COPYRIGHT AND CITATION CONSIDERATIONS FOR THIS THESIS/ DISSERTATION

o Attribution — You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made. You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.

o NonCommercial — You may not use the material for commercial purposes.

o ShareAlike — If you remix, transform, or build upon the material, you must distribute your contributions under the same license as the original.

How to cite this thesis
EXPLORING THE USE OF ISIZULU IN A GRADE 9 SOCIAL SCIENCES CLASS TO FACILITATE INCLUSIVE LEARNING AND TEACHING

by

Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini

submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree

MAGISTER EDUCATIONIS

in

INCLUSIVE EDUCATION

in the

FACULTY OF EDUCATION

(Department of Educational Psychology)

at the

UNIVERSITY OF JOHANNESBURG

Supervisor: Prof. TM Makoelle

OCTOBER 2015
Table of Contents

Declaration.................................................................................................................................................. vii
Abstract................................................................................................................................................... viii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................... ix
Dedication............................................................................................................................................... x
List of abbreviations ................................................................. xi
List of figures......................................................................................................................... xii
List of appendices .................................................................................................................. xiii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................... 1
1.1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT .............................................................................................................. 3
1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS ............................................................................................................. 4
1.4 AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY ............................................................................... 5
1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS ....................................................................................... 5
1.5.1 Research paradigm .................................................................................................................. 5
1.5.2 Qualitative approach ............................................................................................................. 6
1.5.3 Research design: Participatory Action Research (PAR) ......................................................... 7
1.5.4 Sampling and selection of participants .................................................................................. 8
1.5.5 Data instruments and collection process ............................................................................... 8
1.5.6 Data analysis ......................................................................................................................... 10
1.6 TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE RESEARCH ........................................................................ 11
1.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS ................................................................................................. 11
1.8 STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT ............................................................................................... 12
1.9 DEFINITION OF MAIN CONCEPTS ....................................................................................... 13
1.9.1 Inclusive education ................................................................................................................ 13
1.9.2 Inclusive teaching .................................................................................................................. 14
1.9.3 Inclusive learning .................................................................................................................. 15
1.9.4 Inclusive pedagogy .............................................................................................................. 15
1.9.5 IsiZulu .................................................................................................................................... 16
1.9.6 Social Sciences ..................................................................................................................... 16
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

2.2 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

2.2.1 IsiZulu language

2.2.2 Social Sciences according to CAPS

2.3 BACKGROUND TO THE LANGUAGE POLICY OF SOUTH AFRICA

2.3.1 Democratic South Africa and national language policy

2.4 ADVANTAGES OF MOTHER-TONGUE INSTRUCTION

2.4.1 Cognitive development

2.4.2 Cultural identity

2.4.3 Avoidance of rote learning

2.4.4 Reading and writing skills

2.5 LANGUAGE OF EDUCATION IN THE AFRICAN CONTEXT

2.5.1 Zimbabwe

2.5.2 Tanzania

2.5.3 Kenya

2.6 LACK OF MOTHER-TONGUE INSTRUCTION RESOURCES

2.6.1 Learning materials

2.6.2 Educator Training

2.7 ALTERNATIVE MODELS TO MOTHER TONGUE INSTRUCTION

2.7.1 Code switching

2.7.2 Bilingualism

2.7.3 Multilingualism

2.8 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

3.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.2.1 Research paradigm

3.2.2 Qualitative approach

3.2.3 Research design: Participatory Action Research (PAR)

3.2.4 Qualitative data-collection instruments

3.3 Sampling and selection of participants
3.3.1 The research site ................................................................................................................................ 49
3.4 DATA COLLECTION PROCESS ....................................................................................................... 49
3.4.1 Research procedure ............................................................................................................................ 49
3.4.2 Data-collection process ...................................................................................................................... 50
3.5 DATA ANALYSIS ................................................................................................................................... 52
3.6 TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE RESEARCH .................................................................................. 53
3.6.1 Role of the researcher ........................................................................................................................ 53
3.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS .......................................................................................................... 54
3.8 CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................................................... 55

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS OF THE EMPIRICAL-DATA ANALYSIS ........................................... 56

4.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................................... 56
4.2 Themes derived from answers to Question 1: How do educators conceptualize the use of mother-
tongue-based instruction [MTBI] within a context of inclusion? ............................................................... 56
4.2.1 Inaccessible curricula ........................................................................................................................ 56
4.2.2 Meaningful learning .......................................................................................................................... 57
4.2.3 Improved pedagogy ........................................................................................................................... 58
4.2.4 Cultural identity ................................................................................................................................. 59
4.2.5 Academic excellence ......................................................................................................................... 60
4.3 Themes derived from answers to research Question 2: Which challenges (if any) do educators
experience in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers? ............................... 61
4.3.1 Classroom resources .......................................................................................................................... 61
4.3.2 Code switching .................................................................................................................................. 62
4.3.3 Poor quality of instruction ............................................................................................................... 63
4.3.4 Lack of concentration and participation ............................................................................................ 64
4.3.5 Scientific concepts (Geography)........................................................................................................ 65
4.4 Themes derived from answers to research Question 3: Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu
to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences?........................................................................ 66
4.4.1 Information Communication Technology (ICT) in Social Sciences.................................................. 66
4.4.2 Team teaching (PAR) ........................................................................................................................ 67
4.4.3 Co-operative learning ....................................................................................................................... 68
4.4.4 Small group discussion ...................................................................................................................... 69
4.4.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations ....................................................................................... 70
4.4.6 Brainstorming ................................................................................................................................... 71
4.4.7 Direct teaching................................................................................................................................... 72
4.4.8 Seating arrangement .......................................................................................................................... 73
4.5 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................ 73

CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION .............................................................. 74
5.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................ 74
5.2 Restating the Research Aim of the Study .............................................................................................. 74
5.2.1 Research questions ............................................................................................................................. 74
5.2.2 Objectives of the study ...................................................................................................................... 75
5.3 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY ............................................................................................................... 75
5.4 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS ............................................................................................................... 76
5.4.1 How do educators conceptualize the use of MTBI within a context of inclusion? To answer this research question, the following themes which derived from Chapter 4 were used: .................. 76
5.4.1.1 Inaccessible curricula ...................................................................................................................... 76
5.4.1.2 Meaningful learning ....................................................................................................................... 77
5.4.1.3 Improved pedagogy ....................................................................................................................... 78
5.4.1.4 Cultural identity ............................................................................................................................ 79
5.4.1.5 Academic excellence .................................................................................................................... 80
5.4.2.1 Classroom resources ..................................................................................................................... 81
5.4.2.2 Code switching .............................................................................................................................. 82
5.4.2.3 Poor quality of instruction .......................................................................................................... 82
5.4.2.4 Lack of concentration and participation ...................................................................................... 83
5.4.3.1 ICT in Social Sciences ................................................................................................................... 84
5.4.3.2 Team teaching (PAR) ................................................................................................................ 86
5.4.3.3 Co-operative learning .................................................................................................................. 86
5.4.3.4 Small group discussion ................................................................................................................ 88
5.4.3.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations ............................................................................... 89
5.4.3.6 Brainstorming .............................................................................................................................. 90
5.4.3.7 Direct teaching ............................................................................................................................. 90
5.4.3.8 Seating arrangement ..................................................................................................................... 91
5.5 IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY ...................................................................................................... 93
5.5.1.1 Inaccessible curricula ................................................................................................................... 93
5.5.1.2 Meaningful learning ...................................................................................................................... 93
5.5.1.3 Improved pedagogy ..................................................................................................................... 94
5.5.1.5 Academic excellence .................................................................................................................. 95
5.5.2 Which challenges (if any) do educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers? To answer this research question, the following themes derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.5.2.1 Classroom resources

5.5.2.2 Code switching

5.5.2.3 Poor quality of instruction

5.5.2.4 Lack of concentration and participation

5.5.2.5 Scientific concepts (Geography)

5.5.3 Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences? For the purposes of answering this research question, the following themes derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.5.3.1 ICT in Social Sciences

5.5.3.2 Team teaching (PAR)

5.5.3.3 Co-operative learning

5.5.3.4 Small group discussion

5.5.3.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations

5.5.3.6 Brainstorming

5.5.3.7 Direct teaching

5.5.3.8 Seating arrangement

5.6 RECOMMENDATIONS

5.6.1 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TEACHING

5.6.1.1 Inaccessible curricula

5.6.1.2 Improved pedagogy

5.6.1.3 Academic excellence

5.6.1.4 Classroom resources

5.6.1.5 Code switching

5.6.1.6 Poor quality of instruction

5.6.1.8 Scientific concepts (Geography)

5.6.1.9 ICT in Social Sciences

5.6.1.10 Team teaching (PAR)

5.6.1.11 Direct teaching

5.6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LEARNING

5.6.2.1 Meaningful learning

5.6.2.2 Co-operative learning

5.6.2.3 Small group discussion

5.6.2.4 Student presentations and peer evaluations
Declaration

I, Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini, hereby declare that this dissertation, submitted in candidature for the degree of Master of Education at the University of Johannesburg, has not previously been submitted for a degree at this or any other university. This thesis is entirely my own work, and any assistance is acknowledged.

__________________      _____ _____________
Signature        Date
Abstract

The aim of the research on which this dissertation is based was to investigate how mother-tongue instruction (isiZulu) could be used in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. To this end, the research probed the manner in which a group of participating educators conceptualised mother-tongue instruction within the context of inclusion, as well as the challenges that they faced in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers. For ease and convenience, in this qualitative study, the research group comprised educators teaching Social Sciences to a selected Grade 9 class in which all the learners were isiZulu-speaking and had previously been taught through the medium of English. Grade 9 was furthermore selected because the researcher taught in this grade, which meant that the data would be readily accessible.

The study adopted a participatory action research (PAR) approach in which the members of the research group critiqued and reflected on their practice to improve it. To contextualise the research and maintain a balanced broad perspective on the thorny issue of educational language planning, the study briefly examined the nature and implementation of language policies in other African countries such as Zimbabwe, Tanzania and Kenya. The findings of this qualitative study indicated that those learners who had been taught in their mother tongue, or in the same language spoken at home and in the community, generally developed better skills in other languages and even performed better in other areas of study. From the findings it is evident that, given the dearth of knowledgeable educators in the Gauteng province committed to the implementation of mother-tongue instruction and learning, the Gauteng Department of Education needs to provide the requisite teacher training and stimulate the production of study materials to pave the way for the implementation of mother-tongue based instruction. Consequently, the current policies regulating the teaching and learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences in the Gauteng Province are in urgent need of review to create the best opportunities and ensure the best results for the learners concerned.

**Key terms:** mother-tongue instruction, inclusive learning and teaching, context of inclusion, Participatory action research, educational language planning.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express gratitude to the following people and organisations for supporting my endeavours to complete this dissertation:

- First and foremost, I would like to thank God for guiding and protecting me for the duration of the entire study.

- My heartfelt thanks are due to my supervisor, Professor TM. Makoelle, who guided the process with great expertise, commitment and empathy; who never ceased to believe in the successful conclusion of the project; and who encouraged and put his trust in me all the way.

- I owe a special debt of gratefulness to my fellow colleagues in the Social Sciences department—Mr MJ Nthuping, Mr TS Gesa, and Mr PP Khoza—who participated in the study together with the learners of the selected Grade 9 class.

- My Grandmother, Betty Lomasonfo Nkonde, for having been there for me since day one of my life. Without you, this study would not have started at all. Thank you very much Gogo. Niimandze bhambo lunye uma titimbili watitsatsa ekhabonyoko.

- My Wife, Lesego Mittah Dlamini, for the endless support that she gave me while I was working on the study. Your encouragement, advices and reassurance kept me going.

- My Uncle, Majahodvwa Sikhumbuzo Nkonde, for being my source of inspiration. If it was not for you, I would not have thought of venturing into this study.

- My Mother-in-law, Dikeledi Frieda Hlatshwayo, for being a mother to me when I needed you most. Thank you for not complaining whenever I knocked on your door for assistance. Thank you, Lebogolo.

- Mr TA Nkonde, the Principal of Free At Last Comprehensive School, together with the entire staff of the institution—thank you very much for your endless support.
Dedication

This dissertation is dedicated to

my late grandfather

Mahlupheka Joseph Nkonde

and my late mother

Thabisile Nhlavu Nkonde

May your souls rest in peace!
List of abbreviations

CAPS  Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement
DA    Document Analysis
DoE   Department of Education
DoBE  Department of Basic Education
EFL   English as a Foreign Language
ELF   English as a Lingua Franca
ESL   English as a Second Language
ESOL  English for Speakers of Other Languages
FAL   First Additional Language
GDE   Gauteng Department of Education
ICT   Information and Communication Technology
L1    First Language
L2    Second Language
MT    Mother Tongue
MTI   Mother Tongue Instruction
MTBI  Mother Tongue-Based Instruction
MTBE  Mother Tongue-Based Education
NCS   National Curriculum Statement
OBE   Outcomes-Based Education
PAR   Participatory Action Research
PODA  Participant Observation Data Analysis
RJDA  Research Journal Data Analysis
RNCS  Revised National Curriculum Statement
UJ    University of Johannesburg
SGB   School Governing Body
List of figures

**Figure 2.1** Distribution of the population by first language spoken (percentage).
South African Census 2011

**Figure 3.1** The adaptive cycle in Participatory Action Research

**Figure 5.1** The complex integrated structure of interactive learning.

**Figure 5.2** An illustration of a U-shaped seating arrangement
## List of appendices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>Letter of approval from Gauteng Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>Letter to Gauteng Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>Declaration by the researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D</td>
<td>Declaration by the supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E</td>
<td>Declaration by both supervisor and researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F</td>
<td>Letter to the principal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix G</td>
<td>Educator’s letter of consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix H</td>
<td>Parental letter of consent for minors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I</td>
<td>Group consent form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix J</td>
<td>Observation plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix K</td>
<td>Interview questions: Educators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix L</td>
<td>Interview questions: Focus groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix M</td>
<td>Table of improved marks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix N</td>
<td>Table of learners who dropped out of the study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix O</td>
<td>Action research plan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The question as to which language of instruction to use has always been a much debated issue within the South African educational sphere. English as a Second Language (hereafter ESL) is used as a medium of learning by speakers for whom English is not a mother tongue. When it is studied by non-native speakers living in a non-English-speaking environment, English as a Foreign Language (hereafter EFL) usually takes the form of an additional language. English as an Additional Language (hereafter EAL) acknowledges that there are learners who regularly use one or more languages in addition to English.

In South Africa, English is widely used as a medium of instruction or learning in almost all the schools, even by learners who are not native English speakers. This practice continues to create endless complications within the education system, particularly in terms of academic results. Research has shown that learners who study through the medium of a second language (hereafter L2), in this case English, are more likely to experience it as a barrier to learning in class. According to O’Connor and Geiger (2009, p. 255), most “English for Speakers of Other languages” (hereafter ESOL) learners tend to perform poorly academically simply because they are taught in a language that is not native to them and a language that they are not fully familiar with.

There are many challenges associated with using English as a medium of instruction for non-English speakers. For instance, in countries such as Japan, the use of English as an L2 in facilitating learning has presented numerous challenges. Yashima, Zenuk-Nishide and Shimizu (2004, p. 121) point out that many Japanese youths continually feel overburdened and depressed by having to study through the medium of English as they struggle to memorize words and expressions in English in an attempt to raise their formal assessment marks to qualify for examination entry. It is evident that these Japanese learners are only subjected to rote learning instead of meaningful learning: they only do it for the sake of proceeding to the next grade.

In an attempt to address this conundrum, educators often use code-switching during teaching and learning to accommodate learners who are struggling to follow what is being said. This is done by
‘mixing’ languages during lesson presentations in classes. According to Iqbal (2011, p. 188), this is a mixing of languages in bilingual or multilingual situations by educators and learners in an attempt to simplify concepts taught in the language of learning and teaching and the learners’ native language. Code switching brings about positive learning outcomes as it empowers learners to associate their mother tongue with the language of learning and teaching used at that given moment. Speakers switch languages unexpectedly, snubbing social factors or other official restrictions affecting linguistic choices. In a classroom situation, it is likely that the information conveyed might be distorted and cause misunderstandings between the educator and the learners. Code-switching is likely to result in bilingualism which, according to the American Speech-Language-Hearing Association (2004, p. 6), refers to the individual’s ability to use at least two languages. The level at which one can handle both languages is determined by one’s closeness to both languages. The more one uses both languages, the more one is able to handle them in a native-like manner in terms of speaking, understanding, reading and writing.

Byers-Heinlein, Fennell and Werker (2013, p. 198) point out that there are numerous challenges associated with bilingualism; consequently, it is to the detriment of learners to be exposed to bilingual situations as they struggle to understand two sets of vocabularies and two grammars simultaneously. Research indicates that, when children are exposed to more than one language at the same time, the development of their mother tongue could be compromised, which might lead to poor cognitive development and language learning.

However, recently there have been calls for the use of the mother-tongue-based instruction (hereafter MTBI) in teaching and learning. The mother tongue is the language that an individual acquires from his or her mother. This is a language that an individual learns naturally. In general, the mother tongue is the individual’s primary language. According to Oluwole (2008, p. 43), it is the first language that a person learned. In terms of that view, the person is defined as a native speaker of the first language, although one may also be a native speaker of more than one language if all of the languages were learned without formal education, such as through cultural immersion before puberty.

The use of the mother-tongue, or the language of the immediate environment, has been found to be of immense help in promoting childhood literacy and functional education. Therefore, it becomes
a necessity for learners to be frequently exposed to MTBI as it is said to contribute substantially to the language and cognitive development of a child. Tshotsho (2013, p. 41) has observed that the majority of African children are not given an opportunity to learn in their native languages. Educators in classrooms tend to use different models such as code switching in an attempt to ensure learners understand the content delivered in English, which is the language of learning and teaching (hereafter LoLT). This is an educational injustice and inequality considering that some children, more especially from the white communities, are taught in their mother tongue from the first grade of their schooling up to the last grade and they perform outstandingly compared with their black counterparts. According to Ball (2011, p. 5), disadvantaged groups benefit from mother-tongue-based education (hereafter MTBE), and children from the rural areas as well as female learners tend to stay longer in school and achieve better results.

It seems that language is fundamental to the notion of inclusion and access to education. Therefore, the study discussed in this dissertation investigated how well the use of the mother tongue could influence the outcome of learning and teaching within inclusive settings. Hockings (2010, p. 1) explains this as follows:

Inclusive learning and teaching in higher education refers to the ways in which pedagogy, curricula and assessment are designed and delivered to engage students in learning that is meaningful, relevant and accessible to all. It embraces a view of the individual and individual difference as the source of diversity that can enrich the lives and learning of others.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

In South African secondary schools, many learners in Grade 9 are taught through the medium of English. In an attempt to accommodate learners who are experiencing academic challenges when taught in English as a medium of instruction, educators have tried to employ models such as code switching, bilingualism and multilingualism. As much as these models are recognised and used, there is still a great need for learners to be taught in their mother tongue without the interference of other languages. Commenting on the challenges faced by primary-school educators of ESL and ESOL learners in the Western Cape province of South Africa, O’Connor and Geiger (2009, p. 260) point out that, when learners are subjected to a language that is not their own, they constantly lose
their home language and culture. Educators who were interviewed in the study conducted by O’Connor and Geiger (2009) felt that learners continually divorced themselves from their first language (isiXhosa) as they replaced some indigenous vocabulary with English words. Thus it is evident that learning a second language before the mother tongue is well developed, confuses and affects learners’ identities negatively.

It was against the background of this confusion and speculation that the researcher decided to explore the use of isiZulu in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching.

1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

It is evident from the preceding discussion that there is a significant gap in the literature in that few studies have explored the use of indigenous languages such as isiZulu in facilitating learning and teaching. It appears that the main problem is that English as a medium of instruction often acts as a barrier to learning in the case of learners for whom it is not a mother-tongue. Therefore the use of other strategies to enhance learning through English as a second language has proven ineffective, which prompted the main research question posed: How can isiZulu be used in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching? To answer the question, the researcher had to consider the following sub-questions:

- How do educators conceptualise the use of the mother tongue within a context of inclusion?
- Which challenges, if any, do educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers?
- Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate the inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences?
1.4 AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The main problem here was to explore how isiZulu as a mother tongue (L1) could be used effectively to improve inclusive learning in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class. Therefore the following research objectives were formulated:

- To explore how educators conceptualise mother-tongue instruction within the context of inclusion.
- To explore the challenges educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers.
- To develop guidelines for using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning in Grade 9 Social Sciences classes.

1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS

1.5.1 Research paradigm

The study was premised on an interpretive epistemological and ontological approach to social reality. Epistemology has to do with knowledge and what validates knowledge claims—that is, it attempts to comprehend what it means to know, thus assisting people in deciding what kind of information is authentic and sufficient. By contrast, ontology refers to reality, the real world around us (Gray, 2013, p. 19). The study on which this dissertation is based compared and contrasted existing knowledge with what happened in a classroom when Grade 9 learners were taught Social Sciences in isiZulu.

To gather meaningful data using an interpretive approach, the researcher had to interact closely with the participants. This was done in a form of interviews, observations and through document analysis (hereafter DA). This method required the researcher to be part of the community or institution being researched. According to Khakpour (2012, p. 23), interpretive approaches depend largely on naturalistic methods which include interviewing, observation and the analysis of existing text. When these methods are used, there is always a dialogue between the researcher and the participants working together towards constructing a meaningful reality.
Therefore, in this study, the researcher attempted to engage in dialogue with the participants to critique practice, negotiate meanings, and give conclusive interpretations of the phenomenon under study within a natural setting. The interpretive research paradigm therefore led to the choice of a qualitative research approach.

1.5.2 Qualitative approach

The study was conducted qualitatively. According to Henning (2004, p. 5), qualitative research refers to an enquiry in which qualities, the characteristics or the properties of an occurrence is investigated for better understanding and explanation.

It must be noted that, in a qualitative approach, the purpose of understanding is not necessarily to predict what might occur, but rather to understand in depth the features of the situation, the meaning brought to it by the participants, and what is happening to them at a particular moment in time. Hancock (1998, p. 2) indicates that qualitative studies seek to answer the following questions:

- Why do people behave the way they do?
- How are opinions and attitudes formed?
- How are people affected by the events that go on around them?
- How and why have cultures developed the way they have?
- What are the differences between social groups?

This type of research involves the analysis of data, such as words from interviews, pictures or objects. Qualitative data is said to be 'rich', time consuming, and less able to be generalized. According to Dawson (2006, p. 14), qualitative research investigates attitudes, behaviour and experiences by using methods such as interviews or focus groups. A qualitative research method investigates the opinions of a set number of participants and generally a smaller number of people than a quantitative approach.

Therefore, in the study reported on in these pages, the researcher attempted to understand the interactions of the participants in order to generate an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon to arrive at thematic interpretations from which conclusions could be drawn.
1.5.3 Research design: Participatory Action Research (PAR)

The basic research design that was chosen for this study is known as Participatory Action Research (hereafter PAR). According to Coats (2005, p. 4), PAR refers to a study or investigation of a practice conducted by those involved in a practice, with the intention of rejuvenating and refining that particular practice. This means that when PAR is used, the priority is to improve a particular practice among professionals. In the study, a research group was constituted by choosing educators teaching Social Sciences to a selected Grade 9 class with the aim to promote inclusive learning and teaching. These educators worked hand in hand in an attempt to identify useful teaching and learning methods that they could use to improve their teaching methods. According to Makoelle (2012a, p. 84), this form of research is associated with the linkage of theory to practice. Participants tend to maintain abstract and perceptual information and they value impartiality and the absence of any form of bias in the investigation and putting more focus on the individual or group.

In PAR, communication is crucial among the group members as they work through all the stages. Group members are expected to discuss the research from the planning stage, where they would agree on the objectives of the proposed study, up until the reflection stage. Dawson (2006, p. 17) argues that “the group then moves through the four stages of planning, acting, observing and reflecting. This process may happen several times before everyone is happy that the changes have been implemented in the best possible way”.

As already stated above, in the present study, the action research stages identified by Kemmis and McTaggart (1998) as cited in Makoelle (2012a, p 84–85) were adopted for the purpose of collecting data. The stages are: planning (during which the PAR objectives were determined), observation (current practice observed), action (new practices put into action), and reflection (reflecting on PAR processes). During these stages, a series of reflective meetings were held as part of data generation and the frequency of these meetings was determined by the degree of theoretical saturation reached.
1.5.4 Sampling and selection of participants

As previously stated, in this study a research group was constituted by educators teaching Social Sciences to a selected Grade 9 class. Data were collected from a Grade 9 class in which all learners were isiZulu-speaking and had previously been taught through the medium of English. Grade 9 was selected because the researcher taught in this grade and because the research data would be easily accessible.

1.5.5 Data instruments and collection process

The data collection process was cyclical and data were collected using semi-structured interviews, observations and documentary analysis during the PAR phase. The different stages of data collection are briefly discussed below.

a.) Phase 1: Planning

During this stage, the research group determined the PAR objectives. An objective is a comprehensive outcome that a person or structure aims to achieve within a set time frame and with the available resources. Coats (2005, p. 10) explains that the research members (researcher and the participants) have to identify an area where they feel there is a gap that needs to be ‘filled’. Questions should be raised around that particular area that needs to be changed or improved, and the members if the research team need to agree on the aims and objectives of their investigation, as happened in the present study.

b.) Phase 2: Observation

The participants observed one another during the teaching of the Social Sciences lessons. To this end, a pre-planned observation schedule had been drawn up by the research group to evaluate the current practices that were being used to facilitate learning. According to Dawson (2006, p. 103), the process of participant observation can be seen as a methodology rather than a method. It is a technique for producing understanding about the way of life of others.

Access to the community to be observed is important to the researcher. In the present study, the researcher happened to be an educator in the same institution where the study was conducted.
According to Dawson (2006, p. 104), for participant observation to take place, one needs to gain access to the community under investigation. Prior to the commencement of the study, the researcher had been granted permission by the Gauteng Department of Education (GDE) (see Appendix A) to conduct the research and the researcher had also received permission from the principal of the school where the study was to be conducted (see Appendix F). Access to the research site was therefore unproblematic. The researcher then conducted semi-structured interviews with the participating educators based on the observations to gather evidence on how the observed practices could be developed to facilitate inclusive teaching and learning in isiZulu. As is customary for the purposes of conducting the semi-formal interviews, the researcher had equipped himself with a list of questions or specific topics to be covered (habitually known as an interview guide). During the semi-formal interview, the interviewee was free to give any answer (see Appendix K). Pathak and Intratat (2012, p. 4) affirm that “semi-structured interviews are used when the research should benefit from a fairly open framework. They are also used when more useful information can be obtained from focused yet conversational two-way communication with the participants”.

c.) Phase 3: Action

Using the evidence culled from observations and interview data, the research group identified practices that had the potential to facilitate inclusive learning in isiZulu and adopted them in facilitating learning over three months. During this time, a reflective meeting was held once a week to review the usefulness of such practices in facilitating inclusive learning and teaching (see Appendix O). Concomitantly, documentary analysis of learner performance was also carried out by analysing mark schedules in the subject of Social Sciences. DA is a process of looking at the official documents of an institution to gather detailed data on the practices of the institution. Such documents could include public documents, policies, minutes, plans and diaries. In this study, learners’ records such as schedules and assessment exercise books to determine the extent of academic improvement were used.

