COPYRIGHT AND CITATION CONSIDERATIONS FOR THIS THESIS/ DISSERTATION

o Attribution — You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made. You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.

o NonCommercial — You may not use the material for commercial purposes.

o ShareAlike — If you remix, transform, or build upon the material, you must distribute your contributions under the same license as the original.

How to cite this thesis
TEACHER RECRUITMENT AND DEPLOYMENT IN PAKISTANI PRIVATE SCHOOLS

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTERS IN EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT

of

University of Johannesburg

by

NADEEM AHMED

October 2018
ABSTRACT

Pakistan is a low-income country where the increase in private-endeavour schools has significantly enhanced the demand for teachers. This research explores teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools. The Hammond (2010) and Krasnoff (2014) theories are used as the conceptual framework. They state that remuneration, working conditions, professional development and mentoring, and support are the major factors affecting teacher recruitment and deployment. The study consists of qualitative research based on a constructivist research paradigm. A descriptive case study design was employed to investigate the phenomenon. Individual, face-to-face and focus group interviews were conducted with teachers and principals purposefully selected from two schools. The study finds that the recruitment and deployment of professionally qualified teachers; the retention of qualified teachers; and the professional development of recruited teachers are the challenges that private schools, learners, parents and teachers face.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 1
1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE TOPIC ................................. 1
1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM ......................................... 4
1.4 AIM OF THE STUDY ........................................... 5
1.5 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY ................................ 5
1.6 METHODOLOGY ............................................... 5
1.7 DISSERTATION OUTLINE ................................. 6

## CHAPTER TWO
A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 8
2.2 TYPES OF PRIVATE SCHOOLS AND TEACHER RECRUITMENT ........................................... 9
2.3 TEACHER RECRUITMENT AND PROFESSIONAL DEPLOYMENT ............................................... 10
2.3.1 Teacher recruitment and schools ...................... 11
2.3.2 Teacher recruitment and deployment in lo- fee and rural schools ............................................. 12
2.3.3 Teacher recruitment in elite and economic middle class schools ............................................... 13
2.3.4 Women and teacher recruitment and deployment ............................................. 14
2.4 TEACHER TURNOVER ........................................... 15
2.4.1 Teacher turnover and disruption in teaching and learning ... ............................................. 16
2.4.2 Teacher turnover and motivation .......................... 17
2.5 TEACHER PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT .......... 19
2.6 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ................................ 22
2.7 CONCLUSION .................................................. 24
CHAPTER THREE
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................... 26
3.2 RESEARCH PARADIGM ........................................... 26
3.3 RESEARCH APPROACH ........................................... 27
3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN ............................................... 27
3.5 RESEARCH SITE .................................................... 27
3.6 DATA COLLECTION ............................................... 28
3.7 DATA ANALYSIS ................................................... 29
3.8 RESEARCH QUALITY .............................................. 30
3.9 ETHICS IN RESEARCH ........................................... 31
3.10 CONCLUSION ....................................................... 32

CHAPTER FOUR
DATA ANALYSIS

4.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................... 33
4.2 THE STAR SCHOOL ............................................... 33
4.3 THE MOON SCHOOL .............................................. 34
4.4 TEACHER RECRUITMENT ............................ 35
   4.4.1 Private schools and female teachers .................. 38
4.5 TEACHER TURNOVER AND ITS IMPACT ON TEACHING
   AND LEARNING .................................................. 42
4.6 TEACHER RECRUITMENT AND PROFESSIONAL
   DEVELOPMENT .................................................. 48

CHAPTER FIVE
CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................... 53
5.2 SUMMARY ........................................................... 53
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Teacher recruitment</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Teacher turnover</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Teacher professional development</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4 School management</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 FURTHER RESEARCH</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 CONCLUSION</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my respected and dearly beloved parents, my father and mother, for their unremitting prayers for my success through each and every step of my life.

Secondly, the study could not have been carried out without the honest support and sacrifice of my wife Nayab and my two sons, Ahmed Hassan and Muhammad Hashir. I was far away from them during the whole period of my study. I want to express my profound appreciation to my wife and sons for their patience, love and prayers throughout my studies.

Lastly, Prof Dr. Clive Smith-my supervisor and mentor, his support throughout the completion of my master's was remarkable. He helped and guided me through each and every step of my dissertation. I am really grateful to Prof Dr. Clive Smith for his kindness, assistance and patience right through my studies.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACRONYMS</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>QR:</td>
<td>Qualitative Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;D:</td>
<td>Recruitment &amp; Deployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT:</td>
<td>Teacher Turnover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD:</td>
<td>Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTC:</td>
<td>Primary Teaching Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSC:</td>
<td>Secondary school Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSSE:</td>
<td>Higher Secondary School Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSc:</td>
<td>Bachelor of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA:</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEd:</td>
<td>Bachelor of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEd:</td>
<td>Masters in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSc:</td>
<td>Master of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA:</td>
<td>Master of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADT:</td>
<td>Associate Degree in Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIOU:</td>
<td>Allama Iqbal Open University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD:</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV:</td>
<td>Curriculum Vitae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFAQ:</td>
<td>Association for Academic Qualification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOU:</td>
<td>Memorandum of Understanding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDIX</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A:</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B:</td>
<td>Ethics Clearance Application</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DECLARATION

I hereby confirm that this thesis is my own work and all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of the completion of references.

I also declare that study has not been submitted for a degree at any other university.
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION
There are three types of schools in Pakistan: public-, private-, and religious (Deeni Madaris) schools. Private schools differ in terms of their nature; either catering to the rural poor, the economic middle class or the upper class.

In any school the role of the teacher is crucial in both teaching and learning. It is thus critically important to recruit quality teachers to produce well-educated and well-rounded learners for the market (Krasnoff, 2014). A well-qualified, balanced and professionally developed teacher is needed to meet learners’ academics needs.

This research is on the recruitment and deployment of teachers in private, middle-class schools in the cities of Rawalpindi and Islamabad in Pakistan. It highlights the process of teacher recruitment and deployment and the impact of this process on teaching and learning in these private schools.

1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE TOPIC
Pakistan is a low-income country where education is an immense challenge due to both the size and density of the population. It is estimated that over 5.5 million children are not in school and half of the total population is illiterate. Statistics show that 49% of the total population is literate with a ratio of 61% male literacy to 39% female literacy (Khan, n.d.:1). The education of a population of such size and density requires comprehensive planning, budgeting and concerted effort.

There has been a significant increase in the enrolment of learners in Pakistani private schools. Today, one third of all learners attend private school. These schools are considered crucial in terms of education provision (Nguyen & Raju,
In both teaching and learning the teacher is the most important element. Teachers thus play a substantial role in education. Effective educational activities and also the future of any nation are linked to teachers. It is therefore imperative that education department should have quality teachers available to build the new generation.

This study is based on Hammond (2010:21) and Krasnoff’s (2014:3) theories of the key factors that affect teacher recruitment and deployment. According to both Hammond (2010:21) and Krasnoff (2014:3) the recruitment of skilled and qualified teachers is vital for quality education, learner achievement, and smooth teaching and learning practices. The teaching profession in Pakistan’s foremost challenge is to attract academically qualified, well-prepared, motivated and skilled teachers. Unfortunately, a lack of incentives, below-average salary packages, job insecurity, insufficient opportunities for professional development, and unsatisfactory work environments not only contribute to the difficulties in recruiting teachers but also cause high teacher turnover.

Teaching is widely perceived as a low social status- and low income profession in Pakistan and many other parts of the world. Although the attraction of a profession can also be measured by its offered packages, incentives and work environment (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:214), highly qualified, competent people prefer to pursue professions that are better paid than teaching. The majority of middle-class private schools in Pakistan are experiencing a dearth in terms of attracting, recruiting and retaining quality teachers. The reason for this is the individual ownership of each school as a business enterprise. The need to show maximum profit impels schools to compromise on their quality of education by recruiting under-qualified teachers on low salary packages.

An employee’s commitment to their profession is often linked to the compensation they receive for their provision of services (Krasnoff, 2014:3). Two
schools (The Moon School & the Star School) in Pakistan were selected as a case study. In the Moon School, teacher salaries were between Rs11 500.00 – Rs18 500.00 per month. Only a few of the teachers were paid more than Rs15 000.00; the majority earned less than Rs15 000.00. In the Star School teacher salaries were significantly lower: ranging from Rs4 000.00 – Rs12 000.00 per month. Again, only a few of the teachers earned more than Rs9 000.00; the majority were paid less than this. The teachers who were paid less were found to be less qualified and less motivated. This lack of qualification and motivation clearly affected the smooth teaching and learning processes at these schools. A real teacher, who can bring about change in society by producing well-educated and well-rounder earners for the market, must be qualified academically, developed professionally and motivated internally. Real teachers can then only be recruited through striking packages and incentives (Halai & Durrani, 2016:63; Khan, n.d.:11).

Teaching has become a female-dominated profession in Pakistan. A large number of private schools prefer to recruit women as teachers. Over 70% of private school teachers are women - the majority being young, unmarried girls (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:2; Andrab, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). There are several reasons for this state of affairs. Firstly, the offered salary packages in private schools are not attractive, so men prefer not to work at private schools as teachers. In Pakistani culture men have to provide for dependents, so men demand higher salaries than women. Therefore, private schools offering lower salaries prioritise the recruitment of women over men. Secondly, the shorter working hours (7:30am to 2:30pm) also attract women as this leaves them time to look after their families.

Recruitment and turnover are interconnected. A poor salary package, unsatisfactory work environment and the quality of a teacher cause high turnover. This high turnover leads a school to constantly recruit new teachers for vacant posts. Studies show that almost 50% of teachers teaching in Pakistani
private schools leave the profession within the first five years of recruitment (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Guin, 2004:3). This means that, on average, private schools need to replace half of the total teaching staff every five years. Factors that contribute to teachers leaving the profession include female teachers getting married, pregnancy, child bearing and rearing, migration, the unsatisfactory salary packages and work environment, and job insecurity. Qualified teachers often leave schools as and when they get an offer for a better salary package.

1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM

Privatisation of education, especially primary and high school education is a serious problem in Pakistan. The radical upsurge in private schools has increased the demand for teachers to fulfil the education needs of learners. However, serious issues are not only the recruitment of quality teachers in middle-class private schools in Rawalpindi and Islamabad but also retaining them for longer periods. These issues originate as the schools cannot offer attractive salaries due to the limited resources generated in the form of monthly tuition fees (Khan & Aziz, 2013:58; Krasnoff, 2014:3; Ingersoll, 2003:9; Guin, 2004:2; Halai & Durrani, 2016:62).

