding on the most suitable projects for the purpose of this research, The SOMOHO environment and conservation group were selected for interviews because they had assisted the HOV group in meeting their set target of dolls during the project.

The visit was made to SOMOHO not only to conduct interviews with the participants but also to conduct a co-operative inquiry. It was hoped that, in the process of conducting research, the discussions would also help project members identify the root cause of problems being experienced by the group, and enable them to resolve such problems.

On my arrival, the executive members of the project were still in a meeting, while craft and environmental conservation groups were in a production session. The art and craft leader introduced me to group members who had previously given permission to be interviewed.

Mr. Cindi (2004), head of the craft section of SOMOHO, advised that many of the participants to be interviewed were new to the project and therefore had little knowledge of it; in fact, only three of the original group of eight members were still involved in the programme.

In order to facilitate a discussion, rather than direct the outcomes of the interviews, the group was provided beforehand with a number of questions to answer regarding project sustainability, and given an opportunity to comment, ask their own questions and document their answers. In this way, I was able to note the issues the group regarded as important before starting the group interviews.

From my perspective, I felt it was important to simplify my questions by establishing a familiar Sotho and Zulu language base in which it would be comfortable for all participants to converse. This concept was introduced at the beginning of the discussion, and proved helpful to group members while also making the interaction more interesting and relevant with regard to current group issues.
Biographical Information

The group interviewed comprised both new and longstanding members of SOMOHO. Longstanding members, who had been part of the HOV programme, were more familiar with the concept of business development, but indicated that they were struggling to cope with the changes taking place in SOMOHO. Sydney Cindi made this clear when he said: “Since I started managing this arts and craft department in 2003 it has been difficult for the old members to adapt to my attitude because I am strict when it comes to the art and craft group” (personal communication, 4 March, 2004).

According to my observations during the SOMOHO interview and inquiry processes, Cindi seemed to be a leader with the ability to grow and develop the project. For example, when participants were unable to answer questions, he would provide examples to illustrate the concepts under discussion. This helped me conduct interviews without always having to offer a detailed explanation of every concept to each group member.

During the interviews, five participants who had recently joined the project – comprising three women and two men - chose to remain anonymous for the purposes of the interview and questionnaire. The fact that they were not familiar with who I was, or with the
objectives of the interview process, made them feel insecure and uncomfortable and unwilling to disclose their views.

According to Stringer (1999: 25) “to increase participation in an interview, a researcher should stimulate people to change and this is done by addressing issues that concern them now”. Guided by this maxim, I attempted use my researcher role to identify the problems and to address them.

Social Aspects
The members of SOMOHO who had participated in the WSSD intervention, had a clear understanding of WSSD objectives and took the opportunity to showcase some of their craft works to their international visitors during the event. The newer members of the group expressed their interest in the HOV programme and clearly understood its potential long-term value. However, many of the group stated that they had also believed that the WSSD event would provide jobs and employment for many township people; this interpretation may have been linked to the fact that they had themselves experienced long periods of unemployment. This led to a discussion on identifying future opportunities for social upliftment.

Skills Acquired
SOMOHO participants have acquired a wide variety of skills, including making pottery and other artistic objects, and gardening. Currently the project needs to implement strategies that will enable them to market and sell their products. Members now “have confidence in the making of papier-mâché sculptures and they are willing to continue if they get any opportunity” (personal communication with group, 4 March, 2004). This unit however still uses the casting technique they were taught, of applying pulp waste paper onto their sculptures.

Economic Aspects
During the interviews, I raised questions for discussion amongst participants: for example, questions regarding the project market, on how participants can maintain
regular clients. In this way, every member had an opportunity to comment. Some members of the group mentioned problems with distance and access to the marketplace. The original three members agreed that they were happy about the income generated from the HOV programme, and shared with the group many details of the income generating activity during that period.

**Summary**

These individual and group discussions with SOMOHO members yielded sufficient information to record group strengths and weaknesses and identify opportunities for growth within the project. This proved to be beneficial to me as researcher and in assisting the group to with further project planning.

**Maitisong Art Gallery**

![Fig.5.5 Maitisong members participated in the WSSD exhibition. Photograph: David Tshabalala](image)

The centre aimed to establish and showcase artistic African creations including labels and logos designed mainly by black artists who were members of Maitisong Art Gallery. The objectives of the Gallery (2002) are listed in their brochure as:

- *To become a successful empowerment tool among previously marginalized communities;*
- *To create jobs for unemployed youth;*
- *To develop skills; and*
• To become leaders in the promotion and marketing of African art both locally and abroad.

When the HOV project was introduced to the Maitisong Art Gallery, the gallery was no longer run by founder Saul Molobi at the request of the group. Stephen Mokoena and I took over the co-ordination on a volunteer basis, and involved additional rehabilitated offenders in the project.

Before we joined the gallery there were a number of young artists using the premises to practise and produce their art. In addition, there were also Saturday art classes conducted by Ozor Ezefuna, a Nigerian-born artist. The artists were able to generate a small income and pay rent for the premises. When I introduced the HOV Project, there were many young artists who were not at the time part of the centre. Mokoena and I then opened up workshop opportunities to new members of the community by training them in papermaking and casting before involving them in the production of the dolls. During this time Mokoena worked as a station manager at the Gallery to implement and oversee efficient production of the dolls for the HOV project.

Maitisong members also received life skills training offered by Khulisa Services which is a prisoners’ rehabilitation programme initiated by Lesley Stander. Mokoena and I formed links with other, existing rehabilitation programmes and attended prisoners’ workshops in the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (CSVR) in Braamfontein with the hope of assisting these young men. We were also contracted by Khulisa Services to conduct art and papermaking workshops with inmates of Johannesburg Prison.

Follow-up assessment
After the WSSD was over, activity ceased at the Gallery and project members decided to move on and busy themselves with other activities. A number of factors contributed to this and these will be presented. The surplus dolls and papermaking equipment that were no longer used were stored at the Centre’s premises. In April 2004, when I visited the Gallery, I interviewed two young men who had been at the Gallery and worked on the
HOV Project. Although one of them, Walker Tsholo, had some occasional work as a cleaner, both of them had, in fact, returned to the street to resume criminal activities because the gallery was no longer active. I was however pleased to discover that the HOV project had opened a door to providing some of the original project members with jobs. The Lothlorine waste recycling company had occupied the Maitisong premises; three rehabilitated offenders who had been members of the Gallery during the HOV Project, were now contracted to work for the waste recycling company. Their jobs are to collect and package waste paper and boards brought in by the Yeoville community.

Biographical Information
During the course of completing the questionnaire, I discovered that these two young men were at that time surviving only on the income they generated from being on the streets. It was clear that they had both had a difficult time after the WSSD Project had come to an end: they were unemployed and did not have enough money to buy food. They admitted that there were occasions on which they resorted to petty crimes. In fact, subsequent to this interview, I discovered that another gang in the area had brutally beaten one of the respondents to death because he tried to steal their vehicle.

George Jali, the leader of the doll production team who was interviewed by the Sunday Times during the project, died in April 2003 from drug overdose. Several other young men who had been part of the project were also arrested on drug charges early in 2004. These facts clearly reflect the negative impact that long periods of unemployment can have on young people. Unable to resolve their problems, and ill-equipped to find alternative ways of generating an income, many of them turned to petty crime to buy food or involved themselves in the drug world. In extreme cases, such actions cost them their freedom, and even, for some, their lives.

