COPYRIGHT AND CITATION CONSIDERATIONS FOR THIS THESIS/ DISSERTATION

- Attribution — You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made. You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.

- NonCommercial — You may not use the material for commercial purposes.

- ShareAlike — If you remix, transform, or build upon the material, you must distribute your contributions under the same license as the original.

How to cite this thesis

DEVELOPMENT OF PSYCHOSOCIAL INTERVENTION GUIDELINES FOR TRANSNATIONAL TRAFFICKED CHILDREN

AJWANG’ R. WARRIA

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
DOCTOR LITTERARUM ET PHILOSOPHIAE (D. Litt. et Phil.)
in
SOCIAL WORK
in the
FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

at the
UNIVERSITY OF JOHANNESBURG

SUPERVISOR: Prof. J.B.S. Nel
CO-SUPERVISOR: Prof. J. Triegaardt

APRIL 2014
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Without God giving me the strength, wisdom and perseverance, I never would have conducted, compiled and completed this study. All glory and honour to Him.

Isaac Newton (1676) said “If I have seen further, it is only by standing on the shoulders of giants.” This quote clearly captures the extent of my sincere appreciation for my supervisors, Prof. Nel and Prof. Triegaardt; for their invaluable insight and guidance and for their ability to keep me grounded and focused throughout the research process. I would also like to thank the Departments of Social Work at University of Johannesburg and University of Witwatersrand, for support accorded over the years.

I’m extending my gratitude to Prof. Nel for facilitating the award of the Supervisor-Linked bursary, the University of Johannesburg for the Merit Award and SPARC and Humanities Ad-Hoc Committees at the University of Witwatersrand for additional financial support. Appreciation is extended to Prof. Tom Skauge and Prof. Tor Halvosen at the University of Bergen for facilitating and hosting me during my academic visits to Norway.

Although the institutions and organisations which participated in the study remain anonymous for security reasons, my heartfelt thanks goes to all them for their support and assistance duly accorded. I would like to sincerely thank the trafficked children who voluntarily availed themselves, had the courage to share their stories, and made this study possible. You are my heroes and you showed me something worth fighting for!

Much appreciation and love to my husband, Welsh Gwaza, for being the wind beneath my wings. Welsh, thanks for being steadfast, for challenging my socio-legal arguments and for supporting me while I pursued another adventure in our lives, which required sacrifice, patience, and perseverance.

Much gratitude goes to “Oscar & Friends” for guidelines’ graphic design assistance and to Dr. Edmarie Pretorius and Mr. Johan Neethling for assisting with the Afrikaans
translation of the abstract. From the bottom of my heart, I would like to say *asante sana* to all my dear friends who constantly showed considerable interest in my research, and who were understanding when I had to “hibernate” and gave me enormous support during this research journey.

I am forever indebted to my family, wherever they are, for the considerable sacrifices they have consistently made and their message of lifelong learning. Special thanks to my big brother Dr. Pfarr. Dan Warria, for believing in my dream and helping me nurture it again and again. This thesis is dedicated to my loving and prayerful mother, Leah Warria, a survivor in her own way, a special person who has always encouraged me to pursue what I am passionate about and has prayed for me all along. I hope and wish that my mother’s gift of love, hard work, thoughtfulness, and gentleness will be mine too.
ABSTRACT

“Development of psychosocial intervention guidelines for transnational trafficked children”

Children’s rights are fundamental to their growth and development, and child trafficking hampers the achievement of these rights. The growth of child trafficking continues to influence the responsibilities expected of social workers. Thus, it is essential that social workers are able to respond to the needs of trafficked children. Unfortunately, South Africa lacks literature on how cross-border trafficked children experience, perceive and understand identification and initial assistance processes. There is a gap in South African theoretical literature on child trafficking intervention guidelines. The result is that social work knowledge on victim assistance has not kept pace with the growing social issue in South Africa. The aim of this study is to develop psychosocial intervention guidelines for trafficked children in South Africa.

The ever-growing burden of child trafficking demands that effective and efficient interventions are designed and implemented. Therefore, to fulfil the goal of the study, the overarching intervention research model used was the Rothman and Thomas (1994) Design and Development (D&D) model, which was complemented by Thomas’s (1984) Developmental model. The two models were chosen because they are directed by the practical realities in the social work field. The D&D model has six well-defined phases, although in this study, only the first four phases were applied.

In the first phase, the rapid identification of child trafficking and the provision of initial assistance to child victims of trafficking were acknowledged as key issues that require social work intervention. The state of existing interventions was investigated during the state-of-art review, and a feasibility study was conducted to establish the resources required for the study. The outcome of the activities indicated that psychosocial intervention guidelines for child victims of transnational trafficking were needed.
During the data-gathering phase, the researcher conducted a document study to establish what had been done to address the issues identified. An empirical study was also conducted using narrative interviews with ten trafficked children, seven social workers, and 15 key stakeholders. The data was analysed using thematic analysis and was subjected to literature control. The data further influenced the researcher’s decision to continue with the design phase.

The design objectives, domains, and requirements were outlined in the design phase. This was closely followed by the conversion and intervention design processes, which included the formulation of generalisations and the development of the practice guidelines. Within the development of the guideline, additional skills were identified and recommended, and strategies were presented to support the implementation process.

During the early development and pilot testing phase, it was evident that the process of development is intertwined with the realities of users, and thus designing continued into this phase. Pilot testing of the guidelines was conducted with social workers as the intended users to determine if these guidelines were viable and could be used as a practice tool. The social workers were satisfied with the guidelines. The design work, based on the social worker’s suggestions and the introduction of the Trafficking Act (2013), ensured that the goal of the study was achieved. The guidelines were developmentally valid, reasonably coherent, and reflective of the social work practice and policy implementation in South Africa.

Rapid identification, timeous and appropriate referral and the immediate provision of assistance are fundamental aspects of addressing trafficked children's needs and contribute towards the child’s recovery and healing process. In as much as it might be a challenge to provide all trafficked children with the opportunities, services and assistance required, providing high-quality social work assistance is a critical issue worth pursuing.
Key words: transnational child trafficking, intervention guidelines, psychosocial
OPSOMMING

“Die ontwikkeling van riglyne vir psigo-sosiale intervensies met verhandelde kinders”

Kinders se regte lê ten grondslag aan hulle groei en ontwikkeling, en die verhandeling van kinders is in teenstelling met en maak inbreuk op hul regte. Die toename in kinderverhandeling beïnvloed die rol wat maatskaplike werkers behoort te vervul, die verantwoordelikhede wat hulle moet nakom en die vereistes wat bestaan ten opsigt van die hantering van verhandelde kinders se behoeftes.

In Suid-Afrika is daar ’n tekort aan wetenskaplike literatuur oor die ervarings en verstaan van kinders wat oor grense heen verhandel word asook wat die aanvanklike identifiserings- en hulpverleningsprosesse behels. Gevolglik is daar ook ’n gebrek aan riglyne oor die hantering en spesifieke intervensies wat nodig is om toepaslike dienste aan verhandelde kinders te lever.

Die verhandeling van kinders is wêreldwyd en ook in Suid-Afrika ’n vinnig toenemende maatskaplike uitdaging. Desondanks, het maatskaplike werkers se kennis oor en vaardigheid in die hantering van die probleem nie tred gehou met die toenemende behoefte aan hulpverlening op die gebied nie.

Die doel van die studie was om riglyne vir psigo-sosiale intervensies vir verhandelde kinders in Suid-Afrika te ontwikkel. Die steeds toenemende probleem van kinderverhandeling vereis die ontwikkeling en implementering van geskikte en doeltreffende hulpverleningsintervensies. Om die doel van die studie te bereik, is die Intervensienavorsingsmodel wat die Ontwerp- en Ontwikkelingsmodel van Rothman en Thomas (1994) en die Ontwikkelingsmodel van Thomas (1984) insluit, toegepas. Hierdie twee modelle is gebruik aangesien hulle uiteraard op die praktiese realiteit in maatskaplike werk gerig is. Die Ontwerp- en Ontwikkelingsmodel het ses duidelike fases, maar slegs die eerste vier is in die studie toegepas.
In die eerste fase is die vroeë identifisering van kinderverhandeling / kinderhandel en die aard van aanvanklike hulpverlening aan slagoffers van kinderverhandeling/kinderhandel geïdentifiseer as belangrike aangeleenthede wat maatskaplike intervensies vereis. Die bestaande intervensies is ondersoek/nagevors en 'n uitvoerbaarheidstudie is gedoen om vas te stel watter hulpbronne vir die studie nodig sou wees. Die bevinding/resultate was dat psigo-sosiale intervensie-riglyne vir die hantering van slagoffers van kinderverhandeling 'n behoefte is.

Gedurende die dataversamelingsfase het die navorser ook 'n studie van bestaande dokumente gedoen om vas te stel wat reeds gedoen is om die geïdentifiseerde aangeleentheid aan te spreek. 'n Empiriese studie is ook gedoen en onderhoude is met tien kinders wat verhandel is, sewe maatskaplike werkers en 15 belanghebbendes gevoer. Die versamelde data is ontleed deur van empiriese analise gebruik te maak wat onderworpe was aan vergelyking en kontrole van bestaande literatuur. Die bevindinge van die data-analise het die navorser gerig/ beïnvloed om met die ontwerpfase voort te gaan.

In die ontwerpfase is die ontwerpdoelwitte, domein/area en die vereistes uiteengesit. Dit is gevolg deur die verwerking/omvorming en intervensie-ontwerpprosesse wat die ontwikkeling van die praktiese riglyne en die formulerings van veralgemenings ingesluit het. Tydens die ontwikkeling van die riglyne is bykomende vaardighede en strategieë geïdentifiseer om die implementeringsproses te ondersteun wat ook aanbeveel is.

Gedurende die vroeë ontwikkeling en loodsfasen was dit duidelik dat die ontwikkelingsproses inengestrengel is met die praktiese ervaring van die gebruikers en derhalwe het die ontwikkeling gedurende die fase voortgeduur. Om te bepaal of die voorgestelde riglyne bruikbaar en lewensvatbaar is, is die loodsstudie met maatskaplike werkers as voornemende gebruikers gedoen. Dit het geblyk dat hulle tevrede was met die voorgestelde riglyne.
Die ontwerp, gebasseer op die voorstelle van die maatskaplike werkers en die indiening van die Wet op Mensehandel (2013), het bygedra tot die bereiking van die doel van die studie. Die riglyne was geldig, redelik duidelik / samehangend en weerspieëlend van maatskaplike werk praktyk en beleid-implementering in Suid-Afrika.

Vroeë identifikasie, tydige en toepaslike verwysings en onmiddellijke hulpverlening is fundamentele aspekte in die aanspreking van verhandelde kinders se behoeftes en bydraende faktore tot die kind se herstelproses. Alhoewel dit 'n groot uitdaging kan wees om ondersteuning en dienste asook geleenthede aan kinders te bied wat slagoffers van verhandeling is, is die lewering van psigo-sosiale / maatskaplike hulpverlening van goeie gehalte 'n kritieke aangeleentheid wat die moeite werd is om na te streef en aan te pak.
DEVELOPMENT OF PSYCHOSOCIAL INTERVENTION GUIDELINES FOR TRANSNATIONAL TRAFFICKED CHILDREN

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plagiarism declaration</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opsomming</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of contents</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of figures</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of acronyms</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 1: GENERAL ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction to the study                     2
1.2 Background of the study                       2
1.3 Motivation for the study                      5
1.4 Research problem formulation                  7
1.5 Aim and objectives of the study               9
1.6 Research questions                            9
1.7 Research methodology                          10
1.8 Lens of approach: Ecological framework        12
1.9 Definition of key concepts of study           13
1.10 Ethical considerations                       17
1.11 Organization of the study                    18
1.12 Conclusion                                  19
CHAPTER 2: THE CONTEXT OF THE STUDY AND LEGAL TRAFFICKING FRAMEWORKS

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Human trafficking: A developmental contextual perspective

2.3 Human trafficking as a global issue

2.4 Human trafficking in South Africa
   2.4.1 South Africa in context
   2.4.2 The nature of child trafficking in South Africa
   2.4.3 The impact of transnational trafficking on children

2.5 Child trafficking legislative and policy responses
   2.5.1 International legal frameworks
      2.5.1.1 The League of Nations Slavery Convention
      2.5.1.2 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC)
      2.5.1.3 UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, Supplementing the UN Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime
      2.5.1.4 ILO Convention No. 182 on the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour
   2.5.2 Regional legislative frameworks
      2.5.2.1 The African Charter on Human and People’s Rights
      2.5.2.2 African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (ACRWC)
      2.5.2.3 SADC Declaration on Gender and Development
      2.5.2.4 The Ouagadougou Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings, especially Women and Children
   2.5.3 South African legal frameworks
      2.5.3.1 The Child Care Act
      2.5.3.2 The Children’s Charter of South Africa
      2.5.3.3 The Constitution of South Africa
      2.5.3.4 The Children’s Act
      2.5.3.5 Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act
2.5.3.6 The Prevention and Combating Trafficking in Persons Act  
2.6 Situating trafficking legislative frameworks within the ecological approach  
2.7 Conclusion  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3.6</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**  
63

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Intervention research</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Facets of intervention research</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Rothman and Thomas D&amp;D model</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Application of the D&amp;D model to child trafficking</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Problem identification, analysis and research planning phase</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Information gathering, analysis, and synthesis phase</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Design phase</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Early development and pilot testing phase</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 4: PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION, ANALYSIS & RESEARCH PLANNING PHASE**  
83

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Problem identification and analysis</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Problem identification</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Problem analysis</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.1 Scope of the problem worldwide</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2 Scope of the problem in South Africa</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.3 Components of the problem</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.4 Causes of the problem</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.5 Impact of the problem</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.6 Shortcoming of interventions and rationale for social work intervention</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 State of-the-art review</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Discussions with social workers and experts</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.2 Review of international literature 105
4.3.3 Review of South African literature 108
4.3.4 Review of existing international, regional, and South African (trafficking) intervention guidelines 110
4.4 Feasibility of the study 115
   4.4.1 Technical and legal feasibility 115
   4.4.2 Organisational feasibility 116
   4.4.3 Economic, political and use feasibility 117
4.5 Conclusion 118

CHAPTER 5: INFORMATION-GATHERING AND DATA ANALYSIS:
   EMPIRICAL STUDY 120
5.1 Introduction 120
5.2 Research approach 121
5.3 Research design 122
5.4 Sampling/ participants 124
   5.4.1 Children as participants 125
   5.4.2 Social workers as key informants 126
   5.4.3 Stakeholders as key informants 127
5.5 Research instrument 127
   5.5.1 Pre-testing research instruments 127
5.6 Data collection 128
   5.6.1 Data collection with children 128
   5.6.2 Data collection with social workers 130
   5.6.3 Data collection with key stakeholders 131
5.7 Data analysis 133
   5.7.1 Data analysis in the field 133
   5.7.2 Data analysis away from the field 135
5.8 Trustworthiness of study 141
   5.8.1 Credibility 143
   5.8.2 Transferability 144
5.8.3 Dependability
5.8.4 Confirmability
5.9 Ethical considerations
  5.9.1 Informed consent
  5.9.2 Violation of privacy/ anonymity/ confidentiality
  5.9.3 Restoration of respondents
  5.9.4 Deception of participants
  5.9.5 Responsibility in providing information
5.10 Reflexivity
5.11 Conclusion

CHAPTER 6: INFORMATION-GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS:
FINDINGS ON IDENTIFICATION OF TRAFFICKED CHILDREN

6.1 Introduction
6.2 Aim and objectives of the study
6.3 Descriptive data of study participants
6.4 Key themes arising from data collected
6.5 Identification of child victims of trafficking
  6.5.1 Victim identification
    6.5.1.1 Self-identification
    6.5.1.2 Identification of victims by community members
    6.5.1.3 Identification of victims by police officers
    6.5.1.4 Identification of victims by social workers
  6.5.2 Challenges in rapid identification of child victims
    6.5.2.1 Characteristic and nature of child trafficking
    6.5.2.2 Perceived benefits derived from the trafficking relationship
    6.5.2.3 Lack of knowledge among professionals
    6.5.2.4 Fear in children
    6.5.2.5 Trafficking by family members
  6.5.3 Re-thinking mechanisms for rapid identification
    6.5.3.1 Prescriptive policies and procedures
6.5.3.2 Harmonisation and alignment of child protection protocols 179
6.5.3.3 Social mobilisation efforts in communities 180
6.5.3.4 Development and training on child trafficking indicators 182
6.5.3.5 Litigation and the pursuit for justice 183
6.6 Conclusion 185

CHAPTER 7: INFORMATION-GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS: FINDINGS ON ASSISTANCE PROVISION 186
7.1 Introduction 186
7.2 Referral 188
   7.2.1 Referral system(s) in South Africa 188
   7.2.2 Strengthening referral mechanisms 190
7.3 Assistance provision: Responding to trafficked children’s needs 195
   7.3.1 Physical needs 196
   7.3.2 Psycho-emotional needs 199
   7.3.3 Medical/ health needs 205
   7.3.4 Social needs 207
   7.3.5 Legal needs 213
7.4 Challenges in assistance provision 218
   7.4.1 Safety 218
   7.4.2 Diverse and complex needs of trafficked children 221
   7.4.3 Matching lifestyle provided by pimps/ traffickers 223
   7.4.4 Pre-mature return and reintegration 224
7.5 Consequences of inappropriate assistance procedures 225
   7.5.1 Re-trafficking 225
   7.5.2 Shame and stigmatisation 227
   7.5.3 Secondary trauma and victimisation 229
   7.5.4 Trust and deconstruction of constructed identities 230
7.6 Conclusion 231
CHAPTER 8: THE DESIGN PHASE

8.1 Introduction

8.2 The design phase

8.2.1 Designing an observational system

8.2.1.1 Design objective

8.2.1.2 Design domain

8.2.1.3 Design requirements

8.2.2 Specifying procedural elements

8.2.2.1 Conversion and intervention design processes

a) Formulation of generalisations

b) Developing intervention guidelines

c) From design to product: Presentation of the guidelines

8.3 Conclusion

CHAPTER 9: EARLY DEVELOPMENT AND PILOT TESTING PHASE

9.1 Introduction

9.2 Developing a preliminary intervention

9.2.1 Purpose of a pilot study

9.2.2 Sampling/ participants

9.2.3 Determining development instrument(s)

9.2.3.1 Pre-testing the pilot testing instrument

9.2.4 Pilot implementation

9.3 Application of design criteria to the preliminary intervention and results of the pilot implementation

9.3.1 Objective capacity

9.3.2 Adequacy of intervention procedure

9.3.3 Ethical suitability

9.3.4 Usability

9.4 Synthesis of pilot implementation results

9.5 Developmental testing

9.5.1 Addressing design problems and revision of intervention
9.5.2 Revision of guidelines based on the Trafficking Act 286
9.6 Methods to ensure trustworthiness 288
9.7 Conclusion 290

PRESENTATION OF THE PSYCHOSOCIAL INTERVENTION GUIDELINES 291

CHAPTER 10: SUMMARY, LIMITATIONS, CONCLUSIONS AND
RECOMMENDATIONS 292

10.1 Introduction 292
10.2 Aim and objectives of the study 293
10.3 Summary of key findings 293
  10.3.1 Project identification, analysis and research planning phase 294
  10.3.2 Information-gathering, analysis and synthesis phase 295
  10.3.3 Design phase 297
  10.3.4 Early development and pilot testing phase 297
10.4 Limitations of the study 298
10.5 Conclusions of the study 299
  10.5.1 Project identification, analysis and research planning phase 299
  10.5.2 Information-gathering and synthesis phase 300
  10.5.3 Design phase 301
  10.5.4 Early development and pilot testing phase 302
10.6 Recommendations 302
  10.6.1 Social Work practice 302
  10.6.2 Social Work policy 305
  10.6.3 Social Work curriculum 306
  10.6.4 Future research with trafficked children 307
10.7 Concluding remarks 308

REFERENCES 309
APPENDICES/ ANNEXURES

Appendix A: UJ Ethics clearance letter 365
Appendix B: Interview schedule (children) 366
Appendix C: Interview schedule (informants: social workers) 368
Appendix D: Interview schedule (informants: stakeholders) 370
Appendix E: Letter requesting permission (children’s guardians) 372
Appendix F: Letter requesting permission (social workers) 374
Appendix G: Letter requesting permission (stakeholders) 376
Appendix H: Letter requesting consent/ assent (children) 378
Appendix I: Consent to audio record interviews 379
Appendix J: Transcribed interview (child) 380
Appendix K: Transcribed interview (social worker) 387
Appendix L: Transcribed interview (stakeholder) 394
Appendix M: Example of collage by child participant 402
Appendix N: Detailed profile of child participants 403
Appendix O: Evaluation form 404
Appendix P: Participant information letter (social workers) 409
Appendix Q: Consent form (pilot testing guidelines) 410
Appendix R: Evaluation response (social worker) 411

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Comparative perspectives on child development 22
Table 2.2: Exploitation experienced by trafficked children in different parts of the world 27
Table 2.3: Exploitation experienced by trafficked children according to age and gender 28
Table 2.4: Countries that are not part of the UN Trafficking Protocol 43
Table 3.1: D&D phases, research procedures, and processes 72
Table 4.1: Distinct features of human trafficking 90
Table 4.2: Psychosocial intervention issues in child trafficking 102
Table 5.1: Qualitative research in child trafficking research    122
Table 5.2: Sampling of study participants (triangulation of data sources)  124
Table 5.3: Phases of thematic analysis  135
Table 5.4: Comparison of criteria by research approach  141
Table 5.5: Application of trustworthiness in this child trafficking study  142
Table 6.1: Descriptive data of children as participants  154
Table 6.2: Descriptive data of social workers as key informants  155
Table 6.3: Descriptive information of stakeholders as key informants  156
Table 6.4: Themes arising from the qualitative data  158
Table 7.1: Themes arising from the qualitative data  187
Table 9.1: Application of trustworthiness during pilot implementation  289

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Facets of intervention research  65
Figure 3.2: The six-phases of the D&D model  66
Figure 3.3: Phases and activities of intervention research  70
Figure 4.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  83
Figure 5.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  121
Figure 6.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  152
Figure 7.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  186
Figure 8.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  233
Figure 8.2: Social work intervention targets with trafficked children  239
Figure 8.3: Creation of social work intervention guidelines  249
Figure 9.1: Phases and activities of intervention research  262
Figure 10.1: Recommended flow chart for identification of child victims of trafficking  303

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ACPF    African Child Policy Forum
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACRWC</td>
<td>African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AU</td>
<td>African Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCEA</td>
<td>Basic Conditions of Employment Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCI</td>
<td>Children Court Inquiries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCTV</td>
<td>Closed-Circuit Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPCR</td>
<td>Centre for the Protection of Children’s Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSE</td>
<td>Commercial Sexual Exploitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSEC</td>
<td>Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D&amp;D</td>
<td>Design and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoHA</td>
<td>Department of Home Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoJCD</td>
<td>Department of Justice and Constitutional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>Department of Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECPAT</td>
<td>End Child Prostitution and Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBO</td>
<td>Faith Based Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRW</td>
<td>Human Rights Watch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICMPD</td>
<td>International Centre for Migration Policy Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organisation for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>International Social Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KD</td>
<td>Knowledge Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KU</td>
<td>Knowledge Utilisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIDSA</td>
<td>Migration Dialogue for Southern Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NICTIP</td>
<td>Inter-sectoral Committee National on Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>National Prosecuting Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPO</td>
<td>Non-Profit Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODIHR</td>
<td>Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHCHR</td>
<td>Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>Oliver Reginald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVC</td>
<td>Orphans and Vulnerable Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCI</td>
<td>Red Cross International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSA</td>
<td>Republic of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACSSP</td>
<td>South African Council for Social Services Professions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAIRR</td>
<td>South African Institute of Race Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPA</td>
<td>South African Press Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS</td>
<td>South African Police Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>StatsSA</td>
<td>Statistics South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIP</td>
<td>Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>United Arab Emirates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UJ</td>
<td>University of Johannesburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCRC</td>
<td>United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Education and Scientific Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN.GIFT</td>
<td>United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>United Nations High Commission for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USD</td>
<td>United States Dollar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZAR</td>
<td>South African Rand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“The happiness and welfare of the children, at once, the most vulnerable citizens in any society and the greatest of our treasures. The children must, at last, play in the open veld, no longer tortured by the pangs of hunger or ravaged by disease or threatened with the scourge of ignorance, molestation and abuse, and no longer required to engage in deeds whose gravity exceeds the demands of their tender years.”

Nelson Mandela (Nobel Lecture, 1993)
CHAPTER 1
GENERAL ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY

1.1 INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

Violence and abuse against children and the exploitation of children worldwide has become a growing concern in the past decade. Child trafficking is a multiple human rights violation and a global public health, criminal justice, economic, and social issue. The United Nations (UN) Trafficking Protocol (2000) defines child trafficking as the recruitment, transportation, and receipt of children for purposes of exploitation. This definition includes all children under the age of 18 who have been trafficked with or without their consent for forced labour, illegal adoption, sexually exploitative practices, and for illegal body organ trade (Gozdziaik & Bump, 2008; Kropiwnicki, 2007; Martens, Pieczkowski & Van Vuuren-Smyth, 2003; Touzenis, 2010). From this definition, it is evident that child trafficking is a spatial phenomenon embedded in socio-cultural relations, which can overlap with smuggling, refugeeism, prostitution, and child labour, making it a complex issue with varied manifestations.

Worldwide, it is estimated that 1.2 million children are trafficked each year (United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF), 2007). Children’s rights, which are fundamental to their growth and development, are violated when trafficking occurs. Child trafficking presents grave risks and enormous damage to the psychosocial development and well-being of children. It threatens children’s protection. Furthermore, children’s rights to survival, development, and participation are violated through the act of trafficking.

According to the International Organization for Migration’s (IOM) guidelines (2007), understanding child trafficking is premised on the legal context, children’s rights, the criminals involved, and the child victim. However, wider ecological factors may also influence child trafficking, its identification, and manifestation. This study explores the identification and assistance provision to non-South African trafficked children with the aim of designing a social technology for social workers working with this vulnerable population in South Africa.
1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

The past decade has seen rapid globalisation trends and migration patterns giving rise to increased estimates of trafficked victims worldwide. Diverse trafficking perspectives have been forwarded, describing trafficking as a problem of organised crime (Walklate, 2011); migration (Chapkins, 2003; United Nations Education and Scientific Organization (UNESCO), 2007); human rights (Adams, 2011; Bustamante, 2002; UNESCO, 2007); morality (Kennedy, 2010; UNICEF, 2001); labour (De Lange, 2007; Dowling, Moreton & Wright, 2010); as a developmental issue (UNESCO, 2007; UNICEF, 2003; Sawadogo, 2012) and as a problem of global inequalities and globalisation (Brunovskis & Tyldum, 2004; Davy, 2012). These diverse yet inter-linked perspectives are of great significance to the recognition, identification, management, and prevention of transnational human trafficking.

The construction of childhood and meanings associated with childhood during this era of globalisation and increased child trafficking presents challenges to social workers (Finn, Nybell & Shook, 2010; James & James, 2004; Rigby, 2011). Child trafficking violates multiple fundamental rights of children and presents grave risks to their psychosocial development and functioning (Fong & Cardoso, 2010; Rafferty, 2008; Zimmerman, 2003). Although some trafficked children emerge as resilient, it is unlikely that they will self-identify as victims of trafficking; thus it is important to develop rapid identification methods to reach out to victims. Once out of a trafficking situation, it is essential that the immediate response ensures that the child’s basic needs are met, even before any formal assessments can be undertaken. It has been widely reported that traffickers have attempted to infiltrate counter-trafficking agencies that provide assistance to victims in an attempt, to locate their victims who have escaped and are likely to testify against the traffickers (IOM, 2007). Although they can be resilient, trafficked children are still victims of serious crimes and regular risk assessments, safety arrangements, and procedures are necessary. Recent research in the field has shown that trafficked children suffer and continue to be at risk, because social workers lack the required skills to identify them and intervene on their behalf (Pearce, 2011; Rigby, 2011; Sambo, 2009; Wirtz, 2009). Although identifying trafficked children is a challenging task, it is the first crucial step towards
providing the assistance, care, and protection to which these children are entitled (Craggs & Martens, 2010; Pearce, 2011).

Recent developments in the field of child protection have led to a renewed interest in child trafficking, and there has been much discussion on the prevalence of child trafficking and prevention strategies by agencies such as UNICEF, United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR), UNESCO, International Labour Organization (ILO), IOM and United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT). However, the field is evolving to include victims’ rights, reintegration, and repatriation procedures (IOM, 2007; UNICEF, 2006). While the discussions make some good points towards recognition of trafficking, there are serious problems with the manner in which trafficked victims’ needs are met, and their level of participation in the creation of these strategies. Therefore, victim and user involvement in identification and case management of trafficking remains scarcely understood, largely misunderstood and under-developed (Beresford, 2012; UNICEF, 2009).

Some international studies have looked at how trafficked persons perceive and experience their life post-trafficking, and how they value various legal and administrative assistance (Bjerkan & Dyrlid, 2006; Altamura et al., 2009; UNICEF, 2003; Zimmerman, Hossain, Yun, Roche, Morison & Watts, 2006). The studies acknowledge that the severity and range of symptoms exhibited by trafficked persons usually indicates the importance of intervening rapidly and holistically. Surtees’ (2007) study on victim assistance highlighted the victims’ need for access to information and their right to be treated with dignity. The findings further revealed the need for more government-supported intervention strategies, and the victims’ participation in the development and implementation of interventions. Kaufman and Crawford (2011), Potocky (2010), and Brunovskis and Surtees (2012b) have studied the effectiveness of trafficking interventions. From these studies, it is evident that when interventions are developed and implemented without sound evaluation methods, it is possible that the interventions may be ineffective, inappropriate, and may have unintended negative effects.
Challenges in assistance provision to victims of trafficking have been reported in various international studies by Brunovskis and Surtees (2012c); Clawson, Dutch, Salomon and Grace (2009); Gozdziak and MacDonnell (2007) and Potocky (2010). These challenges include: linguistic and cultural barriers, ill treatment of victims, and uneven safety and security procedures. These challenges subsequently jeopardise the victims’ recovery, infringes on their rights, and they continue to live lives of perpetual crisis, fear, and instability. Without a doubt, interventions need to address not only the immediate needs of the trafficked children in the short term, but also broader fundamental socio-economic issues and human rights. The evidence from literature also indicates that clarity is needed in terms of the type and quality of services received by trafficking victims and the effectiveness thereof (Fawcett, 2012; Kaufman & Crawford, 2011; Potocky, 2012).

While referral and assistance interventions are relatively well-documented in Asia and Europe (Delaney & Cotterill, 2005; Pearce, 2011; Wolfensohn, 2004; Yea, 2010, Zimmerman et al., 2006), little is known about trafficking interventions in South Africa. Whereas trafficking interventions have been formulated for health care providers (ILO et al. 2009; Isaac, Solak & Giardino, 2011; Zimmerman & Borland, 2009) and law enforcement (Gallagher & Holmes, 2008; IOM & Austrian Federal Ministry of the Interior (FM.I, 2006), social work, as a professional discipline worldwide, and in South Africa specifically, needs to engage with child trafficking more intensely than it has done up till now. As noted by Rosen and Proctor (2003a, p. 8), social work generally “has the responsibility to develop, organize and elucidate its practice knowledge”, and guideline development can be a part of social work practice (Fraser, 2004; Marsh & Fisher, 2007). If identification and initial assistance in the post-trafficking phase is handled inefficiently, it has the potential to further disrupt the child’s growth and development and can lead to re-trafficking (Centre for the Protection of Children’s Rights (CPCR), 2006; IOM, 2007; Jobe, 2010). As members of the caring profession, it is essential that social workers are able to respond professionally to the needs of trafficked children. Unfortunately, South Africa lacks literature on how cross-border trafficked children experience, perceive, and understand identification and initial assistance processes. Thus, there is a gap in South African theoretical literature on child trafficking practice guidelines. The result is that social work
knowledge of victim assistance within child trafficking has not kept pace with the growing social issue in South Africa.

1.3 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY

Transnational trafficking is complex in nature and form. It is the least researched form of international movement of persons, yet it is vastly lucrative and exceedingly damaging to the human dignity (Akee, Bedi, Basu & Chau, 2011; Sawadogo, 2012). Children who are trafficked happen to belong to an already vulnerable population of children needing care and protection. From a migration framework, children who have been trafficked across borders lack control of the journey’s outcome, they have to rely on the recruiter or the recruiters networks, they have limited economic resources, and they often travel on false documents thus entering the destination country in an extremely vulnerable position (Brunovskis & Tyldum, 2004). Subsequently, children’s vulnerability as children and as (illegal) migrants gets exploited.

The exact number and demographics of trafficked children is unknown worldwide, including in South Africa. A UNODC report by Chatzis (2013) and the transnational political criminal nexus of trafficking by Hughes and Denisova (2001) indicates that there are transnational challenges in investigating trafficking offences as trafficking methods are flexible, traffickers operate across borders with ease and trafficking is linked to other crimes such as corruption, money laundering, organized crime and fraud. According to the United States Trafficking in Persons (US TIP) Report (2013), information from governments that were consulted show that approximately 40,000 victims were identified worldwide in 2012, against the 27 million estimate that is provided by researchers. This has an impact on identification and assistance provisions to victims, as only a fraction of the victims receive care, support, and protection that they rightly deserve.

According to the US-TIP Report (2013), several countries such as US, Canada, Haiti, Gambia, Netherlands, Thailand, Bulgaria, and South Africa have been identified as trafficking source, destination, and transit countries. According to the Lexis Nexis’s Human Trafficking Awareness Index (2013), media articles across Africa report that
54.5% of trafficked victims in Africa are children. In South Africa, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) report that 60% of trafficking victims are children (US-TIP Report, 2010; 2012). Trafficking patterns are reported to run from north to south of Africa with the majority of children who are trafficked into South Africa originating from the neighbouring Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries and Asian countries. Consequently, addressing child trafficking became a child protection priority for the South African government, with the inclusion of Chapter 18 in the Children’s Act (38 of 2005) which exclusively addressed child trafficking (September, 2006). Chapter 18 of the Children’s Act has subsequently been repealed and amended for inclusion as Chapter 4 in the South African Trafficking Act (2013).

The findings from studies by UNICEF (2003), Martens et al., (2003), Allais et al., (2010), and Molo Songololo (2000; 2003) show that child trafficking is not gendered and that the majority of victims are trafficked to South Africa for sexual and labour exploitation. Further studies in South Africa by Sambo (2009) and Sambo and Spies (2012) have advocated for the crucial role of the social worker within child trafficking interventions. Interestingly, studies addressing trafficking for sexual exploitation in South Africa appear to be more prominent (Hilton, 2007; Kennedy, 2010; Kropiwnicki, 2012; Kruger & Oosthuizen, 2012; Lutya, 2010). Furthermore, studies on trafficking-related legislation and child protection policies in South Africa have been done by Horn (2009), Kreston (2007), Kruger (2012a), and September (2006).

Victim identification and assistance and victim-centred research were key gaps identified in international studies by Bokhari (2008), Brunovskis and Surtees (2008; 2012a), Bump and Duncan (2003), Gozdziak (2010), Sigmon (2008) and Rigby (2011), and in South African studies by Sambo and Spies (2012) and Allais et al. (2010). Lack of victim support and protection and prosecution of perpetrators that results from inadequate victim identification prompted the theme of the 2013 US TIP Report i.e. “Victim identification: The first step in stopping modern slavery”. The research gap was also identified from the researcher’s professional experience as a social worker and an anti-trafficking country coordinator. Limited research on the identification and assistance provision to child victims of transnational trafficking is a cause for concern because the South African Trafficking Act (2013) calls upon social
workers to respond to and provide support and assistance to trafficked victims. This is stipulated in sections 18(5)(6)(7), 31(a)(b)(c)(d), whereas section 41(c) calls for the development of guidelines for the identification of victims.

1.4 RESEARCH PROBLEM FORMULATION

Article 25 of the UN Trafficking Protocol states that appropriate measures of assistance, within each country’s means, ought to be put in place to protect victims of trafficking from retaliation and intimidation, and to provide assistance and protection. Although South Africa is a signatory to the UN Trafficking Protocol and there is trafficking legislation in place, the operationalisation of the new legislation is lagging behind (South African Press Association (SAPA), 2013b). Furthermore, South Africa does not have updated formal standard operating procedures to ensure appropriate identification and referral of child victims of trafficking for assistance at all times. The standard operating procedures were introduced to deal with child trafficking cases during the 2010 Soccer World Cup, and further application of the procedures is only linked to major sporting events in South Africa and remains undocumented. In addition, the country still lacks guidelines for general service provisions to child victims of trafficking.

It is essential that social workers respond to issues related to power, dominance, and diversity within social work practice and policy formulation. According to Sawadogo (2012, p. 96), transnational crimes are an old global phenomenon which

“have recently taken complex, dramatic, shocking, and even deadly new dimensions with the wake of globalisation...globalisation has ironically increased the power vacuum by empowering criminal networks so much that assaults on human dignity continue to increase proportionally to the growing globalization.”

UNODC report by Chatzis (2013) indicates that cross-border trafficking is the highest form of trafficking worldwide at 45%. This is followed by in-country/ domestic trafficking at 27%, transcontinental trafficking at 24% and trafficking from nearby sub-regions at 4%. Transnational child trafficking is an outcome of macro-social processes which continues to grow and it inevitably continues to influence the responsibilities expected of social workers through globalisation of social work
practice. Although there is limited information available, anecdotal reports suggest that child protection agencies in South Africa have not been equipped to fully address the issue of child trafficking, despite legislation requiring social workers to engage with child victims of trafficking. The specific trafficked population (i.e. men, women or children) accommodated in the 13 shelters that were identified countrywide for upgrades, is unknown. The Department of Social Development (DSD) also reports training 270 social workers around South Africa on the identification of trafficking victims (US TIP Report, 2011). Dr. Joan Groenewald at DSD (personal communication, 27 August 2013) indicated that a further 270 social workers were trained in 2013 to assist with the implementation of the Trafficking Act (2013). It is not possible for the researcher to establish the impact of the training, because only three months have elapsed since the Trafficking Act (2013) was passed. In addition, it was difficult to establish outcomes because Dr. Groenewald’s position is vacant following her retirement. In recent years, there has been an increasing interest in child trafficking in Southern Africa with Migration Dialogue for Southern Africa (MIDSA) (2007) calling for the development of effective legislation to address migration-related issues including trafficking, through the development and implementation of guidelines. However, no social work research to date has been conducted on the phenomenon of victim assistance from a developmental-ecological-child rights nexus in South Africa.

In this study, victim assistance is looked at with regard to the identification and provision of immediate needs, and is further aligned with the social work principles of non-discrimination, participation, and the right to privacy and individualised treatment and care. According to Elliott and Segal (2012), IOM (2007), and Surtees (2007), effective provision of victim assistance is potentially empowering to victims, and it is significant in their immediate stabilisation and long-term recovery. Transformative, victim-centred social work practice emphasises the principles of self-determination and participation. When victims and service-users are invited to participate in the development of interventions, benefits such as heightened sense of self-worth, renewed sense of hope and energy, perseverance, and a sense of belonging have been noted (Beresford, 2012; Fawcett, 2012; Fisher, 2002; Fisher, 2011). However, according to Stoesz and Karger (2012, p. 657), “social work systematically avoids sampling clients to determine their satisfaction with the services provided”. In this
study, the researcher is interested in how the various fragmented identification and initial assistance frameworks are understood, perceived, and experienced by children trafficked into South Africa. It is hoped that by listening to these children and presenting their articulated perceptions, a standard guideline will be created and subsequently applied as a springboard for change (Proctor & Rosen, 2003b). Certainly in the majority of cases, it is only through correct identification that trafficked children will receive the protection and assistance that they need.

1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY
The main aim of this study was to design a psychosocial intervention guideline for social workers working with transnational trafficked children, as guidelines have proved to be unique in informing and guiding practice and shaping interventions. In order to achieve the above-mentioned aim, the following study objectives were formulated:

   i) to analyse the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa
   ii) to gather information on how transnational trafficked children experience identification and assistance provision procedures;
   iii) to design guidelines for social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking;
   iv) to evaluate the feasibility of the guidelines with social workers in the field; and
   v) to provide recommendations to social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking.

1.6 RESEARCH QUESTIONS
The research questions that this study addressed were:
   i) How widespread is child trafficking and what are the characteristics associated with it?
   ii) What are the experiences and needs of children who have been trafficked transnationally, with specific reference to identification and assistance provision?
iii) What components provided by the research data can be used to generate psychosocial guidelines that promote a trafficked child’s well-being?

iv) What elements in the developed guidelines indicate that it is a practical tool for use by social workers?

v) What recommendations from the study can assist social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking?

1.7 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The goal of the research was applied research, which emphasises solving real problems in practice (Fouche & De Vos, 2011). A qualitative research approach was applied throughout this study. The researcher undertook intervention research because it is ideal in developing a social technology for working on a practical level with trafficked children (Strydom, Steyn & Strydom, 2007) and also because it can illustrate settings and procedures for guideline and policy implementation (Anderson, 2010). Rothman and Thomas’s (1994) Design and Development (D&D) model was contextualised to this study and the first four phases namely problem analysis and project planning; information gathering and synthesis; design and early development; and pilot testing were used. These phases were complemented by activities described in Thomas’s (1984) developmental model. The D&D phases, briefly described next, are outlined vertically and performed in a step-by-step sequence, although they merged and overlapped.

Phase 1: Problem analysis and research planning

In this phase, understanding the social problem to be studied was crucial. Qualitative research was applied towards problem comprehension, and the main activities in achieving this included problem identification and problem analysis, conducting a state-of-the-art review, and a feasibility study (Rothman & Thomas, 1994; Thomas, 1984). Trafficked children are a vital source of information, and they have issues that are of current and emerging interest (ILO, UNICEF & UN.GIFT, 2009). The researcher was able to recognise during practice, through collaborative relationships and through literature reviews that rapid identification and the provision of assistance were key concerns facing children who had been trafficked into South Africa. This
Phase 2: Information gathering, analysis, and synthesis

The main activities in this phase are document study and studying natural examples. Rothman and Thomas (1994) emphasise the importance of knowing what has been done previously to understand and address the current issue. Thus, document analysis was used as a qualitative research method (Bowen, 2009). Previous experiences can be identified by examining existing information sources, conducting empirical studies, and identifying functional elements of interventions. The researcher consulted, reviewed, and interpreted international and South African literature on trafficking in multiple ways, thus theory triangulation was applied (Weyers, Strydom & Huisamen, 2008). Qualitative research was applied when collecting, analysing, and interpreting data from the study participants. The approach was used to give deep meaning and provide rich details in line with the research aim (Babbie & Mouton, 2005; Fouche, 2005). A narrative research design was used because the researcher was concerned with, and wanted to explore the experiences of the trafficked children and key informants (Czarniawska, 2004; Moen, 2006). All interviews were recorded with the participants' consent. Data triangulation was used and interviews were conducted with 22 key informants about identification and assistance provision to trafficked children (Shenton, 2004; Weyers et al., 2008). All data collected was analysed using thematic analysis, resulting in the identification of themes and sub-themes. The data was subjected to literature control enabling verification, comparisons and contrasts to be made. This phase is discussed in depth in Chapters 5, 6, and 7.

Phase 3: Design

The design objective of this study was to create a social work intervention guideline to use with trafficked children. The main activities of this phase included designing observational elements and specifying procedural elements. A qualitative research approach was used in this phase because the design framework, activities, and direction could be swiftly reviewed and amalgamated as new information arose (Anderson, 2010). Intervention is conceptualized as a set of interacting elements;
thus in this phase of the study, the intervention design domains included the social workers, trafficked children, and the agency. According to Mullen (1994), these conceptions of intervention and its components were used to frame the pertinent areas of design. Conversion and intervention design processes were intertwined and the data was manipulated meaningfully to giving rise to the guidelines, which focused on the promotion and protection of children’s rights, the identification, referral of, and psychosocial assistance for trafficked children. This phase is discussed in depth in Chapter 8.

**Phase 4: Early development and pilot testing**

According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 36), during the early development and pilot testing phase, a “primitive design is evolved to a form that can be evaluated under field conditions”. The activities in this phase include developing a preliminary intervention, application of design criteria to preliminary intervention, reporting results of pilot implementation, and developmental testing. To achieve this, evaluation forms were used in the first instance, followed by participant telephonic interviews to check and to fill out the section allocated to descriptive information. Pilot tests of the model were not conducted with trafficked children due to the nature of child trafficking. However, the intervention guidelines were evaluated by social workers as the intended users of the guidelines, and their feedback was subsequently included in the guidelines. This phase is discussed in depth in Chapter 9.

**1.8 LENS OF APPROACH: ECOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

Social work is premised on the notion of the person-in-environment. Evidence suggests that the nature of social work is embedded on the environment as being crucial to a person’s biological and social existence, functioning and survival. The ecological model was applied as an attempt to understand the needs and experiences of child victims of trafficking, and the possible multi-pronged intervention strategies that a social worker can apply at different levels. In the different levels of intervention, there is identification of the strengths within the eco-systems, which can get sustenance from human rights principles (Wronka & Bernasconi, 2012). In addition, recognition is given to the fact that risk and resilience are not independent,
but that they constantly interact with each other, thereby influencing an individual’s adaptation (Liao & Hong, 2011; Jack, 2012; Kropiwnicki, 2007).

The assessments and interventions that emerge from the systems framework take into consideration the larger social and environmental contexts and the reciprocal interactions that occur. Kropiwnicki (2007) and Rafferty (2008) propose that the ecological framework is an ideal approach in conceptualising elements of vulnerability and resilience linked to child trafficking; as the framework emphasises the relationship between people and their environment, rather than examining the elements in isolation.

Although extensive research has been done on child trafficking, no single research in South Africa investigates child trafficking interventions in the context of the ecological framework. The ecological framework was thus applied in order to capture and illustrate the dynamic, mutually reciprocal, and bi-directional influence of the environment on trafficked children. In line with Bronfenbrenner’s (1994) and Schoon and Bynner’s (2003) arguments, the application of the ecological theory in this study is consistent with developmental, psychosocial, and risk and resilience frameworks. This is because within the conceptualisation of ecological-based interventions, post-trafficking stressors can be minimised; negative feelings and thoughts can be regulated (Alston & Besthorn, 2012); power inequities and imbalances can be negotiated (Wronka & Bernasconi, 2012; Hugman, 2012); a culture of listening created; informal social networks promoted (Jack, 2012); and an overall holistic state of homeostasis achieved.

1.9 DEFINITION OF KEY CONCEPTS OF STUDY
While a variety of definitions of the key concepts of the study mentioned next have been suggested, this thesis used the following definitions:

1.9.1 Trafficking
Trafficking is “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of
vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs” (Palermo Protocol, 2000). In this study, trafficking shall refer to human trafficking and not drug trafficking or gun-running. The focus of this study is on trafficking at a transnational/cross-border level within the SADC region. The terms transnational and cross-border may be used interchangeably in the study to mean the same thing.

1.9.2 Child
The South African Children’s Act (2005), the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (1989) and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (ACRWC) (1990) state that a child is any person who is below the age of 18. UNCRC (1989) and the Children’s Act (2005) both indicate that there is no difference between the concepts ‘child’ and ‘minor’. Thus, these words are used interchangeably in the study to mean a person below the legal age of majority, including adolescents. The trafficked children who participated in this study were aged between 9 and 14 when they were rescued from trafficking.

1.9.3 Child trafficking
According to the UN Trafficking Protocol article 3(c) and (d), “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in sub-paragraph (a) and “Child” shall mean any person under eighteen years of age. However, according to the Children’s Act 38 (2005 as amended), “trafficking in relation to a child means the recruitment, sale, supply, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of children, within or across the borders of the Republic by any means, including the use of threat, force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or the giving of receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control of a child, or due to a position of vulnerability, for the purpose of exploitation; and includes the adoption of a child facilitated or secured through illegal means”.

The above definitions differ. The Children’s Act definition implies that there has to be a means for it to be child trafficking, whereas the UN Trafficking Protocol implies that the means used is irrelevant. However, if a child is trafficked and there is explicit means used, then it is also trafficking. Therefore, for purposes of this research, child trafficking entails the supply, delivery, recruitment, procurement, capture, removal, transportation, transfer, harbouring, sale, exchange, lease, disposal, or receiving of a child, across the borders of South Africa, with or without means, for the purpose of exploitation. The purpose of exploitation shall include but is not limited to illegal activities that present risk to a child’s health and wellbeing such as begging, the removal and sale of the child’s body parts and organs, child prostitution, child pornography and other forms of sexual exploitation, child forced/bonded labour, slavery or practices similar to slavery, illegal adoption, forced marriage and participation in armed conflict.

1.9.4 Victim
The term ‘victim’ seems to carry along undesirable connotations of being damaged, weak, vulnerable, hopeless, and powerless. Victims who do not fit these idealised notions of vulnerability tend to be considered invisible in victimology studies. This study adopted IOM’s (2007) definition that a victim is someone (including non-South African child) who has faced social injustices and other human rights violations for which the perpetrator is responsible.

According to Herman (2001, p. 3) victims “challenge us to reconnect fragments, to reconstruct history, to make meaning of their present symptoms in the light of past events”. In this study, the concept “victim” highlights child trafficking victims right to development, protection, and assistance, and the government and other NGOs responsibility to provide for them.

1.9.5 Presumed victim
This term ‘presumed victim’ refers to “persons who are presumed to be victims of trafficking (having met the criteria of the UN Trafficking Protocol) but who have not been formally identified by the relevant authorities or have declined to be formally or
legally identified” (Surtees, 2007, p. 35). In this research, it refers to a child who is vulnerable, in need of care, and is highly suspected to have been trafficked but one who has not been identified as a victim of trafficking according to formal identification mechanisms and processes.

1.9.6 Identification and identified victim
Identification is the “institutional process that allows the potential victims of trafficking and related violence to obtain access to programmes of assistance and protection” (Aradau, 2004, p. 43). In this study, an identified victim means that the specific child trafficking indicators and pre-determination or assessment questions have been applied to ascertain that a child is a victim of trafficking.

1.9.7 Assistance provision
These are measures, programmes, and services aimed at the recovery of trafficked children as offered by governmental and NGOs in countries of destination (UN Palermo Protocol, 2000). According to article 12 of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (2005) “measures that may be necessary to assist victims in their physical, psychological, and social recovery shall include at least:

a) standards of living capable of ensuring their subsistence, through such measures as: appropriate and secure accommodation, psychological and material assistance;
b) access to emergency medical treatment;
c) translation and interpretation services, when appropriate;
d) counselling and information, in particular as regards their legal rights and the services available to them, in a language that they can understand;
e) assistance to enable their rights and interests to be presented and considered at appropriate stages of criminal proceedings against offenders;
f) access to education for children.

These measures shall apply to all forms of trafficking in human beings, whether national or transnational, whether or not connected with organised crime”. The assistance may also involve one or multiple services mentioned.
1.9.8 Intervention guidelines

According to Rosen and Proctor (2003a, p. 1), intervention guidelines are a “set of systematically compiled and organized knowledge statements that are designed to enable practitioners to find, select, and use the interventions that are the most effective and appropriate”. The aim of intervention or practice guidelines is to guide decisions made by practitioners. Intervention guidelines normally describe a range of researched and commonly accepted approaches, which define practices that meet the needs of the client population in most circumstances (National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute, 2013). In this study, the terms ‘practice guidelines’ and ‘intervention guidelines’ are used interchangeably.

1.9.9 Psychosocial

Psychosocial is an individual’s interrelationship, development in and interaction with their social environment. It entails a combination or interaction between social and psychological factors or aspects. For purposes of this research, the meaning attached to psychosocial is used to investigate the trafficked children's challenges and growth points as they interact with elements within their social environment.

1.10 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

This research adapted Zimmerman and Watts’ (2003) World Health Organization’s (WHO) Ethical and Safety Recommendations for Interviewing Trafficked Women and Schenk and Williamson’s (2005) Ethical approaches to gathering information from children and adolescents in international settings. All participation in this study was voluntary. The researcher, as the principal data collector, ensured respect of the children’s dignity, privacy, protection of their identity, and the use of child-friendly language. Assent from the children and informed consent was obtained from the children’s guardians and study informants. Confidentiality and anonymity was ensured, with the researcher having sole access to the audio and digitally-recorded material.

The study participants were not obliged to give any identifying information, and, when they did so, this was camouflaged in the research report; so that the children’s narratives cannot easily be recognised or pose risks or breaches of privacy for the
child, his/her family, and/or the organisation providing assistance. Every effort was made to ensure that the interviews do not cause further harm to the children. The research was carried out with integrity, and all the participants were treated respectfully at all times (Alderson, 1995). The University of Johannesburg’s (UJ) research ethics policy was adhered to when conducting the study. The Faculty of Humanities Ethics Committee at UJ provided permission for the research to be conducted (Appendix A).

1.11 ORGANISATION OF THE STUDY

Chapter 1: In the introduction, the general focus of the study and the research problem are outlined. The motivation, aim, and objectives of the study are discussed. In addition, an overview of the research methodology, theoretical approach, ethical considerations, and key concepts of the study are presented.

Chapter 2: This chapter reviews literature on child trafficking, focusing on the causes and consequences of trafficking, as well as the legislative frameworks and a discussion on South Africa as the context of the study. Further discussions are on understanding legislation and policy in light of the ecological theory and child rights approach.

Chapter 3: In this research methodology chapter, intervention research is discussed and the D&D is presented as an intervention model and its application to child trafficking research. Next, the four out of six phases of the D&D model that are contextualised and applied to this study are discussed.

Chapter 4: This chapter presents a discussion on the first phase of the D&D model, i.e. problem identification, analysis, and research planning. It reports on the results of the analysis phase, where child trafficking as a research and social work issue was identified. It includes a review of literature, including existing guidelines and the feasibility study that was conducted.

Chapter 5: This chapter discusses the second phase of the D&D model i.e. information gathering, with a specific focus on empirical study. Furthermore, ways of
ensuring the trustworthiness of the research are discussed. In addition, ethical considerations and reflexivity are present at length.

**Chapter 6**: This chapter discusses the second phase of the D&D model i.e. information analysis and synthesis. This chapter presents, investigates, and discusses data collected through primary data collection methods, with specific reference to identification of trafficked children.

**Chapter 7**: This chapter also discusses the second phase of the D&D model i.e. information analysis and synthesis. The chapter presents, investigates, and discusses data collected through primary data collection methods, with specific reference to assistance provision.

**Chapter 8**: Phase Three, i.e. the design phase, is discussed in this chapter. This chapter presents the outcome of the design phase. There is discussion on the systematic creation and application of knowledge in the design and development of the intervention guideline document.

**Chapter 9**: Phase Four, i.e. early development and pilot testing results, is discussed in this chapter. The results from the pilot test phase are presented. The aspects of the guidelines that were re-designed are presented and briefly discussed. The revised guideline document is presented after this chapter.

**Chapter 10**: This chapter contains limitations, a summary of findings, and conclusions. There are also discussions on the implications of the findings for social work practice and the social work curriculum, and recommendations for policy and future research.

**1.12 CONCLUSION**

This chapter provided a general orientation to the field of study. This chapter has illustrated the gap within transnational child trafficking victim identification and assistance provision during problem formulation. The aim and objectives of the study are presented. In addition, there is an overview of the D&D model and motivation for
its suitability for this study. There is a brief discussion on the ecological framework as the theoretical approach used. The key concepts used in the study are defined and the organisation of the study is presented.

The next chapter reviews the literature on child trafficking focusing on the general causes and consequences of trafficking, the legislative frameworks, and a discussion on South Africa as the context of the study.
CHAPTER 2
THE CONTEXT OF THE STUDY AND LEGAL TRAFFICKING FRAMEWORKS

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter engages with key contextual background information on child trafficking as a global and local (South African) issue. Trafficking is presented as an issue affecting childhood development across many countries globally. The discussions give general and somewhat specific information on South Africa’s socio-economic, political, and geographical dynamics, which act as pull factors. This enriches the study, because by putting statements in contexts, explanations, interpretations, and readiness for social technologies/interventions can be established.

Trafficking of children is prohibited under several international and regional conventions and their protocols. The main thrust of this chapter is to provide background information on child trafficking and thereafter review relevant international, regional, and South African legislative frameworks, protocols, policies, and action plans that apply to child trafficking. These legislative frameworks, their implications, criticisms, and potential for creating a coherent response to child trafficking are discussed. In addition, the chapter illustrates the shifts and the key changes that have taken place over time. The chapter also attempts to explain the legislative frameworks within the ecological and child-rights approach. The review attempts to inform the discussion on the design and development of the psychosocial intervention guidelines document.

Document analysis as a qualitative research method was used extensively in this chapter. The documents that were reviewed included books, journal articles, maps, conventions and legislations, organisational reports, and research reports. The analytic procedure that was followed entailed “finding, selecting, appraising (making sense of), and synthesising data contained in documents” (Bowen, 2009, p. 28). In this chapter, document analysis was used to provide background and the context of the study, to inform questions that needed to be asked during the primary data
collection process, and as a means of tracking change and development in the legislative frameworks (Bowen, 2009).

2.2 HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A DEVELOPMENTAL CONTEXTUAL PERSPECTIVE

Child development occurs in multiple nested environments and children are not mere recipients of environmental impacts. Childhood has many faces because numerous factors influence a child's developmental pathway, their patterns of risks, resilience and resources, challenges and support networks. Child development is thus significant within the study of child trafficking in order to gain insight into the origins, prevention and treatment of developmental problems caused by trafficking and to optimize conditions of development once a child has been rescued from a trafficking situation.

According to Dottridge and Jordan (2012), the dependency of young children, under the age of 12, has not been recognized even in international documents. Traffickers and exploiters keep children under the age of 12 in states of dependency which is not necessarily one of the conventional methods of controlling or forcing a child to work. By focusing on forceful predictable trafficking methods, considerations on child psychology and children's capacity is overlooked. A comparison of two of Freud’s psychosexual, Erikson's (1963) psychosocial and Piaget's (1963) cognitive stages of development is presented in Table 2.1., as relates to this study.