Focus-group interviews were conducted with learners from the selected class to determine their perspective on practices adopted to facilitate inclusive learning (see Appendix L). The concept of focus-group interviews, according to Dawson (2006, p. 30), refers to a small group of people
gathered to discuss a certain issue. During this kind of interview, there is always a mediator who ensures that there is order and that everyone gets a chance to answer the questions asked. In this type of interview, everyone is allowed to give input on the topic at hand. According to Myers and Barnes (2005, p. 24), focus groups, as the name indicates, are habitually focused on a specific topic, activity or service and, in most instances, all participants share something in common.

**d.) Phase 4: Reflection**

The research group reflected on PAR processes, made interpretations and drew conclusions. The group discussed how different teaching pedagogies could be applied in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to obtain excellent learning outcomes. According to Makoelle and Van Der Merwe (2014, p. 172), reflection is necessary as it is used as a tool to observe the process of change. Educators reflect on their pedagogies based on the objectives they wished to achieve in the course of the investigation. Reflection as a process can be done on a daily basis using field notes that are taken daily to determine the realization of the objectives set by the team. In the present study, reflection was done on a weekly basis after all the participants had agreed on the essential teaching methods for teaching Social Sciences in a Grade 9 class using isiZulu.

**1.5.6 Data analysis**

An inductive data-analysis method was used in the study. The researcher used inductive coding, which began with close readings of the text and a consideration of the multiple meanings inherent in the text. Next he identified text segments that contained meaning units, and created a label for a new category to which the text segment was assigned. According to Dawson (2006, p. 117) data analysed by themes is called thematic analysis. This nature of the analysis is said to be highly inductive in the sense that the themes arise from the data and are not imposed upon it by the researcher. For the purposes of conducting a thematic analysis of the data generated during the research study, the researcher exploited observation notes, his research journal and the interview reports to strengthen the authenticity of the study— even background reading formed part of the analysis process to explain an emerging theme.
1.6 TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE RESEARCH

Trustworthiness is an important aspect of qualitative research and a tool with which to determine the authenticity of a study. Lincoln and Guba (1985) (cited in Loh, 2013, p. 3) stress the importance of the trustworthiness of a research project because, if the research cannot be accepted as trustworthy by other scholars in the wide-ranging field of qualitative research, the opponents of qualitative research (i.e. quantitative researchers) will declare it fallacious. This demands that, by using existing literature and the research data, the researcher should prove beyond a reasonable doubt that the findings are indeed correct. In this study, the trustworthiness of the findings was assessed by using a range of techniques such as comparison with findings from previous research, triangulation within a project, and feedback from participants in the research.

1.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Protecting the confidentiality of the participants was of paramount importance in carrying out this research. According to Dawson (2006, p. 152), it is essential for a researcher to be open and honest with the participants, and to provide them with a Code of Ethics before the commencement of the study. Prior to every participant observation and interview conducted as part of the study, each participant received a full explanation of his or her rights (e.g. concerning confidentiality and anonymity) during and after the relevant sessions. The participating educators all signed a form of consent (see Appendix G), which informed them that their participation was entirely voluntary, and that they had the right to withdraw from the study at any time without penalty, even after signing the form of consent. They also signed a group agreement to maintain confidentiality and anonymity (see Appendix I). In addition, the learners’ parents were also given a form of consent to sign on behalf of their children (see Appendix H) informing them about the voluntary participation of their children. The purpose of the study was explained, as was the position of the student researcher at the University of Johannesburg (hereafter UJ). As previously pointed out, prior to the commencement of the study, the researcher had obtained permission from the Gauteng Department of Education (GDE) (see Appendix A) to conduct the research and had written a letter to the principal of the school where the study was to be conducted (see Appendix F).
1.8 STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT

Chapter 1
This chapter of the study sketches the background to, motivation and rationale for the study. The chapter elucidates the problem statement, research questions, and the objectives of the study. The study is explained with specific reference to the research paradigm, qualitative approach, research design (PAR), sampling and selection of participants, data instruments and collection process, and data analysis. The trustworthiness of the research, ethical considerations, and the structure of the report are similarly briefly outlined in this chapter. Finally, the main concepts of inclusive education, inclusive teaching, inclusive learning, inclusive pedagogy, isiZulu, and Social Sciences are defined in this chapter of the report.

Chapter 2
Chapter 2 presents a review of the research literature and an explanation of the central concept of inclusive education. This is followed by an account of the isiZulu language according to the South African census of 2011 (Statistics South Africa, 2012), and an explanation of Social Sciences as a learning area according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (hereafter CAPS). The chapter sketches the background to the language policy in South Africa, focusing on a democratic South Africa and its national language policy. In addition, the chapter emphasizes the advantages of MTBI, which are improved cognitive development, a sense of cultural identity, the avoidance of rote learning, and the fostering of reading and writing skills. The chapter also addresses the issue of the language of education in an African context, for example in Zimbabwe, Tanzania and Kenya. In conclusion, the chapter draws attention to the shortcomings of MTBI, such as the lack of learning material written in isiZulu and the lack of adequate teacher training in MTBI. The chapter ends by commenting on the advantages and disadvantages of the alternative models to MTBI and their shortcomings, which are code switching, bilingualism and multilingualism.

Chapter 3
Chapter 3 discusses the research methodology of the study, with specific reference to the research paradigm, qualitative approach, research design (PAR), qualitative data collection instruments, sampling, selection of participants, and the choice of research site. Next, the chapter pays special attention to the analysis of the data, the trustworthiness of the research, and the role of the
researcher. Finally, the chapter elucidates the ethical considerations that the researcher had to take into account.

Chapter 4
Chapter 4 reports on the data analysis and understanding of the data analysis measures based on the discussions of the focus-group interviews (learners) and semi-structured interviews (educators) that the researcher worked with. The chapter furthermore focuses on the following themes based on the data collected during the study: inaccessible curricula, meaningful learning, improved pedagogy, cultural identity, academic excellence, classroom resources, code switching, information communication technology (hereafter ICT) in social sciences and team teaching (PAR), cooperative learning, small group discussion, student presentation and peer evaluation, brainstorming and seating arrangements. The chapter justifies the themes by using direct quotations from the transcripts of both the semi-structured and the focus-groups interviews, observations, research journal and the literature discussed in Chapter 2.

Chapter 5
Chapter 5 restates the research aim of the study, focusing on the research questions and the objectives of the study. The chapter provides a brief summary of the study, followed by a discussion of the findings. The chapter further discusses the implications and recommendations of the study. In conclusion, the chapter discusses the limitations of the study and makes suggestions for further research, focusing on the Gauteng Department of Education.

1.9 DEFINITION OF MAIN CONCEPTS

1.9.1 Inclusive education

Inclusive education refers to the process of including all learners in schools regardless of any learning barriers that they might be suffering from. Inclusive education places more emphasis on the rights of learners than on their physical, mental, socio-economic, cultural and even racial backgrounds. Inclusive education is about quality and equal educational opportunities for everyone. Stubbs (2008, p. 11) points out the following:
The key issue is that inclusive education is based on a rights and social model; the system should adapt to the child, not the child to the system. The ‘twin-track’ approach is also important, focusing both on changing the system and supporting learners who are vulnerable to exclusion.

The study acknowledges the fact that inclusive education is about enabling education structures, systems and learning methodologies to meet the needs of all learners. This is evident in the advocacy of using isiZulu rather than English as a medium of instruction as the latter is an alien language to learners who are non-English language speakers. In short, in the study, inclusive education was construed to denote a way of addressing the diverse needs of all learners by reducing the barriers to and within the learning environment.

1.9.2 Inclusive teaching

Inclusive teaching is the act that enables educators with the necessary skills to deliver academic content appropriately to the relevant recipients without any form of discrimination and segregation. Inclusive teaching is based on the belief that educators must prepare lessons that cater for all learners in a classroom, regardless of their unequal capabilities. According to White Paper 6 (DoE, 2001), learning and teaching inadequacies might arise from the manner and way in which content is delivered to the recipients (the learners), rather than from the curriculum. This means that educators should exert themselves even more to ensure that they teach inclusively rather than become barriers to learning and teaching.

Learners who are said to be ‘slow’ in class are frequently ignored and excluded by their educators while those who are ‘faster’ in grasping concepts in class enjoy the benefits of being taught inclusively. Commenting on the importance of inclusive teaching, Kourkoutas, Toth and Vitalaki (2015, p. 6) conclude that the school environment is vital in promoting or hindering pupils’ psychosocial and academic development and inclusion. This actually means that educators need to develop teaching pedagogies that include all learners. In this study, the educators designed lessons that took their own teaching methods (including the medium of instruction) as well as the learners’ educational needs into account. In short, the educators’ methods of teaching were inclusive.
1.9.3 Inclusive learning

Learners often feel threatened and not entirely welcome in their different schools because of being discriminated against and excluded from the learning process by their educators for a variety of reasons. Inclusive learning advocates that all learners have the right to be incorporated into the learning process, regardless of their capabilities and abilities. According to Shevlin et al. (2009, p. 4), the concept of inclusive learning denotes an environment where all learners are fully respected regardless of gender, ethnicity, ability, socio-economic background or special educational needs.

Inclusive learning advocates that all learners in a classroom should be given equal opportunities in order for them to learn effectively. The Queensland VET Development Centre (2012, p. 5) acknowledges the fact that inclusive learning creates equal opportunities for all learners in that they are treated fairly and justly and all receive a fair access to learning opportunities. In this present study, all learners studied Social Sciences using their mother tongue, isiZulu, which made them feel welcome and appreciated at all times. A language or a teaching method that is not inclusive might lead to education breakdown and exclusion of the learners.

1.9.4 Inclusive pedagogy

Inclusive pedagogy is a teaching method that integrates all teaching and learning practices, such as a multicultural curriculum and diverse ways of assessment aimed at improving learners’ academic endeavours. According to Makoelle (2014, p. 1260), “inclusive pedagogy denotes the entirety of teaching methods, approaches, forms and principles that enhance learner participation”. In this present study, educators came up with different teaching methods that were aimed at enhancing learner participation and concentration. The educators’ lessons were designed around the educational needs of the learners to use their mother tongue, isiZulu. An inclusive pedagogy puts more emphasis on the interests of the learners than those of the educator, which means that learning and teaching must be learner-centred at all times. Makoelle (2014, p. 1262) further states that “every teacher adopts a particular teaching approach to teach specific subject material to a designated group of learners. Promoting inclusion in the classroom may require the teacher to analyse which strategies best promote inclusion”.

15
1.9.5 IsiZulu

IsiZulu, which is frequently shortened to Zulu, is one of the 11 official languages of this country (Statistics South Africa 2012). It is estimated that 10 million people living in South Africa are able to speak the language and most of them live in the Kwa-Zulu Natal province. According to Magagula (2009, p. 3), isiZulu is not only one of South Africa’s official languages; but the most widely spoken language in the country. isiZulu language belongs to the Nguni group of languages (Xhosa, SiSwati, Zulu and Ndebele) and is one of the Bantu languages. The present study used the isiZulu language because the majority of the learners at the research site were isiZulu-speakers and because the language was understood by most of the educators. According to Magagula (2009, p. 1), the Pan South African Language Board recommends that, as an indigenous language, isiZulu should be used as one of the media of instruction in schools, including at higher institutions of learning in South Africa.

1.9.6 Social Sciences

The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (hereafter CAPS) of the Department of Basic Education [hereafter DoBE] (2011) defines Social Sciences as the combination of history and geography. History denotes “the study of change and development in society over time … [which] enables people to understand and evaluate how past human actions have had an impact on the present and how they influence the future” (DoBE, 2011, p. 9). This means that historians are concerned with the different socio-economic and political changes that take place in our different environments globally. Geography, on the other hand, is defined as

the study of the human and physical environment. Geography is an integrated discipline that examines both physical and human processes over space and time. Geography helps us to understand our complex world. It offers us a bridge between the human and physical sciences. (DoBE, 2011, p. 11)

10. CONCLUSION

This chapter has provided background information to the study which explored MTBI (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. The chapter has outlined the problem statement, research question, aims and objectives, as well as the rationale of the study. Finally, the chapter has explained the salient concepts used in the study, for example
inclusive education, inclusive teaching, inclusive learning, inclusive pedagogy, isiZulu and Social Sciences.
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter reviews the relevant literature on the importance of the implementation of MTBI that would facilitate inclusive education in South Africa. The chapter sketches the background to the isiZulu language based on the recent statistics published by South African Census (2011), gives an explanation of Social Sciences as a learning area according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), Department of Basic Education (DoBE, 2011), and discusses the background to the language policy of South Africa, with particular reference to the apartheid and post-apartheid era.

As will be shown in this chapter, there is sufficient information in the critical literature to indicate unequivocally that MTBI is beneficial. This chapter therefore focuses on the advantages of MTBI and discusses the language policies of countries such as Zimbabwe, Tanzania, and Kenya.

2.2 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

Inclusive education dates back to 1994 when 92 countries came together in Salamanca, Spain, in a meeting which later came to be known as the World Conference on Special Needs Education. According to Landsberg (2005, p. 8), this conference was aimed at informing the entire world about the importance of implementing inclusive education, which advocates the inclusion of all learners in teaching and learning environments, more especially those learners with learning barriers. Such a shift came long after the marginalisation and discrimination of learners with learning barriers in schools. At this conference, all the participants signed an agreement which later came to be known as the Salamanca Declaration, which advocated the following:

Schools should accommodate all children regardless of their physical, intellectual, social, emotional, linguistic or other conditions. This should include disabled and gifted children, street and working children, children from remote or nomadic populations, children from linguistic, ethnic or cultural minorities and children from other disadvantaged or marginalized areas or groups.” (The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education, p. 3).
In 2001, South Africa implemented inclusive education, and White Paper 6 (DoE, 2001) became the roadmap for schools to transform their teaching and learning processes to be inclusive. This followed the educational injustices and inequalities perpetrated by the apartheid regime whereby the ‘superior race’ (whites) enjoyed more educational opportunities than the ‘inferior races’ (Indians, Coloureds and Native Africans). According to Winter and O’Raw (2010, p. 7), inclusive education is grounded in fundamental human rights. This simply means that education systems need to respect and observe learners’ rights regardless of their racial, cultural, socio-economic and any other related background. Everyone is entitled to education; therefore, it is indeed an essential human right as it is stated in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations [UN], 1948).

In sketching the background to inclusive education in South Africa, Landsberg (2005, p. 15) explains that South Africa adopted the same route as other countries with regard to the implementation of specialised education. There were slight differences though in terms of delivery between the previously racially isolated groups during the apartheid era. To redress the educational injustices of the past, the South African Department of Education took a vital stand and formulated a new policy in July 2001. The policy came to be known as Education White Paper 6 (DoE, 2001) on Special Needs Education: Building an Inclusive Education and Training System. This policy provided guidelines for the new education system it was going to create in South Africa so that all learners would have equal opportunities to be educated (DoE, 2002). The guiding principles for the new education and training system focused on protecting the rights of all people by ensuring that all learners:

- are treated fairly;
- can participate fully and equally in education and society;
- understand and can participate meaningfully in the teaching and learning processes in schools;
- have equal access to a single, inclusive education system;
- depend on community involvement in changing the education system;
- have access to affordable education. (DoE, 2002, p. 8)
To understand the role of inclusive education in South Africa, one needs to take into consideration the different types of schools; that is, mainstream, full service, and special schools. These will now be briefly discussed.

*Mainstreaming* refers to the process of accommodating and educating learners with special needs in regular classes during specific time periods based on their skills. This means that regular education classes are combined with special education classes. According to White Paper 6 (DoE, 2001, p. 17), mainstreaming is nothing but an effort to make learners ‘fit in’ or be brought into the ordinary classroom with ordinary learners. In mainstream schools, educators work hand in hand with specialists such as educational psychologists in identifying and referring learners to the relevant institutions for more educational interventions. The main focus in mainstream schools is on the learners’ academic achievements. According to Wang (2009, p. 155) it is highly possible to have learners in a mainstream school regardless of their physical and sensory difficulties, including children with no impairments. Educators should remain sensitive to their emotional and social needs, especially in the case of learners who are on medication.

Another type of a school to be considered is the *full service school* which, according to Best Practices Briefs (1998–1999, p. 1) is not a specific service model. A full service school is an institution that is designed to serve the needs of children and their parents, by inclusiveness in service and by flexibility in approach. A unique feature of a full service school is the full engagement of both the parents and the community agencies such as churches, non-governmental organisations, police forums and many more. (Best Practices Briefs 1998–1999, p. 1) In most cases such schools assist the neighbouring schools in terms of the provision of inclusive services and support. Harris and Wilkes (2013, p. 2) claim that “although specific services vary from school to school, community schools typically offer those focused on quality education, youth development, physical and mental health, family support, family and community engagement, and community development”.

The last type of a school to consider is the *special school* which, according to Save the Children (2002, p. 10) refers to institutions that are strictly structured with regard to distinctive impairments; for instance, children who are blind attend a school for the blind, children who are deaf attend a
school that caters for learners who are deaf, and children who are autistic attend schools for autistic learners. In this way, such institutions develop different cultures and an ethos based on the form of curriculum offered; hence, they are special. According to the Department of Education (DoE, 2008, p. 9), these institutions convey educational content to learners requiring high-intensive educational and other support. Special schools are necessary because in most cases learners with special educational needs are widely subjected to discrimination in mainstream schools and they are constantly deprived of equal opportunities to learning and teaching.

It is crucial to understand what inclusive education is and what it is not. Learners learn because they are acknowledged for whom they are and stimulated to be all that they can be as they partake in meaningful activities with high expectations. Inclusive education is rooted in the belief that all learners should be given equal educational opportunities unconditionally. According to Save the Children (2002), “inclusive education is a process of increasing the participation of all students in schools, including those with disabilities” (p. 9). This school of thought calls upon all educational systems to review all philosophies, policies, regulations and practices in educational institutions which are discriminatory to be in line with the needs of the learners’ diversities. Wang (2009, p. 155) also concludes that inclusion is necessary to advantage learners with educational special needs through developments in their learning outcomes by placing more emphasis on their social skills, academic achievement and individual growth. It is therefore essential to make learners’ educational needs a priority so that their various educational needs can be met.

Makoelle (2012b, p. 96) points out that South African inclusive education is entrenched in the Constitution of the State, Act 108 of 1996, which was aimed at bringing about societal change—that is, from being discriminatory to being accommodative and inclusive. This followed the long years of racial segregation which were rooted in apartheid laws from 1948 until 1994. The different races were subjected to different ‘forms’ of education: whites, unlike the supposedly inferior races, received a quality education whereas people belonging to the so-called inferior races who lived with any form of disability suffered the most as they were not ‘included’ within the education fraternity. It was from this long period of turmoil that the need arose to grant everyone across the racial groups a fair and just educational opportunity that would be inclusive for all. Hockings (2010, p. 1) claims that
inclusive learning and teaching in higher education refers to the ways in which pedagogy, curricula and assessment are designed and delivered to engage students in learning that is meaningful, relevant and accessible to all.

According to Makoelle (2012b, p. 94), Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) was introduced by the democratic South African government in 2005 to address inclusivity in schools and bring about a positive culture of teaching and learning. However, it appears that issues relating to the language of instruction were never addressed, yet they are crucial in achieving effective inclusive learning and teaching. Thus far, out of the eleven official languages in South Africa, it is only English that is widely used in almost all the institutions of learning across the country—even by non-English speakers, thereby creating yet another instance of educational injustice and inequality.

Inclusive learning and teaching is characterised by an inclusive pedagogy which, according to Makoelle (2014), refers to the “totality of teaching methods, approaches, forms and principles that enhance learner participation. Teaching inclusively is central to this approach” (p. 1260). In South African schools, the most dominant medium of instruction is English, which is an “alien” language to the majority of learners, more especially in township schools which are attended by African learners. Many educators such as the researcher and the research team (which comprised three Social Sciences educators) believe that the use of English as a medium of instruction by non-English speakers is one of the factors that lead to poor performance in South African schools. Commenting on the poor performance of schools due to a lack of an adequate and appropriate pedagogy, Tshotsho (2013, p. 40) claims that equal opportunity in education is a priority for the government but language in education has not received the attention it deserves. Research has revealed that language and achievement are closely linked and that the use of English language as a medium of instruction in South Africa contributes a great deal to the high failure rate and dropout rates among black students.

Consequently, this is a call to all stakeholders of education in South Africa to develop a well-structured pedagogy that would include every learner sufficiently and suitably in all classrooms. According to Makoelle (2014, p. 1261), educators need to apply various teaching approaches such as reciprocal teaching; scaffolding instruction; the use of technology to aid inclusion; multiple
intelligences; multi-level instruction; and multi-sensory instruction aimed at helping learners to transform performance in class.

2.2. IsiZulu language

IsiZulu, which is frequently shortened to Zulu, is one of the 11 official languages of South Africa (RSA Census, 2011). It is estimated that 10 million people living in South Africa are able to speak the language and that the majority of them live in the Kwa-Zulu Natal province of South Africa. According to Magagula (2009, p. 3), isiZulu is not only one of South Africa’s 11 official languages, but it is also the most spoken language in the country. The IsiZulu language falls under the Nguni group (Xhosa, SiSwati, Zulu and Ndebele) and is one of the Bantu languages. The study used the isiZulu language simply because the majority of the learners at the research site were isiZulu speakers and because the language was understood by a most of the educators. According to Magagula (2009, p. 1) it has been suggested by the Pan South African Language Board that isiZulu as an indigenous language should be used as one of the media of instruction in schools including higher institutions of learning in South Africa. Figure 2.1 below gives a graphic representation of the distribution of the South African population by the first language spoken.

![Figure 2.1: Distribution of the population by first language spoken (percentage).]
2.2.2 Social Sciences according to CAPS

The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), Grades 7–9 (DoBE, 2011) defines Social Sciences as the combination of both History and Geography. The document defines history as “the study of change and development in society over time”. It adds that “the study of History enables people to understand and evaluate how past human action has had an impact on the present and how it influences the future”. (2011, p. 9) By contrast, Geography is:

the study of the human and physical environment. Geography is an integrated discipline that examines both physical and human processes over space and time. Geography helps us to understand our complex world. It offers us a bridge between the human and physical sciences. (DoBE, 2011, p. 11)

Over the years the researcher has felt that little or no justice is being done to learners who struggle to comprehend both historical and geographical concepts when they are taught through the medium of English. It is because of such experiences that the researcher believes it would be most helpful to use isiZulu in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class.

2.3 BACKGROUND TO THE LANGUAGE POLICY OF SOUTH AFRICA

The controversy around language policy in the South African education fraternity dates back to the South African War of 1899 to 1902 (formerly known as Anglo-Boer War) between the British and Afrikaner people. Shortly afterwards, Afrikaans and English became the two official languages of South Africa at the expense of the indigenous languages. According to Msila (2007, p. 148) Western education in South Africa dates back to the arrival of the Dutch settlers in the 1600s. Even though it was still on a minute scale, the natives were taught in Afrikaans. However, there was a dramatic change in language use shortly after the war. The Afrikaners were defeated and one of the resolutions after the war was that English would be the second official language alongside Afrikaans.

In 1948, when the National Party came to power under the leadership of D.F. Malan, apartheid policy was introduced which postulated the ‘apartness’ or ‘separateness’ of different racial groups (Whites, Coloureds, Indians and Native Africans). Msila (2007) states that “apartheid education was a practice of maintaining that status quo and of preserving the master-servant relationship
between the Africans and the whites” (p. 149). The Bantu Education Act of 1953 was one of the apartheid laws that had a negative impact on the people of South Africa particularly on the indigenous black population Africans, as far as education was concerned. According to Rehman (2008, p. 6), the notion of Bantu education was the brainchild of Hendrik Verwoerd, an Afrikaner who had studied in Germany and was said to have been inspired by Hitler’s discrimination against the Jews. Bantu education advocated the limitation of African children to only the first four years of schooling so that they will not pose a threat to the white people. African children were only taught how to perform manual labour as opposed to skilled labour.

The apartheid authorities made the South African indigenous languages appear useless and inferior as learners eventually preferred to be taught through the medium of English rather than in their home languages. Afrikaans, on the other hand, was viewed as a language of oppression. The Soweto students’ uprising of 1976, which resulted from Afrikaans being made an official medium of instruction in black schools, marked the full rejection of Bantu education. According to Alexander (2003, p. 15), immediately after the student protests of 1976, the apartheid government responded by allowing MTBE up to the first three or four years of primary education. Although Afrikaans was no longer used as a medium of instruction, it remained a subject up to the last grade of schooling and it remained one of the official languages alongside English during the apartheid era in South Africa.

The introduction of the National Education Policy in 1992 was a turning point in language policy in education in South Africa. This policy indicated that indigenous languages had to be taught in township schools for at least up to the fourth grade of schooling and that English would be used later on (Tshotsho, 2013, p. 41).

2.3.1 Democratic South Africa and national language policy

Shortly after South Africa was declared a democratic state in 1994, a Constitution was drafted as a guideline for everyone living in the country. The Constitution stressed the equality of the 11 official languages (English, Afrikaans, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, siSwati, Tshivenda, Xitsonga, isiNdebele, isiXhosa and isiZulu). The Bill of Rights on education (language) tried to re-address the inequalities and injustices related to the use of English and Afrikaans as the only official
languages in the country during the apartheid regime. The Constitution of the Republic of South
Africa, (1996a) (Act 108 of 1996), Section 29, Education (2) stipulates that it is every citizen’s
right to acquire education in his or language of .choice in public institutions. This is contradictory
in the sense that even today learners (that is, mostly black learners) are still subjected to the injustice
of being taught in a foreign language, English, across all learning areas in schools. According to
Tshotsho (2013, p 40), South Africa as a State, through Naledi Pandor, the then Minister of
education at that time, stated that English would not be compulsory as a medium of instruction.
However, this appeared to be a contradiction as Pandor insisted that English would remain the
language of education until the African languages were satisfactorily advanced.

It is depressing to see that most South African children are still subjected to marginalisation and
discrimination in schools because of their “failure” to handle the ‘Queen’s Language’ while they
are still waiting for their native languages to be “developed”. South African children are dropping
out of school because of their failure to understand concepts taught in English. According to
Tshotsho (2013, p. 41), a majority of black learners lack quite a number of facilities that would
help them enhance their understanding of English, especially those in the rural areas. Urban
learners, on the other hand, are exposed to libraries, television and other forms of media which help
them to improve English language proficiency. The researcher, therefore, supports the call for the
use of MTBI in a bid to create inclusive classrooms in our schools that would cater for every
learner, regardless of ethnicity, race and socio-economic background. It is quite obvious, according
to Gacheche (2010, p. 8), that any educational system that imposes the language of learning and
teaching of a leading group on minorities does so to their detriment and negates their right to a fair
and just education.

After the demise of the apartheid system, South Africa officialised 11 languages and declared
English the lingua franca of the country. A lingua franca is any language that is extensively used
as a means of communication among speakers of other languages. According to Seidhlofer (2005,
p. 339), “in recent years, the term ‘English as a lingua franca’ (ELF) has emerged as a way of
referring to communication in English between speakers with different first languages”. In South
Africa, English is considered to be the lingua franca in business as well as in government
departments (schools included).
According to the South African Schools Act (1996b) (Republic of South Africa, 1996b), it is the
duty of every school to choose the language of instruction from the 11 official languages. This
should be done by the School Governing Body (hereafter SGB) of each school, which consists of
parents, educators, staff members, learners and the principal. The status quo is actually very
different because in most South African schools MTBI only takes place from the first grade of
schooling up to the fourth grade and, in most cases, the SGBs are excluded. This means that, in
South Africa, learners are only afforded the right to use their mother tongue as a medium of
instruction from Grades 1 to 4; that is, at a stage where some learners are not yet entirely proficient
in their mother tongue, thus making it a challenge to learn a second language. According to
Gacheche (2010), an education system that imposes an alien language on a non-English speaking
indigenous population is unjust and unfair as it fails to consider their patterns of linguistic
development, and stunts their intellectual development. It has been proven that education offered
in one’s mother tongue is always beneficial.