Social Aspects
Although neither of these two men interviewed had a matriculation certificate and both had spent time in prison, participation in the HOV project motivated them to rehabilitate themselves. During the period of the project they had not committed any crimes and both
of them explained that this was because they enjoyed being part of the Maitisong Project team, and had experienced – probably for the first time in their lives – the satisfaction of earning a liveable income through their own efforts. The project provided them the opportunity of experiencing a healthier lifestyle.

Skills Acquired
The young offenders who were part of Maitisong Art Gallery proved to have previously acquired hands-on, practical work skills such as painting and cleaning in prisons. Papermaking and casting paper dolls was an altogether new skill for many of them.

Economic Aspects
The financial income generated during the doll production phase of the project, changed the lives of these rehabilitated offenders. The newspaper media proved interest in how the centre had changed these young men’s lives. The WSSD event not only generated income and created jobs for these young men, it also gave them self-esteem.

Summary
Both Walker Tsholo and Isaac Mokoena of Maitisong requested to be part of the WSSD Project if and when it returned to South Africa or to be included in a similar type of project. They stated that, should FOEI representative Donald Pols visit Johannesburg again, they would like an opportunity to discuss the future of the HOV programme with him, especially their ideas on extending the programme to have longer term benefits. The discussion provided the opportunity to explore other opportunities for unemployed youth in Yeoville such as CICI, poverty alleviation programmes and government-funded craft learnerships. The experience of HOV was an especially positive one for these two individuals, and may assist them to find similar opportunities in the future.
Boikhutsong Support Group

This project is an example of how members of the group managed to use the skills learned to generate further income. One of these was a papier-mâché hyena developed by one of the members, which they managed to sell for R300 to the Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Environment in the Northwest Province in March 2004.

Follow-up assessment

Project leader George Apane, an old man from Boikhutsong village, took advantage of the available opportunities. He found out as much information as possible about how to develop a project business plan and then put forward a proposal for the Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Environment (DACE) to fund an initiative to grow and sell vegetables. In Apane’s own words, “the expectation of the department is for the project to start gardening and ploughing vegetables that can generate an income for unemployed community members and to take good care of their environment” (personal communication with Apane, 5 May, 2004). The project received funds in October 2000, a year after it was established.
Biographical Information

Many project members found it difficult to participate in open discussions about their personal details, and I had to be both creative and sensitive in the process of gathering information. My observation was that people felt uncomfortable, and powerless, because they tended to interpret questions on private matters, such as marital status and children, as a violation of their privacy.

Data acquired revealed that 50% of participants were unmarried and had three or more children with them, that many members left school before completing their matric level, that semi-literate members dominate the project, and that many participants joined in order to generate an income and feed their families.

Social Aspects

The interviews and completed questionnaire revealed that project members had very little understanding about the WSSD, although they understood how it made job creation possible. The Boikhutsong Support Group had no links with other local projects; however, the concept was discussed as being beneficial in offering greater security for the group.

Skills Acquired

Combined skills in this group include gardening, sewing, flower design, plumbing and bricklaying and members undertake them on an informal basis. No effective record-keeping exists in this project. Through the discussion, the group recognised a need for the development of administration and business management skills.

Economic Aspects

Participants were happy about the income which the HOV Project generated for them. Subsequent to the WSSD, however, the project no longer provides participants with a regular income and, as a result, many of them had become de-motivated. The majority of members have to walk long distances to the project every day and women, in particular, face difficult situations such as threats of rape and robbery.
During the production period of the HOV programme, Boikhutsong Support Group members managed to earn between R100 and R200 per person at the end of each week. According to George Apane, “the money they received helped many of them to buy food for their families and pay for transport to and from work” (interview with George Apane, 5 May, 2004).

It was noted that in order to expand their activities to include the gardening of vegetables, the project would need to expand the size of the yard in order to grow more vegetable varieties and to purchase gardening equipment.

**Summary**

The group discussion process proved valuable to the members and to me as a researcher, in that it revealed the strengths and weaknesses of the group activity. The group felt that they would be able to draft a business plan that identified further opportunities and actions that would increase income to participants.
Laudium Community Clinic Project
The Laudium Community Clinic Project is well known for its different activities in Laudium. In 2002, the project had difficulties in reaching its weekly target of 110 dolls. The reasons for this included the fact that there were various problems of group dynamics, for example members were from different political parties, which became an obstacle in the working environment. In March 2003, half of the participants started a new project, independent of the HOV Project, called “New Image”, which consisted of people living openly with HIV/AIDS. According to Johannes Noge (2004), (founder of the New Image project) “the Laudium Clinic was unsuitable as a venue at which to run this kind of project because members of the community did not relate well to some of the clinic staff”.

Follow-up assessment
The New Image project, which depends on HIV and AIDS fundraising campaigns such as the selling of beaded AIDS ribbons, ran its offices from the Laudium shopping mall. “The current Laudium Community Clinic project from the time of the HOV project is no longer active and members have no constant activities that keep them busy” (personal communication with Noge, 9 March, 2004).

Many of the New Image Project participants have completed their matric. The project is dominated by men and women who are either single or divorced and have a number of children and other dependents. All members of this project are affected by HIV/AIDS and their mission is not only to earn an income from the work they produce, but also to provide support to one another and to reach out to other individuals whom the HIV/AIDS pandemic has either infected or affected.

Biographical Information
As with other projects, it was difficult to ask questions of these participants regarding health issues or disabilities. The fact that all participants are openly linked to a support group for HIV members indicates that they are directly affected; this also meant that discussions about the long-term sustainability of the project and related issues were
awkward. The project also provides support for victims of child abuse and sexual abuse, and counselling and advice is provided for abused women.

**Social Aspects**
Laudium Project members understood the concept and objectives of the WSSD and the reasons why world delegates were discussing environmental issues and sustainable development. They also understood the intentions and aims of the HOV exhibition.

![Image](image.jpg)

**Skills Acquired**
Before the advent of the HOV Project, this community group had no papermaking skills. An important outcome of the project, therefore, was that they learned how waste could be turned into an economic asset. The group still has a stock of materials and equipment used to manufacture paper dolls. This includes ceramic moulds, waste paper, buckets and wooden screens to make paper. There is a real need that was identified for members of this project to undergo further craft training, which would enable them to utilise this leftover materials. They also identified the need to be taught basic marketing skills so that they can market their pottery and embroidery to earn an income.
Economic Aspects
Participants received no regular, dependable income from the project; most of them were volunteers from the community. All participants were happy to take part in the HOV project and were pleased with the outcome of their efforts. For the duration of the project they had managed to cover the costs of their basic needs, such as food and clothes.

Summary
In Laudium Projects the group discussion process proved valuable, for existing and new members, in that it revealed the strengths and weaknesses of the group activity. The group was very positive about the future of their project after the WSSD. Although the project does not generate enough income, the members seemed determined to produce more craft products.