Table 2.1 Comparative perspectives on child development (adapted from Rathus, 2006, pp. 10, 20, 30)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Freud's psychosexual development</th>
<th>Erikson's psychosocial development</th>
<th>Piaget's cognitive development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Core concept: Instinctive impulses are channelled via social codes, but conflict</td>
<td>Core concept: Child (and adult) experiences life crises that are largely based on social relationships,</td>
<td>Core concept: children adapt to the environment via processes of assimilation to existing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Much of the mind is unconscious. Mental structures (schemes) or by changing these structures (accommodation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latency stage: Sexual impulses are suppressed, allowing the child to focus on development of social and technological skills</th>
<th>Industry versus inferiority: The development task is to become absorbed in the development and implementation of skills, to master the basis of technology, to become productive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6-12 years</td>
<td>Concrete operational stage: Logical mental actions-called operations-begin. The child develops conservation concepts, can adopt viewpoints of others, can classify objects in series, and shows comprehension of basic relational concepts (such as one object being heavier than another)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adolescence</td>
<td>Identify versus role confusion: The developmental task is to associate one’s skills and social roles with the development of career goals. More broadly, the development of identity refers to a sense of who one is and what one believes in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genital stage: Reappearance of sexual impulses, with gratification sought through sexual relations with an adult of the other sex</td>
<td>Formal operational stage: Mature, adult thought emerges. Thinking is characterized by deductive logic, consideration of various possibilities (mental trial and error), abstract thought, and the formation and testing of hypothesis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Childhood is a time of innocence, discovery and vulnerability. In being consistent with this image, children should not experience or witness violence or any other human rights violations and neither should they take part in such activities. In reality, children are denied their fundamental rights when trafficking occurs and they may not able to achieve the milestones mentioned in Table 2.1 successfully. A child’s developmental (st)age might put them at greater risk of being trafficked (Dottridge & Jordan, 2012;
Lutya, 2010; Rafferty, 2008) because they are easy to lure, trick and manipulate. Children are less likely to request for higher wages or better living conditions and they are more trusting and less able to demand or negotiate rights. Dottridge and Jordan (2012, p. 11) argue that “children are more malleable that adults and so they are easier to control once they are removed from their family environment and are dependent on strangers” for basic needs. When these young and vulnerable children lack options other than to do as they are told, they swiftly conform. In certain instances, some exploiters justify employing children because of their small (physical size) for certain types of jobs. The intercultural implications of silence have also been used to exploit children. In Africa, similarly to Asian countries, silence is used to promote harmony, cooperation and it is a sign of mutual respect, personal dignity and affirmation (Robinson, 2007) and exploiters take advantage of this character trait in children.

Cross-cultural child development is crucial for social workers practising in multicultural societies with children whose backgrounds are ethnically and culturally diverse such as child victims of transnational trafficking. Understanding cross-cultural theories of development have beneficial consequences for children trafficked across national borders. Cultural politics of childhood “attempts to understand the cultural determinants of childhood...the identification of the processes by which these cultural determinants and discourses are put into practice at any given time, in any given culture, to construct ‘childhood’ in society and examination of the ways in which children themselves experience these cultural determinants, the processes of ordering and control and the regulatory framings of who they are” (James & James, 2004, p. 6-7).

The ecological systems perspective gives one the possibility of seeing and understanding the connections between culture and development. For example, although many adolescents are regarded to be children under international and national laws, in their own ethnic communities they are customarily considered as adults. Furthermore, cross-cultural research “suggests that the abstract reasoning valued in the African worldview is experiential, symbolic, global, inductive, analogical, end oriented, and seeks to answer the question “why”, as opposed to formal
reasoning, which is experimental, analytical, deductive…and asks “how”. Thus, social aspects are more valued than cognitive skills unless the cognitive skills are used for the good of the whole community. It is essential that social workers do not overgeneralize and stereotype cultural values but that these values act as guidelines rather than solutions (Kreitzer, 2012; Robinson, 2007) and for development to be understood as acquiring “particular cultural skills and tools that are adaptive to a particular socio-economic context and historical epoch, not about a once-for-all universal process” (Woodhead cited in Robinson, 2007, p. 92).

Trafficking poses a direct threat to children’s development, health and well-being as childhood trafficking experiences can have far reaching effects. Transnational trafficking impacts the child’s development from a psychosexual, psychosocial, cognitive and socio-cultural perspectives. These diverse social, emotional, health, intellectual and cultural consequences are discussed in-depth under 2.4.3. Children are trafficked for various types of exploitation depending on their developmental age and gender or demand by “client”. Table 2.2 shows exploitation experienced by trafficked children whereas table 2.3 shows the type of exploitation according to age and gender.

The meaning of the trafficking event from the trafficked child acts as the missing link. Children understand their own trafficking narratives according to their socio-cultural, intellectual and emotional developmental framework. From Bronfenbrenner’s (1994) ecological perspective, it is essential that children’s meanings of the trafficking experience are understood by focusing on the individual mediating factors as well as the social, political, cultural and economic contexts which act as mediators. It is crucial that a developmental intervention approach to child trafficking reflects the experiences that the trafficked child has gone through, the nature and their (culturally-informed) meaning of trauma associated with trafficking suffered, endured and survived (Berman, 2004).

2.3 HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS A GLOBAL ISSUE
According to UNODC (2013), “human trafficking is a global problem and one of the world’s most shameful crimes, affecting the lives of millions of people around the
world and robbing them of their dignity”. Many countries in the world are affected by human trafficking whether or not they are party to the UN Trafficking Protocol. Almost every country is impacted on by trafficking either as a country of origin, country of transit, and/ or as the country of destination. To illustrate this further, UNODC (2013) reports that victims from at least 127 countries were exploited in 137 countries. These 137 countries were not the victim’s countries of origin, but were either countries of transit and/ or destination. In addition, approximately 460 trafficking flows were identified worldwide between 2007 and 2010.

Human trafficking is a global, regional, and a domestic crime, which leads to violation of human rights and protection. Victims of trafficking are trafficked and exploited within their own country (in country trafficking), to neighbouring countries (regional trafficking) and between continents (international trafficking). The UNODC report (2012) states that much of the human trafficking that flows from Africa are either intra-regional, or are directed toward the Middle East or Western Europe. On the other hand, the transnational trafficking that flows from East Asia is reported to be the most prominent globally, with most victims from that region being identified in many other countries around the world.

In search of a better life, victims are mostly willing to move anywhere in the world to work, which gives rise to transnational trafficking. According to UNODC (2012, p. 7), “trafficking for sexual exploitation is more common in Europe, Central Asia, and the Americas. Trafficking for forced labour is more frequently detected in Africa and Middle East, as well as in South and East Asia and the Pacific”. The report further noted that 70% of victims from other regions in the world were trafficked to the Middle East region. In 2010, the UN projected that Qatar, United Arab Emirates (UAE), Kuwait, and Jordan will have 87%, 70%, 69%, and 46% of international migrants, respectively, in their total populations (Sana & Abano, 2010). There is a huge influx of female labour migration to the Middle East from Ethiopia (Dessiye, 2011) and from the Philippines (Sana & Abano, 2010) due to the perceived better wages paid to domestic workers. Males predominantly migrated to the Middle East for construction work, but recent migration for both males and females is in the service sector, although many of the migrants are not protected by the national laws, and are thus vulnerable to exploitation. When examining the link between migration and trafficking,
one can argue that the causes and manifestation of trafficking, the means used, and the types of exploitation within a certain region or country might vary depending on the trafficking demands exerted. See Table 2.2 depicting the different forms of exploitation as experienced by trafficked children.

### Table 2.2 Exploitation experienced by trafficked children in different parts of the world (adapted from Dottridge, 2004, p. 24)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of exploitation</th>
<th>Children involved</th>
<th>Main geographical areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Commercial Sexual Exploitation (CSE)</strong></td>
<td>Mainly teenage girls (aged 16-17) and boys</td>
<td>Widespread but especially areas where (child) sex tourism is rampant e.g. South Africa, Thailand, Cambodia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Forced marriage</strong></td>
<td>Teenage girls</td>
<td>China and the surrounding countries, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Illegal adoption</strong></td>
<td>Usually babies</td>
<td>Children from Latin America, Africa, and Asia to US, China, Scandinavian, and EU countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Slavery/ bonded labour</strong></td>
<td>Teenage boys</td>
<td>South Asia and West Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Domestic servitude</strong></td>
<td>Teenage girls or children under the age of 10</td>
<td>Philippines, Haiti, East, West and Southern Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Begging</strong></td>
<td>Young children (sometimes maimed to provoke pity)</td>
<td>India, South East Asia, Nigeria, South Africa, Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Illicit activities</strong></td>
<td>Younger children</td>
<td>Romanian children in EU countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Camel race jockey</strong></td>
<td>Younger boys</td>
<td>UAE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child soldiers</strong></td>
<td>Teenage boys and girls</td>
<td>Burma, Syria, South Sudan, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Central African Republic, Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organ harvesting</strong></td>
<td>Young children</td>
<td>Southern Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hazardous child labour</strong></td>
<td>Children under the age of 14</td>
<td>Africa and Asia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
lucrative illicit businesses in Europe, with organised criminal groups getting profits of up to ZAR 30 billion (USD 3 billion) per year from the trade (UNODC, 2013). According to Belser (2005), the majority of the profits from trafficking (approximately ZAR 150 billion (USD 15 billion)) are made from victims who are exploited in industrialised countries. Human trafficking thrives because it is lucrative, it preys on the most marginalised individuals, perpetrators are rarely prosecuted, and the human being as a commodity can be sold repeatedly (Aronowitz, Theuerman & Tyurykanova, 2010). In addition, mobility of victims is high and limited initial capital is required although the entry costs “into the business” are low (Shelley, 2011).

Trafficking for sexual exploitation is more common in Europe, Central Asia, and America (Gozdziak & Bump, 2008; Goodey, 2004; UNODC, 2012). According to UNODC (2013), “in Europe, over 140,000 victims are trapped in a situation of violence and degradation for sexual exploitation and up to one in seven sex workers in the region may have been enslaved into prostitution through trafficking”. Indeed, this shows the link between prostitution and trafficking. Trafficking for forced labour is reported in Africa and Middle East, whereas trafficking for begging and removal of body organs is more rampant in Africa and Asia.

According to UNODC (2013) and Davy (2012), one in five victims of global human trafficking are children, although in poorer regions such as Africa and in sub-regions such as the Greater Mekong, children make up the majority of trafficked persons. This is further corroborated by the UNODC (2012) report that 27% of all trafficked victims are children, and that out of every three trafficked children, two are girls and one is a boy. Although these reports support the argument that more girls are trafficked and/ or are at a greater risk of being trafficked in comparison to boys, Table 2.3 shows the weighting to be similar.

Table 2.3 Exploitation of children according to age and gender (adapted from Dottridge, 2004, p. 24)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of child</th>
<th>Common type of exploitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Babies (both boys and girls)</td>
<td>Illegal adoption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Young/ pre-puberty girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Young/ pre-puberty boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Adolescent girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Adolescent boys</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In response to the trafficking being a global issue, international companies like Cadbury’s, Body Shop, Nike and Coca-Cola are proactively positioning interventions to combat trafficking. For example, Coca-Cola “addresses potential and actual human rights impacts, including human trafficking, across its entire system and value chain, from raw materials to end use. The company identifies a range of risks and has implemented globally recognized policies and actions to mitigate them” (O’Neill, 2013). The Body Shop supports counter-trafficking initiatives in Asia.

### 2.4 HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN SOUTH AFRICA

#### 2.4.1 South Africa in context

South Africa is an emerging global market, Africa’s economic powerhouse with well-developed financial, transport, communication, mining, and manufacturing sectors. As the most prosperous country in Africa and within the SADC region, South Africa is an appealing lure, and people from other countries are enticed by the vast wealth of opportunities that seem available (Gallinetti, 2008; Martens et al., 2003). The issue of trafficking in persons has grown in importance in light of its recent identification as the underside of globalisation and migration. Sawadogo (2012, p. 96) argues that transnational crimes like trafficking are complex and that new dimensions can be seen with globalisation as “assaults on human dignity continue to increase proportionally to the growing globalization”.

According to the recently released census results, there are 52 million people in South Africa (StatsSA, 2012) and the unemployment rate seems to be growing exponentially. This means that the vast wealth, which acts as a historical magnet for migrants from other countries, spells doom and bears evidence of the economic disparities present in the South African population. Diversity is a key feature in South Africa, where 11 different official languages are recognised. However, some of these
languages are spoken in the neighbouring countries as well, which assists in the illicit integration of trafficked persons and subsequently makes it challenging to identify victims of trafficking once they are in South Africa.

The Aliens Control Act 96 of 1991 was a legislation governing the terms of entry for non-citizens into South Africa (Stone & Winterstein, 2003). However, it was not effective in post-apartheid South Africa since it was still deeply rooted in the imperatives and ideologies of the apartheid era. In 1994, with South Africa’s transition to democracy, there was an increase in refugees arriving in South Africa because of her economic prosperity, refugee-friendly policies, porous borders, proximity, as well as the country being deemed a safe destination (Martens et al., 2003; Ntlakana, 2006; Stone & Winterstein, 2003). According to a report by UNHCR (2011), high numbers of asylum seekers globally seek refuge in South Africa. This is a concern for South Africa because these asylum applicants are not only from neighbouring countries, but from far away countries like Somalia, Nigeria, DRC, and Ethiopia. The refugees who arrive in South Africa are not accommodated in designated camps unlike the case in most African countries such as Kenya, Zambia, and Namibia. The South African Refugee Act 130 of 1998 allows refugees and asylum seekers, including children, to settle nationwide with attempts to accommodate them in existing institutional frameworks. The rights-based approach was adopted in South Africa to promote local integration, yet the poor constantly criticise the government because with a 25% unemployment rate, many of them compete with the refugee population for scarce resources (Clacherty and the suitcase storytellers, 2006; Van Garderen & Batshabelo in Stone & Winterstein, 2003).

The leading role that South Africa plays in diplomatic and anti-poverty initiatives in Africa remains controversial, and has been a much disputed subject within the field of migration, peace-building and development (Nganje, 2013). Many migrants continue to arrive in South Africa, although acquiring refugee status or being smuggled into South Africa does not guarantee one of financial and/or economic freedom. Debates continue about the best strategies for the management of the overwhelming flow of refugees, asylum seekers, and other migrants (Truong, 2006) versus addressing the plight of many South Africans who live in poverty and are unemployed. Appropriate
solutions to the refugee problem in South Africa seem far-reaching, and in the process of feeling insecure and pressed to find coping and survival mechanisms, refugees subsequently become easy targets for traffickers (Gallinetti, 2008). On the other hand, due to the lucrative high-profits and low-risk elements of trafficking, refugees have also been known to become traffickers. Trafficked victims in South Africa are often recruited by or through a male family member with refugee status, who opts to use women and girls for sexual exploitation as a means of support (Gallinetti, 2008; Kastrup, 2013; IOM, 2003). These findings are supported by Rigby (in Rigby, 2010) who reported that approximately 25% of unaccompanied asylum-seeking children in Glasgow had been trafficked.

According to the US TIP reports (2011; 2012; 2013) and UNICEF (2003), South Africa was reported as being a country of origin, transit, and destination, linked to some of the above-mentioned circumstances. This study did not look at South Africa as a country of origin, because the study was interested in the views of children trafficked into South Africa, as a transit or destination country. Successful prosecution rates have always remained very low, especially given the fact that South Africa had no legislation addressing the crime of trafficking (Allais et al., 2010; Kreston, 2007; Kruger & Oosthuizen, 2012). Recently, South Africa introduced the Trafficking Act (2013) to prevent and combat human trafficking, although no prosecution cases have been reported to-date. This places a great responsibility on the country to introduce measures to counter the growing trends of trafficking. South Africa is placed on Tier 2 of the US TIP Report (2013) for the fourth year in a row. This means that the South African government does not fully comply with minimum standards, but it is making significant efforts towards compliance. The criteria to determine whether these minimum standards are being met address the three P’s i.e. prevention, prosecution, and protection. This research seeks to address the minimum standard that deals with victim assistance and protection.

2.4.2 The nature of child trafficking in South Africa
A discussion paper released by the South African Law Reform Commission (2006) reports that the exact numbers of children trafficked in, out of, and into South Africa is unknown. The thorough literature search, supported by a paper by Gallinetti (2008),
failed to produce any comprehensive published research on trafficking of South Africans (including children) to other parts of the world. However, that is not to say that South African children are not trafficked. A study commissioned by the National Prosecuting Authority (NPA) also reported less trafficking out of South Africa than into South Africa (Allais et al., 2010). For example, between January 2004 and January 2008, the IOM office in Pretoria recorded only eight cases of South Africans trafficked internationally. In the past, IOM has documented cases of Thai women being trafficked to the main cities in South Africa for sexual exploitation. Unconfirmed reports indicate that corpses of children are being used to conceal narcotics, and the bodies are then shipped to destination countries where the child holds citizenship (Allais et al., 2010). The distinct patterns that emerged from IOM’s (2003) study indicated that women and girls are trafficked from Eastern Europe, Mozambique, Malawi, China, and Thailand for sexual exploitation in South Africa. Malawian children and women are also trafficked via South Africa to Northern Europe.

The issue of child trafficking is complex and context specific and developing a more informed understanding of the issue requires that social, legal, political, economic and cultural factors be considered. According to Thomas (1984, p. 144), “possible causal factors are relevant because such conditions generally have important implications for treatment and, therefore, for intervention design”. The factors to be discussed apply the ecological systems framework in outlining the multi-level factors that cause children to be trafficked into South Africa. The causal factors at chrono, macro, exo, meso and micro system are not only interdependent, but they also interact with one another. According to Liao and Hong (2011, p. 567), “the upper layers shape the lower layers, thus creating a trickle-down effect that contributes and intensifies the problem”. Thus, borrowing from sexual abuse research by Spies (2006), assisting affected children necessitates that the professional (in this case the social worker) is aware and has knowledge of the process and understands the negative consequences brought about by trafficking.

There is evidence of contrasts and similarities when considering the African continent. Good governance, development, and accountability are high on the lists of donors who assist African governments. This has resulted in substantial investments, one being benefits to children’s development and wellbeing in sectors such as health.
and education. This is because the protection of children is viewed and supported within the context of development (Myers & Bourdillon, 2012). Despite these positive developments, the state of the African child remains of great concern (African Child Policy Forum (ACPF), 2010; Kasirye, 2007; Sassou & Yogtiba, 2009). The situation of children in Africa is undermined by factors such as poverty, which lead to children increasingly falling victims of trafficking. Parental loss through HIV and AIDS, economic situations of their countries, breakdown in extended families, changes in cultural attitudes and practices, armed conflicts, and natural disasters contribute to children becoming migrants or refugees and subsequently finding themselves at high risk of exploitation.

Bernat and Zhilina (2010, p. 3) situate trafficking within both the local and global by urging that “the causes of human trafficking are rooted in a (global) economy in which lives are commodities to be traded, used and abused”. The structural causes that act at the level of the larger economy and society can influence the creation of enabling environments in which child trafficking can flourish. Trafficking deals with adults as “not only failing to protect children who come under their control and supervision, but actively objectifying and exploiting them as goods or services” (Kreston, 2007, p. 36). The same institutions established to protect children are failing them, such as the same institutions established to protect them such as by government’s lack of commitment to establish child protection systems to identify children who are at risk of being trafficked. In addition, lack of adequate laws and inadequate enforcement of laws have also been identified in the SADC countries as barriers to child protection. Furthermore, counter trafficking efforts are failing because of weak coordination between agencies based in different countries who are concerned with different ends of the same trafficking chain.

A child’s household-income poverty and dysfunctional family are triggers that push children to seek better lives, and may predispose a family or community to accept and even encourage child trafficking. According to the research by Molo Songololo (2000), poverty can contribute to prostitution when children think that they do not have anything valuable except their bodies. In addition, the desire of families to break out of their cycle of poverty, coupled with uneven development and a culture of consumerism has made families increasingly receptive to opportunities abroad. In
Ngidi’s (2009) analysis of a child’s best interests in South African customary law, she highlights that a child’s position is determined by the status of his/her parents, and that the child’s protection is primarily determined by their family. Studies by Kumar et al. (2001) in Nepal, and Molo Songololo (2000) in South Africa overlook the customary law rationale and strongly emphasise that when parents engage in soft trafficking through either silently or actively consenting to the process of selling their children for any reason, it still contributes to trafficking. Comparative select texts by Ngidi (2009) in South Africa, Kasirye (2007) in Uganda and Wolfensohn (2004) in Southeast Europe all demonstrate that the welfare of children is inseparable from that of their families, and that families may not understand the notion of trafficking, but they see it as a survival strategy for the family or as a protection measure for the child. This view supports and contradicts the notion of the family as the core unit of the society and the supportive role it ought to play for the child.

Education may inform a wide and good choice of decisions, as well as offer alternatives and an informed job offer assessment. Thus, intellectual poverty, brought about by inadequate or lack of education, may be a trigger for children to seek a better life (Heady, 2003; Okyere, 2012; Sossou & Yogtiba, 2009). The already deeply entrenched poverty cycle due to socio-economic deprivations further forces the child to abandon school and subsequently become the family’s breadwinner (Palmary, 2007; 2009). Due to their age, lack of skills, and inability to negotiate, these children often end up being exploited. Clearly, relationships will continue to exist between poverty and trafficking because “socio-economic causes and politico-institutional causes remain to a certain extent embedded in each other just like the two sides of a coin” (Sawadogo, 2012, p. 103). Recent developments in social protection have highlighted that poverty reduction is crucial as a mechanism to reduce children’s and families’ vulnerability (ACPF, 2010; Jones, 2009; Okongwu & Mencher, 2000). Jolly (2012) further stresses that the link between children and development deserve more attention, beyond the typical investment in human capital and social welfare.

According to a report by Altamura et al. (2009, p. 12), a “notorious route for child trafficking for sexual exploitation is along the major haulage leading to South Africa from Malawi”. This is mainly because truck drivers have been known to deceive children with promises of marriage or academic opportunities if they agree to
accompany them to South Africa. Children from Mozambique and Lesotho have also been exploited on farms as child labourers in the Free State and Limpopo provinces (Martens et al., 2003). Apart from African children, children from Southeast Asia are also trafficked to South Africa and exploited in escort agencies and massage parlours across the country (Molo Songololo, 2003).

In Africa, children were considered to be blessings and a sign of wealth and prosperity, and hence deserving of protection. Child mobility was an ingrained practice and it was tied to means, especially in resource-poor environments, which therefore necessitated the child to relocate and stay with relatives. According to Surtees (2005), child placement/ fostering is a positive cultural practice that is consistent with the expected responsibilities of the extended family, but it can become problematic when abused. As a socio-economic survival strategy, the child would thus be sent wherever his or her (formal or informal) education, future, security, and general well-being would be best guaranteed (ACPF, 2010; Kamidi, 2007; Surtees, 2005). The children were mostly sent to relatives where intellectual and material resources were more available and accessible for the child’s development. This highly tolerated cultural foster care by relatives (referred to as vidomegoms in Benin) may place children at risk of exploitation if abused, but on the other hand, children can develop valuable life and social skills (Boyden & Howard, 2013). Cultural factors such as early marriages, virgin myths, male privilege, and children being seen as a source of wealth and thus as central contributors to the economic family unit, may increase a child’s level of vulnerability. However, when writing on Benin and Ethiopia, Boyden and Howard (2013) argue the importance of children’s independent migration in relation to domestic, economic, and social integration and transition into adulthood. Liborio and Ungar (2010) further defends and argues that children’s economic activities could potentially be a pathway to the children’s resilience.

Kropiwnicki (2007) draws attention to Southeast Europe’s patriarchy-based social and cultural norms, with authoritarian structures that socialise children to be highly dependent. In Montenegro, the traditional popular saying “a female child is another’s treat” indicates gender disparities, the reluctance of families to invest in girl children, and the willingness to allow exploitation (Kropiwnicki, 2007, p. 27). The
marginalisation of girls and women is especially evident in indigenous populations in Asian-Pacific, Latin America and Africa (Eneyew & Mengistu, 2013; UNICEF, UN Women, UNFPA, ILO & Office of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on Violence against Children (OSRG/VAC), 2013). The tension between absolute and relative values trigger another ethical and cultural dilemma in, for example, the South African cultural practice of abduction and arranged marriage for girls (ukhuthwala) and Benin’s vidomegом with the risk of trafficking being unknown to families and communities alike. A relativistic approach is justified on the basis that what constitutes child trafficking is socially and culturally determined (Touzenis, 2010). Although socio-cultural factors such as the social acceptance of making children work or migration-related traditions might be significant, it is important to stress that children have an absolute need for protection against harm at all times.

2.4.3 The impact of transnational trafficking on children

Child victims of trafficking are subjected to the same harmful treatment as adults. Therefore, their age makes them more vulnerable to the harmful consequences of the abusive and exploitative practices. Children who are victimised by trafficking have their psychological, spiritual, cultural, and social development stolen, which they would have otherwise enjoyed had it not been for the exploitation. Children who are trafficked across national borders experience neglect, physical, emotional, and sexual abuse and are deprived of the typical developmental needs of education, care, affection, safety, and cultural affiliation (ILO, 2009; Sambo & Spies, 2012). However, it is worth noting that child victims of trafficking experience trafficking differently, and may present with different signs depending on:

- the type of exploitation they have gone through (e.g. begging, sexual exploitation, labour etc.);
- the length and duration of the trafficking experience;
- the living and working conditions while trafficked;
- the age and developmental stage of the child;
- the presence, duration, intensity, and frequency of abuse while trafficked;
- the facts entailed in the trafficking experience; and
- the availability, accessibility, and appropriateness of assistance

(Surtees, 2005, p. 68-69).
According to Hyde and Bales (2006) and Rafferty (2008), traffickers use psychological manipulation and coercive methods to control victims by destroying their physical and psycho-emotional defences. Reported methods of control used include physical, sexual, and emotional abuse, neglect and isolation, restricted regular movement, alcohol and drug dependency, controlled access to basic needs such as food, water, and sleep, monitoring of victims actions through use of weapons, cameras, dogs, and humans (IOM, 2007; Zimmerman et. al., 2003). From a developmental model (with reference to complex trauma theory), children who have been exposed to complex trauma such as prolonged child abuse and exploitation are at increased risk for symptoms and behavioural characteristics which may include but are not limited to attachment, emotional regulation, dissociative adaptations, behaviour, cognitive functioning, and self-concept (Hyde & Bales, 2006; Rafferty, 2008; UNODC, 2008; Yakushko, 2009). Thus, it is important to note the strong association between elements of child abuse in trafficked children and maladaptive psychosocial and physical development outcomes.

Children who have been trafficked experience inhumane living conditions, poor nutritional standards, lack proper hygiene, and are denied access to healthcare, all of which result in health problems. Zimmerman et al. (2006) report that the most prevalent and severe physical health symptoms included headaches, fatigue, dizzy spells, memory problems, back pain, and abdominal pain. According to United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2008) and Zimmerman et al. (2006), in situations where the purpose of trafficking is sexual exploitation, there is an increased likelihood of HIV infections, distorted perceptions of sex (Deb, 2005), unwanted pregnancies, unsafe and/or forced abortions. Over 60% of women and girls reported pelvic pain, vaginal discharge, and gynaecological infections upon entry into care (Zimmerman et al., 2006). In instances where the trafficked child has been conditioned to use psychoactive substances, there is increased likelihood of the child getting involved in high risk behaviours, developing substance addictions, being violent, acquiring needle-introduced infections, and having poor memory and attention span.
Economic exploitation through debt bondage, deceptive accounting or debt calculation may lead to risk-taking activities in order to pay debts (UNODC, 2012), and it is evident that the trafficked child would have insufficient funds to pay for health care. When there are acts of deceptive accounting, a sense of mistrust might develop or be exacerbated. Cases of legal insecurity whereby the children’s identity and or travel documents are confiscated and they are forced to participate in illegal activities have been reported (Ngwira, 2011; UNICEF, 2009; UNICEF, 2003). When this happens, it makes children fearful and hesitant to access services, which subsequently results in the deterioration of their health and psychosocial conditions.

According to Rafferty (2008, p. 14) “the experiences associated with trafficking can lead to lasting psychological challenges. Psycho-emotional abuse coupled with ongoing intimidation and threats, isolation and witnessing others being abused negatively affects a child’s self-concept, personal goals, relationship with others and critically endangers the child’s emotional well-being”. Children experience physical and emotional trauma associated with removal and/or separation from their families, friends, pets, homes, and communities; and their subsequent encounters involve substantial harm through abuse. Case studies report adverse emotional effects including depression, hopelessness, guilt, shame, flashbacks, loss of confidence, and anxiety (Kliner & Stroud, 2012; Zimmerman & Borland, 2009; Zimmerman et al., 2006). The negative messages received regularly influence their sense and perception of worth, leading to feelings of self-blame, low self-esteem, and loss of confidence. Victims may have a fear of the police because they are afraid of being deported (Clawson et al., 2009; Elliott & Segal, 2012; Hopper, 2004) or because they come from areas where law enforcement is corrupt and feared (OSCE/ODHIR, 2004a). Sometimes they feel that it is their fault that they ended up being trafficked, and that they will be stigmatised when they go back home (Adams, 2011; Asquith & Turner, 2008). Furthermore, as a coping or survival mechanism, they may have developed loyalties and positive feelings towards their trafficker, or may try to protect them from the authorities.

Behaviours such as mistrust in adults, difficulty relating to others, anti-social behaviours, attachment difficulties, aggressive behaviour, and difficulty in relating to
peers have been reported among children who were trafficked. Mitchels (cited in Rafferty, 2008, p. 15) reports that “some younger children resort to self-harm to regain a sense of control through pain, whereas older children detach themselves from the harsh realities they have endured by abusing alcohol or drugs”. The sense of hopelessness, deflated self-esteem, and lack of self-love indicates how environments that children are trafficked into are insecure, unresponsive, and do not foster opportunities for inter- and intra-personal growth and competence (Deb, 2005).

Building on Bowlby’s (1988) theory of attachment, children need to have a sense of belonging, and trafficking takes away from children their right to grow up in their cultural communities, practice their culture, and develop cultural identities. Trafficking deprives children of chances to access and further their informal and formal education. It robs children of opportunities to develop intellectually and subsequently improve their future economic situation. Lack of access to one’s cultural and historical background can challenge one’s development, and it has been reported to contribute to a fragile sense of self (Fahlberg, 2012). Subsequently, the child’s fragile sense of self of who they are, and how and where they fit in the world can be severely tested (Rigby & White, 2013). A further review of literature indicates adverse outcomes related to deprivation of formal and/ or informal education such as developmental delays, language and cognitive abilities, poor academic performance, grade retention, deficits in verbal skills, low concentration levels, impaired ability to learn, and stagnated literacy (Banovic & Bjelajac, 2012; Clawson et al., 2009; Rafferty, 2008).

Trafficking deprives children of the right to grow up in a family. However, in all instances, it is essential that family tracing does not jeopardise the best interest of the trafficked child or of the family members being traced (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012c). Kasriye (2006), Sossou and Yogtiba (2009), when writing on child trafficking in East and West Africa respectively, indicate that parents of children who are trafficked do not seek professional help due to ignorance, a culture of silence, shame, and compensation awarded by the trafficker. From a cultural perspective, children then come to view trafficking as a shameful secret, especially if it was for sexual purposes and parents are not held accountable by anyone or the structures in place to protect children.
2.5 CHILD TRAFFICKING LEGISLATIVE AND POLICY RESPONSES

Social justice is significant within social work. The principles of human rights and social justice are fundamental foundations of social work. The relationship between social justice and social work and the social justice and social policy nexus has been widely explored (Ife, 2013; Lundy, 2004; Sheppard, 2006; Solas, 2008). Social justice can be part of social worker’s daily life (O’Brien, 2011) as they engage with clients from a clinical perspective (Swenson, 1998), during meso practice and macro practice. The strength of policy practice in social work entails social workers using their social work skills, knowledge, and ethical commitment to propose, change, and implement policies to ensure social functioning and well-being of their clients.

According to Jolly (2012, p. 5), social policies are crucial for children “because they shape the environment in which children and their families live, work and play, and their well-being”. This is evident when looking at what the ultimate goals of policy-making should be, i.e. to address fair and accessible justice, equity, providing needs of all, freedom from poverty and discrimination, social inclusion, and the development of human capabilities (ACPF, 2010; Robinson & Coetzee, 2007). These aspects of policy-making also apply to children and not only to adults. Recent developments in good governance and policy implementation have emphasised that the “nature of growth and the manner in which a society translates the fruits of growth into the increased wellbeing of its citizens is critical, since the fruits of growth do not trickle down automatically” (Elson & Cagatay cited in ACPF, 2010, p. 23).

South Africa has ratified and is a signatory to several international and regional trafficking conventions and their protocols. These conventions, their implications, criticisms, and potential for creating a coherent, fair, and just response to child trafficking in South Africa are discussed next. Firstly, international legal frameworks are presented, then the regional frameworks and finally, South Africa’s legislations.

2.5.1 International legal frameworks

The primary focus of international laws and conventions is to regulate relations between countries at a transnational level (Humby et al., 2012). Furthermore, the issues that international conventions seek to regulate tend to affect more than one
country and may include human trafficking, cross-border extradition of criminals, and trade transactions. South Africa has signed and ratified the conventions discussed below. This means that South Africa undertakes to comply with the rules set forth in the conventions, especially in the absence of a national legislation.

2.5.1.1 The League of Nations Slavery Convention (The Slavery Convention) (1926)
This treaty adopted the first international consensus on the definition of the term ‘slavery’. In article 1 (1) of the Convention, slavery is defined as “the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership is exercised”. In 1924, the League’s Temporary Slavery Commission outlined the types of slavery and these included serfdom, debt bondage, and adoption or marriage for the purpose of slavery.

The Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery (1956) defined the term ‘servitude’ and it obliged members to prohibit slave-like practices that encourage exploitation. “All forms of servitude were prohibited even if the consent of the affected person is obtained” (Currie & de Waal, 2005, p. 312). South Africa ratified the Slavery Convention in 1927 and the Protocol in 1953 but she has not signed the Supplementary Convention. This meant that South Africa had an obligation to eradicate slavery, servitude, and slave-like practices, and to adopt national legislation and establish effective mechanisms to fight slavery.

2.5.1.2 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (1989)
According to Reading et al. (2009, p. 335), children’s rights “are not abstract and idealistic aspirations, but are grounded firmly and pragmatically in the basic human needs for life, growth and development”. The UNCRC (1989) was ratified by South Africa in July 1995; and it seeks to promote and protect the rights of all children, including children with special needs and those living in difficult conditions. The rights enshrined in this convention include rights to survival, protection, development, and children’s rights to participation.
Article 35 of the UNCRC state that countries “shall take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form”, thus making provision for the rights of every child to be protected against trafficking. According to the UNCRC, the five categories of children’s rights that are violated through child trafficking include:

i) The right to life (Article 6.1).
ii) The right to survival and development (Article 6.2).
iii) The right to protection from:
   a) discrimination and punishment (Article 2.2);
   b) physical and mental violence (Article 19.1);
   c) economic exploitation (Article 32);
   d) sexual exploitation (Article 34);
   e) illicit transfer abroad (Article 11); and
iv) The right to participation (Article 12).
v) The right to information (Article 13).

The UNCRC looks into children’s best interests and recognises that they have a right to life, optimal survival and development, and that their views will be taken seriously in according to their age and level of maturity.

The Optional Protocol to the UNCRC on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography further clarifies article 35 of the UNCRC by providing a definition for ‘the sale of children’. In addition, it gives recognition to domestic, regional, and international trafficking, as well as opportunistic traffickers and those who are part of organised criminal networks. Furthermore, the Optional Protocol makes the protection of the rights and interests of child victims compulsory, rather than discretionary as is the case in the Palermo Protocol.

2.5.1.3 UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the UN Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime (UN Trafficking or Palermo Protocol) (2000)

The UN Trafficking Protocol stipulates that countries of origin, transit, and destination with victim status determining this designation, must take practical steps to prevent
trafficking, prosecute traffickers, and protect victims. The UN Trafficking Protocol has been ratified by 154 countries worldwide (UNODC, 2012). South Africa ratified this convention in February 2004. According to Kurbiel (2004), the global nature of trafficking requires a uniform implementation of the terms and purposes of the UN Trafficking Protocol worldwide. However, victim identification, assistance provision and prosecution, are hampered in situations where certain countries, such as those shown on Table 2.4 do not agree to be party to the Protocol.

Table 2.4 Countries that are not part of the UN Trafficking Protocol (adapted from US TIP Report, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AFRICAN COUNTRIES</th>
<th>ASIAN COUNTRIES</th>
<th>OTHER COUNTRIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Angola</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comoros</td>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>Andorra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>Brunei</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eritrea</td>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Iran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>Maldives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Sudan</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>St. Lucia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Barbados</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite the efficacy of the UN Trafficking Protocol, it suffers from major drawbacks such as failing to cover every possible type of trafficking; exploitation is perceived at the end of the trafficking chain and emphasis is mainly on organised crime’s involvement in trafficking (Kreston, 2007; UNICEF, 2003). The latter concept has recently been challenged by smaller operations involving family members and relatives or friendship ties also implicated in trafficking (Gozdziak, 2010). Furthermore, the features present in the UN Palermo Protocol definition indicates that there may be several actors involved during the trafficking process.

Research by Sawadogo (2012) and Lee (2011) focused on transnational elements involved in the process of trafficking, yet other studies have established that trafficking and subsequent exploitation does not necessarily require that children be
transported from one setting to another or that national borders be crossed (Oketch, Morreau & Benson, 2012; UNICEF, 2003). Further questions have been raised about the Palermo Protocol being criminal justice oriented and thus creating obstacles in the design and development of comprehensive assistance mechanisms for victims of trafficking (Hilton, 2007).

As a point of departure, it is worth noting that the UN Palermo Protocol’s article 3 distinguishes between trafficking of children and trafficking of adults. In doing so, it recognises specific vulnerabilities that plague children and which may put them at risk of being trafficked. However, the protocol falls short again because there is no distinction made regarding obligatory issues dealing with repatriation, protection, or victim support of adults and children. However, it may be argued that due to the developmental stages of children, they need more additional focused re-integrative and protective services than adults do.

2.5.1.4 ILO Convention No. 182 on the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (1999)

South Africa ratified this document in June 2000. The preamble to this Convention indicates the necessity for countries to adopt new instruments for eliminating and prohibiting the worst forms of child labour. Article 3 of the Convention does not define ‘child labour’, but there is mention that it constitutes practices similar to slavery, such as using children for illegal activities such as prostitution and drug trafficking as well as any work that is likely to harm the child’s physical and psychosocial wellbeing.

Article 3(a) in the Convention makes the most explicit reference to child trafficking, whereas clauses 3(b), (c), and (d) refer to exploitative activities that trafficked children may experience. This leaves the Convention open to a wide range of interpretations, which can be problematic for implementation. However, all international conventions, with the exception of the ILO Convention, suffer from the fact that they neither address nor highlight the issue that an individual’s morals can be affected by trafficking. Article 7 obliges countries to take all necessary measures to ensure the effective implementation of the Convention, as well as preventative and
curative measures when dealing with children at risk or those already engaged in harmful work. In line with article 7, the Convention proposes that countries compile and design time-bound programmes of action to eliminate and prohibit child labour. In response, one of the South African government’s responses is the prohibition of employment of any child under the age of 15, which is in the Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) (1998). Furthermore, South Africa does not have provisions for children to engage in (light) work at a lower age than the minimum age prescribed age.

2.5.2 Regional legislative framework

In recognition that transnational child trafficking does not end at South Africa’s national borders, the next discussion focuses on regional instruments developed to protect children. According to Wessels and Edgerton (2008, p. 11), “it is essential to build the capacities of stakeholders at various levels to fulfil their obligation to protect children”. The next discussion focuses on the frameworks which protect children.

2.5.2.1 The African Charter on Human and People’s Rights (The Banjul Charter) (1986)

The Convention promotes and protects human rights and basic freedoms of individuals and groups in Africa. South Africa ratified this document in July 1996. The convention was developed in response to the transatlantic slave trade, it emphasises solidarity rights and “focuses on the rights of colonised and oppressed people to free themselves from the bonds of domination, which include foreign exploitation by international monopolies, by resorting to any means recognised by the international community” (Wronka & Bernasconi, 2012).

The Banjul Charter mentions civil and political rights, economic, social, and cultural rights, as well as individual and collective rights. In addition, the Banjul Charter not only awards rights to individuals and groups, but it also stipulates duties and responsibilities associated with these rights. Article 4 addresses issues related to trafficking with regard to the rights to the life, integrity, and security of an individual. All forms of exploitation, cruel, inhumane, or degrading punishment, and treatment
and slave-like actions are prohibited. Central to the discussion of the Banjul Charter is the widespread poverty, which has been noted to hinder its full implementation.

The Protocol to the African Charter on Human and People’s Rights on the Rights of Women, also known as the Women’s Protocol (2005), takes cognisance of women’s and girls’ vulnerability in Africa. Article 4(2)(g) of the Women’s Protocol addresses specific aspects of trafficking, notably its prevention, prosecution of traffickers, and the protection of women and girls at risk.

2.5.2.2 African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (ACRWC) (1990)

The ACRWC was adopted by the African Union (AU) in 1990. South Africa ratified this document in January 2000. The ACRWC is a comprehensive regional framework that has been contextualised to Africa, and like the UNCRC it sets out rights and defines universal principles and norms for the status of African children. According to Ruppel (2013), the charter supplements the UNCRC highlights important children’s issues within the African context. On the other hand, unlike the UNCRC, the ACRWC makes mention of socio-cultural and economic realities particular to Africa, such as challenging traditional African perspectives that are often in conflict with children’s rights, such as child marriages. According to Ruppel (2013), the majority of specific African issues dealt with in the ACRWC were previously not addressed in the UNCRC.

In ACRWC’s preamble, it is noted that the circumstances of numerous African children remains “critical due to the unique factors of their socio-economic, cultural, traditional and developmental circumstances, natural disasters, armed conflicts, exploitation and hunger, and on account of the child’s physical and mental immaturity (s)he needs special safeguards and care”. The Charter recognises the child’s unique and privileged place in African communities and thus generally requiring protection and special care. The AU, as an implementation structure, supports investments in children by stating that they are Africa’s future. The ACRWC accords children a higher level of protection in comparison to the UNCRC. Furthermore, the Charter points out child labour (article 15), sexual exploitation of children (article 27) and the
sale, trafficking, and abduction of children (article 29) as key issues affecting children in Africa. A limitation of the Charter is seen in article 31, whereby emphasis on children’s responsibilities could be in conflict with the child’s right to participate in decisions that affect them or make them vulnerable to trafficking.

2.5.2.3 SADC Declaration on Gender and Development (1997)
This declaration together with its addendum The Prevention and Eradication of Violence Against Women and Children was developed in response to the atrocities mainly committed against women and children. The Declaration demands adoption of socio-legal measures towards the protection of women and children in the region.

2.5.2.4 The Ouagadougou Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings, especially Women and Children (2006)
This action plan was adopted during the European Union-Africa Summit after heads of states made commitments to develop measures to deal with human trafficking. Apart from the general principles outlined, the action plan is structured according to four key pillars namely: prevention and awareness-raising, victim protection and assistance, legislative framework, policy development and law enforcement, and co-operation and co-ordination.

Previous conventions addressed the notions of therapy and justice as two separate entities in of victim assistance in trafficking. However, this action plan hones in on therapeutic jurisprudence by instructing countries to adopt appropriate measures to protect victims, provide them with the necessary assistance, and give them information about their rights. It further recommends that policies and programmes for victims of trafficking be based on international human rights documents, and that countries develop and grow their capacity in order to provide adequate service to victims needing assistance. Finally, the action plan argues that the uniqueness of trafficked children and their developmental stage warrants them to be protected.

2.5.3 South African legal frameworks
South Africa signed and ratified the UN Palermo Protocol and used it as a guideline document when drafting the national Prevention and Combating Trafficking in
Persons Act (2013). The US TIP Reports (2011; 2012; 2013) have consistently reported that South Africa’s lack of comprehensive trafficking legislation placed great responsibility on the country to introduce measures to counter the growing trends of trafficking.

Although South Africa has written the articles of several UN documents into its child protection policy frameworks and trafficking act, anecdotally, the prevalence of various forms of child trafficking remains high. An example illustrating how deficiencies within the South African judicial and child protection systems have been observed to perpetuate children’s vulnerabilities, and exploitation in the country is provided by the following example. In 2005, a 46-year-old Swiss man was fined ZAR 10,000 (USD 1000) after entering into a plea bargain, having been caught sexually defiling a 14-year-old boy in a Johannesburg hotel (Ajam, Russouw & Makgalemele, 2005).

Children must be respected as human beings with clearly defined rights, and South Africa is obligated to provide right entitlements to children. South Africa has designed legislative responses to combat trafficking (Kruger, 2012b). The discussion of the legislative frameworks below show progression, improvements, and measures taken by South Africa to protect trafficked children.

2.5.3.1 The Child Care Act (Act 74 of 1983)

In the Child Care Act, the protection of trafficked children concerned only children who had been found to be in need of care if they were being commercially sexually exploited. Section 50(a) of the Child Care Act criminalised sexual exploitation of children, whereas section 50 “placed an obligation on owners, occupiers, tenants, lessors and managers of buildings in which sexual exploitation of children takes place to report such incidents to the police” (Currie & de Waal, 2005, p. 614). Within section 50, it is also evident that trafficking for other purposes, such as illegal adoption, traditional rituals, forced marriages, and begging was not made explicit.

Debates and a dominant position on child labour indicate that child labour deprives children of their childhood whilst negatively impacting on their wellbeing,
development, and dignity (Dinbabo, 2013; Heady, 2003; ILO, 2001). However, current debates assert that some children’s survival is on the basis of the work that they engage in, and that denying them an opportunity to work would worsen and not actually improve their lives (Calitz, 2013; Liao & Hong, 2011; Moyi, 2011; Okyere, 2012). In light of this discussion, although section 52(a) stipulates that nobody may employ or give work to a child who is under the age of 15, it lacks specific provisions to protect children in illegal employment, and it does not provide any mechanisms for such children to survive without being prematurely employed. Although section 52(a) is subject to Ministerial exemption, “these provisions lack sufficient detail to provide adequate protection for children in employment, and probably do not satisfy the constitutional requirement that children must be protected from exploitative and harmful labour practices” (Currie & de Waal, 2005, p. 615). Enforcement of rigid standards prohibiting younger children to engage in light work may lead to children working in unregulated and unprotected work environments (Calitz, 2013).

In addition, although the Child Care Act recognised maltreatment by the child’s parents, it was not clear if the definition of maltreatment included elements of trafficking. The Act also failed to recognise that increasingly large numbers of children were being exploited by their own parents or caregivers. In as much as this law offered protection to children, it proved inadequate in respecting and promoting some other rights of trafficked children.

This Act made provision for mandatory reporting of abuse. However section 42(1) indicates that limitation in reach by restricting responsibility for reporting to specific health professionals and social workers only, and not including other professionals who come into contact with children. In recognition of the detrimental effect this could have on the protection of children, section 42 was amended by the Child Care Act Amendment Act 94 of 1996 to include mandatory reporting by teachers or any other person employed or managing a children’s home, place of care or shelter. In addition, it made provision for children’s court inquiries in instances where statutory intervention was required. This was done in stages: firstly, it was to determine if the child was in need of care and protection and then, to ensure the child’s placement in alternative care, whilst specifying the rehabilitation options for these children.
However, in comparison to the current Children’s Act (2005), this Act did not offer a wider range of placement options for children found to be in need of care.

2.5.3.2 The Children’s Charter of South Africa (1992)

In consulting with children about their experiences, and making them ‘active participants’ rather than ‘objects of concern’, their experiences become an essential basis for developing genuine child-centred policies and programmes. South African children were involved in South Africa’s struggle for independence (Baines, 2007; Maharaj, 2008). For example, on 21 March 1960, black South Africans in Sharpeville who opposed the carrying of passbooks, offered themselves up for arrest. In response, the police opened fire, 69 people were killed (including 10 children), and 180 people were injured (including 19 children). However, a turning point for South Africa’s history, which is linked to child participation, was the 1976 student uprising in Soweto, where 176 children were killed. The Soweto (Youth) Uprising was in response to the Apartheid government introducing the Afrikaans language as the medium of instruction in all South African schools. The young people who participated in the uprising defied Bantu education, which was considered inferior, and these protests are reported to have revitalised the South African struggle for liberation. The Soweto Uprising was also significant in highlighting “the important role children can play in changing their own destiny, while asserting their ability to claim both their rights and political power through participation” (Viviers & Lombard, 2013, p. 8). Subsequently in years to come, children from all over South Africa were instrumental in drawing up the South African Children’s Charter, where they voiced their concerns about inequality, discrimination, and unjust treatment. Article 9 of the Charter clearly called for the prohibition of child labour, slavery, and the sexual exploitation of children.

It ought to be acknowledged that this Charter was part of the reference documents during consultations on the drafting of the South African Constitution. This was a progressive document, as the muteness of South African children’s voices were ended though participatory and empowering approaches used to involve children in the drafting process. The development of a participatory rights paradigm in which children themselves are regarded as key social actors, whose own views and
perspectives are to be taken into account, was central to understanding issues that affected children (James, 2010, p. 255).

2.5.3.3 The Constitution of South Africa (1996)
The South African Bill of Rights is described as a cornerstone of democracy in South Africa and it stipulates that all people, including children, have inherent dignity and the right to have their dignity respected and protected. Section 12 of the Constitution guarantees every person, irrespective of age, the right to freedom and security. From the best interest determination, child trafficking violates children’s rights to survival, participation, and development. Moreover, it robs them of their childhood and further undermines the right of any child to grow up in a protective environment, free from abuse, violence, and exploitation.

The Constitution reinforces the status of children as subjects of human rights (Duncan, 2008). This is apparent in South Africa’s commitment to children’s rights as clearly outlined in sections 28(1)(d), (e), (f)(i)(ii) and (g) of the Constitution. It stipulates that:

28(1). Every child has a right:
(d) to be protected from maltreatment, neglect, abuse of degradation;
(e) to be protected from exploitative labour practices;
(f) not to be required or permitted to perform work or provide services that
   (i) are inappropriate for a person of the child’s age; or
   (ii) place at risk the child’s wellbeing, education, physical or mental health or spiritual, moral or social development;
(g) and not to be detained except as a measure of last resort.

In determining the socio-cultural factors such as the social acceptance of making children work, or migration-related traditions, it is important to stress that children have an absolute need for protection against harm at all times. Furthermore, in section 28(2), the Constitution mandates that children’s best interests must be of paramount importance in every matter concerning the child, including children who are victims of trafficking. In addition to general protection and socio-economic rights, section 28 of the Constitution stipulates that children also have a right to “basic
nutrition, shelter, basic health care services and social services”. While the term ‘basic’ is not defined, the duty bearer, the state is responsible for ensuring that vulnerable children are assisted (Dawes et al., 2007). According to Skelton (2009b, p. 275), the two underlying and inter-linked themes in children’s rights that have been clearly mentioned in the Constitution are the need for protection and the recognition of autonomy.

South Africa’s progressive legislative framework supports children’s participation as a right. In support of the Constitution, Viviers and Lombard (2013) highlight the three South African pieces of legislation that allow children to participate in matters affecting them. These include the South African Schools Act 84 of 1996, the National Health Act 61 of 2003, and the Children’s Act 38 of 2005 as amended. In light of the above discussion, one can see that the South African Constitution is truly a framework for legislative and policy reform (Duncan, 2008). It is essential for social workers to safeguard and facilitate children’s participation in an ethical, authentic, reflective, and respectful manner.

2.5.3.4 The Children’s Act (Act 38 of 2005, as amended)

The Children’s Act provides for the administration of justice in children’s courts, while also making provisions for children in need of care and protection. This statement could be supported by September’s (2006) argument that the over-arching purpose of the Children’s Act was to consolidate South Africa’s fragmented child welfare system. In addition, the Children’s Act’s sections 2(b)(iii)(iv), (f), and (g) seeks to protect children from exploitation, recognises that their best interests are paramount, and endeavours to promote children’s protection, care, and well-being. The Children’s Act gives effect to certain rights of children as outlined in the Constitution and the international child protection and trafficking conventions that South Africa has ratified.

Although one of the objectives of the Children’s Act is to give effect to the UN Palermo Protocol, the definition of trafficking in children presented in the Children’s Act is different from the one in the Palermo Protocol. The Palermo Protocol does not require evidence of means used to traffick children, whereas the Children’s Act
requires that the means are presented in child-trafficking cases. This compromises procedures related to rapid identification of child victims and the subsequent statutory intervention necessary. Kassan and Mahery (2009) have further criticised the child-trafficking definition in the Children’s Act for not including illegal adoption as a purpose for trafficking.

A critique of the repealed Chapter 18 in the Children’s Act is that it hastened to give explanations on criminalising trafficking but failed to provide trafficking-specific prevention and early intervention strategies, and specialised training for front-line service providers. For example, it is essential that effective referral mechanisms are in place to ensure that non-South African children who are vulnerable to being trafficked are first treated like children, and subsequently identified and referred for appropriate services. However, difficulties arise when attempts are made to implement the policy. One major drawback is that unaccompanied children who have been referred for documentation and who exhibit reasonable indications of being trafficked or be at risk of being trafficked, are generally not referred to child protection units specialising in anti-trafficking work (Elliott & Segal, 2012; Hopper, 2004).

The main weakness of the Children’s Act is the failure to address and prioritise identification of child victims. Many migrant children who are vulnerable to trafficking end up falling through the cracks, being arrested, and illegally detained (Palmary, 2009). Kreston (2007) argues that the lack of appropriate rapid identification measures puts trafficked children at further risk and hampers the achievement and protection of their rights. Furthermore, shortcomings are noted within victim services, as there is an overwhelming emphasis on repatriation of child trafficking victims to their countries of origin. This is bound to fail as a long-term strategy, because the unique needs of the child that made him or her vulnerable in the first place have not been adequately addressed. Although there is a lack of specific provision for psychosocial and/or legal assistance in South Africa, if it is not in the trafficked child’s best interest to be returned home, social workers are tasked with the critical role of providing support for child victims.

The main strengths of this legislation are that general prevention and early intervention strategies have been recommended. In addition, it makes mention of the
various purposes for which a child could be trafficked, into and out of South Africa. Parent’s rights and responsibilities is an increasingly crucial area in the Children’s Act. In recent years, there has been increasing interest in claims of parenthood, especially against parents who traffic their children or those that allow other people to exploit their children for any gain (Ramaekers & Suissa, 2012). This also means that any or all parental rights and responsibilities of that parent or caregiver can be terminated by the court (Skelton, 2009a). In addition, accomplices in the trafficking process are punishable within the existing law.

The Children’s Act criminalises the trafficking of children, which indicates that child trafficking is considered a serious offence in South Africa. In section 305(8) of the Children’s Act, harsh sentencing and penalties of a fine or imprisonment of up to 20 years, or both, have also been imposed as a deterrent to facilitating the commercial sexual abuse of children.

2.5.3.5 Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) (Amendment Act 32 of 2007)

The study by Allais et al. (2010) reported that although South Africa did not have trafficking legislation, “the provision of adequate and effective protection to victims of sexual offences is enshrined in the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act”. The definition of trafficking provided for in this Act is similar to the one in the UN Palermo Protocol. The limitation of the Amendment Act was that it only covered victims of sexual exploitation, unlike that which is outlined in the UN Trafficking Protocol or the South African Trafficking Act. Sections 70 and 71 of the Sexual Offences Act have been repealed and the definitions applicable to sexual offences are provided in Chapters 2, 3, and 4 of the Trafficking Act.

Legislative reforms that do not take into account the non-alignment of national legislation makes it difficult to identify trafficked children and to provide the immediate necessary assistance that they require (Sedletzki, 2008). The issue of consent differs, and the UN Trafficking Protocol states that consent is irrelevant because it was probably achieved by dubious means, and it does not apply to children if trafficking intent can be proved. The interpretation of the Children’s Act is that any
young person under the age of 18 cannot give full consent due to their under-developed and sometimes irrational thought processes. The Sexual Offences Act states that children below the age of 12 are not able to consent validly, but fails to address the issue of consent with children between the ages 12 and 18. It is thus evident that by aligning policies, the core child protection systems in the various government departments in South Africa can be strengthened.

Identification of child victims of trafficking can also be informed by police investigations of other crimes that are either directly or indirectly linked to trafficking, such as domestic violence, prostitution, kidnapping, and drug trafficking. In light of this, the Sexual Offences Act advocates that victims of trafficking, including children, will not be liable for any offences of a criminal nature that were committed as a direct result of their trafficking situation. This clause is aligned to section 22(4) of the Trafficking Act, which states that criminal prosecution may not be instituted against victims of trafficking.

Although there is no specific sentencing provision included in the Sexual Offences Act, an emerging practice was in the case of State v Dos Santos, where 28-year-old Mozambican national Aldina dos Santos was found guilty by the South Gauteng High Court of trafficking three girls to South Africa in February 2008. In July 2011, Ms. dos Santos was convicted under the Sexual Offences Act and was sentenced to life imprisonment and given an additional year for living off the proceeds of trafficking.

2.5.3.6 The Prevention and Combating Trafficking in Persons Act (Act 7 of 2013)

South African president, the Hon. Jacob Zuma signed the Trafficking Bill on 28 July 2013, making it a law. The Act has an inclusive definition of trafficking, which takes cognisance of child trafficking, illegal adoption of children, and forced marriages. The new definition of exploitation provided is broad and covers a wide range of exploitative elements, including impregnation against one’s will for the purposes of selling the child after birth. The expanded definition makes the Act more prescriptive, and subsequently it can assist frontline professionals in rapid identification of victims.
Chapter 2 of the Trafficking Act is commendable, as it introduces harsh penalties for trafficking-related offences committed both in and outside of South Africa. The fact that trafficking can take place across borders has been addressed by repealing section 291 of the Children’s Act, and including it as section 12 of the Trafficking Act. Upon conviction, life imprisonment without the option of a fine, and life imprisonment and a fine not exceeding ZAR 100 million (USD 10 million) are the harshest penalties outlined in section 13. Additional protection has been provided for children, as no defence is recognised for the perpetrator, even if the child consented to being trafficked or to the exploitation. Furthermore, the government is establishing better measures to protect children, and as highlighted in section 14(i) harsher sentences will be given to perpetrators if the victim of trafficking is a child.