As a large number of these schools are privately owned business enterprises, they depend on the tuition fees received from learners and are unable to offer attractive salaries to teachers. This, in turn, results in quality teachers leaving schools (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5). According to both Krasnoff (2014:3) and Guin (2004:3), almost 50% of teachers teaching in these private schools leave the profession within their first five years of being appointed. This disrupts the smooth running of a school’s planned activities. School management have to not only continue the recruitment process throughout the academic year but also recruit female teachers, with fewer needs and demands as compared to male teachers, on lower packages. Therefore, the teaching staff in private schools consist of over 70% female teachers, a proportion that is increasing day by day (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:2; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). Moreover, only
33% of the total recruited teachers in these private schools are academically qualified and have any pre- and in-service teacher training (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:14-16; Memon, 2007:47-55; Khan, n.d.:8).

The drastic increase in the number of private schools in Pakistan combined with the restlessness and confusion of parents in selecting a school for their children, led to this research on the recruitment and deployment of teachers in private schools and the impact of this on teaching and learning. This research aims to help school management and policy makers review the quality of schools and teachers and their impact on the needs and demands of learners in private schools.

1.4 AIM OF THE STUDY
The aim of the study is to determine how teachers in Pakistani private schools are recruited and deployed.

1.5 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY
The objectives of the study are:
   i. To describe the kind of people recruited to teach in Pakistani private schools.
   ii. To investigate the teacher recruitment and deployment processes; and
   iii. To explore whether there is any formal or informal professional development of these teachers.

1.6 METHODOLOGY
This section presents a brief summary of the research methodology employed in this study. Chapter three discusses research methodology in detail.

The purpose of the research is to explore teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools. The research is based on a constructivist paradigm that relies on the existing world. The qualitative research (QR) approach was
used for the research problem. A QR approach helps researchers to explore and investigate a specific social problem by studying the views and thoughts of the participants (Creswell, 2009:175).

A descriptive case study method was employed to conduct research on teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools. Case studies focus on particular situations or phenomena to produce a deeper understanding of a social problem (Creswell, 2009:8).

A purposive sampling technique was used for the collection of data. Individual, face-to-face interviews and group discussions were conducted with the participants on school premises. The data was collected personally (Shenton, 2004:64; Decrop, 2004); transcribed in Urdu, which is the first language of both the researcher and participants; and then translated into English.

The data gathered was organised according to the objectives of the study and then analysed using Creswell’s methodology (2009:186), which helps researchers to construct meanings and patterns (Gall, as cited in Winegardner 2001:5) from the collected data.

1.7 DISSERTATION OUTLINE
The introductory chapter of the study opens the door for readers and researchers to understand what the research entails. Chapter 2 provides an overview of previous research on the same, or similar, relevant topics. It provides a basis and guideline for the research of this study. Chapter 3 contains the research methodology used in the excavation of the research topic as well as the findings and deeper meanings of the problem. Chapter 4 presents and discusses the findings of the research (from the data generated in interviews with the research participants). Chapter 5 provides a conclusion on the research and recommendations to researchers for further investigation and study. The researcher provides guidelines (learnt through personal experience) to later
researchers not only on how to enter the field and decide what is most important to investigate but also on how to equip themselves to achieve their goals using a minimum of resources (human-, capital-, and time-) to get a maximum result.
CHAPTER TWO
A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

2.1 INTRODUCTION
This research examines teacher recruitment and deployment (R&D) in Pakistani private schools. First, this chapter introduces the types of schools in the research area in two cities in Pakistan: Rawalpindi and Islamabad. Secondly is a section on teacher recruitment and deployment in low-fee rural schools; economic middle-class schools; and economic elite- or upper class schools. This section also looks at the recruitment and deployment of women in the different schools. The third section of this chapter is a demonstration of literature on teacher turnover (TT); turnover and disruption in teaching and learning; and motivational factors that can lead to teachers remaining at a school and in the profession. After that a section on teachers’ professional development (PD) in Pakistani private schools - especially in middle-class private schools is presented. Lastly, this chapter presents the conceptual framework for the study and the conclusion of the literature review.

In conducting this research on the R&D of teachers in Pakistani private schools, the University of Johannesburg’s library, UJoogle (an online search engine available to students of the University of Johannesburg) was utilised. UJoogle granted the researcher access to many online databases, such as EBSCO, Springer Link and Cambridge Journals. Google Scholar was also helpful in obtaining and excavating relevant published articles and journals. The keywords used to flag the relevant literature were: teacher’s recruitment, teacher deployment, teacher’s professional development and teacher turnover. In considering teacher R&D, teachers’ PD and TT in a Pakistani context, the researcher found that although some research has been done on public schools, the research done on private schools is very limited.
2.2 TYPES OF PRIVATE SCHOOLS AND TEACHER RECRUITMENT

According to Pakistan’s National Education Census 2005, of a total of 227,791 educational institutions, 76,047 institutes were private. These private institutions catered to 33% of enrolled students and employed 47% of hired teaching staff in Pakistan (Memon, 2007:52). Of the teachers employed in private schools, 75% were female (Khan, n.d.:5; Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5; Nguyen & Raju, 2014:2).

Pakistan has a variety of private schools catering to learners with different social- and financial backgrounds. Elite- or upper-class schools accommodate learners whose families are from a strong economic background. These are full English-medium schools with a high quality of education. These schools are owned by individuals or groups of people and run as business enterprises. Such schools hire professional and qualified teachers; organise in-service teacher training programmes (on- and off the premises of the schools); and pay reasonable salaries, bonuses and incentives to teachers for motivation (Khan, n.d.:5).

Middle-class schools (those catering to learners from economic middle-class families) are huge in number all over Pakistan - especially in urban areas. Most of these schools are owned by individuals. In this category, there are many chain schools (big or small) that cater to learners from economic middle-class and some upper-class families. Some of these schools hire academically qualified, professional teachers, while others hire generally qualified teachers, but are not concerned with teachers’ professional qualifications and teaching skills. These schools have average-to-high tuition fees: dependent on the school’s location and facilities (Khan, n.d.:5). Low-fee and rural schools accommodate learners from poor families. They hire less qualified or under-qualified teachers from the vicinity of the school and pay them very low wages. The quality of the education in these schools is not satisfactory. However, on average, these economic middle class private schools are still produce better results and have healthier perception then the Pakistani public schools (Khan, n.d.:5; Wani, 2017).
Private enterprise schools are completely dependent on the tuition fees received from their students at the end of each month. Their survival therefore depends on keeping costs low: by employing low-cost teachers and limiting spending on rent for properties in which to house the schools. The survival of these schools could thus be ensured only through the employment of local, untrained, young, moderately educated teachers appointed on very low salary packages with no job security and incentives (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2005:4).

2.3 TEACHER RECRUITMENT AND PROFESSIONAL DEPLOYMENT

Building a professional teaching staff requires the recruitment of qualified and trained teachers (Krasnoff, 2014:5). It is important to ensure that teachers’ qualifications and training are adequate to meet students’ needs. Education law in Pakistan states that teachers ought to meet the minimum level of qualification: a bachelor’s degree and certificate in teaching (Krasnoff, 2014:1; Memon, 2007:47-55). The law recognises that in an education system the quality of the teachers and teaching is one of the main factors in the transfer of knowledge to, and the growth of, students. It is then crucial that schools recruit qualified, quality teachers (Ciraso, 2012:1779; Ingersoll, 1999:26). For private schools, teacher recruitment and deployment is not merely a matter of appointing a teacher, it is a challenge to provide quality teachers for students and retain them at the school for a longer period. A number of researchers have found that the challenge of recruiting experienced, qualified, trained teachers is a serious issue faced by the majority of Pakistani rural, poor- and middle-class schools (Halai & Durrani, 2016:62).

Teacher recruitment and deployment affect the teaching and learning process. Therefore the major factors, such as teacher recruitment and the insight of schools; teacher recruitment and deployment in low-fee, rural schools; teacher recruitment in elite- and middle-class (economic middle-class) schools; and women and teacher recruitment and deployment, must be addressed.
2.3.1 Teacher recruitment and schools

A large number of private schools in urban and rural areas cater to children from middle- and lower-middle income families. These schools are affordable as they charge low to moderate tuition fees and thus pay their teachers low wages (Amjad & MacLeod, 2014:23, Andrabi, et. al., 2002:14-16). They have little or no inclination to recruit teachers who are qualified professionally and have pre-service teachers’ training (Memon, 2007:50). Their preference is to hire teachers from the school’s vicinity on low salary packages. The percentage of trained and qualified teachers in private schools was only 33% in the year 2012 (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:17). Consequently, there is a need for these private schools to recruit professionally qualified teachers to fulfil the education needs of learners (Memon, 2007:50).

Many learners with average school-leaving results choose to become teachers which ultimately affect teaching and learning process in the form of the quality of the education. Conversely, higher-performing school leavers usually prefer careers other than teaching (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:214). This ultimately affects teaching and learning process in the form of the quality of education product. There is also the general perception of teaching as a low social status career and a low-salary profession in Pakistan and most of the world. In reality, the social status and salary packages in the teaching profession are too low to attract well-qualified, high-performing candidates (Berry, 2004:11). This contributes to the majority of Pakistani private schools filling a large number of teaching vacancies with under-qualified, uncertified teachers (Nawaz & Yasin, 2015:1). The use of effective strategies by the education department to make teaching an attractive profession can provide the possibility for schools to recruit quality teachers (Abdou & Zaalouk, 2012:10).

Research in Pakistan has found that in spite of the recruitment of candidates that obtained an average grade academically, private school teachers perform much better than their public school counterparts. This is in spite of the recruitment of
qualified, professional teachers at public schools. This situation can be ascribed to an acute management and supervision crisis in public schools (Khan, n.d.:3,9,14). A number of other factors contribute to private school teachers performing better than those in public schools. Firstly, private school teachers have no role in planning and policy making for the teaching and learning process - their role at school is to execute set plans and targets within specific time periods prescribed by school management (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:7). Secondly, the strict managerial policies and practices of private schools ensure high teacher attendance and better performance of learners in academic tests (Khan, n.d.:9; Wani, 2017). Thirdly, teachers in private schools feel more accountable to parents. School management fears that parents will pull fee-paying children from the school if they deem that the school is not fulfilling the educational needs and demands of their children. Tuition fees are thus a major drive to keep school administrations more efficient and to deliver quality education (Wani, 2017).

2.3.2 Teacher recruitment and deployment in low-fee and rural schools

Schools in rural and remote areas of Pakistan always face a shortage of qualified, trained teachers. Most of the schools in rural areas are unable to recruit qualified, trained teachers from the school’s locality and teachers from urban areas avoid joining such schools (Halai & Durrani, 2016:62). Schools in poor, rural areas have no criteria for teacher recruitment. Such schools prefer to hire young girls from the school’s vicinity even with a minimum qualification on a very low salary package with no job contract and security (Khan, n.d.:15, 16). The quality of education in the majority of schools in rural areas and areas surrounding cities in Pakistan is poor due to the shortage of both resources and qualified, trained teachers (Khan, n.d.:5).