FINDINGS ON THE FOLLOW-UP ASSESSMENT
During the interviews conducted with the groups, all participants expressed their views on the achievements of the HOV project and the WSSD and many of the burning issues related to the HOV intervention. They also expressed their disappointments and failures with regard to the project. Stringer (1999: 80), uses “moments of Triumph and Crisis” as part of the narrative used in project assessment. This is useful in generalizing some of the findings of the follow up assessment, and will be expanded on in the following chapter.

Moments of Triumph
Moments of Triumph expressed by all the groups was the ability to earn a dependable income based on production leading up to the WSSD in September 2002. Moments expressed by individuals included receiving certificates, buying clothes and food, paying for basic needs like transport, getting a job, selling the hyena for R300 and submitting a funding proposal and being represented on an international platform at the WSSD.
In SOMOHO members now “have confidence in the making of papier-mâché sculptures and they are willing to continue if they get any opportunity” (personal communication with group, 4 March, 2004). This positive attitude of SOMOHO participants reflected during the interviews highlights the impact that HOV had in their lives. However, in Boikhutsong Support Group the triumph was expressed in terms of the income generated during the WSSD period. According to George Apane, the money they received helped many of them to buy food for their families and pay for transport to and from work (personal communication with George Apane, 5 May, 2004).

**Moments of Crisis**

All the groups expressed moments of crisis when the income generated by the HOV projects ended. This caused stress and disappointment, and members of the Maitisong Art Gallery experienced severe crises that led to crime, drug related problems and, subsequently, arrest and death. Many HIV positive members died from AIDS-related illness and long unemployment periods have resulted in poverty and depression.

In all, projects participants experienced severe crises after the WSSD Conference in 2002. In other instances it may even have led to the death of project members. In Maitisong Art Gallery, George Jali, the leader of the doll production team who was interviewed by the Sunday Times during the project, died in April 2003 from drug-related
problems. Several other young men who had been part of the project were also arrested on drug charges early in 2004.

The above facts clearly reflect the negative impact that long periods of unemployment can have on young people. When visiting Laudium Community Clinic Project there were very few activities taking place. “The current Laudium Community Clinic Project is not active and members have no constant activities that keep them busy” (personal communication with Noge, 9 March, 2004).

Conclusion

In relation to the above statement, it has been established that the limited time period of twelve weeks allocated to the HOV Project was too short to enable the development process. According to Max Neef (1999: 21), in Human Scale Development, development is “the process of enlarging people’s choices available to meet one’s needs” In the HOV Projects, the targeted communities were limited to a three-month time frame in which to intervene and develop the quality of technology that was offered to them. However, the craft skills transferred during the WSSD period have proved to be successful: out of four selected projects, three have demonstrated a willingness to continue learning additional paper casting skills. Haq (1995:16), in Reflections on Human Development, presented four essential components central to human development: equity, sustainability, productivity and empowerment. According to him, when these four essential components are denied, it results in the failure of human development.
CHAPTER 6
CONTEXTUALIZING: CONCLUDING COMMENTS

INTRODUCTION
Ernest T. Stringer (1999:170) refers to the concluding chapter in an Action Research report as “Contextualization”. In keeping with this view, Chapter 6 does not scientifically analyse the data, but positions the outcomes and findings within the context of the original objectives of the HOV. The Chapter also presents the lessons learned and their application to the poverty alleviation projects, specifically Phumani Paper. In addition, it compares the sustainability and technology used for HOV with other poverty relief programmes. Specifically, the Twanano Papermaking Project in Ivory Park will be compared with HOV Projects, and Black Taxi Design with SOMOHO. The general findings from the four projects are presented. The impact of the HOV Programme is presented at the end of this chapter; the chapter is divided into three sections, namely Discussion, General findings and Conclusion.

BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES AND OUTCOMES OF THE HOV PROGRAMME
The three-month period set for the production of a target of ten thousand dolls per project, proved to be an unrealistic one, and one which was not met. However, the impoverishment of the ten communities involved meant that they did not want to refuse the opportunity to generate an income. Project leaders and trainers understood that there was a chance that the groups would be unable to meet their targets, but chose to take this risk and recover some income, rather than continue to live in abject poverty.

The primary concern and focus of the FOEI before and during the WSSD, however, was the production of paper dolls. FOEI came in as an international organisation working on behalf of the WSSD, and created financial expectations within all the target groups. After the Summit, all project members had to continue dealing with the conditions of poverty in which they had previously lived, and which had been alleviated during the period leading up to the WSSD.
This research project was undertaken with a view to understanding the problems faced by the projects after the Summit, to looking at the expectations which this event created in the minds of project members, and to finding out whether these expectations were met in any measurable way. Using in-depth interview discussions and a specifically-designed questionnaire, the research aims to show the despair and poverty of post-Summit projects and to outline potentially achievable means whereby these same projects could, in fact, evolve to offer impoverished communities the reality of sustainable income in the future.

**DISCUSSION**

**Twanano Papermaking Project and the HOV Projects**

Twanano is a project of Phumani Paper Poverty Alleviation Programme which focuses on papermaking and the jobs that are created as a result. The Twanano Papermaking Project trains local unemployed people to make handmade paper and paper products on a commercial basis, using recycled waste paper and locally-sourced milkweed fibre. The project was introduced in the first chapter in which I mentioned that I worked as a co-ordinator for Twanano on behalf of Phumani Paper from 2001 to 2002.

Twanano comprises of nine members, of whom eight are women; all are committed to the development of the project. Their commitment and motives help ensure the success of Twanano, in that each member is part owner of the project and has a task that is part of the project. For example, Tryphinah Simelane works as a stock controller, while Gloria
Sithele is responsible for quality control. Twanano as a business-oriented project depends partially on Phumani Paper for sales support.

In the HOV Programme, participating projects were not profit-driven businesses; instead they participated in the production of ten thousand dolls commissioned by FOEI. Some of the HOV projects, such as the Skinner Street Project, did not exist before the WSSD but were formed because of the need for employment at that particular period. Unlike Twanano Papermaking Project, many of the HOV projects members were not part of the organising committee; one could therefore see this project as a provider of short-term employment for the purpose of the WSSD.

Making dolls from waste paper is a new technology in South Africa, and this made it difficult for HOV participants to recognise the potential viability of this technology after the WSSD. In addition, there was also a lack of understanding of how handmade paper could be manipulated into different three-dimensional designs and other creative techniques besides packaging. Many HOV participants had never been exposed to the craft and hand papermaking markets, which made it difficult for them to foresee the future of using waste paper for sculptural purposes.

**SOMOHO and Black Taxi Design**
SOMOHO used waste paper for the production of three-dimensional figures since its inception, i.e. before the advent of the WSSD in 2002. The difference between the HOV dolls and the sculptural figures which SOMOHO had been producing, was the technique used during production; there was also a difference in the amount of time these different techniques consumed. All of SOMOHO sculptures were initially reinforced by chicken wire. Waste paper was soaked for few days and, during the production process, sand and soft paper porridge were mixed with the pulp to resemble clay. The pulp would then be slowly padded around the wire structure to form a figure. Time constraints meant that this process was not repeated in the production of the HOV dolls.
Black Taxi, a product development group established through the Create South Africa (CSA) learnership, used a different approach in the preparation of paper pulp for sculptural figures and the making paper bowls. The Black Taxi group was contracted to Phumani Paper to help them develop new products. As a result of the success of the HOV paper dolls project, Phumani provided Black Taxi with the challenge of casting commercially viable products out of paper. I was assigned to provide training to the Black Taxi group. The pulp in the Black Taxi design was made from waste office papers and plant fibres. The reason for using plant fibre was not only for the purpose of texture, but also to strengthen the complete figure. The plaster moulds were developed for casting purposes. Unlike SOMOHO, Black Taxi is concerned with the mass production of a product and this led to the more advanced modification of moulds in which simple, lighter plastic moulds were produced to meet customers’ demands.