The identification of child victims of trafficking has been recognised as a challenge all over the world, including South Africa. Unlike several previous drafts, the Act includes a section on reporting child victims of trafficking, which will hopefully hasten the rapid identification and referral of child victims. The inclusion of section 18 in the Act is due to the recognition that after escaping from a trafficking situation, the severity and range of symptoms exhibited by the child usually indicates the importance of rapid intervention. A strong relationship between child protection and shared national responsibility has been supported by the introduction of section 18(1) that stipulates mandatory reporting by any person who suspects child trafficking. The clause on mandatory reporting acknowledges that the general population is the largest single source of potential intelligence, and thus it is essential that its significance in anti-trafficking efforts is not under-estimated (Oketch et al., 2012; OSCE, 2011). The community-policing philosophy was recently praised by the South African Police Minister Nathi Methethwa when he said “community interactions help us to tap into the collective wisdom of citizens in order to enhance crime prevention…whilst jointly seeking solutions around crime” (South African Government News Agency, 2013). It ought to be acknowledged that different actors within human trafficking may still identify victims differently, and may use different indicators depending on their agendas and their professional mandates (Gozdziak & MacDonnell, 2007; Pearce, 2009). However, despite the challenges involved in child victim identification, identification remains the first crucial step towards providing assistance, care, and protection to trafficked children.
Section 18(6) of the Trafficking Act states that the child victim of trafficking ought to be assessed immediately, based on the information received from South African Police Services (SAPS). These stipulations are made with reference to section 151, 155(2), and 156 of the Children’s Act. In cases involving non-South African children, section 11(1)(a) of the Immigration Act (Act 13 of 2002) is also applicable with the Department of Home Affairs (DoHA) issuing a visitor’s visa that subsequently allows the victim to remain in the country during the recovery and reflection period. However, section 18(8) states that non-South African child victims can be allowed to stay in South Africa for the duration of the children’s court order. Sections 18(8) and 15(1) need to be aligned to give more clarity on the procedures to be followed with child victims of trafficking.

A crucial principle in the care and protection of victims of trafficking, as outlined in the UN document on Recommended Principles and Guidelines (2002), is that victims must not be prosecuted for crimes committed when they were in a trafficking situation or for criminal behaviour or offences that were a consequence of trafficking. This has been highlighted in section 22 of the Act. The criminalisation of child victims of trafficking or their confinement in detention centres places blame on the child victims, it enhances the trafficker’s power, and limits children’s access to justice and to the relevant psychosocial services. Furthermore, it reinforces the messages and threats of traffickers and exploiters – that is, that the victims will be treated like criminals if the police find them.

The Trafficking Act provides an array of services for adult victims as outlined in section 26(1), although there is no provision for the specialised treatment for children as outlined by the UNICEF (2007) guidelines. In section 16(5), the Act states that presumed child victims of trafficking need to be referred to a designated child protection organisation to determine if they need care and protection. This clause affects the comprehensiveness of the Act. Operating according to minimum standards is a legal obligation for any accredited organisation or care-giving facility, as stipulated in section 25 of the Act. However, due to lack of adherence to the standards mentioned in the Act, penalties ought to have been included. The above-mentioned measures could offer further protection for trafficked children, if the Act is well-implemented.
In Chapter 7 of the Act, the repatriation of child victims of trafficking is outlined in section 31(1)(a), (b), (c), and (d). Chapter 7 prohibits summary deportations, ensuring that children’s rights are promoted and respected. In section 31(3)(a) and (b), voluntary repatriation of adults is allowed on condition that protective information is given, and clear repatriation procedures are explained to the victim. However, the Act is silent on voluntary repatriation of children in instances where former trafficked children attempt to exercise their sense of agency. The Act is commended for not repatriating victims if they do not contribute towards the criminal justice system. It is essential that the ultimate intention is not to make law enforcement more effective at the expense of the victims, but rather to complement the protection of human rights of victims, and especially the dignity of the victims as human beings.

This recently introduced Act is generally more comprehensive in nature, it has various strengths in comparison to previous Trafficking Bills, and other legislations that attempted to prevent and combat trafficking. It is also apparent that the protection of trafficked children has been prioritised. Preventative policy interventions is an integral part of combating trafficking because it acts to reduce primary, secondary, and tertiary risks and other vulnerabilities. It was thus somewhat surprising that Chapter 2 in the previous Trafficking Bills that addressed prevention was shifted, and is currently inconspicuously included in Chapter 9 (section 41(1)(c)) as part of administration of the Trafficking Act. The Trafficking Act should be speedily implemented to ensure that more walls of silence that perpetuate children’s exploitation are broken down.

2.6 SITUATING TRAFFICKING LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORKS WITHIN THE ECOLOGICAL APPROACH

In as much as social work faces turbulent times in the changing contexts of practice, enhancing the well-being of their client population remains a vital issue for social workers (Dominelli & Hackett, 2011; Strier & Binyamin, 2013). The well-being of all persons either in or out of South Africa, including children, individually or as a collective, remains a crucial goal and the ultimate objective of the ratification of international conventions and development of national social policies. Thus, central
to the discussions on legislative frameworks and policies, is the nature of an individual's functioning, and the distribution of well-being in just and fair ways.

The person-in-environment perspective within social work generalist practice requires social workers to situate their client within a context (Hepworth et al., 2013; Potgieter, 1998). It is essential for social workers working from a systems perspective to acknowledge that people interact with their environment, and that this environment might provide opportunities and/or barriers to development and achievement of goals. Trafficked children require basic needs to survive and realize their capabilities, potential, and goals. However, they live in a community, and the community has collective needs. These collective needs, including legislative frameworks, are influential, and their fulfilment enhances or restricts the children's development and achievement of rights. These legislative frameworks, like the ones mentioned in this chapter, are a consequence of and reflect the institutional environment of South Africa. Social workers recognize that legislative frameworks influence human behaviour, the relationships between people, and society's functions. As argued by Elliott and Segal (2012), social workers' understanding of the legal framework is significant, because these frameworks influence the acceptance levels when victims of trafficking are being assisted, integrated, or resettled in host communities, and it also affects the immigration, child protection, and trafficking policy development and implementation in South Africa.

The previous explanation illustrates that social conditions and problems are not independent entities, but that they are part of whole societal systems. Based on the ecological approach, it is challenging to change or implement legislation and policy without changing parts of a system (Friedman & Allen, 2010). Fragmented, piecemeal approaches rarely result in significant benefits, and a good example of this has been in South Africa whereby different legislations were being used to combat trafficking until recently, i.e. July 2013, when the Trafficking Act was passed. This subsequently affected the identification and reporting of trafficking, and disjointed intervention strategies that were being applied during case management. In light of this, it is important to acknowledge that human trafficking is not static, and according to Lee (2011, p. 47), “the changing patterns in the trafficking flows reflects the
capacity of traffickers to respond quickly to changing political and economic conditions and to adapt to counter-trafficking responses”.

Recognising that change in one part of a system influences all other parts, policy planners in South Africa applied more holistic approaches that looked at the trafficking population group in its entirety, including links to the environment. This is evident in the South African Trafficking Act (2013) that was signed into law recently. The policy planners and drafters recognized that the quality of the whole and the quantitative sum of the Trafficking Act’s parts, and as challenging as it was, the myriad interdependencies that exist are included, including cultural, psychological, economic, and political factors. The lengthy development of the Trafficking Act (2013) could have been influenced by the interdependencies identified, re-alignment of laws, and the nature of trafficking, i.e. how it manifests itself and how it changes.

Legislative frameworks do not exist in a vacuum and are part of macro processes. The related characteristics of legislative frameworks are vital to understand in their entirety, i.e. as a whole. That is, recognising and understanding the reciprocal interactions between people and their environment and the ecological context where these exchanges are taking place. All the legislative frameworks mentioned previously have transpired as a result of the politico-socio-economic environment and the legal, technological, and cultural forces shaping and complementing the setting.

Understanding the macro dimensions of legislative frameworks requires analysing the whole, and viewing social problems in the context of interactions between people and the environment. Social work micro, meso, and macro approaches are complementary and all are necessary in the planning and formulation of legislation and policies. In social work practice, these methods have been known to strengthen and enrich each other. Therefore, it is essential that social workers understand these methods in order to accelerate identification, assistance provision, and growth and development of trafficked children.

Social work is committed to facilitating change in the context of person-in-environment, thus, it is a profession that is therapeutic and reformist in nature, and whose goal (in relation to this study) is the trafficked child’s development and
transformation of their social conditions (Badwall & Razack, 2012; Friedman & Allen, 2010; Preston-Shoot & Hojer, 2012). It is essential that legislative frameworks, which promote child development and societal well-being, are informed by relevant theories, rites, and rights that are context-specific (Osei-Hwedie & Rankopo, 2012; Payne, 2009; Sundai, Sylvestri & Bassi, 2012). Imoh (2013, p. 38) highlights the fact that in as much as many social workers in various countries strive to implement child rights provisions, their efforts are hampered because “the reality of people’s lives shows that they live their lives at crossroads of culture and global standards”. Subsequently, governments face limitations imposed by poverty and by the culture(s) of the communities that they oversee, which in turn impedes realisation of children’s rights (Dinbabo, 2013; Grover, 2004). Therefore, effective legislative frameworks link micro, meso, and macro practice methods within social work. The issues of trafficked children in South Africa will be better addressed with the implementation of the Trafficking Act (2013), which complements the Children’s Act (2005).

Social work in South Africa, a society that is transforming, needs to be empowering and multidimensional. The politicisation of human tragedy in instances of child trafficking and “in order to provide effective services, social workers need to understand the context of their clients experiences, as well as the complexity of world politics and economics that influence the way governments of nation-states formulate immigration policies” (Elliott & Segal, 2012, p. 565). This could assist in gaining different aspects of systemic interactions, which could enhance or restore the trafficked child’s functioning and recovery (Harvey, 1996). Renewed progressive practice approaches, models, guidelines, and paradigms are needed to meet the need for more effective social service delivery, and for rigorous exploration of the best pathways when confronted with complex moral and rights-based dilemmas when engaging with trafficked children.

2.7 CONCLUSION

This chapter presented contextual background information on child trafficking across the globe and in South Africa. In addition, international, regional, and South African legal instruments, legislative frameworks, protocols, policies, and action plans that apply to child trafficking were reviewed. The qualitative research framework used
enabled swift revision to be made in this chapter, especially in relation to the South African Trafficking Act being passed.

The discussion on the background information and legislative frameworks is significant because social work intervention with non-South African nationals acknowledges that the lives of these trafficked children and their life experiences go far beyond the South African boundaries. The chapter also generally discussed the legislative frameworks within the ecological approach. Children’s rights and protection is a major recurring facet in each of the legal frameworks mentioned. The progression within the frameworks mentioned, from international to regional to local, show evidence that unless we develop a greater understanding of the forces shaping the conventions, it becomes a challenge to prevent, assess, manage, or combat transnational trafficking in children, even at a local level. Therefore, formulating policies that matter is imperative if children’s rights are to be achieved. The next chapter looks at the research methodology that is necessary in the formulation of a guideline policy document for social workers working with trafficked children.
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter presents the research methodology that was applied in the study. The specific phases and activities in the D&D intervention research model, which have been identified and contextualised to this study, are then discussed. Interventions “are the core technologies of the helping professions” including within the discipline of social work (Thomas, 1984, p. 7). This chapter also looks at intervention research and shows the suitability of the Rothman and Thomas (1994) D&D model for this study.

In this chapter, document analysis was used as a qualitative research method. The research design used was exploratory in nature. The documents that were carefully selected and reviewed were either printed and electronic-based. The data, which was drawn mainly from books and journals, was interpreted in order to elicit meaning, provide historical insights, and gain a deeper understanding on intervention research. In line with phase four of the D&D model, data was also collected using qualitative research methods.

3.2 INTERVENTION RESEARCH
The ever-growing burden of child trafficking, worldwide and in South Africa, demands that effective and efficient interventions are designed and put into practice to reduce psychosocial challenges and inequalities. Thus, interventions are purposively implemented change strategies, which may be complex or simple, depending on the social issue at hand (Fraser & Galinsky, 2010). Social work is distinguishable from other professions because it strives to induce changes, with the essence of social work research being the development and designing of systematic change strategies (Fraser, 2004). Currently, evidence-based practice is being emphasised and promoted in an attempt to bridge the gap between research and practice. Howard, McMillen and Pollio (2003) and Kirk (1999) argue in favour of this when they state that practitioners ought to regularly teach and apply safe, efficient, and empirically validated interventions.
Intervention research draws upon various disciplines with the ultimate goal being the development of interventions that can be evaluated, whilst maximising the likelihood that the client will receive the most efficient intervention possible. Thomas (1984, p. 29) supports this argument by indicating that interventions “should be part of a helping strategy in which other components help shape the interventive action and have an influence on the outcomes achieved”. Richey and Roffman (1999) argue that guidelines do not necessarily contribute towards positive client outcomes in practice, has been supported by Fraser (2004), Howard and Jenson (1999a, 1999b), Howard et al. (2003), Kirk (1999), and Williams and Lanigan (1999). However, Richey and Roffman (1999, p. 314) agree that in as much as guidelines can suggest or recommend practice components or strategies, it is essential that guidelines do not “replace the need for sound professional assessment, evaluation and decision-making that must be done on a case-to-case basis”.

According to Hawe and Potvin (2009, pp. 10-11) intervention research is “all about all parts of the process of designing and testing solutions to problems and about getting solutions in place”. Whereas, according to Fraser and Galinsky (2010, p. 459), intervention research is “the systematic study of purposive change strategies...as characterized by both the design and development of interventions”. Intervention research and developmental research have in the past been used concurrently. Thomas (1984, p. 23) states that developmental research incorporates ways in which social technology within social work is “analysed, designed, created and evaluated...strong emphasis is placed on generation processes by which information from basic sources is transformed into designs for innovation”.

In social work, both intervention and developmental research can be understood to be forms of applied research, which entails the systematic study of purposive transformative approaches and holistic practice principles aimed at improving interventions. According to Fouche and De Vos (2011), applied research in social work attempts to solve practical and real problems, and it is characterised by design and development of interventions. As emphasised by Thomas (1984, p. 25), “without a design methodology, the human service professions are deprived of a means by which they can be involved systematically and actively in generating the intervention
methods so vital to their professional accomplishment”. Interventions for use in social work practice can be guided and informed by intervention knowledge development, knowledge utilisation and/or intervention design and development.

### 3.2.1 Facets of intervention research

The facets of intervention research, as depicted in Figure 3.1 below, are intervention knowledge development (KD), knowledge utilization for intervention (KU) and intervention D&D. As further depicted in the figure, there is evidence that certain levels of interrelationships exist among these facets.

**Figure 3.1: Facets of intervention research (adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)**

The methods of study involved in the facets of intervention research are similar, however the purpose derived from the generated activities differs. The D&D model was as a result of social work research finding a link between practice and knowledge. The basic rationale behind the model is that the research that social workers conduct needs to inform practice and vice versa. According to Rothman and Thomas (1994), D&D can be viewed within the social work problem-solving process, as seeking to create effective intervention frameworks and helping tools to deal with the identified real life psychosocial challenges. However, the difference between
D&D and other social work problem-solving methods is that “it is a process that is systematic, deliberate and immersed in research procedures, techniques and other instrumentalities…aiming to produce workable human service technology rather than generalizable knowledge per se” (Thomas & Rothman, 1994, p. 12). The D&D facet of intervention research appeals to this study because it draws from numerous disciplines such as evaluation research, technology assessment, knowledge utilisation, and design and practice technology. Therefore, research and social science methods are applied to the needs and creation of innovative social work practice and policy.

The D &D model outlines the systematic development of interventions in six phases, as shown in the figure 3.2 below:

![Figure 3.2: The six phases of the D&D model](image)

Each phase above has unique activities that are essential and that have to be conducted in order to complete the work of that phase. It is further reiterated that “although performed in a stepwise sequence, some of the activities associated with each phase continue after the introduction of the next phase” (Thomas & Rothman, 1994, p. 9).
According to Thomas and Rothman (1994), KD is the foundation for understanding aspects of interventions that informs subsequent D&D. Areas associated with KD include improved knowledge on relevant target behaviour in client systems, relevant intervention behaviour, and the relevant socio-economic, cultural, behavioural, and context-specific environmental conditions. The methodology involved in KD research consists of research methods and techniques within behavioural and social science research. KD can be conducted as an individual activity, it can be linked to both KU and D&D, and it can be incorporated into a D&D activity (Thomas & Rothman, 1994).

KU is the process and activity that entails research knowledge being converted and produced in a user-friendly and practical format. According to Thomas & Rothman, (1994, p. 18), “the processes of KU range from the selection, retrieval, appraisal, codification and synthesis of relevant knowledge to formulating generalizations, stipulating practice guidelines, and making them operational”. It is evident here that the relationship between KU and D&D in the above-mentioned processes can be a vital part of the information gathering and design phases of D&D.

The objective of the study was intervention research as the researcher wanted to create intervention guidelines and develop a social technology. The purpose of the intervention guidelines is to guide social work practice with trafficked children, and subsequently inform child protection policies (Baker, 2001; Strydom et al., 2007). These practice guidelines could assist social workers’ activities to be focussed, sequential, systematic, and more orderly when engaging with trafficked children. Rothman and Thomas’s (1994) D&D intervention research model, including elements from KD and KU, are applied in this study on child trafficking.

3.3 ROTHMAN AND THOMAS D&D MODEL

In social work, problem-solving “is concerned with the basic human needs of people that are blocking their interaction with other systems...and tries to facilitate change in the thinking, feeling, behaviour, interaction, structure and/ or context of systems and their environment” (Potgieter, 2008, p. 31). Therefore, an integrated practice framework is based on the assumption that social problems, development, and ecological contexts are inter-linked (Bronfenbrenner, 1994; Collins & Collins, 2005;
Fraser, 2004; Marsh & Fisher, 2007; Potgieter, 2008). Subsequently, intervention models such as Thomas’s (1984) Intervention Developmental Model, Rothman and Thomas (1994) Intervention D&D Model, and Nel and Nel’s (1993) Integrated Development Model builds on these assumptions and focuses on the interaction between these three elements. Nel and Nel’s (1993) model was based on earlier work by Thomas (1984) and has been applied to Luck’s (2005) South African study on self-esteem. The D&D model has recently been applied to South African social work studies on bibliotherapy techniques by Oelofsen (2012) and Oelofsen and Grobler (2013), and on foster care by Galloway (2013). The model has also been used by:

- Londt (2004) to develop risk-based assessment and intervention guidelines with perpetrators of intimate violence;
- Makhuba (2005) to create a framework for social workers who engage with sexually abused children within the South African criminal justice system;
- Murray (2006) to develop a measuring instrument to assess human factors of air traffic controllers;
- du Preez and Roux (2008) to study professional programmes for in-service teachers;
- Wicomb (2008) to work on a life skills intervention programme for Afrikaans-speaking youth offenders;
- Pitsie (2009) to develop a model for social support services for members of the South African National Defence Force (SANDF);
- Twalo (2010) to develop an HIV/AIDS workplace support programme for teachers;
- Drenth, Herbst and Strydom (2010) to develop a complicated grief model; and
- Binneman (2011) to create gestalt guidelines to assist mine workers enhance their father-child relationships.

The selected South African studies presented above suggest that D&D is emerging as a significant model within South African studies, and in the development of human service interventions.

Rothman and Thomas’s (1994) model has six well-defined phases, as previously depicted in Figure 3.2. For the purpose of this study, only the first four phases are
applied, as illustrated in Figure 3.3. However, the activities are taken from both Rothman and Thomas (1994) and Thomas (1984), in line with the goals of the study. “D&D may be conceptualized as a problem-solving process for seeking effective interventive and helping tools to deal with given human and social difficulties” (Thomas & Rothman, 1994, p. 12).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phases</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Problem identification, analysis,</td>
<td>i) Problem identification and analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and research planning</td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Document study and interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) State-of-the-art review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Document study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iii) Feasibility study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Peer evaluation, document study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Information gathering and synthesis</td>
<td>i) Document study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Textual and content analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) Studying natural examples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Data collection through interviews and thematic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>analysis of data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Design</td>
<td>i) Designing observational elements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Data synthesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) Specifying procedural elements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Data synthesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Early development and pilot testing</td>
<td>i) Developing a preliminary intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Document study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii) Application of design criteria to preliminary intervention and results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Data collection using emailed evaluation forms and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>telephonic interviews and data analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iv) Developmental testing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Research activity</strong>: Data synthesis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 3.3: Phases and activities of intervention research (Adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)

The phases of the D&D model are outlined vertically although they merged and overlapped as the researcher responded to opportunities and challenges in the shifting context of applied research. De Vos and Strydom (2011) assert that activities outlined in every phase are significant, but caution that the activities should be carried out with flexibility, which allows for them to continue in the next phase, if need be. It is also essential that intervention researchers are aware that looping back to earlier phases may be necessary, especially in instances where challenges are encountered or new information is obtained (Rothman & Thomas, 1994).

3.4 APPLICATION OF THE D&D MODEL TO CHILD TRAFFICKING

When intervention is applied by a social worker, the main goal is to enhance the social functioning and well-being of the client. In light of this, intervention research is conducted with “the purpose of conceiving, creating and testing innovative human services approaches to preventing or ameliorating problems or to maintaining quality of life” (De Vos & Strydom, 2011, p. 475). The central aim of intervention research in this study was to generate ways for improving trafficked children’s psychosocial health and well-being.

Rothman and Thomas’ (1994) D&D model was chosen for this study because “it takes as its original point of departure a given real world problem and practical goal, rather than a hypothesis to be tested or a theory to be explored” (Thomas & Rothman, 1994, p. 12). As a form of applied research, the researcher examined relationships between important conditions identified by trafficked children and key stakeholders and personal/environmental factors that contributed to such conditions. In this way, right from the beginning, the fundamental perspectives of D&D and the basic social sciences diverge. According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 25), this research “attempts as much as possible to diffuse the dual purposes of applied science in the same endeavour: promoting understanding of individual or institutional conditions and contributing to their improvement”.
The process of development within the D&D model requires sensitive involvement of users and stakeholders who are significant in the practice implementation of the intervention. In addition, it is mandatory that interventions are “deliberate, structured, sustainable, valid and reliable in order to lead to clearly identifiable outcomes and benefits for the participants of the programme” (De Vos & Strydom, 2011, p. 475). These were appealing characteristics of the model, in addition to it being directed by the practical realities in the social work field. D&D was contextualised to this study on child trafficking, and only the first four phases of the model were used, namely problem analysis and project planning; information gathering and synthesis; design of the intervention; and early development and pilot testing. These were in line with achieving the objectives of the study below, which included:

i) to analyse the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa;
ii) to gather information on how transnational trafficked children experience identification and assistance provision procedures;
iii) to design guidelines for social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking;
iv) to evaluate the feasibility of the guidelines with social workers in the field; and
v) to provide recommendations to social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking.

In certain instances, descriptions of activities within Thomas’s (1984) developmental phases were incorporated to expand on the explanations of activities. Thomas’s (1984) developmental model was used in this study because it was relevant to the research phenomenon being studied, and it speaks to both design and evaluation of interventions. Other recent authorities in the field of intervention research, such as Fraser and Galinsky (2010), Gilgun and Sands (2012), Mullen (1994) and Rosen and Proctor (2003) were also used. The analysis of publications by multiple intervention researchers assisted the researcher to validate findings and to substantiate information derived from other sources (Bowen, 2009), and in the development of a comprehensive guideline. In addition, the researcher was flexible and aware that
though the D&D model is ideally stepwise and linear, looping back to earlier phases occurred.

Table 3.1 D&D phases, research procedure, and processes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D&amp;D phases</th>
<th>Objectives of the study</th>
<th>Research purpose</th>
<th>Research approach</th>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase 1: Problem identification, analysis and research planning</td>
<td>To analyse the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa</td>
<td>Exploratory</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Documents</td>
<td>Textual and content analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social workers and human trafficking/child protection experts</td>
<td>Informal interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase 2: Information gathering and synthesis</td>
<td>To gather information on how trafficked children experience identification and assistance provision procedures</td>
<td>Exploratory Descriptive</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Face-to-face interviews Art work Observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social workers</td>
<td>Face-to-face interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>Face-to-face interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase 3: Design</td>
<td>To design practical guidelines for social workers working with child victims of trafficking</td>
<td>Intervention Descriptive</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Documents</td>
<td>Data synthesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Empirical data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase 4: Early development and pilot testing</td>
<td>To evaluate the feasibility of the guidelines document with social workers in the field</td>
<td>Intervention Evaluative Analytical</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Documents</td>
<td>Textual and content analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social workers</td>
<td>Evaluation form Telephonic interviews</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An overview of the phases of the D&D model used in this study, as depicted in Table 3.1, is presented next. However, the phases and the activities are discussed in-depth in subsequent chapters i.e. chapters 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, and 9.

3.4.1 Problem identification, analysis and research planning phase

The main activities in this phase which are briefly discussed are:

i) problem identification and analysis;
ii) state of-the-art review; and
iii) feasibility study.

A qualitative research approach was used during problem identification and analysis. The qualitative research methods used included document analysis and interviews with social workers and experts. The research purpose was exploratory in nature (Strydom, 2013).

3.4.1.1 Problem identification and analysis

In the context of this study, a problem “is a recognized human service need for which existing approaches or methods are not satisfactory” (Thomas, 1984, p. 142). The general problematic human condition, which was identified in Chapter 2, is child trafficking. Trafficked children were chosen because their issues are topical and their psychosocial issues continue to be both current and of emerging interest to social workers, policy-makers, and researchers worldwide and in South African society at large (Fawcett et al., 1994; ILO et al., 2009; Surtees, 2007; Sigfridsson, 2012). The specific targets and goals of the intervention were related to post-trafficking issues of identification of trafficked children and initial assistance to them, as discussed in depth in Chapter 4. The selection of trafficked children at this stage was intended to ensure that intervention guidelines are developed with sensitivity.

Thomas (1984) stresses that being able to identify a problematic human condition is not sufficient, and it needs to be followed through with analysis. The analysis is essential in explaining the extent of the problem, components of the problem, causal factors, and/ or the effects of the problem. The problematisation of trafficking-related identification and assistance provision was linked to, and framed within, greater
societal challenges. The analysis of the problem led to the identification of relevant stakeholders in the immediate and broader environment, beyond those typically blamed for the problem of trafficking. Finally, the responses guided the researcher towards the choice of intervention research goal, i.e. the development of intervention guidelines.

3.4.1.2 State of-the-art review

The state of-the-art review entailed identifying existing interventions. According to Thomas (1984, p. 145), it is important to conduct this review initially because “it serves to identify the strengths and limitations of existing intervention methods. Without a careful review, directions for the development of new interventions cannot be knowledgeably charted or begun”. The qualitative research method used in this activity was document analysis. Literature on human trafficking was reviewed systematically, looking at South African and global studies and published and unpublished articles. The researcher also reviewed social work practice in South Africa, based on her previous roles as a social worker and as an anti-trafficking national coordinator. During problem identification, the researcher made contact with counter-trafficking organisations, social workers, and experts and asked key questions in attempt to identify, understand, and analyse pertinent issues within child trafficking. The consistent theme identified was that of protection and care to child victims of trafficking though rapid identification and assistance provision.

According to Thomas (1984, p. 145) “successful identification and analysis of the problem serves mainly to establish the importance and dimensions of the problem area, but it does not rule out the possibility that relevant interventions are already available”. Relevant intervention programmes and/or guidelines for child trafficking were identified in Europe (OHCHR, 2002; UNICEF, 2007; Wolfensohn, 2004), UK (Baker, 2001; Delaney & Cotterill, 2005), Asia (Bhagat, 2008; UNICEF et al., 2005) and East Africa (Odera & Malinowski, 2011). To date, there is no documented research in South Africa that has developed intervention guidelines or programmes for child victims of trafficking. Thus, through content analysis, the state-of-the-art review identified strengths and limitations of existing guidelines that would be vital in the researcher’s development of social work guidelines for South Africa.
3.4.1.3 Feasibility study
The goal of conducting a feasibility study is to ensure that designing the intervention does not lead to a waste of time, money and/ or any other resources. However, it is also important that there are adequate resources to facilitate the development of the social technology. According to Thomas (1984), a feasibility study refers to the practicality of the proposed research project and includes determining technical, organisational, economic, financial, political and use practicalities.

Technical feasibility addresses the factual basis for developing the innovation whereas organisational feasibility looks at the researcher’s ability and UJ’s capacity to carry out the proposed development. The extent to which expected benefits balance out the expected costs are considered under economic feasibility, and availability of funding to run the research project reflects financial feasibility. Social issues are linked to political issues, and thus the extent to which the development would be accepted by those in power and adopted as part of social work and/ or counter-trafficking interventions was addressed under political and use feasibility.

Problem identification and analysis is discussed in depth in Chapter 4.

3.4.2 Information gathering, analysis and synthesis phase
According to Thomas (1984, p.43), “the information gathered in assessment should relate to the assessment purposes and these goals in turn should relate to the intervention objective”. In this phase, the discussion focused on how information was gathered and analysed as it relates to the study’s objectives. The main activities briefly discussed in this phase are:

i) document study; and
ii) studying natural examples.

The main activities in this phase are synonymous with qualitative research approach methods. The research purpose was both exploratory and descriptive (Strydom, 2013). In this study, triangulation of methods was adopted to increase depth and accuracy to the study phenomenon. According to Bowen (2009, p. 30) “where there
is convergence of information from different sources, readers of the research report usually have greater confidence in the trustworthiness (credibility) of the findings”.

3.4.2.1 Document study: Using existing information sources
Rothman and Thomas (1994) emphasise the importance of knowing what has been done previously to understand and address the current issue. This means that it is necessary to use existing information sources, study natural examples i.e. collect primary data, and identify functional elements of models and practice guidelines. Thomas (1984) and Strydom and Delport (2011) report that data and resources relevant to intervention design can be obtained from both primary and secondary sources. Without a doubt, one or more sources of information may be relevant to any intervention design process, and a combination of both primary and secondary sources can assist in validating and cross-checking findings (Strydom & Delport, 2011).

For the purpose of this research, a variety of local and international literature on trafficking and intervention design guidelines was reviewed for different chapters. Child trafficking was interpreted using multiple theories, thus theory triangulation was applied (Shenton, 2004; Weyers et al., 2008). The researcher investigated new linkages within ecological and child rights frameworks and discussed the relevant treaties, policies, and legislations. However, specific to this activity in this phase, documents were used to design research instruments, to verify, support, and refute findings from the empirical study (which was conducted in the next activity), and to provide supplementary data that added value to the social work-child trafficking knowledge base (Bowen, 2009). The documents that were used were compared to similar material written by different authors in different contexts and were evaluated for their credibility, authenticity, and meaning. Textual and content analysis focused on interpreting the meanings contained in the documents.

3.4.2.2 Studying natural examples: Empirical research
In studying natural examples, different approaches and primary data collection methods were used with various study participants to elicit comprehensive information. A qualitative research approach was used because of its emphasis on
the subjective view of reality and its concern for/ with meanings and interpretations of situations and/or behaviours, perceptions, and understandings of particular issues (Fouche & Delport, 2011).

The qualitative research methods that were used to collect the primary data included use of in depth interviews with the 22 stakeholders, and a combined use of interviews, observations, and art work with the 10 trafficked children. The different sources of data were used in order to gain different insights, to establish areas of convergence or divergence, and subsequently increase the validity of the study (Guion, Diehl & McDonald, 2011; Hussein, 2009).

Thematic analysis was used to analyse the data. The combination and use of qualitative data analysis techniques and ecological framework enabled the researcher gain a deeper understanding of identification and assistance provision to trafficked children. The use of applied research in this study provided essential means for maintaining and ensuring that intervention design development was consistent with reported findings and advances within child trafficking.

This phase, information gathering, and the results have been discussed in depth in Chapters 5, 6, and 7.

3.4.3 The Design phase

Rothman and Thomas (1994) mention that three types of intervention research that can be carried out are KD, KU, and D&D. KU and KD is what has been described and presented in the previous phases. D&D “includes creating an intervention model, modifying it through preliminary trials and testing and re-testing successive versions” (Bailey-Dempsey & Reid, cited in Gilgun & Sands, 2012, p. 357). Thus, for design and development to be successful, it is essential that the social intervention developer is aware and has knowledge of KD and KU and how they fit in with D&D.

In intervention research, design simply means the formulation of intervention constructs. The main activities in the design phase, which are briefly discussed, includes:
i) designing observational constructs; and
ii) specifying procedural elements.

The research activity that was crucial during this phase was qualitative data synthesis. The researcher had to establish which pre-analysed data would be ideal to use in the design phase. Furthermore, the researcher had to be innovative when it came to the application and transformation of the analysed data to guideline development. The research purpose was intervention, analytical and explanatory (Strydom, 2013).

### 3.4.3.1 Designing observational constructs

In designing observational constructs, the design objective, design domain and design requirements are significant. The design objective is basically the task that needs to be achieved in the design work. The design objective of this study was to develop intervention guidelines for child victims of trafficking. Next, the design domain refers to fixed or flexible intervention elements, which may or may not need design input. The inter-relatedness of these elements is crucial to note during design work. Thirdly, design requirement is the process of establishing the conditions that the intervention needs to satisfy, and it entails outlining measurable aspects of the guidelines. The design requirements that were formulated indicate that the intervention guidelines should:

i) sensitise and build capacity of social workers on the issue of transnational child trafficking;

ii) inform social work identification, referral, and assistance provision to transnational trafficked children in South Africa;

iii) inform social work, child protection, and trafficking policies in South Africa; and

iv) help social workers to see their role in relation to the network of service providers who deal with transnational child trafficking.

### 3.4.3.2 Specifying procedural elements

The activity of specifying procedural elements, involves conversion and intervention design processes. These two processes are intertwined, and a discussion of one
necessitates a discussion of the other. Furthermore, the design processes are information-based and, therefore require creativity and innovation towards the successful development of the intervention guidelines. These processes include formulation of generalisations, development of practice guidelines and presentation of the guidelines. Although design is the least developed feature of purposive planned change in intervention research methodology, its techniques vary “depending on the particular model of planned change dominating the social intervention research” (Mullen, 1994, p. 164).

Intervention is conceptualised as a set of interacting elements. According to Thomas (1984, p. 152), the “concepts may vary in their inclusiveness, ranging from the general to the specific”. According to Mullen (1994, p. 169) these conceptions of intervention and its components are used to frame the pertinent areas of design. According to Fraser and Galinsky (2010, p. 460), the design of an intervention often involves “delineating a problem theory in which potentially malleable risk factors are identified and then a practice theory matching those risk factors…with changing strategies”. Within intervention research, proceduralisation is crucial because it results in social technology procedures and explanations, such as who does what, when, where, how, for whom, and under what conditions. The process of designing an intervention is both evaluative and creative as it requires evaluating and blending existing research with other knowledge, and subsequently creating intervention strategies (Fraser & Galinsky, 2010).

This phase of design is discussed in depth in Chapter 8 of this thesis.

3.4.4 Early development and pilot testing phase

Early development and pilot testing is the last phase in the researcher’s study. The process of development is closely intertwined with the realities of practitioners and clients. According to Thomas (1984, p. 169) “development is the process by which an innovation is implemented and used on a trial basis, tested for its adequacy and refined and re-designed as necessary”. The key activities in this phase, to be discussed briefly, are:

i) development of a preliminary intervention;
ii) application of design criteria to the preliminary intervention and results of the pilot test; and

iii) developmental testing.

In this phase, qualitative research methods were used. The research purpose was interventive, evaluative and explanatory (Strydom, 2013). Document study was conducted at different times and for different purposes in all the activities in this phase. Data was collected using a qualitative method, i.e. telephonic interviews, and an evaluation form. Design elements from the previous phase continue into this phase, since revision of the guidelines called for further development.

3.4.4.1 Development of a preliminary intervention

It is usually in the context of such real-world encounters, which includes diverse feedback to the proposed intervention designs, that meaningful guidelines can be explicited and evaluated for ultimate practical application (Thomas & Rothman, 1994). During this activity, the preliminary intervention procedures were selected and specified, such as the use electronic evaluation form and telephonic interviews as the prototype for use during pilot testing. It was crucial to establish the purpose of the pilot study, i.e. to determine if the guideline is implementable and to examine its viability and utility as a practice tool (Bhattacharyya et al., 2009; Howard & Jenson, 1999b; Rothman & Tumblin, 1994). In order to achieve this purpose, the following pilot testing goals were formulated:

i) to determine social workers’ satisfaction with the guidelines’ purpose and objective capacity;

ii) to determine social workers’ satisfaction with the guidelines’ format and content;

iii) to determine social workers’ satisfaction with the guidelines’ ethical suitability; and

iv) to determine social workers’ satisfaction with the guidelines’ usability

The statement of purpose and the content goals kept the researcher focused on the tasks. Purposive sampling was used to select the pilot test participants. An evaluation form was designed, pre-tested with one social worker, and piloted with
eight social workers (both electronically and telephonically) over a period of four weeks.

3.4.4.2 Application of design criteria to the preliminary intervention concept, and results of the pilot implementation

The relevant themes addressed during pilot testing, as related to the implementation process and the outcome, focused on the guidelines’ accessibility, simplicity, significance, generalisation, and cultural sensitivity. The criteria for assessing the guidelines and the results thereafter were reported under:

i) objective capacity;
ii) adequacy of the intervention procedure;
iii) ethical suitability; and
iv) guideline usability.

The results from the pilot test indicate that the guidelines reached the intended users, and that implementation happened according to the established design criteria.

3.4.4.3 Development testing

Development testing is carried out after trial implementation and the purpose is to determine whether or not the innovation or intervention is adequate, and if not, further revisions might be necessary. In the pilot implementation results, some recommendations were suggested by the social workers who participated in the study. The recommendations on the improvements and changes were clear and straight-forward, and the researcher subsequently made revisions to the document. Developmental testing was further influenced by the South African Trafficking Act being passed, and additional revisions were made.

This phase on early development and pilot testing has been discussed in depth in Chapter 9 of this thesis.

3.5 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, as postulated by Fraser and Galinsky (2010) and Fraser (2004), intervention research encompassing design and development is a significant aspect
of evidence-based social work practice. It is a perspective that focuses on the best available practice knowledge. The researcher's conceptualisation of intervention research design, within Rothman and Thomas' (1994) D&D model, using the four phases, shows that the model can play a significant role in solving social problems. The design and development phases outlined and discussed may be repeated with various other social issues, as the process involved in creating and refining interventions is vital for the social work discipline. The test of the social work profession lies in its capacity to generate knowledge for practice, thus broadening and strengthening intervention research must be awarded higher priority. Interventions are significant within social work, therefore intervention research is fundamental to the profession. The next chapter presents the discussion on problem identification, analysis, and the research planning phase.
CHAPTER 4
PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION, ANALYSIS AND RESEARCH
PLANNING PHASE

4.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter discusses the first phase in the Rothman and Thomas (1994) D&D model, namely problem identification, analysis, and research planning. The major activities of the analysis phase presented in this chapter, as outlined in Figure 4.1; include problem identification and analysis, state of-the-art review and feasibility study.

Figure 4.1: Phases and activities of intervention research (adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)
In this phase, a qualitative research approach was applied and the research purpose was exploratory in nature (Strydom, 2013). Informal interviews with experts and document studies were used as qualitative research methods. From the thematic and content analysis, the researcher evaluates and ascertains if child trafficking as a social issue warrants social work intervention, and if guidelines are needed to address the issue. Furthermore, the analysis assists the researcher to engage with the counter-trafficking community and their challenges in such a manner that a new social technology can be planned.

4.2 PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION AND ANALYSIS

4.2.1 Problem identification

The word ‘problem’ can refer to numerous elements. However, in the context of this study, a problem “is a recognized human service need for which existing approaches or methods are not satisfactory” (Thomas, 1984, p. 142). The overall problematic human condition that was identified in Chapter 2 is child trafficking. The specific problem to be investigated within child trafficking is identification and assistance provision. Child victims of trafficking are invisible because the exploitation they encounter when they are in the trafficking situation is not always visible since traffickers use legitimate fronts to cover up their illegal actions. Within child trafficking, victim identification and assistance provision have been reported as serious issues facing counter-trafficking agencies worldwide (Bump & Duncan, 2003, Gozdziak & MacDonnell, 2007; Lebov, 2010; Oketch et al., 2012, Rafferty, 2008; Rigby, 2011).

Identification is the “institutional process that allows the potential victims of trafficking and related violence to obtain access to programmes of assistance and protection” (Aradau, 2004, p. 43). Therefore, institutions and counter-trafficking agencies are tasked with the main responsibility of identifying victims of trafficking. However, it has been suggested that victims of trafficking be involved in the process of identification. Nevertheless, it is essential that the victim’s involvement in identification is not to the detriment of the victim’s psychosocial well-being. Without correctly identifying child victims of trafficking and referring them timeously, it is almost impossible to contemplate developing and providing the necessary assistance that they require. Identification, referral and assistance provision go hand in hand. According to Aradau
(2004, p. 42), “without the identification of victims, the whole issue of assistance and protection becomes superfluous”. Trimikliniotis and Demetriou (2008) echoed these sentiments concerning a similar situation in Cyprus.

After escaping from a trafficking situation, the severity and range of symptoms exhibited by the child usually indicates the importance of intervening rapidly. Initial assistance during the “golden hour”, or what might also be referred to as crisis intervention care, includes assessment of trafficking, emergency medical assistance, making available resources that meet the child’s basic needs (such as security, rest, food), and specialised psychological support. However, the appropriate referral of victims is just as important as identification and assistance provision. Without proper identification, referral cannot happen, and without referral, timeous assistance cannot be given to the victim. Therefore, all these stages are connected and they form crucial inter-links in the protection of child victims of transnational trafficking.

According to Thomas (1984), for identification and assistance provision to be identified as problems within child trafficking, two factors have to exist. Firstly, standards of the professional community should be based on social values that define levels of behaviour or well-being as appropriate. Secondly, there needs to be evidence that discrepancies exist between the standards and the existing behaviour or states of well-being of the client population. The social work practice principles are outlined in the South African Policy Guidelines for Course of Conduct, Code of Ethics and the Rules for Social Workers. The South African social work professions’ guiding ethical values and principles include respect for people’s worth, human rights and dignity, social justice, integrity, professional responsibility, competence, care and concern for others, and service delivery. These values provide guidance for social work practice, and ensure that the social functioning and well-being of the client, including that of trafficked children, is at the forefront at all times.

The discrepancies that exist include child trafficking being viewed as a criminal justice issue and less of a social issue. In addition, South Africa does not have updated operational standard operating procedures to ensure appropriate identification and referral of victims of trafficking for assistance (Allais et al., 2010). This is in spite of South Africa being a signatory to the UN Trafficking Protocol, which
states in article 25 that appropriate measures of assistance ought to be put in place to protect victims of trafficking and to provide assistance and protection. Furthermore, South Africa also lacks guidelines for general service provision to victims. According to the Trafficking Act and the Children's Act, irrespective of a trafficking experience, if a South African or foreign-born child presents as being in need of care and protection, they are referred to social services. The process for reporting and the referral of victims is different for children and adults, as outlined in the Trafficking Act. The obligation to report presumed cases of child trafficking is extended to any person with reasonable suspicion. Mandatory reporting gives the population a sense that something is being done about the issue, and that they can be part of the process.

4.2.2 Problem analysis

Thomas (1984) stresses that being able to identify a problematic human condition is not sufficient and it needs to be followed through with analysis. This analysis is essential in explaining the scope of the problem globally and in South Africa, components of the problem, causal factors, and the impact of the problem.

4.2.2.1 Scope of the problem worldwide

According to Thomas (1984, p. 143), “determination of the extent of the problem is important because it facilitates establishing a factual basis for the severity of the difficulty”. Although there is no accurate estimate of the magnitude of child trafficking, and the number varies given the challenges in measuring it, it remains a problem with a wide distribution (Gallinetti, 2008; Scarpa, 2006), and every region is affected by some form of it (Chung, 2009). In South Asia and Southeast Europe, trafficking statistics reported by organisations often depend on differing definitions of trafficking, governments' tendencies to under-report the issue, and extrapolations from limited case studies (Deb, 2005; Wolfensohn, 2004). Trafficked children have been reported in various parts of the world, but notably in Asian and African countries. The scope of trafficking is discussed in select countries and regions, although literature points to a lack of comprehensive data on the number of child trafficking cases.

According to CEOP (2009), between March 2007 and February 2008, 325 cases of probable child trafficking were discovered in the UK by different agencies such as law
enforcement, child protection, and immigration agencies. These children were from 52 different countries and when profiled it was discovered that they came from different countries for diverse forms of exploitation in the UK. For example, Chinese children were exploited in the food and sex industries, East and West African children were trafficked into domestic servitude, Romanian children were used to commit street crime, boys from Afghanistan were used for forced labour, and Vietnamese children were used for cannabis cultivation. The mode of transportation used to get into the UK varied, thus this supports the argument that identification cannot happen at one point of entry only. This subsequently makes identification challenging, as the children manifest with different trafficking signs at the various ports of entry. Identification challenges were noted in the UK, where foreign children disappear and go missing within days of arriving in the country (Pearce, Hynes & Bovarnick, 2009). In studies by Dowling et al. (2010) and Pearce et al. (2009), where children who went missing were reported as missing, even though it was suspected that they may have been trafficked, the cases were not investigated and/or pursued due to lack of evidence. Indeed, in the UK, trafficking mainly only becomes apparent after the children disappear from care.

Seelke (2013) reports that trafficking seems to be on the increase in Latin America and the Caribbean, and that the major forms of trafficking are sexual exploitation of women and girls, labour trafficking in South America, and trafficking of illegal immigrants in Mexico and Central America. Latin America is a source for people trafficked to the US and Canada, and a transit for Asian victims predestined for US, Canada and Europe (US TIP Report, 2013). The perceived wealthier destination countries within that region include Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Panama, and Mexico. Seelke (2013) further reports that children are mainly exploited sexually when they try to exercise a sense of agency and contribute to their household income. An estimated one million children are exploited as domestic workers, and a report by ILO (cited in Seelke, 2013) states that out of the 14 million children who work in Latin America, 9.4 million of these children work under hazardous conditions.

Southeast Asia is a major source for trafficked people, including children (Blackburn, Taylor & Davis, 2010; Davy, 2012, Holmes, 2010; Rafferty, 2007), due to factors such as high levels of intra-regional migration, extensive land borders, and evident
disparities in opportunities (Larsen, 2011). The reported Asian networks “include trafficking of children from Cambodia to Thailand for begging; girls from Vietnam/Myanmar to Cambodia/Thailand for sexual exploitation;...girls from Laos to Thailand for domestic or factory work; girls from Vietnam, Myanmar and North Korea for forced marriage in China; boys from Myanmar to Thailand to work on the fishing industry and boys from Vietnam to China for illegal adoption” (Larsen, 2011, p. 3). However, globalisation is giving greater rise to trafficking being re-directed to countries outside Asia, with new destinations including the UAE, South Africa, New Zealand, Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, US, and Germany.

Although the US is located on Tier 1, it is a source, transit, and destination for victims of trafficking. According to Bump and Duncan (2003, p. 203), the majority of the children trafficked to the US are unaccompanied and/or separated children, and they “fall into the two categories: (1) those known through official agencies and systems, but not recognised as victims of trafficking; and (2) those hidden in street life, emergency shelters, migrant camps, and other unidentified places”. According to Gozdziak and Bump (2008), the most prevalent trafficking is for labour, sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, or a combination of the aforementioned. According to Estes and Weiner (cited in Bump & Duncan, 2003), approximately 17,000 children, between ages 12-17, are trafficked into the US for sexual exploitation. Other statistics by Lloyd (cited in Hardy, Compton & McPhatter, 2013) report that the number of annual US occurrences of sexual exploitation range from 200,000-300,000. The largest source country of children trafficked into the US, for child prostitution, is Mexico (Miko & Park cited in Bump & Duncan, 2003). According to the US TIP Report (2013), NGOs reported that Native American girls had been trafficked for the purposes of prostitution, pornography, and stripping in the US and Mexico. Most of these prostituted children end up in the prostitution industry when they become adults (Kotrla, 2010). The top countries of origin identified for foreign victims of human trafficking in 2012 were Mexico, Thailand, the Philippines, Honduras, Indonesia, and Guatemala.

Child trafficking is prevalent in Africa, and it has been widely researched and written about in the West African context (Dottridge, 2002; Fitzgibbon, 2003; Manzo, 2005; Surtees, 2008; UNICEF, 2002). The main source countries are Lesotho,
Mozambique, and Ethiopia. Countries that are reported to be trafficking source, transit, and destination countries include South Africa, Kenya, Nigeria, Ghana, and Tanzania, just to name a few. Children who are trafficked intra-regionally are mainly exploited sexually, for labour and for domestic servitude. Similar to other parts of the world, trafficked children in Africa end up being victims of secondary and multiple exploitation, for example young girls trafficked for domestic servitude may be sexually exploited at a later stage when they reach puberty (Bokhari, 2008; CEOP, 2009). A detailed discussion on child trafficking in Africa can be found in Chapter 2, section 2.4.2, of this thesis.

4.2.2.2 Scope of the problem in South Africa

In South Africa and elsewhere, the general lack of reliable data on human trafficking, and the challenges experienced in researching, monitoring and evaluating trafficking have resulted in reports of repeated statistics often extrapolated from other crime contexts or unverified numbers (Raymond et al., 2002). Accuracy of statistics have also been compounded with difficulties in the identification of victims, the reluctance of victims to report trafficking experiences to authorities, and a lack of comparable data collection methodologies.

Attempts to get statistics on trafficking have been made by Molo Songololo (2000) and Martens et al. (2003). These research reports indicate that 850-1,100 women and children were trafficked to South Africa for sexual exploitation. It is also reported that approximately 1,000 Mozambican women are trafficked into South Africa for sexual exploitation annually. Sylvester (2012) interviewed Barbara Ras who runs a shelter for trafficked victims in Cape Town, who confirmed an increase in trafficked victims. Ms Ras reported that her organisation had assisted 15, 35 and 67 trafficking victims in 2009, 2010, and 2011 respectively. Research by Molo Songololo (2000) estimated that there are between 28,000-30,000 prostituted children in Cape Town. A 2010 survey by the South African Department of Labour reported that more than 268,000 children in South Africa are involved in ‘market’ economic work, but it fails to mention the number of children involved in hazardous work. In addition, random
cases of trafficking have been reported in Mpumalanga (Ferrari, 2013), Limpopo (de Waal, 2012) and Durban.

4.2.2.3 Components of the problem

According to Thomas (1984, p. 143), “identification of component aspects of the problem is germane because it facilitates specification of problem elements…to make it possible eventually to identify particular intervention objectives”. In determining what the components of identification and assistance provision are, it is vital to understand the distinct features of trafficking, who is at risk of being trafficked and who does the identification and provides psychosocial assistance.

a) Child trafficking re-defined

Trafficking is not a single event; it involves a series of distinct phases (Feneyrol, Fichtl, Philippe & Tournecuillert, 2006), as illustrated in Table 4.1.

Table 4.1 Distinct features of human trafficking (UN Palermo Protocol, 2000)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What is done (Act)</th>
<th>How it is done (Means)</th>
<th>Why it is done (Purpose)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>Threat or use of force</td>
<td>Exploitation including:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>Coercion</td>
<td>Prostitution of others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>Abduction</td>
<td>Sexual exploitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harbouring</td>
<td>Deception</td>
<td>Adoption purposes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receipt</td>
<td>Fraud</td>
<td>Forced/ bonded labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abuse of power/vulnerability</td>
<td>Removal of body organs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Giving payments/ benefits</td>
<td>Slavery or similar practices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Questions were raised about the application of the above trafficking features to children, and a consensus was reached on the definition of child trafficking. The definition impacted on identification and assistance provision. The definition that the UN Trafficking Protocol (2000) further put forward in article 3(c) states that child trafficking is the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring, and receipt of children for purposes of exploitation. This includes all children under the age of 18 who have been trafficked with their own consent and without coercion or deception; for forced labour, sexually exploitative practices, and for slave-like practices. All the
three elements mentioned in Table 4.1 must be present for it to be trafficking. However, as outlined in article 3(c) and (d) of the Trafficking Protocol (2000), exceptions are made for child victims of trafficking, and they do not require means for them to be identified as trafficked.

Consent from the child victim to the intended trafficking-related exploitation does not lead to charges of trafficking being dropped. The fact that the pre-meditated and intended exploitation did not take place, does not serve as a defence to charges of trafficking either (Kassan & Mahery, 2009). Any of the acts in Table 4.1 that are performed with the intention to exploit a child and proof of this intention is enough to prosecute a trafficker and for the child to be identified as a trafficked child.

According to Kumar et al. (2001, p. 21), trafficking “is not a mechanical process of transportation from a place of origin to a specific destination”. However, it can occur through multiple routes and diverse modes of transportation can be used. In addition, it is important to note that the movement of the victims happens in typical trafficking but it is not a prerequisite for the process of trafficking. That is, a child can be trafficked without necessarily being transported to a certain destination to be exploited.

b) Who does the identification?
The general population can be instrumental in victim identification. The Guidelines on Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa Region by Odera and Malinowski (2011) and Clawson et al. (2009) acknowledge that everyone and anyone has the potential of coming into contact with a victim of trafficking and can thus play a role in victim identification. The guidelines by Odera and Malinowski (2011, p.17) value the contribution of laypersons, and stipulate that identification of victims of trafficking can generally be initiated by anyone who has information or knowledge on the trafficking indicators. This stance has been adopted in the South African Trafficking Act (2013).

While anyone with knowledge can identify a victim, the first contact with presumed or unidentified victims of trafficking would most likely be an immigration officer at a port
of entry, police during their normal routine, or social service professionals in diverse settings. During these encounters, victims become visible either as illegal immigrants, petty criminals, or as vulnerable children. In South Africa, Ngwira (2011) studied the complementary roles played by law enforcement and the non-governmental organisations (NGOs) in combating trafficking in South Africa’s Eastern Cape province.

According to Pearce et al. (2009, p. 58), “trafficking is hard to define, as it is a process with no easily identifiable beginning, middle or end. It can, therefore, go unnoticed: practitioners are uncertain about definitions or how to recognise a trafficked child or young person”. These levels of uncertainty and confusion as affecting identification and assistance provision were also noted by Larsen (2011). Where the practitioner is more experienced and knowledgeable in the field of trafficking and/ or child protection, the identification process improves and it is easier to recognise emerging patterns from various parts of the world where the children are trafficked from or through.

A promising rapid identification strategy that has been identified is outreach work (Aradau, 2004; Clawson et al., 2009). Clients who frequent brothels and use services of prostitutes and the general population helped identify more than 22% of trafficked victims in an Italian study (Martinscuro, 2002). The report did not identify social workers as being prominent in identifying victims, but the police identified and successfully referred 14% of trafficking cases. The above study shows the application of the security governance theory, whereby reliance and cooperation of non-state actors becomes vital if trafficking is to be resolved successfully (Friesendorf, 2007; Gallagher, 2008; Krahmann, 2003).

c) Assistance provision
Assessments are an important part of any trafficking intervention. The purpose of conducting an assessment varies according to the stage at which the victim is rescued from the trafficking process. For example, as previously mentioned, assessing the status of the victim can ascertain if the child is indeed a trafficking victim or just a person trying to infiltrate the system for other motives (IOM, 2007). In
addition, assessment might entail determining the kind of assistance the child needs and the order of priority of needs. Types of assistance in the past have included medical, legal, social, spiritual, psychological, and emotional assistance. This indicates that it is vital to address the needs of the trafficking victim holistically. Assessments can take place during one session or over several sessions, depending on the merits of the case. According to Pearce et al. (2009), disclosure in trafficking situations takes time and requires a trusting relationship, which subsequently influences the assessment process.

According to Brunovskis and Surtees (2008), when providing assistance to victims of trafficking in Southeast Europe, service providers tend to adopt the medical/disease model and pathologise victims, whereby victims are seen to require resources and guidance to change behaviours. Service providers often work under difficult and strenuous conditions, and tend to be the sole source of support for trafficked victims in crisis, which causes blurring of professional and personal assistance, and can lead to burnout (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2008). Generally, counter-trafficking assistance is provided in a vacuum, there is lack of communication and information-sharing with other actors in the field, and funding dictates the kind of assistance that will be provided.

4.2.2.4 Causes of the problem
Diverse explanations have been provided as to why challenges in identification and assistance provision to trafficked children exist. The causal factors are important since they have significant implications during intervention design (Thomas, 1984). Firstly, evidence of gaps in intervention strategies worldwide lie in the “erroneous conceptualization of the problem and their solutions, inadequate empirical evidence to support specific interventions and unquestioned assumptions about children’s development and their relative capacities and vulnerabilities” (Boyden & Mann, 2005, p. 4). If the issue at hand is not problematised correctly, there is risk that the intervention may be addressing the wrong issue. In addition, according to Gozdzia (2010, p. 251) certain identification and assistance provision systems are complex and bureaucratic, which “sometimes defeats the goal of finding and serving trafficked
children; the more pieces to a system, the more possible cracks for children to fall through”.

Secondly, proper identification of and service provision to child victims of trafficking could be affected by factors such as lack of clear definitions in national legislation, enormous discretionary powers when identifying victims and lack of limited access to detention centres where trafficked children are being detained inappropriately (IOM, 2007). An Albanian study by Gjermeni et al. (2008, p. 946), reported that children above the age of 12 were jailed until there were enough of them to fill a truck, then they were deported back to their countries of origin, whereas children younger than 12 were placed in orphanages while protection services tried to locate their families for re-unification. Such measures exacerbate trafficking and encourage re-trafficking because the children’s unmet needs that led to trafficking in the first place have still not been fulfilled.

Furthermore, the fear of traffickers and law enforcement, victims’ perceived loyalty to the traffickers, lack of trust, and memory loss due to trauma suffered by victims may also challenge the identification and service provision processes. According to the IOM’s (2007) guidelines, a cumulative identification decision is based on pre-interview assessment indicators, answers provided by the victim and additional corroborative material. This is possible, but due to the highly complex, illegal and hidden nature of trafficking, identification of trafficked children requires innovative techniques and might not be so simple.