2.4 ADVANTAGES OF MOTHER-TONGUE INSTRUCTION

While there are merits and demerits to any language model for teaching and learning, MTBI is
known to have several benefits such as promoting cognitive development, cultural identity, the
avoidance of rote learning, and the development of reading and writing skills.

2.4.1 Cognitive development

It has been suggested by a number of scholars that the use of MTBI not only puts learners at an
advantage but contributes to their cognitive development. According to Pluddemann (2010, p. 6),
MTBI promotes successful literacy development and learning at school. The reason is that children
are familiar with all the meanings and sounds of words associated with their native languages,
therefore it becomes easier to make sense of what is said and in the process they develop
cognitively. Research indicates that children acquire their mother tongue more readily than a
second language and, if they are subjected to a second language before the full acquisition of their
mother tongue, this may delay their cognitive development. Landsberg (2005) states that, when a
person listens to a familiar language, he or she is “able to recognise the series of speech sounds perceptually and reconstruct them into meaningful words and sentence structure” (p. 120). This is correct in the sense that the assimilation of English concepts takes place through the mother tongue, thereby enabling learners to understand most of the topics fully. In most cases, our learners are swamped with complicated English concepts at a tender age before they can develop cognitively. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 3), when learners are instructed in a language that they fully understand, they engage meaningfully with the content and they are likely to ask questions whenever they do not understand what they are being taught. In the case of a foreign language, the situation is different as the learners tend to be reserved and quiet in class as they are incapable of expressing themselves, which creates feelings of humiliation and rejection.

It follows that children need to learn their native languages before they are burdened with a second language as this helps them to understand concepts taught in that particular second language more easily. Muchenje, Goronga and Bondai favour MTBI as, in their opinion, it contributes substantially to the cognitive improvement of the learners. The authors argue that learning in general (including second-language learning) occurs more effectively if the required cognitive development has already taken place through the use of a first language as a language of learning and finally literacy and cognitive skills already acquired in the first language provide easy transition to second language medium education. (2013, p. 503)

In South African township schools, learners are formally assessed in English but not in the indigenous languages (e.g. isiZulu, Sesotho and SiSwati), which means that tests and examination question papers are written in English. Learners who are not yet fully developed cognitively are at a disadvantage as they cannot comprehend what they have been asked, which leads to an increase in the failure rate. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 32), “without adequate support for their home language and local knowledge, children may end up lacking the courage to demonstrate their intelligence and be written off as poor performers”. It is therefore essential to promote the use of MTBI in schools as it contributes significantly to the cognitive development of the learners.
2.4.2 Cultural identity

Language is one of the major tools that human beings use for communication and it is also an outstanding element of one’s cultural identity. According to Muchenje et al., (2013, p. 502), human beings use language not only for communication but also for observing and preserving their cultural identity. Language is a custodian of culture because it is through the use of language that people are able to express their cultural values. One’s language carries one’s identity. When learners are exposed to their native languages, they tend to relate to their cultural and traditional ways of life.

According to Guvercin (2010, p. 3) “the child’s native language links the child with the culture of the society the child comes from and shapes his or her identity”. Many South African learners are faced with the dilemma of being exposed to Western culture by using English (and some other colonial languages) and simultaneously losing their own cultural identity. These groups of learners are said to be lacking in both self-confidence and a sense of belonging as they fail dismally to associate themselves with their societal norms and values (Guvercin, 2010, p. 3).

The use of MTBI leads to deeper cultural understanding and increases national consciousness. As stated in the CAPS document (DbE 2011), “one of the aims of history is to create knowledge, understanding and appreciation of the past and the forces that shape it” (p. 10). When learners are taught through the medium of their mother tongue, they realize the beauty of their language, which is rooted in their culture and traditions. According to Muchenje et al., (2013, p. 503), when children or adults are forced to learn a language in order to assimilate into another culture, they may be encouraged to abandon their own cultural identity.

Learners who are not exposed to their mother tongue fail to become linguistically competent members of their families and communities and lose the ability to connect with their cultural heritage. This identity crisis does not only affect learners but educators as well as they move from one language to the next. The findings of a study conducted by Khejeri (2014, p. 81) indicate that educators were in favour of MTBI because it helped learners to appreciate their culture and language, thereby bringing educators and learners together. Indications are that MTBI contributes significantly to the enhancement and preservation of the learner’s culture.
2.4.3 Avoidance of rote learning

MTBI is necessary because the learners' better understanding of the content taught to them discourages rote learning, which involves the memorisation of content and regurgitation of English concepts during assessments for the sake of passing. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 7), learners in MTBI classrooms are able to express themselves and contribute to discussions, which aids their intellectual development as most of their dialogue takes place in a familiar language. This results in more meaningful learning and decreases the dropout, failure and repetition rates.

By contrast, learners who are exposed to English or any other second language become victims of the education system as they are forced to drop out of school and are completely excluded from the academic world simply because they are not proficient in English, even if they are proficient in their native languages. Landsberg (2005, p. 151) points out that the phonological and linguistic fundamentals of two different languages tend to differ. When two languages are forcefully imposed on the learners simultaneously, the learners become confused. According to this school of thought, learners should only be exposed to MTBI to avoid rote learning and confusion in their classrooms. This is, for example, quite evident in the case of learners in Japan who are frequently confronted with the difficulties of using their mother tongue as well as English as a second language.

Khejeri (2014, p. 81) reports that educators who participated in a research study observed that when learners were taught using their mother-tongue there was always a higher level of meaningful participation and concentration in the classrooms. Indeed, MTBI contributes significantly to the motivation and participation of learners during teaching and learning. Educators revealed that MTBI helped learners to switch positively from home-based activities to school-based or related activities because of the similarity of the language used.

2.4.4 Reading and writing skills

Reading and writing skills are essential in the academic world and easily attainable through the usage of MTBI. Learners need to be taught in their native language until they are able to differentiate clearly between L1 and L2. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 6), learners acquire
literacy skills such as reading much faster when they are taught in a language that they are familiar with. When they are taught in a foreign language, learners struggle for a long time to master the sounds before they master the symbols. It is, therefore, advisable to give learners in school environments enough time to be taught in their mother tongue as this would enable them to acquire various academic skills. According to Landsberg (2005, p. 151), when the learning of a second language (English) is made obligatory, the learners’ ability to speak, read and write their first language might be compromised.

Commenting on the positive academic skills that learners acquire by MTBI, Guvercin (2010, p. 4) concludes that it becomes easy for learners to learn a second language once their mother tongue is perfectly fixed in their minds. In addition, this assists them in developing stronger literacy skills at school because it is said that learners’ literacy skills and aptitudes transfer across languages from the mother tongue to the language the child is learning at school.

2.5 LANGUAGE OF EDUCATION IN THE AFRICAN CONTEXT

There are different approaches to choosing the language of instruction in African educational contexts. It is therefore important to discuss a few African contexts to understand how South Africa compares to other countries. This section discusses the language of instruction in Zimbabwe; Tanzania and Kenya.

2.5.1 Zimbabwe

Elements of colonialism are still evident in most African countries as they continue to use their former colonial masters’ languages as their official languages even in schools. According to Thondhlana (2002, p. 32), Zimbabwe is a Southern African country with a population of about 13 million people, and it is said to be a multilingual/multicultural nation because it is broadly made up of African and European population groups. Zimbabwe is one of the countries in Africa that still use English as the main medium of instruction in schools regardless of the two dominant native languages Shona and Ndebele. Thondhlana (2002, pp. 32–33) further concludes that Zimbabwe is no different from other African countries as it tends to officialise their former colonial master’s language by making it the language of parliament, trade and industry, the mass media and
education. This is done at the expense of Shona and Ndebele, which are only used as the medium of instruction in lower primary education.

In Zimbabwe, there are other minority ethnic groups whose languages are not used at all in school environments. The use of English as the principal medium of instruction in Zimbabwean schools has brought about many disadvantages for learners whose native languages are not at all used in the schools. According to Muchenje et al. (2013, p. 500), Shona and Ndebele are the only native languages that are used within the education system, and this is done at the expense of other native languages such as Tonga, Kalanga, Venda, and Shangaan, to mention only a few. A possible reason for this phenomenon could be the fact that these excluded languages belong to minority groups. Muchenje et al. (2013, p. 501) conclude that the Zimbabwean language policy in education is still entrenched in the 1987 Education Act, which is characterised by elements of the colonial age. This policy stipulates that learners can only use their mother tongue up to the third grade of their schooling. It is quite clear that some children in Zimbabwe (those whose languages are not used at all in schools) are faced with the challenge of learning a second language from the first grade of their schooling years, which is very frustrating. As stated earlier on, mother-tongue education is essential for the attainment of literacy skills such as reading and writing. When children are burdened with the “second language dilemma” from an early age, they are being disadvantaged at an early stage of their schooling. According to Thondhlana (2002, p. 33), most Zimbabwean schools prefer to use English from the beginning of the schooling years to enhance the learners’ ability to use English, a language which is associated with power and economic prosperity. This is confusing and contradictory for the innocent children because they have to struggle to develop their own native languages while at the same time being burdened with the task of learning to achieve proficiency in the English language. In most cases, learners from rural areas are seriously disadvantaged as they are not even exposed to television, the radio and magazines that would familiarise them with the ‘Queen’s language’.

According to Thondhlana (2002, p. 33), Zimbabwean educators and parents seem to be deeply concerned about the poor level of English proficiency among the learners after the third grade. The reason for the lack of proficiency is that educators continue to use the mother tongue even though they are expected to teach in English from the fourth grade onwards. Zimbabwean education
authorities and other African countries that are still trapped in the plight of using their former colonial masters’ languages need to drift away and make use of the indigenous languages that would enable learners to perform to the best of their ability by being exposed to their native languages. A number of researchers such as Gacheche (2010), Landsberg (2005) and Tshotsho (2013) believe that African learners who are subjected to colonial languages do not perform up to the expected standard mainly because by the time they enter school their exposure to the school language at home has been minimal. Moreover, learning is said to take place effectively only when the required cognitive development has taken place through the use of the mother tongue (Thondhlana, 2002, p. 33)

2.5.2 Tanzania

Tanzania is a country in East Africa on the Indian Ocean. It shares a border with Uganda and Kenya to the North; to the west, with Burundi, Rwanda, and Congo; and to the south, with Mozambique, Zambia, and Malawi. Tanzania uses two official languages, which are Kiswahili (Swahili) and English. According to Yoneda (2010, p. 139), although Swahili is the most dominant native language in Tanzania, English was made the official medium of instruction in schools. Bwenge (2012, pp. 169–170) states that English was chosen as the language of high-level administration and higher education at the expense of Swahili, which is used as the language of low-level administration and lower education.

According to Marwa (2014, p. 1265) “... a persistent problem in grasping the language of instruction among teachers and students has led to a cyclical language deficiency and educational performance problem across the entire education system”. Research evidence has shown that, if both educators and learners cannot understand each other during teaching and learning in a classroom, effective learning becomes futile. By contrast, learners are said to participate and concentrate well in classes where teaching and learning take place using MTBI, a language understood by both educators and learners.
2.5.3 Kenya

According to the AQUASTAT Survey (2005, p. 1), Kenya is located on the East coast of the equatorial region and Kenya is bordered by Ethiopia and Sudan to the north, the Indian Ocean and Somalia to the east, the United Republic of Tanzania to the south, and Uganda and Lake Victoria to the west. Kenya is a former British colony and one of the African countries that use English as an official language within the education sphere. There are two official languages in Kenya; Swahili or Kiswahili and English. According to Nabea (2009, p. 122), almost a quarter of the Kenyan population effectively use English and it remains the privileged official language and medium of instruction in the education system at the expense of Kiswahili, which is the native language of most Kenyans. The official language policy in Kenya, according to Ogechi (2009, p. 144), dictates that MTBI should be used mainly in the rural areas up to the first three years of schooling while Kiswahili or English should be used in the urban areas. Compared to the other languages, English is given priority in Kenya and it has never been challenged by the authorities since independence from colonial rule. According to Khejeri (2014, p. 76), in Kenyan schools English is not only used as a medium of instruction and taught as a subject, but it is also the language of examinations. However, there are no measures in place to assist learners in improving their learning of the language.

The situation in Kenya is complicated as children are sometimes faced with the difficulties of learning more than two languages simultaneously. Children from marginalised linguistic backgrounds (those who cannot speak Swahili and English) suffer most because, when they enter school, everything is new to them. They are expected to learn Swahili first before they can make sense of their own languages. Ogechi (2009, p. 144) concludes that in Kenya, when learners commence their schooling, they do not all use the same language simply because they are from a variety of linguistic backgrounds. In such instances, learners from marginalised backgrounds are burdened with the task of learning Swahili or English before they can learn their native languages. This creates a mental conflict and it becomes a challenge for them to learn a second language before having achieved proficiency in their mother tongue first.

Kioko and Muthwii (2001) have raised the issue of contextual models of English language, arguing that the actual model(s) that speakers of English use in non-native contexts are not British or
American ones. This begs the question why we then bother our African children to be taught in English when doing so poses so many challenges for them? Kioko and Muthwii (2001, p. 205) sum up the situation in Kenyan as follows:

- There are very few native models of English available in the school system.
- The model of English that the majority of Kenyans are exposed to is that used in Kenya by Kenyans (most Kenyans are not meaningfully conversant with native English).
- The English used in the media, especially on radio and television, provides a mixed ‘English-speaking environment’.

It is vital that Africans realise the importance of MTBI in schools so that the learners can recognise their potential without suffering the perplexing experience of having to learn a language that still represents the excesses of colonial rule. Learners in South African schools are labelled “possible failures”, “learners at risk” and have other dehumanising labels applied to them simply because they cannot perform better when using English as a medium of communication. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 6), such practices usually discredit our African children as they fail to find meaning in what they are taught in their classrooms. It becomes a challenge for educators to cope with such learners at a high-school level or to keep such learners within the school system beyond primary level because they eventually drop out of school. MTBI means that the learning of new thoughts does not have to be postponed until learners become proficient in a second language.

Based on the analysis of the three African contexts, the researcher concludes that the use of English as the language of education is demoralising for the learner. It seems that English is considered to be the language of power, success, superiority and control, whereas mother-tongue instruction is associated with failure, gloom, inferiority and humiliation. Mbatha avers that many studies repeatedly show that the low status of African languages, resulting from Bantu Education, have caused African parents to negatively view the use of African languages in education today as ploy to falsely unleash an inferior education by the educated elite. In spite of the pedagogic gains of using the mother tongue in education, parents in South Africa are uncomfortable with this recommendation. (2010. p. 53)
It is vital for the above-mentioned African states to consider reviewing their language policies in education for the benefit of their citizens. Khejeri (2014, p. 84) has observed that most of the language policies in education in Africa tend to discriminate against learners from rural areas. These policies seem to ignore equity of standards and educational prospects for all children. This is evident even in South African urban township schools where learners in Grade 9 (equivalent to Form 2) cannot create a meaningful sentence in English but they are able to write a meaningful message in isiZulu. This is a sign that the learners are not dull but simply incompetent in using English. Brock-Utne, Desai, Qorro, and Pitman (2010, pp. 4–5) have observed the same trend in Tanzania, viz. that learners starting Form 1 are extremely incompetent in using English, which is the principal language of the curriculum, yet they excel in communicating in spoken and written Kiswahili.

In as much as mother tongue instruction could be the sole solution to the challenges faced by non-English speakers in an English dominated learning environment, the use of MTBI presents various challenges as well. The following section attempts to put these challenges into perspective.

2.6 LACK OF MOTHER-TONGUE INSTRUCTION RESOURCES

One common challenge in South African township and rural schools is the serious lack of resources such as learning materials (textbooks), adequately qualified educators, and proper classrooms. Research evidence indicates that there is a significant shortage of learning materials published in the native languages, as well as little or no formal training of educators in MTBE. According to Lartec et al. (2014, p. 10), the lack of learning resources in mother-tongue-based education (MTBE) refers to the shortage of teaching aids such as textbooks and dictionaries published in the mother tongue that would enable teaching and learning in mother tongue. Furthermore, the findings of a study conducted by Khejeri (2014, p. 82) indicate that Kenya suffered a serious setback with regard to the implementation of mother-tongue-based instruction due to the lack of teaching and learning materials such textbooks published or written in the local languages.. In South Africa, MTBI also faces challenges because of the shortage of learning materials, and inferior teacher training. South African township schools in particular suffer from overcrowded classes with learners from different linguistic backgrounds which again creates a challenge in implementing
mother-tongue-based instruction. According to Godfrey (2014, p. 11), the Tanzanian public education system lags far behind the rest of the world due to insufficient resources, poor infrastructure and lack of an adequately qualified labour force. These challenges are discussed next.

2.6.1 Learning materials

It is vital to note that in as much as MTBE can be implemented in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class, obstacles could still arise because some concepts (both historical and geographical) cannot be explained in isiZulu. This is mainly because there is little or no literature in isiZulu for explaining such concepts; therefore, it is the government’s responsibility to ensure that more literature of this nature is published. Mbatha states that

> the challenge posed by the lack of learning materials may be addressed through an intensive endeavour between the Department of Education and publishers. Home publishers have materials for teaching literacy in African languages but need to promote them dynamically (2010, pp. 66–67).

It makes teaching and learning difficult when there is little or no teaching and learning materials in schools, therefore this is a call to the Department of Education to promote the publication of learning and teaching material in all native languages. According to Lartec et al. (2014, p. 8), in cases where MTBI is implemented, it is necessary to maintain consistency across all the available official native languages. The learning and teaching textbooks must be organised according to the educational interests and needs of learners.

2.6.2 Educator Training

Lack of educator training in MTBI poses another threat to the full implementation of such a programme. Educators seem to shy away from studying their native languages at tertiary level and teaching those languages to the upcoming generations. Research evidence indicates that there are several reasons for the lack of educator training in this particular field. According to Lartec et al. (2014: p. 12), some educators feel it would be futile to teach in the mother tongue considering that in most African schools the classrooms consist of learners from different linguistic backgrounds. Some educators feel that this would bring back the long overdue ‘divide and rule’ system brought
about by the colonial powers whereby learners from a particular linguistic background would be housed separately from others.

The implementation of MTBI in schools would require the Department of Education to arrange meaningful workshops to provide the necessary training to educators in regard to the programme. The Department must also provide bursaries and scholarships that would enable educators to further their studies in this largely disregarded field. According to Dutcher (2004) (cited in Lartec et al., 2014, pp. 12–13), it is essential for educators to receive training in the development of the best methodology needed to facilitate teaching and learning in a language that learners are familiar with. This would reduce the high level of rote learning, repetition and copying in schools, which happens out of frustration. At the same time, this would encourage more peer-to-peer interaction amongst learners as they would be using the same language both on a social and an academic level (Dutcher, 2004).

An element contributing to the lack of educator training is the negative attitude of some educators towards native or African languages. Many educators feel that acquiring a skill through MTBE is not worth it; that it has to be English rather than their own languages. According to Khejeri (2014, p. 83), educators’ attitudes towards any particular language influence the learners’ attitudes towards that language. When educators demonstrate reluctance and negativity towards the use of a local language in education, parents and learners tend to shy away from and doubt any form of success associated with that particular language. Consequently, learners tend to follow the same trend of looking down upon their own native languages while they are struggling to achieve proficiency in English.
2.7 ALTERNATIVE MODELS TO MOTHER TONGUE INSTRUCTION

As educators do not practise mother-tongue teaching in South Africa, the following are popular models used by educators: code switching, bilingualism and multilingualism.

2.7.1 Code switching

Educators who happen to teach in bilingual or multilingual environments use code switching to ensure that their learners comprehend every part of the lesson. This is done by switching from one language to another and then explaining the same point to the audience. According to Ayeomoni (2006, p. 91), the concept of code-switching refers to the process of mixing words, phrases and sentences from two different languages or grammars within the same speech occurrence. A variety of scholars have argued that code switching can be a useful tool in assisting where a second language is used as a medium of instruction by switching to the native language(s) of the audience. However, a study conducted by Ahmad and Jusoff (2009, p. 52) in Malaysian context the belief that code switching should be used as a tool of ensuring that learners understand the educators’ input. The researchers’ findings indicate that educators should not use code switching to the exclusion of their native language (Malay) because this might completely distort the content considering that code switching is a strategy, not a teaching method.

Even though some educators ‘code switch’ in their classrooms, there is still a great need for the implementation of MTBI mainly because some learners struggle to grasp the meaning of the concepts taught. This once again highlights the need for literature written in isiZulu as stated above. According to Tshotsho (2013, p. 41), there is compelling evidence that the majority of African children have been denied the opportunity to be taught in their mother tongue. Educators always opt for different models such as code switching to ensure that their learners fully understand the content conveyed to them. According to Tshotsho (2013, p. 41), some schools in the Western Cape prefer to use foreign languages rather than offer any of the indigenous languages.

South African schools are made up of learners from different linguistic backgrounds, more especially in the townships. It becomes a great challenge when an educator code switches, using a language that is not familiar to some of the learners in the very same classroom. It is therefore advisable that code switching be used in a classroom where all the learners can understand the
educator’s language. The Malaysian study by Ahmad and Jusoff (2009, p. 51) showed that code switching benefits learners only when they are able to make sense of what the educator is saying. Code switching in Sesotho in a class of isiZulu-, isiXhosa- or even Tsonga-speaking learners becomes inappropriate and wasteful. It is for this reason that the researcher maintains that MTBI is better than code switching.

### 2.7.2 Bilingualism

Bilingualism refers to the ability to use two languages efficiently. It may be acquired early by children in regions where most adults speak two languages. According to Hakuta (1990, p. 1), an individual is considered to be bilingual when he or she is able to control two languages in a native-like manner and has a satisfactory command of written and spoken modes of communication.

Bilingualism assumes that learners can cope with both languages mainly because they have been exposed to them at a tender age. It is an advantage for one to become bilingual, as Byers-Heinlein, Fennel and Werker (2013, p. 199) observe. They also maintain that people who are bilingual will always do better than monolinguals in word-learning activities. This actually means that it is easier for bilinguals to acquire and learn two languages simultaneously thus leading to cognitive development compared to monolinguals. However, the researcher is convinced that MTBI offers more benefits than learning to become bilingual. This is congruent with all the arguments that have been advanced by various scholars that MTBI is essential for learning and teaching aimed at achieving positive outcomes. For instance, Butzkamm (2003), writing from a German point of view, suggests that the use of the mother-tongue has enabled Germans to learn to think and learn effectively, and to acquire an instinctive comprehension of grammar. It is therefore essential to teach children using their mother tongue as it contributes to proper second-language acquisition.

### 2.7.3 Multilingualism

A great many South African children are exposed to more than two languages, both at home and even in their school environments. When a community uses more than two languages, it is said to
be multilingual. According to Okal (2014, p. 223), the concept of multilingualism refers to a speaker’s ability to be in control of several (more than two) languages with equal and native-like proficiency. Multilingualism is in fact the opposite of monolingualism, which is the ability to use only one language. Multilingualism as a model used by educators has its own shortcomings such as mixing languages. Whenever an individual mixes and confuses languages, the whole meaning of whatever was said is distorted. Pai (2005, p. 1796) argues that

... though people are facilitated in their daily affairs this way, language thus acquired sometimes becomes a hindrance in school. Instruction in schools is imparted in the standard variety while language learnt in neighbourhood may be a dialect or it may not provide adequate exposure, resulting in speech habits not suitable for school purposes.

Learners who are learning more than one language often use the wrong word until they learn the right one, and from this point of view, learners are bound to make mistakes during their oral presentations in classrooms and during written assessments. Okal (2014, p. 223) observed that people’s proficiency in one language, both in written and verbal communication, tends to dominate the other languages acquired or learned. It is for this reason that the researcher maintains that, no matter how skilful learners might be in terms of using more than one language, the fact is, the mother tongue will always dominate and excel; therefore leaners need to be given more time in schools to use their different native languages rather than shifting the focus to multilingualism. According to Messele and Michael (2009, p. 4), multilingualism sometimes becomes a barrier because it is expensive for governments to promote the usage of all the languages spoken in a country. In most cases, multilingualism tends to be associated with tribalism as people of a certain language group would always want their language to be used more than the other languages.

It appears that none of the above models seems to be directly successful in facilitating inclusive teaching and learning. MTBE, as mentioned earlier on, expands the scope of education. Many rural children’s parents and relatives have no knowledge of English, which means that enforcing an English medium education can place them at a significant disadvantage. Researchers such as Tshotsho (2013) and Gacheche (2010) have shown that having a mother-tongue education enables the children to grasp the course content easily as they are used to the vocabulary, and in the process they protect and preserve the native languages. In support of all the above, Ball (2011, p. 6) claims that children who are denied the right to learn in their mother tongue should have full contact with their families and communities in the discussion of thought-provoking subjects in order for them
to retain their cultural identities. Such children should be given an opportunity to learn their mother tongue so that they can improve their reading and writing skills.

2.8 CONCLUSION

The majority of learners in South Africa experience teaching and learning through English, which is not their first language. Such a practice does not only put these learners at a disadvantage but it also leads to linguistic complications which contribute to learning breakdown. Second-language learners are in most instances exposed to low expectations, rejection, discrimination and a lack of educational peers. Educators also often experience difficulties in introducing appropriate support mechanisms for second-language learners, mainly because they are also challenged when it comes to English as a second language.

This chapter paid attention to the South African Language in Education Policy (Act 27 of 1996) and the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, (1996a) (Act 108 of 1996, Section 29). The South African Language in Education Policy was compared to the language policies of other African countries such as Zimbabwe, Tanzania and Kenya. The chapter also focused on both the advantages and shortcomings of MTBI. In addition, the chapter paid attention to the popular models used by teachers, which are code switching, bilingualism and multilingualism and their shortcomings. The next chapter explains the research design of the study. It elucidates the sampling method and the research approach the researcher followed during the data-gathering process.
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The previous chapter focused mainly on the literature review, which is an account of what has been published on a research topic by other scholars and researchers. This chapter aims to explain the research approach, design, methodology, as well as the procedures and data collection techniques and analyses used in the study. In addition, trustworthiness, as well as other pertinent ethical issues, is discussed in this chapter, which covers the stages associated with PAR, namely planning, observation, interviews, action and reflection.

3.2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.2.1 Research paradigm

The study discussed in this dissertation was premised on an interpretive epistemological and ontological approach to social reality. Epistemology has to do with knowledge and what validates knowledge claims, by contrast, ontology refers to reality, the real world around us (Gray, 2013, p. 19). This means that the study compared and contrasted existing knowledge to what happened in a classroom when Grade 9 learners were taught Social Sciences in isiZulu. Whereas epistemology attempts to explain the meaning of knowing in detail, epistemology assists people in deciding what kind of information is authentic and sufficient.