There are number of advantages to using moulds for the production of three-dimensional products. These advantages include the lighter weight offered by the volumetric space, and the potential for mass production should there be a huge demand.

In terms of technology transferred by the Black Taxi design, one could say it is more sustainable and economically viable because it can be easily adapted by every person
involved in production. In addition, one does not need artistic creativity in order to get involved in the making of products, since moulds work adequately for such purposes. I have had the opportunity of demonstrating these technology modifications to some of the projects. SOMOHO has since adapted this new technology of using paper pulp together with plant fibres for the making of products. In addition, three Phumani Paper groups are using this technology to produce bowls, animals and objects.

GENERAL FINDINGS

Soweto Mountain of Hope (SOMOHO)
One of the first findings of my research was that members of SOMOHO reside in various areas of Soweto. In addition, I found a high level of literacy in this particular project because new members had completed their matric but were unable to further their studies due to financial difficulties. These new members had joined the project subsequent to the WSSD, and therefore had not participated in the doll-making project.

In my efforts to gain further information, I interviewed Programme Director, Mandla Mentoor, who provided me with his views on the success of the HOV Programme, and how the SOMOHO Project had benefitted from it.

“HOV has made a difference in the lives of many participants in the project. The SOMOHO project has gained a lot of recognition through working with the FOEI
project. If organisations like FOEI can contribute to the poverty relief initiatives, South Africa would be better place for all” (personal communication, 4 March, 2004).

Boikhutsong Support Group

![Fig 6.4 Plastic flowers created by members of Boikhutsong Support Group.](image)

Photograph: David Tshabalala

When I revisited Boikhutsong Support Group to conduct my research, I was able to include a video recording to capture the changes that had occurred in this project subsequent to the WSSD.

What was evident was that the expectations of project members were different from my objectives of the visit. Craft objects were displayed and all members were gathered around the table. There seemed to be strong feelings of optimism, and an expectation of good news, such as jobs or the continuation of the HOV programme; members referred repeatedly to the income they earned during the WSSD. While this optimism demonstrated the positive impact that the HOV project had had on their current work, there was also a negative aspect to it, in that it demonstrated the level of dependence and expectation of funding that the HOV Programme had created.

The interview process took several hours due to the fact that some questions had to be explained repeatedly and in much detail, so that every member could understand. Language translation in this project was a problem: I had to use the Tswana, Zulu, and Northern Sotho languages for all members to be able to understand, because it became
counterproductive to focus on one language only while some individuals were clearly struggling to comprehend.

Laudium Community Clinic Project

No activity was taking place at the Laudium Community Clinic Project when I arrived there to conduct interviews: members were relaxed and talking amongst themselves, and I was directed to the Laudium shopping centre where part of the group was located and where it appeared, everybody was waiting for me to arrive. As with the Boikhutsong project, products and craft objects were displayed on the table and one could sense the financial expectations of the group. The chairperson of the group (who was also involved in the HOV programme) welcomed me and introduced the project. I then stated the intentions for my visit and how it could potentially improve the sustainability of their group from a business point of view.

The group communicated their expectations to me, and it was clear that they thought I was in a position to re-activate the HOV project. The members allowed me to use a tape recorder to record the discussions and to take pictures of them with their craft products. The discussions and group interviews were successful in this project because all members offered their production time and contributed hugely to the discussion. I also found it easier to communicate with this group within limited time because counselling and discussion is part of their daily routine. It was also apparent that the newer members of
the “New Image” group were not interested in getting involved in a deeper discussion about the HOV programme. At least part of the reason behind this was that the group was not established until after the completion of the WSSD intervention and only some of its members had been HOV participants.

**Maitisong Art Gallery**

As discussed in Chapter 5, interviews were conducted with Walker Tsholo and Isaac Mokoena in order to gauge their opinions on the HOV project and the Gallery’s participation in it. I managed to document the interview process, even though it was an informal one. Unfortunately I was unable to contact any of the young women who were part of the project group.

![Fig.6.6 Walker Tsholo expressed a keen interest in the HOV initiative. Photograph: David Tshabalala](image)

When mention was made of the HOV Project, the two participants showed immediate interest: they believed I was intending to re-start the project and would offer them employment. For this reason, they questioned me on whether the project was coming back and whether they would again be considered as participants. They also wanted to know how they could use the certificates they had received from FOEI after the WSSD – a clear indication of their desperation to find jobs.

The interviews started with an explanation of my intentions and how the research could potentially benefit them in future projects or work opportunities.
Initially it was clear that there was a lack of trust: they had no idea of how the information they provided was going to be used. All questions were asked in a creative, conversational manner, to avoid offence and suspicion while acquiring answers to the biographical section of the questionnaire. They gave permission for a photograph to be taken with the dolls that were stored at the Centre.

**Quality of Training**

It became clear during the course of the Summit that leaders and co-ordinators were not properly trained and briefed on the kind of issues they should have addressed in the communities. For example, before meeting to discuss issues of jobs and development with communities, leaders should have considered the existing social and financial circumstances and conditions in those communities. This was not done, which led to misinterpretation of information and disappointment experienced by the group.

My visits to the HOV Projects in 2002 offered first-hand experience as to why one should carefully examine one’s assumptions when communicating with disadvantaged communities. Firstly, they are people from diverse cultural backgrounds and religions, and they have their own interpretation of development which could, in their view, include earning an income. Respect for the opinions of all participants during discussions was important, including providing them with an opportunity to speak about their own customs, because they are familiar with the needs of their communities.

During project meetings it was difficult for Stephen Mokoena and I to address long-term issues of sustainability in the communities involved, largely because of the transient, short-term nature of the HOV Programme. FOEI, on the other hand, is a permanent organisation with its own infrastructure and funding, and could therefore have offered opportunities for future planning. For example, at the time they commissioned the HOV Programme, it would have been developmentally responsible for FOEI to use the production period to plan ahead by working on a strategic business plan to help ensure that the life of the HOV Projects was able to extend beyond the WSSD.
**Possible Alternatives**

FOEI could also have maximised the skills that had been learned through its initiatives, either by acquiring sustainable local or international partners to work with the projects after the WSSD, or by formally presenting the programme to national or local government departments, such as Department of Arts and Culture, Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism or Department of Social Welfare. Instead, after the WSSD was over, many participants of the HOV Projects were left with limited choices: they could either continue with their existing projects with no seed funding or seek alternative jobs prospects.

FOEI used the WSSD as a platform to create awareness of their organisation and make their efforts highly visible. The fact is that, when they withdrew their support after the WSSD, they left no infrastructure in place to continue the work they had begun; this caused major problems. The Department of Social Welfare for example, establishes craft activities for some of the most vulnerable groups to function as occupational therapy and provide people with dignity of work activities. These groups are often subsidized as they are not always economically sustainable.