It has been found that learners perform significantly better where they are taught by a teacher who is professionally qualified as compared to a poorly qualified, non-professional teacher. Professional qualification, teaching experience, participation in teacher training, and workshops make a teacher and consequently the teaching and learning process more effective. However, the recruitment of highly qualified teachers is challenging in most private schools but especially in rural and poor
areas. Highly qualified teachers demand handsome rewards in return of their services (Krasnoff, 2014:2; Khan, n.d.:6; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:17). The situation is thus that schools are unable to afford quality teachers (who expect proper compensation on the basis of having proper academic and professional qualification) because low-income parents are unable to afford high tuition fees (Memon, 2007:50). Except for some chain schools (schools having branches in different areas of big cities or in different parts of the country under the same name, registration number, syllabus, uniform, vacation, examination, fees and teacher salary structures) and elite schools (that account for a small portion of total private schooling) the majority of private schools recruit under-qualified, untrained teachers (intermediate; 12 years of schooling and a bachelor’s degree to 14 years of schooling) and pay them comparatively less than teachers at chain- and elite schools in addition to them having no job security (Memon, 2007:50).

2.3.3 Teacher recruitment in elite and economic middle-class schools
Elite private schools usually announce teaching vacancies in local- and national newspapers. Candidate CVs are received and a written test followed by an interview and demonstration are conducted. These schools prefer to recruit highly qualified teachers with a minimum qualification of a master’s degree in the required subjects along with professional qualification as a subject teacher. These schools pay their teachers handsome salaries as well as bonuses and incentives.

In many economic middle-class private schools, teacher recruitment is a major problem that continues throughout the academic year (Krasnoff, 2014:2,3; Khan & Aziz, 2013:1). These schools usually recruit teachers through reference and do not emphasise written tests and formal interviews. In some cases, they do ask candidates for a demonstration but not in all instances. Such schools prefer to hire qualified, skilled teachers but in most cases they recruit professionally unqualified teachers (only some of which are fluent in English). They offer low salary packages with no bonuses or incentives. Contracts are usually for a year - extendable on the basis of teacher performance.
As mentioned above, in spite of many private schools recruiting a large number of uncertified teachers, these schools produce better learning outcomes and academic results and their learners have better labour market outcomes compared to learner’s from government schools. This is due to the strict managerial practices in private schools (Aslam, 2009:2; Lodhi, 2017:n.p).

### 2.3.4 Women and teacher recruitment and deployment

A large number of teachers at private schools in Pakistan are neither qualified nor trained (Memon, 2007:48) and the majority of private school teachers are female (Khan, n.d.:3). Studies show that teaching has become a female dominated profession, especially in private-sector education in Pakistan (Guarino, Santibanez & Delay, 2006: 179). Over 70% of teachers recruited by Pakistani private schools are women and the percentage of female teachers is increasing day by day (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). The reason for the recruitment of such a high percentage of female teachers by private schools (especially in moderate and poor rural areas) is the low salary package offered (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:2). Public schools are funded by the government whereas private schools do not receive any funding from government. The majority of these schools are individual enterprises run for the purpose of income generation. They have to raise money for their own survival and to pay the salaries of teaching and non-teaching staff (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:1). These schools pay very low wages to hired teachers because of the limited resources generated through the collection of monthly tuition fees (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:1; Amjad & MacLeod, 2014:23, Andrabi, et. al., 2002:14-16). Moreover, it is convenient for women to choose teaching as a profession because of the shorter working hours as compared to other jobs and occupations (Khan, n.d.:3).

It is believed that the performance of learners depends on the quality of the teacher. However, the recruitment of quality teachers is linked to the salary package a school offers their teachers. Quality teachers demand attractive salary packages, which are comparable to other professions and career paths, as well as incentives and bonuses. The limited resources of private middle-class and poor, rural schools...
necessitate the appointment of female teachers on low salary packages (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:1, 5). These teachers differ from those in government- and upper-class schools as they are inexperienced, young, usually unmarried, and mostly untrained local women (Amjad & MacLeod, 2014:23, Andrabi, et. al., 2002:14-16). Limited resources and schools as business enterprises have made teaching a feminised profession (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5).

2.4 TEACHER TURNOVER
Teaching has become a revolving-door occupation in Pakistan as a large number of teachers are switching to other, non-teaching jobs (Nawaz & Yasin, 2015:1; Ingersoll, 2003:11), while highly qualified teachers go abroad, especially to European countries, for better jobs and salary packages (Memon, 2007:48). Many teachers resign due to being recruited by higher-performing schools or other departments for better salary packages. This causes an acute shortage of qualified teachers in rural-, poor and middle-class schools (Krasnoff, 2014:1; Ingersoll, 2003:9). Research shows that almost 50% of teachers teaching in private schools leave the profession within five years, which disrupts the smooth running of a school planned activities (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Guin, 2004:3). It has been found that working conditions, salary packages, rewards and incentives are the major factors that cause teachers to remain in the profession (Guarino, Santibanez, & Daley, 2006:184). The lack of attractive compensation packages at many rural, poor- and middle-class Pakistani private schools means they not only fail to attract quality teachers but also have high teacher turnover (Krasnoff, 2014:2,3; Khan, n.d:1).

Teacher turnover is high in Pakistani private schools, especially in rural, poor- and middle-class schools. There are several factors that contribute to teachers leaving the profession. A large number of teachers depart the profession within their first five years of teaching. Less- or under-qualified teachers tend to have a higher turnover rate than qualified, professional teachers. Under-qualified teachers face more job insecurity, which leads to them leaving the profession sooner, while qualified, professional teachers stay longer (Khan & Aziz, 2013:59). It is also evident that
Teacher turnover is a severe problem for Pakistani private schools. According to Ingersoll (2003:9), turnover can be described in two different terms. The first is movers, also known as “migration”, which means the movement of a teacher from one school to another in the same area or any other school in the country or world. The other term is leavers, meaning “attrition”, which indicates that a teacher has left the teaching profession permanently and chosen another occupation. Ingersoll (2003:9), further explained that migration does not affect the supply and demand of teachers in the department of education. However, attrition badly disorders the smooth running of teaching and learning processes in schools. It also negatively impacts school management, as recruiting a new teacher is not a straightforward, easy task. Teacher recruitment is also a time-consuming task that requires human- and capital resources. Lastly, high teacher turnover also necessitates the continuous professional development of newly recruited teachers, which is crucial for the school and the department of the education (Khan & Aziz, 2013:59).

2.4.1 Teacher turnover and disruption of teaching and learning
Teachers turnover is one of the most serious and extensive problems that a large number of private schools in Pakistan face (Khan & Aziz, 2003:58). It significantly impacts learner achievement and interrupts the day-to-day planned syllabus and activities designed by school management for the academic year (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Ingersoll, 2003:9; Guin, 2004:2). Excessive workload, low salary packages, poor working conditions and the perception of teaching as a low-status profession demotivate teachers and lead them to leaving the profession (Krasnoff, 2014:2,3; Khan, n.d:1).

High turnover also has a negative impact on relationship- and trust building between teaching staff, both of which are needed if teachers are to work as a team. In
building relationships, people need to have some interaction and experience with the other person, which provides the basis for trust. In schools where turnover is high, it is difficult for teachers to establish relationships and trust with newly hired teachers. This ultimately interrupts the performance of the school and of tasks planned to be achieved through collective effort. It also creates instability in team work that disrupts the smooth running of planned activities (Guin, 2004:3).

The achievement of learners predicts the interaction and the quality of relationships between teachers and between teachers and learners. When a teacher leaves the school, the held relationship between the teacher and learners becomes distorted. It takes time for a newly hired teacher to harmonise and form relationships with learners and fellow teachers. Thus, learner achievement is negatively affected by teacher turnover, as it affects the held relationships at school (Ronfeldt, Loeb & Wyckoff 2013:5 and Khan, n.d.:217).

Teacher turnover is a problem not only for learners but also for schools. High turnover increases the demand for recruitment as well as the professional development of newly recruited teachers. Schools then fill vacant posts, regardless of the qualification and quality of a teacher. Only a qualified, skilled teacher creates a difference in the transformation of knowledge to a new generation and their preparedness to accept the challenges of the modern world (Ingersoll, 2003:10).

2.4.2 Teacher turnover and motivation

It is believed that learner performance is directly related to a teacher’s qualification, training, experience, motivation and commitment to their profession (Khan, n.d.:212; Memon, 2007:53). Commitment and motivation tend to be strongly associated with the offered salary package as well as the fulfilment of other basic needs. The offered salary packages (between Rs4 000.00 to Rs18 500.00 per month) of teachers at middle-class and rural private schools are on average five times less than those of their public school counterparts (Khan,n.d.:23; Memon, 2007:50). Added to this is the fact that these private school teachers also lack job security (Khan,n.d.:23;
Only a few teachers at private schools are paid more than Rs15,000.00 and almost all private schools sign only one-year teaching contracts with their teachers (Khan, n.d.:23; Wani, 2017). The motivation of teachers is determined by the rewards and incentives received in return for their provision of service - this can play a positive role in the reduction of teacher turnover (Khan, n.d.:1). It is also widely accepted that teaching is not an attractive profession for most academic high performers, because of the low offered salary packages and perceived low-social status of the profession (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:214). A large number of private school teachers do not want to remain in the teaching profession. Most of them are in the profession because they were free at home and it was the only option available to them. Thus, whenever they encounter an opportunity better than teaching and more to their advantage they easily switch to another profession (Khan, n.d.:16).

Motivation and job satisfaction are the keys to high performance and productivity of an employee. These are determined by the salary package, job security, a comfortable work environment, self-respect, opportunities for personal- and professional development, and a friendly working relationship with colleagues, the school principle and management, students, parents and the community (Khan, n.d.:1; Guin, 2004:16). Work environment, salary, incentives and bonuses are sources of attraction to any profession (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2005:1). Moreover, cash incentives might enhance teacher performance and stimulate them to remain in the teaching profession (Halai & Durrani, 2016:63; Khan, n.d.:11). Teachers with poor salary packages, no incentives or bonuses usually enter the classroom with less motivation and more unprepared lessons, which affect teaching and learning and, in turn, again increase turnover (Krasnoff, 2014:1). The teaching profession needs intervention in the form of incentives, increments and promotions to motivate high performers towards teaching (Halai & Durrani, 2016:63; Khan, n.d.:11).

Teaching has become a women-dominant profession in Pakistan: over 70% of teachers in private schools are female (Khan, n.d.:5; Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5; Nguyen & Raju, 2014:2). The turnover for female teachers is moderate to high in
middle-class and poor, rural schools. This turnover is caused by job offers from other schools and in other fields; female teachers getting married to a partner away from the locality of the school; admission to university for further education; and family migration from rural- to urban areas or urban- to urban areas. Although these factors play a role, the low salary packages at private schools remain one of the strongest de-motivators to staying at the school or in the profession (Khan, n.d.:16). High teacher turnover has a significant effect on the performance and academic results of learners (Halai & Durrani, 2016:63). Educational experts and research show that a newly hired teacher requires three to seven years to become a professional, productive teacher (Krasnoff, 2014:6).