Many victims have been known not to self-identify as victims or identify family and friends as traffickers. Victims may also not appear to need social services because they have a place to live, food to eat, medical care, and what they think is a paying job. Their levels of vulnerability are superseded by their sense of agency and vice versa. For example, a study by Gozdziak (2010, p. 253) reports that some children who had been clearly identified as having been trafficked by their families “were upset when law enforcement or service providers referred to their family members as traffickers; even the children who felt wronged by their loved ones had difficulty conceptualizing their actions as criminal”. This means that the victim’s statement
might be tainted and given in such a manner that does not implicate their family in trafficking, thus affecting the identification and assistance provision processes.

Another factor why identification and assistance provision challenges exist relates to disclosure. When the trafficked child is rescued, similarly to child abuse, the child may not want to disclose what happened to him/her (Briere, 1992; Hill, 2012). This could be due to cultural taboos broken by abuse, fear of stigmatisation, and understandable psychological reluctance to re-live abuse. In addition, the child might be unable to provide verbal descriptions, might have been bribed or tricked into keeping quiet, might be under the influence of drugs, the child might like the attention being given, and the child might be afraid of getting the adult into trouble. All of the above present as barriers during identification and service provision.

The issue of who an ideal trafficking victim is has been a controversial, highly contested issue and a much-disputed subject within the fields of victimology and criminology. One of the most significant current discussions in legal, psychological, and social fields has raised questions on who a victim of trafficking is. Lee (2011) discusses the construction and denying of victimhood in trafficking, based on notions of ideal victims and hierarchies of victimhood. Victims who harbour characteristics that do not fit neatly into the identified indicators are not recognised as legitimate, and they can also become invisible and blameworthy if they do not have enough features to warrant public sympathy and professional empathy (Lee, 2011; Pearce et al., 2009). A culture of disbelief, and under- and misclassification of victims greatly affects the rapid identification and referral for appropriate services.

From the prior discussion, identification of victims and service provision to them can be both a complex and a time-consuming process that might necessitate professional guidance and support structures to create safe spaces for the victims. Victims generally mistrust authorities due to fear of retaliation from the traffickers, and it may take a long period for them to recover from the traumatic experience. The trafficking networks of individuals who are involved in either or both countries may worsen the complexity. In light of the above, it is essential that the identification process be considered as part of the wider victim protection and support system.
There are few incidents where victims have been able to self-identify as victims of trafficking. However, numerous reports indicate that this is the least favoured method applied in the identification of victims. This is because firstly, victims might not be aware that they are victims, they might not know about trafficking, and they might not know about their rights nor the local country-specific laws that are in place to protect them (Clawson et al., 2009). In certain cases, in spite of being knowledgeable about one’s rights, self-identification might not happen as easily because whilst being transported children may not have been exploited, nor might they have the knowledge that they will be exploited at a later stage (Gozdziak, 2010).

It is becoming increasingly difficult to ignore the fact that trafficking is a lucrative trade, earning approximately ZAR 650 billion (USD 65 billion) in profits worldwide (UNHCR, 2011). This is at the heart of the increased concern and understanding of the high mobility of trafficked children, as the majority of trafficked victims are usually sold more than once, to a different cartel, farm, factory, brothel, or escort agency in the same or different province or country. The trafficked children’s innocence is stolen, their dreams are shattered, and their development is hampered.

NGOs have also been known to provide services to victims whilst working in isolation. To tackle assistance provision to child victims of trafficking in a holistic, integrated manner, Clawson et al. (2009) suggests that child welfare workers and social service providers work closely with other stakeholders, such as (juvenile) detention facilities, the police, court systems, drop-in centres, hospitals, and schools. According to a UK study by Pearce et al. (2009), a US study by Potocky (2010) and an Asian study by Davy (2012), close collaborations between different agencies and transnational networks is essential for ensuring that services provided help keep the trafficked child safe, that the case is kept alive, and focus is maintained on the child.

The mentioned challenging factors related to identification and assistance provision are not exhaustive and exceptions exist in relation to all of them. This is because of the nature of child trafficking in that it is ever-changing and it manifests differently in different regions. It is essential that the factors mentioned above are not looked at in isolation, because an incorrect identification or misclassification might be reached, resulting in providing an incorrect intervention.
4.2.2.5 Impact of the problem

According to Thomas (1984), the analysis of the problem in relation to its consequences is significant because it is bound to indicate how harsh the identified problem is. Frontline officials—including social workers lack knowledge and awareness about child trafficking (Bump & Duncan, 2003; CEOP, 2009; Rigby 2010). According to two UK studies by Pearce et al. (2009) and the Wirtz (2010), and a South African study by Sambo (2009), institutional factors such as a lack of awareness by frontline officials, makes these children become hidden. This has been identified as a major challenge in the trafficking identification process because the children fall between the cracks (Gozdziak & MacDonnell, 2007; Hopper, 2004; Pearce, 2011) and it “blocks any further actions in the chain, such as referral and support” (Trimikliniotis & Demetriou, 2008, p. 2). In circumstances where the frontline officials come across trafficked children and they are not aware of any trafficking indicators, then they will not be skilled in what signs to look for. Furthermore, if the officials have limited knowledge and understanding of pieces of legislation and policies, and how these apply to victims, they might not be in a state to correctly identify victims (Clawson et al., 2009).

According to the Tsireledzani report by Allais et al. (2010), in South Africa, trafficking cases are not being attended to because initially they are not being correctly identified. Lack of acknowledgement of victims of trafficking by service providers can be detrimental to the identification of victims. For example, within the KwaZulu-Natal trafficking task team, members disagreed when it came to identification and referral of victims. This might be avoided if there was uniform use of common definitions and indicators that can be contextualised. The report further cautions against cases being taken at face value and calls for the involvement of well-trained and experienced professionals to work on these cases. Delays in investigations and subsequent identification, due to lack of capacity, increases the risks to affected trafficked children and deters witnesses (Richter & Dawes, 2008).

Lack of adequate identification would mean that victims fall through the cracks and they are then not in a position to access either their rights or protection (Aradau, 2004; Bump & Duncan, 2003; Gozdziak & MacDonnell, 2007). Re-trafficking is also
likely to occur if the victim is identified and assistance is not provided, or the assistance that is provided is not appropriate or congruent with the victim’s needs (Adams, 2011; Jobe, 2010). Challenges in identification and assistance provision jeopardise the victim’s recovery and it infringes on their rights as they continue to live lives of perpetual crisis, fear, misery, and instability. The above situation also facilitates the growth of trafficking operations in an area.

4.2.2.6 Shortcoming of interventions and rationale for social work intervention

Intervention guidelines are usually seen as the tail end of legislative frameworks, and are usually informed by international, regional, and national conventions, laws, protocols, and action plans. Indeed, guidelines that make recommendations for strategies have been referred to as “the wave of the future” due to their centrality in policy implementation process. Recent developments in social work have heightened the need for the development of practice skills, knowledge, and guidelines.

According to Williams and Lanigan (1999, p. 338), social work’s commitment to the development of guidelines seems to be lagging behind, yet “guidelines have been demonstrated to improve clinical practice and client outcomes”. Wambach, Haynes and White (1999) are opposed to social workers developing their own guidelines; this opposition is based on the cost factor, the fact that social workers work in multi-disciplinary settings, and the lack of clarity regarding how profession-specific guidelines would be applied. On the other hand, Richey and Roffman (1999, p. 311) promote the development of guidelines by insinuating that guidelines which “promote treatment integrity (consistent practitioner application of processes and techniques) may not necessarily result in consistently positive client outcomes with social work clients”. Thus, whereas the guidelines may provide or be a useful map for specific interventions, they may not necessarily be explicit on client participation that would ensure adherence to the intervention.

To date, research and practice tended to focus on adults pre-determining what interventions are best for trafficked children, yet these children might have other concerns. Central to the discipline of child protection are interventions that are
informed by children. Identification and assistance provision interventions which are informed by psychosocial theories and are directed towards trafficked children require an increased and in-depth understanding of children’s life/developmental stages and of the inner concerns as felt and experienced by these children. Children’s voices need to come out and be heard in the definitions and explanations that clarify their experiences and psychosocial and socio-cultural notions of being trafficked (Briere, 1992; Goodey, 2004; MacMullin & Loungry, 2000).

According to Turner (1972, p. 39), the social worker as a “psychosocial therapist is committed to understanding the personality and its determinants as well as those things within the person and the society that contribute to enhanced growth and development as well as those that contribute to problems of functioning and suffering”. Therefore, the goal during identification and assistance provision is to ensure that the child victim experiences change and well-being in relation to thoughts, emotions, behaviours, livelihood, and relief from trafficking-induced pain and suffering. In ensuring optimal psychosocial functioning and wellbeing of the child, it is crucial that their values and rights are recognised and respected and that the child is allowed to narrate their story in a manner that suits them (Freedman & Combs, 1996).

Lack of research impedes the ability to identify and intervene with child victims of trafficking. Kaufman and Crawford (2011) and Gozdziak (2010) report that trafficking is a complex area for conducting systematic, evidence-based research and to design and implement interventions, because trafficking is an illegal activity and therefore clandestine, concealed, and access to trafficked victims during various stages of trafficking is restricted. Potocky (2010) and Brunovskis and Surtees (2012b) studied the effectiveness of trafficking interventions and concluded that interventions that are not well-developed and implemented may be ineffective and have unintended negative effects.

4.3 STATE OF-THE-ART REVIEW

State of-the-art review entails finding out and subsequently identifying which interventions exist. According to Thomas (1984, p. 145), it is vital to conduct a state-
of-the-art review before embarking on design and developmental work because “it serves to identify the strengths and limitations of existing intervention methods. Without a careful review, directions for the development of new interventions cannot be knowledgeably charted or begun”. Furthermore, according to Thomas (1984, p. 145) “successful identification and analysis of the problem serves mainly to establish the importance and dimensions of the problem area, but it does not rule out the possibility that relevant interventions are already available”. The aspect of the state of-the-art review that is discussed in this section includes discussions with social workers and experts from counter-trafficking organisations, review of South African literature, and a review of existing South African and international interventions.

4.3.1 Discussions with social workers and experts

Research that involves stakeholders is likely to receive the support and endorsement from the target population, professional community, and the general public (Fawcett et al., 1994). The selection of experts and social workers at this stage was intended to ensure that intervention materials are developed with sensitivity. In addition, interventions developed with stakeholders’ participation, which draws on their capabilities and respects their right to participation, is a tool for social change and promotes the guideline’s long-term maintenance and sustainability (Cooper, Hill & Powe, 2002; Chase, 2005; Thomas, 1984).

Fouche and Schurink (2011, p. 326) encourage gaining entry into settings via interaction with indigenous people who are part of the setting to be studied. Gatekeepers, or in this study court-appointed guardians, are usually responsible for making decisions on behalf of young people placed in their care. Designed to protect the young people under their care, part of the guardians’ responsibility includes granting access to researchers (Heath, Brooks, Cleaver & Ireland, 2009). For the purposes of this study, indirect entry and subsequent cooperation was achieved by inviting diverse stakeholders to human trafficking workshops facilitated by the NGOs where the researcher previously worked (Feldman, Bell & Berger, 2003; Lee, 1996). This cooperation was gained through a combination of tactics that were identified by Shenton and Hayter (2004) as reciprocity, through demonstration of professional suitability and through exploitation of past links with the organisations.
Prior to approaching the organisations that were involved, the researcher conducted a background search on the agencies in terms of their goals, policies, staff, and human trafficking programmes. This has been referred to by Shenton and Hayter (2004) as the phased entry tactic, whereby the researcher does research on the organisations or requests information relating to the organisations’ characteristics. The goal that transcended all the organisations' characteristics was a commitment to protect children in all circumstances, including trafficking. All organisations that were approached either had a child protection policy in place or were in the process of drafting one. Different levels of human trafficking programmes and/or child protection programmes were being run by the organisations, namely at preventative/early intervention and after-care/rehabilitation and reintegration. This preliminary contact and information-gathering was vital, especially during phase two of the D&D model when the researcher required greater involvement and/or access to the actual study participants (Shenton & Hayter, 2004).

Access was negotiated and subsequently verbally granted. The collaborative relationships with key stakeholders were significant, and the stakeholders were subsequently involved in the initial identification of the research problem, and later in planning the research project, especially with regards to data collection. The researcher’s previous and current work collaborations within child protection and in the counter-trafficking field in South Africa with those who could facilitate access was vital to this study. This is because the researcher was able to gain the gatekeepers’ cooperation, trust, and support, all of which are necessary for conducting intervention research (Fawcett et al., 1994, p. 29).

According to Fawcett et al. (1994) and Fisher (2002), researchers involved in intervention research ought to avoid imposing external views of the problem and subsequent solutions. As previously mentioned, the researcher was able to identify trafficked children’s concerns through informal collaborative relationships when practising as a social worker, as a children’s rights activist, and as an anti-trafficking coordinator. Furthermore, once the researcher had access to the four social workers and six experts, there was an increased attempt to understand the issues of importance from them.
According to Thomas (1984, p. 143), the proper identification features, for example in this case within child trafficking, are relevant because they make it possible to specify problematic elements. The researcher asked the social workers and experts the questions in Table 4.2 below in an attempt to identify and understand pertinent child trafficking issues.

Table 4.2: Psychosocial intervention issues in child trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child trafficking stakeholder* questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Is child trafficking rampant in this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Why do you think children are trafficked to this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Where do the trafficked children come from?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Who identifies the children who have been trafficked?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v) What are the harmful consequences of child trafficking?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vi) What will happen if the issue of child trafficking is not addressed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vii) Who are the major stakeholders in “solving” the problem?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viii) Which multi-level, intervention issues are involved in trafficking of children?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ix) Which South African policies and legislation address trafficking of children?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>x) Do you know of any South African guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xi) What are your research ethics concerns, with regard to trafficked children?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*stakeholders included social workers and experts in the field of trafficking

4.3.1.1 Summary of discussion with social workers and experts

Child trafficking was reported to be rampant in areas close to the border, where there are farms, and in the major cities in South Africa. The specific areas mentioned included inner city Johannesburg, Pretoria, Lusikisiki, and Malelane. The reasons provided for children being trafficked included working on the farms, for domestic
servitude, to beg on the streets, for forced marriages, for child prostitution, and the producing pornographic material. The children were reported to have been trafficked from resource-poor communities and townships around South Africa or from neighbouring countries such as Zimbabwe, Malawi, Lesotho, and Mozambique, which were viewed to have fewer economic opportunities in comparison to South Africa.

The social workers and experts jointly reported that it is the social worker’s sole mandate to identify child victims of trafficking. However, some experts reported that identification was dependent on where the child was found, but that the social worker plays a key role during assessment of needs and finding a safe placement for the child. All social workers and experts agreed that there are harmful consequences associated with child trafficking. Some of the examples given included psychological disturbances, death, illnesses, loss of family, friends, and childhoods, missing school, and drug addiction.

In response to what will happen if child trafficking is not addressed, replies included an increase in trafficking of children, children not feeling protected, parents and community members living in perpetual fear, and in as much as trafficking is a harmful practice, it could become normalised in these areas. The major stakeholders who were mentioned included embassies, the police, immigration officials, the government, NGOs, schools, and churches. Interestingly enough, community members were not identified as major stakeholders in the fight against trafficking.

The intervention issues identified included rapid identification of victims, comprehensive assessment being done to correctly identify needs, matching needs to service provision, appropriate and timeous referrals being made, protection of victim’s rights, and appropriate return, reintegration, and follow up. There was anecdotal evidence from social workers and experts pointing to the fact that there are child trafficking interventions in South Africa, although most of them are not documented or readily shared. It was clearly highlighted that the intervention issues require a multi-stakeholder and multi-sectoral, approach and that the victim needs to be at the centre stage of the intervention.
The three international conventions that reference was made to were the UNCRC, ACRWC and the UN Trafficking Protocol. At the local level, reference was mainly made to the Children’s Act, the Sexual Offences Act, and the Films and Publications Act. The social workers and the experts were all aware of the South African Trafficking Bill (2010), but were displeased that the drafting of the trafficking legislation was taking so long. All social workers and experts reported that they were not aware of any local/ South African guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children, and they highly recommended the production of a policy document or guidelines that would assist social workers working in this area. The ethical concerns raised included the level of trafficked children’s participation required, confidentiality of information, and anonymity of organisations providing direct assistance. In addition, the social workers questioned the procedures in place to ensure that the research would proceed ethically and that the safety of child participants would be ensured.

The main factor reflected upon in this pre-study when considering child trafficking as a research topic was to determine if there were any standards, norms, or procedures for social workers working with non-South African trafficked children within identification and assistance provision. Secondly, discrepancies in the standards, norms, procedures, and states of well-being of trafficked children were also deliberated on. Subsequently, the key issues that arose during the discussions was that South Africa has legislation that deals with trafficking of children, but lack of social work practice guidelines impacts on the identification of and initial assistance provision to trafficked children. These discussions raise some salient points regarding successful recognition of child trafficking identification and initial assistance as a social issue worth researching and producing a social work intervention in South Africa.

According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 30), the problematisation of trafficking-related identification and assistance provision, by the experts and social workers consulted, was linked to and framed within greater societal challenges such as crime, migration, and child protection. These included negative consequences felt by the children themselves, the family, and society at large. This in turn helped the researcher to explain or reason why child trafficking exists, why interventions have not succeeded,
and why specific interventions have to be introduced at specific crucial moments. In addition, the discussions led to the positive identification of relevant stakeholders in the immediate and broader environment, beyond those typically blamed for the problem of trafficking. Finally, the researcher was able to obtain responses that guided the choice of intervention research goal, i.e. the development of intervention guidelines.

4.3.2 Review of international literature

A variety of literature in the form of books, journal articles, newspaper clips, and reports was reviewed. The US TIP Reports (2010; 2011; 2012; 2013) provided the context by giving a summary of the country tier placements and the trafficking narratives, which included efforts made by countries to prevent trafficking, protect victims of trafficking, and to prosecute traffickers. This was further complemented by reports such as by OHCHR (2002; 2010), UNODC (2004; 2008; 2012), UNICEF (2001; 2003; 2006; 2011) and UNHCR (2011), all of which provide global and/ or regional perspectives and strategies regarding trafficking.

Trafficking was linked to globalisation (Aronowitz, 2009; Jolly, 2012; Lee, 2011; Sawadogo, 2012), migration (Bustamante, 2002; De Lange, 2007; Zhang, 2012; Raymond et al., 2002), the business model (Aronowitz et al., 2010; UNICEF, 2001), and human rights (Holmes, 2010; Touzenis, 2010). Anti-trafficking laws, conventions and policies were found to be important in the prevention and combating of trafficking (Desai, 2008; Kelly, 2013; OSCE/ODIHR, 2004b; Scarpa, 2006; Sedletzki, 2008), preventing re-victimisation (Adams, 2011; Bokhari, 2008), and in victim empowerment (Jorge-Birol, 2008).

Although many articles written on child trafficking still tend to focus on trafficking for sexual exploitation (Altamura et al., 2009; Asquith & Turner, 2008; Baker, 2001; Delaney & Cotterill, 2005; Gozdziak & Bump, 2008; Kaufman & Crawford, 2011), there is a new body of knowledge emerging on trafficking for other forms of exploitation such as for labour (Liao & Hong, 2011; Moyi, 2011; Woodhead, 1999), removal of body organs (Dottridge, 2004; Kelly, 2013; OSCE, 2013), illegal adoption (Dottridge, 2004; Larsen, 2011; Mezmur, 2010), begging (ECPAT, 2010; Human

Literature on refugees and asylum seekers (Daniel & Knudsen, 1995; Dunkerley et al., 2006; Elliott & Segal, 2012; Joyce et al., 2010; Masocha & Simpson, 2011; Nelson et al., 2013; Ngo, 2009; Potocky, 2012; Watters, 2008), the ecological and systems perspective (Brofenbrenner, 1994; Collins & Collins, 2005; Friedman, 2010; Gough & Elbourne, 2002; Liao & Hong, 2011; Jack, 2012), and on child (sexual) abuse (Berg-le Clarcq & de Baat, 2012; Briere, 1992; Elliott, 1993; Elliott et al., 1995; Paine & Hansen, 2002) was reviewed as a way to gain a deeper understanding of the child trafficking phenomenon and its management.

Under-identification of child victims of trafficking has been reported to be a challenge globally as depicted by studies by Bump & Duncan (2003), Farrell et al. (2010), Fong and Cardoso (2010), Gozdziak (2010), Gozdziak and MacDonell (2007), Hepburn and Simon (2010), Hopper (2004), Oketch et al. (2012), and Sigmon (2008). Victim assistance was viewed as being paramount in the protection of child victims of trafficking. Victims’ needs which have been identified in the reviewed literature include housing and accommodation (Craggs & Martens, 2010; Shuker, 2011; Surtees, 2008), social needs (Busch-Armendariz & Nsonwu, 2009; Rafferty, 2008), mental health and psychological services (Banovic & Bjelajac, 2012; Kliner & Stroud, 2012; Yakushko, 2009), medical health services (Alempijevic et al., 2007; Beyrer & Stachowick, 2003; Crane & Moreno, 2011; Dovyolaitis, 2010; Ingemann-Hansen & Charles, 2013; Miller, 2011; Zimmerman, 2003; Zimmerman & Borland, 2009), seeking justice (Palmer, 2010; Wijers & de Boer, 2010; UNICEF, 2006), and return and reintegration (Asquith & Turner, 2008; Bjerk & Dyrlid, 2006; Boyle, 2009; Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012c; CPCR, 2006; ILO, 2006).

Childhood is an important developmental stage. A child-centred approach, which incorporates child participation in addressing child protection and other childhood concerns, has been widely advocated (Finn et al., 2010; Hill, 2006; O’Kane, 2008;
MacMullin & Loungry, 2010; Spyrou, 2011; Wulczyn et al., 2010). Addressing child victim’s psychosocial needs has also been linked to addressing their socio-economic vulnerabilities that mainly make them prone to trafficking in the first place (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012a; Walklate, 2011). Due to the victim’s vulnerability, when working with victims of trafficking, the victim-centred approach has been supported in studies by Brunovskis and Surtees (2008), Goodey (2004), Hynes (2010), Simenonic-Patic and Copic (2010), Surtees (2007) and Uy (2011).

Chung (2009) looked at complex cultural factors within child trafficking and recommended that psychologists use culturally responsive human rights intervention models. On the other hand, Bennett-Murphy (2012, p. 147) writes about the treatment of a child survivor of trafficking and recommends “analytically oriented psychotherapy...as a means of restoring internalised good objects and of working through complex desires, needs, threats, and hopes that come from speaking the unspeakable”. Victims of trafficking require refuge and a secure physical and psychological space to be able to deal with the psychic impact of trauma, relational disruption, secrecy, and the loss of home (Ben-Yoseph, 2005; Bennett-Murphy, 2012; Bowlby, 1988; Herman, 2001; Freedman & Combs, 1996), and trafficking-related stigma and shame (Marion, 2012; Tang et al., 2008).

The crucial role that referral plays as a response to human trafficking and in the protection of victims of trafficking has been noted (Asian Development Bank (ADB), 2009; OSCE/ODIHR, 2004a). Furthermore, the roles of civil society (the Protection Project, 2012) and the community policing (Murray, 2006; OSCE, 2011) have been heralded in the fight against trafficking. Intervention programmes within trafficking were reported to be important as counter-trafficking measures (Bhagat, 2008; Clawson et al., 2009; Kaufman & Crawford, 2011), and user-involvement in the development of these interventions was encouraged and supported (Beresford, 2012; Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012b; Elks & Kirkhart, 1993).

The important role that social work and social workers can play during victim identification and assistance to victims of trafficking has also been widely highlighted (Desai, 2008; Horgan et al., 2012; Palmer, 2010; Pearce, 2009; Preston-Shoot & Hojer, 2012). Pursuing ethnic-sensitive approaches (Chung, 2009; Urh, 2011), multi-
disciplinary approaches (Van Impe, 2002), and therapeutic jurisprudence within notions of social justice (Gallagher & Holmes, 2008; Herman, 2005; Hugman, 2012; Ife, 2013; Lundy, 2004; O’Brien, 2011; Sheppard, 2006; Swenson, 1998) have been recommended when engaging with victims. The complexities in social work practice with victims of trafficking are reported by Breuil (2008) in France, Fong and Cardoso (2010) in the US and Pearce et al. (2009), Pearce (2011), Rigby (2011), and Rigby and White (2013) in the UK.

The review of international literature on trafficking indicates certain trends being apparent. The first trend is that trafficking has been widely researched in other parts of the world in comparison to South Africa. The research conducted on trafficking has not limited itself to social work, but has lent itself to many disciplines such as medicine, education, criminal justice, politics, economics, and psychology. This, then, subsequently dictates the management of cases by the social worker. Victim identification and provision of effective services and programmes continue to be a challenge to practitioners globally, including to social workers, although there seems to be an increase in research being done in these areas. Based on this, the researcher decided to review South African literature to ascertain whether research has been carried out in South Africa on identification and assistance provision from a social work perspective.

### 4.3.3 Review of South African literature

UNICEF (2003), Martens et al. (2003), Allais et al. (2010) and Molo Songololo (2000; 2003) have researched trafficking in South Africa and the findings from their studies suggest that in as much as there is evidence of feminisation of poverty, child trafficking is not gendered. The other trend identified in these studies is that the majority of victims are trafficked to South Africa for sexual and labour exploitation. Other forms of trafficking noted are for street begging, removal of body parts usually used for *muti* rituals, and for illegal adoption (Gallinetti, 2008; Jobe, 2010). In alignment with the rest of the world, studies addressing trafficking for sexual exploitation in South Africa appear to be more prominent (Hilton, 2007; Kennedy, 2010; Kropiwnicki, 2012; Kruger & Oosthuizen, 2012; Lutya, 2010).
Allais (2013) argues that the trafficking of men and boys receives less attention in comparison to trafficking of women and girls. Gallinetti (2008) further reports that boys are more exposed to exploitation for labour purposes in comparison to girls, and that this exposure is usually also determined by the child’s age. A study was conducted in South Africa by Sambo and Spies (2012) who considered the role of the social worker in the prevention of child trafficking. Magano (2012) looked at how child trafficking is being addressed in South African schools’ policies. Clarcherty (2003), Hiller (2007), Kropiwnicki (2010), and Palmary (2007; 2009) have addressed vulnerabilities surrounding migrant children in South Africa, including the risk of being trafficked. The interventions that have been documented relate to advocacy work (Ferrari, 2013; Sylvester, 2012), lobbying for trafficking legislation (de Waal, 2012; Frykberg, 2012), and prevention (Sambo, 2009). This is a cause for concern because victim support and victim empowerment work being done has largely gone unreported.

From a law perspective, Kamidi’s (2007) study compared Benin and South Africa in consideration of the legal responses to child trafficking in Africa. Sigfridsson’s (2012), which was situated within International Relations, examined how international conventions have impacted South African’s national legislation on child trafficking. Furthermore, South African studies on trafficking-related legislation and child protection policies have been done by Kreston (2007), Kruger (2011; 2012b) Mashiyi (2010), and September (2006). Kruger’s (2012a) study compared the South African legal response to combating human trafficking against established international standards. In a follow-up paper, Kruger (2012b) looks at South Africa’s legal response to combating human trafficking where she also mentions the legal response to child trafficking. Mashiyi’s (2010) research looked at the effectiveness of South African trafficking legislations.

The South African literature reviewed shows that in as much as there has been considerable focus on the trafficking legislations, little has been done to implement child rights’ concerns and strategies into practice or to use the information to develop practice guidelines relating to child trafficking. In addition, based on such few qualitative studies found and presented, trafficking of non-South African children seems like a low priority issue among frontline officials and researchers. South Africa
is continuously being viewed as a haven where traffickers can easily maximise their profits from this illicit trade. Although statistics regarding trafficking of children are unreliable, qualitative studies previously mentioned have shown that the extent of transnational trafficking in South Africa is widespread. David (2010) argues that counter-trafficking infrastructures can be built on the case studies provided and other forms of evidence. Therefore, in as much as international and South African policy require statistical evidence to justify expenditure on trafficking issues, other qualitative information can contribute greatly to show the complexities in prosecution, protection of victims, and prevention of trafficking. Qualitative information was at the heart of understanding child trafficking in South Africa and developing the psychosocial guidelines.

4.3.4 Review of existing international, regional, and South African (trafficking) intervention guidelines

This section of the state-of-the-art review identifies strengths and limitations of existing guidelines. Guidelines more or less offer a map for addressing an identified problem to reach a certain agreed goal. However, availability of formal guidelines for specific interventions has been known to make practitioners overlook important and essential work in conducting thorough assessments (Bhattacharyya et al., 2009; Richey & Roffman, 1999). With the availability of guidelines, practitioners are tempted to make hasty judgements in finding solutions rather than spending adequate time understanding the client’s problem and their perceived solutions. This may be problematic, especially when practitioners are dealing with culturally-diverse cases. Guidelines need not be applied from a ‘cookbook approach’. That is, “guidelines are not commands, and providers will always have to call on their experience and judgement when making decisions regarding individual clients” (Bhattacharyya et al. 2009, p. 500). Because of guidelines’ sensitivity to complexity, considerable time and flexibility in their implementation must be allowed, which helps in enhancing the client-problem fit whilst addressing the importance of the ecological context. The guidelines identified for discussion are from the year 2000-2012.

The Guidelines for Action to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labour: Sexual Exploitation of Working Children (2001) was created specifically for social
development advisors in Scotland. However, Baker (2001) mentions that the guidelines might also be relevant to practitioners in healthcare, education, and research, and for good governance advisors. Apart from the above guidelines, according to Rigby (2010), the Scottish government published a practice document and an assessment toolkit for practitioners working with children suspected to have been trafficked. It is not clear from Rigby’s (2010) report if these Scottish guidelines were based on UNICEF’s (2007) guidelines.

**The Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking (2002)** provide a procedural interpretation of the UN Trafficking Protocol and identify human rights considerations that one has to bear in mind when implementing the Protocol. The following measures were established by the UN for governments to follow with regard to protecting trafficked children:

- establish procedures for the rapid identification of child victims and ensure they are not prosecuted;
- adopt measures to protect the rights and interests of children during all stages of criminal proceedings against traffickers as well as during compensation proceedings;
- protect the privacy and identity of child victims and prevent the dissemination of any information that could reveal their identity;
- take steps to locate family members when the child victim is unaccompanied;
- establish adequate care arrangements that respect the rights and dignity of the trafficked child if there are no possibilities of returning them to their home country;
- provide children with specialised care that includes appropriate physical, psychological, legal and educational support as well as appropriate housing; and
- ensure that the personnel assigned to provide assistance to child victims are properly trained and educated (i.e. legal and psychology-based training).

Where applicable, the aforementioned measures are incorporated in the researcher’s guidelines.
Guidelines on the Protection of the Rights of Children Victims of Trafficking in Southeast Europe (2003) were developed by UNICEF and they established standards for good practice with regard to protection of and assistance to child victims of trafficking, as well. Principle 10 mentions that the best interests of the child will prevail, and Principle 8 notes that due to the particular harm suffered by children and their increased vulnerability, the interventions need to be different.

UNICEF Manual for social workers dealing with child victims of trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation (n.d) was developed for social workers and other members of staff working in rehabilitation centres. This guideline does not address issues related to the immediate care of exploited children, but considers their medium-term to long-term care and protection needs. A strength of the manual is that it shares innovative practices that have been identified.

UNICEF recognised the difference that parliamentarians can make in preventing and responding to child trafficking worldwide. There was acknowledgement that there is progress in the global fight against child trafficking in terms of the formulation of international conventions, comprehensive legislations enacted by numerous countries, and multi-lateral agreements implemented to foster inter-country partnerships. UNICEF's Handbook for Parliamentarians (2005) outlines measures that parliamentarians can take to end child trafficking. It outlines specific steps such as policies, laws, and advocacy efforts which parliamentarians across the world have taken, are taking or can take to make children safer from being trafficked.

The IOM in partnership with the Austrian Ministry of Interior produced a Resource Book for Law Enforcement on Good Practices in Combating Child Trafficking (2006). The resource book is premised on sharing information, experience, good practice, and knowledge, all of which are essential for partnership in the fight against child trafficking. The book is practical and it emphasises the human rights and victim-centred approach, whilst focusing on improving the collective understanding of child trafficking issues and maximising effectiveness. The book is resourceful as it provides information on general trafficking trends, age assessments, investigative methods, interviewing techniques, and partnerships.
In Australia, the National Roundtable on People Trafficking to Assist NGO’s developed the **Guidelines for NGO’s working with trafficked people (2010)**. This guideline indicates the significant counter-trafficking work that NGOs take part in. The guidelines outline ten principles for working safely and ethically with trafficked people, such as the use of culturally appropriate services, ensuring people’s safety, and negotiating informed consent. In addition, the strength of the guidelines is that it provides a referral guide on NGO’s working with various trafficking issues at different levels.

In Africa, a literature search only yielded the **ILO Guidelines for Labour Officers (2008)** and **Guidelines for Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa Region (2011)**. Zambia passed the anti-trafficking legislation in mid-2008 and there was a realisation that the war against forced labour in the country could only be won if the frontline officers had the right tools in terms of anti-trafficking skills and knowledge. It was acknowledged that guidelines were thus necessary for outlining trafficking concepts and indicators. In response, the **ILO Guidelines for Labour Officers (2008)** were developed with the purpose of providing information and practical guidance that allows labour officers to detect possible trafficking cases, to take preventive action, and to protect the victims involved.

**Guidelines for Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa Region (2011)** is a set of standardised regional procedures that was a joint collaboration between Kenya, Uganda, Tanzania, and Rwanda. These guidelines were developed as a framework for direct assistance provision to persons identified as trafficked due to the consequences of traumatic trafficking experiences (Odera & Malinowski, 2011). The main areas of focus in the guideline are identification, direct assistance and reintegration. A major strength of the guidelines is its recognition of trafficking as a regional issue, and thus warranting and developing a regional response. A major criticism of these guidelines is that they have to be read in conjunction with each country’s trafficking legislation, yet Rwanda does not have a trafficking legislation.

Child exploitation was one of the key priority areas identified within the South African National Policy Framework and Strategic Plan for the Prevention and Management of Child Abuse, Neglect, and Exploitation in 2004 and a task team formed in 2010.
Active development of policy by the diverse group of stakeholders has resulted in the formulation and consolidation of The South African Exploitation Strategy (DSD, forthcoming) and The South African Guidelines on the Prevention and Responses to Child Exploitation (DSD, forthcoming). The guidelines have been created for all social service professions, including social workers, with the purpose of interpreting the Children’s Act (2005) to guide their practice in preventing and responding to child exploitation. The strength of the guideline document is that it attempts to cover all possible aspects of exploitation, including commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC), child labour, child trafficking, and child pornography, in addition to being a practical interpretation of the Children’s Act. A further strength is that the document proposes a variety of guidelines, such as prevention and early intervention, statutory services, reporting, assessment, care, and investigation. One major drawback with this approach is that in as much as it is detailed, certain sections could have been merged to make it more concise. Although a multi-sectoral approach was used to develop the guidelines, a serious weakness with the guidelines is that the beneficiaries of the service, i.e. the children, were not consulted at all. Nevertheless, it is evident that a majority of the stakeholders who formed part of the task team were social workers, as they are the intended users of the document.

From the review of existing intervention guidelines at the time of problem analysis in 2009/2010, no South African intervention programme for social workers working specifically with trafficked children existed. Based on this, the researcher decided to conduct a feasibility study with the goal of designing and developing psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers. After reviewing the above-mentioned and available guidelines, the researcher considered the following strengths and limitations, which have been adopted from the above guidelines:

- An assessment toolkit will not be provided, but the possible signs and indicators of child trafficking need to be incorporated into the guidelines.
- The focus of the researcher’s guideline document will be on rapid identification and immediate care and protection of trafficked children, and not on medium-term and/ or long-term care, prevention and/ or reintegration. This could be a
potential limitation of the guidelines to be developed because of its narrow yet specific focus on immediate care.

- The guideline to be developed could emphasise the use of a child-rights approach, victim and child-centred approaches and culture-sensitive perspectives.
- The guidelines need to be formulated for a specialised group, i.e. social workers, and not social service professions, police, immigration, or labour officers. This could be a limitation of the guideline because it will not appeal to the various multi-disciplinary team members required for a holistic intervention to be achieved.
- Participation of both beneficiaries and users of the guidelines is paramount. Thus, both groups (i.e. social workers and trafficked children) are included in the development of the guideline, albeit at different design stages.

4.4 FEASIBILITY OF THE STUDY

The feasibility study looks at the availability and accessibility of necessary information and resources required for the success of the research. It addresses the practicalities involved in the proposed intervention development. The benefit of conducting a feasibility study is that it might give assurance. However, according to Thomas (1984, p. 145) the assurance does not guarantee risks that further development will not be a waste of resources and effort. The aspects to be discussed in this section include technical, organisational and economic feasibility, and political and use feasibility.

4.4.1 Technical and legal feasibility

Technical feasibility “refers to whether there has been sufficient prior technical accomplishment to provide a basis for developing the intended innovation” (Thomas, 1984, p. 146). Technical feasibility investigates whether a proposed plan will work. Based on the information gathered and presented, one is able to conclude whether the project is viable, or whether more thought could be applied to planning, resource allocation, and other assistance required.
In this study, technical feasibility is closely linked to legal feasibility. Legal feasibility looks at whether the proposed development of the guideline is in conflict with South Africa’s legal requirements and obligations. Legal feasibility was discussed in-depth in Chapter 2 under “Child trafficking legislative and policy responses”. The legal framework underpinning the study was presented to PhD peers at a migration-themed workshop at the University of Bergen in Norway, in 2010. The feedback received was incorporated into the discussion on legislation in Chapter 2. It seems that there is an indication of sufficient technical foundation for this desired innovation, evidenced by legal policy and the researcher’s professional practice. Legislation and policies are legally sanctioned documents that embody a country’s values and provide authority for performance or limiting of designated functions (Humby et al., 2012). Development of child trafficking innovation is influenced by specific directives calling for the protection of trafficked children such as in the South African Constitution, the Trafficking Act, and the Children’s Act, and modifications of market incentives as related to the legal liability of social workers in practice, such as in the South Africa Social Work Code of Ethics.

4.4.2 Organisational feasibility

According to Thomas (1984, p. 146), organisational feasibility means “the extent to which the individual and the organisation of which (s)he is a part have the ability to carry out the proposed research”. This includes looking at aspects such as the training and knowledge base of the researcher, administrative support, operational administrative assistance, and organisational resources.

Intervention research is about transformation processes, and therefore certain competencies are required (Hawe & Potvin, 2009). The technical competence required in this study varied at different stages of the study, and it included study and interview schedule design, data management, extraction of information, guidelines design/ policy development, data analysis, and data synthesis, as evidenced throughout the thesis. Due to intervention research looking into social conditions that determine risk, the researcher is able to theorise change dynamics (Hawe & Potvin, 2009). The researcher has the ability to look at and assess different elements in different ways. Theory of the problem and theory of the solution are not the same,
and challenges exist when it comes to linking theory to practice. Thus, the researcher continues to upgrade her knowledge within the realm and the demands of intervention theory and practice, and on how to successfully export research ideas into practice and vice versa. The research will be meaningful to the key informants as it will contribute towards improving trafficked children’s well-being. Thus, skills in communication, diplomacy, networking, policy, and social analysis were vital.

The experience of the practitioner-researcher that is accumulated in a professional activity can be vital in intervention development. The professional experience is based on professional training involving knowledge and skills development. The researcher’s skills and knowledge base include acquiring a Master’s degree in Social Work, specialising in Clinical Social Work, and completion of a short course titled “Introduction to law for non-lawyers”. The researcher has provided assistance to the South African government during drafting national policies related to human trafficking and child protection. In addition, the researcher has previously worked with vulnerable children including children living and working on the streets in Kenya and South Africa. Furthermore, she has researched and worked with refugees and unaccompanied and migrant children in South Africa. Finally, the researcher has worked in the child protection field in South Africa for over five years and in the counter-trafficking field (including Mozambique, Swaziland, and South Africa) for two years.

The researcher gained the support of key informants and top administration, from both her previous and current place of work. The administrative support has contributed towards positive outcomes for the proposed innovation. Part of operational administrative assistance has included elements and assistance with resources such as the use of telephones, printing and photocopying, downloading articles from the internet, facilitating teacher/lecturer replacement, and money for research-related costs.

4.4.3 Economic, political and use feasibility

Economic feasibility “refers to the extent to which the expected benefits exceed or equal the expected costs” (Thomas, 1984, p. 147). Challenges exist in terms of
quantifying anticipated benefits, especially since there are human lives involved. Any measure undertaken to make human life even slightly better is always worth pursuing.

In terms of financial feasibility, personal funds were set aside to meet the initial anticipated costs. Research-related funds were obtained from both UJ and the University of Witwatersrand for further expected research-related costs, such as cost incurred during data collection.

The political feasibility of this research innovation indicates that a level of acceptability would be reached, somewhat, from those in power. South Africa has recently passed the Trafficking Act (2013), which criminalises the trafficking of both (South African and non-South African) adults and children. The proposed research innovation that is to be developed would assist in the implementation of that legislation, as well as the Children’s Act and it would further complement the Child Exploitation Guidelines policy (DSD, forthcoming).

Although a main goal of social work is to improve the quality and quantity of research that demonstrates efficient interventions, it seems as though social work practitioners are reluctant to integrate practice-based research into their work (Williams & Lanigan, 1999). There is a need to find a bridge between social work trafficking intervention research and social work practice worldwide, including in South Africa. Therefore, in terms of use feasibility, there are positive indications that the proposed innovation will be adopted in the area of intervention for which it is being developed for, namely social work. Furthermore, use feasibility can be made possible through professional development training of social workers in practice as users, subsequently increasing acceptance of the innovation.

4.5 CONCLUSION
Based on the problem identification and analysis, state-of-the-art review and the results of the feasibility study, it was evident that a psychosocial intervention guideline for social workers working with transnational child trafficking victims is needed. Therefore, the researcher decided to continue with data collection and the
design phase. The next three chapters address information gathering within the D&D model. The next chapter, which is the first of the three chapters, looks at the empirical study that was carried out in order to formulate comprehensive guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children.
CHAPTER 5
INFORMATION-GATHERING AND DATA ANALYSIS: EMPIRICAL STUDY

5.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter addresses phase two of the D&D intervention research model. Phase two of the model focuses on information gathering, which can be done through either a document study or empirical study, or both. According to Thomas (1984, p. 43), “the information gathered in assessment should relate to the assessment purposes and these goals in turn should relate to the intervention objective”. In this phase, the discussion focused on how information was gathered and analysed in relation to the study’s objectives.

This chapter focuses on studying natural examples (i.e. empirical research). In researching natural examples, different approaches and primary data collection methods were used by the researcher with various study participants to elicit comprehensive information. The research methodology that was applied to collect and analyse primary data to be used to develop the practice guidelines is briefly discussed next.

This chapter starts by looking at a qualitative research approach and then a narrative approach as the research design. The research population and the strategy are then presented. Next, the research instrument is discussed and the researcher reports how data was collected. After this, thematic analysis as the data analysis method used in the study is presented. Finally, trustworthiness of the study, ethical considerations, and reflexivity are discussed individually.

Rothman and Thomas’s (1994) model has six well-defined phases, as previously depicted in Figure 3.2 (in Chapter 3). For the purposes of this study, only the first four phases are applied, as illustrated in Figure 5.1.
5.2 RESEARCH APPROACH

The qualitative research approach was used because it emphasises the subjective view of reality. It is “particularly suited to questions such as what happens and how
does it happen, or the what, how and why of an experience” (Black & Rabins, 2010, p. 168). The use of qualitative research in this study on children offered “insights into their experiences, their discomforts and their needs and show how care can be improved and their needs met” (Liamputtong, 2007, p. 31). In addition, the researcher was interested in understanding the participants’ points of view, unfolding the meanings attached to their experiences, and uncovering their lived world prior to the research (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009, p. 1). Table 5.1 represents qualitative research as applicable to this research.

Table 5.1: Qualitative research in child trafficking research (adapted from Holloway & Wheeler, 1996, p. 10)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key areas</th>
<th>Application to child trafficking research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aim</td>
<td>• Exploration of research participants meaning&lt;br&gt;• Understand and generate practice guidelines from data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>• Context-bound, mostly in natural settings&lt;br&gt;• Process-oriented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample</td>
<td>• Participants (children) &amp; key informants (social workers and stakeholders)&lt;br&gt;• Flexible and theoretical sampling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection</td>
<td>• In-depth interviews, observation, and art-work (children)&lt;br&gt;• In-depth interviews (informants)&lt;br&gt;• Documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasoning</td>
<td>• Inductive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>• Thematic analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>• Narratives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>• Direct involvement of researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validity</td>
<td>• Trustworthiness, authenticity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3 RESEARCH DESIGN

A narrative research design is “based on the assumption that the life world of a person can best be understood from his/ her own account and perspective” (Fouche & Schurink, 2011, p. 313) and it has been used to study young people
“Participants are invited to reflect upon specific aspects of their lives through telling stories about them, or through being invited to reflect upon a particular period in their lives, sometimes in relation to identified theme or themes” (Heath et al., 2009, p. 83). In this study, narratives were used because the researcher wanted to explore the experiences of the trafficked children, how they make sense of their lives through the stories they tell about themselves, and what these stories reveal about identification and assistance provision (Czarniawska, 2004; Engel, 2006; Moen, 2006). Furthermore, Heath et al. (2009) reiterate that narrative research is well suited to child-related studies because research in this area focuses on processes and transitions, and in uncovering pivotal moments.

In consulting with children about their experiences and making them active participants rather than objects of concern, these experiences also become an essential basis for developing genuine child-centred policies and programmes (O’Kane, 2008; Woodhead & Faulkner, 2008). MacMullin and Loughry (2000) and Woodhead (1999) further argue that research that does not take into account children’s perspectives into matters that affect them, is limited in value. However, Woodhead and Faulkner (2008) and O’Kane (2008) caution against throwing the baby out with the developmental water by respecting children as social actors, and not by perpetuating power and status hierarchies, nor by diminishing adult responsibilities.

Post-modernists hold the assumption that the use of life history narrations, as a method of data collection, allows the research participant’s voice to be heard and not stay muted, i.e. the subjective reality of the individual (Babbie & Mouton, 2004; Plummer, 2010). Giving voice to marginalised people and naming silenced lives are the main goals for narrative inquiries, and this subsequently facilitates social change (Chase, 2005). Narrative inquiries can be a tool for social justice when researchers explicate and share the meta-narratives depicting oppressive stances as mentioned by the narrators. According to Denzin and Lincoln (2005), it is essential that the data is not interpreted or analysed, but rather that the data is gathered and presented in such a way that the participants speak for themselves. Thus, in this research,
analysis of the narratives entailed listening to the voice within each narrative and presenting extensive quotes so as to allow for reader's alternative explanations.

Narratives are about time; they change as time goes by and they can be impacted upon by traumatic events and losses. According to Spyrou (2011) and Andrews (2009), narratives transform with developmental maturity and verbal competency, and through study participants embracing new meanings of their pasts through therapy and other inter-personal encounters. Furthermore, according to UNICEF (2006) guidelines, Heath et al., (2009) and Van Liempt and Bilger (2012), it must be recognised that the narrative approach to individual agency might be contradictory; because not telling the truth is a sign of betrayal of trust and a coping strategy that trafficked children have learnt to rely on in precarious situations. Bruner (cited in Moen, 2006), Chase (2005), and Plummer (2010) state that one always creates or hears a narrative in terms of her/his own life experiences and background and within the social frameworks of memory. As emphasised by Wolcott (cited in Moen, 2006), the researcher spent time building rapport with the participants. In addition, writing began early, the interviews were accurately recorded, and the researcher was constantly aware of her subjectivity. Theory and data triangulation were used in this study for evidence corroboration purposes.

5.4 SAMPLING/ PARTICIPANTS
Non-probability sampling was used. Purposive sampling was applied in this study so as to get “a sample composed of elements that contain the most characteristic, representative or typical attributes of the population that serve the purpose of the study best” (Grinnell & Unrau cited in Strydom & Delport, 2011, p. 392). The participant sampling criterion used is shown in Table 5.2 below, and it will be discussed further under the sub-headings: children, social workers, and stakeholders.

Table 5.2 Sampling of study participants (triangulation of data sources)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Sampling criteria</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>• Non-South African children</td>
<td>10 children</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4.1 Children as participants

Purposive sampling within non-probability sampling procedures was used. The basic criteria for selecting the child participants were: non-South African trafficked children exploited for any purpose, any gender, between ages 10-17 when rescued in South Africa, and accommodated at government-registered place of safety. Trafficked children are generally difficult to access because of the hidden, dangerous, and illicit nature of human trafficking (Surtees & Craggs, 2010). According to Cwikel and Hoban (2005, p. 313), “there will never be an accurate census of trafficked persons due to the ramifications of their illegal status”. Ten children were interviewed for this study. The combined population of identified trafficked children at the two places of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social workers</th>
<th>Gender: females and males</th>
<th>Willing to be interviewed and available during data collection</th>
<th>Registration with the SACSSP</th>
<th>Currently working in the child protection field and for at least 6 months prior to data collection</th>
<th>7 social workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>Gender: males and females</td>
<td>Willingness to be interviewed and available during data collection</td>
<td>Currently working in the human trafficking and child protection field and for at least 6 months prior to data collection</td>
<td>15 stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
safety was 15. However, this number could be more because there were several cases of children presumed to be trafficked but who had not been identified. According to Heath et al. (2009, p. 51) “hard to reach groups remain, by definition, hard to reach, and those who are the hardest to reach are likely to remain under-represented in most youth research”. The sample in this study was not intended to be representative, but it focused on whether the research questions would be answered and the objectives of the study met. This is contrary to research conducted by Surtees (2007), whereby the sampling method sought maximum variation of study participants and their experiences. That is, their aim was to learn from a broad spectrum of trafficked persons, both adults and children, and in so doing identifying an ample range of experiences related to the victim’s identification, reintegration/return, and assistance provision.

5.4.2 Social workers as key informants

Data triangulation was used to enhance the credibility of the research and to gather information about identification, assistance procedures, and practice with trafficked children (Creswell & Miller, 2000; Shenton, 2004; Weyers et al., 2008). While the focus of the study was on child victims’ direct experiences, perceptions and opinions, it was also important to collect information from key informants. The selection criteria for social workers as key informants was that they should be registered social workers, be available during data collection, and should have been working in the child protection field for at least six months prior to data collection. Seven social workers were interviewed.

Social work is a scarce skill and a critical profession in South Africa (Earle, 2008). In light of this, Ndaba (2013) reported that there are only 750 social workers in Gauteng servicing a million vulnerable children. According to a press release by the South African Institute of Race Relations (SAIRR) (2012), there were 16,740 registered social workers in South Africa in March 2012. The report further states that 6,655 (40%) social workers are employed by the government, 2,634 (16%) by the non-profit organisations (NPOs) and the rest, 7,451 (44%), are registered social workers who might be in the private sector or are not practising. However, the population of social workers working in the child protection field was difficult to establish because child
protection has not yet been recognised as a social work specialisation in South Africa, and there is no database of social workers working in that field.

5.4.3 Stakeholders as key informants
Data was also collected from stakeholders considered to be experts in the area of human trafficking and/or child protection. The criteria for selection were the same as that applied to social workers, apart from social work registration. Since the focus area of the research was child trafficking, their diverse job descriptions could have afforded them entry into trafficking in one way or another. Thus, the human trafficking-child protection nexus was important. The 15 stakeholders who were interviewed, in addition to the social workers, included seven child protection advocacy officers, three victim empowerment practitioners, three researchers, a SAPS detective, and a human rights lawyer.

5.5 RESEARCH INSTRUMENT
The research instrument used in the study was the semi-structured interview schedule. The semi-structured interview schedule acted as a framework for exploring the areas of interest and the pre-determined questions guided and did not dictate the interviews. The interview schedule combined open-ended and focused questions to elicit free responses and to probe and prompt participants to provide effective responses. In this way, the researcher was able to follow up on particular areas that emerged during the interview, and the participant was able to provide a fuller picture (Greeff, 2011). The interview content covered similar material and helped to maintain focus on the pre-determined topics, while allowing freedom to navigate the unanticipated responses (Rubin & Babbie, 2005). Different interview schedules were developed for trafficked children (Appendix B), social workers (Appendix C) and the stakeholders (Appendix D).

5.5.1 Pre-testing research instruments
According to Scott (2008, p. 97) “asking questions that are meaningful to the child’s own experience is not, however, sufficient to guarantee that children will give meaningful answers”. For the researcher to avoid asking questions that do not elicit desired responses from the participants, data collection instruments were pre-tested
with two children prior to the researcher commencing with actual data collection. The pre-test study assisted the researcher to re-focus and narrow certain aspects relating to data collection. Furthermore, pre-testing enabled the researcher to explore the feasibility of the study and other methodological issues related to the process of data collection in intervention research. Receiving feedback about the research instruments from the participants was not quite helpful, but replaying and listening to the interviews afterwards helped the researcher to modify the interview schedule and the assent/consent form. The researcher also tested the interview schedule for social workers with a child protection research expert, and subsequently made the necessary changes under the guidance of her research supervisors.

5.6 DATA COLLECTION

In-depth interviews were used during data collection. Despite the variation in interview schedule questions, the interviews gave detailed pictures of the participants’ experiences and allowed for flexibility. In addition, the interviews gave the researcher room to inch closer towards gaining more clarity, and enabled the study to be conclusive (Rubin & Babbie, 2005). Furthermore, interviews were found to be suitable because the researcher was interested in the participants’ personal experiences and the fragmented identification and assistance-provision process in South Africa, which are complex, and somewhat controversial and personal (Greeff, 2011; Zimmerman & Watts, 2003).

5.6.1 Data collection with children

Data was collected from the children using interviews and through artwork. The researcher was frustrated by her inability to speak any of the South African languages that the children spoke or any language from their countries of origin. Furthermore, the interpreter was chosen at the last moment by the gatekeeper in one of the two participating organisations and was therefore not well trained. However, the researcher went through the aim of the research with the interpreter as well as highlighting the key research protocols and ethical considerations. The interpreter was well versed with the children’s stories because she had been working in that organisation. The interpreter was also able to provide brief background information on the children prior to the interviews, which helped the researcher to
focus the discussions. In the first interview, the children had a face-to-face verbal interaction with the researcher, whereas in the second interview, collage-making as an alternative way of drawing out and understanding the children’s experiences and voices was applied (Spyrou, 2011).

Prior to data collection, letters requesting permission were sent out to the participating organisations and individuals (Appendix E). Consent/assent was also obtained from the children (Appendix H). A letter requesting permission to record the interviews (Appendix I) was also made available to all study participants, although the majority consented verbally and this was captured in the recordings. The interviews were recorded, which allowed a much fuller verbatim record (Appendix J) and the researcher was able to fully concentrate on the interview proceedings rather than on note-taking. However, process notes were taken in moderation and were further supplemented by field notes that were jotted down immediately after the interview. The field notes included what the researcher knew, thought and observed before, during and after the interviews, and basic interpretations relating to those aspects (Emerson, Franz & Shaw, 2010; Greeff, 2011). The researcher transcribed all the recorded interviews herself due to the nature of the research and the agreement reached by the participants to ensure confidentiality and anonymity. Delimitation was that although the verbatim transcribing process was time-consuming, tedious, and monotonous, this process proved rewarding because the researcher was able to engage with and start preliminary analysis whilst transcribing.

Engaging in art with children is important because it can afford a social worker or a researcher rich situations for exploring children’s thinking, feelings and behaviors communicated through art. Leitch (cited in Spyrou, 2011, p. 153) highlights that alternative forms of researching (with) children can help children narrate “the unrecognized, unacknowledged or ‘unsayable’ stories that they hold”. Art work in the form of a collage was used to gather information from the children, to engage with their thinking process about their future goals, and “to make life meaningful through art making” (Malin, 2013, p. 16). The children engaged in this process as a group, but worked on individual collages. The researcher and the interpreter were also present, they took on the “least adult role” (Spyrou, 2011) and were also involved in designing personal collages as well. The researcher took on the role of the observer-
participant-researcher, whereby she observed what was happening; she also took part in the art activity and she explored the children’s personal explanations of their art-making (Malin, 2013; McArdle & Wong, 2010; Nikoltsos, 2001). Due to the lack of an art room, the art work was done in the office, after the researcher had interviewed all the children. Examples of the children’s collages (Appendix M) have been used in the guidelines developed by the researcher.

5.6.2 Data collection with social workers

In-depth interviews with social workers were used as supplementary sources of data in the research. This was carried out to better understand social workers’ perspectives and to collect general information about procedures and practice in the identification and assistance provision to trafficked children (Greeff, 2011). The selection of the social workers interviewed was based on shared commonalities, experiences, and viewpoints relating to the topic of discussion. Letters requesting permission were emailed to the social workers’ supervisors prior to the start of data collection (Appendix F). The questions in the semi-structured interview schedule (Appendix C) focused on opening/ introductory, transition, key and ending questions (Krueger & Casey 2000). In some of the questions, the participants were asked to think back and reflect on a personal social work experience, and then to respond to certain questions (Greeff, 2011). The researcher piloted the interview schedule with a child protection research expert, and subsequently made the necessary changes under the guidance of her research supervisors.

Social workers were the most challenging sample to recruit for the study. Sometimes recruiting would successfully occur and a date would be set for the interview. On the date or hour that the interview was supposed to take place, a cancellation would happen in favour of a distressed client or urgent statutory work that needed to be undertaken. This was a real reality that the researcher had to face, i.e. the reactive nature of social work, social worker’s expected multiple responsibilities, and their high case loads. Another challenge was that many social workers were unable to see their role in working with trafficked children within child protection. During telephonic and email contact when the researcher was recruiting, the most common responses received were “I have never come across a trafficked child” or “our organisation does
not work with trafficked children”. This made the researcher aware of the low trafficking awareness levels among these professionals as the organisations being contacted were designated child protection organisations. In addition, it also confirmed the hidden nature of trafficking and its manifestation.