In the course of the study, the researcher attempted to engage in a dialogue with the participants, which was maintained through semi-structured and focus-group interviews and participant observations in order to critique practice. The participants met, identified practices that had the potential to facilitate inclusive learning in isiZulu, and then adopted them to test their usefulness in facilitating learning over a trial run of three months. During this time, a weekly reflective meeting was held to review the usefulness of the identified practices in facilitating inclusive learning and teaching, discuss appropriate learning and teaching methods which emanated from the study, and to reflect on the usefulness of the PAR process. The interpretative research paradigm had therefore led to the choice of a qualitative research approach.
3.2.2 Qualitative approach

The study was conducted qualitatively, using dialectic and interpretive methods. This means that, as a researcher conducts a study, there are a great many interactions with the participants and interpretations by means of the qualitative research approach adopted towards the participants. According to Dawson (2006, p. 14), qualitative researchers—because of their extensive contact with the participants through semi-structured or focus-group interviews and participant observations—tend to be interested in investigating the different attitudes of participants, their behaviour and experiences in a specific environment. Therefore, in the study reported on here, the researcher took careful note of the interactions of participants in order to generate an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon and to identify themes from which conclusions could be drawn. According to Hancock (1998, p. 2), qualitative studies seek to answer the following questions:

- Why do people behave the way they do?
- How are opinions and attitudes formed?
- How are people affected by the events that go on around them?
- How and why have cultures developed in the way they have?
- What are the differences between social groups? (Hancock, 1998, p. 2).

The specific research design used in the study aimed at exploring the manner in which educators conceptualise mother-tongue instruction within the context of inclusion, identifying the challenges educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers, and developing guidelines for using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning in Grade 9 Social Sciences classes.

A qualitative approach was used in the study because of the relatively small size of the research sample—that is, a Grade 9 Social Sciences class selected on the basis of isiZulu being the learners’ mother tongue. The nature of data collection maintained close contact between the community under scrutiny (participants) and the researcher. This enabled everyone involved in the study to communicate effectively and raise issues that needed thoughtful attention. Furthermore, the data were said to be extremely accurate, rich in useful information and widespread (see Moriarty, 2011, p. 2). The qualitative research approach therefore prompted the choice of PAR as a research design.
3.2.3 Research design: Participatory Action Research (PAR)

The basic research design that was chosen for this study is known as Participatory Action Research (PAR). According to Coats (2005, p. 4), PAR refers to a study or investigation of a practice conducted by those involved in a practice, with the intention of rejuvenating and refining that particular practice. This means that, when action research is used, the priority is to improve a particular practice among professionals. In the present study, a research group was constituted by educators teaching Social Sciences to a selected Grade 9 class with the aim of promoting inclusive learning and teaching. These educators worked hand in hand in an attempt to identify useful teaching and learning methods that they could use to improve their teaching pedagogies. According to Mackenzie, Tan, Hoverman, and Baldwin (2012, p. 12), action research becomes Participatory Action Research depending on who is involved in each of those stages, and to what extent. At its most participatory, researchers engage with participants as collaborators who can inform project design, propose methods, facilitate some of the project activities, and importantly review and evaluate the process as a whole.

In PAR, communication among the group members is crucial as they progress through all the stages. The group members are expected to discuss issues from the planning stage, where they would agree on the objectives of the proposed study, to the reflection stage (see Appendix P). In the study, the action research stages identified by Kemmis and McTaggart (1998) in Makoelle (2012a, p. 84–85) were adopted for the purpose of collecting data. The stages are: planning (during which the PAR objectives were determined), observation (current practice observed), action (new practices put into action), and reflection (reflecting on PAR processes). During these stages, a series of reflective meetings were held as part of data generation and the frequency of these meetings was determined by the degree of theoretical saturation reached.

Like any other methodology, PAR has its own shortcomings. According to Brydon-Miller, Greenwood & Maguire (2003, p. 25), “one of the weaknesses of action research is its localism and the difficulty we find in intervening in large-scale social change efforts”. This is true in the sense that, if a local institution finds a solution to a problem, that solution may not be valid elsewhere. This means that each institution must conduct its own research in order to improve a particular practice. With this methodology, there is no ‘one size fits all’. Another shortcoming associated with PAR is the fact there is a danger that existing relations among staff members could be
compromised. According to Dawson (2006, p. 17), some staff members will always shy away from participating merely because of their reluctance to improve their practice. Consequently, those dedicated few who would like to see themselves improving in their practice would always be viewed as a threat by the rest. Action research sometimes lacks objectivity, more especially if the findings contain critical information about the practice. In some instances, the practitioners do not include findings that would reveal any form of irregularity with regard to the practice in the report.

3.2.4 Qualitative data-collection instruments

This study employed the following three most common qualitative methods during PAR: participant observation, in-depth interviews, and focus groups. Each method is particularly suited to obtaining a specific type of data.

• Participant observation
Participant observation in qualitative research is about ‘observing’ the community that the researcher is investigating alongside the culture of that particular community. The researcher becomes part and parcel of that community by being an “insider” while at the same time remaining an “outsider”. According to Dawson (2006, p. 33), this form of inquiry is popular with anthropologists and sociologists who are keen to know how other people live in their specific areas. Researchers achieve this through mingling with members of a particular community under scrutiny, and this might take months or even years merely because the researcher needs to develop mutual trust with that particular community (Dawson, 2006, p. 33). In the study reported on in these pages, the researcher managed to be an observer by virtue of being an educator in the same institution. He participated in the observation process for at least three months with the rest of the research team.

• Semi-structured interviews
Semi-structured interviews afford the researcher an opportunity to interact with the participants (individually) to obtain their full opinions on the subject being investigated. According to Dawson (2006, p. 29), semi-structured interviews assist the researcher obtaining information from different participants at different intervals only to determine the similarities and differences of all the information proffered. According to Dawson (2006, p. 30), semi-structured interviews centre on topics and themes to be covered during the interview, and the researcher follows a guide which
consists of a list of questions to be covered during the interview (see Appendix K). In this study, the interview schedule was used with all the different participants to maintain continuity and congruency.

- **Document analysis (DA)**

The documents of an institution under scrutiny can provide a great deal of important information. According to Mogalakwe (2006, p. 222) a document is any written text with information, which could be produced by individuals or groups on a daily basis when executing their duties. Documents are written for a specific purpose and it becomes necessary for a researcher to understand the originality, the reason for publishing that particular document and those who are meant to interact with that particular document. Such documents could include policies, minutes, plans and diaries. In this study, learners’ records such as schedules (school reports) and activity exercise books (both informal and formal assessments) were perused to determine the extent of learning (see Appendix M and N).

- **Focus groups**

Focus-group interviews were conducted with learners from the selected class to determine their perspective on practices adopted to facilitate inclusive learning (see Appendix L). The concept *focus-group interviews*, according to Dawson (2006, p. 30), refers to a small group of people gathered to discuss a certain issue. During this kind of interview, there is always a mediator who ensures that there is order and everyone gets a chance to answer the questions. According to Myers and Barnes (2005, p. 24), focus groups, as the name suggests, habitually focus on a specific topic, activity or service. In most instances, all participants share something in common. One unique feature about focus groups is that information is shared among the groups and members.

- **Research journal**

One outstanding method of gathering data in qualitative research is to use a research journal or a research diary, which could be a blank notebook in which the researcher can make notes, or it may be a specially designed booklet. Commenting on the positive aspect of using a research journal or diary, Woll (2013, p. 2) points out that

> a diary may furnish the researcher with an improved way of collecting important data. A diary often provides more information than an interview or an observation. A possible reason for this relates to one
of the major strengths of the diary, which is that it is often much easier to write about certain things than it is to speak about them.

In the study reported on in these pages, the researcher used a research journal to record all the events from the first to the last day of the study. One of the greatest advantages of the research journal in this study was that the researcher could record all the incidents exactly as they took place, without compromise.

3.3 Sampling and selection of participants

In this study, purposeful sampling was used to select the school. According to Palinkas et al. (2013, p. 3), this means that a researcher selects an institution under scrutiny with a purpose. In the study, the institution was selected because most of the learners were natively Zulu and spoke isiZulu; consequently, the researcher was keen to learn more about the learners’ academic performance in this school when they were taught through the medium of isiZulu in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class.

Purposeful sampling was also used in the selection of educators as there were educators who taught Social Sciences to a Grade 9 class. Three educators were selected because they had been in the Social Sciences department for more than twenty years. Educator 1 was head of the Social Sciences department with at least 25 years of experience teaching Geography. Educator 2 was a post-level 1 educator who had taught History as a learning area for at least 24 years at the same institution. Educator 3 was a post-level 1 educator who had specialised in Geography and had been teaching at the school for at least 25 years. At the time of the study, the researcher had taught English (FAL), History and Social Sciences at the same institution for at least three years.

Purposeful sampling was used to select a class of Grade 9 Social Sciences learners. Data were collected from a Grade 9 Social Sciences class in which all the learners were isiZulu-speaking and had previously been taught through the medium of English. Grade 9 was selected because the researcher taught in this Grade and the data were easily accessible.
3.3.1 The research site

This study was conducted at a single institution, namely at Free At Last Comprehensive School (pseudonym). This previously disadvantaged township school is located in Vosloorus in the Ekurhuleni metropolitan (the former East Rand) area of the Gauteng Province of South Africa. At the time of the research, the school, which had been established in 1980, had 1206 learners, 34 educators, 4 administrators and 3 general workers. All the learners attending this school were Africans whose native languages, for example, were isiZulu, isiXhosa, and Sesotho. However, the medium of instruction in the school was English. The research was conducted at this institution for reasons of convenience as previously intimated.

3.4 DATA COLLECTION PROCESS

Research data collection followed a particular pattern. In this section the research procedure PAR and data-collection process are explained.

3.4.1 Research procedure

The research process adhered to the following systematic procedures. The researcher visited the Gauteng Department of Education in Johannesburg to request permission to conduct the study at the targeted institution. Next, a meeting was arranged with the Social Sciences department (the head of department and two educators) and the principal of the institution where the study was to be conducted. This meeting was aimed at discussing the objectives of the study and explaining the PAR process to the educators (see Appendix P).

This was followed by a meeting with 30 Grade 9 learners who were all native isiZulu-speakers previously taught through the medium of English. After the terms and conditions of the study had been explained to all the participants (educators and learners), they were presented with a letter of consent informing them about the ethics of research, with specific reference to the issues of confidentiality and voluntarily participation.

The next stage was the classroom observation process, which lasted for three months. During this period, the researcher and three other educators taught a number of lessons to the same Grade 9
Social Sciences class, using isiZulu as the medium of instruction, and observed each other’s lessons. These observation sessions, which took place three times a week and lasted for fifty-five minutes each after school hours, were followed by interviews with the three educators. These interviews were based on the researcher’s observations to gather evidence on how the observed practices could be developed to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching of Social Sciences in isiZulu.

The learners were split up into three groups of eight (at this point only 24 learners were part of the study) and formed focus groups who were then interviewed with the purpose of understanding their experiences of mother-tongue instruction in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class. The research group met to reflect on the PAR processes, discuss the data, and draw conclusions. The data, which had been collected through observations and interviews and included both the focus groups and educators, were then analysed inductively.

3.4.2 Data-collection process

The study was conducted using a PAR approach. The core members of the research team included three Social Sciences educators and 30 learners. This approach was chosen because the overarching purpose of the full study was to develop guidelines for the teaching of Social Sciences in a Grade 9 class in isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. The guidelines would also assist the teachers in evaluating the effectiveness of that process and rendering support to learners with difficulties in English as the medium of instruction. The members of the research team were engaged in different, yet complementary roles.

Firstly, the research team met to discuss how the study was to be conducted, a process known as the planning phase. During this phase, the research group determined the objectives for PAR. Secondly, the participants observed each other during the presentations of Social Sciences lessons, which was phase 2 of the study. A pre-planned observation schedule had been drawn up by the research group to evaluate current practices used in facilitating learning. According to Kawulich (2005, p. 2), participant observation is of great importance in qualitative research as it affords the learner the opportunity to learn about the activities of the community under scrutiny in a natural setting. The researcher observes and participates in those activities simultaneously. In this study,
the researcher observed and participated in all the teaching sessions that were aimed at identifying effective teaching methods that would enhance inclusivity.

Secondly, the researcher conducted semi-structured interviews with the three participating educators based on his classroom observations to determine how the observed practices could be developed to facilitate inclusive learning in isiZulu. Semi-structured interviews in qualitative research are helpful by giving the interviewer and interviewee an opportunity to deliberate on some topics effectively, without any reservation. It is not forbidden for the interviewer to give the interviewee a hint in a case where the question is not clear.

Thirdly, the research group used the evidence extracted from the observations and interview data to identify practices that had the potential to facilitate inclusive learning in isiZulu. These practices were then adopted to facilitate inclusive learning over a three-month period during which time reflective meetings were held once every week to review their usefulness in facilitating inclusive learning and teaching. This was the third phase, which entailed action.

Focus-group interviews were conducted with learners from the selected class to determine their perspective on the practices that had been adopted to facilitate learning. Focus-group interviews are useful for obtaining different views from the group on the same topic under discussion.

Fourthly, the research group reflected on the PAR process and interpreted the data during this last phase known as reflection.

In conclusion, it should be mentioned that the data-collection process is cyclical and, in order to obtain adequate and appropriate data, it is important to consider the specific data collecting tools needed for a particular study. Figure 3.1 below illustrates the cyclical data-collection process during PAR.
Figure 3.1: The adaptive cycle in Participatory Action Research (Mackenzie, Tan, Hoverman, and Baldwin, 2012, p. 17)

3.5 DATA ANALYSIS

According to Dawson (2006, p. 117), the analysis of data by theme is called thematic analysis, which is said to be highly inductive in the sense that the themes arise from the data and are not imposed upon the data by the researcher. In the study, for the purposes of carrying out a thematic analysis of the journals, documents such as observation notes, a research journal and the interview transcripts were all exploited to strengthen the authenticity of the study—even background reading formed part of the analysis process, to explain an emerging theme.
3.6 TRUSTWORTHINESS OF THE RESEARCH

In the study, maintaining trustworthiness was of paramount importance as data were consciously collected and carefully analysed. Trustworthiness in a qualitative study is said to be the relationship between the data that was collected by the researcher and the actual incidents that took place in the community under scrutiny. In short, this refers to the estimated actuality of an interpretation or conclusion (Loh, 2013). According to this school of thought, the researcher should use the existing literature and the participants to prove beyond reasonable doubt that the content of the findings are indeed correct. In the study, the trustworthiness of the findings was assessed by using a range of techniques such as comparison with findings from previous research, triangulation within a project, and feedback from participants in the research.

3.6.1 Role of the researcher

The researcher played the role of an insider because he was an educator at the same institution as the other participants. As an insider, the researcher benefited considerably because data gathering was not restricted to the classroom but encompassed the entire institution. According to Unluer (2012, p. 1), being an insider is associated with numerous advantages but it runs the risk of increased subjectivity in the findings. The researcher explored the use of isiZulu in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning in the secondary school where he had been employed as an educator for three years at the time of the research. Since the research setting was his working area, he collected the data as an insider participant observer, which meant that he was a researcher as well as a member of the group at the same time. According to Unluer (2012, pp. 2–3), it is advantageous to be an insider because of his or her familiarity with the people around the institution and the rules and regulations to be observed and respected. The researcher’s membership of the Social Sciences department made it easier for him to be fully accepted and given permission to conduct the study.

The study observed the principle of justice in research. The Canterbury Christ Church University (2006, p. 4) states that “justice connotes fairness and equity for all participants in research”. In his role as project head, the researcher ensured that all the participants were treated with respect and
viewed as equals by the researcher in the process of data collection. According to Resnik (2013, p. 4), it is important to respect your colleagues and treat them fairly as well. The researcher did not reveal any data or information to anyone during the various stages of data collection, except to his university supervisor who had access to the captured data in the research journal, the transcribed interviews, and the documents that were analysed for the study (see Appendices M and N). All the ethical principles relevant to the research were strictly observed.

3.7 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

In any research study, ethics plays a crucial role in determining an effective and eloquent study. This includes the protection of the participants’ confidentiality and anonymity. The researcher needs to be open and honest with the participant and explain all the logistics around the entire study. Resnik (2013, p. 2) urges the researcher to bear in mind that “many ethical norms in research, such as guidelines for authorship, copyright and patenting policies, data sharing policies, and confidentiality rules in peer review, are designed to protect intellectual property interests while encouraging collaboration”.

In this present study, the researcher met with all the participants (both educators and learners) in a bid to explain the conditions of their participation, for instance confidentiality, anonymity and voluntarily participation. Educators who participated in the study signed a form of consent (see Appendix G) which stated the conditions of their participation, which included voluntary participation and withdrawal from the study at any time without any penalty. Educators also signed a group agreement to maintain confidentiality and anonymity (see Appendix I). As the 30 learners were all minors, the researcher asked for permission from the learners’ parents who were also given a form of consent to sign on behalf of their children (see Appendix H) informing them about the voluntary participation of their children. According to Resnik, where research is carried out on human subjects, the researcher should “minimize harms and risks and maximize benefits; respect human dignity, privacy, and autonomy; take special precautions with vulnerable populations; and strive to distribute the benefits and burdens of research fairly”. (2013, p. 4).
All the details of the study were sufficiently explained to all the participants as was the researcher’s position as a student researcher at the University of Johannesburg (UJ). Before the commencement of the study, the researcher was granted authority to conduct the study by the Gauteng Department of Education (GDE) (see Appendix A). Furthermore, the researcher had obtained written permission from the principal of the institution where the study was conducted (see Appendix F).

3.8 CONCLUSION

This chapter commenced with a discussion of the research methodology of the study, with specific reference to the research paradigm, qualitative approach, overall research design (PAR), and qualitative data-collection instruments. The chapter furthermore discussed the sampling method, the procedures governing the purposive selection of participants, the research site, and the data-collection process. The chapter paid special attention to data analysis, focused on the trustworthiness of the research, and the role of the researcher. In conclusion, the chapter elucidated the ethical considerations that safeguarded the confidentiality and anonymity of the participants.

The next chapter focuses on the data analysis and the formulation of themes. It seeks to triangulate the collected data with the existing literature as discussed in Chapter 2.
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS OF THE EMPIRICAL-DATA ANALYSIS

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a summary of how the data embedded in the interview transcripts were collated and analysed, what conclusions could be drawn from the analysis, and how the data were interpreted. Extracts from the interview transcripts were used to support the conclusions and interpretations. In this chapter, the different sets of data are discussed in relation to the themes identified and how the data were triangulated—that is, the data from the semi-structured interviews with teachers, focus-group interviews with learners, participant observation, document analysis (hereafter DA) and research journal. The chapter is structured thematically according to research questions posed.

4.2 Themes derived from answers to Question 1: How do educators conceptualize the use of mother-tongue-based instruction [MTBI] within a context of inclusion?

4.2.1 Inaccessible curricula

Research journal data analysis (hereafter RJDA) and PODA indicated that the curriculum design did not suit the needs of many learners, more especially those in township schools. Learners have a right to study in their first language if they encounter difficulties with the second language, which in most cases is English. DA further revealed that the learners performed better when taught in their mother tongue instead of English. In support of the fact that the use of mother tongue is believed to create accessible curricula for learners, this is what one of the educators involved in the study had to say:

*Educator 3: ... like I’ve said once you include isiZulu you are hammering on the language that they understand better and then which means the terms themselves ... they become better to them and then like I’ve said if they understand the term in isiZulu it is easier to build on the term that they know and you just add on the bits that they have and to me it worked in the sense it was easier to even go further to other aspects using the mother tongue unlike where you have to use English where you have to start by spending the times on things that they don’t understand but with isiZulu...*
because that’s their home language they can relate to some of the things that you are saying once you say them in isiZulu

Learners felt that using MTBI helped them to express themselves freely in class without being pressurised. It also improved their participation, concentration and attention span in class. This is what one of the learners said during one of the focus-group interviews:

Learner 15: it was great to participate in the isiZulu class than in the class of English because in the class of isiZulu I was free enjoying but when is come to English I get bored wanting to sleep because that thing they told me is not entered and I didn’t understand it better.

4.2.2 Meaningful learning

According to the RJDA and DA, learners who had been taught through the medium of a foreign language were continually struggling to decode words; their sound recognition ability (phonemic awareness and analysis) was poor; they battled to differentiate between similar sounds (auditory discrimination); they had difficulty associating the sound of letters with their written format (audio-visual association); they had to make an effort to remember sight words when reading and spelling; it was difficult for them to spell; their word-arrangement ability when reading and writing was poor; and they had difficulty ordering their opinions and giving comprehensible answers while speaking and discussing.

This is what another educator had to say during a semi-structured interviews in connection with the use of MTBI in promoting meaningful learning:

Educator 1: ehhh ... it is important to use mother tongue instruction because one ... the learner understands better when you give him or her new information excelling information or scientific information ... now you are putting information on a well based ... ehhh ... ground ... so the learner will understand and another thing it’s difficult for the learner to even think ... ehhh for argument sake ... think of examples that he can confer to the teacher when using another language ... for argument sake Meneer ... .can you invent using a mother tongue ... ehhh ... .using a foreign language ... invent a car ... .invent anything using a foreign language?
In support of the educator’s conceptualisation of MTBI within a context of inclusion and meaningful learning, this is what a learner from one of the focus groups had to say:

**Learner 2:** Sir it benefitted me because sometimes I wouldn’t understand some lessons in English then when I get into the isiZulu ... in the isiZulu class I would understand them better ... like weathering I didn’t know what weathering was all about then in the isiZulu class you explained clearly to me and I now ... and I understood

PODA showed that learning was enhanced in the class as learners were eventually able to explain and understand most of the scientific concepts; therefore their participation rate had improved dramatically. During the isiZulu class, the learners engaged in class discussions, something that they hardly [ever] did in the English-oriented class.

DA showed a significant improvement in scholastic performance in Social Sciences. For instance, learners who had previously obtained lower levels (level 1 and 2) managed to improve up to level 5 (see Appendix M).

### 4.2.3 Improved pedagogy

PODA AND RJDA showed that educators tried different teaching methods which were all aimed at enhancing inclusive learning and teaching, and simultaneously improving the educators’ teaching methods. On completion of the study, educators realized how significantly the use of MTBI had assisted them in finding the appropriate pedagogy for every lesson to be presented. The following statements show what educators thought about the use of MTBI in facilitating inclusive teaching and learning:

**Educator 1:** my understanding of mother tongue instruction...mother tongue instruction according to my understanding is the cornerstone of communication, learning and understanding of concepts or different things that the one or learner has to acquire...that’s what I understand...mother concept...mother tongue concept

**Educator 2:** Ehh ... I think it was ... I was more impressed with the group ... ehh ... working or teaching let me say bec ... for the reason that kids were engaging each other they were arguing until they came to a common understanding.
**Educator 3:** My understanding of teaching and... inclusive teaching and learning ehh...its teaching and learning in totality whereby we cater for the learners who are emotionally and also physically challenged... and by totality I mean that one should take into consideration that in a class there would be learners who are slow learners, they are learners who cannot probably inclined into class

The focus-group analyses showed that learners thought their teachers were enhancing their learning, which clearly indicates that the pedagogy was inclusive and responded to the learners’ needs. This is what one of the learners said:

**Learner 12:** Ehmm ... when taught by different teachers ... ehmm ... it was great because when we were learning a certain section ... ehmm ... then another teacher comes and teach us again ... if that teacher doesn’t fully understand it in isiZulu he or she would call another teacher to help it was really fun

### 4.2.4 Cultural identity

PODA and RJDA supported the contention that an integrated approach to learning language and culture simultaneously is essential for building the strong partnerships that undergird language development. A language community’s needs and aspirations are best understood and assisted when communication takes place in the local language and cultural context. During the study, the learners revealed their isiZulu patriotism as they engaged in discussions and explanations in their mother tongue.

This is what another educator had to say in support of cultural identity when using MTBI:

**Educator 3:** I think that could be integrated in the very lesson that you are dealing with them and culture will come in ... in the sense that once you use your mother tongue you are including culture and traditions at the same time and that will not especially in social science will be part of history ... are you aware talking about history you are teaching them that they should know their heritage which is culture at the same time ... so mother tongue you are also able to display that to them all ... dissimilate the very same information to them in a way that they understand better with their native language
The learners felt that it was improper for them to use English, especially when they were with their parents. Their parents (more especially the illiterate ones) felt that by speaking English they were betraying their cultural identity. This is what some of the learners had to say:

**Learner 15:** Ehhh ... using ... speaking English when I’m at home I think is not a good thing because adult person they will think that you disrespect them ... you let your culture ... language of the home then you go speak English they will think that you make yourself better you want to know something.

4.2.5 Academic excellence

The research findings (based on DA and RJDA) indicate that MTBI helped the learners to perform much better and improve their marks at school. Before the group of learners started studying Social Sciences by means of MTBI (isiZulu), the majority of them had had lower marks, which drastically changed shortly after they started receiving instruction in their mother tongue (see Appendix M and N).

This is what learners had to say about the improvement in their marks after being part of the study:

**Learner 5:** Ehhmm ... yah ... ehhhm ... I did experience... it was a good experience for me because I was developed ... we were understanding better than in the English class and our marks were improving ... .I never thought that I would improve in social sciences because our social sciences teacher was teaching us ... he was very strict in social sciences in the English class but in Zulu we were understanding him much

**Learner 9:** it was good Sir because our marks were increasing when using our mother tongue if you go somewhere maybe at Natal we talk our mother language because we have learned a lot in isiZulu

**Learner 24:** Ah ... Sir, what I can say is that I think our marks will go higher because in ... in term one we didn’t knew anything only we knew were the thing we done in grade eight ... in grade eight we did history maybe too much and geography was just a little bit but now what I can ... now my idea is if I wanna pass I only take those English words and try to translate into isiZulu so that I can get my marks higher
Participant observation data also indicated that educators alike felt that MTBI contributed significantly to academic excellence among the learners. This is what one of the educators had to say:

**Educator 2:** for learners to understand ... ehh ... more clearer ... and mother tongue instruction has been used you can see now that in South Africa English is being used or Afrikaans and those learners who are doing ... learning with their mother tongue they mostly pass and more than those that ... ehh ... doing it in second language so I believe that if learners can be given equal opportunities they will do well everybody in South Africa can pass and that can contribute in making South Africa a better place.

4.3 Themes derived from answers to research Question 2: Which challenges (if any) do educators experience in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers?

4.3.1 Classroom resources

The term ‘classroom resources’ refers to any teaching and learning aid that is used in a classroom to support learners in understanding the content taught by their educators. Learning resources are texts, videos, software, and other materials that teachers use to assist students to meet the expectations for learning as defined by provincial or local curricula. RJDA and PODA indicated that teaching Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers was a problem where resources were scarce. During this study, educators felt that a Social Sciences dictionary was essential in dealing with some of the terms or concepts. They felt that some of the scientific concepts (mostly from the Geography part) were difficult to comprehend even when taught in English. In general there was a serious shortage of textbooks across all the learning areas in this particular school. The analyses revealed that teaching without a textbook written in the language of instruction was one of the greatest challenges the teacher participants had ever faced.

Data analyses of both the focus-group and semi-structured interviews revealed that lack of classroom resources, such as a special Social Sciences dictionary (isiZulu version), created obstacles when the salient concepts had to be explained. This is what some of the participants had to say:
**Educator 1:** the disadvantage is that we don’t have a dictionary for the terms as such I think the problem lies with the terms like the ones I have mention weathering, erosion, you know quite a number.

**Learner 11:** I would create ehh ... Zulu dictionary and English dictionary so that the words would be easier so that it would be easier for the child who doesn’t know English.