The HOV development process could have used a phased approach like the one used by the Phumani Paper programme: for example, the set-up phase, capacity-building phase, creativity phase and business development phase. When comparing these programmes, it becomes clear that the HOV Programme ended when it was still in the first stage of its development. The three months of a programme is a relatively short time in which to complete the development process. In situations where a community project involves HIV-positive and AIDS participants, any development process would need a somewhat longer period because participants are often unable to attend due to poor weather or health problems. The fact that these particular participants are also extremely poor and disadvantaged meant that they had no further income-generating prospects at all after the FOEI withdrawal.
According to Sue Holden (2003:35), “Addressing AIDS through development and humanitarian work is an additional strategy, which should interact with existing AIDS-focused work to form a virtuous circle, countering the vicious cycle spun by AIDS and underdevelopment.”

The HOV Programme was not geared to take into account the issues or special needs of people living with HIV/AIDS and, even though these played a large role in the production and target-meeting processes, FOEI’s focus was on the output of ten thousand dolls.

In effect, no consideration was given to the reasons behind the delays in producing the dolls or on the special needs of each project and its participants. It is of interest to record that, during the WSSD period, there was a discussion among rehabilitated offenders of the Maitisong Art Gallery about dedicating the next HOV programme to HIV/AIDS participants. They believed this was important because of the fact that so many participants were HIV-positive men and women. However, while the concept was good, there were no resources to dedicate to planning the next phase. This research project emerged out of a personal motivation to ensure that the lessons learned from this kind of intervention will be uppermost in the minds in those involved in the planning and undertaking of any future development works involving these communities.

Outcomes
All the HOV Projects were dependent on an income from FOEI for their survival. In other words, the income provided by FOEI created a financial expectation and participants did not capitalize on the opportunities which existed during the WSSD to find out about, and approach, potential donors who could provide assistance for long-term sustainability. Because FOEI was not going to be around in the future, they assured was the responsibility of the HOV Projects themselves to find partners for the long-term sustainability of the programme. Two projects did, in fact, form partnership with local Departments of both Health and Agriculture.
Another positive outcome of the WSSD Programme was that project members gained valuable skills, by learning to use their hands in a creative way. Since levels of poverty should be defined not only in terms of financial outcomes, but also in what skills were gained, it is appropriate also to emphasize here the value of those skills. Chapter 2 looked at reading material which addresses poverty in terms of income affecting the sustainability of projects. Bearing this in mind, it can be seen that many of the HOV projects needed a longer period of supervision and financial support in order to be sustainable.

All participants had the opportunity to learn creative skills, including basic papermaking and casting with waste paper, without having to pay for tuition. The skill of casting is a specialised one, and is not usually easy to acquire without proper college training, for which a substantial amount would have had to be paid. For this reason, it is a skill not usually acquired by people living in circumstances of poverty and deprivation. The transfer of this casting skill to project members proved to be a valuable asset which empowered them and increased their self-confidence.

All participating members of the HOV Programme received certificates from FOEI for their involvement; the certificates state that members had acquired papermaking and casting skills during the WSSD period.
Another important impact to be re-emphasised is that many of the HOV projects are dominated by people with HIV/AIDS and disabled people, all of whom benefited enormously from the projects, both emotionally and financially. It also made a significant and positive contribution towards helping to rehabilitate Maitisong’s rehabilitated offenders.

**Development**

I have now briefly discussed community projects and NGO’s that deal with issues of sustainable development, such as poverty relief, waste recycling, skills transfer and job creation. The discussion which follows outlines how these projects and NGOs are able to benefit from the lessons learned from the HOV Project.

“The small, medium and micro-enterprise (SMME) economy has been viewed by the government as a critical element in achieving some of the objectives of post-apartheid reconstruction and development” (Rogerson, 1991:41).

The intensive training in papermaking and casting skills in the HOV Projects was geared to suit and meet the needs of the FOEI organisation, and participants had to abide by the limitations and expectations set by FOEI for that period, such as a limit of 16 participants per project. In addition, projects that were unable to meet the target of 110 dolls per week were subjected to high levels of pressure from FOEI. While it can be argued that FOEI had to ensure the successful outcome of the HOV Programme, I believe the incorrect indicators were used, in that returns on investment took precedence over consideration of the effects the projects could have on the lives of participants.

No research or feasibility study to inform and guide the HOV project initiative was ever undertaken prior to the start of the programme in 2002. Such research would have assisted FOEI in accurately assessing which aspects of the project needed to be addressed like the issues of health and poverty emphasised by Allen and Thomas (Chapter 2), and the participants with special needs such as clinic patients and the disabled. These aspects were not sufficiently considered in the 2002 HOV Project.
The Phumani Paper projects, on the other hand, had a learning period of four years, starting from June 2000. This has been of great benefit to their projects, particularly those located in urban settlements, because of their accessibility to markets. The long-term approach of Phumani Paper takes into account the different conditions under which each community operates, their specific needs and the organizing strategies applied by a specific community to accommodate their unique situation. For example, Bosele Papermaking Project in Zeerust accommodated slow and disabled learners who are often very productive in the making of paper products because they are treated according to their individual abilities. Siyazama Disabled Project is one of Phumani’s most productive, consistent and most reliable groups in terms of production. Of the 21 projects initiated through the DST funding of Phumani Paper, 75% of the projects are still surviving. In the case of the HOV Projects, 30% are still in existence, while only 10% use the skills learned in HOV training. However as the PAR methodology reveals it would be misleading to view these statistical results as success indicators.

**Interpretation of Results**

My return visit to four of the HOV Projects in 2004 was intended to conduct interviews using PAR methodology, with the purpose of assessing the projects and helping them to deal with any project-related problems they were experiencing. Before the interviews took place, the objectives of the interviews were stated and discussed with each group, and participants were assured that the interviews conducted would help them to identify their problems. Since the HOV Programme was a short-term intervention geared to improving the lives of disadvantaged communities, it is important to look at the impact – both negative and positive – that it has had on the targeted communities.

On the one hand, the HOV Programme can be seen as a stepping stone for many other community projects because FOEI enabled participants to generate an income and acquire skills during the WSSD period. In general, the effect of the acquisition of new skills and the generation of income was that confidence levels of participants were raised.
Interviews undertaken for research purposes clearly show that participants were very supportive of the HOV Programme and felt that it had been a positive experience. They were keen to highlight not only the uniqueness of the programme but also the positive national and international reputation it had created. Despite problems that occurred in the various aspects of the projects, many participants recognised the large amount of experience they had gathered from their involvement in the HOV Programme. Some projects used their skills by applying them to their own activities. For example, in the SOMOHO Project many hollowed sculptures continue to be produced which use the casting technique learned in the HOV programme. The pulping process of rolling wet paper of the floor has also made a useful contribution to the ongoing growth of SOMOHO.

In Chapter 4, mention was made of the successes of the Boikhutsong Support Group. The papier-mâché hyena that was produced by one member of the group was cited as a positive example that empowered all members of the group, and led to additional income and a sense of pride.

It is successes like these – including the generally high levels of skills acquisition, the increased capacity of groups, and the innovative developments that have taken place in some groups – that have enabled me to feel positive about the outcomes of the HOV Programme.