The majority of social workers were subsequently recruited at a national 5-day child protection workshop organised by the DSD, held in May 2012 in Johannesburg, South Africa. Four interviews were conducted at the workshop venue before and/ or after the workshops sessions. The remaining three interviews were conducted at the social workers’ place of work in Pretoria. Verbal permission was obtained from all of the seven participants who took part in the study. The participants were reassured that there will be no repercussions should they decide to withdraw from the study at any point. Although none of the social workers interviewed requested emotional support, they were informed of its availability. The discussions were audio-recorded, using tape and digital recorders. The researcher transcribed all these interviews, word for word, with no respect for rules of written language (Appendix K). The researchers’ attempts to establish credibility were partially achieved when the interview transcript and follow-up questions were emailed to the social workers. They confirmed that the details were captured correctly, however they all cited a high workload at that point as the reason for not being able to respond to the additional questions posed (Creswell & Miller, 2000). The names of the agencies and the social workers who participated in the study remain anonymous, since the aim was not to expose professional bad practice but to explore the complexities of identification and assistance and hence tap into the fragmented aspects of victim assistance.

5.6.3 Data collection with stakeholders
In-depth interviews with key stakeholders were also used as a supplementary source of data in the research, and to collect general information about procedures and practice in the identification and assistance provision to trafficked children (Greeff, 2011). The interview schedule (Appendix D) and the letter requesting permission were emailed to the stakeholders’ supervisors prior to data collection beginning (Appendix G). The multiple view-points of these experts further enriched the study, and additional factors leading to and/ or, responsible for fragmentation and those that
influence assistance provision were elicited. The researcher was also interested in their recommendations for the social work guidelines.

In total, 15 stakeholders were recruited and interviewed (See Table 6.2 for descriptive data). Six of the stakeholders had a social work background and were registered as social workers at the time of the interview. The stakeholders were from various governmental, non-governmental and international organisations. A majority of the interviews were face-to-face, and in one instance the interview was conducted via skype. Almost all the interviews were conducted at the stakeholders' places of work, and they provided a comfortable venue for the interview. Since approximately half of the stakeholders were from various non-social work backgrounds, the researcher was knowledgeable about the topic of investigation, but she had to master the technical language as well as familiarise herself with the stakeholders' legal and social environments and how trafficking fitted in (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009). This enabled a sense of symmetry to be achieved in the interview relationship, as it cancelled out the powerful position of the expert interviewees. The researcher noticed that some of the stakeholders are used to being interviewed and that they had "standardised" view-points and agencies’ opinions that they wanted to communicate during the interview. Because the researcher had not prepared for this initially, it was challenging to navigate, especially in the early interviews. However, in subsequent interviews the researcher strove to create a balance whereby certain viewpoints were diplomatically challenged, whilst maintaining and respecting the secure status of the stakeholders being interviewed. Thus, the nexus in the researcher's gentle confrontation and contribution to some of these viewpoints gave way to new insights.

The interviews were also audio-recorded using both tape and digital recorders. All the interviews were downloaded onto a computer and the researcher transcribed all interviews thereafter, and paralinguistic features also included (Appendix L). Similar to social workers, the researchers’ attempts to establish research credibility through member checking were barely achieved. The interview transcripts and follow-up questions were emailed to the stakeholders after transcription was completed. Only two stakeholders fully responded and also answered the follow-up questions. The researcher continued the research based on the assumption that if the recording of
the interviews had been incorrect, they would have responded. Similar to social workers, the names of the key stakeholders participating in the research and the organisations that they represented were anonymised, since the aim was not to expose professional bad practice but to explore the complexities of identification and assistance, and hence tap into the fragmented aspects of victim assistance.

According to Creswell and Miller (2000, p. 125) “researchers determine how long to remain in the field, whether the data are saturated to establish good themes and categories”. In this way, research credibility can be established using the researcher’s lens. For this study, primary data collection started in November 2011 and ended in June 2012, with the researcher being in the field for a total of seven months. The researcher was thus able to solidify evidence, subsequently enhancing credibility of the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Malterud, 2001).

5.7 DATA ANALYSIS

Data analysis requires that the data collected undergoes a generation process. Thematic analysis was thus applied. According to Thomas (1984, p. 115), data analyses are “the changes required to transform and apply basic information from one or more sources into results or products that may be used directly in the design and development of innovative intervention is referred to as generation processes”. Data analysis dictates that data be scrutinised using a two-fold approach (Schurink, Fouche & De Vos, 2011). In this study, the first analysis happened in the field during data collection, i.e. as data was being gathered, it was also analysed preliminary. The second analysis happened after completion of data collection. The simultaneous data gathering and analysis process in this study lent itself to the construction of a more consistent interpretation of the data. Thomas (1984, p. 117) refers to this process as knowledge application, i.e. the “process by which knowledge of human behaviour from research is transformed into results directly applicable to the design of intervention methods”.

5.7.1 Data analysis in the field

Field notes become pertinent in data collection and analysis because they comprise initial written accounts of what researchers hear, see, experience and think in the
course of collecting and reflecting on the data they gather (Bogden & Biklen, 2007; Emerson et al., 2010). Therefore, this provided an early opportunity to develop initial interpretations and analyses. According to Schurink et al. (2011, p. 406), during data collection, the following key questions were significant and needed to be answered, though not necessarily in that order or in that structure:

- What happened?
- Who were involved?
- Where did the activities occur?
- What circumstances or issues impacted on the data?
- What are the major issues emerging? Explore by asking “So what?”
- What issues need to be followed up?

The compilation of answers to the above questions assisted in relating occurrences and discovering connections, emerging themes and relationships or further questions. According to Murchinson (2010, p. 116), these key themes or connections became recognisable in narratives, phrases, symbols, or ideas that constantly reappeared in information gathered. This recurrence became an indication of how significant they were. The greater the theme recurrence amongst the research participants, the greater the shared-ness and value attached to it by the participants.

Elements that the researcher included in the field reflection notes according to Bogden and Biklen (2007), Phoenix (2009), and Westcott & Littleton (2005) were basic reflection on analysis, methodologies, the social and cultural character of narratives, ethical dilemmas and conflicts and the researcher’s frame of mind. This was noted at the beginning of the analytical framework and it was refined and developed as the researcher proceeded with the research. In line with Schurink et al. (2011), caution was taken, and the researcher did not focus much on data analysis whilst still in the field because it has the potential to interfere with analytical insights. In addition, Bogden and Biklen (2007) report and caution that reading related literature whilst doing analysis in the field can hinder one from looking at the data collected from other angles.
5.7.2 Data analysis away from the field

Rothman (1974) reported that raw data transformation to consensus generalisations was highly reliant on essential processes such as retrieval, codification and generalisation of research findings. All data collected was analysed using thematic analysis, resulting in the identification of themes and sub-themes. According to Patton (2002), and in relation to this research, this analytic approach was inductive as it allowed significant dimensions to emerge from patterns in the data, without making prior assumption about relationship and causes. This method of qualitative analysis was chosen for its flexibility, rigour, ability to generate unanticipated insights, and for its possibilities of psychosocial interpretations of data (Braun & Clarke, 2006; Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006; Thomas & Harden, 2008). In addition, and in line with the research goal of developing guidelines, the method was valuable in the production of qualitative analyses suited for informing policy development (Braun & Clarke, 2006; Richie & Spencer, 1994). Table 5.3 is a summary of the analysis process that was followed as related to the phases of thematic analysis outlined by Braun and Clarke (2006).

Table 5.3: Phases of thematic analysis (adapted from Braun & Clarke, 2006)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PHASES</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION OF ANALYSIS PROCESS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 Familiarising myself with data | i) Narrative preparation, i.e. transcribing data  
ii) Reading and re-reading the data and noting down initial ideas |
| 2 Generating initial codes    | i) Coding interesting features of the data in a systematic fashion across entire data set  
ii) Collating data relevant to each code |
| 3 Searching for themes       | i) Collating codes into potential themes  
ii) Gathering all data relevant to each potential theme |
| 4 Reviewing themes           | i) Checking if themes work in relation to the coded extracts  
ii) Checking if themes work in relation to the entire data set  
iii) Reviewing data to search for additional themes  
iv) Generating a thematic “map” of the analysis |
| 5 Defining and naming themes | i) On-going analysis to refine the specifics of each theme and the overall story the analysis tells |
During data analysis, the information gathered was organised into meaningful episodes. The research participant’s narratives were analysed with the goal of reorganising them into a new framework i.e. ‘re-story’ (Creswell, 2007, p. 56). The discussion of the specific data analysis phases, as outlined in Table 5.3, follows next.

### 5.7.2.1 Familiarisation with data collected

The researcher re-visited the “mini” analysis that was done in the field during data collection. The mini analysis in the field enabled the researcher to begin the familiarisation process. This was coupled with the fact that the researcher transcribed all the interviews by herself. The researcher concurs with Bird (2005) and Kvale and Brinkman (2009) who argue that data transcription should be acknowledged as a key phase in data analysis, because there is much more involved than simply typing the conversations verbatim. According to Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 88), “the time spent in transcription is not wasted, as it informs the early stages of analysis, and you will develop a far more thorough understanding of your data through having transcribed it”.

Once the researcher had finished transcribing all the interviews, the researcher read all the transcripts for the first time fully “as this provides the bedrock for the rest of the analysis” (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 87). The transcripts were then re-read several times as the researcher immersed herself in the details. This assisted in obtaining a general sense of the interview in its entirety before breaking it into various components.

The researcher wrote short phrases, ideas, key concepts and possible follow-up questions in the margins of the field notes and transcripts, as they acted as a link
between the data and more conceptual thinking and formed the foundation for later analysis (Schurink et al., 2011). Without a doubt “the careful reader hears many voices in and around narrative text” (Daiute & Lightfoot, 2004, p. 83). This lends itself to the fact that narrative texts are shaped partially by interaction with audience and thus should be read, understood and analysed within the context of the voices and within the contexts that they are produced (Chase, 2005; Daiute, 2004).

### 5.7.2.2 Generation of initial codes

The key process in this step was coding, i.e. classifying or categorising single entities of data in a system. The codes identified data features that attracted the researcher’s attention. The researcher reasoned that the identified codes could be assessed in a meaningful manner with regard to trafficked children. Coding procedures were significant within data analysis because as the researcher ascertained definite experiences among the collected data, some pointed toward a theoretical understanding of trafficked children (Rubin & Babbie, 2005). On the other hand, other experiences and sub-themes derived from the codes were data driven.

Coding was done manually. Various coloured highlighters and pens were used to indicate potential patterns in the data. Different colours denoted different codes. These were then collated together within each code. At this juncture, the researcher worked with both the coded transcripts on hard copy and the typed transcripts on soft copy. Organising and ordering of codes involved cutting and pasting extracts of data from individual transcripts (on soft copy), and collating them together under one code.

Coding and relating concepts was essential to the analysis process as the researcher was identifying elements that subsequently formed the basis of some themes. It should be noted that as one engages with coding, fresh sub-themes may surface. This stage was tedious yet exciting, as certain extracts were coded under several different themes that lead to un-coding, double- or even triple-coding of extracts. This step is what Grinnell and Unrau (2005) referred to as first level coding as it involved identifying and labelling relevant codes within the data collected.
5.7.2.3 Searching for themes
This next step calls for reduction of the raw data into manageable elements. It involved grouping concepts that seem to pertain to the same phenomenon in what is referred to as discovering themes. This was a tentative process due to the nature of linkages identified. Here, the researcher started sorting out the various codes into potential identified themes. It was worth remembering and noting that recurrent codes are often embedded within different stories, and in this study in diverse themes (Phoenix, 2009, p. 67).

Thematic networks “are web-like illustrations that summarize the main themes constituting a piece of text” (Attride-Sterling, 2006, p. 385). The researcher used this in form of a spider diagram. The codes were first inserted without the extracts. The extracts were then added and also organised according to the identified themes. Similar to a report by Strauss and Corbin (1998), the name that was identified for the themes was the one most logically related to the data it was representing and the outlined research objectives. Some of the codes were combined and five overarching themes emerged, some formed further sub-themes and others did not seem to belong anywhere and were isolated but with question marks next to them.

5.7.2.4 Reviewing themes
This step involved refining the core themes identified in the previous step. Since data within themes ought to gel and fit together in a meaningful manner, it was vital for there to be identifiable distinctions between the themes (Braun & Clarke, 2006; Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006). In reviewing the five core themes, the researcher felt that the themes were not gelling and that it was necessary to check if the themes were problematic or if some of the extracts were not suitable. Finally, the two core themes that had been previously identified tended to have extracts and sub-themes that overlapped with the other extracts and sub-themes in other themes. Reviewing of the ordered interview extracts for each theme was done and reconsidered to check their coherence within the theme. Subsequently, the two core themes ended up being sub-themes, and some of the extracts were omitted due to repetition.
In addition to the above, the researcher returned to the themes identified in the field and revised them accordingly, whilst evaluating their usefulness. Themes and sub-themes that emerged were added or amalgamated with previous ones, or omitted completely at that point (Emerson et al., 2010; Murchinson, 2010). At this stage of this step, the themes seemed to work in relation to the data collected. In this step, as the researcher was reviewing the themes, there were constant back-and-forth thoughts about the relationships between the codes and the themes and between the different levels of themes (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 89). According to Creswell and Miller (2000), this element of disconfirming evidence can be a way to establish the credibility of data. In the end, there was a sense of information gelling together and there was evidence of an overall story that had emerged about the data. This is the point that Altheide and Johnson (cited in Creswell & Miller, 2000, p. 125) referred to as validity-as-reflexive-accounting.

5.7.2.5 Defining and naming themes

According to Braun and Clarke (2006, p. 92) in this step it is necessary to define and further refine the themes to be presented for analysis, and to analyse the data within them. This entailed identifying the crux of each theme and establishing data-related elements that each theme captured. The themes should speak directly or indirectly to research questions and objectives. This indicates the analysis process as the researcher thinks "through the meanings of themes and the way they connect to other themes" (Murchinson, 2010, p. 176). The repeated subject matter or themes act as foundation blocks because gaps are filled using examples from themes in determining how, and to what extent the research questions were covered.

The collated extracts were revisited and the researcher identified what was fascinating about them and why. These detailed analyses which entail interpretation of patterns, are presented in the next two chapters in terms of the story each theme tells in relation to the research goal. The names allocated to the themes were concise; they gave the reader a sense of what the theme was about and the researcher could define what the themes were (Attride-Sterling, 2001; Braun & Clarke, 2006). Attempts to successfully produce a picture painted by the participants required the researcher to be knowledgeable in the relevant literature, have the
ability to move back and forth between data generation and analysis confirming or disconfirming emerging ideas, and have a high level of linguistic agility and skill (Babbie & Mouton, 2002; Hawe & Potvin, 2009; Ryan & Bernard, 2003).

5.7.2.6 Production of a report
As shown previously, the first aspect of the conceptual framework was based on meanings attached by study participants whereas. The second aspect of the conceptual framework goes as a step further and involves the researchers’ own discovery and re-construction of participants’ interpretations. The researcher was cautious about how she had chosen to write about the research subjects because this would have a significant influence on how the subjects are perceived by academics, service providers and policy makers (Liamputtong, 2007). The researcher strove to incorporate the relationship between the researcher and the participants to capture the story of “individuals unfolding” (Fouche & Schurink, 2011, p. 314). This is because narratives are joint constructions and are considered to be a by-product of the relationship between the researcher and the study participant (Potter & Hepburn, 2005). Thus, when writing up, the researcher strove to be reflective and reflexive (Sing cited in Liamputtong, 2007, p. 190).

The next chapters will tell the complex story that is embedded in the data that was collected. The data was subjected to literature control enabling verification, comparisons and contrasts to be made against the existing body of knowledge. The write-up provided extracts as evidence to show the prevalence of the theme. The extracts were embedded within analytic narratives that extended beyond description of the data, and made compelling arguments in relation to the research question and goal (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 93).

The above step was the last one in the Braun and Clarke (2006) thematic analysis steps. However, the above argument on data analysis is neither complete nor valid without mentioning contradictions that may emerge during data analysis. In this study, the researcher experienced apparent contradictions in the form of experiences, themes, ideas and pieces of information that seemed contradictory.
These were understood from various angles, such as contradiction being indicators reflecting variations, and as consequences denoting participants’ individual differences and peculiarities (Murchinson, 2010). In addition, in certain instances they proved to be relevant sources of information, they provided another outlook on insights, and provided the researcher with a glimpse of varying perspectives from the various research participants. Murchinson (2010, p. 180) convincingly argues that these contradictions can be important points of analysis for the researcher as (s)he looks into creating nuanced comprehension of the research topic, whilst also moving below the surface to examine the non-obvious in contributing towards a greater understanding of the narrative data collection process. Finally, qualitative thematic data analysis was important in the identification and clarification of differences and or similarities evident in the experiences of the study participants.

5.8 TRUSTWORTHINESS OF STUDY
Trustworthiness of a study involves increasing the worth of a study by applying various methodologies. Lincoln and Guba’s (1985) evaluative criteria on trustworthiness of a study is applied to this study because it is conceptually well-developed and has been used widely. Guba’s model (cited in Krefting, 1991, p. 217) “identified truth value, applicability, consistency and neutrality as the four criteria applicable to the assessment of research of any type…and argued that these criteria must be defined differently for qualitative and quantitative research based on the philosophical and conceptual divergence of the two approaches” as shown in Table 5.4.

Table 5.4 Comparison of criteria by research approach (Krefting, 1991, p. 217)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Qualitative approach</th>
<th>Quantitative approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Truth value</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Applicability</td>
<td>Transferability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Consistency</td>
<td>Dependability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Neutrality</td>
<td>Confirmability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The methods and strategies used to increase trustworthiness in this study as presented in Table 5.5 are discussed next. According to Krefting (1991), the strategies applied in a qualitative study are crucial for increasing rigour in a researcher’s study, and it is also useful for readers who may be interested in assessing the value attached to the research findings.

**Table 5.5 Application of trustworthiness in this child trafficking study (adapted from Krefting (1991) and Shenton (2004))**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Criteria/ provision made by researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Truth value</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>Prolonged time spent in the field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reflexivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Triangulation of data sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-testing research instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Peer scrutiny of project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Member checking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Audio/digital recording and verbatim transcription</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Description of background and experience of researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Examination of previous research to frame findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Application of tactics to ensure honesty in participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Applicability</td>
<td>Transferability</td>
<td>Dense/ thick description of phenomenon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Provision of background data to establish context of study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Consistency</td>
<td>Dependability</td>
<td>Thick descriptions of research methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Triangulation of data and theories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Neutrality</td>
<td>Confirmability</td>
<td>Triangulation of data and theories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In-depth methodological descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recognition of shortcomings/ limitations in the study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reflexivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Audit trail through use of diagrams and attaching interview transcriptions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The strategies shown in Table 5.5 above are discussed next under credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability. The criterion and the strategy are discussed concurrently, then examples of its application in this study are provided.
5.8.1 Credibility

According to Lincoln and Guba (cited in Krefting (1991, p. 251), “truth value asks whether the researcher has established confidence in the truth of the findings for the subjects of informants and the context in which the study was undertaken”. The truth of the findings can be based on the applied research design, the research participants interviewed through unearthing of their experiences, representation of multiple realities, and the context of the study. Truth value “is subject-oriented, not defined priori by the researcher” (Sandelowski cited in Krefting, 1991, p. 215). Lincoln and Guba (1985) referred to this as credibility.

The strategies applied by the researcher in this study to ensure credibility include:

a) Prolonged time spent in the field: The research spent a period of seven months in the field collecting data. Prior to this, the researcher familiarised herself with the culture of participating organisations through reviewing reports, and conducting preliminary visits.

b) Reflexivity: A field journal was kept by the researcher and she entered her feelings and thoughts as influenced by the research data gathering process. Reflective commentaries on the research process and trends were recorded as well.

c) Triangulation of data sources: Three sets of research participants were interviewed, namely children who were previously trafficked, social workers, and stakeholders. With the children there was a further triangulation of methods by using interviews, artwork and through observation.

d) Peer scrutiny of project: The preliminary findings of the data collected were presented at an international child abuse conference in Turkey in 2012. In addition, the legislative framework underpinning the study was presented to peers at a migration-themed seminar in Norway in 2012. In both instances, the fresh perspectives were subsequently incorporated during the thesis write up.

e) Audio/digital taping: All interviews conducted were audio and/or digitally recorded and subsequently transcribed verbatim.

f) Member checking: The transcribed interviews were made available to the participants so that they could confirm that the information was captured properly.
g) Description of background and experience of researcher: The training background and the relevant experience acquired by the researcher is explained in section 4.4.4 of the thesis.

h) Examination of previous research to frame findings: This has been done in Chapter 4 of this thesis.

i) Application of tactics to ensure honesty in participants (Shenton, 2004): This has been discussed in this chapter in sections 5.9.1 and 5.9.4. The study participants were given a chance to refuse to take part in the study, and the ones who gave consent and agreed to participate were considered to be willing to share information freely.

5.8.2 Transferability

Krefting (1991, p. 216) states that applicability is “the degree to which the findings can be applied to other contexts and settings or with other groups; it is the ability to generalize from the findings to larger populations”. Sandelowski (cited in Krefting, 1991, p. 216) argues that applicability is somewhat of an illusion because it is unique to each situation as “every research situation is made up of a particular researcher in a particular interaction with particular informants”. Lincoln and Guba (1985) refined this argument and presented the perspective referred to as transferability. Transferability is when findings fit into contexts outside the study, as determined by the degree of similarity in the two contexts. Lincoln and Guba (1985) argued that when it comes to transferability, it is the responsibility of the person wanting to transfer the findings, although the researcher of the original study should have sufficient information and descriptions available to allow for later comparisons to be made.

The strategies applied by the researcher in this study to ensure transferability include:

a) Thick description of phenomenon: The researcher has provided detailed information on child trafficking, and identification and assistance provision in Chapters 2 and 4. Furthermore, the research methodology used has been described in-depth in Chapter 3 and the empirical study process and presented in this Chapter and Chapter 6 and 7.
b) Provision of background data to establish context of study: This has been provided in Chapters 1-4 of the thesis.

5.8.3 Dependability

According to Krefting (1991, p. 216), consistency of the data refers to “whether the findings would be consistent if the inquiry were replicated with the same subjects or in a similar context”. One of the strengths of qualitative research is its emphasis on uniqueness of lived human experiences, and not necessarily that of identical repetition of experiences. Thus, Lincoln and Guba (1985) argued that the concept of dependability be attributed instead to identified sources. The research processes applied should be clear and repeatable as much as possible (Morrow, 2005). Demonstration of attainment of credibility ensures the dependability of a study (Krefting, 1991; Morrow, 2005; Shenton, 2004).

The strategies applied by the researcher in this study to ensure dependability include:

a) Thick descriptions of research methods: This has been provided in this chapter and previously in Chapter 3.

b) Triangulation of data and theories: Triangulation with different data sources has been presented in this chapter, whereas triangulation using a diverse source of documents (Shenton, 2004) appears in Chapter 2 and 4.

5.8.4 Confirmability

Neutrality is “the degree to which the findings are a function solely of the informants and conditions of the research and not of other biases, motivations, and perspectives” (Guba cited in Krefting, 1991, p. 216). According to Morrow (2005), this criterion is based on the acknowledgement that research is never objective, but that it should be representative of the phenomenon being researched. Lincoln and Guba (1985) further advocated for neutrality to be looked at in terms of the integrity of the data, and not in relation to the researcher, hence the notion of confirmability.

The strategies applied by the researcher in this study to ensure confirmability include:
a) Triangulation of data and theories: Triangulation with different data sources has been presented in this chapter, whereas triangulation of theories is in Chapters 2 and 4.

b) In depth methodological descriptions: This has been provided in this chapter and previously in Chapter 3.

c) Recognition of shortcomings/limitations in the study: This is presented in section 9.4 of this thesis.

d) Reflexivity: A field journal was kept and the notes are reported in section 5.10 in this chapter.

e) Audit trail: This has been done through the use of diagrams in the various chapters and by the researcher attaching interview transcriptions in the appendix section of the thesis

5.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Ethics and safety continue to be key concerns in the planning of a study. This research was undertaken with careful consideration of ethical issues that might have inevitably arisen in victim-centred research with trafficked children. Ethics clearance was obtained from the Faculty of Humanities Academic Ethics Committee at the UJ (Appendix A). The research was also guided by Zimmerman and Watts’s (2003) WHO’s Ethical and Safety Recommendations for Interviewing Trafficked Women and UNICEF’s (2006) Guidelines on the Protection of Child Victims of Trafficking.

5.9.1 Informed consent

During this research, sufficient information on the goal of the investigation, the procedures to be followed during the investigation, and the credibility of the researcher’s study and researcher was made available to participants and their legal guardians, where applicable (Hopkins, 2008; Pearce, 2009; Strydom, 2011). In addition, according to Zimmerman and Watts (2003), due to the emotionally distressing and dangerous nature of trafficking, the researcher clearly explained the reason for the interview, the subject matter to be discussed, potential risks and benefits involved in participating and the nature of questions to be asked.
None of the study participants were persuaded or intimidated into giving assent or consent. Several participants refused to take part in the study and as far as I know, there have not been any negative repercussions thus far. Emphasis was placed on voluntary participation of the individuals and organisations and they were made aware that they could withdraw from the study at any point. A letter outlining the nature of the study and requesting consent and assent was provided to the children’s guardians and the children were informed of the contents of the letters. In all instances, the children’s parents could not be contacted to give consent due to conflict of interest and their whereabouts being unknown, thus parental permission was waived. In addition, a re-confirmation of consent was verbally sought, after completion of the interviews, especially from child participants, and once more clarity was gained on what was covered (Heath et al., 2009).

5.9.2 Violation of privacy/ anonymity/ confidentiality
For purposes of this study, the above terms were viewed synonymously. The researcher was aware of the responsibility towards protecting the privacy and identity of respondents and acted with due sensitivity. The information was safeguarded to ensure that the children were not put at greater risk (ILO et al. 2009; Surtees & Craggs, 2010; UNICEF, 2006). The researcher assessed the range of risks at all times (Hopkins, 2008; Zimmerman & Watts, 2003; UNICEF, 2006). Developmental research and theory indicate that protection of privacy is of paramount significance to adolescents more specifically, because they are at a stage where they are developing the differentiated sense of self (Melton, 1992; Schenk & Williamson, 2005; UNICEF, 2006). The young people involved in the study exercised agency as the researcher requested them to choose their own pseudonyms as a replacement for their real names during data collection (Heath et al., 2009). The participants were also informed of instances when confidentiality might be breached, e.g. if there was impending harm to themselves or others. Data was safely stored in a way that renders the study participants unidentifiable, even if anyone came across the data.

5.9.3 Restoration of participants
Dunkerley et al. (2006) reports that there are added ethical sensitivities in conducting in-depth interviews with children and that trafficked children tend to be particularly
more vulnerable because of previous trafficking experiences. According to UNICEF’s (2006) guidelines, and Kellett (2010) and Alderson and Morrow’s (2004) assertion that the best interest of the child is the primary consideration, the researcher protected all research participants from any harm that might result from the research. Knowing that these children had undergone traumatic experiences, each interview session with each individual child was treated as if the potential harm was extreme, until there was evidence to the contrary (Zimmerman & Watts, 2003). Furthermore, debriefing sessions were used, and reprisal and re-traumatisation risks were assessed regularly as ways of minimising harm. In addition, the researcher applied the “least-intrusive-means principle” throughout the research process (Melton, 1992; Surtees & Craggs, 2010). Through debriefing, issues that were created by the research experience were rectified by discussing the participants’ feelings regarding the research experience immediately after the session.

Finally, although the researcher is a qualified, registered social worker and the issue that was being addressed was sensitive, the researcher took extra caution and avoided transforming the researcher-participant relationship into a therapeutic relationship (Greeff, 2011; UNICEF, 2006). Instead, the researcher felt that social work intervention would be appropriate and essential to all the children, and this recommendation was presented to the organisations.

5.9.4 Deception of participants
The researcher did not distort facts in order to make the participants believe what was not true (Powell & Smith, 2009; Schenk & Williamson, 2005; Strydom, 2011). No information was withheld nor was inaccurate information offered in order to ensure the participants involvement, when they would refuse otherwise (Surtees & Craggs, 2010; UNICEF, 2006). The interviews were conducted at a time convenient to the participants and in a private setting chosen in consultation with the participants. The setting was easily accessible and culturally sensitive to the needs of the participants, as well as familiar and safe in relation to the participant’s needs, resources, and concerns. The children were also offered the option of having another (trusted) person present during the interviews (Surtees, 2007).
5.9.5 Responsibility in providing information

A study facilitated by UNICEF (2006) and Zimmerman and Watts (2003) report that trafficked children rarely have chances of accessing information that can be beneficial to their health, development, and safety. Therefore, in as much as the researcher was collecting this information, she was also responsible for providing this information, where necessary. However, the report cautions researchers about offering assistance in the wrong way or at the wrong time. In light of this, the researcher was clear about the research and what would be done with it, and avoided raising unrealistic expectations, especially about future interventions that might improve the participants’ situation. The researcher gathered details on various types of assistance and the contact persons responsible, in the event that such contacts were required during data collection.

5.10 REFLEXIVITY

Child protection is a passion that has developed in the researcher over the years as a result of interaction with vulnerable children across Africa. A hallmark feature of qualitative research is that the researcher is a research instrument, with elements of the research and process being subjected to the researcher’s theoretical orientation, judgements, and capability (Malterud, 2001). Reflexivity, thus, is a process of self-reference when the researcher reflects on him or herself (Davies, 2008). Furthermore, the research process is a by-product of the forged relationship between the researcher and the study participants who are socially competent and are actively involved in the negotiation of their social worlds (Alderson, 2008; Gergen, 2004; Squire, 2009; Westcott & Littleton, 2006). The research diary acted as a tool for reflective practice (Nardin & Cassell, 2006).

According to Davies (2008, p. 7), reflexivity “expresses researcher’s awareness of their necessary connection to the research situation”. Certainly, the research encounter is a significant exploration site where production, circulation, consumption, and negotiation of information occurs. Therefore, critical reflexivity calls for the researcher to recognise the role they have played in informing and influencing the research process, the data and the resulting findings. Similar to Bailey and Jackson (2003), there were times during the reading of the data that the researcher connected
with the participants’ responses and the researcher found herself reflecting upon her own experiences as a non-South African national in South Africa and as a registered social worker. In this way, the researcher’s life experiences proved useful in her academic work as she continuously examined and interpreted aspects of it in relation to her research studies.

It is essential that safeguards for vulnerable researchers are put into place. Bourdieu (1990), Emmerson et al. (2010), Heyl (2010) and Liamputtong, (2007) recommend sensitive researchers studying vulnerable populations to “take two steps back” from the research process and develop sophisticated levels of awareness in the interplay between the “self” and “other”. This would subsequently enable them to see the overall picture, to write about personal feelings and emotions and finally to comprehend their contribution to what is unfolding during the research process.

There were times when the researcher had empathic responses, also referred to as “pain by proxy”, due to her frustration with the different government departments that have been allocated responsibility to engage with human trafficking and child protection matters (Liamputtong, 2007). Although both places of safety have been registered with the DSD, elements of general neglect were evident. Such environments are toxic and tend not to be developmentally friendly for children. On the other hand, before launching an attack on the general state of these alternative placements, the researcher reminded herself about the horrors of trafficking and thought that perhaps the safety and lack of exploitation were more paramount in these children’s cases.

Hearing trafficking narratives is not easy and reading up on trafficking traumas can be emotionally burdening (Coy, 2006; Melrose, 2002). Fully immersing oneself in data collected to identify themes and sub-themes over and over again can be stressful. When the researcher combined all of them during analysis and writing up, she experienced a sense of emotional tiredness or what Pearce (2009) referred to as emotional labour. Could it be a case of secondary traumatisation within research? Discussing the research subject with close colleagues in the counter-trafficking and child protection fields helped the researcher a great deal. Colleagues were able to give the support needed which spurred the researcher on.
5.11 CONCLUSION

This chapter looked at the process of gathering data through an empirical study in order to elicit comprehensive information for designing the intervention guidelines. The qualitative research approach and narrative approach as the research design were found to be the most appropriate approaches from which to conduct the study. Based on the aim of the study, trafficked children, social workers, and stakeholders were found to be the best sample to provide the required data. There was a triangulation of methods used to gather data, which enhanced the credibility of the study. A discussion on thematic analysis illustrated how the data was scrutinised using a two-fold approach, i.e. during data collection and after data collection ended. Trustworthiness of the study was discussed in line with the strategies that the researcher used to ensure rigour in the study. Finally, the ethical considerations adhered to by the researcher and the reflexivity processes were discussed. The next chapter, also on the information gathering phase, reports on the findings from the data gathered from the participants. The chapter discusses findings from the theme that focuses on the identification of trafficked children.
CHAPTER 6
INFORMATION-GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS: FINDINGS ON IDENTIFICATION OF TRAFFICKED CHILDREN

6.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter is a continuation of discussions on phase two of the D&D model, focusing on information gathering and synthesis, as shown in Figure 6.1 (below). The chapter presents and investigates data collected through interviews, observations, and art work with 10 trafficked children; interviews with 22 key informants (who also included social workers), and document analysis, as discussed in Chapter 4.

Figure 6.1: Phases and activities of intervention research (adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)
The first section of the chapter recaps the aim and objectives of this study, whilst outlining the research objective, which is addressed in this chapter and Chapter 7. The objective focuses on how trafficked children experienced identification procedures and assistance provision processes after being rescued, and is complemented by data gathered from key informants. Next, brief discussions on the descriptive data of study participants are presented. A table comprising of themes and sub-themes that emerged during data collection are presented, and the findings are discussed. Various quotations, observation reports and field notes were used to give prominence to the participants’ voices and narratives.

In this phase, a qualitative research approach was applied. The research purpose was exploratory in nature (Strydom, 2013) because the researcher wanted to gain insight into the identification of trafficked children (Fouche & De Vos, 2011).

6.2 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The aim of this study was to generate intervention guidelines for trafficked children with regard to their identification and initial psychosocial assistance. Therefore, the researcher focused on the following objectives in order to achieve the aim:

i) to analyse the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa;
ii) to gather information on how transnational trafficked children experience identification and assistance provision procedures;
iii) to design guidelines for social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking;
iv) to evaluate the feasibility of the guidelines with social workers in the field; and
v) to provide recommendations to social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking.

Objective (i), which addressed the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa was addressed in Chapters 2 and 4. This chapter reports the findings of study objective (ii) regarding the identification of trafficked children.
6.3 DESCRIPTIVE DATA OF STUDY PARTICIPANTS

The starting point of this chapter is the presentation of descriptive information on the research participants, namely children, social workers, and stakeholders. The descriptive information was based on variables of interest when analysing the data that was collected. The descriptive data is presented first, and a discussion linking the findings to previous literature reviewed is presented thereafter in this chapter and in Chapter 7.

6.3.1 Child participants

Table 6.1: Descriptive data of children as participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Age in 2012</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Trafficker</th>
<th>Rescue by:</th>
<th>Purpose of Exploitation</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Legal Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td></td>
<td>Female: 6</td>
<td>Family: 6</td>
<td>Self: 3</td>
<td>Labour: 6</td>
<td>Mozambique: 7</td>
<td>Refugees: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13yrs: 2</td>
<td>Male: 4</td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td>Community members: 4</td>
<td>Labour and sexual: 4</td>
<td>Malawi: 1</td>
<td>Unknown: 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14yrs: 4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td>Police: 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Zimbabwe: 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16yrs: 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td>Social workers: 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>DRC: 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17yrs: 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18yrs: 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20yrs: 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stranger: 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ten children were interviewed to the point of saturation of data (Appendix N: Detailed profile of child participants). Their age at the time of trafficking was unknown. However, the children’s age at the time of rescue is based on age estimations, which was identified to be between the ages of 12-17, with the exception of one who was rescued when she was nine years old. The majority of the children were trafficked by a family member. However, an interesting and somewhat surprising finding was that the remainder of the children reported that their traffickers, though strangers, were known to their families, and during the interviews the children referred to them as ‘family friends’ and further said that they spoke their (same) language. All the children interviewed were non-South African. During trafficking, all the alleged traffickers used road transport to get into South Africa. The children did not have any recollections of the cities or national borders they had passed through.
The results of this study show that all the children were initially trafficked for labour purposes, either to work in houses or on farms. Subsequently, four of the children, all girls, were also sexually exploited. Although the girls were trafficked for labour exploitation, sexual abuse and exploitation inflicted on them could have been done as a form of control or coercion. The children interviewed had either escaped from the trafficking situation, or they were assisted to get out of their situation by the police, social workers, and community members who seemed concerned about their welfare. Interestingly, when it comes to rescuing trafficked children, social workers feature the least, yet they were identified by the key informants as being critical in rescue and assistance provision to this group of children.

No children who were interviewed were South African, yet they spoke at least two South African dialects fluently. A possible explanation for this might be that they were exposed to the languages when in trafficked situations. The majority of the children were from Mozambique and they were exploited on the farms in Mpumalanga province. The three children from Zimbabwe, DRC, and Malawi were rescued in Gauteng province. However, narratives from the Zimbabwean child alluded to her being exploited in Limpopo province as well. Upon enquiry, only three children had refugee status, although they had all been at the place of safety for more than six months, with the exception of the two who had been rescued recently. All the children had been placed by court orders at the place of safety as an alternative placement.

6.3.2 Social workers

Table 6.2: Descriptive data of social workers as key informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Academic Qualification</th>
<th>Social Work Experience</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Nationality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maximum: 25 years</td>
<td>NGO: 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All social workers interviewed were females. All were South African, and although they spoke various South African dialects, none of them spoke or understood any of the regional southern African languages spoken by the trafficked children. This was
one of the challenges mentioned in terms of communicating with the children during intervention. All the social workers interviewed had a Bachelor of Arts (BA) degree in Social Work from a recognised South African university, but none of them had specialised further. Their initial undergraduate training probably did not include the new Children’s Acts and the new South African Trafficking Act. However, in-service training took place, assisting them to be up to standard with the legislative and policy changes regarding children. A majority of the social workers had attended a short course on human trafficking, but the quality of the training or service providers is not known, and they all felt that they could do with additional training.

The years of social work-related experiences varied from five to 25 years in practice. This was quite significant, especially when it came to expertise in the social work field. An interesting finding was that a sense of maturity and extensive experience were identified as crucial to social workers, due to the harsh realities of trafficking. The majority of the social workers interviewed worked for the government.

### 6.3.3 Key Stakeholders

**Table 6.3: Descriptive data of stakeholders as key informants**

|-----------|--------|------------|-------------|---------------|-------------------------|---------------------|

The total number of stakeholders interviewed was 15. Out of the 15 participating stakeholders, 12 were female and three were male. Eleven of the interviewees were South African, whereas four were non-South African. The majority of the interviewees
had travelled widely outside South Africa and they were able to share international perspectives on trafficking, which could be applicable in South Africa, or which were in the process of being implemented in South Africa. Seven of the informants in this population worked for international organisations based in South Africa, whereas six worked for South African organisations and only two worked for the government. Therefore, a wide array of information was obtained from them.

The interviewees employment positions in 2012 varied and included child protection and advocacy officers, victim empowerment managers, researchers, a lawyer, and a detective. What was interesting was that even though they came from different academic backgrounds, at the time of the interviews their jobs entailed engaging with human trafficking or child protection issues, or both. Therefore, different and similar perspectives on identification and assistance provision to child victims of trafficking were gathered. This was vital to show the multi-disciplinary nature of addressing trafficking and how everybody could fit into the referral and service provision puzzle.

In light of the discussion in the above paragraph, it was also interesting to note that one-fifth of the stakeholders had a background in social work and had previously practiced extensively as social workers in South Africa. This meant that they were able to give expert opinions on child trafficking, and clearly link it to social work principles and values. In addition, since they were all registered to practice as social workers in South Africa at the time of the interview, the researcher was also able to gauge them on some direct social work issues relating to child trafficking.

6.4 KEY THEMES ARISING FROM THE DATA COLLECTED

A systematic standard of ensuring trustworthiness of data was applied, and the information for the study was collected from three different sources, i.e. triangulation of data sources. The data gathered from trafficked children and key informants was analysed using thematic data analysis. From a constructivist paradigm, thematic analysis ensured a process of disconfirming evidence, thus safeguarding the credibility of the data. From the analysis of all three sources of data gathered, two core themes emerged, namely identification of child victims of trafficking and assistance provision to child victims of trafficking, as indicated in Table 6.4. The
theme related to identification is discussed next in this chapter, and the theme on assistance provision is discussed in the next chapter, i.e. Chapter 7.

Table 6.4: Themes arising from the qualitative data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEME</th>
<th>SUB-THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identification</td>
<td>Identification through i) Self ii) Community members iii) Police iv) Social workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Challenges in identification i) Characteristics and nature of trafficking ii) Perceived benefits from trafficking iii) Lack of knowledge among professionals iv) Fear in children v) Trafficking by family members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Re-thinking mechanisms for rapid identification i) Prescriptive policies and procedures ii) Harmonisation of child protection protocols iii) Social mobilisation in communities iv) Development and training on trafficking indicators v) Pursuit of justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance provision</td>
<td>Referral mechanisms i) South African referral mechanisms (current) ii) Strengthening of referral procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immediate needs identified i) Physical needs ii) Psycho-emotional needs iii) Medical/ health needs iv) Social needs v) Legal needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Challenges in assistance provision i) Safety ii) Children’s diverse needs iii) Matching pimps/trafficker's lifestyle iv) Children’s views on perpetrators v) Premature return and reintegration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Consequences of inappropriate assistance provision i) Re-trafficking ii) Stigmatisation iii) Secondary trauma and victimisation iv) Reinforcement of mistrust</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.5 IDENTIFICATION OF CHILD VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING

Identification of child victims of trafficking can be equated to lifting veils of silence. Veils of silence are lifted and in this way the trafficked children become more visible and they can be heard. This theme explores the identification process of trafficked children by focusing on how knowledge about a child who is presumed to be
trafficked emerges, is unearthed, and shared with service providers. The theme looks at how police, social workers, and community members respond to children presumed to be trafficked. It further outlines the challenges experienced when identifying trafficked children, and shows how the knowledge base of identifying children who have been trafficked can be enhanced. The researcher also attempts to present the various elements of fragmentation identified within the process of identifying victims, and how these fragmented frameworks are understood, perceived and experienced by trafficked children, social workers and key stakeholders.

6.5.1 VICTIM IDENTIFICATION

Victim identification is a crucial step towards the protection of trafficked children. Findings from the study point to victims being identified by the police, social workers, community members and through self-identification. These are discussed in greater detail next.

6.5.1.1 Self identification

Self-identification was one of the ways that the child victims of trafficking escaped from the trafficking situation. Within the justice, educational, and social systems in the victim’s countries of origin, awareness-raising on what trafficking entails is not available, thus self-identification in a country of transit or destination rarely happens. This becomes a major challenge within self-identification as victims are not aware of the trafficking indicators and therefore they do not suspect when anything is amiss. The lack of information makes them gullible and more vulnerable to exploitation, and it prolongs their stay within a trafficking situation. The majority of the key informants interviewed acknowledged that lack of self-identification is a key challenge when it comes to identification of victims of trafficking. This illustrated in the following extract:

“…there are a lot of community organizations that pick these. There’s one in inner city Jo’burg...they pick up a lot of children through their outreach work and once they talk to those children and even their mothers they find that they’ve actually been trafficked but they don’t, the women and children, they don’t know so that they can distinguish themselves that that’s what happened to them. They just know that they have been deceived”. (Stakeholder 1)
The interview extract shows that self-identification is rare. It is rare because unless someone more knowledgeable in trafficking, its indicators, and consequences comes along, identification and subsequent rescue might not happen. This finding supports Clawson et al. (2009) and the Polaris Project’s (2012) research findings that victims of trafficking are usually not aware that they are victims. This study supports the findings of Pearce et al. (2009) when they interviewed practitioners who concurred that children would not use the term ‘trafficking’ to describe their experiences because it does not resonate with them and their exploitative experiences. What they did understand was that they could not withstand the abuse anymore and they yearned for similar developmental goals like children their own age. True to this observation, the children interviewed for this study escaped from the trafficking situation, not because they knew they had been trafficked, but because they felt tricked and cheated, and also because they could not take the abuse and exploitation any longer. This is further illustrated in the extract below:

“I ran away…because I felt it was too much. I suffered a lot…I was wandering around the streets, so the community called the police and said there is this child and then they [police] took me to (name of place of safety)” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

The research conversations with the majority of the children interviewed reported elements of hurt, suffering, abuse, and mistrust. The researcher did not go into details of the abuse and exploitation, but by reflecting with them on the referral and service provision interventions undertaken, it was evident that part of escaping from the trafficking situation was so that they did not have to deal with the pain and hurt anymore. Thus, it becomes extremely important for service providers to be sensitised to the children’s possible prior experiences in the hands of the traffickers (Rigby, 2010).

All the children who had escaped and were interviewed for the study reported that they knew it was dangerous to be on the streets alone. This was an interesting finding because most trafficking literature on children begging on the streets have been linked to traffickers exploiting them in this way (ECPAT, 2010; Segawa, 2013;
Wenke, 2013), yet this study was able to establish that some children end up begging on the streets after escaping from a trafficking situation. A point of contradiction that the researcher wants to put forward is that when children are being exploited through begging, the trafficker offers some sort of illusionary protection. However, after they escape from the trafficker and they are on their own in the streets, fearful and with no access or knowledge of where to seek assistance, they are open to further exploitation by potential abusers who notice their vulnerability. However, that is not to say that being in a trafficking situation is better and safer than being alone on the streets. Both situations are unsafe for children because exploitation will happen in either of the cases, subsequently compromising the child’s development and well-being (HRW, 2010).

6.5.1.2 Identification of victims by community members

In this study, community members were highly significant in counter-trafficking efforts as they were able to identify and refer the most number of child victims of trafficking for further assistance. The community and its members existed within certain geographical boundaries that increased their visibility and they subsequently ended up being the largest single source of intelligence and information. A possible explanation for this is that community members tend to be more familiar with their surroundings, and they are able to observe changes taking place within their environment, as reported in the case below:

“There’s a case going on in Benoni. Those children are from Lesotho. They are brothers under 15. They came here with their uncle, for them to come and herd cows and livestock. They don’t go to school. They literally stay next to the kraal. They are actually staying with the livestock in a very small shady shack and the uncle is staying in this plush house, his children are going to school, after school they come to supervise these ones then they go back home. These children were rescued by one of our partners and when they were interviewed how they actually got there, they came here, they crossed the border without papers. They were asked to lie down. I don’t know what was put on top of them when the car was crossing the border and that on its own is
human trafficking but I don’t think he knows that that is human trafficking…”

(Stakeholder 5)

Field notes indicate that community members were generally suspicious of their non-South African neighbours, and these suspicions grew with the sudden appearance and or disappearance of foreign children being housed by neighbours. The children were being over-worked in the house and forced to engage in lengthy activities that were not child-friendly and some children did not even attend school during school term. In other instances, community members noticed vulnerable children who had just arrived on the streets and were not hard-core street children. Due to their concern, the community members became inquisitive and talked to the children about what led to their current situation. Interestingly enough, these children were the trafficked children who had run away from the unbearable exploitative trafficking contexts and were now on the streets. Through the intervention of community members, both sets of children, i.e. those exploited in private homes and the new arrivals on the streets, were subsequently referred to the social worker or police depending on the proximity of either office.

Observations from previous visits to the Mpumalanga province areas where the children were interviewed denote remoteness. From field notes, it was evident that the police have invested time, energy, and efforts in building relationships with these communities. From this study, it is evident that enlisting the support of the community led to the successful preliminary identification of many of the children interviewed, who were subsequently reported to the police officer or to a social worker. The interview extract below shows that effective community relationships and tapping into collective population’s knowledge can have meaningful results within child protection.

“So the police found him then the social worker brought him here. He’s saying that one of the ladies who took him from the streets…took him to the police station, then from the police to the social workers and then brought [him] here…” (Sibusiso, a Mozambican trafficked child, through an interpreter)

In another incident narrated by a social worker, several community members noted the suspicious activity that was happening within their community. These concerns
were then reported to social workers at a designated child protection organisation who then alerted the police. The nature of trafficking, the required criminal justice intervention, the necessary child protection measures, and the sensitive investigation by the police warranted the trafficking process to be disrupted, as indicated in the quotation below.

“In one case when the children, the girl child landed with us, there was good cooperation from community people. We informed the police and just before the flight was leaving for London from OR Tambo airport, the immigration people and the police moved in to stop the flight, and they arrested this person and the child was placed with us.” (Social worker 7)

As shown in the extract above, the contribution that community members have made in South Africa towards the identification of victims and the subsequent arrest of traffickers is positive. The information brought forward by community members through community policing has led to more children being protected. It is evident that the principles underpinning community policing that influenced positive identification of victims is based on strong reliance on well-built and negotiated community relations and trust between the police, the social workers, and the community. The ripple effect of this is that these community members are then more likely to call on the police or the social worker again, and come forward with information in future (OSCE, 2011; The Protection Project, 2012). In light of the above, it is quite clear that identification by a social worker or the police might not always happen in most areas in South Africa because of their low ratio to the high population being served. Therefore, it becomes essential to empower community members and to educate them on trafficking, its prevalence, potential indicators, rights of victims and available resources for reporting cases.

6.5.1.3 Identification of victims by police officers

Policing includes a wide array of activities such as investigating and preventing crimes, and in this study it includes child protection through the identification of child victims of trafficking. As evidenced by this study, the police have a great possibility of identifying child victims of trafficking through referrals by community members, or
through normal routine police operations. The children interviewed reported that when the police rescued them, the police happened to be at the point of rescue because the police were carrying out their normal routine operations. Social workers interviewed corroborated this:

“Most of the children who are trafficked are brought to the centre by the police…the police just find them on the streets and as a result, because they don’t want to see any child on the streets, the end up bringing them to the centre…” (Social worker 1)

In the previous interview extract, the police have been reported in the previous interview extract as trying to maintain order through the removal of prostitutes, criminals, and children living and working on the streets. However, during these routine operations it seems that they come across vulnerable trafficked children. This finding seems to be consistent with and supports OSCE’s (2011) report that police gain information about trafficking by controlling their problematic areas, especially during patrolling. This indicates that identification can also be informed by police investigations of other crimes, which are either directly or indirectly linked to trafficking, such as domestic violence, prostitution, kidnapping, and drug trafficking. In this study, children found during routine police operations were presumed to be victims of trafficking. After further interaction the police were able to ascertain the status of the children by asking questions that assisted them to make a decision as to whether the crime of child trafficking had been committed, and to establish the child’s identity as a victim of trafficking.

In this study, victim identification by the police did not take place at the location of exploitation, or where the child was found. Prior to the police starting to interrogate the children who were interviewed for this research, it was evident that they assessed the immediate needs of the children and in certain instances either sent the children for medical care, psychosocial support, or provided them with something to eat first. This study has been able to demonstrate that the children were clearly treated with respect, as their physiological needs were attended to first. The police then subsequently asked questions related to personal information, recruitment, transportation, and exploitation. During data collection, there were similar responses
from the children interviewed on the type of questions asked by the police, such as biographical information, trafficker details, and the potential trafficking indicators that included trafficking routes and the experiences of abuse. In addition to this, the key informants reported that the child’s behaviours were also being observed to establish congruency with the story being narrated, or for signs of emotional instability and discomfort. The brief extract below is from a child who was allegedly trafficked, and the child is responding to question when asked about the interview questions posed by the police:

“…like where’s my father, how comes I’m living here and all those questions…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

According to the SAPS National Instructions on Victim Empowerment (Forthcoming) that the researcher reviewed, the comprehensive report based on this first contact has to be passed on to the investigating officer after a case has been opened at the police station. There is an assumption that this did not happen. It is difficult to explain this result, but it might be related to the fact that from the research interviews, it was evident that no police officer contacted the children once they were placed in alternative care.

Evidently, no children interviewed were informed of the police’s reasons for the questioning, and neither were they told what would happen with that information or its purpose. This contravenes the UN Recommended Guidelines (2002) that govern processing of collected personal information from trafficked persons, including children. However, on the other hand, age and lack of knowledge might have influenced information sharing by the police, as it was noted that pushing for details from presumed victims of trafficking has the potential to be abusive to the child if they are not ready to discuss what happened. Nevertheless, as argued by Pearce (2011, p. 18) “good practice helps the child understand their experience of abuse while alleviating any sense of responsibility”. In this study, it was evident that the majority of the children had high stress levels that did not make them much concerned about what was going on, or whether or not to trust the policeman/woman, but rather they longed and yearned for a safe place to stay and for their immediate needs to be met.
In response to the question asking if she would have wanted to know why the police were asking her many questions, one of the participants said:

“Noooo I was too young to think about that…I was thinking, hey if these people can get me to a safe place to stay that will be fine with me, so that I can continue studying, that will be ok…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

The field notes indicate that there was a transition phase when the child participants narrated interaction with the police and their faces started glowing. This observation was unexpected, and it implied that the police were seen and experienced by the children as caring, compassionate, and having their best interests in mind. This study suggests that when children were treated with respect they readily shared information with the police officers. The police were able to bring back a sense of trust and security, and the children must have felt empowered and in control of their lives (Bhagat, 2008). The vulnerability that is connected to status of residence and lack of knowledge about rights and entitlement has often been reported to make it more difficult for trafficked children to report cases to the police. This study supports this notion during assistance provision, but refutes it during identification, as it is evident that the children’s vulnerability led them to break their silence regarding their exploitation.

The children’s views of the police as safeguarding them from further harm were quite different to those depicted by the key informants in the study. These results differ from those of the key informants who alleged that the police were corrupt, incompetent, lax, and were involved with trafficking syndicates. This is supported by the extract below:

“…we do come across allegations of police corruption and police inactivity that compromise the ability to, say if we can report of maybe child prostitution the police will go, they’ll do a raid, everybody will be taken to the police station, released and in a couple of days, everybody’s back where they were and there seems to be no in-depth investigations of where these people come from, how did they get there, and what kind of intervention definitely prevents
us from helping those children effectively and dealing with the issue that they may actually have been trafficked…” (Key stakeholder 7)

It is important to bear in mind the possible bias in the children’s and the adults’ responses. However, an analysis of these allegations point to the child victims’ rights being violated by the trafficker, and subsequently there is further violation and secondary victimisation by a system that is meant to protect them. In addition, it defeats the purpose of creating effective prevention measures through information shared by the trafficked victims.

6.5.1.4 Identification of victims by social workers

Social workers in direct and indirect practice can play key roles in the identification of trafficked children. This was acknowledged by the key informants interviewed, but interviews with children indicate otherwise. Only one child participant was identified by the social worker:

“Social worker find me and bring me here” (Maradona, a Mozambican trafficked child)

The results of this study showed that social workers identified few cases of child trafficking. The reason for this is not clear, but it may have something to do with the scarcity of social workers on the ground. This is quite worrisome, because social work is one of the crucial professions that is heavily tasked to identify and assist child victims of trafficking. However, irrespective of who identified trafficked children in this study, social workers provided a key link during assessments, referral, and service provision. All the children interviewed had had an opportunity to meet with a social worker, at least once. The registered social worker was able to do an initial assessment of the presumed or identified trafficked child, and ascertain his or her psychosocial needs and circumstances. Based on the available evidence, the social workers concerns about the child’s safety, well-being and presumed trafficking were established. It can be correctly assumed that the children interviewed had undergone statutory intervention, as they were being accommodated in registered places of safety, according to Section 155 6(b)(v) of the South African Children’s Act.
Identification by social workers is directly linked to social work assessments. When the social workers who were interviewed in the study were asked how children end up in their care, there was a variety of responses. The common responses involved engaging with the child and finding out their background information and how they ended up in and out of the trafficking situation. The first extract below shows how the social worker applied an inquisitorial approach to determine if the trafficked child was in need of care and child protection:

“You would find that with children who are trafficked, there is always a push and pull factor, and we would look at that. An assessment is done on the circumstances of the child and we would look at what is the most presenting problem…and often the child is placed in alternative care. And that is how we render the services to the child and then ensure that the child is not exposed to those circumstances again” (Social worker 2)

The practical approach that social workers use which was also highlighted in this study, is that once information is collected from the child victims, it is essential that it is translated into action. Although the social workers reported assessment and report writing for statutory work to be a routine, there may be complexities depending on the merits of the case, which may be influenced by the scarcity of resources in South Africa. This is illustrated in the extract below:

“…the social worker will first take action. All the child protection options are available in South Africa…to end that exploitation. So that child can be placed in temporary safe care, depending on the circumstances of the child. The social worker might feel that the child needs to go into temporary safe care and I think in almost all those cases, all cases of suspected trafficking, those children will be taken to the Children’s Court as children in need of care and protection. Because in every single case a social worker would have to do an investigation to assess the situation of the child, the nature of the exploitation and take a decision as to the most appropriate care of that child in future” (Social worker 5)
The two previous extracts above and the one below all attest to the important role a social worker plays in terms of conducting a needs assessment. The extract below indicates how children can be involved in decision-making processes, and it corroborates the findings of a great deal of the previous work in this field. It acknowledges the importance of the victim’s participation and calls for social workers to listen to the children because they are best placed to provide information and they know their needs better than anyone else. This study confirms that good mental health is associated with participation. These findings further support the idea of child participation. This is illustrated by the interview extract below:

“It’s the social worker who does the identification because they admit the children and collect background information about the reason they are in the centre and just to check who brought them [in] and why and what happened…We learn from them. They are the ones who give us information about what they think we can do. We call them teachers [laughter] because they know much. They know their problems much more than us...” (Social Worker 1)

The three quotations are from three different social workers who were interviewed and one can incorrectly identify fragmentation in how assessments are conducted by the social workers. Nevertheless, none of the approaches and modes of assessment applied is incorrect in their orientation. However, the researcher argues that each approach can be applied to a specific child trafficking situation, but that each case needs to be re-visited from time to time in support of Rigby and White’s (2013) argument that assessment is an on-going process. In as much as the researcher would recommend that a combination of the approaches be applied in assessing child trafficking cases, what really matters is that assessments are facilitated in a comprehensive manner that ensures accuracy, accountability, and the victim’s participation (Bentovim et al., 2009; CEOP, 2013; Pearce et al., 2009). This finding has important implications for developing identification assessments, which minimises harm and provides baseline information and guidance to social workers on the type of child protection services needed by the child. Reduction of possible secondary traumatisation during identification is shown in the extract below depicting the police and social workers’ collaboration:
“Some of them [social workers] are very intelligent, very good intelligence gatherers for us because we’ve actually communicated with social workers and say, when you conduct an interview, you’ll obviously have a lot of questions, but I would like you to slip this through when you’re asking about that. When you’re asking about that, you can ask them about this. When you’re asking about how you came to South Africa, just put in these two questions there. We would like to know the answers to these two, that’s what it is about” (Stakeholder 13)

In light of the above findings, it helps us to understand that the identification of a child who has been trafficked is a process and not a mere event. Thus, fragmentations during identification can be better understood from that angle, and based on the notion that trafficking does not have a clear, identifiable beginning, middle and ending, but rather the victim’s narratives are reconstructed according to how the victim narrates them. Rigby (2011, p. 333) concludes that “…traumatised young people may not come out with beautiful precise, matching sets of information”. The combination of findings provides some support for the conceptual premise that ultimately it is about recognising that every child has a story and a voice that needs to be elicited, and that their participation in the identification-assessment process is vital. One of the issues that clearly emerges from these findings is that identification of child victims of trafficking is not easy, though it is one sure way that the presumed trafficked child will receive appropriate care, support and protection within South Africa. The next section reports on identified challenges that could hamper rapid identification as well as mechanisms that can aid rapid identification of child victims of trafficking.