### 4.3.2 Code switching

PODA and RJDA clearly indicated that code switching was a problem for learners from different linguistically oriented backgrounds with different native languages. During the study, educators would code switch in their own native languages, Sesotho for instance, even though some of the learners in the class were isiZulu or isiXhosa by birth. The moment an educator switched to Sesotho, a learning barrier was created for those who did not understand Sesotho.

This is what Educator 1 had to say with regard to code switching:

**Educator 1:** In most cases this is done when explaining or clarifying a concept or terminology ... sometimes you’ll find that it is difficult for learners to understand what you are saying in the foreign language so you need to code switch and talk ... and explain that in their mother tongue so that they comprehend and understand what you trying to say to them

The justification given by the educator raises the question whether all learners’ educational needs are met when an educator code-switches.

Data analysis of focus-group interviews revealed that, while educators use code switching as a remedy, it sometimes creates a learning barrier. This is what other learners had to say:

**Learner 21:** well Sir sometimes other teachers use Sesotho well we don’t understand Sesotho so I don’t expect them to teach us and learn in Sesotho I expect it to learn in English and isiZulu.

**Learner 5:** not all ... not all of us understand the teachers’ languages but they do mix all languages because sometimes ... they fell like expressing their selves in their own language
4.3.3 Poor quality of instruction

PODA and RJDA showed that educators experienced poor quality of instruction when teaching social sciences in English to non-English speakers. The quality of instruction is displayed by fundamentals such as effective questioning and use of assessment by educators. Specific practices, such as reviewing previous learning, providing model responses for learners, giving adequate time for practice to embed skills securely and progressively introducing new learning (scaffolding) are also elements of high-quality instruction. However, the research team concluded that they faced a great many challenges when they had to introduce and explain concepts in English to non-English speakers. Sometimes the learners would pretend to be learning yet they were not learning at all.

The research team took note of the fact that English was not only a second language to the learners but to the educators as well and sometimes educators were also faced with the difficulties of expressing themselves fluently in English. The most productive educators have a deep knowledge of the topics they teach, but when their knowledge drops below a certain level because of a lack of language proficiency, it is a significant impediment to learners’ progress in the subject.

Data analysis of both focus-group and semi-structured interviews revealed that, when educators used MTBI, there was quality instruction taking place compared with when learners were taught in English as an L2. This is what some of the participants had to say:

**Educator 2:** Ehh ... first of all on the part of teaching as I mentioned earlier kids become more actively involved than when you using English and they asking ... ehh ... questions on those things that they don’t understand and they free ... ehh ... communicate in as far as learning is concerned ... ehh ... you see the results from the assessment when assessing the kids even those who were below par when teaching them in English they have improved after being taught in their mother tongue ... so I think that helps to emphasize ... I mean to enhance learning more especially from the side of the kids.

**Learner 13:** the different teachers that taught in isiZulu I understand more than English because in isiZulu I understand more than English and in isiZulu I can ask questions and in English I cannot ask questions because I don’t understand English.
4.3.4 Lack of concentration and participation

PODA and interview data analysis (of both focus-group and semi-structured interviews) showed that teaching and learning that took place through the medium of a language that was not the learners’ first language resulted in poor concentration and participation in class. To keep learners involved and on their toes, the research team ensured that the activities were not teacher-centred but learner-centred. This was achieved through MTBI. The research team believed that classrooms where there were active learning and active listening, and in which learners were thoroughly and thoughtfully engaged with each other or the educator, signified concentration and participation. By contrast, the research team observed that in a classroom where there was communication breakdown because of language issues, learners tended to shun the activities in that particular class. Teaching Social Sciences in English to learners who are not native English-speakers not only places these learners at a disadvantage, but it also leads to linguistic difficulties which contribute to learning breakdown. Communication is essential for learning and development in both formal and informal contexts, and positive communication contributes to adequate and expected concentration and participation of learners in class.

Data analysis of both the focus-groups and semi-structured interviews revealed that when educators used MTBI there was a higher level of concentration and participation in the class compared with when learners were taught in English as an L2. This is what some of the participants had to say:

**Educator 1**: yah ... it was very fruitful because each and every child wanted to expose his or her knowledge of Zulu to the ... to the ... to the concept or to the teaching ... everyone wanted to participate so if everyone want to participate it means everyone understands what is happening ... so that was an ash tide now teaching ... ehhh to learning ... learners were happy enjoying themselves

**Learner 12**: on my own ... in my own opinion I feel that learning in isiZulu was much easier than learning in English ... ahhh ... and my participation when coming to isiZulu ... ahh ... it was great ... I feel kuthi (that) it was great because ahhmm ... it gave me more courage to attend afternoon classes but then when you said we were going to attend in isiZulu ... learning in isiZulu ... the language ... ahhhm ... I felt happy and I gain courage to attend afternoon class
Educator 3: I think that is brought by the language itself as I’ve said ... I will only concentrate and listen if you speak a language that I understand, if you speak a language that is only familiar to you I won’t concentrate.

4.3.5 Scientific concepts (Geography)

The research team concluded that it was challenging to teach Social Sciences in English to learners who were not native English speakers simply because of the difficulties attached to explaining the scientific concepts, especially in the Geography part.

PODA and RJDA revealed that the Social Sciences classroom (Geography) was often a frustrating place for both non-English language learners and educators. Science has a complex vocabulary that is difficult even for native English speakers to learn, therefore the difficulty posed by learning English should not be confused with an inability to think scientifically. Indeed, the research team managed to teach this part of the Social Sciences syllabus without great difficulty using MTBI (isiZulu).

Data analysis of both the focus-group and semi-structured interviews revealed that when educators used English to explain scientific concepts to learners, both educators and learners encountered communication problems. This is what some of the participants had to say:

Learner 21: Well Sir the other topic that I understood better in isiZulu it was about erosion, deposition ... yes but Sir in the English class when you taught us about erosion and deposition in English I did not understand ... yah

Learner 7: oh what I enjoyed about isiZulu SS ... the learners were not nervous during the isiZulu lesson than during the SS in English and they can interpret English concepts in isiZulu without being nervous or disturbed by something

Educator 3: like for example an arch, a stack and then you have ... ehh ... like you have stalagmite you have meandering you have weathering and erosion those are some of the terms that I can mention ... like I’ve said a stack and then you have which result as a process of erosion and meandering.
Learner 2: Sir it benefitted me because sometimes I wouldn’t understand some lessons in English then when I get into the isiZulu ... in the isiZulu class I would understand them better ... like weathering I didn’t know what weathering was all about then in the isiZulu class you explained clearly to me and I now ... and I understood.

4.4 Themes derived from answers to research Question 3: Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences?

4.4.1 Information Communication Technology (ICT) in Social Sciences

Learners who were part of the study were more motivated to learn and had increased self-confidence and self-esteem. The data analysis of focus-group interviews revealed that the learners found learning in a technology-enhanced setting more stimulating and learner-centred than in a traditional classroom. This is what some learners had to say:

Learner 7: Ohhh ... the usage of Tablets was good because learners ... they were so ... .they were so ... bebakhuthala sir ukuza ku class le isiZulu [translated as: learners were eager to attend the isiZulu orientated class] because they know that the usage of tablets will help understand even our researches

Learner 24: sir using tablets was fun because some of us it was our first time using them especially during researches we usually go to the libraries use the computer room and the thing that I’ve seen that in isiZulu we used tablets but in English class we didn’t use them ... .the teachers used to give us projects and tell us to go to the internet Cafe or go to the libraries

To enhance the learners’ understanding of the concept ‘apartheid’, the research team afforded the learners the opportunity to view the film entitled Sarafina, which depicts the Soweto students uprising of 16 June 1976. This was aimed at enhancing inclusive learning and teaching through ICT in Social sciences. This is what one of the educators had to say:

Educator 2: It helped me a lot for learners to one: experience visually the sufferings that black people incurred during ... ehh ... apartheid so ... they see ... they saw the sufferings and brutality of the state and then it became easier for me ... ehh ... ehh ... for them to understand the concept
apartheid ... what is apartheid or what was apartheid all about it was not only about blacks being paid lower wages but it involved all aspects of life so they saw it from the ... the movie so it was easy for me to ... for me to explain or yah to give them an explanation of the term or the concept apartheid because they know that it has ... it goes hand in glove with the suffering and brutality of the state.

4.4.2 Team teaching (PAR)

RJDA and PODA showed that the learners were excited to be taught the same content by different educators using isiZulu. Both educators and learners benefited from this setup: learners enjoyed listening to different explanations and examples given by different educators, while the educators learned different skills from one another about how to deliver the same content appropriately and adequately to the recipients.

DA indicated that teamwork improved the quality of teaching as several educators approached the same topic from different angles, in theory as well as in practice. Teacher strengths were combined and weaknesses were reduced. Poor teaching methods were observed, critiqued, and improved by the other team members in a non-threatening, supportive context. The evaluation done by this team of teachers was more insightful and balanced than the introspection and self-evaluation of an individual teacher.

PODA revealed that working in teams spreads responsibility, encourages creativity, deepens friendships, and builds community among teachers. Teachers complement one another. They share insights, propose new approaches, and challenge assumptions. They learn new perspectives and insights, techniques and values from watching one another.

Focus-group interview analysis showed that team teaching helped the educators to enhance inclusive learning and teaching during this study. This is what some learners had to say:

Learner 17: Sir I want to say that I experienced more that ... I like more to be taught by many educators because they explain that thing very well than the one educator because sometimes he doesn’t understand what to say ... what he’s explaining ... he doesn’t know what to say ... so it is nice to be taught by many educators
Learner 3: sir I would like to be taught by many teachers because sir when they are many teachers I understand more and they are doing ... ehhh ... different examples.

4.4.3 Co-operative learning

RJDA and PODA clearly showed that educators were able to use co-operative learning as a teaching strategy in facilitating inclusive learning and teaching. When the researcher observed the research team implementing this method, he realized that there was frequent use of relevant interpersonal and small-group skills and frequent and regular group processing of current functioning to improve the group’s future effectiveness.

On examining the attributes of co-operative learning, the research team concluded that this method had a positive effect on student learning as compared with individual or competitive situations. It had the potential to produce a level of engagement that other forms of learning could not reach. Learners could elucidate topics or present lessons better to another learner than an educator to a class. Learners acquired the skill to teach one another and explained material in their own words. Questions were more likely to be asked and answered in a group setting. Positive inter-dependency was achieved as individuals felt that they could not succeed unless everyone in their group succeeded. Interpersonal and collaboration skills could be learned in a co-operative learning activity. Co-operative learning has the potential to meet more learning style needs most of the time than individualized direct instruction. For co-operative learning to take place effectively, the research team had to explain the outcomes that learners were to achieve after the activity and provided clear directions about the academic tasks that each group undertook.

Data analysis of both focus-group and semi-structured interviews revealed that, when educators used co-operative learning as a teaching method, inclusive learning and teaching took place effectively. This is what some of the participants had to say:

Learner 4: I understood all the lessons that we have just done in isiZulu and we didn’t laugh at each other if there’s a problem we all talking ... we all all ... talking and telling each other that this thing is wrong this thing is right.
Educator 2: it was very good I like the part where they were prepared to listen to each other until they reached common conclusion and moreover everybody was participating they were arguing, debating until they came to a conclusion which is common and acceptable to everybody and that’s why I feel as learning.

4.4.4 Small group discussion

PODA revealed that using small group discussions is one of the effective teaching methods in facilitating inclusive teaching and learning. A typical view of a ‘small group’ is around 8–12 learners facilitated by an educator. Using small group discussions as a main teaching technique permits the educator to stimulate critical thinking. As instructors form connections with their learners, they can demonstrate that they appreciate the learners’ contributions at the same time that they challenge them to think more deeply and to articulate their ideas more clearly. Common questions, whether asked by the instructor or by the learners, provide a means of measuring learning and exploring in-depth the key concepts of the lesson. So, what characterizes a ‘small group’ is not so much its size, but the teaching and learning context and the way in which the educator works with and facilitates the learning process.

RJDA and small-group data analysis provides opportunities for learning that are difficult to establish in large group settings. Such opportunities are particularly useful to enable learners to take part in discussion, participate actively, provide feedback and reflection, consolidate learning, clarify understanding, and explore ideas and concepts. Depending on the purpose and nature of the group, small-group teaching can also help to develop ‘transferable’ skills, such as study skills, communication skills, team work, problem-solving and personal development.

Data analysis of both focus-group and semi-structured interviews revealed that, when the educators used small-group discussions as a teaching and learning method, inclusive learning and teaching took place effectively. This is what some of the participants had to say:

Educator 3: group work ... in a group work simply you group them you give them a particular task probably you highlight what you want them to do at a particular time ... assuming this particular instance you want them to explain various stages of a river trust me if you group them you choose
a leader over them it works ... if they have a problem they call you ... you just monitor each and every group as such ... to me it worked very well and also you are able to have a one on one situation whereby they don’t understand then they just raise their hands and you come over and to compound it everybody becomes involved in a group in the sense that they are talking their home language it becomes simpler.

Learner 21: well ... Sir I agree with all the learners who have said the answers and another thing we used to challenge each other on the isiZulu class but on the English class we didn’t challenge each other we were just quiet ... just listening to you ... we were quiet but in isiZulu we were challenging ... we were debating ... it was like a debate ... our answers were different but they were all correct.

4.4.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations

PODA revealed that when the educator spoke, the learners more or less had to pay attention, at least some of the time, but when their classmates presented, they all paid attention and they were eager to participate. The only solution to such a downslide is to involve the learners as evaluators of every presenter (peer evaluation). Not only does this make it more difficult for the presenter, it means that the students who are listening are not likely to have any sort of learning experience. The quality of the feedback learners provide is improved when they use certain criteria or the same rubric as the one used by the educators to assess the presentations.

The concept ‘student presentation’ refers to a short talk by one learner to a group of learners in a classroom introducing and describing a particular subject or topic. On the other hand, peer evaluations are one way to get learners listening and learning from the presentations of others. DA reflected that student presentation improved the quality of learning and teaching as learners learned how to speak in front a group, a broadly applicable professional skill. They learned how to prepare material for public presentation, and practice (especially with feedback) improved their speaking skills.

Data analysis of both focus-group and semi-structured interviews indicates that, when educators use student presentation and peer evaluations as a teaching and learning method, inclusive learning and teaching takes place effectively. This is what some of the participants had to say:
Educator 2: the atmosphere is very excellent and human relations were good in that learners were respecting each other’s point of view prepared to give each other a chance to explain in her view or his view until finished so to me the atmosphere and human relations was very good they were also in the process learning from each other without the hundred per cent involvement of the teacher alone.

Learner 16: Sir in the isiZulu class we were ... we were understanding better ... we were able to argue to each other if someone is wrong we correct each other but in English we can’t correct because we don’t understand some words.

4.4.6 Brainstorming

According to the RJDA and PODA, brainstorming proved to be another teaching strategy that encompasses both inclusive teaching and learning in the sense that learners were seen trying to open up possibilities and discarded wrong assumptions about the limits of the problem. Judgments and analysis of ideas were explored after the brainstorming process while the focus was on the generation of ideas. Brainstorming contributed to the generation of creative solutions to a problem. It taught learners to break away from old patterns of reasoning to new unexplored paths of thinking. Problem-solving had become part and parcel of the teaching and learning process. The research team found brainstorming to be a fun teaching method as it strengthened both learners’ and educators’ relationships as they solved problems in a positive, stress-free environment.

During the brainstorming sessions, learners were asked to outline ideas and thoughts that at first seemed to be a bit irrelevant. The intention was to use some of these thoughts to form original, creative solutions to problems. Even some seemingly useless ideas can still spark more concepts. The goal of brainstorming is to direct people to new ways of thinking and break away from the usual way of reasoning.

Semi-structured interviews revealed that, when educators use brainstorming as a teaching and learning method, inclusive learning and teaching takes place effectively. This is what one of the participants had to say:
**Educator 3:** like I’ve said when you start in a class ... the rules and then they must respect and they listen to each other they respected each other and then that is why one could listen to the other but there was also engagement whereby there was bit of confrontation which was not I would say not that would make the situation ehh ... unconducive but the interesting one whereby they are engaging in a sense of coming to a solution to the problem ... in fact they were solution driven in a class it’s like you know to say whatever they wanted to say on their mother tongue.

### 4.4.7 Direct teaching

PODA revealed that the research team used the direct teaching method, which is a teaching method that makes extensive use of academic learning time (time on task). The method involved teacher-structured lessons following a clear, sequential approach, with the educator in control of the content, activities, and lesson pacing. This method was useful in teaching new skills and concepts using deductive reasoning. It is academically focused, with the educator stating the goals for the lesson. The research team monitored the learners’ understanding and provided feedback. The research team concluded that direct teaching was good for the following objectives: clearly articulated goals, teacher-directed instruction, careful monitoring of learner outcomes and the use of clear classroom organization and management strategies.

The analysis of the semi-structured interview data indicated that, when educators use brainstorming as a teaching and learning method, inclusive learning and teaching takes place effectively. This is what a participant had to say:

**Educator 3:** to be honest with you firstly you have to make sure that the environment is conducive ... and how do you do that ... I mean you lay the rules before you get to class and then the language also made it simpler they understand you better if you say I don’t want this or whatever that ... like I’ve said home language makes things easier in the sense that they are able to ask questions even if they don’t understand a particular thing in a particular class and communication runs smoothly as such.
4.4.8 Seating arrangement

RJDA and PODA indicated that the seating arrangement used during the study was effective in achieving inclusive teaching and learning. Considering that many classrooms were overcrowded, the research team worked with a manageable group of 30 learners and used a desk configuration that created broad walkways running from the front to the back of the classroom, as well as from side to side. The research team opted for a U-shaped desk configuration which supported frequent whole-group conversations as learners were all able to see one another and the educators at the same time. None of the learners managed to hide at the back of the class to avoid participation, so even the most introverted learners were drawn in. The research team managed to move around the classroom quickly and frequently and this physical seating arrangement proved to be most effective. As an educator moves about the room, he or she can check the learners' work. There is much less time for fooling around and much more time for the tasks at hand by being among the learners and moving around the room.

4.5 Conclusion

This chapter reported on the data analysis and provided insight into the data-analysis measures based on the discussions of the focus-group interviews (learners) and semi-structured interviews (educators) that the researcher worked with. The chapter also focused on the following formulated themes based on the data collected during the study: inaccessible curricula, meaningful learning, improved pedagogy, cultural identity, academic excellence, classroom resources, code switching, ICT in Social Sciences, team teaching (PAR), cooperative learning, small-group discussions, student presentation and peer evaluation, brainstorming and seating arrangements. The chapter sought to validate the themes with direct quotations from the semi-structured and the focus-group interview transcripts, observations, RJDA, and the literature reviewed in Chapter 2. The following chapter presents the summary, recommendations and conclusion of the study.
CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This concluding chapter restates the research question and the objectives of the study. The findings of the study are presented according to the research question and the sub-questions. The researcher has compared the themes in Chapter 4 against the background of the literature review in Chapter 2 to arrive at a number of conclusions to determine the contribution the study has made to the existing body of knowledge in this field. Based on the findings, recommendations for both teaching and learning and to policy are made. The chapter concludes by listing the limitations of the study and areas for further research.

5.2 RESTATING THE RESEARCH AIM OF THE STUDY

The main problem here was to explore whether MTBI could be used effectively to improve inclusive learning to a Grade 9 Social Sciences class. Therefore the following research question were stated

5.2.1 Research questions

In Chapter 1, the research question of the study was stated as follows: How can isiZulu be used in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching?

To answer the question, the researcher had to consider the following sub-questions:

- How do educators conceptualise the use of mother-tongue-based instruction (MTBI) within a context of inclusion?
- Which challenges (if any) do educators experience in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers?
• Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences?

5.2.2 Objectives of the study

The objectives of the study were as follows:

• To explore how educators conceptualise mother-tongue instruction within the context of inclusion.

• To explore the challenges educators experienced in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers.

• To develop guidelines or strategies for using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Science classes.

5.3 SUMMARY OF THE STUDY

Chapter 1 of the study emphasised the background, motivation and the rationale for the study. Additionally, the problem statement of the research, research questions and ethical considerations were explained.

Chapter 2 presented a review of the relevant literature. Reference was made to previous studies (mainly the language policies of apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa and, of course, other African countries). Existing models of MTBI to facilitate inclusive teaching and learning were investigated.

Chapter 3 discussed the research design and the methodological stance of this research. It also described the data collection methods and kinds of interview that the researcher used. The researcher furthermore explained why he chose a qualitative study.

Chapter 4 reported on the data analysis and explained the data-analysis measures as based on the discussions of the focus-group interviews (learners) and semi-structured interviews (educators) that the researcher worked with.
Chapter 5 gave an overview of some of the shortcomings and limitations experienced in this study and made some recommendations for overcoming the limitations. The chapter concluded with a discussion of some possible explanations and implications of the findings of this investigation and gave a summary of the results.

5.4 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

This part of the study discusses the findings of the entire study with regard to the themes used in the data analysis in Chapter 4. The discussion firstly restates the research question, and then discusses the themes. The literature review in Chapter 2 was cross-referenced with the themes to support the findings. Finally, the implications of the study are discussed with reference to the use of MTBI to facilitate an inclusive approach to the teaching of Social Studies to a group of Grade 9 learners.

5.4.1 How do educators conceptualize the use of MTBI within a context of inclusion? To answer this research question, the following themes which derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.4.1.1 Inaccessible curricula

In an attempt to resolve the problems created by the previous school curricula, the African National Congress (ANC) government introduced what came to be known as the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), with the following introduction timeline 2012: Grades 1–3 and 10; 2013: Grades 4–6 and 11; and 2014: Grades 7–9 and 12 (DoBE, 2011). None of the syllabi (including CAPS) introduced in South Africa has emphasised MTBE in schools from the first grade up to the last grade of schooling. Learners, more especially in township schools, are still subjected to the dilemma of being taught in a foreign language (English) regardless of their poor academic performance. (Tshotsho, 2013, p. 41). The use of MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class has created an opportunity to address the serious problems experienced by the multitude of learners who have serious learning difficulties using English as a medium of learning. Education authorities need to acknowledge that developing accessible curricula for all learners is a fundamental equal opportunity and human rights issue, and it is an issue to be addressed. According to the Bill of
Rights of the country's Constitution, it is an obligation of the State to make education available and accessible to all.

As previously mentioned in Chapter 2, Thondhlana (2002, p. 33) believes that, in order for learners to do well, accessible curricula need to be developed, which should include the use of MTBI in schools. According to White Paper 6 (DoE, 2001) fundamental to the accommodation of diversity in our schools is a flexible curriculum and assessment policy that is accessible to all learners, irrespective of the nature of their learning needs. The study revealed that most of the learners experienced a great many challenges in expressing themselves during the English-orientated classes compared with the isiZulu classes. Learners were keen to learn when using their mother tongue (isiZulu) because MTBI made the curriculum flexible for everyone. It is, therefore, a prerequisite to consider MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to help learners realise their goals.

The study revealed that MTBI is fundamental to inclusion and, if learners cannot understand the language used in delivering the content, teaching and learning will not take place (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.1). The study revealed that educational systems that ‘force’ learners to learn using a language that is not native to them create a conflict in terms of accessing quality education. Such learners are often forced by such educational systems to drop out of school, which usually leads to societal marginalization and exclusion due to lack of academic skills.

Even if such learners managed to enrol in schools, they are often unable to follow classroom instruction and end up being pushed out of the education system. This in turn results in further marginalization and exclusion from society.

5.4.1.2 Meaningful learning

Meaningful learning presupposes that the knowledge learned is fully understood by the individual and that the individual knows how that specific fact relates to other facts stored in the brain. According to Gacheche (2010, p. 7), a majority of learners who are taught in a second language are in a true sense subjected to rote learning instead of meaningful learning. Learners need to be exposed to MTBE so that whatever they learn in schools can help them to make sense of it. As indicated in Chapter 2, Landsberg (2005, p. 151) argues that the use of MTBI contributes widely
to meaningful learning. When learners use their mother tongue, concepts become easier to understand as learners associate them with their environmental language. Meaningful learning is opposed to rote learning and refers to a way of learning where the new knowledge is related to the previous knowledge. Learners displayed a great deal of meaningful learning when they used their mother tongue (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class and, therefore, the researcher believes that introducing mother-tongue instruction would help learners to acquire a meaningful education.

The study revealed that, in order for school educators to provide a successful learning experience to the learners, they have to build on the known foundation of the language and experience of the child (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.2). Once a solid educational foundation is laid in the child’s first language, the child can expand his or her experience and learn more even through other languages spoken in the wider environment. The study revealed that basic education in one’s first language is excellent preparation for higher education in whatever language. The study showed that MTBI contributes significantly to a high rate of participation, concentration and attention among learners. The study revealed that learners were always willing to learn in their native language, as opposed to English, which made them feel that they were being constantly humiliated and rejected when they failed to pronounce, spell, read and write English correctly.

5.4.1.3 Improved pedagogy

The concept of pedagogy denotes the way and means in which educators deliver their content in their classrooms, taking into consideration the educational needs of the learners. According to Makoelle (2014, p. 1260) “inclusive pedagogy refers to the totality of teaching methods, approaches, forms and principles that enhance learner participation”. In the study reported on in these pages, the use of MTBI enabled educators to improve their teaching philosophies merely because it became easier to express themselves in a language that was sufficiently well understood by the learners.

Effective educators use a selection of teaching strategies because there is no single, universal approach that suits all situations. Makoelle (2014, p. 1262) asserts:

Teachers use different teaching approaches to interact with learners. The choice of a particular teaching approach or strategy is guided by the nature of the learning material, type of learners, and the ability of
the teacher to manage the process. Every teacher adopts a particular teaching approach to teach specific subject material to a designated group of learners. Promoting inclusion in the classroom may require the teacher to analyse which strategies best promote inclusion.

Just as some approaches are better suited than others to teaching certain skills and fields of knowledge, other approaches are better suited to certain student backgrounds, learning styles and abilities. MTBI does not only benefit learners in terms of their academic performance but also helps educators to improve their pedagogies because this is a language they understand better together with their learners. The researcher is therefore convinced that MTBI is one of the methods that can be used to improve educators’ pedagogies as it empowers them to express themselves in a language that they understand best.

The study revealed that educators helped each other to ensure that the content was appropriately and adequately delivered (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.3). So, it is important to introduce MTBI at the level of a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusion. The research findings clearly showed that MTBI proved to be an effective pedagogical practice as it promoted the well-being of students, educators and the school community; it improved students’ and educators' confidence and contributed to their sense of purpose for being at school; and it built community confidence in the quality of learning and teaching in the classroom.

5.4.1.4 Cultural identity

In this study, the use of MTBI helped the learners to observe and preserve their cultural identity, which was being ‘washed away’ on a daily basis by their being exposed to a second language. In a study conducted in the Western Cape province of South Africa, O’Connor & Geiger (2009, p. 260) observed that learners demonstrated a shift away from their cultural identity when taught in a foreign language (English), and that they eventually revealed a shift from isiXhosa by replacing some Xhosa words with English ones.