Members of the Laudium Clinic Community project, now known as New Image, also indicated that they had derived positive benefits from the HOV Programme. Project leader Johannes Noge said that project members had made a presentation to their funders which reflected the success of the HOV programme. This, for me, was proof not only of the achievements of the participants, but also of their ability to apply the skills they had learned to create opportunities for the future. The participation certificates that were presented to all members during the WSSD were also significant: they played a major motivating role in the lives of participants who had never previously received a certificate of any kind, and didn’t believe they would ever receive one. This point was proved when
Walker Tsholo, one of the rehabilitated offenders of the Maitisong Art Gallery, presented his HOV Certificate to his friends who were still involved in crime. By doing that, he was able to indicate to others that there was an alternative to a life of crime.

The newspaper and television media that were invited during the production and installation of the dolls proved interested in the project. The visits of many different newspapers to the Maitisong Art Gallery during the production period to document the doll-making process and interview members previously engaged in criminal activities, is a good example. The coverage that resulted from their interest proved to be a source of pride and increased confidence to group members. The HOV Programme had a broad appeal for the media which gave the it a great deal of coverage – it received so much attention, in fact, that the WSSD recognised this particular event as being amongst the organisation’s most successful ever held.

The intervention was also highly successful in bringing together communities and providing skills training for groups infected and affected by HIV/AIDS. Looking at it in retrospect, there are clear benefits in using PAR as a research design tool and as an ongoing method of research.

**Conclusion**

Many changes have been brought about in the face of the enormous challenges which confronted these four HOV Projects in the months and years following the WSSD.

These were evident during my visits to the projects in the first half of 2004, for the purpose of this research, and made the task of fully researching and documenting all aspects of the projects, a difficult one. Many hurdles had to be overcome – such as members who were no longer motivated or had moved away, changes or relocation of venue, non-existent or closed down projects, and the deteriorating health (and even death) of some members due to HIV, AIDS, drugs and crime.
These factors – and the fact that these participants had the highest standard of communication – influenced my decision to conduct interviews in these specific projects.

The advantage of using the specially-designed research questionnaire was that it had the potential to help projects improve their viability and creativity in the future, through more effective and focused management. The unintentional negative spin-off of revisiting the projects after the WSSD had closed was that the financial hopes and expectations of all participants were raised.

Conducting the research in this manner was also a fulfilling experience in that it offered project members useful tools which had the potential to rekindle the projects that had closed down, and improve the prospects of those still in existence.

In every aspect, and on every level of interviews conducted, it was evident that, even though the HOV Programme was a short-term project, it has had a positive impact on many people’s lives. This was highlighted when members were given the opportunity to comment on the financial side of their specific projects: here it was evident that, even for a short period of time, the income they had earned meant a great deal to them and their families.

As one of the Co-ordinators of the HOV Programme, it was gratifying to learn that some projects, like SOMOHO and Boikhutsong Support Group, continued even after the programme ended, to use the skills and technology they had learned during the HOV Programme to benefit group members.

This Chapter highlights the differences between Twanano Papermaking Project and the HOV Programme and highlights the objectives of each in terms of sustainability. As stated, the HOV Programme was never intended to be a sustainable, long-term project; it was planned by the WSSD as a three-month project.
The Chapter also discusses and interprets the outcomes and challenges of the HOV Programme against a backdrop of social and economic factors unique to our country, while referring also to the positive impact that the Programme has had on the various projects, and including some recommendations and comments on lessons learned.

THE IMPACT OF THE HEAR OUR VOICE PROGRAMME

Fig.6.8 Paper jewellery designed by Black Taxi Design. Photograph: David Tshabalala

Accounting for the data process
The questionnaire is used as a guide for discussion for the selected HOV projects. Questions asked have been carefully selected and presented to all participants. The questions were also asked randomly in an environment of group discussion and co-operative inquiry, so that participants do not feel intimidated. The percentage of men and women participants in each project was recorded in an effort to capture accurate data. Since poverty relief programmes in South Africa are geared to address conditions of women, children and disabled people. I have tried to capture data on the participants who are openly HIV-positive (i.e. those who participate in HIV/AIDS support groups) and those who are mentally and physically disabled.

It can be deduced from the data gathered during the research process that over one-third of HOV participants are HIV-positive. This seemed to be the case in all four of the selected HOV projects. It was also highlighted during the co-operative inquiry stage that, in all four HOV Projects, women proved to be the leaders.
The HOV participants learned useful skills during the co-operative inquiry, including new and different ways to help them solve their problems. In terms of skills learned before the WSSD, only two projects, namely SOMOHO and Boikhutsong Support Group, still utilize waste paper for the making of three-dimensional sculptures.

**Limitations to study**

The HOV Programme has experienced both success and failure. In spite of the lack of long-term planning, it proved successful in addressing the need for short-term employment because participants managed to get jobs and generate a reasonable, weekly income. However, the programme’s short lifespan can be regarded as a failure for several reasons. Firstly, after the WSSD in September 2002, there was no continuity because of insufficient income in some projects and no income at all in others. As a result of this, the job expectations created by FOEI could not be addressed on a longer term, and many participants dropped out, while others died of AIDS-related illnesses.

The value of the research findings from four of the HOV projects is highlighted in the valuable lessons learned which are leading to more sustainable employment through the implementation of Black Taxi’s new design and products.

**Meeting Project Targets: Expectations and Problems**

The aim of the combined projects was to produce a target of ten thousand dolls. Instead, we managed to produce a total of six thousand dolls, amounting to 60% of the target figure set by FOEI. The factors which led to this are fully discussed in Chapter 4, and summarised as follows:

![Fig.6.9 Six thousand paper dolls were exhibited at the WSSD event at the Sandton Convention Centre. Photograph: David Tshabalala](image-url)
• Some project members were chronically sick, which made it difficult for them to work when the weather was inclement – for example when it was raining.

• The logistics of delivery of materials was an important factor. Deliveries that were vital to the production process – such as waste newspapers and glue – often arrived late, which held up the making of dolls.

• The 12-week period which the projects were given to complete their targets was too short and, instead of challenging members, it caused many problems.

• Some of the dolls were damaged when they were removed from the storeroom which had been given to us in the Wits University buildings; others were damaged during the installation process at the exhibition centre in Sandton. Not all the damaged dolls could be repaired, although project members were able to repair some.

After the conclusion of the WSSD, the income that participants had been earning from making dolls decreased and, in some cases, it came to an abrupt halt. On my visit to the Boikhutsong Support Group 18 months after the Summit, for example, members told me of extreme financial difficulties: after earning approximately R200 per week per member before the WSSD, they now had no alternative source of income.

Financial issues like this have an enormous negative impact on the lives of people who have no other alternative source of income, and whose physical and psychological resources are also minimal. The end of the WSSD need not have been so difficult for project members if, for example, FOEI had considered different development cycles or phases, such as those discussed in Taryn Cohn’s An Impact Assessment of Phumani

Paper (2004:23). The impact assessment conducted by Taryn Cohn supports some of my key findings.

These include:

- the concept of a partnership with organisations that offer a secure, well-developed infrastructure;
- craft-based intervention (an example of this is Phumani Paper, which is effective in addressing human development and poverty); and
- projects with strong leadership.

The development cycle to which she refers should be based on the programme design and type of technology to be transferred.

