

LIABILITY FOR GROSS HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS: FROM CRIMINAL TO CIVIL REMEDIES

DEDICATION

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

SUMMARY/OPSOMMING

ABBREVIATIONS

CONTENTS

PART A

PRESENT SYSTEMS OF MONITORING AND PROTECTING HUMAN RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW 1

CHAPTER 1

THE UN SYSTEM OF HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION 4

1. THE (abolished) UN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS 5

1.1. Overview 5

1.2. The CHR and its Sub-Organs 5

1.3. Evaluation 8

2. THE UN HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS 11

2.1. Overview 11

2.2. Assessment 12

3. THE HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL 12

4. TREATY BASED HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEES 14

4.1. THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE 14

4.1.1. Overview 14

4.1.2. Evaluation 15

4.2. THE COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE (CAT) 17

4.3. THE COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION (CERD) 19

4.4. THE COMMITTEE ON MIGRANT WORKERS (CMW) 20

4.5. Conclusion	22
5. THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL	22
5.1. Overview	22
5.2. The present composition of the SC as an obstacle to its efficiency	25
5.3. The problematic mandate of peacekeeping	26
5.4. Sanctions as tools of human rights protection	27
5.5. Evaluating the SC's role in the protection of human rights	28
6. Conclusion	29

CHAPTER 2

THE PROTECTION OF

HUMAN RIGHTS AT THE REGIONAL TREATY LEVEL 32

1. THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN EUROPE 32

1.1. HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION UNDER THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE REGIME 33

1.1.1. Overview 33

1.1.2. CoE human rights protection prior 1994 33

1.1.3. CoE human rights protection after 1994 34

1.1.4. Evaluation of the CoE human rights protection 35

1.2. THE ORGANIZATION FOR SECURITY AND COOPERATION IN EUROPE AND HUMAN RIGHTS 37

1.2.1. Overview 37

1.2.2. Evaluation of human rights protection under the OSCE 38

1.3. HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE EUROPEAN UNION 39

1.4. Conclusion 42

2. THE INTER-AMERICAN HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM 44

2.1. Introduction 44

2.2. THE INTER-AMERICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS 44

2.2.1. Overview 44

2.2.2. Shortcomings 45

2.2.2.1. Financial dependency 45

2.2.2.2. Lack of efficiency and enforcement measures	46
2.2.2.3. Impartiality and rivalry	46
2.3. THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS	47
2.3.1. Overview	47
2.3.2. Shortcomings	47
2.3.2.1. Lack of an effective enforcement regime	47
2.3.2.2. Principal deficits of the Inter-American contentious case mechanism	48
2.3.2.3. Insufficient financing	49
2.4. Evaluation of human rights protection under the Inter-American system	49
3. THE AFRICAN HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM	51
3.1. Introduction	51
3.2. THE AFRICAN CHARTER ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	51
3.2.1. Overview	51
3.2.2. Shortcomings	52
3.2.2.1. Rights v. duties	52
3.2.2.2. Domestic limitations of the scope of human rights	53
3.2.2.3. A weak enforcement regime	54
3.3. THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	55
3.3.1. Overview	55
3.3.2. Shortcomings	55
3.3.2.1. Questionable impartiality	55
3.3.2.2. Lack of independence and conflict of interest scenarios	56
3.3.2.3. Lack of confidentiality	56
3.3.2.4. Confidentiality v. promotion of human rights	58
3.3.2.5. A weak reporting system	58
3.3.2.6. The absence of a mandatory amicable settlement option	59
3.3.3. Evaluation of human rights protection by the ACHPR	59
3.4. THE (future) AFRICAN COURT ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	61
3.4.1. Overview	61
3.4.2. Shortcomings	62
3.4.2.1. Independence and funding	62

3.4.2.2. Limited admissibility	63
3.4.2.3. Enforcement of judgments	64
3.4.2.4. The wide choice of applicable law and mechanisms may weaken the court's effectiveness	65
3.5. Evaluation of human rights protection under the African human rights system	66