This study revealed that the use of MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class was crucial in helping the learners to develop a sense of cultural identity (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.4). As part of the individual's self-conception, cultural identity is the sense or feeling of belonging to a specific nationality, ethnicity, religion, social class, generation, locality and any kind of social group that
has its own distinct culture. In this way, cultural identity is both characteristic of the individual but also of the culturally identical group that has its members sharing the same cultural identity. The study showed that the use of MTBI promoted a sense of cultural identity among the learners as they later enjoyed and took pride in studying as isiZulu learners (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.4). Their pride was displayed in multiple ways such as in the strong isiZulu accent of traditional isiZulu speakers. As indicated in Chapter 2, Guvercin (2010, p. 3) points out that when learners are exposed to their mother tongue they develop a strong sense of cultural identity. This study again proved that language is one of the tools that help to transmit the culture and traditions of a certain group of people. As learners were exposed to their language, isiZulu, while learning Social Sciences, they felt culturally inspired.

5.4.1.5 Academic excellence

Academic excellence is defined as the maximum development of one’s individual capacity and skills and is reflected in qualities such as initiative, creativity, knowledge, skills, critical reflection, pride, passion, and integrity. Learners are enriched with a solution-oriented and a problem-solving approach. As stated in Chapter 2, Khejeri (2014, p. 81) revealed that the use of MTBI accelerates academic excellence in learners. This is indeed what happened when the Grade 9 Social Sciences class was taught in isiZulu as the learners displayed a high level of concentration, attention and participation in class and their academic achievement changed dramatically as was evident from their positive assessment records (see Chapter 4, section 4.2.5). This study revealed that MTBE contributed to the significant improvement in the learners’ marks from term two to term four after the study had been conducted (see Appendix M).
5.4.2 Which challenges (if any) do educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers? To answer this research question, the following themes which derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.4.2.1 Classroom resources

The study revealed that the main challenge faced by educators teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers was the lack of teaching materials (e.g. a Social Sciences dictionary) and teaching training resources. This challenge of lack of resources does not only lie with the English language but also with the isiZulu language. In Chapter 2, Mbatha (2010, pp. 66–67) is cited as indicating the crucial importance of addressing the lack of resources in schools, pointing out that the Department of Education needs to be part of the solution-finding process. Currently, because of the lack of training, only a small number of educators would qualify for delivering MTBI. Educators are also trapped in the plight of not being able to explain some of the concepts in both English and the native languages. In Chapter 2, Lartec et al. (2014: p. 12) pointed out that the lack of teacher-training, which goes hand in hand with unpreparedness of educators to teach their learners using MTBI is a great setback. Training and seminars are important for educators who teach multilingual learners because they need to be oriented and guided to handle learners from different language backgrounds. The study showed that several educators struggled to explain important concepts in isiZulu until eventually the learners would come up with relevant synonyms in isiZulu which would help the entire research team to understand those concepts (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.1). Lartec et al. (2014) are cited in Chapter 2 as pointing out that a lack of resources does not only hinder the expected teaching and learning standard but it also creates a deleterious environment for both learners and educators. Learners tend not to care about all the activities and educators, on the other hand, feel depressed when they find it difficult to deliver the content fully due to limited resources. It is from this viewpoint that the researcher maintains that the lack of resources poses a threat to educators teaching a Grade 9 Social Sciences class in English to non-English speakers.
5.4.2.2 Code switching

Educators take pains to ensure that all the information taught in a classroom is transmitted to the recipients as accurately and painlessly as possible. In the process, they employ teaching models such as code switching which, according to Ayeomoni (2006, p. 91), occurs when a speaker substitutes and mixes two languages in the same conversation to ensure sufficient understanding on the part of the audience. This present study revealed that in as much as code switching is used by educators in classrooms to convey the content easily to their recipients, it becomes a hindrance when they “code switch” among learners who are from different linguistically orientated backgrounds and who use different native languages.

As previously pointed out, code switching as a model has helped learners with low know-how of the language used as a medium of instruction to understand concepts much better in a classroom setup. However, most South African schools are multi-lingual, which means that learners are from different linguistic backgrounds. Consequently, whenever an educator ‘code switches’ some learners are excluded completely. There is always distortion of information leading to communication breakdown. This study revealed that when an educator “code switches” in his or her native language which is different from the learners’, such activity creates confusion for some of the learners and therefore hinders teaching and learning (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.2). Consequently it is important to use MTBI rather than code switching when teaching Social Science to learners who are non-English speakers and from different linguistic backgrounds. It is patently clear that MTBI cannot bring about any form of confusion in a class where all the learners are from the same linguistic background.

5.4.2.3 Poor quality of instruction

The study revealed that, when educators used English language as a medium of instruction to non-English speakers in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class, the quality of instruction was compromised. This resulted in a poor quality of instruction which, in turn, resulted in other learners being “excluded” from learning because of poor understanding of the content delivered. Creemers and Kyriakides (2006, p. 358) put more emphasis on the role of educators in making sure that learners
are adequately instructed in helping them to acquire problem-solving skills. The use of a foreign language as a medium of instruction in a classroom creates several learning barriers as educators themselves struggle to convey their content effectively to their audiences. This is no doubt that the usage of English language to non-English speakers leads to poor quality of instruction.

This study revealed that little or no progress is achieved by learners when taught in English compared to MTBI (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.3). English becomes a challenge not only to the learners but also to the educators who struggle to explain some, if not all, of the scientific concepts in English. This study revealed that MTBI (isiZulu-orientated class) was characterized by quality interactions between educators and learners, which was an indication of quality instruction and educator anticipations: the need to create a classroom that is constantly demanding more, but still recognizing students’ self-worth. MTBI, according to the study, involved ascribing learner success to effort rather than ability and valuing resilience to disappointment.

5.4.2.4 Lack of concentration and participation

In Chapter 2, Gacheche (2010, p. 6) reportedly stated that it becomes much easier for learners to participate in classrooms where the language used as medium of instruction is known to them. The study revealed that, when non-English-speaking Grade 9 Social Sciences learners were taught in English, there was poor concentration and participation among the learners compared with when they were taught in their mother tongue (isiZulu). The study revealed that learners became frustrated as they faced challenges in expressing themselves whenever a question was asked by the educators (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.4). Some learners slept in class because of boredom when taught in English unlike when they were taught in a language that they were familiar with (isiZulu). The study revealed that, when learners received MTBI, it became easier for the educators to begin a lesson with a short review of previous learning and that this made learners participate. Educators were able to present new material in small steps in the isiZulu class, with learner practice after each step, and the educators asked a large number of questions to check the responses of all learners which indicated excellent concentration and participation.

As indicated by Creemers and Kyriakides (2006, p. 358), lack of concentration and participation in most cases results from educators’ failure to offer learners problem-solving skills and worked
examples in the English-orientated classes; however, this was successfully achieved in the MTBI class. Learners were eager to learn and they participated enthusiastically (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.4). This study also showed that the lack of concentration and participation was due to the fact that educators could not provide proper scaffolds for difficult tasks in English, unlike in the isiZulu class. Educators were able to require and monitor independent practice from the learners in the isiZulu-instructed class, which motivated the learners to achieve sustained concentration and participation.

5.4.2.5 Scientific concepts (Geography)

There are quite a number of challenges associated with the teaching of scientific concepts in English to non-English speakers. This is mainly because most of the concepts are abstract and difficult to explain to learners who are not proficient in the language of instruction. According to Slotta and Chi (2006, p. 286), “before designing instruction for a specific science topic, educators must first determine whether students are required to undergo a change in their ontological commitments for that topic”.

This study revealed that the educators’ knowledge of the content (Social Sciences) they taught in English to non-English speakers did not help the learners gain any knowledge (see Chapter 4, section 4.3.5). It was patently obvious that educators could not help children learn things they themselves did not understand. The educators struggled to explain most of the scientific concepts in English to the learners compared with in the isiZulu class. With MTBI, it was easy for the educators to explain and conjure up examples related to the scientific concepts. The study showed that learners were able to understand scientific concepts because they were allowed to develop strategies and networks of ideas by being challenged to think, through explaining, listening and problem-solving using their mother tongue. The educators, on the other hand, ensured that all pupils were being challenged and stretched, not just those who were more capable but all of them inclusively. The educators also built upon learners’ own mental strategies for understanding scientific concepts and helped them to become more efficient.

It was the research team’s responsibility to intervene to assist the learners, using their mother tongue, to become more efficient in the use of scientific concepts in Social Sciences. The research
team used teaching approaches that encouraged discussion during the lessons, small groups, and learner presentations and evaluations to make sure that all the scientific concepts were well understood by the learners.

5.4.3 Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences? To answer this research question, the following themes derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.4.3.1 ICT in Social Sciences

Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in education has made a positive impact in terms of results. Learners who use ICT in schools have shown outstanding results compared with those who are not exposed to ICT. According to Kaur (2014, p 16):

ICT is a tool, a way for fact-based learning and allows students to do a lot of the research using the internet and various other tools and at the same time these students are learning very valuable research skills which they can be transplant at high levels of education, at classroom, play field, universities and beyond.

In the course of the study, learners were exposed to multiple ICT devices such as Tablets, a TV set and a DVD player (used for educational films). The study revealed that the use of ICT in a Grade 9 Social Sciences is one of the strategies that could be used to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.1). Makoelle and Van der Merwe (2014, p 521) maintain that the use of technological devices has diverse outcomes for diverse types of learners. Technology aids processes of learning such as collaborative learning, collaborative problem-solving and ensure the participation of learners in the learning process. During this study, learners were keen to learn when provided with technological devices in class. All the learners considered ICT tools very helpful for completing their assignments.

The study also revealed that the research team agreed that ICT enabled learners with English difficulties to achieve and grow academically as well. This is mainly because they were exposed to visuals that helped them to understand the lessons better. ICT also helped to reduce social disparities amongst the learners, as they worked in teams in order to achieve a given task or common goal. The study also showed that ICT has had a significant impact on educators and the
teaching processes (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.1). However, it must be noted that educators had to interpret most of the information obtained by learners from English to isiZulu. It was challenging but both learners and educators benefited from such an activity. It is therefore necessary to use ICT as a strategy in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching.

5.4.3.2 Team teaching (PAR)

The research team was engaged in Participatory Action Research which, according to Makoelle (2012a, p 84), is a kind of study where a group of professionals work hard towards improving their practice by engaging in investigations that would help improve that particular profession. The study showed that working as a team is very important in order to achieve excellent results in teaching and learning. The PAR research team worked hand in hand to make sure that learners achieved the expected lesson outcomes. The study revealed that there were learners who had difficulties with English but who were also receiving specialized instruction in their own mother tongue. Learners had the opportunity to be taught in an intense and individualized manner (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.2). Educators themselves learned from each other’s expertise and expanded the scope of their teaching capacity which contributed to learners obtaining higher marks. According to Van Niekerk and Van Niekerk (2009, p. 131) “participation encourages co-operation, negotiating skills, learning to debate, finding purpose, but most of all, decision-making”. In the study, educators were highly involved in co-operative activities; at times the research team members were engaged in positive debates about the effectiveness of some of the teaching and learning strategies that were adopted, and finally they would come to a stable decision.

5.4.3.3 Co-operative learning

Co-operative learning denotes a learning strategy whereby learners in a classroom are grouped in small groups and given a task that requires everyone’s participation in that particular group. This is a method that helps learners to develop intrapersonal, interpersonal and leadership skills as they relate to their peers. According to Laguador (2014, p. 46),
The term cooperative learning (CL) refers to students working in teams on an assignment or project under conditions in which certain criteria are satisfied, including that the team members be held individually accountable for the complete content of the assignment or project.

Co-operative learning promotes considerable face-to-face interaction among learners and therefore helps them to share their ideas and views on a particular topic. This study demonstrated that cooperative learning provides opportunities for higher order thinking as opposed to passive listening (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.3). This method of teaching reinforces listening to others and gives opportunity for immediate feedback and adjustment of thought. Garfield (2013, p. 3), in support of co-operative learning, avers that:

> It seemed that more learning took place as a result of group work because students had to verbalize their understanding, use statistical language, or explain and defend their solutions. My classes became known for my small group activities and projects, and I received three different teaching awards and was asked to become a mentor to junior faculty on teaching. Much of this mentoring involved helping faculty move away from lectures to try more small group activities. I seemed to have become one of the cooperative learning resource teachers at the university.

This means that learners interact directly with each other by means of verbal and/or non-verbal communication. They promote each other’s learning and become personally committed to each other to achieve the mutual outcomes. The study revealed that co-operative learning also promotes social interaction skills, greater acceptance of others, and a greater sense of “community” in the class, in part by addressing learning style differences (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.3).
Figure 5.1 below graphically illustrates the complex integrated structure of interactive learning.

5.4.3.4 Small group discussion

Dividing learners into small groups has proved to be an effective method in teaching and learning inclusively. According to Gunn (2007, p. 3) “small group work can also be used to refer to the method of Problem-based Learning, which is often undertaken in the form of small, student controlled, groups”. These smaller debates trigger prior information and engage students in thinking about the lesson. Then, during the whole class discussion, students are exposed to multiple perspectives that stretch their thinking. The role of the educator is to facilitate learning and teaching by asking relevant questions.

The study showed that, the moment learners come together as a group, they alleviate any form of discrimination and promote each other’s success (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.4). The more learners interacted with one another, the more they showed signs of cognitive and social developmental skills which created more academic activity increase compared with individual learning. The research team concluded that, several times during the teaching and learning sessions when learners
were engaged in group discussions, there was more inclusive learning taking place. Each one of the learners wanted to impress his or her particular group. The research team concluded that a great many skills, such as leadership and interpersonal skills, are developed when learners work in small groups. The research team played a vital role in helping learners to acquire these skills. The study indicated that this teaching method helped learners to know and trust each other: they communicated accurately and unambiguously; they accepted and supported each other; and they resolved conflicts constructively.

5.4.3.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations

According to White (2009, p. 3), any form of student presentation in a classroom is considered to be a public performance, a platform where learners are able to show off their skills or talents in front of their classmates. Furthermore, when students evaluate their peers, this becomes a form of performance-based assessment; it becomes a platform where learners perform a task and show specific skills and competencies. It must be noted that for this learning and teaching method to be effective, learners need to be fully involved and supervised at all times so that they are not left behind and end up giving unnecessary scores to other learners.

The study revealed that student presentations and peer evaluations encouraged learner involvement and responsibility. This teaching method encouraged learners to reflect on their role in and contribution to the process of group work (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.5). The method also focused on the development of learners’ judgment skills (subjectivity and objectivity). Learners were involved in the process and were encouraged to take part and ownership of this process. The research team concluded that this teaching method provided more relevant feedback to learners as it was generated by their peers. It was considered fair by most learners, because each learner was judged on his or her own contribution. The research team concluded that, when this method is perfectly implemented, it reduces the marking load faced by educators on a daily basis. As learners were given marking criteria or a rubric, this meant that there could be little or no confusion about assignment outcomes and expectations.
5.4.3.6 Brainstorming

Brainstorming, which is a strategy that is commonly used in group work, encourages group problem-solving skills while at the same time promoting positive relationships among the group members. According to Ibnian (2011, p. 264), “brainstorming is a technique used to encourage individuals to generate ideas and come up with a list of possible solutions to a certain problem”. The study revealed that brainstorming is good in the sense that it helped the average learner who found it difficult to come up with a variety of ideas in response to a problem. When a learner is working in isolation, he or she finds it difficult but that same learner feels less pressured and less alone when working in a group and is much more likely to come up with different ideas, solutions and connections.

The study demonstrated that brainstorming enabled educators see who had no prior acquaintance with or understanding of the work, who had a little prior knowledge, and who already knew a lot about the topic (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.6). The research team concluded that brainstorming prior to a lesson or unit of study allowed both educators and learners to get an idea of how much a learner knew about the topic. As the research team moved through the unit of study, learners were asked to revisit their brainstorming tools (where they recorded their ideas) and either added new ideas to the list or corrected misconceptions. Doing this gave learners a sense of what they knew. This method proved to be a motivator because it allowed learners to recognise progress in their understanding.

5.4.3.7 Direct teaching

Direct teaching is a teaching strategy whereby educators tell the learners the idea or skill to be learned and then lead them through instructional activities intended to result in student learning. According to Huitt, Monetti & Hummel (2009, p. 3), “in general, direct instruction models advocate that essential content should be exposed to students via an active presentation of information”. Direct teaching as a teaching method is skills- and educator-oriented. This method advocates the use of small-groups, face-to-face teaching and learning, and assistants using positively designed lessons aimed at helping learners to develop cognitively.
The study revealed that direct teaching is best for learning specific concepts or skills. The specificity of the objectives or learning targets also made it easier for the research team to create assessment tests of high validity and high reliability. Learners, for their part, did not suffer much confusion in determining which part of the lesson was important and which part was not (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.7). The research team ensured that the contents of instruction were logically organised and that the learners already possessed the essential knowledge on each topic that they tackled.

5.4.3.8 Seating arrangement

The seating arrangement is often determined by the size of the classroom and the number of the learners who form that particular class. Classroom arrangement is something that some educators do not give attention to yet it impacts heavily on teaching and learning. Commenting on the role seating arrangement plays, Wannarka and Ruhl (2008, p. 89) aver that:

Because proximity and orientation influence communication, it is possible that desk configuration impacts on the nature and extent of student interaction. Thus it is important for teachers to have the knowledge necessary to make informed decisions about whether rows, clusters, semicircles or some other arrangement will best meet the instructional needs of their students.

In most cases, learners choose where they want to sit in classrooms and usually those who are focused are always seated at the front and those who misbehave are always seated at the back or next to windows as it provides them with sufficient distractions to escape from the boredom of the lessons. It is common for learners who are mischievous and enjoy disturbing the class generally to sit at the back. It is therefore important for educators to take note of an effective seating arrangement that would facilitate inclusive teaching and learning.

The study found that the U-shaped seating arrangement, which is sometimes called the ‘horseshoe’, was more effective than the traditional classroom setups (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.8). Simmons, Carpenter, Crenshaw, and Hinton (2015), commenting on the horseshoe arrangement, claim that “desks arranged in a way that resembles like (sic) a horseshoe” (p. 56) enable tremendous learner participation as everyone is visible to the educators. The research team concluded that this arrangement supported frequent whole-group discussions as learners were all able to see one another and the educators at the same time. As with classroom discussions, learners did not feel
hidden in this arrangement, and that stimulated them to improve their performance. The U-shaped desk arrangement might take up more space in the classroom, but it gave the research team many options to manage traffic-flow (see Chapter 4, section 4.4.8). For the educators, nothing obstructed a walk into the U to collect papers or answer questions. The study revealed that a rotation system, when integrated into the classroom, can guarantee that learners are not branded as front or back benchers. Everyone is given an opportunity to sit in the front, middle and back. According to Simmons et al. (2015, p. 56), seating arrangements can play a huge role in learner performance. Hence, it is the duty of teachers to select wisely an arrangement that best suits their particular circumstances and classes. The U-shaped seating configuration is well illustrated in Figure 5.2 below.

![Figure 5.2 An illustration of a U-shaped seating arrangement (Source: Google Images)](image-url)
5.5 IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY

The implications of the study are next explained according to the research sub-questions in relation to the themes discussed in Chapter 4 of the study.

5.5.1 *How do educators conceptualize the use of the mother-tongue within a context of inclusion?* To answer this research question, the following themes which derive from Chapter 4 were used:

5.5.1.1 Inaccessible curricula

Transforming the current curriculum into a curriculum that would accommodate MTBI is possible. However, that would mean dealing with challenges such as: teacher development and support, monitoring the implementation, assessment, provision of learning support materials, and achieving the desired outcomes or results. Teacher development and support keeps educators up-to-date on new research on how children learn, and familiarises them with the latest technological tools for the classroom, new curriculum resources, and more. The best professional development is ongoing, experiential, collaborative, and connected to and derived from working with students and understanding their culture; however, all this comes at a cost and takes time. Monitoring should be executed by all stakeholders (institutions and individuals) who have an interest in the project. To implement a project efficiently, the people planning and implementing it should plan for all the interrelated stages from the beginning and this is also time-consuming and expensive. Transforming the current curriculum would mean changing the means of assessment and the provision of learning support materials. These factors could have an influence on people's willingness to participate and will need a well-organised and implemented campaign to change people's attitudes.

5.5.1.2 Meaningful learning

MTBI (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class could contribute to meaningful learning but this could require that the learnt information should be built on previously learned knowledge. In
reality, it means that learners must be taught Social Sciences in isiZulu while they are still in Grade 8 so that it would be easy for them to assimilate the new material. A poor memory causes a struggle for learners who lack prior knowledge as they get very little out of active learning sessions. Meaningful learning can only take place when students have a knowledge base related to the new material. Teaching should take account of what learners already know in order to plan the next steps. This means building on prior learning as well as taking account of the personal and cultural experiences of different groups.

5.5.1.3 Improved pedagogy

In as much as MTBI (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class could help educators to develop effective pedagogies, it must be noted that the problem is not only the language of instruction but also the quality of teaching, the knowledge of curriculum, and the stability of the school that determine educational chances and changes in a black school. In a properly functioning school system, language education requires only the following essential inputs for success: sufficiently qualified educators; good standard textbooks; and suitable school facilities, such as stationery, classrooms and libraries with books that could be helpful to learners. Of all the required fundamentals mentioned, the most important one is the educators’ professional development.

5.5.1.4 Cultural identity

Promoting cultural identity through the use of the mother tongue would be an excellent activity in South African schools; however, this would take South Africa back to the notorious apartheid laws such as the Population Act of 1950 and Group Areas Act of 1950 whereby people were classified according to their racial and ethnic groups. In such a scenario, isiZulu learners would need their own schools and be taught by their own isiZulu educators in order for them to promote and preserve their isiZulu culture, which I think would not be easily achieved in a democratic South Africa where people are free to associate with anybody of their choice and to settle anywhere they can afford to and feel comfortable. Furthermore, the use of one’s native language in education does not guarantee the preservation of culture. The implementation of MTBI (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social
Sciences class would not necessarily mean that the learners would remain true to their culture at all times. There are a great many influences that learners are faced with, such as television, which interferes with their cultural identity. The negative influences of television can be found on many programmes. Television stations and other forms of media tend to influence the youth in a negative manner as most of the programmes display a high quality of drug and alcohol abuse, violence, crime, explicit sex and fighting scenes which pollute their minds. In this way, the youth are far from preserving and observing their cultural traits.

5.5.1.5 Academic excellence

The study established that MTBI promotes academic excellence as the learners achieved higher marks in the assessments; however, it is noteworthy that it also limits learners from connecting with the rest of the world. For instance, isiZulu learners cannot do well in a Venda-orientated class because they have been confined to their mother tongue. MTBE promotes the mother tongue at the cost of the connecting languages (in South Africa it is English) that would enable the learners to connect with the rest of the world. If the school does not expose them to English, they will find it very hard to master the language (as their parents and surroundings will not be of assistance to them in this regard). When learners are exposed to MTBE, they experience a painful shift in higher education. Learners will have a painful shift at high school or university when they are required to learn engineering, medical or accounting concepts in English.

The implementation of MTBI (isiZulu) in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class could result in academic excellence; however, a great many African parents associate academic excellence with the English language. Black parents prefer to have their children study through the medium of English. Notwithstanding the arguments that researchers have advanced about the positive aspects of mother tongue instruction, black parents make the ‘correct’ deduction that virtually the entire economy is now organised along English lines; therefore the chances of success are much greater if the former colonial language is used. During the first few weeks of the study, some parents came to the school to ask the authorities to “remove” their children from the study because they felt that teaching their children in isiZulu would not benefit them in any way.
5.5.2 Which challenges (if any) do educators face in teaching Grade 9 Social Sciences in English to non-English speakers? To answer this research question, the following themes derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.5.2.1 Classroom resources

The worst drawback in the process of implementing MTBI is the lack of classroom resources and lack of teacher training in MTBI. Educators are not sufficiently well trained in MTBI and most African educators and parents still believe that a quality education must be and should be transmitted in English. Because of the lack of training in MTBI, most educators are motivated by the fact that English is the language of instruction in higher classes and of examinations. They then choose to teach in English as opposed to the mother tongue in the belief that the earlier it is introduced as the lingua franca the faster pupils are likely to attain proficiency in the language. It is common cause that English has both material resources (teaching materials, literature, dictionaries, publishers, journals and so on) and immaterial resources (knowledge and skills). These are English extrinsic arguments which on the surface seem to be quite sound and fool proof. Be that as it may, the implementation of local languages as media of instruction can be done in a restricted or gradual manner, while the material for the indigenous languages is being developed and the staff trained.

If we eradicate English as a medium of instruction from our institutions, it is quite obvious that the lower-income school children will never learn to speak English well. This is because learners from poor families lack resources such as television, video programmes and the internet. It appears that the acquisition of English in this time of globalization is compulsory to enable learners to participate in the knowledge-based world.

5.5.2.2 Code switching

Educators use code-switching in classrooms to provide learners with sufficient input in the two languages for them to obtain grammatical and lexical information to help learners at different language levels to understand the explanations, to provide a way of life establishing equal prestige
for both languages within the classroom setting, and then to encourage a balanced distribution of
the two languages, and to keep the students on task. In a multilingual classroom, learners who do
not have the same mother tongue might feel neglected by the application of code-switching in their
classroom. Code-switching can only be applied effectively in the classroom where all learners have
the same main language. Code-switching in teacher instruction might lead students to feel bored
and lose their attention to the previous instruction in the target language. It happens because the
educators often repeat their instructions in their own main languages which sometimes are contrary
to the learners’ main languages.

5.5.2.3 Poor quality of instruction

When educators use a language that is foreign, not only to the learners but also to themselves, there
is always poor communication which results in poor quality of instruction or poor delivery of the
content to the directed recipients. When there is poor quality of instruction, learners hardly become
themselves and they scarcely develop their personalities as well as their intellects. When learners
are taught in a foreign language instead of their mother tongue, they are forced to sit silently or
repeat content automatically, which leads to frustration and ultimately disappointment and dropout.
Poor quality of instruction leads to poor communication because neither the learners nor the
educators express themselves clearly. When learners are able to express themselves, it becomes
easier for educators to identify what has been learned, what remains to be taught, and which
learners require further educational help. Where there is poor quality of instruction, it becomes
difficult for educators to determine whether the learners have difficulties in understanding the
concepts, the language of instruction, or the language of assessment.

5.5.2.4 Lack of concentration and participation

It is vital to deliver any form of knowledge to learners using a language that is known to them so
that they could realise their potential in schools and this could only be achieved through MTBI.
Lack of concentration and participation is often perpetrated by forcing learners to learn using a
language that they do not comprehend. It is quite obvious that where there is no concentration and
participation there cannot be effective learning and teaching. Learning and teaching is an awesome experience that every learner should enjoy. When learners are taught in a medium that is familiar to them, they fully concentrate and participate which brings about happiness and love of the particular content delivered. Lack of concentration and participation in class due to lack of communication between educators and learners results in escalating failure rates which eventually lead to a high proportion of learners dropping out of school.

5.5.2.5 Scientific concepts (Geography)

Educators’ failure to explain scientific concepts to a Grade 9 Social Sciences class results in poor academic performance and, finally, to learners dropping out of school without acquiring any academic skills. Instructing learners using a foreign language results in rote learning, unlike MTBI, which allows educators and learners to interact naturally and negotiate meanings together, creating participatory learning environments that are conducive to cognitive as well as linguistic development. Sometimes when scientific concepts in English are taught to learners who are non-English speakers, they might accept the definition only for one purpose—that is, for them to be promoted to the next grade without the acquisition of a skill. It is quite likely that learners might not fully understand the concept when taught in their mother tongue, they could only associate that particular concept with a certain synonym.