6.5.2 CHALLENGES IN RAPID IDENTIFICATION OF CHILD VICTIMS

Identification of human trafficking victims is not an easy task. The challenges encountered and identified by study participants hamper the fight against trafficking and victim assistance services. Field notes indicate that in South Africa, anti-trafficking communities in Mpumalanga and Gauteng provinces continue to be beleaguered with the low numbers of trafficked children identified in these areas who
are receiving services versus the large anecdotal estimations given of children who are trafficked into these areas. In trying to understand this, the researcher presents the challenges identified during data collection on the identification of trafficked children. The discussion includes characteristics of trafficking, trafficked children’s relationship with the traffickers, limited knowledge of trafficking among professionals, fear in trafficked children and family involvement in the trafficking process.

6.5.2.1 Characteristic and nature of child trafficking

Child trafficking is a spatial phenomenon embedded in socio-cultural relations and economic issues making it a complex issue with varied manifestations. These varied manifestations within child trafficking make it difficult to define and detect trafficking, and this has led to confusion, frustration, and uncertainty among practitioners, including social workers. It is vital to understand that because child trafficking is a hidden activity, its consequences are also hidden, as reported by the participant below:

“...it depends where they are, because if you have a child that never goes outside and is locked up somewhere in an apartment in the middle of downtown Jo’burg you’re not going to easily identify them and you might find that you’re suspicious about what might go down there but [you] wouldn’t necessarily know that it’s trafficking...” (Stakeholder 1)

As illustrated above, due to the hidden nature of trafficking, cases could go on for a long time without being detected and reported, and thus provision of interventions becomes almost non-existent or impossible. The reported secretive nature of trafficking and the forbidden or restricted contact ensures that victims are not easily recognised. This finding is in agreement with Aronowitz’s (2009) and Zhang’s (2012) findings that link the secretive nature of trafficking to challenges of identification. Some of the issues emerging from this finding relate specifically to isolation as a way to control the victim, to increase their vulnerability to exploitation, and to prevent viability of any possible rescue by anyone.
Exploitation that happens in private spaces, such as a home, are often not recognised as child labour because the child lives with family or relatives. In addition, because we live in trusting environments, the child is also generally assumed to be safe within these settings. Children who are exploited in family homes or private spaces are thus invisible, hidden behind closed doors and difficult to reach, especially for social workers. Furthermore, in South Africa it is evident that there is institutional and legislative reluctance to address issues that seem to impinge on the rights of the family. The problems that subsequently arise from children being trafficked by family members is that they are difficult to identify, quantify, rescue, provide victim/ social assistance to, and they are excluded from policies and laws.

6.5.2.2 Perceived benefits derived from the trafficking relationship

This research was able to establish that the child-trafficker relationship is harmful, risky and complex in nature. Findings reveal that the trafficked child’s socio-economic background and personal characteristics determine the level and intensity of the relationship that the child and trafficker have. In support of the social exchange model (Zafirovski, 2005) and according to Wolfensohn (2004), the more a child thinks they are benefiting from the relationship they have with the trafficker, the less likely they are to want to leave the trafficking situation. In this case, it is evident that the worth of the relationships is weighed against the outcomes, as illustrated in the following interview extract:

“…and the third factor I would say is non-cooperation from them. Some of our victims I think if I put it, enjoy it, it’s going to be too harsh. They sort of like tend to lean on to the new lifestyle in terms of sexual exploitation. You find that some of the females say I’m getting my own money, back in my own country I wouldn’t earn anything like this, so that is fine. Same with labour exploitation. It’s sad but it’s the reality of this practice, and you wouldn’t want to compromise. If I’m going to open my mouth to the police or law enforcement then obviously there are consequences attached to my cooperation. So if it’s non-cooperation, then I’m safe and sound…” (Stakeholder 13)
The extract indicates that the removal of aspects of poverty, whether physical, financial, intellectual, or emotional in nature, seem fulfilling to some children in trafficked situations, rather than them continuing to live lives plagued with socio-economic struggles. The findings enable us to understand that the demand factors within the child’s close environment influences the enabling environment in which child trafficking flourishes. These structural causes and the subsequent trafficking tend to give the child a skewed aspect and sense of life. Furthermore, as a coping or survival mechanism, the relationship that the child has with the trafficker is based on perverse and skewed developed loyalties and positive feelings towards their trafficker, and they try to protect them from the authorities. The developed loyalties in a trafficking situation are consistent with Palmer’s (2010) and Brunovskis and Tyldum (2004) findings in relation to the Stockholm Syndrome as identified in victims.

6.5.2.3 Lack of knowledge among professionals

Another important finding was that rapid responses to trafficked children, including their identification, are hampered firstly by lack of awareness of the phenomenon amongst frontline practitioners, such as social workers and the police. This makes initial identification challenging, as these professionals might know the trafficking definition, but they might have difficulty applying it in their practice with presumed trafficked children. In addition, they may also be unaware of the indicators they should be looking for. The following extract from a participant speaks of the utter importance of having knowledge on trafficking when interacting with a presumed child victim:

“…how to identify if a child is in need of care and protection for me that is very much crucial because if you can’t identify, if you don’t know what are the issues to look for in order to determine if the child is in need of care and protection, then automatically you can sit with a child who is in need of care and protection and be unable to connect if there’s a need. So the identification should be key. For me people should be able to identify. That is the starting point for me” (Social worker 3)
Key informants acknowledged that frontline professionals are good at their jobs. However, as indicated above, if they work in situations where they are most likely to come across a child victim of trafficking, then it is vital for them to have some working knowledge of what trafficking entails, how it might be manifested, and how to identify it. This research supports findings by Sambo (2009) who indicated that in as much as social workers are generally good at their jobs and want to intervene with trafficked children, their efforts are hampered by lack of sufficient specialised knowledge and skills within child trafficking. An implication for this is the possibility that trafficking might not always be about looking beneath the surface. The victims happen to be in plain sight, that is, only if the social worker knows what (s)he is looking for. These sentiments build on Rigby’s (2011, p. 330) findings that “professionals often struggled in recognizing abuse and exploitation, as a result of the differing presentations of children and individual protective or resilient factors”. Thus, in support of Spies’s (2006) study, knowledge, manifestation of the phenomenon, and the consequences thereof are important if a professional is to support the trafficked child through their healing and recovery effectively.

6.5.2.4 Fear in children

The narratives that the traffickers tell the children are often conjured up; they are used to instil fear in children, and often they are not a true portrayal of what would happen in real life. Thus, the children end up fearing authority (the police), being arrested and deported or prosecuted, and they fear being stigmatised by others. While these fears can be discussed separately, it is important to note that in trafficking situations, the threats are not so readily compartmentalised or uttered by the trafficker in isolation. Bronfenbrenner’s (1994) ecological perspective can be used to explain the significant and complex interrelationships, influences, and over-lapping factors when trafficked children are threatened. The child is personally threatened, their family is threatened, and other greater societal factors are used to instil further fear in the child. Based on the nature and the magnitude of these threats, the trafficker becomes glorified and this makes the child live in fear of the trafficker, as reported in the following interview extracts:
“…One of the investigation obstacles that we have…is intimidation factors, the victims are scared of the trafficker…” (Stakeholder 13)

“…If they see service providers are being empathic, they would feel more able to approach services, but definitely children fear to approach formal services because they anticipate being returned to where they come from (interruption)…these children have been trafficked out of very difficult circumstances, it’s your very poor children who lack family support, care, and love who are vulnerable to being trafficked in the first place. So some of these children do not want to go back to where they have come from. Secondly, the fear of punishment, and also children don’t phone up our crisis lines and say I’ve been trafficked. They don’t really understand the concept of trafficking despite all the public awareness that happens in schools and communities…” (Stakeholder 7)

Fear can also be linked with knowledge acquisition and production. It was evident in the children who were interviewed that illiteracy and lack of general knowledge played a big role in them being trafficked, or remaining in the trafficking situation. That is, the less the children knew, the more they became inclined to believe and trust the trafficker. It is evident that raising awareness might not be purposeful, especially in situations where trafficked children and community members have different understanding and meanings of what trafficking, exploitation, and childhood entail. The lack of awareness-raising having the perceived positive impact might have been influenced by diverse factors which were not explored in this study, but which could potentially be investigated in a future study.

The fear element during the trafficking situation was not explored with the children interviewed due to the interview focus and the delicate nature of that period. Hence, during analysis of the sub-theme “fear in children” the researcher felt as if the children’s voices were disappearing. However, further reflection indicated that these voices had not been lost, but rather they had manifested themselves elsewhere, i.e. in terms of what they would want to happen to the perpetrators. The roots of social work are grounded in social justice and human rights, and the analysis of children’s fear and vulnerabilities are linked to these two concepts (Alvarez & Allessi, 2012;
Hepworth et al., 2013; Morales, Sheafor & Scott, 2010; Palmer, 2010). Social workers are well placed to recognise, identify and understand the dance of power, control, and oppression and its impact, especially on trafficked children’s need for justice and protection of rights. The nature of social work allows for therapeutic justice, whereby legal processes are humanised and fairness and justice are maintained (Palmer, 2010). Since fear and mistrust are core elements within a child’s trafficking process, findings from this study reveal that the provision of stability, safety, and informed social work practice is of great significance. The notion of therapeutic jurisprudence, which develops, becomes the normative framework that speaks to pain and suffering of child victims of trafficking versus the triumphing over traffickers’ lack of acknowledgement of victims’ pain, and prevention of re-victimisation.

6.5.2.5 Trafficking by family members

Findings from this study reveals that a majority of the children interviewed were either trafficked by relatives, or their families gave consent for them to be trafficked. This information was sourced from the children themselves, and it was explored in terms of who they left home with or who accompanied them as they travelled to South Africa. Almost all key informants interviewed corroborated this finding from children and one participant said:

“…the role of the family in the trafficking of children who are their own relatives is a big question mark. One would not expect [it]. I’m just saying family, [but] children’s parents are involved in the trafficking of their own children. Point is that they are in some cases, and that’s a difficulty. No wonder the act of trafficking is only discovered afterwards, because [if] I go somewhere with my aunt, my mom’s sister, no one will suspect this person or it’s unlikely that the person will be suspected because my mother’s sister is as good as my mother, and meanwhile they are linked to other people...It’s one of the most biggest difficulties...” (Social worker 7)

The statement shows how the desire of families to break out of their cycle of poverty leads to trafficking, and they may either silently consent or be actively involved in the
In light of the above extract, a new anticipated finding that emerged from this study is the fact that the more unsophisticated the crime network is, the more difficult it is to recognise trafficking and fight it. A possible explanation for this is that child trafficking constantly keeps on replicating itself in diverse ways involving family members and extended relatives during the different processes of trafficking. This provides further support for the hypothesis that the faster the processes of trafficking change, the more difficult it becomes to identify it, or aspects of it. In addition, the more children exercise agency, the less able they are to see the negative role played by family members and they become angry when family members are correctly identified as traffickers, and the more challenging it will be to assist these vulnerable children. This study supports Gozdziak's (2010) findings that children trafficked by family members became upset when their family members were referred to as traffickers. Surprisingly, this also included the children who felt wronged by their loved ones, and the researcher observed that the trafficked children had difficulty conceptualising their loved ones’ actions as criminal.

6.5.3 RE-THINKING MECHANISMS FOR RAPID IDENTIFICATION

In this section, the researcher re-assesses mechanisms for rapid identification, with the consideration of deepening the current agenda on identification. In reporting the possible alternatives suggested by the study participants, the following issues are discussed: standardised prescriptive policies and procedures, alignment and application of child protection protocols, community outreach work, and development and training on child trafficking indicators.
6.5.3.1 Prescriptive policies and procedures

The key informants interviewed were able to report concretely that DSD has developed a standardised prescriptive policy document on exploitation of children, which will be disseminated to all social work practitioners in the country in due time. Putting the legal framework into place might be one step. However, the next challenge on how to enforce the legislation was a concern for a majority of key informants interviewed. Interestingly, field notes indicate that these concerns were mainly shared once the research interview “was over”, and the interview session was no longer being recorded. However, several examples on how legislation could be successfully implemented were provided by the study participants. Many of the suggestions provided bordered on strategic management of relationships, engaging and consulting policy implementers and devising executive directives, as shown in the participants’ quote below:

“…if our legislation is not specifically mandating a particular department or any service provider then there’s a loophole, because the people from that particular department or whatever don’t feel that they own it, they don’t have the ownership of that performance. We need to perform this duty because it’s our mandate. They don’t feel that it’s important for them. So for me as a social worker, the starting point is where a person, irrespective of whether mandated or not. So be the committed social worker and service providers whether you are mandated or not. For me that would be a best practice. We’ll really work together and make a difference in people’s lives” (Social worker 3)

As shown in the above extract, in order to hold professionals more accountable it is essential that the wording within the documents are adjusted, made more prescriptive, and aligned to child trafficking trends. Formulation of prescriptive legislation and policies is in line with guidelines stating the responsibility of states (OHCHR, 2010). Subsequently, this finding has important implications for formulating and developing an identification policy framework that matters for children, as well as for professionals in realising children’s rights and their protection (Robinson & Coetzee, 2007; Todres, 2012).
6.5.3.2 Harmonisation and alignment of child protection protocols

Political processes and systems have the potential to affect a trafficked child’s vulnerability. Child protection vulnerabilities and child trafficking consequences cut across the responsibilities of multiple government departments in South Africa. This means it is pivotal to secure the involvement of a wide range of government actors leading to an integrated approach.

This study revealed that the synchronisation-alignment-ownership nexus within the pyramid of harmonisation is an approach that can be lent to understanding child trafficking policies in South Africa. This is because the nexus allows for practical, realistic, and progressive approaches. The study participants’ criticisms were on the non-alignment of the existing laws and policies, which then subsequently made it tougher to easily identify trafficked children. Lack of consistency was also identified, which might have manifested itself as disorganisation or children not getting the required services, as shown in the extract below:

“…when I think of fragmented systems I think of various government agencies, government departments that aren’t working together, the different organisations that are not working together, either aren’t working together to provide resources. I mean to provide services or are not speaking to each other on these various issues. So you have maybe justice department not working alongside DSD. So therefore, the victim of trafficking, I’ve seen in many instances, isn’t protected from the perpetrator in the way that they need to be protected, their identity, their, so often departments have policies that aren’t even aligned with each other. It can result in a mess…” (Stakeholder 6)

As indicated above, by aligning policies, the core systems within the various lead departments in South Africa can be strengthened, and there can be a greater impact in terms of trafficked children’s rapid identification. By harmonising international instruments, local legislations and policies, the context-specific approaches with diverse meanings attached to trafficked children and identification are clarified. This has the potential to enhance credibility and reliability of South Africa’s identification process, whilst widening the knowledge base. In this way, child protection will
continue to feature on the political agenda in South Africa. Thus, findings from this study support the positive role attached to consistency that can be played through harmonisation of laws and policies (ACPF, 2010) in the creation of better policies. It is essential that the policies are harmonised, especially for the protection of transnational victims of trafficking.

6.5.3.3 Social mobilisation efforts in communities

The current study found that social mobilisation in communities is a process that is not spontaneous, but one that has to be prompted and shaped. Through community policing, early warning signs of trafficking that were observed by community members were reported to the police or the social worker. The South African spirit of ubuntu or the spirit of togetherness and oneness, which was displayed in cases of identification by community members earlier in this chapter, means that everybody looks out for the other and this includes supporting children's best interests.

Field notes indicated that individuals acted alone and reported cases, or collectively as part of organised action. All the key informants in the study unanimously agreed that communities need to be empowered because recruiting and training community persons to act as a ‘bridge’ between service providers and the community can be crucial in identifying new cases of trafficking. There was a consensus from all participants that everybody needs to be made aware of trafficking, the indicators, consequences, and how it could manifest itself within their community.

“..I believe communities and adults in communities, should be equipped and should be sensitised. They don’t have to be social workers they could be teachers especially but other people in the community, it could be owners of shops or nurses in clinics, doctors in clinics whenever children, they come into contact with children whether it be the mamas [mothers] in the communities or the gogo’s [grandmothers] sitting around the whole day in the community, they need to be sensitised to noticing these children, to valuing these children and to find out what is happening with these children. And they need to be told the process. They can be the first respondents in identifying the child, then taking the child to the social worker…” (Stakeholder 3)
The absence of social workers on the ground was also noted as a reason for training community members who would then be able to feed back the pertinent trafficking cases and information to the social worker. In this situation, the traditional boundaries and turf lines do not apply, but rather a sense of partnership is created through information sharing, and more children are protected in the end. The following extract by a participant supports the notion of involving people at grassroots levels:

“…it’s a bit [of a] tricky one because just being practical. Key role players will be people who are on the ground, and your professionals like your social workers, rely on information from ordinary people, people who can come to them and say there’s a child. You know very well that social workers are not on the ground. They can’t identify. I’m not saying what they’re doing is wrong, but I’m just saying the nature of how they operate doesn’t really allow them to be there. So people will get to them and report the case and it’ll get attended to but the people who are really on the ground are the NGOs and also they are more accessible so if we can capacitate them. Just think [of] the educators, because normally a trafficked child would normally not be at school and educators can identify children who are at school. However, you may not want to exclude them because they interact with children who are at school, who can actually tell them what’s happening back at home. It could be a child who is trafficked in their own family or next to where they stay” (Stakeholder 5)

Successful community mobilisation incorporates a series of collective actions based upon individuals’ efforts. This study was able to demonstrate that no effort can be dismissed as being too insignificant to bring about change. In light of the above finding, a system of identifying trafficking cases and making referrals that is limited to social service professionals, police and justice systems fails to include trafficking cases that may be encountered in hospitals, communities and schools. This study supports the report of Wulczyn et al. (2010) on adapting a systems approach to the protection of children. An implication of this is that multi-disciplinary, multi-level, multi-sectoral and multi-stakeholder approaches are taken into consideration.
6.5.3.4 Development and training on child trafficking indicators

Trafficking indicators are the signs that help one identify and/or determine whether a child has been trafficked or not. A majority of stakeholders interviewed for the study have a working knowledge of child trafficking, but were quick to acknowledge that they would benefit from additional tools and specific on-going trafficking-related training. The informants identified the need for experiential training on signs of trafficking, accessible resources, and on preventative measures as having the greatest potential in increasing identification of child victims. The extract below shows support for development and training on trafficking indicators:

“...the strengths is people who are adequately trained and capacitated to be able to identify and their training is, is practical, like government holds a lot of training all the time and people attend all these training workshops but they are practically not better equipped and again I think some kind of not really a checklist but a kind of indication of specific things to look out for or to possibly indicate that a child might possibly have been trafficked and then resources for it...It’s also about proper public awareness and understanding to allow for records in identification” (Stakeholder 1)

In as much as the key informants were motivating for clear trafficking indicators and checklists, which is a good step within victim identification, nevertheless, these indicators can be limiting. This can happen especially in circumstances where the indicators are applied rigidly and/or if they are not assessed on a regular basis, taking into account traffickers’ ever-changing modus operandi, new trends, information, international conventions, and research findings in the trafficking field. Therefore, even in the development of indicators “trafficking should be best understood as a continuum which involves various degrees of force, exploitation and positions of vulnerability” (Lee, 2011, p. 151). In addition, the training needs to be developed in such a manner that the information to be provided is tailored to the specific audience, to ensure relevance to the service provider’s position and is in line with the mission of the organisation. Follow up technical assistance would also be beneficial in helping the service providers translate training into practice.
6.5.3.5 Litigation and the pursuit for justice

The complexity, sensationalism and ever-changing nature of child trafficking sometimes make the narratives that children present with cause them to be categorised as fantasies and/ or lies. An initial sense of justice not being served was identified in the study when a trafficked child narrated their story and no one believed them. In instances where social workers especially do not believe children and their narratives, it shows a lack of appreciation in the value of the relationship, it affects the stability of the child’s future relationships; as well as the child’s health and well-being. The extract below illustrates sentiments of a child participant on not being believed:

“Lots of people don’t believe us especially when you’re trying to explain that someone has been doing this and that, you know, especially in my case since they have been my relatives. If I went to my father and said my uncle was doing this and this and that, he would not believe me. So they think we’re kind of lying or something like that, ya, and another thing, we’re not being taken seriously...like I’ve never, how do I put it? I’ve never heard of a case that they have arrested someone that has been trafficking children, you know. It’s like people who are trafficking are getting away with it, ya...” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

Social workers are called upon and urged to advocate for those who are marginalised, excluded, and are facing social injustices. Within child trafficking, this means advocating for trafficked children so that they can access care and protection, as well as calling for perpetrators - and not the trafficked children - to be held accountable for their actions. This is illustrated in the interview extract below:

“Well, there’s a number of justices [laughter]. Because firstly, it wasn’t supposed to be done in that way, the child wasn’t supposed to be trafficked. That’s the first injustice...secondly, we all know that somebody who is trafficking needs to be prosecuted because that is a crime. So to make justice to that, a person should at the end of the day be sentenced because he or she doesn’t qualify to be where human beings are. Remember a child is a human
being. So one of the justice[s] is that the person should get a very terrible sentence because there’s an element of inhumanity in that particular case. Then another justice is that the child should be exposed or the child [should] go through therapy. I mean if something wrong happened to a normal being you start being abnormal. Then you need to be taken back to the normal situation. That is one of the justice[s] that should be done to the children. But another justice is that of safety. The child should be safe even though it is difficult to guarantee 100% safety. But my opinion is that one as a parent, as a neighbour, one as a police officer or any other person who is closer to that particular child, irrespective of whether the child is mine or not should try to provide security. And then the last justice for me will be happiness. The child should always be happy” (Social worker 3)

The thread that ran through the majority of the interviews of children and key informants alike was the notion of (in)justice. The above extracts and the one below call for social workers and other professionals or persons that the children might report the trafficking incident to, to believe children and their stories, no matter how wild and unbelievable these stories might be, and for perpetrators to be arrested, tried, and prosecuted. The present results are significant in at least two major respects. This includes collaborating with other stakeholders, such as law enforcement, medical doctors, social workers, immigration officials, and psychologists in the journey to justice (ILO, 2006; Miller, 2011; Van Impe, 2002). In addition, one service provider cannot meet the complex needs of trafficked children, and this study acknowledges that it is the right combination that matters, rather than an optimal number of service providers (Melrose as cited in Shuker, 2011).

Meeting the ends of justice acts as a motivating factor for those wanting to report cases as depicted in the extract below:

“…and two is feeling like if you don’t report something you’ll get nothing done about it, because many times you see people and they don’t report it because they just think nothing is being done about it and then these children end up, continue to be in these exploitative situations” (Stakeholder 1)
All key informants and the majority of the participants noted that the limited punishment dished out to traffickers acts as a deterrent to community members wanting to report cases of trafficked children. It also stifles trafficked children’s recovery and their healing process and they carry with them the fear of the perpetrator returning and retaliating due to the incriminating information the children have shared with the police and/or social workers. During data collection, when key informants discussed the sub-theme related to justice, they seem disillusioned. On the other hand, field notes indicate that the majority of the key informants pointed out that the South African government’s indicators on commitment to combating trafficking in persons include police raids on brothels, where victims found on the scene are identified as being trafficked and referred to the relevant service providers, arrests are made, charges are laid, and alleged traffickers make court appearances. This is in line with what is generally reported on by the media (SAPA, 2011a; SAPA, 2011b; SAPA, 2013), but it is in contrast to the reported number and rate of trafficking convictions in the country (Allais et al., 2010; Donne, 2007).

6.6 CONCLUSION

The theme explored in this chapter has shown that identification of trafficked victims is not an event but a process that is highly dependent on the child’s entry point into the child protection system. The chapter examined challenges faced by service providers in identifying trafficked children, and further explored some mechanisms to enhance rapid identification. During identification, social workers and other service providers need to respect the voice of the child, whilst also upholding the best determination principle of protecting children and keeping them safe from harm and further abuse and exploitation. Furthermore, identification needs to respond to local trafficking trends and patterns, and thus training of service providers should incorporate these ideas. Proper and rapid identification of trafficked children in South Africa needs to be prioritised by the government, so that there is uniformity in identification of presumed cases of trafficking. This is because lack of awareness or application of uneven protocols leads to the development of walls of silence, which perpetuates children’s exploitation. These walls need to be broken down and the standardised protocols and procedures need to be implemented.
CHAPTER 7
INFORMATION-GATHERING AND SYNTHESIS: FINDINGS ON ASSISTANCE PROVISION

7.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter is a continuation on discussions of phase two of the D&D model, focusing on information gathering and synthesis, as shown in Figure 7.1 (below). The chapter presents and investigates data collected through the document study and empirical study. In this phase, a qualitative research approach was applied. The research purpose was exploratory (Strydom, 2013) in nature because the researcher wanted to gain insight on assistance provision to trafficked children (Fouche & De Vos, 2011).

Figure 7.1: Phases and activities of intervention research (adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)
The objective of the study addressed in this chapter focuses on how trafficked children experience assistance provision after rescue, as shown in Table 7.1. The chapter starts by discussing referral as a core provision in the intervention chain. The core needs of trafficked children are identified and discussed. Trafficked children’s needs and the service provider’s role in responding to these needs form the basis of this chapter. There is a discussion on challenges encountered when attempting to address these needs, and a further discussion on the consequences that might come about if the needs are not addressed promptly and adequately.

**Table 7.1: Themes arising from the qualitative data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEME</th>
<th>SUB-THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Identification                              | Identification through: i) Self-identification  
                                                ii) Community members  
                                                iii) Police  
                                                iv) Social workers |
| Identification challenges                  | i) Characteristic and nature of trafficking  
                                                ii) Perceived benefits from trafficking  
                                                iii) Lack of knowledge among professionals  
                                                iv) Fear in children  
                                                v) Trafficking by family members |
| Re-thinking mechanisms for rapid identification | i) Prescriptive policies and procedures  
                                                ii) Harmonisation of child protection protocols  
                                                iii) Social mobilisation in communities  
                                                iv) Development and training on trafficking indicators  
                                                v) Pursuing justice |
| Assistance provision                        | Referral mechanisms i) South African referral mechanisms  
                                                ii) Strengthening referral procedures |
| Immediate needs identified                 | i) Physical needs  
                                                ii) Psycho-emotional needs  
                                                iii) Medical/ health needs  
                                                iv) Social needs  
                                                v) Legal needs |
| Challenges in assistance provision         | i) System fragmentation and bureaucracy  
                                                ii) Children’s diverse backgrounds and needs  
                                                iii) Matching pimps/ trafficker’s lifestyle  
                                                iv) Children’s views on perpetrators  
                                                v) Premature return/ reintegration |
| Consequences of inappropriate assistance provision | i) Re-trafficking  
                                                ii) Stigmatisation  
                                                iii) Secondary trauma and victimisation  
                                                iv) Reinforcement of mistrust |
7.2 REFERRAL

It has been acknowledged that even though child victims might be free from their traffickers, they still carry on feeling controlled, trapped, exploited and are unable to make measured decisions independently. These debilitating psychosocial difficulties mean that trafficked children are entitled to basic assistance. For the healing and recovery process to be a success, referral among various professionals was identified by key informants as being the vital treasured link in the chain of care, support, and assistance required by children who have been trafficked.

From the research interviews, the researcher was able to see how identification and referral of child victims of trafficking are interlinked. The participants’ responses integrated elements of both identification and referral. Without identification, referral cannot occur, because what would the child be referred for? As highlighted in the previous chapter, the complex, illegal, and hidden nature of child trafficking necessitates the application of innovative techniques during identification. There was a consensus from study participants that once identification happens, the referral mechanism needs to commence in such a manner that the case management system ensures that the child immediately receives the necessary care and support. It was reported that the ultimate referral system could include assistance, return and successful reintegration of the child victims. For purposes of this study, the referral system is only discussed with regard to initial assistance due to trafficked children immediately post-rescue.

7.2.1 Referral system(s) in South Africa

Referral of child victims of trafficking for direct service provision relies on multi-disciplinary skills and the cooperation of service providers who are likely to encounter presumed or identified victims. This research was able to establish that South Africa does have referral systems and mechanisms in place, although not at a national level. Field notes indicate that in South Africa, referral mechanisms seem to exist and are operational at diverse levels, some are known and documented, while others are informal, unknown, and undocumented. For example, the referral mechanism exists in certain legislations such as the Children’s Act, but the legislative documents and policies have not been fully implemented, and therefore that information seems to be
lacking in service provision. On the other hand, some of these mechanisms may seem clear and easy to understand among certain professionals, but a many professionals might find challenges interpreting the legislative documents or they might not know about them. When the researcher inquired from the social workers how child victims end up with them, one replied:

“Generally it’s by referral as prescribed in the Children’s Act, section 110. The Children’s Act always says that people must report any kind of abuse, neglect, or exploitation and since trafficking is a category of exploitation, so they are obliged to report or generally children, if they want assistance they will come to the service providers” (Social worker 2)

Notwithstanding the fact that the structure of referral mechanisms will vary from country to country, the challenge with the existing South African referral networks is that they do exist, albeit in disorganised modes. The trafficking in person task teams is an example of a referral mechanism that has been set up in Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal, Western Cape, and Mpumalanga Provinces. Although the other provinces have not established task teams, it was reported by key informants interviewed that the inter-provincial coordination is applied, and that there are undocumented referral systems that also feed into the already established task teams. The task teams have been viewed as rapid response teams and a best practice, as shown in the extract below:

“…The second innovation, best practice that I’m finding is the rapid response team’s approach, where you find that the various cluster role players work together on a particular case. They develop a strategy together and carry it out from the beginning to the end and they use specific teams in addressing or in ensuring that a particular case is dealt with from the beginning till the end. So I think the rapid response team is also a best practice that we should actually think of adopting. It’s a form of specialised approach, it’s not a normal run off the mill ya” (Stakeholder 11)

An interesting finding within the researcher's field notes is that there is an exclusive referral mechanism at national level referred to as the Inter-sectoral Committee
National on Trafficking in Persons (NICTIP), and also referral mechanism at grassroots’ or community levels. However, there seems to be a disjuncture in the two, as it is rare for them to meet at a mid-point. Each seems to be working towards the same goal, although in isolation; whereas they could partner, share ideas, and do much more together. There seems to be a competition between the two entities, as mentioned by several study participants.

“...I think you see [civil society organisations] CSO’s are actually implementing what government can’t do. They are not competing and they shouldn’t be seen as competing with government because like I said for me the NGO’s are the people who are actually on the ground…It’s a good system but for us here we need to improve on how best we can do things. We are already to an extent doing it, even though there are still misconceptions about CSO’s, it’s like they want to take over or they want to compete with government but you see from our point it’s like that the two should be complementing each other because we know the capacity of the other is not that much. We must just be honest…” (Stakeholder 5)

7.2.2 Strengthening referral mechanisms

There was a general consensus amongst the key informants on what was required to conduct an appropriate, timeous referral. The core elements identified include knowledge about who to refer to, important documents of information to attach, consistency, and information sharing. In addition, collaboration and co-operation among relevant role-players with clarity in the devolution of responsibilities was emphasised, whilst building on national capacity and the flexibility of mechanisms.

One of the main elements constantly repeated and highlighted as being important by the study participants was knowledge of where to refer. This could be in the form of knowledge about the varied services the different agencies offer within the specific jurisdictions. A resource directory, as highlighted in the extract below, was highly recommended as a helpful tool during referral in assisting the referee to identify and choose the most ideal agency to assist the victim.
“...And then the other thing is that you need to be able to refer in case, the referral procedure. I don't know what you call it. If I'm unable to assist this child, then I must be able to refer the child to somebody who will be able to assist. And then you do not just refer. There must be a resource directory. A resource directory will give me an indication, to say, say this is Gauteng and in case I want to refer the child, this is the person that I need to talk to then I'll be able to refer the child...” (Social worker 3)

From a review of South African trafficking literature and through data collection, it was established that the country does not have a specific resource directory for victims of trafficking. What is available and accessible to the public is the “National Directory of Services for Victims of Violence and Crime”. A specific resource directory of services would be essential towards the successful referral of trafficked victims. In line with the dangers associated with trafficking, the actual address of the service provider can be withheld, and only provided upon establishing that the service provider making the referral is genuine and can be traced and trusted. The following example shows the importance of knowing where and to whom to refer the trafficked children should be referred:

“When doing referrals I think again that needs to be checked. You just don't do referrals for the sake of doing referrals with these kinds of girls because you have to check the area number one. I can't say if I get a prostituted girl now and then I think that I'll refer this girl to Pretoria because I think Pretoria is far. So we have to check how safe it is, the safety of the girl and also the people that you involve. You just can't call anyone, you have to have your kind of people that you are working with, you just can't call the police for the sake of calling the policeman, you have to know. You know for example you have identified a place in Rosettenville, calling police or a policeman just on the road it might not help. You'd rather go to a particular person, present the case to a person who will understand you, present your case and see who you can go with to rescue, you understand...” (Stakeholder 12)

As indicated in the extract above, it is important to conduct a risk assessment prior to making a referral to ascertain any security risks. These could be in terms of...
establishing individual risks to the child victim and/or strategic or operational risks to the service delivery organisations involved. Apart from risks involved, it becomes clear that it is also not the sole obligation of one service provider to manage all the needs and risk factors that a child victim of trafficking presents with. Much thought pertaining to the child’s urgent and essential needs is therefore required. Therefore, it is possible that this will subsequently determine what the crucial need will be for the victim at the point when they present to the service provider. This is because if an inappropriate referral is made, it has the possibility of not only placing the child at risk, but also of breaking the chain of assistance provision. An appropriate referral that is done in a timely manner has the potential to benefit the victims’ well-being, as well as make the trafficked person and the service provider feel empowered, well-informed and secure (Zimmerman & Borland, 2009).

A majority of the key informants interviewed reported that it was also important for the organisation making the referral to know which documents to present or send to the agency receiving the child victim. If possible, it is vital that these logistics be established and understood clearly by all parties involved prior, to making the referral. The social worker below explains how this can be possible:

“If the police brought them [children] during the day, they are brought straight to our [social work] office. Then, they, we require certain forms from them, such as Form 36. If the child has been abused sexually, we’ll also request them to give us a Form 9. We call it Form 9, but it’s no longer Form 9 now. It has been changed in the Children’s Act. So they give us those forms, together with the statements because they need to explain how they got the child and what happened and so forth and so forth. We require a lot of documents from them, so that we’ll be able to know what happened to the child…” (Social worker 1)

In as much as the agency that the victim is being referred to require information, it is crucial that this information is limited to what has been agreed upon by the victim, and only the information that is required for effective care could be exchanged, transferred, or given. This study is in support of OHCHR (2010) and Davy’s (2012) findings that information sharing between transnational networks and agencies
requires that all security precautions are also observed and that the victim’s privacy and participation is respected when making these decisions.

Other aspects of information sharing are consistency and involvement of the role-players during rescue and immediately post-rescue. The complex nature of trafficking requires a multi-disciplinary team’s participation. This was echoed by the majority of the key informants who were interviewed for the study, as indicated in the extract below:

“...sometimes police identify a particular area and they do a raid, that’s carefully planned from their point of view, but there’s no planning on where will they take children if children are found to be there and picked up. It’s kind of a very ad hoc arrangement...we enter this brothel, we suspected there were trafficked people and we did not anticipate that six of them might be children. So suddenly they have six children at the police station and nowhere to take them because they haven’t prepared any service provider to stand by to receive those children...” (Stakeholder 7)

It is crucial that the design of the referral system aims to concretise communication, co-operation and collaboration between government, NGOs, CSOs and Faith-Based Organisations (FBOs) where necessary. This is because as reported in the next interview extract, successful partnerships are committed; there is a sense of collective ownership and they bring together diverse resources to reach a common mutually identified goal. Subsequently, benefits from partnerships have been reported to be phenomenal in certain geographical areas prioritising child protection work:

“I must say the partnership, collaboration and coordination in Musina has yielded positive results. It led to collective ownership and [a] response in ensuring that children’s rights are realized, because like I said, different stakeholders with different expertise and resources have come on board to ensure that the needs of children are being addressed. Some come with material support, some come with technical support, some ensure that the child protection system is being strengthened…” (Stakeholder 10)
“...you know what I’m saying, to re-invent the wheel but also we need to spin the wheel together, it’s about making the wheels move, that’s what I’m trying to say, because the one thing is if we re-invent the wheel by having many competing services then...at the end of the day the children will not be receiving services adequately” (Stakeholder 15)

The finding on concretising co-operation supports Emser (2013) and Wessels and Edgerton’s (2008) research findings that emphasise that child protection is a collective responsibility and that one organization or agency cannot fully succeed in fulfilling it singlehandedly.

In line with the partnerships, roles and responsibilities, an emerging best practice mentioned by the majority of the stakeholders relates to the designation of a national authority as the main coordinator of the referral mechanism. This study supports the notion of good governance and prioritisation of coordination as highlighted in the study by the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) (2012). The top-down approach where the government is the main overseer was recommended for accountability purposes but also because it is the government’s responsibility to act as a safety net for the population and to ensure availability and accessibility of basic social services. This was strongly expressed in the next interview extract:

“Yes, a referral system is important, but ultimately you would ask who would run it and how should it be implemented or coordinated? Because of coordination problems amongst the NGO’s I believe government should take the lead role and have a whole government approach...” (Stakeholder 9)

A majority of the stakeholders who were interviewed felt that it is essential that a referral system is not rigid, but that it has flexible mechanisms. This means that the mechanism is accessible, available and that it is constantly updated with practical and relevant recommendations from role-players. This can be done in a manner that fits with the jurisdiction within which it functions, as well as the trafficking trends of that region and the needs of the trafficked victims.
“…what we need is something where people, the available resources, who they need to involve and they’re working together smoothly and coherently so that the police will protect the children from the perpetrators, will link up with the services that the child needs for care and protection. That everything hangs together the way it’s supposed to hang, and that it’s an inter-sectoral approach that you’re taking and all the child’s needs are taken care of, that the law enforcement part of it all will also have to work to ensure that the child’s protected, because if the child is not protected we can’t make any of this work” (Stakeholder 8)

Strengthening inter-agency, inter-department and cross-disciplinary collaborations is necessary in the provision of seamless services where everybody works together with one goal of rapid identification and assistance provision to victims. An underlying notion that was noted in the field notes indicates that sometimes it might not be possible for a victim to be referred, because either their situation is unsafe, they are subject to summary deportations, or the victim simply refuses to be referred and requests that they be sent back to their home country. This situation could be a potential dilemma for the service provider, and it may have further unanticipated traumatic endings for the victim involved.

7.3 ASSISTANCE PROVISION: RESPONDING TO TRAFFICKED CHILDREN’S NEEDS

This study produced results that corroborate the findings of a great deal of the previous work in this field in Asian countries (Deb, 2005; Bhagat, 2008). Based on the researcher’s reflection periods after the interviews, violence and abuse were noted as featuring predominantly in victim’s profiles and accounts of trafficking. These challenges require long-term, medium-term and/or short-term management. Key informants were able to share that although the majority of victims experience violence while in the trafficking situation, it cannot be ruled out that for some victims, violence and abuse was already prevalent prior to recruitment for trafficking in the country of origin. Pre-trafficking vulnerabilities, trafficking-related stressors, and post-trafficking stressors are inter-related in a manner that is complex and not necessarily
easy to separate. Although exploring experiences prior and during trafficking were not objectives of the study, it ought to be acknowledged that service provision to child victims of trafficking is complex and could be linked with pre-existing socio-economic and cultural vulnerabilities (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012a; CPCR, 2006) anchored in gender and other structural inequalities, subsequently making them more challenging to address. This section of the data analysis seeks to explore the immediate needs and subsequent direct assistance that trafficked children require after withdrawal from a trafficking situation. The issues discussed include the post-trafficking stressors identified in this research. In discussing the response to trafficked children’s physical, psycho-emotional, health, social, and legal needs, challenges in assistance provision as well as the consequences of children not getting the appropriate assistance timeously are also presented.

7.3.1 Physical needs
The researcher’s observations and interviews with social workers revealed that a trafficked child may present with urgent material needs that can be identified easily, and to which responses can be initiated and provided for immediately. However, when the trafficked children in this study were asked about what their needs were, it was evident that the experiences of being trafficked children steal from these children their right to survival, development, and participation. This discussion around needs created a sense of ambivalence in the children when they spoke. A possible inference that the children’s responses were highly impacted on by their socialisation processes or lack thereof cannot be ruled out. The feedback from a majority of children interviewed indicated that they yearned for there to be very basic necessities in their lives. This general atmosphere of minimalism was also noted in research by Boyle (2009). What the children seemed to have appreciated was the opportunity to have a normal life and to have simple everyday routines such eating, bathing, sleeping, and being cared for re-introduced into their lives. In addition, they reported that they appreciated the life-skills training, the homely feeling provided by the place of safety, and being treated like any other ‘normal’ child. The extracts from the children’s interviews depict this:
“Here they teach us how to clean, you know to wash ourselves, and all those chores everyone does, whether you are a boy or a girl in their homes. They teach us the values you know. Yeah, they treat us like their own kids. It’s a home actually…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

“…she likes it…that I eat, I play, I sleep on a bed, I bath…” (Anna, a Mozambican trafficked child, through an interpreter)

In Siphiwe’s and Anna’s case above, and those of other children interviewed for this study, establishing safety began by focusing on their bio-socio-emotional controls simultaneously with attention to their basic needs, such as sleeping, bathing, eating, and being provided with safe accommodation. The issue related to safety is linked to and discussed briefly again later in this chapter under “socialisation” within the provision of social needs. At this point, it is important to mention it because emotional safety and physical safety are interlinked. It is crucial that safety begins with the emphasis on body control then extends to the victims’ greater environment. This is in support of Maslow’s (1954) hierarchy of needs theory that stipulates that lower level basic physiological needs have to be satisfied before an individual moves on to satisfy higher level growth needs.

7.3.1.1 Accommodation

There was a general consensus among the three sets of study participants who pointed out that housing is the most frequent need requested by victims of trafficking. This present finding seems to be consistent with research by Potocky’s (2010) and Surtees’s (2008) studies that identified housing as a priority for trafficked victims. The need for housing is typical and essential because the victim is no longer being forcefully accommodated by the trafficker as a mechanism of victim-control. In addition, interventions are rarely successful if the victim is in contact, living with, or under the control of the trafficker. All the children interviewed for this study were placed in registered places of safety, which have been mandated to accommodate any children in need of care and protection. In all the cases, accommodation was identified as one of the core areas of initial intervention.
“...but the child then needs to be placed in a safe and secure environment in which the child actually feels safe and secure. That is not always easy because these children are often told that wherever you are I'll find you. I'll find you, but placing a child in a safe and secure environment as quickly as possible is necessary and then providing that child with also some basic stuff that enables that child to feel that this is a place in which I'll be cared for, protected and nurtured. You know when these raids happen, the child has no clothes, no toiletries, none of the things that make a person feel I'm valued like a human being...” (Stakeholder 7)

Both key informants and the children interviewed shared that it was important that the accommodation provided for trafficked children be a place that offers safety and other basic needs. The availability of safe and stable accommodation is among the first assistance that enables recovery. Further regular movement might destabilise the child and lead to recovery regression, because constant movement can be viewed as a means of control, similar to what was previously used by traffickers. In addition, this study revealed that the removal of a trafficked child from the harmful exploitative environment is an emerging practice that is relevant for an intervention to be successful. A secure alternative care becomes a place where children’s previous traumatic trafficking experiences are recognised, and they can be assisted to work on them, on a client-based, needs-based, and rights-based manner (Berg-le Clercq & de Baat, 2012; Boyle, 2009; Surtees, 2008). The placement also needs to be a sensitive, caring, and supportive environment where victims can still practice elements of their culture, religion, and language.

7.3.1.2 Clothing
Clothing is a key issue that has been overlooked in previous research studies focusing on needs of trafficked persons, including children. This study would like to highlight that this as an important basic need that can essentially be provided together with other core needs such as shelter, food, and safety. Children who have been rescued from a trafficking situation often do not have much, or are not given time to gather their belongings. Often the only clothing or personal belongings are
what they have on them. The extract below echoed how important it is to address issues to do with clothing for the child being rescued:

“They’ll have moved from one place which they are familiar with, now they are being taken to a place which they are not familiar with, and what they were doing there is very emotionally disturbing…Their needs, their other physical needs, they should get assistance. If they need clothing, just to bring back their dignity because you find that sometimes you’ll find them in a [unclear] those kinds of things…Services that could actually bring back their sense of being to this child these, are the ones that you need immediately” (Stakeholder 5)

A majority of the children interviewed mentioned being given a set of clothes upon their arrival at the place of safety. To start with, most of the children had few clothes at the place of exploitation and the majority had managed to escape with what they had on them. This seems to be a clever tactic because the exploiter might not have suspected their plans to run away, and in a way the exploiter cannot accuse them of stealing the clothing items previously given to them. From a deeper symbolic perspective, the researcher argues that leaving clothing and other items reminiscent of their past behind, the children seem to be ready to shed the past and start afresh. Unfortunately, for most children, and depending on what they had been exploited for, the clothing they are wearing is often synonymous with the purpose of their exploitation. Thus, material assistance, such as giving children new clothing upon their arrival at the place of safety, is one of the ways in which a child can start moving away and begin healing from the old trafficking persona and their debilitating past. It is interesting to note that from an empowerment approach, the child can start assuming personal and individual responsibility for the changes in their life, simply by putting on the new clothing provided (Gutierrez, 1990; Lum, 2004).

7.3.2 Psycho-emotional needs: Frozen words
The researcher’s observations indicated that trafficking instils fear in a victim and robs them of their sense of power and control. These observations were further corroborated by interviews with key informants. Metaphorically speaking, the
suffering that the victims go through renders them speechless, forgetful, and voiceless, and their words literally freeze. The trauma undergone can leave victims with psychological aspects of traumatic amnesia or traumatic muteness or both. This sub-theme discusses the two notions, i.e. safety, suffering and trafficking, and trafficking, trauma and intervention.

7.3.2.1 Safety, suffering and trafficking

Victims of trafficking feel unsafe within their own bodies and in relation to other people in their physical environment. The less they say when they are in a trafficking situation, the more they are guaranteed of their safety and survival. The victim feels isolated yet somewhat exposed. It is as if they have been trapped in their bodies and they constantly exhibit spiralling thoughts that manifest as fragmented life stories after rescue. These spiralling thoughts can be transformed and can lead to physically getting escaping from the painful event as the initial way to deal with it. This form of physical escapism is shown in the extract below:

“...I ran away...because I felt it’s like too much [shaking head]. I suffered a lot...” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth, with a sad facial expression, trailing voice, and evidently holding back tears)

As shown above, escaping from the situation at that particular point seemed to the majority of the children as the only alternative they felt they had available to them. The majority of the key informants were able to corroborate the dehumanising trafficking conditions that these children are held in, which could possibly lead to them wanting to leave.

“Most likely they have been threatened, most likely they have been warned not to speak to anybody, and if they are in a strange place, whether internal trafficking or trafficking from outside the country, then they will not be in networks where they know people, people they can trust. So issues of being taken out of their normal environment, then you’re taken from your normal working systems and you don’t know where to go or who to trust and you don’t know whether it’s safe to talk to people...” (Stakeholder 8)
Sometimes getting away from the exploitative situation seemed to weigh a lot on the children. Research has identified that loss of family and friends is a stressor that affects unaccompanied, migrant and refugee children because they tend to miss and long for their families (Joyce et al., 2010; Masocha & Simpson, 2011; Save the Children, 2008; Watters, 2008). These findings are also applicable to trafficked children who were interviewed in this study, who reported that they missed their families. This was especially in relation to those family members who had not wronged them in any way. It felt as though they regretted leaving in the first place, and when probed further they were also worried about the safety of their other younger siblings. Based on information taken from research on intra-family sexual abuse of children, which report that the abuse is usually perpetrated on more than one child in the family or that the perpetrator has committed more crimes against children than what has been reported (Elliott, 1993; Elliott et al., 1995; Payne & Hansen, 2002), it is essential that these concerns are taken seriously. When interviewing Ben, tears swelled in his eyes, and he took time before he responded to my questions about his family. The reflection must have taken him back to some good memorable times, and in as much as he said he missed his sisters, deep down he must have also been concerned about their well-being.

“...because there’s my sisters there in Tembisa, my two sisters but they are still young. I miss them. I wish to see them again if they are there...I usually pray to see them again. I hope they are still alive...” (Ben, a Mozambican trafficked child)

It is clear in the above interview extract that children’s relationships with their siblings are vital, because it is an acknowledgement of their individuality and it also gives them a sense of belonging. In light of this, relationships with peers at the place of safety can affirm their acceptability, which was lost during trafficking, and subsequently provide them with compensatory bonds.

Gaining trust of the trafficked victim is an important first step in providing assistance, because it involves sharing deep emotions with another person and thus emotional safety becomes paramount as well. It can take a long time before a trafficked child
trusts a professional and shares their trafficking experiences, as indicated by an extract from Siphiwe’s interview below:

“When I first arrived here, I was this child who likes to exclude myself from others, like I was not free. I was not active like the other children. I always felt like this is how I must like live, like I must live alone, just sit there, you know, not eating, [I] didn’t want to go and wash the clothes. It’s a must for me, that’s how I’ve been living all along. I didn’t know what the love of a mother is, you know. Until, but as time goes by and with the help of Mom-G, you know, I started to be like a normal child…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

Although the trafficked children, including Siphiwe, were usually reluctant to ask for assistance, or to re-engage with their horrific trafficking experiences, this did not mean that they do not want to participate in their healing process. Building rapport with the victims is very important, as the victim’s lack of trust might have been impacted on by the skewed socialisation process encountered during trafficking. In Siphiwe’s case, she appreciated the physical and emotional space provided, yet at the same time elements of care and support were also provided. In this way trust was gained, and she was able to open up at her own time and pace. Findings from this study support research by Herman (2001), Horgan et al. (2012) and Shuker (2011), which point out that it is crucial to prioritise the victims’ physical safety and gain their trust if the social work therapeutic intervention is to succeed.

7.3.2.2 Trafficking, trauma and intervention

It was evident from this research that disempowerment and disconnection are core experiences of any trafficking-related trauma. For healing to take place, fundamental principles of empowering the child and creating of new connections or re-establishing trustworthy relationships from the child’s past are vital. These are clearly elaborated in the extract below:

“…even when children are involved in domestic labour, sexual abuse or exploitation, once they have been trafficked there are some personal possessions that they hold dear and often when there are raids, these are left
behind. Perhaps that’s another thing, when the police do raids and the child is questioned, we should find out a little a bit about where are the child’s possessions [are] and try and retrieve them because children in this situation definitely need what we call a transitional object. Things that they hold dear, that perhaps have been with them for a while, that if it goes with the child into the care situation, it helps the child feel connected to something, gives a sense of maybe not permanence, but has a meaning for them…” (Stakeholder 7)

The extract shows that a child who has been exploited is more likely to trust if they have a transitional object that they can hang on to during the assessment process. Apart from acknowledging and allowing transitional objects to be a part of a child’s post-trafficking life, it is also vital that the victim is allowed to tell their story in as much depth as possible and in whichever way they feel comfortable with life story telling. This reconstruction of the trafficking narrative by the victim, which includes the significance of the transitional object in their lives is crucial, because it allows for different experiences to be integrated into the victims’ life. It is also necessary to work with the victim in terms of contextualizing the trafficking narrative in such a manner that it is no longer perceived as a present threat to themselves, the transitional object, and their well-being.

Another important finding was that of fragmented narratives. A possible explanation for this might be that fragmentation was still a coping mechanism used by the trafficked children. Possible inference that the fragmented narratives could indicate disintegration within the victim’s physical and emotional lives as a result of the trafficking experiences cannot be ruled out. The extract below depicts an example of a fragmented narrative:

“Another man he told me, ‘you you stay in Marabastad there’s nobody here, there is somebody he wants to rape you’. I said ‘yes’. I said she come from Zimbabwe. She has an operation and she’s blind. If I talk to her operation she said my doctor do not like this…” (Privilege, a Zimbabwean trafficked child)
The interview with Privilege was disjointed to such a degree that the researcher had challenges understanding what she was saying, but was also torn between continuing with the interview or terminating it. The researcher carried on with the interview as it was evident that there was more to the story, especially because there were instances when Privilege’s responses were quite clear and easy to understand. The unevenness in narratives was also evident with a few other children interviewed in the study. An example was when the interpreter would tell me “s/he’s saying her own things” which she later explained that the child was not answering the question that had been asked, but instead went on other unrelated tangents in spite several clarifications being made. It was quite clear then that the children were not ready to go back and access those traumatic incidents, and the researcher respected that and did not probe further in line with UNICEF’s (2006) and Zimmerman and Watts’s (2003) guidelines. The study supports previous research by Spyrou (2011) on reflexive research with children. It further supports Rigby and White’s (2013) study on complexities of victim narratives and Rigby’s (2011, p. 333) study which concluded that “…traumatized young people may not come out with beautiful precise, matching sets of information”.

The nexus between trust and consent are major elements within human trafficking. Upon rescue, these two elements continue to be associated with victims’ past trafficking experiences, i.e. being accustomed not to trust, not being trusted by other people, and simply not knowing people well enough to trust them. Lying then becomes a coping mechanism used by victims to deal with the betrayal of trust and other challenging post-trafficking elements in their lives. The majority of key informants interviewed reported that lying was predominantly used by victims of trafficking they had interacted with. This is illustrated by the following extract from a social worker:

“…so it’s very difficult really, even if a person can go out maybe manage to escape. They’ll go to the police and maybe come to the shelters. They don’t say that. They’ll tell you something else. They’ll tell you something that you want to hear, not something that they did...because they’ll give you a different version. They’ll lie. They’ll lie. They’ll simply listen to what the criteria is. They
As shown in the previous extract, the lack of trust can clearly be seen as a functional coping mechanism for dealing with multiple changes, multiple uncomfortable questions, and other challenges that trafficked children encounter. It can also be linked to the unpredictability and the uncontrollability of trafficking as a life-threatening event where there is repetitive and chronic danger. Thus, lying becomes a way to deal with the intense or prolonged psychological reactions, or the victims ill-conceived thought that trafficking was their fault. It is thus essential that the relationship between the child and the social worker is a relationship of existential engagement. An assessment of a victim’s high anxiety levels and the identification of the adaptive and maladaptive strategies built to cope with the traumatic trafficking experience is important (Zimmerman et al., 2006). This is because “traumatic account is often confused and inconsistent, which may be due to emotional distress and trauma rather than lying” (Zimmerman & Borland, 2009, p. 140). The significant role that a social worker can play is to believe the trafficked child’s narratives.

7.3.3 Medical/ health needs

Physical health needs go hand in hand with mental health needs. Therefore, another immediate concern for service providers, as identified in the study, was the immediate physical health needs of trafficked children. Although it was reported by social workers who were interviewed that medical testing was not a condition for being accepted into places of safety, it is an issue that can be looked into and investigated further, for example, to curb the spread of infectious diseases. That said, in case medical testing is to be taken up with places of safety in the future, it is essential that when it is conducted for admission purposes, that it is done in an empowering manner that does not humiliate the child. Although the children interviewed for this study alleged to have been physically abused, the extent of injuries they presented with was not clear during admittance to the place of safety. However, based on their answers, we can assume that, none of them saw a doctor during intake, and none of them was physically abused to the extent that they would have to be referred for a medical forensic examination. In as much as the factors
explain the relatively good correlation between minimal injuries and the lack of medical testing, it cannot be ruled out that physical abuse took place.

Physical abuse is not the only kind of abuse unleashed on trafficked children. Children who have been trafficked for labour exploitation can also be simultaneously sexually exploited, or the exploitation can escalate to sexual exploitation as a way to further control the child. An interview with a child victim who had been sexually exploited indicated that:

“The police get her out of there…they took her to the social workers, then the social workers before they bring her here they took her to the clinic, to the hospital because she was raped. They needed to check all that, they gave her some medicine and then she was brought here…” (Anna, a Mozambican trafficked child, through an interpreter)

It is clear from the above extract that the social workers were involved as soon as possible, which enabled the victim to get pre-counselling in a safe environment, prior to medical treatment and the extraction of evidence for forensic and intelligence purposes. Medical forensic examinations to establish the nature and extent of sexual exploitation can be as invasive as the sexual exploitation itself, and a support person, like a social worker, can be present during the medical check-up if the child requests, consents to it, or if it makes the child feel safer (Alempijevic et al., 2007; Ingemann-Hansen & Charles, 2013).

Findings from key informants interviewed indicate that trafficked children are coerced to take drugs as a form of control, and that they subsequently abuse drugs as a way of disassociating from their trafficking experiences. However, the results of this study based on children's narratives, and their records and reports at the time of intake do not explain the occurrence of drug (ab)use. However, it is essential when engaging with victims that this is not ruled out entirely in an assistance program, i.e. in case service providers encounter exploited children who are addicted to substances.

Medical contact with trafficked children needs to be viewed as a potential step towards improving their holistic well-being (ILO, 2006; Miller, 2011; Zimmerman,
In the same way that an encounter between a social worker and a trafficked child can have a positive or negative impact on the child’s health and well-being, an encounter with a medical practitioner can have a similar effect on a trafficked child.