A professional and competent school principal, who has motivational and counselling skills, can reduce teacher turnover. The provision of skills development opportunities and the involvement of teachers in decision-making and school improvement programmes also motivate teachers to stay in the profession, which then decreases teacher turnover (Krasnoff, 2014:5, 6). Pakistani schools have the acute need to recruit quality, qualified teachers to the teaching profession in order to produce well-qualified learners, who are ready for the market and can face the challenges of the modern world (Andrabi, Das & khwaja, 2005:1).

2.5 TEACHER PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT
Educational privatisation and the drastic increase in the number of private schools have intensified the demand for professional teachers in Pakistan (Halai & Durrani, 2106:60). In Pakistan, in the past, four types of pre-service teacher qualification/training had to be completed for a person to qualify as a teacher. First, a Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC), which required the completion of a Secondary School Certificate (SSC) and equalled 10 years of education. Second, a Certificate of Teaching (CT), which required the completion of a Higher Secondary School Certificate (HSSC) and was 12 years of education. Thirdly, a Bachelor of Education (BEd) was needed, which required the attainment of a Bachelor of Science (BSc) or Bachelor of Arts (BA) and was 14 years of education. Lastly, a Master's in Education
(MEd) had to be completed, which required a master's degree in the science or arts (MA or MSc) and was then 16 years of education (Khan, n.d.:7).

The education department and policy makers in Pakistan identified that if teachers were to satisfy professional requirements and meet the demands of learners in the classroom, the teaching profession needed reforms. Thus, in the National Education Policy 2009 it was decided that to become a primary school teacher would require a two-year Associate Degree in Teaching (ADT) - increasing the required education for primary school teachers from 10 to 14 years. This is equal to a 12-year education in developed countries (Halai & Durrani, 2016:60, 61). The professional qualification required to become a teacher in Pakistan is still low compared to the requirements in developed countries. However, a mean of 14.3 years of education is mandatory in most countries (Khan, n.d.:14).

Private school teachers need the opportunity to equip themselves professionally by attending pre- and in-service teacher training (Krasnoff, 2014:1), but the provision for teacher training opportunities in Pakistani private schools is minimal (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:7). Most of the teachers at middle-class, lower-middle class and poor private schools have little to no possibility of professional training during their teaching contract (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Khan, n.d.:8). Only 33% of teachers employed by private schools are academically qualified and have had any pre- and in-service training (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:14-16; Memon, 2007:47-55; Khan, n.d.:8). The education department also lacks teacher training institutes and qualified educators to train newly recruited teachers. There is only one university- Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) that offers teacher training courses along with other disciplines on a large scale (Memon, 2007:49).

The success of the school and learner is directly related to teachers’ qualifications and professional skills. Teachers should be provided the opportunities for professional and skills development on a regular basis; according to the needs and demands of the curriculum (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:15). Some middle-class and chain
schools arrange teacher training workshops on and off school premises from time to time. However, the majority of these schools have no or very little focus on their teachers' professional development. The opportunity to attend training workshops is only given to those teachers who have more than two years of teaching experience at the same school and have signed a bond to not leave the school for a specific period of time (Khan, n.d.:9).

Effective teaching and learning is possible if teachers are well-equipped, knowledgeable and have command of the subjects they teach (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2005:3). Studies show that the professional development of teachers increases their motivation and commitment (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:10). It also makes teachers feel more comfortable when performing diverse and complex tasks at schools (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:12).

Only elite- or upper class private schools in Pakistan have regular training programmes for their teachers and spend adequate time on teacher training throughout the academic year. The allocation of days in the academic calendar for teacher training greatly impacts the teaching and learning process and is reflected in the academic performance of learners. Some developed countries, such as Finland, Singapore and Japan, invest up to 40% of their working time in teacher training and skills development (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:215). In South Korea teachers spend 35% of their time on teaching, lesson planning, monitoring, counselling and the evaluation of learners, while 65% of their time is spent on teachers’ skills development. Teachers’ professional development, their involvement in lesson planning, frequent classroom visits of teachers, and interaction with learners are factors that positively affect teaching and learning and learner performance. On the other hand, Pakistani schools (private and public) have no or very little teacher time in academic calendars allocated for teachers’ professional development (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:215). Teacher training and professional development play a key role in learner performance - thus due emphasis must be placed on the training of teachers at private schools (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:7).
The role of the school head/principal as a leader is crucial to the teaching and learning process. The provision of professional development opportunities and the enhancement of relevant teaching skills and capabilities depend on the school head/principal – as they provide the opportunities to teachers to improve teaching skills through developmental stages (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:15, 17). Professional and skills development capabilities could be attained by involving teachers in relationship building, embedding them in classroom activities, presenting teachers with opportunities to enhance their leadership skills and providing them with emotional and administrative support (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:15,16). Teachers’ professional development is thus very important, but even more crucial is an environment where teachers can practice their skills, which avoids training practices being fruitless in outcome (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:17).

2.6 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK
The study is embedded in the Hammond (2010:21) and Krasnoff (2014:3) framework for the core factors of teacher recruitment and deployment. The benefits reaped from the recruitment and deployment of highly qualified, skilled teachers is vital to learner achievement and a smooth teaching and learning process. It is, however, challenging for the teaching profession in middle class private schools to attract academically qualified, well-prepared, skilled and experienced teachers to choose teaching as a profession (Krasnoff, 2014:5). According to both Hammond (2010) and Krasnoff (2014), the major factors affecting teacher recruitment, deployment and turnover are: remuneration, working conditions, professional development, mentoring and support.

The majority of high performers do not choose to academically qualify as teachers, because of the low offered salary packages and low social status of the profession. The attraction of a profession is determined by the remuneration packages offered in that profession (Khan & Afridi, n.d.:214). Characteristically, less-qualified teachers are paid less and are less prepared, which significantly affects effective teaching and learning and results in high teacher turnover (Krasnoff, 2014:3). The teaching
profession must become competitive with other occupations in terms of wages and incentives to attract well-qualified, high-performing people. An attractive occupation demands better salary packages and incentives to attract and hire quality staff. Research has shown that for teaching the overall salary packages are low when compared to other professions (Hammond, 2010:20). Teachers are paid 15% to 30% less than people in many other non-teaching professions. The low salary packages negatively affect teacher commitment, which leads to higher turnover in rural- and poor areas as compared to middle-class and elite schools in urban areas (Hammond, 2010:20).

Studies show that working conditions and an attractive school environment play a major role in attracting academically qualified people to choose teaching as a profession (Hammond, 2010:21). Highly qualified, certified teachers usually expect attractive packages and a good working environment at school to maintain effective teaching and learning. Qualified teachers could be recruited and retained if school management and leaders provide a smart working atmosphere and involve teachers in the decision-making process. The involvement of teachers in decision making creates teacher motivation and satisfaction, which leads to higher teacher effectiveness and decreases turnover.

Poor working conditions, an excessive workload and weak management- and managerial policies result in teachers becoming de-motivated regarding the profession (Krasnoff, 2014:5). Furthermore, there is big difference between rural, poor schools, middle-class, and elite schools when it comes to the involvement of teachers in decision making; the working conditions at school; and teachers’ workload. A large number of rural- and some middle-class schools hardly recruit and retain qualified teachers due to both the shortage of financial resources and the poor working conditions at the schools (Hammond, 2010:1).

The professional development of recruited teachers is vital to effective teaching and learner achievement, as the success of learners is linked to teacher competency
Newly recruited teachers need skills development opportunities to equip themselves professionally - by attending teacher development sessions they can better meet learners’ academic needs. Providing teachers with skills development facilities results in the production of high achievements in terms of learners’ academic results and also minimises the teacher turnover rate (Krasnoff, 2014:5). Many studies (Hammond, 2010:22; Krasnoff, 2014:3) show that turnover is higher in schools that are less focused on teacher development. Over 50% of uncertified teachers in Pakistan leave teaching within five years: 33% leave the profession within three years of recruitment - compared to a lower rate of 14% for certified, trained teachers (Hammond, 2010:22; Krasnoff, 2014:3). Newly recruited teachers who are provided a chance to develop professional skills leave the profession at half the rate of those who had no chance to improve their professional skills. A well-prepared teacher is more likely to stay in the profession than a less- or poorly prepared one (Hammond, 2010:22).

Evidence suggests that recruitment of quality teachers is crucial to school- and learner achievement. The achievements of learners (in terms of academic results) are significantly higher where they are taught by a teacher who is effective and qualified in their subject field. The effectiveness of a teacher is determined by their academic background, professional development, teaching experience and motivation regarding the teaching profession (Hammond, 2010:17). Private schools in Pakistan need to develop effective policies to not only attract academically qualified, high-performance teachers but also reduce turnover and attrition. A well-prepared teacher mentoring- and support programme can attract teachers to the teaching profession and also recruit and retain effective, skilled teachers in the profession (Krasnoff, 2011:8 and Hammond, 2010:24).

2.7 CONCLUSION

This chapter is an overview of the literature and research on the research topic: teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools. Using a descriptive approach, this chapter provides a bigger picture of the situation in such private
schools. The following chapter describes the methodology used to collect, interpret and analyse the data to support this study.
CHAPTER THREE
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION
This study is mainly concerned with examining the views and thoughts of its interviewed participants on teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools in Rawalpindi and Islamabad.

To start with, a constructivist paradigm approach (Creswell, 2009:8) was used to ensure that the findings of the research are the voices of its participants. This then led to the use of a qualitative research approach to explore and draw meaning from the chosen topic. Subsequently, a descriptive case study design explained how and why it was important to apply this design to this research. Next is a discussion on the data-gathering tools, which consist of a purposive sampling technique - individual, face-to-face interviews and focus group discussions. Lastly, this chapter explores the data analysis method and ethical issues of the research.

3.2 RESEARCH PARADIGM
A research paradigm guides the researcher in the collection, analysis, interpretation and discussion of the research questions required to gain a deep understanding of a specific problem. For this study, a constructivist paradigm was used to underpin the research questions, as the constructivist paradigm mainly focuses on participant voices, views and interpretations and not the researcher’s thoughts and feelings (Creswell, 2009:8). According to Macfarlane (2000: n.p.), the constructivist paradigm seeks to understand the phenomenon studied in terms of the experience of the people involved - through investigation and exploration. To accomplish the set target, it is imperative that the researcher become part of the situation and involved with the people. The researcher must discuss, share and visualise the participants’ experiences and perceptions of the problem. To gain understanding of the situation in this research, the researcher spent more than a month in the field; discussing the matter at hand in detail with participants.
3.3 RESEARCH APPROACH
For this case study a qualitative research (QR) approach was utilised to draw meaning from a specific research question. QR helps researchers to investigate, explore and understand a particular social problem by getting to know more about people’s views and thoughts on it (Creswell, 2009:175). QR also assists in the development of literature through the rigorous study of a social problem and by means of language (Lechman, n.d.:23). A reliance on text data and unique data analysis steps further characterise QR. It draws on diverse strategies of inquiry and is often practiced in organisational contexts and in education.