5.5.3 Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of Grade 9 Social Sciences? For the purposes of answering this research question, the following themes derived from Chapter 4 were used:

5.5.3.1 ICT in Social Sciences

Educators’ attitudes to ICT seem to be one of the main obstacles hindering the full implementation of ICT in schools. The majority of educators are still trapped in the traditional ways of performing their duties—more so those who never had a chance to use ICTs during their schooling days. Such educators view ICTs as an element of distraction to learning.
The introduction of ICTs in education might end up in a situation where learners cannot display literacy skills such as writing, counting and spelling. It is likely that learners could have all the correct answers of an assignment that they cannot explain, this could be the result of internet functions such as google search. So, for example, they may use the computer to do some Social Sciences activities rather than learning and understanding themselves. They may be able to obtain good results, but not really knowing the meaning of what they have studied. In short, ICTs encourages learners to plagiarise instead of coming up with their own authentic activities using the ‘cut and paste’ process. The introduction of ICTs might deprive learners of the privilege of conducting their research in a library and talking directly to people in search of information that could be useful to them due to internet functions such as ‘youtube’. A crucial setback for the introduction of ICTs in education is the financial cost attached to such a development. It is a fact that technology is expensive, therefore schools from disadvantaged communities might face serious challenges in achieving such a transformation. Furthermore, ICTs require a lot of security to avoid burglaries in schools. This would mean that schools have to pay for extra security services rendered to them, if not, the computers would be stolen.

5.5.3.2 Team teaching (PAR)

Team teaching as a teaching method could bring about serious setbacks for learners in a classroom. This is largely based on the fact that educators’ teaching methods differ from one to the next. Some educators might not be effective as others and this could create an element of hatred amongst the team of educators. Competent educators have a tendency to dislike lazy educators because of the poor quality of knowledge they transmit to the learners. Some educators tend to shy away from the fact that they cannot teach other topics sufficiently and effectively, so if you offer to help them, they might feel humiliated and exposed of their weaknesses to the learners and some of their colleagues. Team teaching involves considerable planning and feedbacks (team discussions), some educators tend not to avail themselves for the team activities, which creates obstacles for the entire team. Every job done is attached to a monetary value, educators who put more muscle into the job might expect a lot of payment than the others. If it happens that they don’t receive that, they might end up disliking the practice itself. Learners believe in certain educators and they tend to develop
certain attachments to them, so whenever they are taught by other educators (except for the ones whom they believe in) they tend to perform poorly academically. Team teaching reduces accountability and responsibility from both educators and the learners. If learners happen to fail a particular topic addressed by the team, some educators might shift the blame to some of the team members or, on the other hand, learners might also blame some educators for not handling a certain topic appropriately.

5.5.3.3 Co-operative learning

Co-operative learning is derived from the notion that learners learn best in a collective setup as they share and deliberate ideas together. This is not always the case as some learners tend to be difficult because of their different personalities and this usually leads to unresolved conflicts. Learners’ objectives vary from one learner to the next in the sense that some might want to achieve higher marks and some might just want to progress to the next grade. Some learners might just enjoy causing confusion and being reprimanded by their educators while others might be enjoying the benefits attached to team learning. It becomes natural for some learners to be in charge of their groups and become dominant, thereby not giving other learners a chance to express themselves. Those who are not given a chance to participate might be left out of the learning and teaching process. Some learners view co-operative learning as a chance to tell stories with their group members. Educators need to be on their toes to ensure that learners are well supervised in all the activities given to them. Cooperative learning might promote favouritism. Learners who tend to excel might end up enjoying the benefits of being adored by their educators and this could create inequalities and injustices in terms of mark allocation.

5.5.3.4 Small group discussion

Small group discussions are associated with noise and mischievousness in a classroom. Learners tend to concentrate on their personal issues when given an opportunity to work in groups rather than working effectively. Some groups are manageable and some are not. One danger of small group discussion is having weaker learners clumped together in one group and the stronger learners
concentrated in another group. The weaker learners tend to make a noise and disturb the class, more especially if they are poorly supervised by the educator. When learners are not meticulously grouped, time is always wasted and there is usually no effective teaching and learning taking place.

Small group discussions become problematic again when the educator forms groups randomly or even mixes the weaker learners and the stronger learners. Learners who are not gifted and not willing to learn tend to shift the whole assignment to those who are and willing to learn. Obviously, the stronger ones who are also willing to do the assignment would carry on, but when marks are allocated, every learner in the group will benefit, some unduly and unfairly so. The educator might assume that a topic was dealt with in class, yet some of the learners might not have any idea of what is transpired in that particular topic. Small-group discussions require extensive supervision, management and guidance from the educator.

5.5.3.5 Student presentations and peer evaluations

Learners tend to remember actions and behaviours easier than words through reading, writing and listening. Observing their peers presenting helps learners to self-reflect and avoid repeating others' mistakes. Nonetheless, student presentations are time-consuming, more especially in a classroom with a large number of learners. Learners may overspend their time on flashy animations and drawings and not on the actual knowledge contents. Educator and peer assessors may also be affected by these ‘extras’ and overlook the meaningful ideas behind the topic. If the skills of live presentation are not relevant to the learning outcomes, presentation may not be a suitable assessment method.

Peer evaluations create an extra workload for educators as they are expected to conduct an additional briefing session to explain the marking criteria or the rubric. Peer evaluation has an amount of risk with respect to the reliability of grades as peer pressure to apply elevated marks or friendships may influence the assessment, although this can be reduced if learners submit their assessments independently of the group. Learners have a tendency to award everyone the same mark as they feel ill-equipped to undertake the assessment. They may be reluctant to make judgements regarding their peers. At the other extreme, learners may be discriminated against if learners ‘gang up’ against one group member.
5.5.3.6 Brainstorming

Brainstorming, when sufficiently implemented helps learners to develop self-esteem and in most cases it becomes helpful when learners are constantly involved in challenging tasks. Be that as it may, this technique becomes problematic because it involves small groups of learners juggling around a certain problem for a solution which sometimes ends up getting out of control. Learners differ in their personalities—there are those who will take everything for granted and there are those who will be serious about their work. Those who are not serious will deliberately disagree on important points and throw them away at the expense of the group. Brainstorming becomes productive only if everyone has something constructive to contribute to the group. Group members need to be focused and more imaginative so that they could come up with meaningful solutions. Brainstorming does not require learners who would just sit and listen to others: everyone needs to participate fully towards a common goal. Nevertheless, it is not every learner who will be willing to participate and make a meaningful contribution to the group.

5.5.3.7 Direct teaching

The arrangement of direct teaching can be rigid enough to hinder the creativity of the educator. There is very little room to improvise because this method follows a step-by-step technique. The technique usually starts with an introduction, followed by the rationale for the instruction, then by the instruction itself. The procedure ends with a summary followed by an assessment. Direct teaching, if used by unprepared educators, can be catastrophic. For direct teaching or instruction to be operational, the educator must have a mastery of the subject matter, must prepare well-organised content, and must have excellent communication skills. Without these traits, an educator could not effectively carry out direct teaching or direct instruction, nor could he or she develop higher order thinking skills in the learners. In larger classes, this method is not properly applied and using this method does not suit or satisfy the needs of individual students in large classes. The direct teaching method is based on the philosophy that auditory appeal is stronger than visual appeal. But then there are learners who learn more visually than with their oral- auditory senses of listening and
tasting. The method ignores systematic written work and reading activities and too little attention is paid to reading and writing.

### 5.5.3.8 Seating arrangement

Classroom layout contributes vastly towards the behaviour of learners. This includes how much they focus on the teaching, and whether they will work more individually or in groups. During the study, the research team preferred using the U-shaped seating arrangement which delivered great visibility of the central chalkboard for learners and made it easy for the educator to have contact with the learners. Desks were placed in a wide U-shape which combined a layout to encourage group discussion with a constant line of sight to the educator. This brought a sense of closeness which was beneficial to educators as eye contact could be maintained and contributions from all learners encouraged. Nonetheless, the major drawback of using this layout is space. This layout requires a big classroom and most South African classrooms are small with overcrowded learners. Usually more co-operative seating arrangements require more space, which might not be available. When educators want to implement more interactive seating arrangements, they need to have flexible seats so that they can be arranged in different styles at any given time. Such an arrangement demands prior planning and sufficient people who would be willing to rearrange seating arrangements, which might not be available.

### 5.6 RECOMMENDATIONS

MTBI has proven itself to be of great importance with regard to expanding the reach of education and producing excellent results when well implemented. Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations are made with regard to teaching, learning and, finally, policy.

#### 5.6.1 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TEACHING

##### 5.6.1.1 Inaccessible curricula

Modifying existing general curricula has been an effective way to create more accessible learning environments to support all students and their educators in various educational contexts. The
researcher recommends that the Gauteng Department of Education (GDE) consider MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Science class in order to resolve the problem of on-going poor performances in our schools, particularly the once UNITED African languages. This would create a conducive learning and teaching environment for the learners as they would be learning in their mother tongue and this would make the curriculum accessible. It would be then necessary for the GDE to ensure that the curriculum remains similar in all native African languages across the country and that all educators received the necessary training in handling mother-tongue-orientated classes.

One significant element about changing the curriculum is the expense attached to the entire process, which involves teacher development, study material, content delivery and assessment programmes. To deal with the problem, I would recommend that the GDE set aside a five-year budget plan that would enable adequate teacher development in MTBI and make provision for appropriate study materials (textbooks and dictionaries) written in all the native South African languages.

5.6.1.2 Improved pedagogy

The present study showed that the usage of MTBI helped educators to improve their teaching pedagogies. The manner and way in which educators transmitted content to their recipients changed drastically. The researcher therefore recommends that the GDE should encourage educators to adopt MTBI in order for them to improve their pedagogies. Proper methods of teaching and appropriate instructional materials should be adopted to complement the teacher’s knowledge. The GDE should come up with a strategy that would help educators to improve in MTBI so that the system of education remain South African and be in a good position to cater for the educational needs of a South African learner rather than copying other models from foreign Western countries. In the study, educators expressed themselves fluently without any language barrier and the lessons were designed inclusively, thus considering all the learners’ academic needs. The researcher highly recommends that the GDE should review and consider MTBI in schools because it helps educators to improve their pedagogies, and this includes the teaching methods and procedures that they use during their lesson presentations.
5.6.1.3 Academic excellence

In the study, learners’ performance improved significantly when MTBI was used in teaching Social Sciences. It is for this reason that the researcher recommends that the GDE implement the use of MTBI in schools as it plays a crucial role in helping learners to improve their academic results. It was relatively easy for learners to demonstrate a high level of academic achievement because they were taught using a language that they understood better. To create a situation whereby all learners would perform to the best of their ability, I recommend that the GDE make a huge effort in promoting the usage of local native languages in schools rather than put more emphasis on English which is a problem language for both educators and learners.

5.6.1.4 Classroom resources

This study indicated that there was and probably still a huge shortage of learning resources with regard to MTBI and this includes textbooks, videos, wall charts, and other materials that educators use to assist students to meet the expectations for learning stipulated by provincial or local curricula. The lack of teaching and learning resources written in isiZulu is one of the greatest challenges educators face. The researcher recommends that the GDE invest in the publication of both classroom teaching and learning aids and develop educators appropriately in order for them to deliver the content in the mother tongue. This process should be backed by a culturally contextualized curriculum with appropriate and adequate materials, and should be written in a language that is relevant to children (isiZulu). The lack of such materials has a hugely negative effect on children’s learning. At the same time, teachers need to be equipped not only for teaching across a multi-lingual curriculum, but also for improving the quality of education in general. In some cases, this will involve ensuring sufficient placements of educators who speak local languages, through working with teacher organizations to develop appropriate recruitment and retention schemes.
5.6.1.5 Code switching

Code switching is regarded as a communicative phenomenon that involves constant switching between two languages in a bilingual’s speech repertoire. Code-switching performs various functions in its naturally occurring context. People use code-switching to manipulate or influence or define situations as they wish, and to convey nuances of meaning and personal intention. It is also used to build intimate interpersonal relationships among people who share the same code. It can be said to be a tool for creating linguistic solidarity especially between individuals who share the same ethno-cultural identity and, in some situations, it is used deliberately to exclude a person from a conversation. It is seen as a sign of solidarity within a group. The researcher recommends that educators should be instructed to know when and how to implement code switching mainly in South African classrooms which are made up of multilingual learners. Code switching in isiZulu in a classroom made up of isiXhosa, Sepedi and Setswana learners would be wrong in the sense that no communication would be taking place. On the contrary, the educator would become a learning barrier. Educators need to do more than teaching theories in class. The researcher recommends that educators of a certain ethnic or linguistic group should teach learners of the same ethnic or linguistic group so that even if code switching is used at any point it will not create communication breakdown.

5.6.1.6 Poor quality of instruction

Poor quality of instruction will always lead to poor performance of learners in a classroom. This means that if educators cannot reach the minds of the learners, then no effective teaching and learning will take place at all. On the other hand, the English proficiency of many learners during the study ranged from an inability to converse about common place topics to an inability to understand simple phrases and concepts. In order for educators to achieve the expected academic standards, the researcher recommends that they use MTBI in teaching non-English speakers in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to avoid miscommunication, misinterpretations and misconceptions between the educators and the learners. The English language does not only create challenges for the learners but also for the educators. Often the blame is shifted to the learners for not completing their class activities, homework and assignments on time, yet the educators did not explain clearly
how such tasks should be carried out. I recommend that the GDE should offer on-going teacher
development on MTBE to assist educators in ensuring that the content is appropriately and
adequately delivered to the recipients to curb all the challenges associated with poor quality
instruction in English.

5.6.1.7 Lack of concentration and participation

The study revealed that when educators used English as a medium of instruction in a Grade 9 Social
Sciences class made up of non-English speakers there was always a lack of concentration and
participation on the part of the learners. This is mainly because the learners did not comprehend
what the educators were trying to say. The researcher recommends that educators should use MTBI
in order to have the full participation of learners in their classrooms. It is hard for a learner to
respond positively to a language that is not known to him or her. The researcher also recommends
that the GDE should review the MTBI policy. It is evident that the majority of educators in Gauteng
public schools in all the grades use alternative models of teaching and learning such as code
switching, as well as a bilingual and multilingual medium of instruction despite the fact that most
of the classrooms comprise learners from different linguistic backgrounds. Such practices (code
switching, bilingualism and multilingualism) accelerate the rate of lack of concentration and
participation in classrooms.

5.6.1.8 Scientific concepts (Geography)

The study revealed that comprehending of scientific concepts is a very challenging task when
taught in English. A compromise was achieved when these scientific concepts were taught in
isiZulu as learners were able to relate to their day-to-day activities. The researcher recommends
that MTBI be used in teaching and explaining all these scientific concepts to ensure that they
become meaningful to the learners. The GDE needs to develop programmes that would promote
the teaching of science using the native South African languages. In order to achieve this, there
must also be more teaching and learning materials in the indigenous languages (isiZulu for this
study) in South African schools. It is in this manner that mother-tongue education can be improved.
All teacher-training organizations and other institutions of higher education have fundamental roles to play in ensuring that educators in their preparation recognise and appreciate the important role of the mother-tongue instructional policy in schools as a means of fostering functional education and literacy in South African schools.

5.6.1.9 ICT in Social Sciences

This present study found that the use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) such as Tablets, proved to be a solution in teaching Social Sciences. The researcher recommends that the GDE should consider the full implementation of the use of ICTs in schools mainly because they provide learners with a full understanding of the content. With the availability of the internet, learners are able to connect with the entire world and access information quickly which is most useful in their studies. The introduction of emails, social media such as Facebook and educational software programs has increased and improved communication between educators and learners in the sense that even if an educator is absent from work, the learners can still carry on with their school work through communication using ICTs.

The researcher strongly recommends that educators should develop their knowledge of ICTs to be able to use them in their classes. If educators are able to use ICTs, both educators and learners will no longer have to rely solely on printed textbooks and other physical media materials stored in libraries for their educational needs. Some educators are reluctant to learn how to use ICTs in education. The researcher recommends that the GDE should provide basic training to educators who are ignorant and struggling to use ICTs.

5.6.1.10 Team teaching (PAR)

This present study showed that team teaching is one of the teaching methods that educators could use together with MTBI in teaching Social Sciences effectively to a Grade 9 class. Team teaching, which is also known as co-operative teaching encompasses a cluster of educators who work towards one common goal of enabling learners to acquire enough knowledge on a particular topic.
Educators should pool their resources and prepare lessons together for a single classroom that would be taught by all of them at different intervals. The researcher recommends that the GDE should encourage team teaching in schools for better results and to promote effective inclusive learning and teaching. This teaching method would enable educators to know their strengths and weaknesses on a particular topic. In the study, some educators demonstrated strong points in Geography while others demonstrated strengths in History, so team teaching helped the research team in identifying educators who would deal with the two different specialities. Team teaching helps educators to understand the kind of learners they are dealing with. Some educators are open to their learners and some are not, therefore having educators who are easily reached by their learners would make teaching and learning easier. The researcher also recommends that principals and heads of departments in schools should promote team teaching so that educators develop progressive relationships among themselves which might be of great interest to the learners.

5.6.1.11 Direct teaching

The researcher recommends that educators adopt this teaching method as a method of instruction in the classroom, although direct teaching or direct instruction is probably the one that has the fewest flashes and sparkles. The learners are not divided into groups but the educator presents the lesson under normal and usual circumstances. There are no experiments, there is very little disruption and less learner participation involved. The presentation revolves around the educator who at some intervals throws questions at the learners as a way of getting feedback on how the lesson is assimilated by the recipients. The researcher recommends that educators use direct teaching because it is best for learning specific concepts or skills. When teaching Social Sciences, instructors should remember that there are many scientific concepts that require precise explanation. If they use direct teaching, they have the liberty to explain the concepts fully to the learners without being interrupted. In case educators choose to use direct teaching, I recommend that they plan their lessons effectively to suit the educational needs of their learners. If the lessons are not properly designed, learners are unlikely to benefit anything from direct teaching.
5.6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LEARNING

5.6.2.1 Meaningful learning

This present study revealed that MTBI contributes significantly to meaningful learning. The concept of meaningful learning denotes the process of acquiring useful knowledge by learners, which they could rely on in solving day-to-day problems. This, in most cases, is achieved when learners use a language that is known to them—that is, the mother tongue. Learners need to remember some of the learnt information at a certain stage (which is known as retention); on the other hand, a learner is expected to use the learnt information to overcome day-to-day challenges and have new ideas (which is known as transfer). The study indicated that it is quite difficult for learners to achieve meaningful learning when taught using a language that they do not fully understand. Learners end up memorising most of the content in order for them to progress to the next grade of their schooling and this becomes rote learning. It is from this perspective that the researcher recommends that the GDE should consider the use of MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class because it contributes towards meaningful learning and it enhances inclusive teaching and learning. MTBI encourages learners to improve their abilities to make sense of what they have been taught and apply that in their everyday activities to tackle any form of academic challenge. When learners are in a good space of using what they have learnt in a classroom situation and apply it to solve day to day problems, they are engaged in meaningful learning.

5.6.2.2 Co-operative learning

Co-operative learning refers to the instructional use of small groups that allows learners to work together to maximize their own and each other’s learning. This teaching method is premised on the assumption that learners’ abilities vary from one learner to the next and that each learner is unique with a set of gifts that can be shared among their peers. When learners develop any form of attachment towards one another they tend to be aware of each other’s academic achievement which is a priority. The researcher recommends that educators use this teaching method in their classes so that they can help learners to understand that all the group members are dependent on one another for success. The researcher further recommends that educators should coach learners to
help, support, and appreciate one another. The researcher recommends that this teaching method should be frequently used so that learners can improve academically, obtain leadership skills and be able to interact with other members of the team. In this way learners develop an element of appreciating responsibilities and they learn to be accountable.

5.6.2.3 Small group discussion

Small-group discussion is one of the effective teaching methods that were used by the research team in the present study. It had a positive effect on student learning compared with individual or competitive conditions. Learners who had more information than the rest took leadership roles and mentored their fellow classmates, while, those who needed more help relied on their peers to gain more information. The researcher recommends that educators should engage with this teaching method in order to realise the potential of every learner in a friendly and welcoming manner. The researcher recommends this teaching method because learners may explain things better to other learners than an educator to a class. Learners learn how to teach one another and explain material in their own words. Moreover, questions are more likely to be asked and answered in a group setting.

5.6.2.4 Student presentations and peer evaluations

Peer evaluations are one way to get students listening to and learning from the presentations of others, and learners attend more carefully to what their classmates are saying when the evaluations they are doing count. For effective student presentations and peer evaluations to take place, educators need to be committed and be conscious of time limits. The researcher recommends that educators should constantly use this teaching method as it helps to promote learner-centred classrooms. Learners become hands-on doers, unlike in an educator-centred classroom where everything is said and done by the educator. As learners engage more with the administration of their learning and teaching, they become motivated and eager to participate. The researcher recommends that educators implement student presentations and peer evaluations because each
learner would have the benefit of the entire class's feedback and expertise, not only that of the instructor or a small group of peers. Total class-instructor feedback is not available when assignments are submitted only to the educator. Moreover, by presenting an assignment in class, the student presenter could receive immediate feedback from all peers and the instructor, so that the presenter could make changes before submitting a final draft for grading.

5.6.2.5 Cultural identity

Languages are possibly our most influential tools for preserving and developing heritage and culture. When a language is lost, culture and heritage are also largely lost. MTBI instruction in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class would play a crucial role in protecting and preserving the isiZulu language and culture, which largely contributes to identity. The researcher urges the GDE to consider making the South African native languages including isiZulu, major languages of instruction in schools to help learners preserve their native identities which would otherwise be destroyed at the expense of the former colonial masters’ languages. Moreover, popular entertainment such as television, music, film and printed media are produced predominantly in English or Western European languages, all of which contribute to the superiority enjoyed by English and the inferior status suffered by African native languages.

5.6.2.6 Brainstorming

Brainstorming allows an opportunity for learners to think openly about a task and help generate a starting point for exploration. When well-implemented with proper constraints, brainstorming can operate as a very good collective approach to beginning the task of understanding an educational problem. A majority of educators, however, tend to refrain from using brainstorming in their classrooms because they associate it with noise, mischievousness and discipline problems. This may be true at the outset, but once they see how it works and how much pleasure it can give, brainstorming will become a firm classroom teaching method. The researcher recommends that educators use brainstorming in their teaching and learning activities because it helps learners to be fully involved in classroom activities, it also promotes leadership skills in learners and promotes
learner-centred learning which encourages learner participation. The researcher recommends this teaching method mainly because learners get tired of being taught in the traditional way of learning; instead they need to enjoy being adventurous and hands-on.

### 5.6.2.7 Seating arrangement

This present study showed that seating arrangement is crucial in achieving excellent results in schools. There are numerous seating arrangement designs to choose from such as the horseshoe or U-shaped. The researcher recommends that educators use the U-shaped seating arrangement in their classrooms mainly because of its effectiveness. It looks demanding but it is not. The U-shaped desk arrangement allows all learners equal access to viewing demonstrations. Positioning the learners so they can see the front of the class will allow the educator to explain and demonstrate the day's lesson without interruptions for rearranging or moving around the classroom. Similarly, this arrangement creates a natural stage for learner performances and presentations throughout the school year. The researcher recommends that educators should refrain from seating arrangements that discourage effective inclusive teaching and promotes mischievousness and unruly behaviour classroom behaviour instead.

### 5.6.3 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the current language policy, learners are expected to begin intensive learning in their own language and should only be introduced to the second language at the level of Grades 4 or 5. The idea was that the most cognitively demanding skills should be taught in the learner’s native language for a longer period of time so that students could benefit from the support of their mother tongue. They can only change to the L2 when they have acquired the necessary language and cognitive skills. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996a) (Act 108 of 1996) Section 29: Education (2) clearly states that everyone has the right to receive education in the official language or languages of his or her choice in public educational institutions where that education is reasonably practicable. The researcher would recommend that the GDE consider extending the number of years in which learners receive education in their mother tongue, more
especially in black schools, from the stipulated number of years up until Grade 12. Unfortunately, in predominantly black schools, the Constitution is often ignored and learners are not given an opportunity to learn languages of their own choice. By contrast, predominantly white schools are using MTBE.

The National Education Policy (National Department of Education [NDoE], 1992) is aimed at promoting democracy, which includes the protection of language rights. It is also aimed at promoting respect for and tolerance towards linguistic and cultural diversity, as well as furthering the elaboration and modernization of the African languages. I would recommend that the GDE consider reviewing its educational language policy in order to accommodate all children of school-going age in order for them to realise their full potential. The researcher would highly recommend that the GDE offer extensive support to all the relevant educational stakeholders to ensure that MTBE is implemented for the benefit of all African children.

5.7 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The qualitative study was conducted at one South African secondary school where MTBI is not at all implemented in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class. MTBI is only used when teaching and learning the different native African home languages offered by the institution in which the study was conducted as learning areas (isiZulu, isiXhosa and Sesotho). The study is further limited because MTBI is not at all implemented in Grade 9 classes across the country. Since the study was conducted at one institution, the findings may not be applicable to other institutions, regions, provinces or countries. Even so, the study generated unique findings that confirmed the researcher’s belief that the implementation of MTBI in Grade 9 Social Sciences would bring about change in the academic successes of the learners.
5.8 SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This study was aimed at exploring the use of isiZulu in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching on a limited scale. Given the importance of the findings, the following aspects should be researched in the future.

- A further exploration of how MTBI can assist learners in acquiring a second language.
- An examination of educators’, learners’ and parents’ experiences concerning the use of MTBI in the senior phase to promote inclusive teaching and learning.
- A further investigation of how MTBI could be helpful in obtaining better matriculation results and improve inclusive teaching and learning in South Africa.
- An exploration of how educators could improve their pedagogies when using MTBI to create inclusive classrooms.

5.9 CONCLUSION

The study has revealed the importance of MTBI in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class. The study revealed that the use of MTBI is an essential instrument for the development of intellectual, physical and moral aspects of education. Habits, conduct, values, virtues, customs and beliefs are all shaped through the mother tongue. Needless to say, weakness in the mother tongue means a paralysis of all thought and power of expression. The study revealed that the mother tongue is part of a child’s personal, social and cultural identity. It is this sense of identification we get from speaking our mother tongue that enforces successful social patterns of acting and speaking. Our diverse social backgrounds make us unique and appealing in society.

The study showed that children’s ability to learn a second or additional local language and an international language such as English does not suffer when their mother tongue is the primary language of instruction throughout their early schooling. Furthermore, the findings indicated that fluency and literacy in the mother tongue lays a cognitive and linguistic foundation for learning additional languages.
When learners receive formal instruction in their first language throughout primary school and then gradually transition to academic learning in the second language, they learn the second language quickly. If they continue to have opportunities to develop their first language skills in the higher Grades, they emerge as fully bilingual (or multilingual) learners.

The research study was arranged into five chapters. Chapter 1 of the study placed more emphasis on the background, motivation and the rationale for the study. Additionally, the problem statement of the research, research questions and ethical considerations were explained.

Chapter 2 provided a review of the relevant literature, with special reference to the language policies of apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa and other African countries. Existing models of MTBI to facilitate inclusive teaching and learning were investigated.

Chapter 3 discussed the research design and the methodological stance of this research. It also described the data collection methods and types of interviews that the researcher used. The researcher furthermore elucidated why he chose to conduct a qualitative study.

Chapter 4 reported on the data analysis and enabled understanding of the data analysis measures based on the discussions of the focus-group interviews (learners) and semi-structured interviews (educators) that the researcher worked with.

Chapter 5 gave an overview of some of the limitations experienced in this study and made some recommendations for future research. The chapter concluded with a discussion of some possible explanations and implications of the findings of this investigation and gave a summary of the results.