CHAPTER 3

THE NATURE OF AVAILABLE REMEDIES	68
1. INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINTS	68
2. FINANCIAL REMEDIES	70
 CONCLUSION PART A	 73

PART B

CRIMINAL ACCOUNTABILITY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	75
----------------------------------	----

CHAPTER 1

INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	77
1. DEFINING INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	77
2. SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	79
3. INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	81
3.1. Overview	81
3.2. The core crimes	81
3.3. The legal development of the core crimes	83
3.3.1. Genocide	83
3.3.2. Crimes against humanity	84
3.3.3. War crimes	86
3.3.4. Aggression	89

3.3.5. The crime of torture	93
3.3.6. The crime of international terrorism	94
4. FORMS OF CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY	97
4.1. State criminal responsibility	97
4.2. Individual criminal responsibility	101
4.3. Corporate criminal responsibility	104
5. Conclusion	105

CHAPTER 2

THE PROSECUTION OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	107
1. THE CHOICE OF FORUM	107
1.1. International Courts	107
1.2. National Courts	108
1.3. Choosing the appropriate judicial forum	110
2. CRIMINAL PROSECUTION BEFORE INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS	112
2.1. TEMPORARY “AD-HOC” TRIBUNALS	112
2.1.1. THE INTERNATIONAL MILITARY TRIBUNAL OF NUREMBERG	112
2.1.1.1. Introduction	112
2.1.1.2. Jurisdiction and sentencing	113
2.1.1.2.1. Crimes against peace	114
2.1.1.2.2. War crimes	114
2.1.1.2.3. Crimes against humanity	115
2.1.1.2.4. Sentencing	116
2.1.1.3. The IMT and the criticism of retroactive law	116
2.1.1.3.1. Overview	116
2.1.1.3.2. The legal nature of the different crimes under the NC	117
2.1.1.3.2.1. Crimes against peace	117
2.1.1.3.2.2. War crimes	119
2.1.1.3.2.3. Crimes against humanity	120
2.1.1.4. The Prosecution of war criminals after 1949 under domestic German criminal law as an alternative.	122

2.1.1.4.1. Overview	122
2.1.1.4.2. The applicable law	123
2.1.1.5. The IMT's limitations of other defences of criminal law	126
2.1.1.5.1. Superior orders	127
2.1.1.5.2. Duress	128
2.1.1.5.3. Mistake of law	129
2.1.1.6. Conclusion	131
2.1.2. THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE FORMER YUGOSLAVIA –(ICTY)	134
2.1.2.1. Jurisdiction and sentencing	134
2.1.2.2. Evaluation	136
2.1.3. THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA (ICTR)	141
2.1.3.1. Jurisdiction and sentencing	141
2.1.3.2. Evaluation	142
2.1.4. THE SPECIAL COURT FOR SIERRA LEONE (SCSL)	145
2.1.4.1. Jurisdiction and sentencing	145
2.1.4.2. Addressing jurisdictional immunity and amnesty	146
2.1.4.3. Evaluation	149
2.1.5. THE SUPREME IRAQI CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL (SICT)	149
2.1.5.1. Jurisdiction and sentencing	150
2.1.5.2. Evaluation	152
2.2. THE PERMANENT INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT (ICC)	153
2.2.1. Introduction	153
2.2.2. Jurisdiction and sentencing	155
2.2.3. Shortcomings and present difficulties	156
2.2.3.1. Restrictions and limitations to the court's jurisdiction	156
2.2.3.2. The notorious opposition of the USA	157
2.2.4. Conclusion	159
3. CRIMINAL PROSECUTION OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES BEFORE NATIONAL COURTS	159

3.1. Israel	160
3.2. Belgium	161
3.3. Germany	163
3.3.1. Overview	163
3.3.2. The prosecution of international crimes before German courts	163
3.3.2.1. Criminal Prosecutions of serious international crimes before the introduction of the CCAIL	164
3.3.2.2. Criminal Prosecution of international crimes under the new CCAIL	165
3.4. Canada	165
3.5. United Kingdom	166
3.6. Conclusion	166