3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN
A descriptive case study design (Creswell, 2009:13) was employed to explore and inquire into the phenomenon of teacher recruitment and deployment. A descriptive case study approach was suitable, as the phenomenon is very much rooted in the research problem. Moreover, “case studies help researchers to explore and inquire into detailed and targeted social problems in a bound time period” (Creswell, 2009:13). According to Yin (2012:4) and Denzin and Lincoln (1994:236), a case study is a “derive” to comprehend a single real-world entity in deeper meaning, rather than to generalise the research, especially when the context of the phenomenon is not clear. In this case the context of the research into the single entity was teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools. In light of this, case study methodology was selected to grant the researcher (and reader) a deeper understanding of the research topic.

3.5 RESEARCH SITE
Two private schools in which study the phenomenon (not only the procedure of teacher recruitment and deployment but also how teachers are developed professionally in private schools) were selected using a purposive sampling technique. These schools were selected for the research as they are regarded as quality education providers in their respective areas and match the criterion (case
study) of the research problem. Both of the schools are considered as quality education providers in their areas by parents and the community and as claimed by school management. Moreover, these two schools are both private enterprises catering to children from middle-class families, but their syllabi, fee structures, required teacher qualifications and offered salary packages are dissimilar. The Moon is a school located in Rawalpindi (along with many other private schools). The Star School is located in a richly populated area in the surrounds of the capital city of Pakistan. The Moon is one of 450 branches of a chain operated across the country. This chain school is owned by a group of people, serves rural- and urban areas, and caters to middle-class families. The Star School is an individually owned enterprise. It serves the community, claiming to be a quality education provider among many other individually owned chain- and NGO schools.

3.6 DATA COLLECTION
A purposive sampling technique was used to collect data. Individual, face-to-face interviews and focus group discussions (FGDs) were employed as methods of data collection. The school principal/owner and three teachers from each school were interviewed. The school principal/owner of each institution was selected because of their relevant position (in the study’s context) in each school. The interview with the school owner was conducted off the school premises, as this was convenient for him. All other interviews were also conducted on school premises during breaks. An interview of 40–50 minutes was conducted with each school principal/owner. To ensure the dependability (Shenton, 2004:71) of the research, in-depth, face-to-face interviews of 35–45 minutes were carry out with each of the selected teachers. All interviews were transcribed by the researcher in a research diary, but audio was not recorded.

The two FGDs with teachers helped the researcher to lead participants to deeper discussion and to excavate detailed information regarding the research problem (Delamont, 2012:392). Both FGDs lasted 45–60 minutes with a representative group of five to seven teachers present. The participants of both FGDs were not the same
teachers as those whom the researcher had interviewed individually. Of the two FGDs, audio from the second one was recorded with consent of the participants. Being a new researcher, in his first focus group discussion, the researcher had expected that he would be able to make notes of the discussion points. Hence, the researcher had not been prepared to make audio recordings before entering the field. During the first FGD the researcher realised that for a single person to note everything said in the research diary was not possible. The best way to keep discussions on record is to use audio recordings. Therefore, this was set up only for the second FGD. The individual interviews were transcribed in bullet point format in the research diary (during discussions) and then elaborated on to keep a comprehensive record of all interviews for discussion and the presentation of data. A research diary can provide assurance to both the researcher and reader that findings are the reflections of a thorough, thoughtful and comprehensive process of data collection – and not the researcher’s own views and remarks (Thomson, 2014:n.p).

Urdu is the first language of both the researcher and participants. Urdu was therefore employed as the language of communication with the participants. This ensured a deeper understanding of questions and answers in interviews and FGDs. Notes were made in the research diary of all conversations (with teachers and the school principal/owner) on the research topic. The interviews (except with the school owner) were conducted on school premises and transcribed by the researcher. The researcher personally conducted interviews; made transcriptions and took field notes to ensure first-hand, valid information, views and knowledge. This warrants that the findings are based on neutrality - the researcher has presented the participants’ views and thoughts and not his own (Shenton, 2004:64; Decrop, 2004).

3.7 DATA ANALYSIS
The qualitative data analysis method is the systematic study of participant views, thoughts and answers received in response to a researcher’s inquiries into a specific social problem (Marshall & Rossman, 2011:207). The process involves the collection
of data in the field; sorting the collected data according to the objectives and structure of the research; and, finally, giving a theme and wording to the collected data so that the problem can be identified and meanings understood (Creswell, 1994:53; Creswell, 2009:186). Cresswell (2009:186) further explained that data analysis methods help qualitative researchers to construct and draw meaning from collected data.

After having collected the raw data for this study, the data was read and reread to provide the researcher a general sense of it. Every participant’s name, academic and professional qualifications, marital status, age, salary and teaching experience was collated - which was necessary for the writing of the data analysis chapter. Next, the relevant information was categorised according to the objectives of the study by using a coding technique (Creswell, 2009:186; Marshall & Rossman, 2011:212). Coding techniques help researchers assign themes and shapes to raw, “unstructured” data (Creswell, 1994:53). A theme was generated from the categorised data in the research diary. Finally, the information was translated from Urdu to English (see FGD appendix A).

**3.8 RESEARCH QUALITY**

Research quality means that the researcher has employed certain approaches to ensure the correctness and authenticity of the research findings (Gibbs, 2007 as cited in Creswell, 2009:190). Research is about the recognition of self- and others’ truth, honesty and loyalty (Potvin, 2013:219). This research was conducted with honesty and reflexivity. The source of data was the teachers of two different schools in two cities in Pakistan - Rawalpindi and Islamabad. To ensure the trustworthiness of research it is crucial to establish trust between the participants and the researcher. This warrants findings that are based on neutrality - where the researcher presents the participants’ views but not his own thoughts (Shenton, 2004:64; Decrop, 2004:102). To guarantee this, the researcher spent more than 40 days in the field to build trust with the participants and undertake the research. The credibility of the researcher is important in research (Patton as cited in Shenton,
2004:68), as the researcher is key to data collection, analysis, and establishing findings. To ensure credibility, the collected data from individual, face-to-face interviews and FGDs were compared and cross-checked. Chapter 4 provides rich descriptions and narrative explanations of the problem of how teachers in Pakistani private schools are recruited and deployed. This enables readers to immerse themselves in the research. The dependability of the research is guaranteed through the in-depth (Shenton, 2004:71) face-to-face individual and focus-group interviews conducted. These enabled the researcher to discover “rich, detailed” and comprehensive data from the participants of the research (Bickman & Rog, 2009:244). The confirmability of research is ensured through the researcher being unbiased and providing results and findings based on the participants’ views and thoughts (Shenton, 2004:72). To ensure conformability and avoid the risk of researcher bias, the researcher did not share his personal experience of private schools and teachers with the participants. Emphasis was placed on the participants’ words and opinions (Bickman & Rog, 2009:243).

3.9 ETHICS IN RESEARCH

The research was conducted at two different schools. Excluding one school owner, all of the participants were unknown to the researcher. Access to the Star school was negotiated with the owner of the school. Access to the Moon was obtained by contacting the chain’s CEO, who referred the researcher to the regional director, who in turn provided the referral to the school principal. The credibility of the researcher is important in research (Patton as cited in Shenton, 2004:68) as the researcher is central to data collection, analysis, and findings. Consent from all research participants was obtained (see Appendix B) through a memorandum of agreement and a written undertaking of confidentiality regarding the information provided by both parties; the researcher and participants. I used pseudonyms when referring to the schools (The Moon & The Star) participants (Mrs. Carnation, Miss Iris, Mrs. Ruby, Mrs. Lotus, Mrs. Tulip, Miss Jasmine, Mrs. Poppy, Miss Dazy, Miss Bluebell, Miss Freesia) owner of the school (Mr. Jacob) and location name (Auckland Park).
3.10 CONCLUSION

This chapter discusses the research approach and paradigm briefly, which highlights the research question. A design-descriptive case study approach on the phenomenon of teacher recruitment and deployment was employed to gain understanding of the research problem in a limited time period. Purposive sampling is discussed as it was best suited to this project. Interviews were conducted and transcribed in the researcher and participants’ first language (Urdu). These were then translated into English. Data was analysed using the Creswell (1994:53) method of analysis. The chapter concludes with the ethics of research. The following chapter presents and discusses the data.
CHAPTER FOUR
DATA ANALYSIS

4.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter presents and discusses the data collected from the respondents - the teachers and the principals/owners of two private schools in Pakistan. The aim of the study was to determine how teachers in Pakistani private schools are recruited and deployed. This includes the following objectives:

- To describe the kind of people recruited to teach in Pakistani private schools.
- To investigate the teacher recruitment and deployment processes.
- To explore whether there is any formal or informal professional development of these teachers.

The data was collected by means of individual, face-to-face interviews and two focus group discussions. In total, 16 teachers and two principals/owners of two private schools were interviewed in Pakistan during December 2017 and January 2018. The data was analyzed and findings discussed according to the objectives of the study.

4.2 THE STAR SCHOOL
The Star School is a high school located in an area close to Islamabad, the capital city of Pakistan. The school was established in 2011 and named an international school, although there are no international learners in the school. The Star school (like the majority of private schools) is owned by an individual. It’s a co-education school situated in an area populated by people of middle- and low-middle class economic background. The Star school’s fees are average to low as compared to other private schools. At the time of this study, 244 learners were enrolled in the school: 120 boys and 124 girls. The learners were from the school vicinity – living in an approximate radius of two kilometers from the school. This school has two campuses on two different streets in the area.
Both campuses consist of double-storey residential houses. Neither campus has a lawn or playground where learners can play and exercise. The school employs 17 teaching staff over the two campuses: 14 female teachers and three male teachers. According to the staff register, of the employed teachers, three had completed a master’s degree, 12 a bachelor’s degree (14 year qualification) and two an intermediate qualification (12 year qualification). However, of the 17 teachers, only four had professional teaching qualifications.

At the time of this research, the principal of the Star school was in her seventh year as principal. She had previously been a teacher - working at different schools for a period of 10 years. She is married and holds a master’s degree in education with a professional teaching qualification. She emphasized that “her being female was not the reason for the preponderance of female teachers on the Star school’s staff. She also noted that the sex and marital status of the school principal does not influence the recruitment of teachers – in the sense of recruiting mostly unmarried, female teachers.”