In conclusion, the research study revealed that MTBI influences the learners’ performance in a Grade 9 Social Sciences class and that there are other factors contributing to learners’ poor performance in Social Sciences. These other factors are poor teaching methods, the lack of textbooks, the learner’s language background, and the lack of professional growth and development of teachers. On the whole, the performance of learners in Social Sciences taught in English is poor and if the situation is not remedied soon, the standard of education will continue to deteriorate.
REFERENCES


Mbatha, T. (2010). Putting the end point at the beginning: Teachers’ understanding of using a dual medium approach for teaching literacy in Foundation Phase classrooms. Alternation, 17(1), 49–71.


Appendices

Appendix A

GDE RESEARCH APPROVAL LETTER

Date: 24 June 2014
Validity of Research Approval: 24 June 2014 to 3 October 2014
Name of Researcher: Dlamini S.P.
Address of Researcher: 13 Van Vollen Hoven Street
Sheerwood Gardens
Brakpan North
1540
Telephone Number: 076 936 5707
Email address: sibonisodlamini11@gmail.com
Research Topic: Exploring the use of isiZulu in a Grade 9 Science class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching
Number and type of schools: ONE Secondary School
Districts/HO: Ekurhuleni South

Re: Approval in Respect of Request to Conduct Research

This letter serves to indicate that approval is hereby granted to the above-mentioned researcher to proceed with research in respect of the study indicated above. The onus rests with the researcher to negotiate appropriate and relevant time schedules with the school/s and/or offices involved to conduct the research. A separate copy of this letter must be presented to both the School (both Principal and SGB) and the District/Head Office Senior Manager confirming that permission has been granted for the research to be conducted.

The following conditions apply to GDE research. The researcher may proceed with the above study subject to the conditions listed below being met. Approval may be withdrawn should any of the conditions listed below be flouted:

Making education a societal priority

Office of the Director: Knowledge Management and Research
9th Floor, 111 Commissioner Street, Johannesburg, 2001
1. The District/Head Office Senior Manager/s concerned must be presented with a copy of this letter that would indicate that the said researcher/s has/have been granted permission from the Gauteng Department of Education to conduct the research study.

2. The District/Head Office Senior Manager/s must be approached separately, and in writing, for permission to involve District/Head Office Officials in the project.

3. A copy of this letter must be forwarded to the school principal and the chairperson of the School Governing Body (SGB) that would indicate that the researcher/s have been granted permission from the Gauteng Department of Education to conduct the research study.

4. A letter / document that outlines the purpose of the research and the anticipated outcomes of such research must be made available to the principals, SGBs and District/Head Office Senior Managers of the schools and districts/offices concerned, respectively.

5. The Researcher will make every effort obtain the goodwill and co-operation of all the GDE officials, principals, and chairpersons of the SGBs, teachers and learners involved. Persons who offer their co-operation will not receive additional remuneration from the Department while those that opt not to participate will not be penalised in any way.

6. Research may only be conducted after school hours so that the normal school programme is not interrupted. The Principal (if at a school) and/or Director (if at a district/head office) must be consulted about an appropriate time when the researcher/s may carry out their research at the sites that they manage.

7. Research may only commence from the second week of February and must be concluded before the beginning of the last quarter of the academic year. If incomplete, an amended Research Approval letter may be requested to conduct research in the following year.

8. Items 6 and 7 will not apply to any research effort being undertaken on behalf of the GDE. Such research will have been commissioned and be paid for by the Gauteng Department of Education.

9. It is the researcher’s responsibility to obtain written parental consent of all learners that are expected to participate in the study.

10. The researcher is responsible for supplying and utilising his/her own research resources, such as stationery, photocopies, transport, faxes and telephones and should not depend on the goodwill of the institutions and/or the offices visited for supplying such resources.

11. The names of the GDE officials, schools, principals, parents, teachers and learners that participate in the study may not appear in the research report without the written consent of each of these individuals and/or organisations.

12. On completion of the study the researcher/s must supply the Director: Knowledge Management & Research with one Hard Cover bound and an electronic copy of the research.

13. The researcher may be expected to provide short presentations on the purpose, findings and recommendations of his/her research to both GDE officials and the schools concerned.

14. Should the researcher have been involved with research at a school and/or a district/head office level, the Director concerned must also be supplied with a brief summary of the purpose, findings and recommendations of the research study.

The Gauteng Department of Education wishes you well in this important undertaking and looks forward to examining the findings of your research study.

Kind regards

[Signature]

Dr David Makhado
Director: Education Research and Knowledge Management

DATE: [Date]

Making education a societal priority

Office of the Director: Knowledge Management and Research
9th Floor, 111 Commissioner Street, Johannesburg, 2001
Appendix B

Department of Basic Education
Gauteng province

Dear Sir/ Madam

Re: Masters Research Project: Mr S.P. Dlamini student no: 201143344, perva no: 23735783

Kindly be informed that the above-mentioned student, a registered student for the degree of Master of Education at the University of Johannesburg from 2014-2015 academic period.

Mr Dlamini’s research will be conducted in one of the schools in the jurisdiction of your department and will need access and permission to the school. The title of the study is:

Exploring the use of isiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching.

The study will be conducted by means of Action Research together with the teachers at a chosen school. Ethical policy rules and regulations of the department will be adhered to (see details in the research proposal). Attached is an Action research plan with dates and activities of the project. The study will take a minimum of three and a maximum of six months.

Kindly note that the study will be supervised by Dr T.M. Makoelle, an Inclusive Education research expert from University of Johannesburg. All enquiries about the conduct and behaviour of the student during the project could be directed to the supervisor as per contact details below.

Hope your department consider this request favourably.

Yours in education

Dr TM Makoelle

Department of Educational Psychology
University of Johannesburg, Auckland Park Campus
B-Ring 471A
011 559 3915/0781722431
tmakoelle@uj.ac.za
Appendix C

1. School programme is not interrupted. The Principal (if at a school) and/or Director (if at a district/head office) must be consulted about an appropriate time when the researcher(s) may carry out their research at the sites that they manage.

2. Research Research may only be conducted after school hours so that the normal may only commence from the second week of February and must be concluded before the beginning of the last quarter of the academic year. If incomplete, an amended Research Approval letter may be requested to conduct research in the following year.

3. Items 6 and 7 will not apply to any research effort being undertaken on behalf of the GDE. Such research will have been commissioned and be paid for by the Gauteng Department of Education.

4. It is the researcher's responsibility to obtain written parental consent of all learners that are expected to participate in the study.

5. The researcher is responsible for supplying and utilising his/her own research resources, such as stationery, photocopies, transport, faxes and telephones and should not depend on the goodwill of the institutions and/or the offices visited for supplying such resources.

6. The names of the GDE officials, schools, principals, parents, teachers and learners that participate in the study may not appear in the research report without the written consent of each of these individuals and/or organisations.

7. On completion of the study the researcher must supply the Director: Knowledge Management & Research with one Hard Cover bound and an electronic copy of the research.

8. The researcher may be expected to provide short presentations on the purpose, findings and recommendations of his/her research to both GDE officials and the schools concerned.

9. Should the researcher have been involved with research at a school and/or a district/head office level, the Director concerned must also be supplied with a brief summary of the purpose, findings and recommendations of the research study.

DECLARATION BY THE RESEARCHER

1. I declare that all statements made by myself in this application are true and accurate.

2. I accept the conditions associated with the granting of approval to conduct research and undertake to abide by them.

Signature: [Signature]

Date: 12 June 2014

NB. If a group of Students / Researchers will be conducting the same research in the same / different GDE Institutions, Annexure A (attached) must be completed and signed by each researcher.
Appendix D

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DECLARATION BY SUPERVISOR / PROMOTER / LECTURER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I declare that: (Name of Researcher) Dr T.M. Makoelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. is enrolled at the institution / employed by the organisation to which the undersigned is attached.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The questionnaires / structured interviews / tests meet the criteria of:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Educational Accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Proper Research Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sensitivity towards Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Correct Content and Terminology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Acceptable Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Absence of Non-essential / Superfluous items</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surname:</th>
<th>Makoelle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Name/s:</td>
<td>Tsediso Michael</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institution / Organisation:</td>
<td>University of Johannesburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty / Department (where relevant):</td>
<td>Faculty of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone:</td>
<td>Tel: 011 559 3915 Cell: 0761722431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail:</td>
<td><a href="mailto:tmakoelle@uj.ac.za">tmakoelle@uj.ac.za</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signature:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date:</td>
<td>12 June 2014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N.B. This form (and all other relevant documentation where available) may be completed and forwarded electronically to Diane.Bunting@gauteng.gov.za and please copy (cc) Researchinfo@gauteng.gov.za. The last 2 pages of this document must however have the original signatures of both the researcher and his/her supervisor or promoter. (For Group Research Annexure A, must also have original signatures.) These pages may be faxed to (086 594 1781) or hand delivered (in a sealed envelope) to Diane Bunting, Room 509, 111 Commissioner Street, Johannesburg. All enquiries pertaining to the status of research requests can be directed to Diane Bunting on tel. no. 011 843 6503.
APPENDIX E

ANNEXURE A:

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR GROUP RESEARCH

This information must be completed by every researcher/student who will be visiting GDE Institutions for research purposes.

By signing this declaration, the researcher/student accepts the conditions associated with the granting of approval to conduct research in GDE Institutions and undertakes to abide by them.

Supervisor/ Promoter/ Lecturer's Surname and Name: Mokwelle Tsebo

DEVELOPMENT BY RESEARCHERS/ STUDENTS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surname &amp; Initials</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Tel</th>
<th>Cell</th>
<th>Email address</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dlamini S. P.</td>
<td>Siboniso</td>
<td>0769365707</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sibonisodlamini.dlamini1@gmail.com">sibonisodlamini.dlamini1@gmail.com</a></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

130
Appendix F
13 Van Vollenhoven Street
Sheerwood Gardens
Brakpan North
1540

The Principal
Free At Last Comprehensive School
Mbatha Street
1300

Dear Sir

Re-request to conduct a study

I am an educator at Free At Last Comprehensive School, a postgraduate student, M Ed, under the supervision of Dr T. M. Makoelle, who is the senior lecturer at the University of Johannesburg, faculty of education, department of educational psychology. I am conducting a research study entitled: Exploring the use of IsiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. Kindly grant me permission to conduct the study in your institution.

The study will be limited only in the institution and I am going to work with educators from the Social Sciences department.

The study is premised on an interpretativist epistemological and ontological grounding and it shall be conducted qualitatively. The study will assume a participatory action research (PAR). In this study a research group will be constituted by 3 teachers teaching social science to a selected grade 9 class (30 learners) and the main aim is to promote inclusive learning and teaching.

Data collection process will be a cyclic and in this study data will be collected using focus group interviews, semi-structured interviews, observations and documentary analysis during PAR.

Inductive analysis will be used to analyze data. I will adopt Inductive coding which begins with close readings of text and consideration of the multiple meanings that are inherent in the text. I will then identify text segments that contain meaning units, and creates a label for a new category into which the text segment is assigned. Additional text segments will be added to the category where they are relevant. At some stage I might develop an initial description of meaning of category and by the writing of a memo about the category (e.g., associations, links and implications). The category may also be linked to other categories in various relationships such as: a network, a hierarchy of categories or a causal sequence

Defending the confidentiality of participants will be of great significance in the accomplishment of this research. Prior to every observation and interviews, every participant will receive a full explanation of his or her rights such as confidentiality and anonymity during and after the interview sessions.
I will approach the Gauteng Department of Education to ask for permission for authorizing the conducting of the study.

**Researcher**

Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini

Cell #: 076 936 5707

E-mail: sibonisodlamini.dlamini11@gmail.com

Postal address: 13 Van VollenHoven Street  
Sherwood Gardens  
Brakpan North

**Supervisor**

Dr T Makoelle DEd (UNISA) PhD (Manchester, UK)  
Senior Lecturer: Inclusive Education  
University of Johannesburg  
Auckland Park Campus  
Bring 417 A  
Tel: 011 559 3915  
Cell: 0761722431  
tmakoelle@uj.ac.za

I hope you will give this letter the priority it deserves

Yours in education

Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini
Appendix G

Educators Letter of Consent

Dear Colleague

You are invited to participate in a research study conducted by Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini, from the UNIVERSITY OF JOHANNESBURG who is currently registered for a Masters’ degree in Inclusive education with the faculty of education, department of educational psychology. The topic of the study is: Exploring the use of IsiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. You were selected as a possible participant in this study because you also teach a grade 9 Social sciences class in the same school. Permission to conduct this study shall be obtained from the Gauteng Department of Education.

If you decide to participate, be informed that you will be expected to participate in action research in your school. Practitioners who engage in action research inevitably find it to be an empowering experience. Action research has this positive effect for many reasons. Obviously, the most important is that action research is always relevant to the participants. Relevance is guaranteed because the focus of each research project is determined by the researchers, who are also the primary consumers of the findings.

Any information that is obtained in connection with this study and that can be identified with you will remain confidential and will be disclosed only with your permission or as required by law. If you decide to participate, you are free to withdraw your consent and discontinue participation at any time without penalty. Participants are advised to read and understand the following research ethics:

- The Researcher will observe and record participants’ interviews describing their understanding of Inclusive teaching and learning as part of the action research.
- There will be interviews, which are expected to take no more than 1.5 hours each.
- The participant has the right to withdraw his/her assistance from this project at any time without penalty, even after signing the letter of consent.
- The participant has the right to refuse to answer one or more of the questions without penalty and may continue to be a part of the study.
- The participant will receive a report summary, which will come as a result of this study.
- The participant will be entirely free to discuss issues and will not be in any way coerced into providing information that is confidential or of a sensitive nature. Even though this study's questions are not of a sensitive nature, if illegal activity is disclosed the researcher will be obliged to report this to the appropriate authorities.
- Pseudonyms will be used to conceal the identity of the participants. The information disclosed in the interviews will be confidential. Anonymity cannot be guaranteed as there...
is a slight chance that direct quotes or stories may identify the participant to others, particularly colleagues.

- Audio-tapes and transcripts will be kept under lock and key in secure cabinet and destroyed after three years.

- This project was approved by the University of Johannesburg (faculty of education). If the research subjects have any questions or concerns about their rights or treatment as subjects, they may contact the Supervisor of the study, Dr T. M. Makoelle who is the senior lecturer in the department of educational psychology (faculty of education) at the University of Johannesburg.

I, ____________________________, agree to the conditions stated in this letter of consent and certify that I have received a copy of the consent form.

____________________________________________________
(Signature) (Date)

Your signature indicates that you have read and understood the information provided above, that you willingly agree to participate, that you may withdraw your consent at any time and discontinue participation without penalty, that you will receive a copy of this form, and that you are not waiving any legal claims.

Questions concerning the study can be directed to the following:

**Researcher**
Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini
Cell #: 076 936 5707
E-mail: sibonisodlamini.dlamini11@gmail.com
Postal address: 13 Van VollenHoven Street
Sherwood Gardens
Brakpan North

**Supervisor**
Dr T Makoelle DEd (UNISA) PhD (Manchester, UK)
Senior Lecturer: Inclusive Education
University of Johannesburg
Auckland Park Campus
Bring 417 A
Tel: 011 559 3915
Cell: 0761722431
tmakoelle@uj.ac.za

I hope you will give this letter the priority it deserves

Yours in education

Siboniso Phathumuzi Dlamini
Appendix H

Parental Letter of Consent for Minors

Dear Parent/Guardian

I am an educator at Vosloorus Comprehensive Secondary School, a postgraduate student, M Ed, under the supervision of Dr T. M. Makoelle, who is the senior lecturer at the University of Johannesburg, faculty of education, department of educational psychology. I am conducting a research study entitled: Exploring the use of IsiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching.

The following are the objectives of the study:

- To explore how teachers conceptualize mother-tongue instruction within the context of inclusion.
- To explore teachers’ challenges experienced in teaching grade 9 social sciences in English to non-English speakers?
- To develop guidelines on strategies of using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of grade 9 social science classes.

I am requesting your child’s participation, which will involve observations (in a classroom) and interviews (focus group). Your child’s participation in this study is voluntary. If you choose not to have your child participate or to withdraw your child from the study at any time, there will be no penalty. It will not affect your child’s grade, treatment and academic progress. Likewise, if your child chooses not to participate or to withdraw from the study at any time, there will be no penalty. The results of the research study may be published, but your child’s name will not be used.

Although there may be no direct benefit to your child, the possible benefit of your child’s participation would be very much appreciated.

If you have any questions concerning the research study or your child’s participation in this study please feel free to contact me or my supervisor using the following contact details:

**Researcher**

Mr S. P. Dlamini

Cell #: 076 936 5707

E-mail: sibonisodlamini.dlamini11@gmail.com

Postal address: 13 Van VollenHoven Street

Sherwood Gardens

Brakpan North
Supervisor
Dr T Makoelle DEd (UNISA) PhD (Manchester, UK)
Senior Lecturer: Inclusive Education
University of Johannesburg
Auckland Park Campus
Bring 417 A
Tel: 011 559 3915
Cell: 0761722431
tmakoelle@uj.ac.za

I hope you will give this letter the priority it deserves

Yours Sincerely

Mr S. P. Dlamini
Appendix I

Group Agreement for Maintaining Confidentiality

Group Consent Form

Title: Exploring the use of IsiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching.

This form is anticipated to additionally guarantee confidentiality of data obtained during the course of the study entitled: Exploring the use of IsiZulu in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive learning and teaching. All parties involved in this research, including all focus group members, will be asked to read the following statement and sign their names indicating that they agree to comply.

I hereby affirm that I will not communicate, or in any manner disclose publicly, information discussed during the course of this focus group interview. I agree not to talk about material relating to this study or interview with anyone outside my fellow focus group members and the researcher (or moderator).

(Participant name) (Signature) (Date)

Researcher’s signature and Date

Researcher: S. P. Dlamini,

Programe: M Ed (Inclusive education).

Contact details: cell #: 076 936 5707

Email address: sbonisodlamini.dlamini11@gmail.com

Postal address: 13 Van VollenHoven Street

Sheerwood Gardens

Brakpan North

1540
Appendix J

Observation plan

The observation plan will be used by the participants (grade 9 social sciences educators together with the researcher) as a guideline and making sure that their presentations are in line with what is expected from them when presenting lessons in the selected grade 9 Social Sciences class. This observation plan will determine the pedagogy to be employed for a particular lesson.

A. Curriculum related aspects of class teaching

- Carrying out lesson plan
- Presenting the lesson
- Assessment of learners during and after the lesson presentation
- Participation of learners during the lesson
- Interaction of learner with the teacher and with other learners
- Sitting arrangement of learners and teacher movement in class

B. Teaching (pedagogic) aspects

- Teaching approach e.g. behavioral, interactive
- Teaching strategies e.g. collaborative, differentiated, motivation, reciprocal, scaffolding, multi-level, multiple intelligence and multi-sensory
- Use of technology to aid teaching
- Maintaining discipline in the class (methods used)
- Motivation of learners e.g. extrinsic or intrinsic
- The role of assistant teacher in the class

C. Learning aspects

- Cooperative learning
- Group work
- Peer tutoring
- Collaborative problem solving

D. Social aspects in the classroom

- Communication between learners and the teacher and learners among themselves
- Management of diversity (accommodating differences in the class)
- Relationships between teacher and learner and between learners themselves
- Values and norms in the classroom

The above observation plan was adapted from Makoelle (2013, p. 245)
Appendix K

Interview Questions: Educators

❖ How do teachers conceptualize the use of mother-tongue within a context of inclusion?
1. What is your understanding of Inclusive teaching and learning?
2. What is your understanding of mother tongue instruction?
3. How often do you use the learners’ mother tongue in your English orientated classes when presenting a lesson? (code switching and/or multilingualism)

❖ Which challenges (if any) do teachers experience in teaching grade 9 social sciences in English to non-English speakers?
4. What was your experience in using isiZulu in a grade 9 Social Sciences class to learners who are natively Zulu as a medium of instruction?
5. How did the use of isiZulu as a medium of instruction in a grade 9 Social sciences contributed towards enhancing Inclusive teaching and learning?
6. Why is it significant to use mother tongue as a medium of instruction?
7. From the observation sessions that you were part of, which teaching pedagogy that satisfied you? Why?

❖ Which strategies are applicable in using isiZulu to facilitate inclusive learning of grade 9 social sciences?
8. When using isiZulu as a medium of instruction how was the following:
   - Learner and teacher communication
   - Co-operation among learners
   - Atmosphere and human relations in the class
   - Class discipline
   - Learner motivation
   - Learner concentration and attention

9. How did the use of technology such as IPads, Television and DVD player contributed towards effective inclusive teaching and learning?
10. The geography part of Social Sciences consists of scientific concepts, how did you managed to explain them in isiZulu? Did you face any challenges in doing that?
11. Kindly mention any advantages and disadvantages of using mother tongue instruction.
12. What is your suggestion towards the implementation of mother tongue instruction in all the learning areas except for English language (First Additional Language)?
Appendix L

Interview Questions: Focus Groups

1. What language do you speak at home?
2. When do you use your mother tongue at school?
3. What is the official language that is used in your school during learning and teaching?
4. What was your experience learning Social sciences in isiZulu?
5. What did you enjoy most to be taught in isiZulu?
6. Describe the classroom atmosphere when taught in English and the classroom atmosphere when taught in isiZulu the same learning area?
7. How the use of mother tongue as a medium of instruction did benefited you towards learning and teaching of Social sciences?
8. How was your participation in the isiZulu class compared to the English orientated class?
9. What do you prefer to be taught by one educator or more educators the same learning area?
10. How did you feel when you used technology during the isiZulu Social sciences classes?
11. If you were to change your curriculum, what is it that you would change?
12. Give a summary of your experiences during the isiZulu class for instance, interaction amongst yourselves, interaction amongst educators, your participation and attention.
Appendix M

Term 1 and 2 indicates levels achieved by learners before they were taught in isiZulu and Term 3 and 4 indicates levels achieved by learners after being taught in isiZulu.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learner</th>
<th>Term 1 level</th>
<th>Term 2 level</th>
<th>Term 3 level</th>
<th>Term 4 level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learner 1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 16</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 18</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 24</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix N

The table below shows the marks of the learners who were part of the study and later dropped out at different intervals due to different reasons. Learner 25 and 26 dropped out of the study two weeks before its completion because of family related issues. Learner 27, 28 and 29 dropped out of the study within the first week after the researcher was advised by their parents to excuse them simply because the parents wanted their children to only learn in English. Learner 30 terminated his participation on the fifth week of the study due to drug related issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learner 25</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learner 26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 27</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 29</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner 30</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHASE</td>
<td>RESEARCH ACTIVITY (WHAT)</td>
<td>PARTICIPANTS (WHO)</td>
<td>WHEN (DATE &amp; TIME)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANNING PHASE</td>
<td>The first task is to get the research team together. In this case I organized the social science department educators. I also involved an educator who has taught isiZulu for more than 20 years to be part of the study. I then prepared the learners who will be part of the study and I explained to those who won’t be part of the study that this is not meant to exclude them. I then conducted a workshop which was aimed at helping the educators to fully understand Participatory Action research and inclusive education (teaching and learning).</td>
<td>Educator 1 (HoD) Educator 2 (S.S.) Educator 3 (S.S.) Educator 4 (isiZulu educator) Researcher Learners (selected class)</td>
<td>12-15 May 2014</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBSERVATION PHASE</td>
<td>The research team shall observe each other during lesson presentation. The team will be looking for teaching methodologies that could be used efficiently and adequately to facilitate inclusive teaching and learning. The observation plan will be used by the participants (grade 9 social sciences educators together with the researcher) as a guideline and making sure that their presentations are in line.</td>
<td>Educator 1 Educator 2 Educator 3 Researcher Educator 1 Educator 2 Educator 3 Researcher Educator 1 Educator 2</td>
<td>21-26 July 2014 28 July- 01 August 14 04-08 August 2014 11-15 August 2014 18-22 August 2014 25-29 August 2014 01-05 September 14 08-12 Sep 2014 15-19 Sep 2014 22-26 Sep 2014</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
with what is expected from them when presenting lessons in the selected grade 9 Social Sciences class. This observation plan will determine the pedagogy to be employed for a particular lesson.

A. Curriculum related aspects of class teaching
- Carrying out lesson plan
- Presenting the lesson
- Assessment of learners during and after the lesson presentation
- Participation of learners during the lesson
- Interaction of learner with the teacher and with other learners
- Sitting arrangement of learners and teacher movement in class

B. Teaching (pedagogic) aspects
- Teaching approach e.g. behavioral, interactive
- Teaching strategies e.g. collaborative, differentiated, motivation, reciprocal, scaffolding, multi-level, multiple
intelligence and multi-sensory
- Use of technology to aid teaching
- Maintaining discipline in the class (methods used)
- Motivation of learners e.g. extrinsic or intrinsic
- The role of assistant teacher in the class

C. Learning aspects
- Cooperative learning
- Group work
- Peer tutoring
- Collaborative problem solving

D. Social aspects in the classroom
- Communication between learners and the teacher and learners among themselves
- Management of diversity (accommodating differences in the class)
- Relationships between teacher and learner and between learners themselves
- Values and norms in the classroom
Adapted from Makoelle (2013, p. 245)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTION PHASE</th>
<th></th>
<th>Educator 1</th>
<th>02-28 February 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>According to the GDE policy on conducting a study, it cannot be done during</td>
<td>According to the GDE policy on conducting a study, it cannot be</td>
<td>Educator 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the last term of an academic year. So this simply means that the action phase</td>
<td>done during the last term of an academic year. So this simply</td>
<td>Educator 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shall resume on February. From the observations (that will run for three</td>
<td>means that the action phase shall resume on February. From the</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>months) the research group will then determine the adequate teaching methods</td>
<td>observations (that will run for three months) the research group</td>
<td>Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that could be used in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive</td>
<td>will then determine the adequate teaching methods that could be</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teaching and learning. Reviews shall be done on weekly basis. Documentary</td>
<td>used in a grade 9 social sciences class to facilitate inclusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>analysis of learner performance will also be reviewed by analysing mark</td>
<td>teaching and learning. Reviews shall be done on weekly basis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>schedule in the social sciences subject. Interview questions shall be derived</td>
<td>Documentary analysis of learner performance will also be reviewed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from the observations. The observation phase will determine what kind of</td>
<td>by analysing mark schedule in the social sciences subject.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>questions to be asked. Focus group Interviews will be conducted with</td>
<td>Interview questions shall be derived from the observations. The</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>learners from the selected class to determine their perspective on practices</td>
<td>observation phase will determine what kind of questions to be</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>adopted to facilitate learning. Focus group will be used to explore the</td>
<td>asked. Focus group Interviews will be conducted with learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>opinions, perceptions and views of the participants without putting any</td>
<td>from the selected class to determine their perspective on practices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pressure on them. Focus groups will</td>
<td>adopted to facilitate learning. Focus group will be used to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>explore the opinions, perceptions and views of the participants without</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>putting any pressure on them. Focus groups will</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
be used in this study because they are known to stimulate high levels of involvement among participants when there is a need to generate ideas from the individuals in a collective manner.

| REFLECTION | The Participatory Action Research team will reflected on the positive aspects of using PAR. The team shall state what they have gained in using such a research tool. The researcher will also be engaged in an individual analysis of the entire data collected using PAR as a research tool | Educator 1 Educator 2 Educator 3 Researcher | 02-28 March 2015 |