7.3.4 Social needs
The findings from this research identified the provision of social needs as another group of needs that are essential to trafficked children. In discussing social needs, the following are explored: socio-cultural connections, family tracing, socialisation, life-skills training, and recreation.

7.3.4.1 Socio-cultural connections and disconnections
Children’s cultural backgrounds and experiences influence the assistance provision processes and the support that children can receive from social workers. The social workers interviewed were able to attest that they try their best to integrate the child in alternative care and youth care facilities and to provide trafficked children with the best possible care and support. The provision of children’s cultural needs and the integration thereof in their lives ensures that children’s dignity is respected. Field notes recorded during and after the art project with the children indicate that majority of the children miss their homes, families, and the opportunities to speak their home languages. These seem to be monumental losses coupled with the fact that a majority of them no longer remember the location of their homes, their mother-language, or details about their families. It was an interesting finding, as it seems as though the children longed for and made connections with the unknown, yet they yearned for a past that they could not easily access. Even though the children who were interviewed spoke numerous South African languages based on being resettled in South Africa, all of them acknowledged their nationality when they introduced themselves. Another interesting point that follows closely to this, which will only be highlighted, was the child participant’s choice of pseudonyms (Appendix N). Although the children all had names that can be clearly located to their different geographical regions, none of the pseudonyms they chose such as Sibusiso, or Promise, or Siphiwe could be traced back to their nationalities.
The main challenges noted by social workers who were interviewed were related to communication barriers due to language and cultural or religion-related eating habits.

“…It’s a challenge but you know, eventually non-communication works. I’ve seen that. [Mimics] You tell a person eat, floor, go there, bath and others. So that’s what we did, but they didn’t stay long. They left, [after] less than a month…It was frustrating to keep them and we can’t communicate with them. Ya, and different cultures, they do things differently. They were not comfortable. You won’t be comfortable in a place where they give you an egg and you don’t eat eggs. They gave you noodles, you eat soup, you eat Chinese food and they give you “pap” [a thick porridge made out of mealie-meal] [laughter]. So obviously they also had to say warawaiwara [gibberish talk]…”

(Social worker 6)

It is evident that when verbal communication did not work, the service providers resorted to non-verbal communication and the use of gestures. The use of informal sign language indicates the universality of certain symbols such as eating, sleeping, and bathing, and a connection might be made. However, one must be careful that the sign is not misinterpreted, or that the victim is misunderstood or misdiagnosed. From a social work perspective, and as identified in other studies by Pearce (2011), Potocky (2010), Rigby (2011) and Sambo and Spies (2012), language barriers evidently create difficulties for child victims to relate their problems and concerns, and it subsequently becomes a challenge for the social worker who is doing an assessment or providing social services. This concern is highlighted because in social work assessments and within service provision, exploring a child’s meaning of their anxiety in a language that they are well versed with can be highly valuable.

7.3.4.2 Family connection, disconnection and tracing

Without a doubt, children belong with their families and communities of origin. However, this might not be possible if children are abused, violated, and exploited within these families or communities. Findings from this research, as discussed in the previous chapter, recognise that the problem of trafficking started within the children’s families. Nonetheless, if child victims want to re-unite with their families,
their decision needs to be respected, especially if it is in their best interest. Family tracing then becomes the first practical step towards re-uniting the child victim of trafficking with their family. Key informants reported that this can happen immediately after rescue or later, depending on the merits of the case and the successful completion of a risk assessment. As shown in the following extract, there is recognition that places of safety are purely alternative placements and that Red Cross International (RCI) and International Social Services (ISS) play key roles during inter-country family tracing.

“...I'll mention something small even though it's the International Social Services speciality area. After a victim has been trafficked and then I mentioned all these processes on this programme which is rendered to the victims in the shelters, we prepare the victims to go back and be reunited with their own families or their own countries...So, what is happening is that we liaise with social workers on that side to check security issues because that's the main concern. Then, if they are of the opinion that the child, the victim, can be reunited safely with the family members or the community members, whoever, then that can be done, but the first thing to consider is the security issue. So, in other words, I'm trying to tell you that shelters are not permanent homes for the victims” (Social worker 3)

As indicated in the extract, since care facilities are only temporary solutions, family tracing is undertaken to establish the appropriateness of reunification towards the achievement of a durable solution. Once the child’s family has been identified, risk assessment is conducted to establish if the child’s return to their family will be in their best interest. Attempts of family tracing are evident in the narratives of the children who were interviewed for this study. However, as shown in the following extracts, the majority of the children interviewed did not know the whereabouts of their families:

“...I went to my father’s place here in South Africa, where we first arrived, but only to find out that there were other people living there...I couldn’t remember where about in Mozambique my family was, so they couldn't take me there...”
(Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)
“He doesn’t know his relatives. The only person he knows is his parents and they are both dead…” (Sibusiso, a Mozambican trafficked child through an interpreter)

In circumstances like the ones mentioned in the previous extracts where it becomes difficult to trace the children’s families, a durable solution calls for the children to be resettled in South Africa or in a third country. The notion of home in every community and for every person, including for trafficked children, is significant, and resettlement affects this concept and makes it complex. Home is where one can feel at ease and can be understood. The idea of home in African cultures takes on a systems perspective (Wulczyn et al., 2010) where it is linked with one’s identity, one’s past through ancestors, and it is associated with the creation of a sense of belonging and togetherness. For the children interviewed, based on their resettlement in South Africa and their inability to remember where home was and/or any details of their relatives seemed to be heart breaking, and it may lead to an alteration of their concept of home. It was as these children did not belong in their country of origin and nor did they belong in the country of present resettlement (i.e. South Africa), and in the process their concept of home had to be re-created. This finding on yearning for home as intertwined with memory, identity, and displacement supports research conducted by Ben-Yoseph (2005) and Bennett-Murphy (2012). Field notes on reflexivity indicate that the researcher could really see and feel the children’s deep pain and longing for their home of origin. Further research in this area is therefore recommended.

7.3.4.3 Socialisation and life-skills training

It was evident from the children interviewed for this study that their socialisation and both formal and informal life skills’ training ended pre-maturely when they were trafficked. This seems to have left a permanent mark on them as expressed in their narratives of why they have enjoyed being at the place of safety. The majority of the children mentioned increased awareness and learning of skills, as shown in the following extract:
“Here they teach us how to clean; you know to wash ourselves and all those chores everyone does, whether you are a boy or a girl in their homes. They teach us the values you know. Yeah, they treat us like their own kids. It’s a home actually…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

Observations in the field indicated that the chores that were assigned to the children in at the places of safety were deemed age appropriate. Furthermore, from an ethnic sensitive approach, and building on their ethnic and cultural identities (Sundar et al., 2012; Urh, 2011; Zastrow, 2013), the children took part in gender-specific roles, although gender-neutrality was encouraged. The chores were executed either individually or with other children, and were supervised by an adult. In line with what happens in many African homes, sometimes an older responsible child was given the role of supervising younger children performing an activity. In addition, the chores were not forced on them but a spirit of participation, unity, and belonging was encouraged and nurtured. In the trafficking situation, the children neither had nor were they allowed to exercise any choice. Re-establishing simple fundamental foundational routines that the children had been denied is essential for long term integration plans, re-introduction of notions of childhood and nurturing successful completion of that life stage (Erikson, 1963). This was also echoed as being significant by all the social workers who were interviewed, as shown below:

“So we develop them and we give them skills so that they can be able to work and be financially independent…Unfortunately, you can’t say go out because you’ve made a mistake. We have to listen and give the person a chance, because after all, we’re social workers we’re developing them not destroying them, or what you started with them” (Social worker 6)

The main participants of the study were taught life-skills in the context of social events and towards the promotion and maintenance of the victims’ mental well-being and capability. Improvements in victims’ self-confidence through the life skills training is essential for enhancing their ability to cope with real life situations. This short-term provision, if well timed, can lead to better long-term outcomes for child victims in the future. The provision of sustainable transformational developmental activities such as vocational skills training, education and awareness-raising can create better
opportunities, or enable victims to make better decisions in future when opportunities are presented to them. The provision of developmental activities indicates that social workers rightfully acknowledge structural inequalities and the push and pull factors that led the children to be trafficked in the first place. From a capabilities lens, these developmental provisions can assist the trafficked children to achieve full functioning (Pyles et al., 2012). The social worker can also use and enhance what the victim already has and build on it from it as there is a base i.e. it is about developing the victims, starting where they are and further boosting their resilience points. This perspective acknowledges the strengths of the victims and enables a shift during assistance provision to be made from the vulnerability to the competency paradigm.

7.3.4.4 Recreation

In many cultures, childhood is associated with playing, having fun, and living a carefree lifestyle. A common thread that was observed with all the children interviewed was the light-heartedness and brightening up of their faces when they were asked about what they liked about the alternative placement. The aspect of play was mentioned by all the children interviewed, as illustrated in the response below:

“It’s nice [smiles, giggles and starts swinging legs playfully]…We play, we learn…We learn how to cook and to clean…play with other children” (Promise, a Mozambican trafficked child)

The researcher was able to observe and even participate in a range of activities that the children at the places of safety participated in during free/ play-time, such as gardening, art work, playing soccer, skipping, and dancing. It is quite clear that anything that children can engage in in terms of fun and developmental activities will definitely contribute towards their overall health, sense of well-being, and happiness (Ginsburg, 2007; Talbot & Thornton, 2010). The researcher’s observations indicated that these pleasurable activities reduced the children’s stress, helped them gain perspective of themselves and their situations, and contributed to enhancement of relationships with other children and trust in the researcher. Subsequently, through interaction there is increased awareness i.e. shared interests, difficulties, and capacities which may have a therapeutic effect, as shown in the extract:
“I think what will be good for them will be when they are rescued there must be resources, there must be resources...When I say therapeutic programmes I mean if there can be things that the child can do with the hands that can also work with the mind, that is what I’m referring to, not necessarily counselling and sessions like that but other things that she [the trafficked victim] can do that will remind her, “uti” [i.e.] who are you, what do I want to do with my life, things like that, without pressurising the person, do this, do that, do that, ya” (Stakeholder 12)

As illustrated in the extract above, therapeutic programmes can take many different forms and can be delivered using any of the three social work methods, namely micro practice, meso practice, or macro practice. Whichever form of therapy is used, measures need to be taken to ensure that that the child is not harmed. It is essential that social workers and other caregivers monitor the children’s activities at the place of safety to see that everyone gets to play and have fun and that no one gets hurt. Through observation, the researcher was able to establish that social workers can informally assess the children’s needs and their levels of social or peer interaction. Furthermore, they can observe the capacities and difficulties exhibited by the children when they are doing an activity. This is valuable because there is great significance in witnessing what the child can do, their frustrations and levels of satisfaction, their approach to and withdrawal from situations, peers, or activities, rather than them self-reporting (Northen & Kurland, 2001). Furthermore, this finding supports Nussbaum’s (2000) capabilities theory, which states that fostering basic freedoms and creating spaces to express things that are worthwhile to a child is critical to their development. The quality of pretence and spontaneity involved in fun activities makes it possible for children to communicate their feelings and thoughts freely, in a way that gives them the chance to say and do what they like.

7.3.5 Legal needs

Trafficking of children is a criminal activity. From the study, it was evident that trafficked children are bound to have legal needs because of the illegal circumstances that they have been through. In such instances, this research
identified that assistance can also include provision towards legal needs linked to children’s legal rights, obligations, and other judicial proceedings. Under this sub-theme, legal counselling, legal guardianship and immigration status were identified and discussed as essential needs for trafficked children.

7.3.5.1 Legal counselling

Legal counselling is about the trafficked child having access to information about their rights. The issue of rights and access to rights-based information reasonably links to the issue of language. This is because the description of children’s rights can only be of value to the child if it is explained in a language and manner that they can understand, and if they are going to be safe after divulging trafficking-related information. However, as shown in the extract below, legal counselling is usually provided on the basis of prosecution of the trafficker:

“Possibly not the satisfaction but the assurance that the person has been brought to book and that they are not likely to have reprisal because they have gone to the police. So some things, that’s what some persons, children may want but often it’s sometimes [just] to be returned to the place they know and [have] just been explicated from the situation. Like many children, [they] don’t want to testify and stuff because it’s too traumatic; they’d rather just go somewhere else and leave it all behind” (Stakeholder 1)

It is essential that legal counselling is provided to every child who has been identified as being trafficked, even if they are not interested in the prosecution of the trafficker. It is essential that child trafficking victims are given the option of participating freely in investigations and legal proceedings and that their refusal to do so does not cause harm or jeopardise the provision of other elements of assistance to them, including legal counselling (OHCHR, 2010). In as much as it is necessary for legal aid/counselling to be provided as soon as possible, the psycho-emotional state of the child victim needs to be taken into consideration. It apparently does not make sense to bombard an emotionally fragmented victim with heavy, loaded legal information if they do not have the emotional energy, will, and/ or capacity to pursue legal
proceedings. Furthermore, it is clear then that legal counselling is not offered in isolation, but that it is given in conjunction with social services.

7.3.5.2 Legal guardianship

Trafficked children are vulnerable to annihilation and invisibility. Returning a child to his or her community of origin might not be a desired or the best durable solution for the child. Therefore, risk and security considerations always need to be taken into account. The children who were interviewed were found to be at risk if they were placed back with their families and not all the children were aware of the whereabouts of family members. In their cases, the parents were precluded from the decision-making processes as a result of conflict of interest. After determination according to section 150 of the Children’s Act, these children were offered protection in South Africa. During their statutory placement, the children were given recognition that they are victims of trafficking, and that they are in South Africa without responsible parental or legal guardianship. The children were deemed not to be able to make important decisions on their own; therefore, the Children’s Court would allow or even appoint someone to act on their behalf as a legal guardian. In this study, it is not known if guardianship was recommended in the social worker’s reports. In addition, it could not be confirmed if the children’s court had legally appointed a legal guardian for the children. However, since the role of a guardian is to advocate for and help in the coordination of assistance and support for the child, within the context of the child’s rights, it can be assumed that guardianship for the children who were interviewed rests with the social worker and/or the director of the place of safety. When the children in the study were asked who they were informed would take care of them and support them once they arrived at the place of safety, they said:

“When the police take me here, they arrived here and they introduced me to Mom-G and they said this is the person you will be staying with, but for how long I didn’t know…” (Siphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

“Yes, they told him that there is Mom-G here and she is a mother to every child here, and she will be taking care of him…” (Sibusiso, a Mozambican trafficked child, through an interpreter)
From the children's narratives it is evident that legal guardianship was awarded to the director of the place of safety. In terms of understanding her role towards the children, field notes and observations denotes how fondly the children spoke of Mom-G. Mom-G’s emotional support was applauded by the children who said that although they do not have social workers; their guardian is always there for them and keeps them abreast of any developments in their lives. This is to avoid legal-ethical related cases where children end up being provided with limited facts or have a limited understanding of information provided to them (UNICEF, 2006).

7.3.5.3 Immigration status

The research ascertained that trafficked victims often lose their travel documents during trafficking. Confiscation of documents by the trafficker was viewed by almost all key informants in this research as the reason for non-South African trafficked children not having documents when rescued. A key informant said:

“The first difficulty, you find that remember that most of the children who are trafficked from other countries their documents will be taken away from them so it means they’ll be in the country without documents. So they’ll be living under threats because they don’t know what might happen to them because they [traffickers] have their identity document. It’s like their [victim’s] identity has been taken away from them and also to go for services and to look for help…becomes another challenge…” (Stakeholder 12)

However, from the interviews that the researcher had with the children, the children reported that they did not know how they went through the border and they could not remember if the immigration officials requested any documents. This inconsistency between the children and the key informants suggests that perhaps the children were smuggled into the country. Without basic identity or any travel documents, it becomes a challenge to establish the child’s age, to trace their family, or to have them registered in South Africa. Lack of identity documents tends to rob one of their identities especially when in a foreign country. The key informants interviewed reported that not having the correct, valid travel and or identity documents in South
Africa was scary for any migrant, but especially for child victims of trafficking. There was also a consensus amongst the key informants that in South Africa, having identity documents is unfortunately most often linked with access to services. These sentiments were shared by the majority of the key informants interviewed for this study, as indicated in the following extracts:

“Most of the time you know that our services are inter-linked with official documents. Most of the times the child doesn’t have any official documents. They will not have status here and any way, if any person wants to help, when they want to take action they’re solely dependent on if they have the papers” (Stakeholder 5)

“…legal documentation is an entry point to child protection and assistance provision. Most of the children come illegally into the country and they don’t have proper legal documentation and this makes it difficult for them to get care, protection and support” (Stakeholder 10)

It is pathetic if a child’s involvement in criminal activities during trafficking is used to undermine their status as a child, as a victim, and their related rights to protection. The child’s best interest must be taken into account at all times, and it is crucial that they be allowed to exercise their rights fully, irrespective of their immigration status or any other legal status that they may be lacking. A key legal recourse for child trafficking victims in South Africa to obtain protection is through the social worker’s statutory intervention. This is crucial to the child victim since they might have been trafficked because they were attempting to run away from situations where human rights were abused, which would qualify them for the asylum status regardless of the trafficking experience. Secondly, the fact that the children were trafficked means that they could be eligible for asylum especially if they have a well-founded fear of reprisals from the trafficker if they are repatriated to country of origin.

The overlap between asylum, immigration and child protection in this research was identified as a challenge. Asylum and immigration needs were considered to be more significant in relation to the trafficked boys’ legal status in the country. Speaking off the record, the boys mentioned that they are more likely than girls to be stopped by
police, searched, and queried about their immigration status. These sentiments echo the findings in the Joint UN Commentary report (OHCHR, 2012, p. 70) that “a law enforcement approach to criminal and status offences by children may also prevail and migrant children may first be treated as foreigners and irregular migrants rather than children”. This means that presumed trafficked children or identified trafficked children without identification papers will most probably be referred to immigration offices rather than to child protection agencies.

7.4 CHALLENGES IN ASSISTANCE PROVISION
The challenges identified in this study and discussed in this section include ensuring safety, the diverse backgrounds and needs of trafficked children, matching lifestyle previously provided by pimps/traffickers, and premature return and reintegration of the trafficked children.

7.4.1 Safety
A pressing concern identified by several children in the study was to do with their safety, especially based on the continuous threats that they had previously received from the traffickers and exploiters. If one analyses child trafficking from a business model approach, for the trafficker, the loss of a child is equal to the loss of money and profits (Aronowitz et al., 2010). Therefore, this means that security and safety will always be a high priority when engaging with victims of trafficking. All social workers reported that restrictions on movement, communication, and interaction were introduced by the places of safety to protect the children. The extracts illustrated below speak to supervision of children, physically securing the facility, practising confidentiality, and capacity-building as ways of ensuring safety.

“…the names of the shelters are not disclosed, only the service providers, the relevant ones who are working closely with the shelters know exactly where [they are] in terms of meeting with the police halfway, we are not doing that for the same security reasons and one of the measure to try and protect shelters is that [at] the time the victim is brought to the shelter their cell phones are taken away from the victims and kept safely for them till it is time for them to exit the shelters. Reason being [that] the very same victims can call the
trafficker because there are some situations whereby the victims can have a very good relationship with the trafficker. It is very much interesting to listen to that kind of conversation because under normal circumstances you would think that no one would really have a good relationship in that situation but it is happening. So in other words, I’m trying to say to you that it’s quite a very challenging phenomenon which is challenging the shelters… our shelters have CCTV [closed circuit television] cameras and then their names are not disclosed and then the nearby police and those who are at the shelter that have panic buttons by the time they start suspecting, they press the panic buttons [so] that the police can be around within a second. That has been working. So all the shelters are secured in terms of burglar doors and windows, so we are trying by all means to have things in place but you will never guarantee security, that’s the thing” (Social worker 3)

Service providers who engage with trafficked children need to supervise and monitor the children in such a way that still allows the children to have a sense of privacy. Over-intrusiveness is discouraged. Confidentiality is vital, because lack of it not only compromises the child victim’s safety, but it has the potential to put other victims and staff members at risk, and compromises any on-going police investigations. Confidentiality is usually with regards to the child’s identity, circumstances, and whereabouts. As illustrated in the extract below, this can be further enforced by the Children’s Court order.

“We have security services, [to] whom we obviously can’t tell them the details of the children but if the social worker who bring the child before the Children’s Court with all probability [he/she] will have the details of the perpetrator and on the Children’s Court order when the child comes to us, it’s often stated that name of the person(s) whom the child is not allowed to have contact with and must be allowed in for visitations should they come to the institution. Unfortunately it sounds harsh but that’s a way of protecting the child…” (Social worker 7)

The majority of the social workers interviewed also mentioned the need to provide information to the trafficked victim as a way to ensure their present protection, and in
strengthening their sense of agency for the future. This supports the sentiments by Shuker (2011) that trafficked children need to be taught to be safe when they are on their own, and that their safety matters to social workers. The direct message given to trafficked children is illustrated in the next extract:

“…during orientation with them, we also make them aware on how they are supposed to behave in order to avoid being trafficked again, because if we don’t give them that information some can abscond from the centre and it happens that they can be trafficked again. So we give them a lot of information and reassure them about the services that we have for them” (Social worker 1)

Clearly, it is essential that assistance provision is conducted within a sphere of protection. This means that safety and security need to be prioritised during all assistance-related processes which also include protecting victims from media attention, exploitative research, re-victimisation and stigma as well as from threats and any acts of intimidation from traffickers or their allies. By keeping the child’s information confidential, the social worker is also, in a way, protecting other children at the place of safety as well as protecting him or herself from revenge by traffickers.

Establishing a security protocol, child’s safety plan, code of conduct when engaging with trafficked children, erecting physical barriers, monitoring the child 24/7, installing electric fences, locks on door, and bars on windows, may assist in maintaining a safe environment for victims, as explained in the interview extract. However, the same elements of safety that have been established can also make a child feel as if they are being detained, punished, or controlled in the same way that the trafficker previously did.

This study supports the findings by Shuker (2011) that a combination of secure arrangements and an intensive therapeutic plan early on in the placement can safeguard and help build trust with the trafficked children. Nevertheless, in as much as it is necessary to acknowledge that trafficked children need to grow up in a safe and secure environment, it is necessary to address the service provider’s concern that provision for total security might not be possible. At the same time mechanisms
put in place to achieve the children’s safety need not downplay the risks that the trafficker poses, nor take away the child’s carefree and fun childhood experiences.

7.4.2 Diverse and complex needs of trafficked children

An earlier discussion in this chapter indicated that trafficked children mostly present with numerous needs ranging from behavioural to psychological, socio-emotional to medical and legal to physical. A child who was trafficked for labour exploitation and was subsequently suspected to have been sexually exploited describes a partial glimpse into what child trafficking entails:

“…by using them [unclear], by using them, they give them a lot of work to do in the house, cleaning and all that and washing clothes, and also by using them and selling them, and by giving them away or making them stand on the streets or something, and also some are also raped by those kind of people again who traffic them…” (Shakira, a Malawian trafficked child)

A possible explanation of the above extract can be linked to the economic theory, whereby the exploitation of child victims is clearly dependant on how much the trafficker can benefit from the vulnerability of the victim. As shown in the extract, one child can be used by the trafficker for multiple profit-making functions. The trafficked children who were forced into multiple exploitative situations presented with complex diverse needs that required multi-dimensional and holistic approaches to enable their recovery.

The complexity of needs also includes emotional support. Children in need of protection hesitate in forming relationships with social workers unless they know and are convinced that the social workers will believe them and are emotionally strong enough to hear their story and address their diverse needs. One child said:

“Lots of people don’t believe us, especially when you’re trying to explain that someone has been doing this and that, you know, especially in my case since they have been my relatives. If I went to my father and said my uncle was doing this and this and that, he would not believe me. So they think we’re kind
of lying or something like that, ya, and another thing, we’re not being taken seriously...like I’ve never, how do I put it? I’ve never heard of a case that they have arrested someone that has been trafficking children, you know. It’s like people who are trafficking are getting away with it, ya...” (Sphiwe, a Mozambican trafficked youth)

The extract shows that trafficked children want to know that they are safe and that their needs, including prosecution of the trafficker, will be comprehensively addressed. In as much as trafficked children will have complex psycho-social issues, the goal of the social work intervention process is to allow children enough space to explore, express and vent emotions and frustrations safely, without feeling that they are being judged or dismissed. The present findings seem to be consistent with research by Helm (2011) which found repeated failure by professionals to engage with what children say about their needs and experiences.

The complexity of the matters discussed by children could indicate emotional fragmentation, but on the other hand it is worth noting that this is a child’s way of operating their own choices, control, and changes within the healing relationship and their recovery journey. The ideas and decisions that emerge are because of the working alliance between the child and the social worker, which makes it crucial for social workers to seek professional support and to continuously reflect on the feelings evoked by the children’s complex trauma experiences and diverse needs (Briere, 1992; Herman, 2001; Pearce, 2009). This is because if the social worker feels fear, terror, or is threatened in any way, the child also mirrors and feels the same way. Failure for social workers to engage with trafficked children is failure in social work practice.

Cultural-responsive care becomes a highly important practice method for a social worker engaging with trafficked children from diverse socio-cultural, linguistic, economic, and ethnic backgrounds. This is because trafficked children’s socio-cultural backgrounds will most likely influence the way they perceive the trafficking situation, their expectations for assistance provision, and how they respond to social work interventions. The children from this study mainly came from societies where, although children are treasured and childhood is cherished, children are meant to be
seen but not to be heard. This meant that such restricting environments may have influenced the children in this study to minimise the discomfort with assistance provision services (Boyle, 2009). Nevertheless, this could also be viewed as a product of their ages and developmental stage at the time of trafficking and or rescue.

7.4.3 Matching lifestyle previously provided for by pimps/ traffickers
The relationship between the trafficker and the trafficked child can be complex. In the previous chapter, the perceived benefits derived from the trafficking situation were discussed as a challenge in rapid identification. These perceived benefits are a challenge during assistance provision as well. This time around, if the service provider is unable to match the lifestyle provided for by the trafficker, it has dire consequences on the intervention. For the child to have the same standard of living, the trafficker’s grooming process pushes the child to feel that they need the trafficker and that the service provider is not meeting their needs. The challenge is shown in the following extract:

“…to the perpetrator. They go back where they were found because some of them that could be the only place that they know. Sometimes they go back because you should remember that when children are trafficked, they are usually trafficked for commercial exploitation. Some form of commercial exploitation whether it’s hard cash or cash received by somebody else, but there’s some economic activity going on whether this child is being given ZAR 10 (USD 1) on a weekly basis, they are not going to get ZAR 10 (USD 1) in a shelter or a home where you’re trying to rehabilitate them. And what happens? They are going back to the ZAR 10 (USD 1) or the cell phone. They want to go back” (Stakeholder 5)

In light of the above, building a trusting, open and supportive environment is extremely vital for children who do not have family, or whose family cannot provide them with the material or emotional needs that they want, are entitled to, or yearn for. The key informants interviewed for this research rightly acknowledged that it is important to recognise the negative value traffickers play in young people’s lives and
the constitutive structural contexts that the trafficked children come from. In as much as service providers might not be able to provide all the support and assistance and match it to the previous pimps or trafficker’s lifestyle, it is essential that the service providers strive to put the children on an equal footing with other children in the community. In this way, the children will feel that they have similar opportunities and support like all other children in the community. In addition, when trafficked children are treated differently and receive more assistance, it can lead to further stigma, jealousy and anger from the community. As reported in the Child Recovery Network (n.d), service providers are cautioned against such kinds of disparities because they can also result in parents knowingly perpetrating in the hope that their children will be rescued and will receive the same opportunities.

7.4.4 Pre-mature return and reintegration

When the researcher asked about initial assistance provision to child victims of trafficking, without a doubt, one of the very first responses from a majority of the key informants was repatriation or return to countries of origin. This was interesting because it could be interpreted in two ways. One is that family reunification is considered the best solution in ensuring the trafficked child’s harmonious development, and the second contradictory interpretation is what use is it if they are being taken back to the same circumstances that led to them being trafficked?

Pre-mature return of the child is detrimental to their psychosocial well-being. This is because incidents that made the child to be trafficked have not been addressed and yet the child has been returned to the same environment. This is what one key informant had to say about the pre-mature return of child victims of trafficking:

“History is the best teacher. What we know is that children who have been taken to Zimbabwe without proper arrangement, two to three weeks later, they cross back to the country because of the push factors. Because if you don’t know, don’t do prior preparation it means you’re taking the child back to the very same situation-push factors. Sometimes the push factors will be poverty, it will be the need for education, it will be running away from an abusive environment” (Stakeholder 10)
Pre-mature return of child victims of trafficking seems to be a huge problem in South Africa, especially in instances where service providers are not given any opportunity to intervene with the victim and the victim is repatriated as soon as possible. Poor repatriation policies are not in line with the child rights approach because the child’s safety is compromised and this subsequently makes them vulnerable to being a double victim of trafficking i.e. having experienced trafficking before (Adams, 2011). It is evident that trafficked children’s safety during the repatriation process, availability and suitability of care arrangements and safety of the child are vital points for consideration prior returning them to their countries of origin. Rapid repatriation and return can only be included as part of the emergency process if the service provider is able to conduct a thorough risk assessment within that short period and ascertain the child’s safety upon return.

7.5 CONSEQUENCES OF INAPPROPRIATE ASSISTANCE PROCEDURES

Child trafficking is an area riddled with complexities especially when it comes to victim assistance. If inappropriately handled, procedures related to referral and assistance provision can have huge costs and implications, at different levels. The major consequences identified within this research that are discussed include: re-trafficking, stigmatisation, secondary trauma and victimisation, institutional abuse, and development of mistrust in victims.

7.5.1 Re-trafficking

This sub-theme links very closely to the last one discussed under challenges in assistance provision. Children who are returned to their countries of origin without adequate support from and in the country of rescue tend to be extremely vulnerable to being re-trafficked. In response to the question on the possible consequences of the child being repatriated without the necessary intervention, key informants agreed that it was detrimental to the trafficked child’s welfare. This was illustrated in their responses as shown in the following extract:
“The child will just run back. They will just run away. The level of abscondments of children taken out of prostitution into care is extremely high and that totally destroys the police case. A lot of the children run back to where they were being exploited because they know nothing else, which is very well to say why did they go back? It’s the only life they know. Many of the children are drug addicted, so for some of them, there’s a need to get the substance…often those kids are labelled negatively and often most kids who’re vulnerable to trafficking are the children who are not happy at home. Either because of serious poverty, and deprivation or perhaps because there’s family violence or perhaps because of some of the typical issues associated with adolescents are not being dealt with appropriately…So you can’t place a child at home without service. One needs to assess what is the home environment, what was the situation when the child left home, was this child abducted, was the child in some kind of trouble at home, did this child abscond, what were the reasons? And one has to begin a process of service to that family, look at what de-stabilised this family in the first place. To put a child back home, without looking at the history and expect the family to cope is just ridiculous. It’s asking the child to run away again” (Stakeholder 7)

It seems counter-productive for victims to be rescued and be returned to the same socio-economic environments that made them leave in the first place, without improvement to these environments. The Poppy Project (Dickson, 2004) found that 1 in 5 women (19%) were re-trafficked after being deported or repatriated. This critically points to gaps in the reintegration efforts and the danger that traffickers pose upon victims’ returns (Surtees, 2007). None of the children interviewed for this research was a repeat victim.

Although this study did not set out to research re-trafficking, it is worth mentioning that according to Lee (2011, p. 79), re-trafficking occurs in situations where there are huge debts still owed to the trafficker or exploiters, where there is difficulty reintegrating into communities due to the stigma associated with being trafficked, or where difficult choices have to be made by an individual. While repatriation and reintegration programmes are designed to be inclusive, the underlying assumptions of key informants in this study was that these programmes are shaped by short-term,
narrowly focused policy concerns and by assumptions of what trafficking victims want rather than what they may actually need. Follow-up studies that are beyond the scope of this research need to be done on children who have been reintegrated to evaluate and monitor the impact of that intervention, i.e. exploring the post-repatriation experiences of trafficked child victims.

7.5.2 Shame and stigmatisation

In this study, shame was identified as one of the biggest obstruction when considering reintegration of victims of trafficking. Trafficked children may face rejection by families and communities and they are most likely to be victimised again for bringing shame and dishonour to their families upon their return. A majority of the key informants saw this as a major obstacle, especially when working with child victims who were trafficked for sexual exploitation. This was captured in the extract below:

“…it becomes a problem because there will be the issue of stigma, you know, unfortunately…if you’ve been trafficked for prostitution for example the community does not really accept you as a victim. They take you as a child who is loose or whatever, you know, so you lose some form of values so that stigma [is] attached [to you]. You find that now the child is not comfortable in the same community. The parents will be struggling with this child in terms of acceptance and so the support is like lacking and then the child goes back to where they were abused or exploited because then the child will be like what is better?” (Stakeholder 10)

It is quite evident from the research findings that stigma and prejudice is not caused by people who are strangers to the victims of trafficking, but that stigmatisation is perpetuated by the same people who are supposed to be protecting the child victim of trafficking. Discrimination is propagated by the victim’s family members, the neighbours and other people in their community. As victims try to move forward with their lives, the past experience of trafficking seems like an albatross around their necks as their families and community members continuously discriminate and taunt them. Unlike Marion’s Albanian study (2012) where the perpetuation of stigma is
fostered by a culture where shame and low status of women are cultural norms, the findings in this study show that stigma is attached to lack of remittances and notions of lost family values, family pride and purity and loss of innocence in childhood especially for female children.

Traffickers tend to control victims by making them perform acts that will lead to their isolation upon return to their families. Traffickers profit from stigma-related activities that are considered taboo, or which the community would scorn. This introduces the notion of transferred shame in connected and collective societies, such as in southern Africa, as highlighted in Tang et al.’s (2008) study. Victims of trafficking can harbour internalised shame, but at the same time their shame can be brought about by external shame. External shame is attached to strong family traditions associated with honour, thus families feeling shamed by the trafficked children’s experiences.

In most African communities where the trafficked children who were interviewed originated from, there are cultural and family-related values that speak to the maintenance of honour, always but especially, in the eyes of the immediate community. However, in the cases of children who were interviewed, the researcher strongly believes that the shame would be brought about by the fact that the families would be bitter, angry and disappointed by the lack of earnings or social or academic upliftment that they had expected from the children. This is a key finding because the children being reintegrated would be returning empty-handed yet the families had long-term expectations of monetary rewards after allowing their children to be trafficked.

In light of the above discussion, it is evident that when the victims of trafficking are returned to their communities of origin, they tend to be isolated and are fearful of the negative social stigma attached to their return. Since stigma is a strong indicator of family and community acceptance, it is essential that the assistance provided by social workers to both the trafficked child and his or her family prior to any attempts at reunification focus on family acceptance. According to Tang et al. (2008), closeness of the relationship determines the intensity of shame felt. Therefore, although the trafficked child might internalise shame, if those around them reject the shame and
stigma, the child has the potential to do the same and recover faster from their trafficking experiences.

7.5.3 Secondary trauma and victimisation

Secondary victimisation was identified by study participants as the suffering or harm caused to the victim by the initial crime because of the criminal process, or as a consequence of the lack of assistance provision. This is supported by the extract from a key informant interviewed for the study.

"Then you’re leaving a child who is in desperate need in a desperate state and what does that do? That is just destructive, the child may end up, if one looks at the kinds of things that happen to people who are trafficked, especially children; the child could end up just dying in desperate circumstances. Otherwise you could look at a child sinking into drug addiction, being trapped permanently in prostitution, being damaged. If the trafficking is for labour, let’s say other than commercial sexual exploitation, then the child will lose out on his or her education, the child’s future is damaged and destroyed” (Stakeholder 8)

As shown above, both fragmented systems and assistance provision systems that do not do their duties can potentially victimise the child victim of trafficking. Secondary traumatisation fails to take into recognition that a trafficked child is a victim of crime whose rights have been violated. It devalues the child victim because when the child is interrogated, the statements and information they provide is doubted. It is quite evident in the extract that victimisation fails to acknowledge that promotion of human security is linked to the protection of child victim’s needs (Jorge-Birol, 2008).

This research supports findings by Hynes (2010) that reports that vulnerability does not end when the trafficked child is rescued, but events such as accessing services, negotiating assistance provision, and lack of trust in the children’s narratives can all maintain or increase the initial vulnerability. Furthermore, this study supports findings from Van Liempt and Bilger’s (2012) research that reports that the lives of vulnerable
migrants, including trafficked children, have a tendency to be shaped and influenced by institutional frameworks.

7.5.4 Trust and the deconstruction of constructed identities

A snapshot approach tends to view trafficked children’s violations through a limited child rights violations lens that ignores the complex set of structures, needs, factors, trends, themes, and abuses. The extracts below illustrate how realities within children’s lives can be ignored and violated by the very systems that are meant to protect them and their identities:

“It’s a really difficult situation to get the child. It just makes it a very difficult case and the child would want to go back. You have to build a relationship of trust with the child and understand that the child has come from this background of abuse and they think I’m ok, I’m now going to get help and no help comes. Children just shut down and just turn off” (Stakeholder 4)

Trust becomes a key issue in the construction and deconstruction of an individual’s identity. Borrowing from research conducted by Daniel and Knudsen (1995) on refugees and from Hepburn and Simon’s (2010) study on trafficking in the US, mistrust and being suspicious plays a crucial role in ensuring that a refugee survives or not. Similarly to victims of trafficking, findings from the majority of the key informants established that if the trafficked children have been let down the first time, arrested or detained after sharing their story, a greater sense of mistrust develops and their future narratives are adapted to suit different circumstances. An example is illustrated in the following extract:

“The child goes back to the trafficking situation. So what we have noticed is that either the pimp will be more tougher to the girl or if the girl doesn’t go back to the pimp or to the trafficker the girl will go into prostitution. Then when the child is there, it is very very difficult to assist because the first assistance that the girl needs, you find that the system has failed the child already, now the child doesn’t have trust anymore. So it becomes difficult to win that particular child back to the services. It takes time again to win the trust because [of] the
trauma that they have been through. First when you’re working with this victim you need to build trust, you understand, you need to build trust and work with the victim individually, and if that is broken it’s very hard to mend it again” (Stakeholder 12)

Based on the above interview extract, one can see how easily mistrust can be a strategy for survival for trafficked children in the future. Borrowing again from refugee research, elements of historical mistrust are reported when refugee and asylum-seekers interact with service providers (Hynes, 2010). This subsequently trickles down to trafficking, as trafficking has been largely reported to be an issue affecting immigrants, thus the thinking and language of service providers is that which is traditionally linked to refugees and asylum seekers.

Trafficked persons generally live in fear and in environments that are loaded with suspicions. Part of the fear and changing storylines and narratives stem from their trafficking experiences and from the intensive interrogation by professionals from different multidisciplinary teams. Due to possible distortions in their thought processes, trafficked victims tend to think that they are not believed and trusted, although in certain instances this might be true. This finding supports Rigby and White’s (2013) findings that changing narratives can be a sign of complexities of children’s lives and journeys undertaken, and the children’s views of the trafficking experiences and events. In the latter, the lack of trust in children’s trafficking narratives prohibits rapid proactive identification, as discussed in the previous chapter. There is greater disclosure of information in instances when trafficked children feel safe and can trust.

7.6 CONCLUSION

Trafficked children have multi-dimensional needs. This chapter looked at the best possible integrated manner to return well-being to children who have been trafficked. The discussions indicated that referral is not just about transferring the child from one service provider to the next, but that it is a fundamental mechanism of providing holistic care to trafficked children. Establishing cooperation mechanisms among service providers is valuable in referral and assistance provision for trafficked
children. Failure to facilitate processes accurately, appropriately and timeously makes any rights accorded to children abstract and illusionary, and it increases the trafficked children’s vulnerability.

Service fragmentation causes further vulnerability to children as they become powerless and tend to feel hopeless and worthless when they are being processed through disintegrated child protection, justice, social services and immigration systems. It was noted that although safety of trafficked children was considered to be a major issue, there needs to be a balance between protection of children who are at risk of being re-trafficked and treating them in a way that is similar to trafficking them. Service providers could strive to achieve a balance between safety and normality for the child as much as possible and in whichever way possible.

In terms of their needs, there is simply no right way or single approach for children who have been trafficked. However, the aims of assistance provision could ensure that assistance provision is adapted to the child’s individual needs, that it is supportive of healing and recovery through a child-centred therapeutic jurisprudence plan, and that it is empowering, participatory and holistic. These aims speak to social work’s mandate to advance human rights and social justice and for social workers to be active participants in the fight against child trafficking.
CHAPTER 8
THE DESIGN PHASE

8.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter realises the main goal of this research, which is to develop a psychosocial guideline for social workers working with trafficked children. This chapter describes the design phase in the development of the guidelines, with the main activities being designing observational elements and specifying procedural elements (See Figure 8.1). The researcher adapted these two activities in an attempt to create innovative guidelines that seek to maintain quality of life for child victims of trafficking.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phases</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Problem identification, analysis, and research planning | i) Problem identification and problem analysis  
ii) State-of-the-art review  
iii) Feasibility study |
| 2. Information gathering and synthesis | i) Document study  
ii) Studying natural examples |
| 3. Design | i) Designing observational elements  
ii) Specifying procedural elements |
| 4. Early development and pilot testing | i) Developing a preliminary intervention  
ii) Application of design criteria to preliminary intervention and results of pilot implementation  
iii) Developmental testing |

Figure 8.1: Phases and activities of intervention research (adapted from Rothman & Thomas, 1994)
In this phase, a qualitative research approach was applied. The research purpose was descriptive, analytical and interventive (Strydom, 2013) in nature because the researcher was presenting the specific details followed when designing the social innovation (Fouche & De Vos, 2011).

8.2 THE DESIGN PHASE

Rothman and Thomas (1994) stipulate three types of intervention research that can be carried out, namely KD, KU and D&D. In this research, KD and KU is what has been described and presented in the previous six chapters. D&D which is presented in Chapters 7 and 8, although heavily influenced by the content in the previous chapters “includes creating an intervention model, modifying it through preliminary trials and testing and re-testing successive versions” (Bailey-Dempsey & Reid cited in Gilgun & Sands, 2012, p. 357). Thus, for D&D to be successful, it was essential that the social intervention developer, i.e. the researcher was aware and had knowledge of the other two types of intervention research and how they fit in with D&D. KU, KD and D&D were integrated in this study.

In intervention research, design simply means the formulation of intervention constructs. Certainly, Thomas (1984, p. 151) argues convincingly that “design is the planful and systematic application of relevant scientific, technical, and practical information to the creation and assembly of innovations appropriate in human service intervention”. Designing interventions requires that they are prepared in a manner that is “deliberate, structured, sustainable, valid and reliable in order to lead to clearly identifiable outcomes and benefits for the participants in the programme” (Monette et al. cited in De Vos & Strydom, 2011, p. 475). This is in line with Peebles-Wilkins and Amodeo (2003, p. 207) who stated that researchers within practice guideline development ought to design processes which “1) relies heavily on research related to outcomes, 2) results in consensus and 3) ensures uniform implementation of the guidelines”.

Social intervention research has been influenced by concepts, methods and approaches from evaluation research, ecological approach, and policy analysis, thus the design stage in this study draws on contributions from these fields. Indeed,
according to Mullen (1994, p. 165), significant emphasis lies on “social intervention research as viewed through social research and development framework and developmental research paradigm”.

The two main activities of the design phase, as identified by Fawcett et al. (1994) in Rothman and Thomas’s D&D Model, which are discussed in-depth in this chapter, are designing an observational system and specification of procedural elements in the intervention.

8.2.1 DESIGNING AN OBSERVATIONAL SYSTEM

Although design is the least developed feature of purposive planned change in intervention research methodology, its techniques vary “depending on the particular model of planned change dominating the social intervention research” (Mullen, 1994, p. 164). Social technology “includes all of those artefacts used by service professional or change agents to achieve their intervention objectives” making the designing of an observational system crucial during design phase (Mullen, 1994, p. 167).

The development of a social technology is in abstract form, and the different technologies could range from micro to meso to macro interventions. Therefore, the design phase addresses operational elements such as what the researcher did, to whom (i.e. the target group(s)), when, how often and where. This process has been referred to as monitoring interventions by Marlow (2005), whereas Fawcett et al. (1994) and Mullen (1994) refer to it as designing of the observational system. The core sub-activities that are discussed further under the observational system are design objective, design domain, and design requirements.

8.2.1.1 Design objective

The researcher starts this section by presenting an extract from the children’s storybook “Alice in Wonderland” which was written in 1895 by Charles L. Dodgeson, under the pseudonym Lewis Carroll. During Alice’s travels in Wonderland, she asks the cat to tell her which way to go and the cat responds by saying “that depends a good deal on where you want to go”. Similarly, in design work, the design objective
indicates where the researcher wants to go. This is because social intervention is a “focused process, designed to achieve specified goals” (Loewenberg, 1983, p. 20). In intervention design, the design objective is the task to be achieved in the design work (Rothman & Thomas, 1994). Thomas (1984, p. 29) refers to design objective as change objectives indicating “the goals toward which the efforts of helping should be directed”. The goal connects the problem and the strategy or techniques to be developed, and it also provides an opportunity for evaluating the desired results. In formulating the design objective, it is crucial to understand that the design of a helping strategy is shaped by both behaviour and intervention theories. Behaviour theory looks at understanding the behaviour of child victims of trafficking, social workers, and stakeholders affected by this intervention. On the other hand intervention theory “is directed towards understanding and prescribing the behaviour of the helping person and the activities involved in the helping process” (Thomas, 1984, p. 84). Both theories are important in this design process because each occupies an essential position in the formulation of the intervention guidelines.

The design objective in this study was to develop practice guidelines for social workers working with child victims of trafficking. Practice guidelines are prescriptive knowledge relating to practice principles, which “serve to organise practitioner activity in a focused, sequential, systematic fashion” (Thomas, 1984, p. 90). More specifically, the primary design objective was an attempt to create psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers to use with child victims of trafficking. Secondary objectives are discussed later under “procedural elements”. The design objective is an example of a differential goal whereby there is a specific aim for a specific problem condition. According to Loewenberg (1983, p. 77), differential goals are valuable “because without such individualized goals it will not be possible to develop a strategy which will be relevant for the specific condition”. Thus, in relation to this study, a differential goal statement would read like this: “the development of psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers working with child victims of trafficking”. The statement implies a problem, the client, the social situation of client, social work goals, and the desired change. For the development of the guidelines, the researcher drew on the needs of trafficked children as identified in Chapter 6 in an attempt to create set practice guidelines for social workers.
8.2.1.2 Design domain

The design domain within intervention research refers to intervention elements that may be fixed and therefore, design is not required or they may be flexible and needing design work (Mullen, 1994). The singling out of fixed and/or flexible elements when designing interventions is thought to make design task(s) less complex, especially when other variables are chosen carefully.

Social work interventions involve individuals, families, and/or communities at micro, meso, and macro levels respectively. When social workers intervene at these three levels simultaneously, from an ecological perspective, intervention is seen as a set of interacting elements (Hepworth et al., 2013; Payne, 2005; Wulczyn et al., 2010). Target persons within intervention designs includes a combination of individuals, families, or communities as the client system, with other elements being the social worker, the organisation involved and the specific practice knowledge and techniques used.

The elements applied in design work to structure areas for design activity are the social worker, the client, the agency, and techniques. These elements have a reciprocal relationship with each other in such a manner that each influences the other and is, in turn, influenced by every other element (Bronfenbrenner, 1994; Loewenberg, 1983; Wulczyn et al., 2010). In other words, every social system is interrelated and part of other social systems, thus, a change in one part of the system will affect all interrelated systems. The elements discussed next under design domain are the social worker, the client, the agency, and the techniques.

a) Social workers

The nature of child trafficking usually necessitates intervention from various professional helpers within the human service professions such as psychologists, counsellors, psychiatrists, nurses and social workers. Thomas (1984) indicates that interventions can have a broad focus that could potentially make the intervention purposeful to criminal justice, immigration, and other helping professions as well. However, the researcher’s and other non-social work professionals’ academic training and background had to be considered. The researcher decided to design an
intervention that applied to social workers only, based on her familiarity with the South African social work curriculum and training. The training that social workers in South Africa receive is uniform and is regulated by the South African Council for Social Service Professions (SACSSP) and the Council for Higher Education (CHE). This makes social work as a discipline a fixed element, although the techniques to be used with trafficked children needs designing.

In this study, a wide range of trafficked children’s needs was identified, and subsequently the multiple roles played by social workers in providing assistance to trafficked children was found to be the most crucial. Furthermore, during data analysis, it was evident that the formulation of practice guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children would be essential. Thus, in this stage, the researcher attempted to transform the research findings into relevant practice guidelines for social workers. A further motivation for this is in support of Gilgun and Sand’s (2012, p. 359) statement that “social work is an applied discipline whose researchers seek to contribute to the development of interventions that carry forward social work’s commitment to effective practice”.

In line with the work that social workers perform with children in need of care being accommodated in alternative care placements, a mediator such as a child care worker, a friend, family and relatives can be significant. These persons who interact with the client “can function in a quasi-rehabilitative capacity under the guidance of the helping person” (Thomas, 1984, p. 36). The use of biological family and relatives was not applicable in designing the intervention guidelines in this study, as the whereabouts of their families was unknown and/ or could not be established. However, future studies could see how child and youth care workers could be incorporated into intervention design work.

b) Client/ recipient: trafficked children

It is vital to organise knowledge for intervention around targets, thus the notion of designing for action. Trafficked children were identified as a target due to the needs that they present with at a social service organisation. The social worker, with the help of the trafficked child, tries to understand the nature of the child’s problem and
develop intervention goals and identify approaches to achieve these goals (Hepworth et al. 2013; Potgieter, 1998). According to Rosen and Proctor (cited in Kirk, 2003, p. 146), “social workers have many options in selecting treatment goals” as depicted in Figure 8.2. The options selected for this study are intervention target numbers two and three, based on identification of trafficked children’s diverse and complex needs. However, it is important to bear in mind that targets can be selected without necessarily identifying problems, and that interventions can be selected without identifying problems (Kirk, 2003).

Figure 8.2 Social work intervention targets with trafficked children (adapted from Kirk, 2003)

Children’s participation in the decision-making process can be resource-intensive, thus, it becomes easy for service providers to under-estimate children’s ability to be involved (Warrington cited in Shuker, 2011). However, Thomas (1984) identified the client as one of the core targets of change, and states that clients might be called upon to take on some responsibilities depending on the focus and client’s psychosocial capability and/or sense of agency. From a child-rights approach and strengths-based perspective, trafficked children’s strong points can be drawn upon to assist in the development of the intervention and the sustenance of the goals achieved (Walklate, 2011).

Trafficked children’s participation can assist in their healing process because their resilience, sense of agency, and self-confidence can be boosted and new skills can be learnt. From a client-centred approach, the needs of clients determine which
services are to be provided, and when and how they are provided. Therefore, the client’s needs ought to determine the content of designed programmes and the process of social service delivery (Stumbo & Peterson, 2003). In this way, trafficked children can become agents of change.

c) The agency
The agency setting as a context of service can be either private or public. The agency or organisation that the social worker will be practising from, whether private or public contains fixed elements (Mullen, 1994). As mentioned previously, what needs to be designed are the practice guidelines that the social worker will use. However, the intervention objective and the planned change environment need to be appropriate for the planned change process.

The agency as the service delivery setting needs to be taken into consideration because burdensome agency procedures may have consequences for the implementation and subsequent utilisation of the innovation (Fraser & Galinsky, 2010; Zayas, 2003). In addition, in relation to technical feasibility, policy stipulations may also influence the implementation of an intervention (Thomas, 1984). For example, section 25 of the recently introduced Trafficking Act (2013) stipulates norms and minimum standards for accredited organisations offering services to adult victims of trafficking but it is silent about children victims. Section 25 of the Trafficking Act overlook children and fails to make reference to section 191(2)(f) of the Children’s Act which states that trafficked children can be accommodated in child and youth care centres, and section 194 of the Children’s Act that addresses norms and standards for child and youth care centres. According to Marchionni and Richie (2008), the organisational context is crucial, and a supportive learning culture and transformational leadership were identified as enabling guideline implementation and its sustainability.

d) The techniques
Techniques are plans or strategies developed and used to engage with the client system. The techniques serve as a bridge because it connects problem identification and goal setting with the development and subsequent implementation of the
intervention (Loewenberg, 1983). The techniques for use by social workers were not considered to be fixed elements in the design work. The helping strategy components that were selected under techniques for designing include identification, referral, and initial assistance. According to Loewenberg (1983, p. 23), the development of an intervention technique requires “thoughtful consideration…to identifying the problem, determining the desired outcome, selecting the most effective points of intervention, and choosing the most efficient and most effective intervention methodology”. The use of the words ‘selection’ and ‘choice’ in the quotation implies that there are various techniques that might be applied and there are diverse targets for intervention, but that the participation of the both client and the social worker is crucial for the success of the technique chosen for implementation. Without a doubt, and as reiterated by Zayas (2003, p. 203) “the relationships among client, provider and service setting characteristics are vital to the development and implementation of guidelines for interventions”.

The South African Children’s Act and the Trafficking Act give broad instructions on how social workers could engage with any child in need of care and protection. Primary data collection with children, social workers, and key stakeholders yielded information on trafficked children’s needs. Based on this information, the researcher embarked on developing social work practice guidelines on identification, referral, and assistance provision. Indeed, “tools that guide practitioners through detailed steps of the decision making process are widely viewed as reducing error variance, ensuring greater accountability, and bolstering practitioner authority” (Talbott cited in Rosen, 2003, p. 284).

8.2.1.3 Design requirements

Design requirement is the process of determining the conditions that the intervention needs to satisfy (Rothman & Thomas, 1994). Mullen (1994) refers to this sub-activity as the identification of innovation requirements. Devising design requirements entails outlining measurable aspects of the guidelines. The design requirement says what the intervention will do. The requirements must link with the previously determined end results and they need to be measurable. According to Nel and Nel (1993), they must be stated in positive terms as well as relate to the necessary child protection
policies in South Africa. The design objective in intervention research is the “development of a social technology to ameliorate a social problem” (Mullen, 1994, p. 167) and to achieve desired outcomes (Proctor & Rosen, 2003). In this study, the design objectives are aligned to specific ideas and statements that could be used to influence rapid identification and initial assistance with trafficked children.

The aim of this developmental intervention research was to generate practice guidelines for social workers working with child victims of trafficking. In line with this, the design requirements that were formulated include a variety of issues, but are not limited to what has been mentioned below. It is essential that the guidelines:

i) sensitize and build capacity of social workers on the issue of transnational child trafficking;
ii) inform social work identification, referral, and assistance provision to transnational trafficked children in South Africa;
iii) inform social work, child protection and trafficking policies in South Africa; and
iv) help social workers see their role in relation to the network of service providers who deal with transnational child trafficking.

The psychosocial intervention guideline was based on the assumptions that:

i) childhood is a precious and delicate stage of development;
ii) child trafficking steals children’s rights to survival, participation and development; and
iii) children’s rights are fundamental to their development.

The mentioned design requirements were significant because they enabled the researcher to focus the design work.

8.2.2 SPECIFYING PROCEDURAL ELEMENTS

Identifying and laying down what the procedural elements will be in design work is crucial. According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 35), “by observing the problem and
studying naturally occurring innovations and other prototypes, researchers can identify procedural elements for use in the intervention”. In this stage, the information gathered was manipulated and transformed into a form and structured in a manner that will produce practical design concepts. The design concepts are articulated through a two-step design process of conversion and design (Rothman & Thomas, 1994), and are discussed next.

8.2.2.1 Conversion and intervention design process

Conversion and intervention design processes seem to be intertwined. In discussing conversion, reference is made to design work and vice versa. While both processes are information-based, it was essential for the researcher to be creative and innovative, especially upon realisation that the successful development of an intervention was simply not dependent on the information gathered (Mullen, 1994). The researcher had to be creative and imaginative, but also arty and flexible. The personal creative nature of designing a guideline makes the ability to replicate the conversion process highly problematic (Mullen, 1994).

In the previous chapters, textual and thematic analysis of the data indicates that trafficked children have pertinent needs that require social workers’ attention and intervention. In her research, Beytell (2008) referred to this as “factor isolating theory”, followed by “factor relating and structuring”. That is, manipulating data to meaningful forms that will produce feasible design concepts. The information “is converted into basic action constructs and through design processes, these basic action constructs are used to formulate more specific situational concepts”, which subsequently form the conceptual plan for development (Mullen, 1994, p. 172). The nature of this research was applied research, which necessitated borrowing and adapting concepts. In addition, the design may come across as being simplified because the data collected was practical with the intent of applying findings. Thus, guideline principles may seem clear and easily identifiable when these findings are examined for use in the design stage.

According to Fraser and Galinsky (2010, p. 460), the design of an intervention often involves “delineating a problem theory in which potentially malleable risk factors are
identified and then a practice theory matching those risk factors…with changing strategies”. However, Thomas (1984, p. 152) cautions against excluding certain ideas based on improbability or being impractical, but encourages openness to potential ideas throughout the designing process. Thus, through consistent reflection and brainstorming, the researcher continuously modified concepts during the design process. That said, for this study, the focus of the guidelines was on the overall promotion and protection of trafficked children’s rights, although rapid identification and provision of initial psychosocial assistance to trafficked children remained a constant. These elements were teased out and composed sensibly and meaningfully based on completeness, compatibility and relatedness for the guidelines objectives to be realised (Thomas, 1984).

a) Formulation of generalisations
The process of designing an intervention is both evaluative and creative as it requires evaluating and blending existing research with other knowledge, and subsequently creating intervention guidelines and practice strategies (Fraser & Galinsky, 2010, p. 460). The researcher built on work done in previous guidelines whereby some conversion work had already been done, for example, highlighting children’s rights. The researcher borrowed this aspect of children’s rights from previous design work (Munson & Pelz cited in Rothman & Thomas, 1994). However, the “borrowed generalizations and guidelines were combined with original work done…in other areas of conversion” (Mullen, 1994, p. 175). Generally, design work sometimes involves and combines borrowing, adapting, and developing activities and innovations towards the creation of specific interventions.