4.3 THE MOON SCHOOL
The Moon school is located in a populous area of the city Rawalpindi in Pakistan. This school is considered one of the best in the area. It is a branch of one of the largest chain schools in Pakistan, with more than 500 branches across the country. The chain is owned by a group of people and was established in 1991. This branch was established in 2010. The Moon school (and the rest of the chain) targets the economic middle-class. The average tuition fee at this school is Rs3 000.00, per month which is unaffordable for poor- and some moderate-income families. Teachers’ salaries range from Rs11 500 to Rs18 500 per month. The school has two campuses in the same area; a primary school campus and a high school campus. Both campuses fall under one principal, assisted by two coordinators. The school buildings are double storey rental houses. There are no playgrounds facilities where the learners can play, exercise or walk during break time. The learners spend break time in their classrooms. At the time of this research, 471 learners were enrolled
over the two campuses and 30 teachers and 11 non-teaching staff was employed. Of the teaching staff, 27 were female and three male; one who served as director of the school and two who taught Hifz (Memorization of Holy Quran) classes to male learners. The top most post in these schools is the director whose role in the schools are to manage and control overall activities of the school; According to the staff register, only 10 of these teachers had completed a professional teaching qualification. The remaining 20 teachers were not qualified professionally, although they were qualified academically. At the time of this research, the principal of this school was in her ninth year as principal at the Moon school. She had been a teacher in one of the army public schools for a few years. She holds a master’s degree and is a professionally qualified teacher.

4.4 TEACHER RECRUITMENT

It has been evidenced and is widely accepted that the teacher is one of the most important components of effective teaching and learning practices. Both quality education and learner achievement link directly to the excellence of the teacher, which, in turn, depends on their academic and professional background (Krasnoff, 2014:1). So, it is important to ensure that teachers’ qualifications and training are adequate to meet students’ needs (Khan, n.d.:212). Effective strategies for the recruitment and selection of teachers can ensure the appointment of quality teachers at schools (Abdou & Zaalouk, 2012:10). This shows that the teacher recruitment process is crucial to satisfying learner needs and reaching educational goals. Neither the Star nor the Moon, like many other schools in the area with the same standards, quality and type of education, has policies and yardsticks in place for teacher recruitment and deployment. According to Mrs. Lotus, the principal of the Star School,

“In my seven years of service at this school, we have never advertised any vacant posts in a newspaper or any other advertisement site. Usually, advertisements are announced through verbal communication via teaching and non-teaching staff of the school and learners. Mostly,
teachers drop their CVs at school. When a vacancy arises at the school, we call the potential candidates for tests and interviews. There is no set criterion for the tests and interviews. Candidates are asked to write an application for the vacant post in both Urdu and English. Some candidates are asked for a demonstration in class, but not all. We prefer to recruit qualified teachers, but when it comes to the offered salary packages qualified teachers do not want to accept the position. The qualified teachers who accept positions are those whose parents do not allow them to work in a school that is far from their residential area.”

The recruitment and selection process of teachers at the Moon school is much the same as at the Star School. The Moon school has no written policy and procedures to follow. Furthermore, it has no black-and-white policy regarding the advertisement of vacant posts in newspapers or any other place of advertisement. Mrs. Carnation, the Moon school principal, said,

“In my nine years of service at the school, we have only advertised a position once - in the newspaper in 2016. We received just three CVs based on the newspaper advertisement. The candidates were called for tests and interviews. After the selection of a teacher, when the salary package was offered, the teachers refused to accept the post as their demand was much higher than our package. After that we have never advertised posts in newspapers again. We easily recruit teachers without any advertisement as there are a number of female teachers who came to school from time to time to drop their CVs. Usually our recruitment and selection are done through existing teachers. Whenever we announce a position, existing teachers of the school extend the voice to their sisters, cousins, friends and colleagues who want to join teaching. This process is very suitable to recruit teachers according to the needs and demand of the school.”
The recruitment of teachers is a serious issue for middle-class schools throughout the academic year. It is done through reference (teachers teaching in the school, sisters and cousins, children studying in the same school, friends) as these schools are not much concerned with written tests and job interviews (Krasnoff, 2014:2, 3; Khan & Aziz, 2013:1). Miss Ruby, a teacher at the Star School, noted,

“I started teaching by tutoring my neighbors’ children when I was in grade eight. My mother wanted me to become a teacher. After my wedding, my husband and I moved to this (Auckland Park) area where the school is situated. When my child had grown to school-going age I took him to the school for admission. I asked the school principal whether there was a vacant teaching post. The principal said yes. I told her that I wanted to teach. She replied by asking my academic and professional qualifications and told me that if I want to join as a teacher I could start the very next day. I accepted the offer and started teaching – this was the whole process of my recruitment and deployment.”

Nine teachers at the Moon school were interviewed in a focus group discussion and individual, face-to-face interviews. It was found that 100% of these teachers had approached the school themselves - without seeing an advertisement in the newspaper or any other announcement. They had dropped their CVs at the school - applying for a teaching job. The majority of them received a call with a job offer from the school within a few days. Miss Iris, a teacher at the Moon school, said,

“I came to school for my children’s admission. While sitting in the office, I told the school principal that I had taught in a school before I got married and that I wanted to start teaching again. The principal asked me about my qualifications and experience. She said that if I
wanted to join the school I could come to school as a teacher from the very next day. This was the whole process of my recruitment and selection at the school.”

A large number of private schools in Pakistan have no criteria for teacher selection and recruitment (Khan, n.d.:15, 16). These schools prefer to recruit young, academically qualified women in the vicinity of the school on minimal salary packages with no job security or job contract. The recruitment of qualified, skilled, professional teachers is a challenge for private schools because professionally qualified teachers demand attractive salary packages and job security. As private enterprises, these schools are greatly concerned with revenue: they offer neither attractive salary packages nor job security (Khan, n.d.:15,16; Krasnoff, 2014:2; Khan, n.d.:6; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:17). The majority of private enterprise schools prefer to hire academically qualified teachers on low wages in order to save on expenses. They are not worried about the skills and professional qualifications of their teachers. The qualifications of teachers at such schools range from intermediate (12 year qualification) to master’s (16 year formal qualification). The main aim of the school is to save money and thus increase profit as the school is considered a business enterprise. There are no written rules and regulations that private schools must follow in the recruitment and selection process; the drawing-up of job contracts; and the fixing of teacher salary packages.

4.4.1 Private schools and female teachers

In Pakistan, teaching has become a profession dominated by women - over 70% (and increasing) of teaching staff are female. The majority of these women are young, unmarried women. Low salary packages and unprofessional recruitment practices are the main reasons for the current large number of female teachers in private schools. (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:2; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). According to Mrs. Carnation, the Moon school’s principal,
“The offered salary packages in poor, rural schools and in some middle-class private schools are not attractive to male teachers, because they are their families' breadwinners. Men have to provide for their dependents, while the majority of women do not have that responsibility. Women teachers want be engaged in an activity rather than staying at home and teaching is the best profession available to them. Furthermore, shorter working hours, as compared to other professions, are another attraction for women. In our culture, the head of the family is male and it is their responsibility to provide for their family. Most female teachers do not present any of their income to the family head no contribution is expected from women. Only those teachers who have financial problems at home (parents or husbands are jobless or unable to work) assist their families.”

In this regard, it is suitable for private schools to recruit women, as they have fewer needs and demands than their male counterparts. These private schools are unable to offer attractive salaries because of the limited resources generated from learners’ monthly tuition fees (Khan, n.d.; Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:1; Amjad & MacLeod, 2014:23, Andrabi, et. al., 2002:14-16). Therefore, private schooling as a business enterprise has made teaching in Pakistan a female profession (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5).

Another important contributor to the large number of women currently teaching in private schools is the unchallenging recruitment process. According to Mrs. Ruby, a teacher at the Star School, “A teacher can obtain a teaching job in a private school very easily, because there is no hard and fast recruitment practice in these private schools and one can very easily leave the profession when one wants to.”

Mrs. Lotus, principal at the Star School, shared,
“Most private schools prefer to recruit unmarried women as teachers, because they are less likely than married women to have responsibilities and engagements at home. They can focus more on the learners and perform better than married women. The majority of married teachers also have to do household tasks, like looking after the children and cooking and cleaning before and after school. They also concentrate less on learners than unmarried teachers. Usually, unmarried women do not have the burden of household chores. They can work at the school after hours, if needed, and can also take assigned tasks home.”

Young, unmarried, female teachers are predominantly recruited in the teaching profession in Pakistani private schools (Khan, n.d.:3; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). At the time of this research, of the nine female teachers interviewed at the Moon school, three were married while six were unmarried and between 24 to 27 years of age. The younger, unmarried women were relatively less experienced than their married counterparts. Of the six unmarried teachers one had professional qualifications and the majority had been in the profession for less than two years. Thus, of the research participants at the Moon School, 67% were not married. Research also found that once a woman gets married 33% of women continue teaching or join the teaching profession after a short- or long break. At the Star School, out of nine female teachers interviewed - five (55%) were unmarried. According to Mrs. Tulip, one of the teachers at the school,

“I started teaching after completing my academic qualification, when I was unmarried. After getting married I stopped teaching and moved to this area with my husband. Later, I again started teaching before the birth of my first child. During the last months of my pregnancy, I again left teaching. I taught on and off between the births of my children. Now I am a mother of four children. I never have any difficulties or hurdles in the process of resigning from jobs and in being selected and
recruited at different schools. I am done having children and now I will continue teaching.”

Salary package is another determinant that leads schools to recruit female teachers (Aslam, 2009:2; Lodhi, 2017:n.p). Individual- and group-owned chain schools are business enterprises with the purpose of earning capital and maximizing profit. Anyone can easily open a private school in any part of the country. There has thus been a drastic increase in the number of private schools, without provision of rules and procedures for them to follow. These schools are totally dependent on capital generated from the monthly tuition fees of learners. So the salary packages offered by private schools cannot attract qualified, experienced and professional teachers - male or female. The only option left to these schools is to hire female teachers and to disregard their lack of qualification. According to the Moon School’s staff register, out of 30 teaching staff only three teachers were male. Two of them were teaching Hifz classes (special class for those learners who want to memorize the Holy Quran) to boys, and the other was both a school- and regional director of schools in the region. Thus 94% of teaching staff at the Moon school was female, whereas only 6% was male. When Mrs. Carnation was asked why the school did not hire more male teachers, she replied by saying,

“In my school, except for two male teachers to teach to Hifz classes, the teaching staffs are female. I think teaching is a motherly word and it suits women. Male teachers demand attractive salary packages because they are the heads and breadwinners of their families and have to fulfill the needs of siblings and dependents. However, in our society women are not accountable for the provision of household expenses. Most of the middle-class schools do not offer attractive salaries to teachers. That is why teaching in private schools has no attraction for male teachers.”
The majority of female teachers’ families (parents and husbands) neither demands any financial assistance from them nor forces them to do teaching or any other job. The drastic increase in the number of private schools has swelled the demand for teachers. This opened the door for female teachers to get employment, with no recruitment procedures being implemented. It is also convenient for women to choose teaching as a profession, because of its shorter working hours as compared to other jobs (Khan, n.d.:3). Appointing female teachers also suits private enterprise school owners - as they save money and maximize their profit (Allegretto & Tojerow, 2014:5).