These findings further support the failure indicators of the HOV programme. The phases that were implemented in the HOV programme proved to be too short. For example, the skills transfer phase on papermaking took a week in each of the projects, and this did not provide participants and trainers sufficient time to deal with issues like the quality of skills.

Station Managers of the separate projects were responsible for motivating the groups in the HOV programme; however, they also succeeded in contributing to the creation of expectations and demands which could not be met. In addition, they were insufficiently trained to exercise leadership and organisational skills and, when the income from their projects ceased, most of them failed to realign members’ expectations and, instead, lost the respect of some members. This resulted in a loss of motivation and hope for the future in most groups. As one of the HOV Co-ordinators, my tasks included trying to maintain participant’s motivation during the production period. Thereafter, I used the PAR research process to reveal some of the after-effects of the WSSD.
Recommendations

It is important to look at the lessons emerging for other programmes that will address the issues and technologies raised by the HOV Programme, and to make recommendations that may prove useful.

As stated in Chapter 1, the primary aim of FOEI’s use of ten thousand dolls was to make a statement regarding the impact that disadvantaged people have on the planet, even though they have no ‘voice’. The statement made proved to be well received by every media as well as by all the delegates attending the WSSD in September 2002. Although the HOV Programme did not address the criteria for sustainability, it was successful in developing community skills which can be applied to other projects that use casting skills to make three-dimensional paper crafts. In this way, the HOV Programme is an example to other existing, community projects, and sets a precedent for future projects.

HOV proved to be a complex type of community programme which addressed a wide variety of issues such as HIV/AIDS, poverty relief, and waste management and, for this reason, it is an important information resource. Other projects will be able to benefit from its experience to foresee and deal with underlying problems which may arise.

In terms of the sustainability of different types of research, it is recommended that governments and their agencies – particularly in developing countries – undertake a needs assessment as well as PAR-type of research before funding any community programme. The participatory nature of the research conducted in analysing the HOV Programme proves that PAR is the most appropriate tool for the analysis of community-based programmes – despite the fact that it initially appears to be a complex practice for researchers used to employing a survey method of research. PAR as a research methodology presented in table format in Chapter 4 has proved to be a successful community tool which is able to enhance the quality of new knowledge to benefit community-based projects by researchers.
In addition, it is recommended that project leaders and funding organisations are aware of the financial expectations of communities before implementing any sort of development programme. According to Tim Allen and Alan Thomas (2000), omitting to do so could destroy the development process.

It is also recommended that organisations planning to provide funding for community programmes should be aware of specific aspects of development which need to be addressed in order for the programme to be successful. For example, if HIV-positive and mentally disabled people are going to participate in the proposed community project, it will only be successful if potential, underlying problems are properly addressed beforehand and accounted for.

A clear example of this is the Paper Prayers AIDS awareness programme in Newtown, Johannesburg, which has proved successful in addressing issues around HIV/AIDS and in assisting people affected by the virus. The programme involves people in rural and urban settlements in the making of embroidered items that are sold to support families of people with AIDS. “It has contributed in no small way to the awareness programme, fundraising efforts, alleviation of poverty and the creation of jobs” (Sellschop and Goldblatt and Hemp, 2002: 90). The Paper Prayer programme could also benefit HIV/AIDS patients in the HOV Programme, because of its experience and proven ability to address the emotional and physical well being of patients through creative activities.

**Media**

The HOV programme received significant media attention. Media highlights included:

- Front-page coverage in the New York Times on 5 September 2002, which published a picture of the ten thousand dolls outside the Sandton Convention Centre, as part of their report on the WSSD in Johannesburg.

---

13 HIV/ AIDS awareness programme initiated by Kim Berman at Artist Proof Studio
• The project was exhibited at Brandeis University. The exhibit included a video interview in which I described the project, as well as two examples of the dolls produced for the WSSD and photographs.

• In the Catalogue, Co-existence: Contemporary Cultural Production in South Africa, Professor Pam Allara stated:

“The paper-doll project was an installation of art with political ramifications far beyond its one-day physical presence: it was a collective effort that offered rewarding work to those who would never have thought of themselves as artists” (Allara, 2003: 6).

• The HOV programme was covered by the Sunday Times on 21 July 2002. The coverage included an interview with me and another member of the Maitisong Art Gallery.

• A report on the programme was published in Across the Campus, TWR’s newsletter, September 2002 edition, and the TWR Magazine which published students’ successes etc.

• Maitisong Art Gallery was publicised in the Go Africa website on 2 July 2002. The article focused on the involvement of rehabilitated offenders in the Gallery.

• The project was given publicity on the FOEI website and listed in various WSSD publications.

Poverty Alleviation

One highly successful impact of this Project was the involvement of ten community projects which, in total, provided an income to over 200 participants. I would argue that the HOV programme has made a significant impact on communities in terms of alleviating short term poverty for the following reasons:
• Disadvantaged communities were given an opportunity to generate income over the period of the WSSD.

• These community members acquired valuable skills, such as casting sheets of paper out of waste paper and producing sculptural skills from recycling waste.

• The communities managed to express their concerns about poverty and have their voices heard by the government.

• People with HIV/AIDS and disabled people were given an opportunity to prove their capabilities to a world audience.

• The HOV Programme became an agent for the empowerment of certain communities through the provision of a wide range of skills.

CONCLUSION
In conclusion it can be stated that investigation of the use of paper pulp for the production of three-dimensional figurative sculptures has yielded a number of positive outcomes. One of these is the significant impact of the HOV Programme on the WSSD in that it met many of the immediate and short-term objectives. It has also led to the development of other products which use similar technology and production methods. The marketability of these products is an indication of the huge potential paper-based technology has to make a positive economic impact on poverty alleviation and environmental conservation.

The HOV Programme has opened many possibilities for these members to produce paper products. New members of the project are also more interested in paper making and product development as an additional activity.
Summary

My thesis began by introducing the HOV Programme against the background of the Phumani Paper Poverty Alleviation Project and highlighting the motivation for the research project. A description was provided of the community projects selected to undergo skills training in order to produce ten thousand dolls for FOEI. The overall goals of the projects in relation to this research project were also stated.

In Chapter 1, I introduced the research project and continued with the vision, aims and objectives. I also put the study into context, and provided the motivation for the choice of this study. In Chapter 2, I presented the theory of PAR and viewed its relevance to this study. I also presented the literature of academic disciplines, government agency policy and programs, organisations and institutions, and media on this type of research design and methodology, such as catalogue sources published during the WSSD, which has been used to contextualise the project. In addition, the three pillars of sustainable development – social, economic and environment – were reviewed against a background of HIV/AIDS, crime, poverty, the transference of skills and technology, and the recycling of waste.

In Chapter 3 I have presented and contextualized the research design used in this study, and presented PAR as a research design method used by Caroline Wang and Ernest Stringer. The methodology presented in this chapter referred to the technical methods used to achieve the objective of producing ten thousand paper dolls in order to meet the HOV objective.

Chapter 4 presents the findings from the initial assessment. Participation of all stakeholders in the HOV Programme is presented in table format. I also presented all HOV Projects in Table 2 and provided their background and their level of participation in the HOV Programme. The logistics of the implementation of the Project are also discussed in this chapter, as are the immediate and short-term outcomes of the HOV Project.
Chapter 5 discussed the questionnaire used and presents the assessment of the HOV programme by unpacking and assessing four visited projects. The goal has been measured by assessing the aims of the study, the data used and an analysis of data.