CHAPTER 3

IMMUNITIES AND DOMESTIC AMNESTIES AS

KEY OBSTACLES TO AN EFFECTIVE CRIMINAL PROSECUTION 168

1. IMMUNITY 168

1.1. Introduction 168

1.2. The present concept and practice of immunity from criminal prosecution in respect to human rights atrocities 169

1.2.1 The House of Lords' *Pinochet* decision 170

1.2.1.1. Overview 170

1.2.1.2. Facts of the case 170

1.2.1.3. The legal findings 171

1.2.1.4. Comment 172

1.2.2. The ICJ' s *DRC v. Belgium* decision 173

1.2.2.1. Overview 173

1.2.2.2. Facts of the case 173

1.2.2.3. Legal findings 174

1.2.2.4. Comment 174

1.2.3. Conclusion 175

2. OTHER OBSTACLES 176

2.1. Pardoning and amnesty	176
2.2. Lack of will and means to prosecute	177
 CONCLUSION PART B	 178

PART C

CIVIL ACCOUNTABILITY FOR GROSS HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS UNDER INTERNATIONAL AND DOMESTIC LAW

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	180
 CHAPTER 1	
CIVIL RESPONSIBILITY OF STATES FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW	182
1. The concept of state responsibility	182
2. State responsibility for human rights violations	184
3. The individual as claims holder in cases of state responsibility for human rights violations	186
3.1. Situation under international law	186
3.2. Situation under regional treaty law	189
3.3. Shortcomings	190
4. Conclusion	193
 CHAPTER 2	
ADJUDICATING HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES IN DOMESTIC JURISDICTIONS	195
1. INTRODUCTION	195
2. CIVIL LIABILITY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES BEFORE US COURTS	195
2.1. Overview	195

2.2. The Law	196
2.2.1. The Alien Torts Claims Act (ATCA)	196
2.2.2. The Torture Victim Protection Act (TVPA)	198
2.2.3. The Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act (AEDPA)	198
2.3. Limitations of the U.S. human rights litigation and their exceptions	199
2.3.1. The Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act (FSIA)	199
2.3.2. The Head-of-State doctrine	200
2.3.3. The “political question” doctrine	202
2.3.4. The Act-of-State doctrine	203
2.3.5. The objection of <i>forum non conveniens</i>	204
2.3.6. Further limitations to US human rights litigation	204
2.4. The development of human rights litigation in the USA	206
2.4.1. The individual human rights perpetrator: <i>Filartiga v. Pena-Irala</i>	206
2.4.2. The non-state actor: <i>Kadic v. Karadzic</i>	207
2.4.3. States as defendants	208
2.4.4. The corporate defendant: <i>Doe v. Unocal, Wiwa v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Company</i> and other cases	210
2.4.5. Mass torts and class actions	213
2.5. Conclusion	217
3. CIVIL LIABILITY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES IN OTHER DOMESTIC LEGAL SYSTEMS	218
3.1. South Africa and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission	218
3.2. United Kingdom	220
3.3. The Federal Republic of Germany	221

CHAPTER 3

HUMAN RIGHTS LITIGATION AS A DETERRENT TO THE PERPETRATOR OF FUTURE HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES-THE BALANCE SHEET

1. <i>JUS COGENS</i> VIOLATIONS AS PART OF DOMESTIC TORTS LAW	225
2. THE ADVANTAGE OF CIVIL REMEDIES IN THE QUEST FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	226

3. THE BENEFITS OF HUMAN RIGHTS LITIGATION	226
--	-----

CONCLUSION PART C	228
-------------------	-----

PART D

DRAFT STATUTE ON A CONVENTION ON INDIVIDUAL CIVIL LIABILITY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS ATROCITIES

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	229
----------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 1

THE DRAFT – ESTABLISHMENT OF THE COURT	230
--	-----

CHAPTER 2

THE DRAFT – SUBSTANTIAL RULES	240
-------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 3

THE DRAFT – PROCEDURAL RULES	250
------------------------------	-----

CHAPTER 4

THE DRAFT – REMEDIES AND THE ENFORCEMENT OF VERDICTS	259
--	-----

BIBLIOGRAPHY	264
--------------	-----