4.5 TEACHER TURNOVER AND ITS IMPACT ON TEACHING AND LEARNING

Turnover is a serious problem faced by a large number of private schools in Pakistan. The high turnover badly interrupts instruction and negatively impacts not only learner academic achievement but also other teachers at the school (Khan & Aziz, 2003:58; Krasnoff, 2014:3; Ingersoll, 2003:9; Guin, 2004:2). Of the 28 teachers at the Star School, 13 were recruited during the year 2017. Teacher turnover for 2017 was therefore 46%. During interviews, it came to light that out of nine randomly selected teachers, only four had been teaching in the same school for more than one year while the other five were in their first year of teaching, and had a maximum of four months’ teaching experience at the school. Moreover these five teachers were new in the profession. The staff register at the Moon school illustrated that the school had recruited 15 new teachers in the year 2016. As the school employees 30 teaching staff, this shows a teacher turnover rate of 50% in 2016. According to Krasnoff, (2014:3) and Guin (2004:3), almost 50% of teachers who teach in private schools leave the profession within five years of being hired. This disrupts the smooth running of school activities. Research has found that the factors affecting turnover are low salary packages; the working conditions in schools; teachers getting married; teachers moving; the further studies of teachers; the workload on teachers; and the perception of teaching as a low-status profession (Krasnoff, 2014:2,3; Khan, n.d:1). According to the owner of the Star School,
“Most of the teachers in these private schools are in fact not qualified teachers. In the private sector, where a large number of schools have no policy and criteria pertaining to recruitment and deployment, these teachers perceive it as one of the easiest occupations to join, as there are no bonded agreements or rules to applying for a post.”

Miss Jasmine, a very young, fresh teacher, had been teaching at the Star School for only three months at the time of this research. Miss Jasmine noted,

“After the intermediate examination I was free at home. I thought that teaching was the best occupation to keep me busy until the annual results announcement. I want to join the Pak Army. My intention is to do a BSc so that I can be eligible to apply. I will continue teaching until April 2018, after that I will leave teaching and continue my studies.”

Mrs. Lotus, principal of the Star School expressed her views by saying, “The majority of teachers remain in the profession for one to two years. Most of the girls choose teaching as a profession to fill their free time, an activity to keep them engaged, and this is one of the professions suitable for them.”

During the individual interviews with the school principal and school owner it was found that offered salary packages; teachers getting married; teachers moving; the further studies of teachers; pregnancy and childbirth; and job offers in the government sector are the main reasons for teacher turnover. Some middle-class private schools have very low fee structures in comparison to urban- and elite schools. It is therefore difficult for these schools to tender high salary packages and attract and retain quality teachers. Schools with greater levels of poverty have a significantly higher rate of teacher turnover than schools in richer areas (Guin, 2004:4). According to Mrs. Lotus, the principal of the Star School,
“In the last seven years only one teacher has been working with me from day one, while many others have come and gone. There is no teacher in my school who was unmarried at the time of recruitment and continued teaching in the school after she got married. I usually prefer to recruit unmarried teachers, because they can focus more on learners than married teachers.”

To the contrary, Mrs. Carnation, the principal of the Moon School, explained,

“I prefer to recruit married teachers for several reasons. Firstly, if a teacher is married at the time of appointment there is less chance that she will leave the profession. Secondly, married teachers can teach much better than unmarried ones, because being in the profession after getting married means she is a teacher and wants to remain in the profession. The only problem with married teachers is that they have to look after their children and families and have to accomplish household tasks before and after school. Some of these teachers cannot dress up properly like unmarried teachers do. Late arrival, early departure, and absenteeism are also higher for married women as compared to unmarried teachers.”

The turnover of female teachers is moderate to high in middle-class schools because of job offers from other schools and fields; marriage of female teachers to a partner away from the locality of the school; admission of teachers to university for further education; and family migration from rural- to urban areas or from one urban area to another (Khan, n.d.:16). Miss Iris, a teacher at the Moon School, expressed the following,

“Culturally, a woman has to move to her in-laws after getting married. This forces a female teacher to leave teaching. Usually, teachers in government schools try to continue teaching, but private school
teachers mostly leave the profession as they know the trends and procedures for recruitment at private schools are not as strict as those of government schools.”

Mrs. Poppy added that, “Girls usually leave teaching after getting married because they have to move to their in-laws and sometimes they are not allowed to continue teaching at the same school or any other school.” Mrs. Carnation further added her view on the same matter by saying, “In the private education sector, one can get a job very easily because most of the private schools have no strict rules to follow. It is very easy for women teachers to resign from teaching when getting married and take employment up again later if they wanted to.”

Salary packages are also a strong factor that motivates teachers to stay. Salary packages are usually very low at private schools (Khan, n.d.:16). Offered packages range from Rs4 000 to Rs7000 per month at the Star School - depending on the qualification and experience of the teacher. At the Moon school teacher salaries fall between Rs12 000 to Rs18 500 monthly. These private schools have no set policy and criteria to determine teacher salary packages, incentives, increments and promotions. Some schools increase salaries annually, but without any set patterns or rules. One of the teachers of the Moon School expressed her frustration,

“\textit{I am not satisfied with my salary as I receive only Rs7 000 per month, but I have been at the school for the last seven years. This Rs7 000 has no value if we compare it to a laborer’s daily wages. A laborer can earn Rs500 – Rs700 per day; double than a teacher. My two children are studying for free and my home is not far from school, which are the only attractions for me to teach at this school. Another main and important motive that forces me to stay in teaching is my husband’s income. He is a part-time driver at rent a car and his income is not enough to run a home. I have to fully support him so that we can live our life.”}
Miss Dazy stated, “I am not satisfied with my salary package but I have no other choice. My father has no job and I have to support my family. My salary is not enough to fulfill household needs, but I believe something is better than nothing.”

Teacher turnover is one of the most serious and extensive problems at a large number of private schools in Pakistan (Khan & Aziz, 2013:58). It has a significant impact on learner achievement, as it generally interrupts the day-to-day planned syllabus and activities designed by school management for the academic year (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Ingersoll, 2003:9; Guin, 2004:2). When teachers were asked (in a group discussion) about the impact of teacher turnover on learners and their achievements, one of the teachers (Miss Dazy), who had been teaching at the Star School for three years, said,

“A large number of teachers in private schools enter for a short time without having any professional qualifications and skills. Schools are not much concerned about teachers’ job duration and employment contracts, so whenever they want to leave teaching they can do so easily by giving very short verbal notice to the school principal. In one case, a teacher just made a phone call to management to say that she was not coming to school for teaching anymore. The frequent loss of teachers in a school negatively impacts learner achievement as it is habitual to take some time to harmonies with and understand a new person whom one did not know previously. This high turnover disrupts the learners, management, and the teachers remaining at the school.”

Miss Bluebell (a teacher) explained, “If a teacher leaves the school we have to take her modules or class. In this case, existing teachers then also have to teach those modules that are not their favorite or of which they do not have command. When a teacher does so, it has a negative impact on the teacher and on the learners.”
Mrs. Lotus (the principal at the Star School) expressed her views by saying, “High turnover negatively interrupts the relationship and trust-building between teaching staff, to work as a team, and between teachers and learners. When building a relationship and trust, teachers and learners need to have some interaction and experience with each other to provide them with the basis to trust.”

In schools where turnover is high, it is difficult for the teachers to establish relationships with- and trust in newly hired teachers. This ultimately interrupts the performance of the school and achievement of planned tasks through collective effort. It also creates instability in teamwork, which disrupts the smooth running of planned activities (Guin, 2004:3). Mrs. Carnation (principal of the Moon School) expressed her views,

“In private schools, fillers are more common than real teachers. In my school and in my experience, turnover is over 50%. The main reasons for high turnover are teaching experience and salary packages. Those unqualified filler-teachers leave the profession whenever they want to and qualified teachers expect handsome packages, which private schools usually do not want to offer. Learners experience frequent change and new teachers, which disrupts relationship building between teachers and learners.”

The achievement of learners reflects the interaction and quality of the relationship of teachers with each other and with learners. When a teacher leaves the school, the held relationship between teachers and learners become distorted. The newly hired teacher takes time to establish a harmonious relationship with both learners and fellow teachers. Thus, learner achievement is affected negatively to the extent that teacher turnover affects relationships in the school (Ronfeldt, Loeb & Wyckoff 2013:5 and Khan, n.d.:217). Teaching staff that remain stable allows schools to assist newly recruited staff members to make them valuable assets to the school. One of the experienced teachers of the Star School, Mrs. Ruby, explained,
“Established teachers are much more confident and productive than young and newly hired teachers. Young, fresh teachers expect assistance when they are assigned a task to accomplish. This constantly places an additional burden on stable teachers where the turnover rate is high. Stable teaching staff can create a difference in the school with teamwork.”

High turnover also negatively affects school management, who are ultimately forced to recruit new teachers each and every year. Mr. Jacob, the Star School’s owner, “High turnover is not only a setback for us; a large number of middle-, poor- and some elite schools face the same problem. High turnover badly disrupts planned activities and negatively affects the learner-teacher relationship. It also keeps school management busy with recruitment during the academic year.”

The Star School faces an acute turnover percentage, which means up to 55% recruitment needs to be done every year to fill the teaching staff gap. At the Moon School the percentage turnover and recruitment is 50% every year. Mrs. Carnation (principal of the Moon School) and Mr. Jacob (owner of the Star School) have similar views on turnover and its impact on teaching and learning. They noted that the frequent turnover disrupts not only smooth teaching- and learning processes but also the professional development of stable- and freshly recruited teaching staff.

4.6 TEACHER RECRUITMENT AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT
Teacher training and professional development are vital to the provision of quality education to learners. However, a large number of the teachers at private, middle-class schools are untrained and have no, or very minimal, opportunities for pre- and in-service professional training (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:14-16; Memon, 2007:47-55; Khan, n.d.:8). The professional development of teachers is crucial for smooth teaching- and learning processes. In a focus group discussion at the Star School, the teachers stated that the offered professional development sessions were not enough for the teachers to equip themselves according to the
academic needs and demands of their learners. Mr. Jacob (the owner of the Star School) added,

“It is challenging for the school to arrange teacher development programs for the newly recruited teachers at the beginning of every academic year. We usually organize at least one teacher development session a year, but I think that is not enough for development and for effective teaching and learning processes. The high turnover is the main problem we, and some other schools in our area, face. We have to develop almost 50% new teachers every year, which is a big challenge for middle-class, private schools.”