Chapter 6, the concluding chapter, has been divided into three sections, namely discussion, general findings and conclusion.

**Personal Reflection**

I conclude by offering my personal opinion of what I have learned as the HOV Programme researcher and facilitator, and how I feel about the outcomes of the intervention.

When I was invited to participate in the HOV Programme, I never imagined the scale of the programme or that it would be the focus of my research. Initially, I thought the programme was simply a platform to provide income-generating opportunities for many artists and communities who live in poverty. Instead, it resulted in an extensive and multi-faceted intervention that far exceeded my expectations.

As indicated in the literature survey discussion, many important lessons were learned from the HOV experience. One of those is that, when doll production skills were transferred to members of the projects, it proved that there was a lack of long-term vision. The lesson learned from this is that, before transferring any skills to disadvantaged communities, facilitators should be aware of how long those skills are going to be used, and of whether or not they will sustain the project.

It is true that the WSSD was used as an opportunity for organisations, companies and individuals to market their services or products to a broader audience, and to generate an income. However, it also provided a remarkable personal experience for me as a researcher and community facilitator, and proved to be an exciting opportunity to be part of a programme that involves different communities.
As a community facilitator and co-ordinator, I also gained valuable experience from my work with these different communities whose members came from different backgrounds and circumstances. Through actively implementing some of the objectives of the WSSD and being part of its interventions, many lessons were learned, some of which are detailed below:

Craft initiatives can be used as part of a development process, and have the potential to develop into a viable poverty-alleviation tool. Disadvantaged communities have an important role to play in the development of the country, and can make a positive contribution to its stability and prosperity. With proper planning, adherence to time schedules and deadlines, and regular, accurate measurement, anything is possible. (At the time the goal of producing ten thousand dolls in a period of two to three months seemed quite unrealistic.)

The involvement of young, rehabilitated offenders in initiatives like the HOV Projects can help to control crime. As Nelson Mandela said: “HIV/AIDS is a human rights disease”. People living with HIV/AIDS deserve the same treatment and opportunities as everybody else. Working with mentally-disabled and HIV-positive communities provided me with one of the most fulfilling experiences of my career and provided me with a great sense of personal fulfilment in knowing I was adding value and making a positive contribution to their lives.
Academic research principles are sometimes inappropriate when dealing with people whose basic needs are not met on a daily basis, and who have special expectations. PAR, on the other hand, was a useful methodology, which was effective both in the development process and in assisting groups to identify relevant strategies for their organisations. Other impacts that were achieved during the course of the HOV Programme and that lead to my personal sense of accomplishment included the following:

During and after the WSSD I managed to create a useful network between the various HOV Project participants. The establishment of these partnerships between the groups was a positive personal experience in that it provided the groups with valuable opportunities for potential funding and organisational support in the future. In addition, it gave me a sense of having managed to make a difference in the lives of other people, and to offer participants a measure of hope through motivating them wherever possible.

Working as local co-ordinator for FOEI taught me some important lessons with regard to conducting meetings, setting achievable deadlines and practising the kind of broad understanding that is required when working with different communities. Craft making initiatives are an important intervention when it comes to helping to reduce crime and assisting people who are infected or affected by HIV/AIDS. This was particularly true in the case of the rehabilitated offenders of Maitisong Art Gallery, who believed in themselves and in the positive outcome of being creative in the field of craftmaking. People who were destitute and living with HIV/AIDS expressed appreciation for being able to augment their income and achieve creative results through the production of dolls from waste.

The HOV Project members who were awarded participation certificates and had never previously thought of themselves as ‘achievers’, and receiving the award had a huge impact on their lives. They felt a sense of pride and accomplishment.
The introduction of paper-based technology to make three-dimensional craft objects from paper pulp has created extensive opportunities for further job creation by expanding the markets of the various projects. The primary example cited was the Black Taxi product design group, which is currently developing marketable three-dimensional products for implementation by existing Phumani Paper projects to enhance their markets.

**Closing Statement**

All of the lessons learned, as stated above, are important factors that could be taken into consideration by a development agency or government department in planning and implementing a poverty alleviation initiative that focuses on craft development.

As a development agency, FOEI came to South Africa specifically for the WSSD, and presented an exciting opportunity for a short-term intervention. However, they did not take into account the longer-term expectations of the various groups, and their inevitable disappointments when FOEI left the country after the end of the WSSD, when the various projects were left with unmet expectations and little or nothing in the way of future prospects. This led to the collapse of many, though not all, of the groups.
This research project clearly shows the positive impact that the HOV Programme had during the WSSD, and the difference it made in the lives of participants.

![Protest Rally outside the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism in Pretoria. Photograph: Neo Lusiba](image)

In accepting that there were major challenges and problems experienced in achieving the set target of ten thousand dolls, it is nevertheless important to consider the positive aspects of the three-month period dedicated to training and production. It was highly successful in terms of the jobs that were created, the income that members were able to earn; the skills transferred to people with little or no previous skills, and the pride that the participants gained from the experience. In addition, the HOV Programme created strategies for longer-term waste management through the establishment of the partnerships that were created. Participation of all parties proved to be of a vital importance in this programme.

The protest rally outside the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) provided an international face to the critical issues facing disadvantaged people in South Africa; these are issues that need to be considered by the government.

In the course of this research process I have learned that there is great value in sharing one’s passion for the creative process with others. Many people have been empowered through new opportunities and skills. The impacts of this programme have made a difference to the lives of the participants and to the environment. The introduction of
paper pulp for use in three-dimensional figurative sculpture has also contributed to the diversity of creative strategies available for craft development and poverty alleviation in South Africa.

IF WE CANNOT END OUR DIFFERENCES, AT LEAST WE CAN HELP MAKE THE WORLD SAFE FOR DIVERSITY.

John Fitzgerald Kennedy – American University (Washington, USA), 10 June 1963.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


STATTS SA. undated. “*Consumer Price Index (South Africa)*” [Online] [Accessed 22/08/2003].


UNITED NATIONS DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS, DIVISION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT. undated. “*Chapter 3: Combating Poverty*” [Online] in Agenda 2


UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA. undated. *An Introduction to Participatory Action Research* [Online]. Available from:


## PERSONAL COMMUNICATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Donald Pols</td>
<td>14 May 2002</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Kgobokwe</td>
<td>17 February 2004</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandla Mentoor</td>
<td>04 April 2004</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maitisong rehabilitated offenders</td>
<td>02 July 2002</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bettinah Molefe</td>
<td>18 March 2004</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isaac Mokoena</td>
<td>4 May 2004</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesley Mahlangu</td>
<td>14 July 2002</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walker Tsholo</td>
<td>20 March 2004</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Mogane</td>
<td>04 March 2004</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandla Mentoor</td>
<td>04 April 2004</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney Cindi</td>
<td>14 May 2004</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOMOHO</td>
<td>4 March 2004</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Apane</td>
<td>5 May 2004</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johannes Noge</td>
<td>9 March 2004</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Apane</td>
<td>5 May 2004</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandla Mentoor</td>
<td>4 March 2004</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>