Miss Bluebell (another teacher at the Star School) expressed her views,

“Previously, this school offered more than one training session during the academic year, but in the last two years teachers have hardly been provided a chance to attend merely one training session of one day. We need to learn how to plan, teach and deliver lessons in class, which is only possible if we have been provided a chance to attend professional development sessions.”

Mrs. Ruby (a teacher at the Star school) said,

“Teachers are the main source and the transformers of knowledge - they should be provided opportunities for professional development on a regular basis so that they can align their skills according to the needs and demands of the current era. An effective and productive teacher is the one who has been trained before entering into the classroom.”

High turnover leads to continuous recruitment throughout the academic year. The continuous process of recruitment throughout the academic year negatively impacts
the professional development of teachers. Such continuous recruitment disrupts the planned syllabus and activities of the academic year. School- and learner success are directly related to the quality of the teachers, while such quality is measured by the qualifications and skills acquired (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:15). An annual turnover of over 55% means that of the teachers employed at a school, more than half will be new and fresh teachers that enter the system every year. This shows that a large number of teachers in private schools are untrained and professionally unskilled. Some middle-class schools organize teachers’ professional development workshops, but the majority of the schools have no or very little focus on teacher development. Opportunities to attend professional development training workshops are often only given to those teachers who have more than two years of teaching experience at the same school or have signed a contract not to leave the school for a specific period (Khan, n.d.:9).

The teachers also explained that most of them were not allowed by their families and parents to go away (from the area) for more than a day for professional development or any other reason. According to the Star School’s owner,

“We were afforded the possibility by some of the training institutes to send our teachers for professional development and training. But, unfortunately, most of our teachers refused to go by saying that they were not allowed by their parents and families to go away for a night to stay over.”

The demand for teachers and for their consequent professional development has grown due to the radical increase in the number of private schools in Pakistan (Halai & Durrani, 2016:60). Studies show that only 33% of teachers hired at private schools are professionally qualified, skilled and developed. This means that 77% of the teachers hired are under-qualified (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:14-16; Memon, 2007:47-55; Khan, n.d.:8).
Of the nine teachers interviewed at the Moon School, three were professionally qualified, while the other six were well-qualified academically, but not professionally. These teachers therefore had master’s degrees in different subjects and fields but were not professionally qualified as teachers. When the principal was asked about the procedure for teacher recruitment at the school, she replied by saying, “The school does not have a set pattern or procedure to follow in the recruitment process. We prefer to recruit qualified and experienced teachers.”

Further, of the 30 teachers at the Moon School, 10 were qualified professionally. This again shows that only 33% of teachers were qualified professionally, while the remaining 67% were academically qualified, but not professionally. This indicates that these private schools are not much bothered with the professional qualification of teachers. They prefer to hire teachers, with fluency in English, in the vicinity of the school, on low salary packages (Memon, 2007:50; Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:17). It has been found that a large number of private, middle-class schools are lacking in qualified and professionally developed teaching staff.

It seems that not only recruitment but also professional development of the teachers presents a challenge to private schools. A school’s success and learner achievement are linked with the professionalism of the school’s teachers. It is crucial for schools to provide their teachers with professional- and skills development opportunities (Rizvi & Elliott, 2007:15). The Moon school provides opportunities for the professional development of teachers by engaging the Association for Academic Qualification (AFAQ) from time to time. AFAQ is known for being a teacher development institute used by private schools, especially by the Moon schools. This chain school system has a memorandum of understanding (MOU) with AFAQ to develop their teachers in different regions and schools. According to the teachers who participated in the focus group discussion, the Moon school had arranged teacher development sessions in the past. The teachers had found these to be very beneficial, especially the subject teachers, who developed in their ability to teach learners effectively. But for the two years prior to this research no opportunity had
been given to any teacher at the school to develop professionally. The Moon school’s FGD concluded by saying that the development and training of teachers could make a big difference. They felt it was needed to professionally upgrade teaching staff so that targets could be accomplished successfully.

Miss Freesia said, “During my service, I have never attended any teacher development session or training in- and outside of the school.” Miss Iris added that, “In the past, teacher development sessions were arranged by school management from time to time, but for almost the last two years we have not been provided a chance to equip and developed ourselves professionally.”
CHAPTER FIVE
CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION
The study enquires into teacher recruitment and deployment in two private schools in Rawalpindi and Islamabad; two cities in Pakistan. The core of the research was to determine how teachers in Pakistani private schools are recruited and deployed. This chapter summarises the study and addresses the learning based on the aims and objectives of the research. This chapter also gives suggestions for further investigation to explore teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools.

5.2 SUMMARY
The study examines teacher recruitment and deployment in two economic middle-class private schools situated in Rawalpindi and Islamabad in Pakistan. In teaching and learning, the teacher is considered as one of the most important elements. It is thus imperative to ensure that the recruited teachers are qualified and developed professionally to meet the educational needs of the learners; to attain educational goals; and to improve the quality of education (Krasnoff, 2014:1; Abdou & Zaalouk, 2012:10). In this research to investigate the procedure of teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools, it was identified that teacher recruitment and deployment is a serious issue faced by a large numbers of private schools. The main concern of these private, individually owned, enterprise schools is to increase their profit. They therefore prefer to recruit academically, but not professionally, qualified and equipped teachers on low salary packages. This, combined with stunted or non-existent rewards, de-motivates teachers, which results high turnover and necessitates the recruitment of throughout the academic year. Mr. Jacob, a school owner, mentioned that “private schools have no written rules and regulations to follow in the recruitment and selection process nor are they much concerned about it, they just hire teachers on low wages with generally no signing of job
contracts.” “Private schools neither has written rules and regulations to follow in recruitment and selection process nor they much concern about it, they just hire teachers on low wages with generally no signing of job contracts.” The recruitment and selection of teachers in Pakistani middle-class, private schools consequently demands effective and efficient strategies to fulfil the needs of the learners. As the subjects of the study, this also holds true for the Moon as well as for the Star school.

Schools as business endeavours; weak governmental education policies of government regarding private schools; frail checks and balances; and low wages are the leading factors to affect recruitment and professional development of teachers and cause high turnover in private schools. Teacher recruitment, turnover, professional development and school management are separately summarised below.

5.2.1 Teacher recruitment
The research identified that female teacher’s form the greater part of teaching staff in economic middle-class private schools: with over 70% to males’ 30% (Andrabi, Das & Khwaja, 2002:27). The proportion of female teachers is also rising day by day. Moreover, young, unmarried women form the majority of teachers in private schools. These women usually do not have to shoulder financial responsibility for their families. They see teaching as an opportunity: they prefer working for low wages to sitting at home. Furthermore, the fragile government policies and control regarding private education mean that these schools do not hesitate to recruit professionally under-qualified and untrained teaches on low salary packages with no job security and contract of employment.

The majority of male teachers and highly qualified female teachers are less likely to teach in these middle-class private schools because of the offered salary packages and non-availability of incentives. These schools, as individually owned business enterprises, totally depend on the income generated from the learners’ monthly tuition fees. This forces their school management to recruit teachers on minimal
packages, which conversely affects the recruitment of professionally qualified teachers.

5.2.2 Teacher turnover
The findings of this research highlight that teacher turnover is a dilemma for a large number of middle-class Pakistani private schools. Almost 55% of teachers leave the profession within their first five years of teaching (Krasnoff, 2014:3; Guin, 2004:3). There are different elements that influence teachers to leave the profession. Firstly, teachers with a strong academic- and professional background are less likely to leave the school than those who are less or under-qualified. Secondly, managing a school as a business endeavour leads management to offer low salary packages, which ultimately de-motivates teachers and results in high turnover. Thirdly, women form over 70% of teaching staff, but they typically have to move to their in-laws after getting married; they bear and rear children; and look after their families, all of which prompt them to leave teaching. Lastly, the perception of teaching as a low social-status profession lessens the motivation to stay in the teaching profession, which increases the turnover ratio as professionally qualified people want to earn attractive packages and have secure jobs. Furthermore, recruitment and turnover are interrelated, high turnover leads to continuous recruitment in these private schools, which badly affects learners’ concentration on their studies as they are faced by abrupt changes in teachers.

5.2.3 Teacher professional development
To meet the needs and requirements of students it is important to ensure that the recruited and selected teachers are qualified academically and skilled professionally. The professional development of teachers at middle-class private schools is a challenge for school management. Only 33% of teachers at these schools in Rawalpindi and Islamabad are trained and developed professionally. High teacher turnover not only disrupts the recruitment of teachers and learners’ education but also affects the professional development of teachers. An annual turnover of over 55% means that these schools have to professionally develop at least half of their
teaching staff each and every year. This is a challenging task and a financial burden for these private schools, especially where there is no guarantee that teachers will remain with the school for long time. Although some schools provide professional development opportunities to those teachers who have been teaching at the school for longer than two years (as the school has more assurance that the teacher will not leave for few years), this remains a challenge for private schools. Only a few middle-class schools arrange teacher development programmes and courses, on- and off school premises. This does not fulfil the requirements of the teaching and learning process. The professional development of teachers at middle-class, private schools needs serious attention to keep the profession as well as teaching and learning productive.

5.2.4 School management
The majority of private schools in Pakistan are business endeavours. The purpose of an individual or group of people in opening and running a school is to earn capital. These private schools are totally dependent on the funds received from learners in the form of monthly tuition fees. The management and owners of these schools wish to recruit quality, qualified teachers but qualified teachers demand attractive remuneration packages, while business-endeavour schools are inclined to save as much as they can. This leads to schools compromising on quality and recruiting teachers, with disregard of their professional qualification, on minimum packages.

5.3 FURTHER RESEARCH
Based on the researcher’s experience conducting this case study on teacher recruitment and deployment in Pakistani private schools, the following suggestions can be made for further investigation.

i) Very little research has been done on educational privatisation, especially on private schools in Pakistan. So it is important for researchers and educators to know the causes and reasons for privatisation and its impact on society.
ii) In Pakistan there are different types of private schools: elite- or upper class schools that charge huge monthly tuition fees; middle-class schools with average-to-high monthly tuition fees that economic low-middle or poor parents cannot afford; and the schools for the poor that charge a nominal fee or are charity schools. These different private schools also need to be seriously researched to explore the different sets of schools and their impact on society.

iii) Keeping in view the limitations of this research: the focus was only on two private schools in two cities in Pakistan, but research on private schools needs to be conducted in other areas of the country as well.

5.4 CONCLUSION
This summarises the study, which is based on the learning of the research problem. The research was aimed at exploring teacher recruitment and deployment in two Pakistani private schools. The study highlights the process of teacher recruitment and deployment; the types and quality of recruited teachers; and teacher turnover. Moreover, it also looks at recruited teachers’ professional qualifications as well as the in-service professional development of teachers.
REFERENCES