According to Mullen (1994), borrowing and adapting are dominant in situations whereby applied research is the primary type of information retrieved. This was the case in this study, which led to design work being simplified. In this study, the practice strategies included engaging in a relatively structured activity described in a guideline document. This entailed transformation of research findings from the empirical generalisations. That is, the empirical generalisations were descriptive, whereas the desired practice guidelines are prescriptive, i.e. they prescribe what the interventionist (social worker) is required to do or accomplish if the desired objectives
are to be achieved (Thomas, 1984). The practice principles and guidelines were easy to identify from the applied research findings and analysis. Furthermore, in Formulating the guidelines, the researcher observed and acknowledged the existence of inter-relationships. The following was thus considered:

i) the presumption of a causal relationship for the empirical generalisation in question i.e. variable X (rapid and well-coordinated identification and initial assistance) presumably affecting variable Y (psychosocial development and well-being of trafficked children);

ii) the practice guideline generally prescribes either an increase or decrease in condition X as a means of bringing about condition Y; and

iii) the practice guideline also included prescribed behaviours for social workers, situations, or conditions presumed to produce the desired level of condition X.

Within intervention research, the above process may also be referred to as proceduralisation i.e. “the process by which desired activities of the helping process are described, explicatred, and made into procedures that helping persons and others involved in the helping process may follow” (Thomas, 1984, p. 163). The results of proceduralisation within social technology procedures are meant to tell us who does what, when, where, how, for whom and under what conditions.

Substantive generalisation regarding all the guideline areas chosen i.e. identification, referral, and assistance-provision were teased out. The validity of the data to be used during conversion was examined. According to Mullen (1994, p. 176), “the approach to review the quality of evidence supporting a substantive generalization includes four tasks:

1) specification of the representativeness under which the investigation was studies;

2) identification of the characteristics of the research design and threats to validity;

3) specification of the consistency of the findings; and
During guideline formulation, generalisations were thought out and developed based on the relationship between the identified guideline statement and its impact on the trafficked children. For example, a formulated guideline statement such as “identification should always lead to service provision” instils and inspires confidence in presumed victims, and they are more likely to provide information if they are assured that they will be assisted subsequently. Thus, the greater the positive impact on psychosocial development and well-being of trafficked children, the greater the likelihood of the statement being included in the guideline document.

Next, limiting factors were also considered in light of the local South African environment, trafficked children and the organisational, policy and resource conditions that might influence the intervention. The South African Children’s Act would be a limiting factor, especially in those situations where the registered social worker struggles with its application due to lack of resources such as lack of children’s courts in their jurisdiction. Certain limiting factors were of unknown relevance, thus further design work during implementation might have to be undertaken by the concerned social worker. Furthermore, quality of evidence generalisation was examined in terms of the nature of empirical and theoretical information in relation to the guideline statement being made. The basis of the design work was the primary data collected, although in certain circumstances other sources of data were consulted. The criteria followed when consulting secondary sources assessed the source’s generalisability, verifiability and consistency within the application in the guideline.

Mullen (1994) values the development of alternative interventions because he argues that evidence from practice necessitates those social problems be approached from alternative intervention methods. However, from an ecological-systems perspective, the researcher is of the opinion that in recognition of social issues being multi-dimensional, there is a need for integrated intervention approaches (Wulczyn et al., 2010). Rubadiri (1967, p. 38) states that “no man can crack lice with one finger”. The multi-level causes of child trafficking based on the state-of-the-art review and the over-lapping needs identified during data collection demand that alternative methods
such as cognitive procedures for social workers, be included in the design work. An example of a cognitive procedure that was included as a guideline statement is the following: “Social workers must be aware that in as much as naming of trafficking is a vital process for recovery, talking about and narrating traumatic experiences emanating from trafficking can be difficult for a child victim”. The cognitive procedural element was formulated before the guideline statement and it acknowledged the important recovery and healing role that is attached to helping clients identify and label the social challenges that they are facing. These cognitive procedures expected from social workers working in the child protection field were significant in achieving the goal of developing the guidelines. However, as mentioned previously, the specific application of the guidelines will be determined by the social worker’s own values, knowledge, and skills.

According to Mullen (1994), the descriptive generalisations mentioned above mainly emerge from the information retrieval stages and once the generalisations are converted to prescriptive formulations, they are referred to as guidelines. Mullen and Bacon (2003, p. 231) stress that social workers do not consume research in the same manner that other mental health practitioners do, and thus it is important that guidelines be “held to standards that reflect the reality of the way social workers acquire and develop practice knowledge”. This was taken into consideration during guideline development.

b) Developing intervention guidelines

Proctor and Rosen (2003, p. 108) define practice/intervention guidelines as a “set of systematically compiled and organized knowledge statements designed to enable practitioners to find, select, and use appropriately the interventions that are most effective for a given task”. Guidelines have the potential to provide valuable and crucial tools for social workers as they respond to managed care interventions, such as with trafficked children in alternative care placements (Peebles-Wilkins & Amodeo, 2003).

There are diverse intervention activities for a problem area or a desired goal. However, the selection of a specific intervention activity that will permit the most
effective and most efficient intervention is crucial when developing intervention
guidelines. Loewenberg’s (1983) criticises social workers by reporting that social
workers tend to use intervention activities that are highly valued but are often less
effective. The ability to identify different potential intervention options and to choose
the most appropriate and relevant one is reported to be a crucial characteristic of an
effective practitioner-researcher in intervention research (Proctor & Rosen, 2003a).

The development of problem-solving knowledge for social work has been advocated
focuses on outcomes instead of the problems of the client population. It is not
possible to reverse child trafficking but social work goals were chosen based on
outcomes that will enhance the trafficked children’s well-being. The problem-solving
approach was chosen when designing the guidelines because presently, social work
as a profession aligns itself to the strengths-based model, and lays emphasis on
empowerment and competency rather than on client’s vulnerabilities and problems
(Ashford & LeCroy, 1991; McMillen, Moris & Sherraden, 2004; Oliver et al., 2012). In
design work “outcome-based target domains will serve as the logical beginning foci
for consolidating the building block knowledge. It could then be further refined
according to outcome categories within domains…” (Proctor & Rosen, 2003a, p.
123).

In design work, the conceptual task is to take the set of generalisations formulated
during the retrieval stage and to make specific intervention prescriptions pertaining to
identification, referral, or assistance provision (Mullen, 1994). Initially, the guidelines
resulting from the conversion process was quite general, and more creativity was
required in terms of its application to social workers. At times, the process ended at
this stage and at other times development carried on and was made more specific to
child protection social workers or further to child protection social workers working
specifically with trafficked children. This is illustrated next in Figure 8.3.
Figure 8.3 Creation of social work intervention guidelines for trafficked children

Proctor and Rosen’s (2003) discussion on array of interventions looks at the same concept of generalisation, but describes it in the following stages:

i) establishing target domain;
ii) outlining the ultimate outcome;
iii) forming intermediate outcomes; and
iv) outlining component interventions.

For example, the target domain will be the social functioning and well-being of child victims of trafficking, and the ultimate outcome is rapid identification. Next, an immediate outcome could be the victim consenting to assistance followed by a component intervention/guideline statement such as “the child victims should be given time to ask questions or clarify elements that they might not understand during the assessment. In case the child gets emotionally distressed, the assessment must be stopped and continued at a later stage”.

According to Mullen (1994), and as experienced by the researcher during designing the specific guideline, the original identified social intervention problem and goal became pivotal and much creativity had to be harnessed. Both Mullen’s (1994) and Proctor and Rosen’s (2003a) descriptions were used during guideline development in this study. Without a doubt, “without a creative, pragmatic element, it would be
difficult to develop intervention guidelines from what might appear to be interesting but distant empirical and theoretical generalisations” (Mullen, 1994, p. 184). Creativity was noted by the researcher in terms of the creation of various alternative options, i.e. by thinking big or sometimes even thinking small or simplistically, by supplementing the traditional with the new, the new with the old, customary with the creative, traditional with the innovative or the new with the cultural, and by brainstorming. Sometimes the guidelines were similar to what was developed in the conversion phase, but afterwards one could notice the difference in the practice guidelines because the specific area of application will have been included or added. The differences in practice guidelines were guided by the following criteria: effectiveness, efficiency, capacity, motivation, and utilisation. This part of the design process shows that the development of holistic interventions for children is generative and requires knowledge of change strategies and the ability to create policy-friendly guidelines that have cultural, child-like, and contextual grounding. It further indicates that guidelines are potentially specific, public, repeatable, open to scrutiny, and informs professional accountability.

i) Formulation of guidelines aims

According to Fraser and Galinsky (2010) and Proctor and Rosen (2003b), design involves the specifications of an intervention, which includes determining the extent to which intervention is defined by inter-linking explicit practice guidelines, goals, and activities. This statement is supported by Thomas (1984) who states that it is essential for aims to correspond and be capable of merging with research information that is in line with research problem identification and analysis. Aims generally tend to have a long-term perspective and may not be specifically measurable. The research problem was identified in such a way that the research findings inform the social work practice guidelines’ aim. Thomas (1984) identifies eight types of aims within intervention research, namely remedial, interventive, skills and knowledge-based, educational, preventative, advocacy, assistance provision, and protective. The type of classification used for this design, based on the research findings, is intervention. However, it also drew heavily on the other aims. Therefore, the goal of the guidelines is the creation of a framework that is holistic, victim-centred, and guided by the child rights approach.
Although the aim of the guidelines is intervention-based, in support of research by Gilgun and Sands (2012), the researcher would like to propose that within the aim, recognition be given to developmental aspects that relate to its formulation. This is crucial because in line with the ecological model, interventions are created in such a manner that they can be valuable and can be used to influence complex societal systems and challenges. Therefore, it is essential that they are responsive to individuals, families, and communities. Furthermore, systems focus on connections and they tend to interact with each other in complex ways (Payne, 2005). The ecological model acknowledges the on-going changes and developments that occur within a system and thus, any intervention developed needs to speak to these changes. Thus, by proposing that the aim of the guidelines be both intervention- and developmentally-based, the researcher is acknowledging that “practitioners must continually adapt and re-develop interventions in response to system changes” (Gilgun & Sands, 2012, p. 356).

**ii) Social work guideline assumptions**

The social work assumptions that guided the guideline development include:

- social conditions are responsive to social interventions;
- social problems are dynamic and there is a reciprocal relationship between people and problems; and
- the societal context in which social work is practiced influences problem definition, goal setting, and intervention.

**iii) Components of the guideline**

The needs of the clients determined the nature of the guideline, and the latter directed the components of the guideline and the role of the social worker (Stumbo & Peterson, 2003). Apart from the inclusion of guideline statements regarding identification, referral and assistance provision, the other components or sections of the guideline were influenced by the formulation of policy documents. This means that the general format used in South African policy documents was followed in order to make it reader-friendly.
The components to be briefly discussed include the table of contents, acronyms, glossary of terms, rationale of the guidelines, objectives of the guidelines, guiding principles, research methodology, situational analysis, legal framework, and specific guidelines.

**Table of contents**
This gives the reader an outline of what is contained in the document. It is important in a document because it helps the social worker to quickly locate a certain section of or within the guideline.

**Acronyms**
A list of acronyms indicates the abbreviations and abbreviated words that have been used in the document. The list provided in the document shows all the abbreviations in full. However, the first time the abbreviated word is used, it was written in full and subsequently abbreviated in the document.

**Glossary of terms**
The glossary of terms provided is in line with the South African legislations and other legal documents. This is important in the document because it creates a sense of uniformity in terms of service delivery, it is contextualised to the South African environment and it links to the technical feasibility of the study (Thomas, 1984).

**Rationale of the guidelines**
This section of the guidelines is based on the development of professional knowledge base and links the guideline development to accomplishment of competent, standardised, ethical social work practice with trafficked children.

**Objective of the guidelines**
Devising guideline objectives entails outlining measurable aspects of the guidelines. These must link with the previously determined end results, and it is essential that they are measurable. The objectives of the guideline are provided in a summarised version in the guideline. This section has been previously discussed in this chapter under “designing an observational system: design requirements”.

252
Guiding principles of the guideline

Guiding principles refer to the level of competency with which an innovation will be executed. They guide and direct the intended users of the document. It is essential that fundamental values and skills, which act as a map, be identified as a foundation for the guidelines. Design activity was not required in the identification of guiding practice principles because they already exist. However, it was necessary to engage in design activities in terms of adapting and aligning the practice principles to the specific context of trafficked children (Mullen, 1994). In this study, the greater context is South Africa, whereas the immediate context where the guidelines will be utilised is within any child protection or human trafficking agency in South Africa. However, as previously discussed in Chapter 6, this is not to say that these are the only two points of entry at which the presumed trafficked child will present.

The guiding principles to be taken into consideration when social workers are working with trafficked children are the child-rights approach (UNCRC, 1989), victim-centred approach (IOM, 2007; Surtees, 2007; Walklate, 2011), holistic, integrated approach (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2012a), and the evidence-based approach (Howard et al., 2003; Surtees & Craggs, 2010). The practice principles recommended for the implementation of the guidelines are those outlined in the South African Policy Guidelines for Course of Conduct, Code of Ethics and the Rules for Social Workers. The guiding ethical values and principles, to be discussed briefly, include respect for people’s worth, human rights and dignity, social justice, integrity, professional responsibility, competence, care and concern for others and service delivery.

- **Respect for people’s worth, human rights, and dignity:** This value is based on acceptance, confidentiality, and that every person is unique and has inherent worth. Therefore, social workers ought to respect and strive to enhance trafficked children’s competence, resilience, dignity and individuality and to mitigate risks.

- **Social justice:** Social workers have a responsibility to advocate and lobby on behalf of trafficked children. Social workers pursue change and challenge
social injustices that continue to marginalise, oppress, victimise and make trafficked children vulnerable.

- **Integrity:** Social workers are encouraged to act in an honest, fair, and respectful manner when they engage with trafficked children. It is essential that they use their knowledge, skills and values to serve others above their own self-interests (Hepworth et al., 2013).

- **Professional responsibility:** Social workers are expected to maintain “professional standards of conduct, clarify their roles and obligations and accept responsibility for their behaviours” (South African Code of Ethics, p. 7). They are further encouraged to partner with other social workers and agencies, and to adapt social work methods to address trafficked children’s social problems.

- **Competence:** This principle champions social workers to be knowledgeable and skilled in the interventions that they use, as well as striving towards continuous professional development and contributing towards the social work profession.

- **Care and concern for other’s well-being:** It is crucial that social workers value human relationships, and that they value trafficked children as partners when engaging them in the promotion, restoration, maintenance and enhancement of their well-being (Hepworth et al., 2013).

- **Service delivery:** Social workers’ core purpose is to give service to others, with passion and commitment, even in instances when they will not be remunerated. It is significant that they commit to assist trafficked children to access and obtain resources to address their social problems.

The word ‘client’ was substituted for ‘trafficked children’ to make it more relevant to the study. The above guiding principles were recommended because they are founded on the provisions in the South African Constitution. In addition, section
27(1)(a) of the Social Services Professional Act (1978) stipulates that a code of ethics for social service professionals be developed. These legislative and policy documents mentioned are prescriptive, and penalties can be imposed if certain clauses are contravened. Thus, chances are high that social workers will adhere to guidelines based on the stipulated code of ethics.

In addition, social workers are already working according to these principles, thus the underlying framework will not only be the same, but it will be uniform as well. The only thing that changes is the client system, and therefore structural complexities are minimised as recommended within the use and technical feasibility (Thomas, 1984). This means that the guidelines practice principles are more likely to be readily accepted by the social workers, because in addition, they have background knowledge, skills, competence, and other resources necessary. Implementation and policy research shows that people experience frustrations when change is introduced, especially if there is no alignment (Hill, 2012; Luthuli, 2007). This further supports the notion that interventions need to be tailored to the specific contexts (Gjermeni, 2008; Lund et al., 2008).

Research methodology
The research methodology section of the guideline outlines the sources of information consulted, how, why and when they were consulted. This has the potential to increase the credibility and acceptance of the guidelines during implementation, if conducted well.

Situational analysis
A situational analysis is generally a snapshot of a situation. According to UNESCO (2004, p. 1), a situational analysis is “an effort undertaken by programme planners to gather and analyse information that will help them to design, implement and evaluate interventions”. The inclusion of a situational analysis section within the guideline is significant, as it informs the development of the guideline. The situational analysis addressed child trafficking and the child trafficking indicators within the South African context as well as documenting challenges within the identification, referral, and assistance provision system. The prevalence, realities, and types of child trafficking is mentioned in the situational analysis as it is a crucial element that can inform
intervention services and resources needed, as well as provide a baseline for measuring future trends. For any sound social technology to be developed, a situation analysis is a key foundation.

**Legal framework**

When drafting guideline documents, it is essential that the policy and legislative framework is taken into account. In addition, if there are related policies in place, the obligation is to decide if they need to be changed or amended in such a manner that the social issue can be addressed. If there is nothing in place, the social worker can lobby for legislation to be drafted or implemented accordingly. International, regional, and South African legal frameworks that were consulted have been outlined in the guidelines.

**Guidelines**

This was previously discussed in this chapter under “design domain: techniques” (See 8.2.1.2 (d))

**iv) Identification of skills**

Design work was not required in identifying skills that social workers needed. This is because the social workers role of clinician-behaviour-changer implies that they provide “advice, counsel, therapy, behaviour change and crisis intervention” (Thomas, 1984, p. 37). Therefore, the same social work skills such as communication skills, interviewing, observing and report writing skills, engagement skills, and assessment skills used within clinician-behaviour role, and which are taught to Social Work under-graduate students in South African universities, would be highly applicable. However, the researcher felt that certain additional skills are essential in the achievement of the desired goals, and thus the following skills are encouraged, namely provision of practical assistance, research, information giving, networking, linkage and referral, and advocacy. These are briefly discussed next, in the order mentioned.
Practical assistance
These are activities that are perceived by clients as being real and actual, as opposed to other equally important psychosocial services that are not tangible. The three types of practical help identified by Loewenberg (1983) include:

- concrete but non-material services such as help with shopping;
- provision of non-convertible things i.e. goods received in kind that must be used as received such as food and clothing; and
- provision of convertible things, such as allowance money that allows the client to decide how they want to spend it.

It is essential that the type of practical help provided by a social worker to a trafficked child is not a routine decision, although it is worth noting that it potentially could be limited by agency policy and practice. It is worth noting that there are times where provision of practical help to a trafficked child will help to build rapport and a trusting relationship with the social worker.

Research
Mullen and Bacon (2003) criticise social workers for not being willing to take responsibility and expand their knowledge base through engaging regularly with new information and critical readings. Child trafficking is both an old yet relatively new phenomenon in South Africa, thus, the social worker will constantly have to read widely, especially in terms of the traffickers ever-changing modus operandi and manifestations of different forms of child trafficking. Knowledge on child trafficking changes quite fast for social workers to be fixated on the initial information received or known. Therefore, the social worker will have to engage with design work, depending on the aspects of the guideline that have changed and need to be amended.

Information giving
It is crucial that provision of information to trafficked children is not underestimated by social workers. As identified in this study, trafficked children rarely have knowledge of available services and resources, what is expected of them in their new situations,
and how to make decisions on what to do or where to go to next. This information ought to be provided in such a manner that it does not attempt to influence the outcome of the child’s decision-making process. According to Loewenberg (1983), a social worker who provides information in this manner empowers the child and affords the child an opportunity and tools for making a decision, whilst strengthening their social functioning.

**Networking**

In addition, networking becomes vital for the social worker because due to the dangerous nature of child trafficking, the practitioners already working in that area do not readily give out information unless it is to a trusted person. Thus, the social worker will need to network and know the different organisations within their practice jurisdiction and their core areas of service. In the guideline appendix section, there is a page titled “important contacts” where the social worker can add his or her relevant contacts. This becomes another area of design work where the actual user of the guideline gets involved with simple yet important design work.

**Linkage and referral**

This skill links directly to the previous one on networking i.e. knowledge of other service providers can help a social worker know where and how to refer child victims of trafficking. The social worker’s role as a broker is vital in connecting victims with relevant resources (Hepworth et al., 2013). Without a doubt, a skilled social worker does not single-handedly try to resolve every problem that a trafficked child presents. Instead, social workers have the ability to conduct an assessment and know which resources might be required and the agency or individual who might offer the required services.

Other skills linked to referral are social workers maintaining contacts with other professions and agencies, and preparing both client and receiving agency for referral. This skill becomes crucial when a social worker is trying to implement the referral guidelines. Hepworth et al. (2013) refer to this as case coordinating, whereby the social workers role as a link to goods and services is highly exercised in comparison to other social work roles.
Advocacy
Generally, trafficked children are powerless in every sense of the word, and to obtain the assistance that they require and which they are entitled to, they need the help of a social worker. The social worker can play the role of broker-advocate as identified by Hepworth et al. (2013), Payne (2005) and Thomas (1984). Social workers as advocates can aggressively use their professional power, knowledge, and skills on behalf of the trafficked children, and in the children’s best interest.

v) Instruction strategies
In formulating a guideline document, it is crucial to have the knowledge of professional theories and the specific professional knowledge development. According to Marsh (2003), the social worker is alleged to have a unique set of knowledge and skills. The guideline has been designed in such a manner that, with under-graduate background training in social work, a qualified and registered social worker can understand the guideline content without additional assistance. Therefore, the design work focused on using social work terminologies, methodologies, and simple inferences in English. The researcher also attempted to make the sentences short and concise.

However, in recognition that child trafficking was and is still not part of the South African under-graduate social work training/curriculum at most universities, it might be essential to further develop a short training programme where the guideline can be introduced to the social workers working in the child protection and/or human trafficking field.

vi) Resources
Outlining the resources needed seems like the final activity in the design phase. Identification of resources required is important because it determines and influences the implementation process of the guideline. The main resource required was finance to enable the printing of the guideline document as a real-world representation (Thomas, 1984). The realisation of the guidelines consisted of it being a typed and/or printed document in a form that would necessitate for it to be referred to as an intervention innovation (Thomas, 1984). However, in this era of technology,
researcher could re-package the material and present it in a CD, on a flash drive, or as an online booklet. The disadvantage with the former is that it would only work in situations where the social workers have regular access to a computer or a laptop and internet facilities. Thus, the rural or remote areas in South Africa will be disadvantaged; but it could work as a cost-saving measure in the urban and peri-urban areas in South Africa.

c) From design to product: Presentation of the guidelines
The D&D methodology inherently requires explicit yet sensitive involvement with intended users who were implicated in the practice implementation of the intervention guidelines (Bhattacharyya et al. 2009; Thomas & Rothman, 1994; Thomas, 1984). Through social workers involvement, it is argued that the guidelines will “be more acceptable, more compatible with existing methods, simpler, sustainable, and in general, more contextually appropriate” (Thomas, 1984, p. 165).

8.3 CONCLUSION
In this chapter, the design phase of the D&D intervention research model was discussed and its application to the study was highlighted. The aim of this study was to create psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children in South Africa. In an attempt to conceptualise this, the activities discussed included designing an observational system and specifying the procedural elements. The important sub-activities that the researcher engaged in included developing design objectives, domain, requirements and conversion, and intervention processes. Additional core sub-activities involved the formulation of generalisations, development of practice guidelines, identification of skills, selection of instruction strategies, and determining resources needed. The researcher was able to design the psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers. The pilot testing of the guidelines is discussed in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 9
EARLY DEVELOPMENT AND PILOT TESTING PHASE

9.1 INTRODUCTION
This chapter looks at early development and pilot testing phase. This is the phase where according to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 36), “a primitive design is evolved to a form that can be evaluated under field conditions”. This explanation is similar to the one put forward by Thomas (1984, p. 169) stating that “development is the process by which an innovation is implemented and used on a trial basis, tested for its adequacy and refined and re-designed as necessary”. These explanations seem similar in their orientation and both imply that this phase of the D&D model speaks to quality control and accountability and are intertwined closely with the realities of social work practitioners as users. According to Mullen and Bacon (2003), quality control and accountability is considered in terms of development of standards to assess quality of guidelines, provision of frameworks to users for assessing guidelines and user involvement as collaborators. In light of the above, design work from the previous design phase continues into this stage, since pilot testing the guidelines calls for further development and refining of the guideline.

According to Stumbo and Peterson (2003), a basic step adapted from Lundegren and Farrell (cited in Stumbo & Peterson, 2003) that is used to evaluate programmes involves planning, designing, implementing, analysing, and applying the result. However, according to Rothman and Thomas (1994), the steps are the five activities that apply to this phase and they include developing a prototype/ preliminary intervention, conducting a pilot test, applying design criteria to the preliminary intervention concept, determining developmental instruments and revising the intervention. All of these activities are addressed in the chapter, although for the purposes of coherence, they are discussed under developing a preliminary intervention, application of design criteria to the preliminary intervention and results of the pilot implementation, and developmental testing (See Figure 9.1). Strategies to ensure trustworthiness are also briefly outlined and discussed.
The research approach that was applied in this phase was qualitative and quantitative. The research purpose was evaluative, analytical and interventive in nature (Strydom, 2013) because the researcher wanted to ascertain the effectiveness of the social innovation created (Fouche & De Vos, 2011). The researcher also integrated concepts from evaluation research to improve the guidelines’ effectiveness in practice (Fouche, 2011).

9.2 DEVELOPING A PRELIMINARY INTERVENTION

Formative evaluation is where data collection is an on-going process, with the information collected along the way being used to refine the guideline. Formative evaluation was not used in this study, however summative evaluation was applied. In
summative evaluation, the appraisal was conducted once the designing of the guideline was completed.

The scope of development depends on the domain of the design, depth, and generality. Thomas (1984, p. 171) acknowledges that there are practical limitations when engaging with D&D, and that there is a need to “set the scope of development to obtain the greatest developmental gain, given the innovation objectives, while still mounting a manageable and workable project”. In the creation of these guidelines, the researcher pursued a broad domain with limited depth, which allowed the researcher to explore more areas within the guidelines’ development.

By this stage of the D&D model, preliminary intervention procedures are selected and specified. According to Thomas and Rothman (1994), the development of a prototype for use during pilot testing requires researchers to establish and select a mode of delivery such as workshops, telephonic or email consultation, or other methods of communicating the intervention to the intended users. Electronic mail (email) and telephone interviews as a means of communication and as a mode of delivery was chosen and it is discussed in-depth later in the chapter. In this D&D phase, it was also important to ascertain the purpose or the intended outcome of the guidelines, which is discussed next.

9.2.1 Purpose of a pilot study

According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 36), “pilot tests are designed to determine whether the intervention will work - to see if the beast will fly”. Generally, it is only usually in the context of such real-world encounters that includes diverse feedback on the proposed intervention designs that meaningful guidelines can be explicated and evaluated for ultimate general utilisation. Pilot testing of the guidelines as an intervention design, was conducted to determine if it could be implemented in natural settings and to examine its viability and utility as a practice tool (Bhattacharyya et al., 2009; Howard & Jenson, 1999b; Rothman & Tumblin, 1994). According to Fawcett et al. (1994, p. 37), “pilot tests help to determine the effectiveness of the intervention and identify which elements of the prototype may need to be revised”. Therefore,
Pilot testing is expected to result in improvements being made on the intervention guidelines, resulting in an enhanced and thoroughly appraised guideline document.

Pilot tests are generally implemented in settings that are not only convenient for researchers, but also in environments that are somewhat similar to the ones in which the intervention will be applied (Luthuli, 2007; Rothman & Thomas, 1994). Due to the nature of trafficking, access to the real setting was not possible at the time of pilot testing, and the researcher did not test the prototype in an analogue situation where actors play the role of actual clients. Instead, as mentioned earlier, the researcher pilot tested the intervention with intended users using a methodology that was conducive to the study’s participants, i.e. using emailed evaluation form. Therefore, effectiveness of the guideline was examined from the social work practitioner’s perspective (Elks & Kirkhart, 1993).

It is essential that the purpose statement for pilot testing provides a general direction. In this study, the purpose of carrying out the pilot study was to determine social workers’ satisfaction with the psychosocial intervention guidelines. The aim of the pilot studies helped to narrow down the intent and establish priorities. In the researcher’s study, the aim defined the level at which the pilot testing would occur, i.e. with social workers. Furthermore, according to Stumbo and Peterson (2003, p. 368), after establishing purpose, pilot testing goals “are logical extensions of the purpose statement and specify the content that becomes the focus of the evaluation”. Therefore, to reach the purpose that was established, the following pilot testing goals were further established:

i) to determine social workers satisfaction with the guidelines’ purpose and objective capacity;

ii) to determine social workers satisfaction with the guidelines, format and content;

iii) to determine social workers satisfaction with the guidelines’ ethical suitability; and

iv) to determine social workers satisfaction with the guidelines’ usability.
The pilot testing goals became even more significant in later stages as they helped the researcher to determine the type of questions to ask, and how to go about collecting data for the pilot. The purpose statement and the content goals helped in keeping the researcher focused on the task at hand in this phase of the D&D intervention research model. Stumbo and Peterson (2003, p. 369) state that the “purpose statement and the content goals may be revised and refined as the process continues”.

Fraser (2004), Howard and Jenson (1999b) and Rothman and Tumblin (1994) caution researchers that pilot testing and/or evaluation can demand many resources yet it can also provide a rich and high volume of information. Their advice is that a great deal of sensitivity is required, and that the researcher needs to tread carefully and not influence the intended users of the guidelines. In addition, the researcher was tactful and alert to unspoken clues from the intended users. Apparently, a disciplined approach, anchored in cultural-sensitive methods, is a richer route for walking this fine line.

9.2.2 Sampling/ Participants

The intervention guidelines were evaluated by non-experimental means (Thomas, 1984). The evaluation of the intervention guidelines was not conducted with trafficked children due to the precarious nature of child trafficking. However, as mentioned previously, the researcher shared the intervention guidelines with the social workers as users, and they were requested to give feedback on it (Cooper et al., 2002; Fraser & Galinsky, 2010; Stecher & Davis, 1987). The involvement of social workers ensured credibility of the guidelines (Lincoln & Guba, 1985), because the design concept was ‘tested’ by intended users and their reactions collected, based on the guidelines’ effectiveness, efficiency and costs.

Non-probability purposive sampling was used when selecting the pilot test participants. Purposive sampling was based on the judgement of the researcher and it was used because the sample had typical attributes of the population that serve the purpose of the study best (Strydom, 2011). The researcher shared the intervention guidelines with social workers as the intended users. The inclusion criteria for the
sample of intended users targeted included: social workers, currently registered by the SACSSP, working or having worked in a child protection and/or human trafficking field for at least six months at the time of pilot testing and availability to complete the evaluation form (Appendix O). The inclusion criteria were important so that concrete and relevant information could be gathered for later use in guideline development. A total of eight social workers were recruited for the pilot test.

The researcher recruited five study participants through face-to-face or telephone/mobile phone communication and via email. Recruitment of these five participants was done at the national conference on Orphans and Vulnerable Children (OVC) which was hosted in Durban (South Africa) by the DSD from 27-30 May 2013. The researcher approached participants at the conference for the first time or followed up a previous telephonic/email contact with a face-to-face meeting and discussion, inviting them to participate in the evaluation. The conference also provided a good opportunity to identify other organisations that the researcher could use later to recruit social workers from, based on their specialised areas of social services.

In line with Rothman and Tumblin (1994) and in increasing the scope of development, cognitive testing was also carried out, by involving key informants who were interviewed previously upon which the guidelines were based. Five key informants were approached, but only three agreed to take part in the study, with the other two citing heavy workloads at the time of data gathering. The researcher wanted to find out from them “whether the guidelines represented practice as reflected in their own experiences as they had tried to convey” in the initial in-depth interviews conducted (Rothman & Tumblin, 1994, p. 218). The significance of cognitive testing was to gauge the conceptual reality of the social work practitioners on the accuracy of the guideline document.

**9.2.3 Determining development instrument(s)**

This section of the study was not organised according to the method of data collection, but it was based on the issues arising from the study and determining the best possible way to collect the data. The instrument which was used during pilot testing was an electronic evaluation form. However, the evaluation form was
triangulated with telephonic interview data. According to Babbie (2007, p. 246), the evaluation form contained “questions and or other types of items designed to solicit information appropriate for analysis” and it was chosen as an evaluation tool because the researcher was interested in getting the opinions of social workers on the guidelines developed for social workers working with child victims of trafficking. In addition, the emailed evaluation form was chosen because most participants indicated that they would not be available to attend the half-day workshop that had been suggested by the researcher. The benefits of using an electronic evaluation form was that the cost associated with emailing was relatively low; the participants could complete the form in their free time, and participants were from a wider geographical area in South Africa (Strydom, 2011).

The evaluation form was designed by the researcher in a simplistic and on-threatening manner (See Appendix O). The principles of designing questions in a form that were followed included brief and clear sentences, questions contained one idea that was relevant to the purpose of the questionnaire, varied and clear response alternatives, and pitching questions at the right reading level (Strydom, 2011). The form had 16 questions, thus, it was long enough to include relevant questions in the areas that the researcher was interested in. The response system built into the form was a Likert-scale type of response whereby the participant was expected to mark their “Yes/No/Unsure” response with an X. After every question, space was provided for additional comments and suggestions, which allowed the participant to elaborate and provide more descriptive information.

However, the pitfall with emailed communication as a way of collecting data, is the possibility of missing data. That is, it was not guaranteed that all participants would elaborate on their “yes”, “no” or “unsure” answer. Indeed, not all participants gave further descriptive information especially in cases where they were satisfied with an aspect of the guideline. According to Gabor, Unrau and Grinnell (1998) when participants did not answer certain questions, it was explored with them in a sensitive manner and it was done telephonically. In terms of the format, the evaluation form was accompanied by a covering letter that introduced the purpose of the research, the researcher, the university the researcher was working from, who stood to benefit
from the research, and the ethical considerations (Appendix P). Consent forms were also sent (Appendix Q)

9.2.3.1 Pre-testing the pilot testing instrument
Pre-testing of the instrument used during the pilot test of the guidelines was done using one participant, with the same criteria described previously. Pre-testing was carried out to improve trustworthiness of the study. The information from the pre-test assisted the researcher to fine-tune the instrument. That is, one question was deleted from the instrument and two were refined to make them clearer. In addition, the researcher was able to estimate the length of time required to read the guidelines and complete the evaluation form.

9.2.4 Pilot Implementation
The evaluation form was initially emailed to ten study participants with the expectation that they would open the attachments, "read the instructions, answer the questions and then return it to the researcher" within the mutually agreed date (Strydom, 2011, p. 186). The forms were emailed to the study participants on 13 June 2013, and they were requested to send their responses back on or by 19 June 2013. It was important to send a reminder, which the researcher did because there was a national holiday on 16 June 2013. No feedback had come through by 19 June 2013 and further efforts that the researcher put into place included sending three email reminders and contacting the different participants telephonically for a minimum of two occasions and a maximum of eight.

On 4 July 2013, three weeks after the forms had been emailed, the researcher had received responses from five out of ten participants. There was clear case of data saturation in terms of the responses received for 13 out of the 16 questions asked. The researcher was able to ascertain data saturation through constant comparison with previous data received to additional data being received (Glaser & Strauss cited in Tuckett, 2004). For the other three questions (namely questions 1, 2 and 9 (See Appendix O)) there was a tie in responses, thus the researcher sought to get clarity on this matter by contacting the other five participants who had not sent their feedback and by recruiting two more participants in case none of the previous five
participants responded. The participants were contacted on the 4 and 5 July 2013 via email and telephonically. On 9 July 2013, an additional three responses were received, and upon comparison with the previous data, it gave clarity to the patterns that had previously been confusing.

The telephonic follow up, the inclusion of the research explanation letter, and addressing the evaluation form to the specific person are thought to influence higher response rates and all these were used in this study (Delport & Roestenburg, 2011). By using different instruments at different times, the researcher was able to capture rich data, from eight participants, which ended up being meaningful to the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Shenton, 2004).

9.3 APPLICATION OF DESIGN CRITERIA TO THE PRELIMINARY INTERVENTION CONCEPT AND RESULTS OF THE PILOT IMPLEMENTATION

According to Rothman and Thomas (1994, p. 37), “the design process is informed by common guidelines and values for intervention research”. Agreements about acceptable standards for interventions have been identified in medicine (Apfelbaum et al., 2013; Banks, Freeman & Practice Parameters Committee of the American College of Gastroenterology, 2010; Department of Health, 2006;), education (Ministry of Education, 2011; Rashid & Tikly, 2010), nursing (Berlowitz et al., 2001; Colon-Emeric et al., 2007; Marchionni & Richie, 2008) and psychology (American Psychiatric Association, 1995; Parker, 1995). The development of practice guidelines for counter-trafficking interventions within social work is still in its early stages, especially in South Africa. This compares poorly in relation to other fields such as health and education (Stoesz & Karger, 2012).

According to Stumbo and Peterson (2003), pilot testing design and guideline design can be done at the same time. The researcher found it easier to conceptualise the design criteria to be applied during pilot testing when designing the guidelines. Initially, the questions to be asked were not clear, although ideas on what to ask were still jotted down for later reference. However, the questions to ask became clearer as the guideline document took shape. The questions for pilot testing were
determined by the purpose of the pilot test and the data collection instrument to be used. The form that was developed had closed ended questions, but with space allocated for provision of descriptive information by participants. Emailed responses were received from a total of eight participants. There was no need to recruit other participants and email more evaluation forms or to follow up with the four participants who had not responded, as data saturation had been reached.

Intervention research in social work knowledge development is practice-based and practice-oriented and the knowledge needs to be accessible to social workers in ways that could inform practice (Shaw & Hunt, 2012). Researchers (Howard & Jenson, 2003; Leape, 1990) have referred to the desirable attributes of guidelines, which include that they have a developmental basis, that they are comprehensive, specific, inclusive, manageable, valid, reliable, applicable, clear, clinically flexible, and cost-effective.

The guidelines which were developed by the researcher were evaluated “in terms of whether, as constructed, it: will be useful, as is, as a practice tool; was useful but needed to be refined or reformulated; or was not useful and should be discarded” (Rothman & Tumblin, 1994, p. 229). Thus, the relevant themes addressed during pilot testing as related to the implementation process and the outcomes focused on issues of accessibility, simplicity, significance, generalisation, and cultural-sensitivity. Specifically, the criteria for assessing the guideline were adapted from Thomas’s (1984) developmental model and they are: objective capacity, adequacy of the intervention procedure, ethical suitability and usability. These criteria are discussed next and quotations are used to give prominence to the findings.

9.3.1 Objective capability

Objective capacity is “the ability of the intervention to accomplish what it was intended to achieve” (Thomas, 1984, p. 98). The two elements included in objective capacity when doing assessments are efficacy and efficiency. Efficacy is the capacity to produce an effect. In this study, it refers to how operational the proposed guideline will be in achieving the desired goal. That is, can a change in the social worker’s techniques produce the desired outcome? A strategy might be popular or
elegant, but unless it contributes to the desired goal, it might not be suitable. However, it could be refined or modified or discarded completely in favour of another one that promises better results. The question asked in the evaluation form was “Will the guidelines lead to desired outcomes for trafficked children?” A majority of the participants were in agreement that the guidelines would indeed be beneficial to child victims of trafficking. This is supported by two extracts from the participants as indicated below:

“I think that these guidelines are really going to sensitise child protection workers to the need to provide properly coordinated services to these children” (Participant 3)

“It has all the aspects that ensure that the service providers put the best interest of the child first” (Participant 7)

On the other hand, efficiency refers to when interventions are executed and the subsequent desired goals realised with less effort and in less time. The critical question asked in the pilot test was “Can the guidelines be implemented without excessive investment on the social worker’s time?” The element of objective capacity within guideline development is significant because it assesses whether the guidelines genuinely promote best practices and accountability, or if they constrain clinical social work decision-making (Marsh, 2003).

Although a majority of the participants agreed that the guidelines were implementable, the additional comments provided noted that building a trusting relationship with the trafficked child needs investment in time, and that for the response to be adequate a substantial amount of time and resources need to be spent on implementation. This is illustrated by the following extract:

“Unless the social worker makes an effort in building a trust relationship with the victim, the service delivery will not be successful” (Participant 1)
9.3.2 Adequacy of intervention procedure

Adequacy of the intervention procedure refers to whether or not the intervention processes are applicable and useful enough to guide the necessary action (Thomas, 1984). To be able to determine this, the guideline was tested for validity of the basis, completeness, specificity and behaviour-guiding.

**Validity of the basis** looked at sources of information consulted in the creation of the guidelines. The question asked was: “Were the sources of information consulted for the study valid and credible?” Invalid sources dent credibility of any intervention whereas where valid sources have been utilised, the interventions are highly thought of and considered to be justifiable, credible, and effective. Indeed, the likelihood of social work practitioners’ using the guidelines will be influenced by their levels of trust in the knowledge and the extent to which the knowledge is credible and relevant (Marsh, 2003). In response, all the participants consulted were in agreement that the sources consulted were valid. Only one participant further added:

“Very broad consultations contributed to a very useful guideline. You are also commended for exploring the views of trafficked children” (Participant 4)

**Completeness** in intervention procedure means that the techniques are described fully (Thomas, 1984). The areas that the pilot test participants commented on are if they can readily identify who the guidelines are for, who this identified group will be working with, the areas of social work intervention, and the techniques outlined. The question that was asked was: “Are the techniques in the guidelines described in a manner that will enable social workers to intervene appropriately with trafficked children?” In response, all participants except one indicated that the techniques were adequate. In terms of use and technical feasibility, it was interesting to see that the participants could identify the link to social work methods and techniques and one said:

“Some techniques are similar to those used in other sectors or fields of social work” (Participant 8)
The one participant who responded with “unsure” qualified her response by indicating that:

“The concept and importance of dealing with victims from a trauma-centred approach is maybe under-played. Needs to be emphasised throughout guidelines” (Participant 1)

If the participants identified that a certain area was omitted, the guideline would be considered incomplete and the area highlighted more clearly. The comment on working from a trauma-centred approach has been specifically highlighted in section 6.4 of the guideline under “Guidelines for initial trauma assistance” and alluded to in other guidelines’ sections, such as the guidelines for social work assessment speak to social workers facilitating trauma-informed assessments. In the other sections, the trauma-centred approach has been integrated with the child rights approach so that the trafficked child has fewer experiences of being pathologised, medicalised, and/or individualised during social work interventions (Nelson et al., 2013). Furthermore, the type of approach put forward by the researcher in the guidelines could offer a potentially culturally diverse and rich understanding of healing that is not dominated by the trauma-centred approach. An intervention that is overshadowed by the trauma-centred approach might be detrimental to trafficked children coming from other African countries who hold different worldviews. Juma (2011) and Swartz (1998) advocate for the use of African psychology where psychosocial problems are understood from an African traditional perspective that is ritualistic and uses figurative language, and not a Western perspective that mainly incorporates talk therapy. This response is in support of the Guidelines for NGO’s Working with Trafficked People that called for culturally appropriate services to be provided to victims.

In intervention evaluation, specificity refers to relevant details being provided explicitly within the intervention procedure (Thomas, 1984). After pre-testing the instrument, the aspect on specificity was combined with correctness and behaviour guiding and they were addressed in the question: “With your background in social work, are the details provided within the guidelines explicit enough for social workers in practice?” In this question, the researcher was trying to establish if the procedures
and techniques outlined in the guideline are directing the activities of the user in the right direction. Simply put, are the instructions clear to social workers on what to do when engaging with child victims of trafficking? The consequences of the procedures not being clear is that the impact of the intervention may be challenging to account for. On the other hand, the procedures might be clear but still not produce the intended results because the instructions are complicated, disorganised or poorly communicated. According to Thomas (1984, p. 101), shortcomings of correctness and in behaviour-guiding may be resolved by “altering the procedure so that it is made consistent with what is known about the intervention domain…or through increasing practitioner’s skills in working with it”. All the participants were in agreement that the details provided in the guidelines were explicit enough and two participants reported that:

“The guidelines are written in a non-technical and unambiguous, yet professional language” (Participant 7)

Although I am familiar with some policies, I specifically learnt more regarding the “possible signs of child trafficking” (Participant 8)

However, additional comments by one participant recommended that:

“But some parts can even be more elaborated on. Need to also add parts on use of interpreters and court preparation” (Participant 1)

In response to this, the researcher would like to highlight that the issue of language and interpreters has been dealt with under the following sections in the guidelines 6.2 (vi), 6.3 (vi), 6.4 (viii) and 6.5 (v). The suggestion on court preparation was looked into and taken into consideration and is discussed under “Developmental Testing”.

9.3.3 Ethical suitability

Ethical suitability refers to the development of interventions that protect the rights of clients (Ngo, 2009; Thomas, 1984). This element refers to the protection of trafficked children. The important question asked was: “Does the guideline protect the rights of
trafficked children in South Africa?” This question might have proven tricky if the participants were not well versed with the South African child protection instruments and regulations. In response to the question asked, there was consensus in terms of all participants agreeing that the guidelines would offer protection to trafficked children. One participant said:

“The protection of children’s fundamental rights like the right to education and a place to stay is emphasised” (Participant 7)

One participant responded by agreeing that the guidelines protect trafficked children in South Africa. However, the participant further added the comment below:

“Not the guideline on its own, but, yes, if it is properly implemented by trained and sensitive people” (Participant 3)

9.3.4 Usability

According to Thomas (1984, p. 102), usability refers to “the extent to which the characteristics of the intervention itself make it likely to be used by the interventionist for who it is intended”. The elements briefly discussed in relation to usability are relevance, codification, simplicity, flexibility, modularisation, costs, consumer satisfaction, sustainability, socio-cultural compatibility, and technological compatibility.

Relevance refers to appropriateness of the guidelines to the child trafficking circumstances relating to identification and assistance provision. The question asked was “Would the guideline contribute towards rapid identification of and initial assistance provision to child victims of trafficking in South Africa?” The relevance of the guidelines needs to be well-suited and compatible with the problems identified or else it would be redesigned to increase its applicability. The general feedback was that the guideline would make a contribution, especially if implemented properly, however one participant was unsure and her additional comments to support her response was:
“My fear is just that too much emphasis is on getting the child safe and identify whether it is trafficking, which is necessary, but the trauma FIRST needs to be addressed. My experience with social workers here is that HUGE LACK of victim-centred approach” (Participant 1)

As mentioned in the literature review, recovery from trauma involves crucial socio-cultural processes that assist in restoring control, connection, meaning, purpose, dignity, and value (Herman, 2001). To mitigate the disempowering effects of the trauma framework, the guidelines adopted the strengths and resilience approach as previous studies by Nelson et al. (2013) have noted the importance of a strengths-based approach. Similar to the human/child rights framework, dialogue is fundamental in social work practice with trafficked children, but this can only happen when the child knows, thinks and feels that they are physically safe. A positive relationship has been noted between psycho-emotional outcomes and the initial provision of basic needs. As mentioned in the literature review in relation to Maslow’s (1954) theory on the hierarchy of needs, it is challenging to address higher needs if the lower/basic needs have not been given attention. Therefore, it is ideal if the basic needs of accommodation, safety, and food are addressed prior to intervening on a psycho-emotional level.

**Codification** refers to the representation of an innovation. According to Miller (1973, in Thomas, 1984, p. 103) “a technique is intelligible to the extent that we understand how and why it works”. The format of presentation such as written, audio, visual, audio-visual and digital is guided by the objectives set. The guidelines that were piloted were principally in a written format, although there are sections where pictures, i.e. children’s collages, were used. Codification and simplicity can go hand in hand as the guideline was produced in two formats in order to make it easier for the social workers to work with the techniques recommended. Thus, **simplicity** refers to the ease with which an intervention can be used. The question posed to the participants was: “Is the guideline complex in any area(s)?” The simplicity of the intervention generally determines how often it will be used by the target group, or how soon it will be implemented in an agency. Based on the responses from the participants, the guideline was reported not to be complex in any area, i.e. content related but one participant said:
“The small print makes it difficult to read, but the content is ok” (Participant 4)

Participant 4 received a hard-copy of the guideline, and thus was not able to adjust the font size, unlike other participants who received the guideline electronically. This design work suggestion was not looked into.

One participant reported that she was not certain about the guideline being complex but was rather unsure. The participants’ contradictory descriptive comment reported:

“Not complex. Just annoying to have to check the list of acronyms” (Participant 5)

In response to the above comment, simplification of the intervention by writing the acronym in full, might make it user-friendly to the target group, but it is bound to make the document longer and it might seem repetitive. This suggestion was not taken up and incorporated in the design work. The same participant also raised the issue of the guidelines having steps and a process having to be followed. In response to this suggestion, the researcher would like to emphasise previous reviewed literature by Rosen and Proctor's (2003, p. 1) on the purpose of a practice guideline being “meant to assist practitioners in decision-making…they are a set of systematically compiled and organised statements…which help practitioners select and implement interventions that are most effective and appropriate for attaining the desired outcomes”. These aspects give the guideline a sense of flexibility and adaptability. Therefore, re-designing the guideline to have specific steps to be followed was not adopted because it would restrict further design work by practitioners in the field.

Flexibility looks at aspects of creativity and refers to adjustments that can be made to an intervention without shifting or interfering with the core issues. The question asked was “Can a social worker easily modify the guidelines to suit their jurisdiction without the guideline losing its fundamental character?” Any amount of flexibility is looked at positively since it allows for the possibility of participation of the users in design work, as mentioned in Chapter 8. This in turn increases the sense of
ownership and commitment in implementing the recommended techniques. Critical implementation of the guidelines relies and “encourages adaptations and improvisations on the intervention, drawing upon the practitioner’s experience and practice wisdom” (Proctor & Rosen, 2003, p. 284). The majority of participants agreed that it would be easy to modify the guidelines. However, two participants commented that modification of the guidelines would be influenced by the experience that the social worker has in the field.

“It would depend on their level of experience in this field -at a more experienced level, yes, but an inexperienced social worker might find it a challenge to insist on flexibility and adjustments in an inter-sectoral context” (Participant 3)

“A social worker with experience should be able to” (Participant 8)

**Modularisation** refers to small contained interventions that can be implemented easily in conjunction with other intervention components. The benefit of modularisation is that it is bound to be accepted, approved much faster, and enjoy widespread use. Some already existing social work intervention components that were used in the guidelines to enhance modularisation included working with the recognised South African child protection and human trafficking legal frameworks, application of the social work ethical principles as outlined by the SACSSP, and building on knowledge and skills taught in the South African undergraduate social work curriculum. The question that was posed to the participants was: “Can the guidelines be used with core social work intervention processes namely micro, meso and/ or macro practice?” All the participants were in agreement that guidelines could be used with the different social work methods. One participant added that:

“If follows typical [social work] intervention process” (Participant 5)

**Costs** in intervention research refer to the budget or financial requirements needed to implement an intervention. Cheaper interventions could mean that it is accessible to all users irrespective of their setting. According to Veeder & Peebles-Wilkins (cited in Peebles-Wilkins & Amodeo, 2003), connections to quality of care include cost
containment and access which are considered to be good outcomes in defining mental health interventions. Similar to modularisation, the cheaper the intervention, the more acceptable and the more widely it will be used. However, that said, Thomas (1984) reiterates that costs can be justified based on the extent of benefits received. The issue of sustainability of the intervention was addressed in conjunction with cost. Sustainability basically looks at implementation and use of the guidelines with the existing limited resources and without the intervention requiring additional funds. The question asked relating to costs was: “Can the guidelines be used with limited or no expenses at all?” In response to this question, all but one participant responded affirmatively. The two participants who mentioned that the costing would have to be included reported:

“You can’t do [a] job properly without the necessary resources” (Participant 3)

Resources are part of any implementation plan, especially with child trafficking because it usually involved travelling” (Participant 7)

The above contributions have been acknowledged in terms of budgeting for children’s programmes, especially in Africa, and thus making children’s rights a reality. This finding supports previous research on budgeting for children’s protection by ACPF (2010). Budgeting for resources that children require for their protection, support, and care calls for children to be prioritised in the public planning expenditure system. Prior studies by Marchionni & Richie (2008) have reported that the organisational and political context impacts on sustainability of guidelines. An implication for this is the possibility that if interventions are fighting for resources within an organisation context, the one needing fewer resources is most likely to be implemented. That is, strategies that utilise the social workers’ networks and those that take advantage of their available resources are usually preferred.

Consumer satisfaction refers to the extent to which the users of an intervention are eager to use it. According to Peebles-Wilkins and Amodeo (2003, p. 210), practice guidelines which are applicable to all and satisfy the users tend to enhance the quality of care and have been reported to reduce differences further within service provision. The question designed to establish participant satisfaction was: “Are you
generally satisfied with the guideline?" It is important to gauge user satisfaction because it may have drastic consequences, such as delayed acceptability or non-implementation. Minimal satisfaction as a start would be acceptable, and areas needing redesigning to increase satisfaction rates can be looked into. Strategies that require a person to remain in, or return to, his/her work comfort zones tend to be preferable to those that result in removing that person from their social work and practice utilisation (Loewenberg, 1983). All participants were generally pleased with the guideline, as shown in the two participants’ extract below:

“Well written and language [is] friendly to social workers…I’m delighted to note that the issue of protection, security, safety of the child victim and trusted responsible service providers flows like a golden thread throughout the document” (Participant 2)

“They are user-friendly and suitable for the diverse child protection sector” (Participant 7)

**Socio-cultural compatibility** refers to how well-matched an intervention is in relation to the prevailing values, principles, culture and traditions, and needs of the users (Ngo, 2009; Thomas, 1984). The values and principles underpinning social work are strongly embedded and they might have to be called upon to learn how to work with other professions, since child trafficking is multi-dimensional. Sometimes the readiness of social workers is vital, but at other times that of the client could be potentially more important. In as much as values, principles, motivation and readiness are not necessarily fixed elements, changes in these elements may require more time. This criterion on compatibility was therefore looked at in relation to the trafficked children. The question asked was: “Would the guidelines be able to accommodate the diverse range of trafficked children?”

According to Zayas (2003, p. 196), “culturally competent practice is built on the awareness of and sensitivity to client differences”. Culturally competent guidelines tend to improve the quality of services for targeted populations (Peebles-Wilkins & Amodeo, 2003; Chung, 2009), and they were created because this study looks at foreign trafficked children in South Africa. The guidelines were created in a generalist
manner that would enable social workers to adapt them when working with diverse
groups of trafficked children to meet their specific characteristics and needs (Zayas,
2003). All the participants were in agreement that the guideline was inclusive in its
orientation. However, one participant, as shown in the following extract, commented
that adaptations in practice might need to be made, for example, in relation to
trafficked children with disabilities.

“One would obviously need some adaptations to response - e.g. for children
with disability” (Participant 3)

**Technological compatibility** is “the extent to which the innovation is compatible with
the other aspects of social technology to which it is related” (Thomas, 1984, p. 107).
The researcher designed the guidelines in such a manner that they are aligned to
social work service provision and policies. The question to determine technological
compatibility is: “Can the guidelines be aligned to South Africa’s child protection
legislations?” This aspect is significant because if the guideline has technological
compatibility it enhances the uniform application of services (Peebles-Wilkins &
Amodeo, 2003). All participants were in agreement that the guideline was
technologically compatible and one participant reported:

“This guideline, as with other policies, highlights the importance of
understanding the client’s situation and thus how to respond to those specific
needs” (Participant 8)

In addition, the definitions provided in the glossary of terms were found by all the
participants to be satisfactory, although minimal design work was recommended by
one participant, as indicated in the extracts below:

“Yes, but…definition of child: a person under 18 years. Remove: unless
otherwise specified! This is a very important definition, and it should be in line
with the definition of the Children’s Act” (Participant 4)
9.4 Synthesis of pilot implementation results

Guidelines are intended to offer social work practitioner’s concise instructions on how to render services to clients in such a manner that it improves the quality and process of care and protection (Graham & Harrison, 2005). The pilot implementation set out to determine the quality of the guidelines developed by the researcher based on social workers’ satisfaction. It can be postulated that the prior discussion on pilot implementation results indicate that the psychosocial intervention guidelines has the potential to improve social workers’ intervention with child victims of trafficking.

The results show that the guidelines reached the intended users during pilot implementation, and that the implementation process occurred according to the design criteria established that looked at objective capability, adequacy of intervention procedure, ethical suitability and usability. The preliminary intervention procedures were also selected and specified to achieve the intended outcome. The data can be interpreted with caution because all interventions do not have equivalent outcomes, based on interpretative qualitative synthesis and explanations (Gough & Elbourne, 2002; Reid, 1997).

Analysis of the results indicated positive outcomes and that the social workers were generally satisfied with the guidelines presented. The conclusion that can be drawn is that the guidelines can offer concrete techniques that social workers can use to improve the potential well-being of trafficked children. This conclusion has important two-fold implications for social work, i.e. the guidelines can be accelerated and incorporated into practice based on its potential impact to ensure well-being for trafficked children, and improved service provision for social workers (Fielding & Teutsch, 2012).

Based on the results of the pilot implementation, certain recommendations were emphasised by the intended users of the guideline and were supported by evidence highlighting different strong points (Graham & Harrison, 2005). These included:

i) aligning the definition of the term ‘child’ to the Children’s Act;
ii) adding an extra objective to the guidelines on the role of social workers;
iii) re-alignment of specific guideline statements; and
iv) re-formatting the document.

The results of the pilot implementation support the idea that the guidelines can be implemented relatively successfully with social workers. It is further envisaged that the additional design and development work, based on the social workers’ feedback, as discussed under “Developmental Testing”, will increase the validity of the guidelines.

9.5 DEVELOPMENTAL TESTING

Developmental testing is carried out after trial implementation and according to Thomas (1984, p. 182), “it is the process by which an innovation is systematically tested, revised, and redesigned as necessary”. A major purpose of developmental testing in this study was to determine whether the innovation is adequate and, if not, to redesign the innovation appropriately. As per the recommendations put forward by the participants, the draft guideline was further re-designed by synthesising pertinent additional information and feedback provided by the social work practitioners in child protection and child/human trafficking field.

Previous data that was collected was not revisited for further re-interpretation, but literature was reviewed, which can also be seen as an opportunity to make out new layers of meaning within the data (Andrews, 2009). These re-interpretations were perceived as complementing previous interpretations. Subsequently, this was an attempt to ensure that the guidelines are developmentally valid, reasonably coherent, and reflective of the essential social work practice in South Africa. According to Thomas (1984), for an innovation to be considered developmentally valid, it means trial implementation has occurred, it has been tested developmentally and there is an increase in the practice needs being met.

9.5.1 Addressing design problems and revision of intervention

Potocky (2010) and Brunovskis and Surtees (2012b) studied the effectiveness of trafficking interventions and concluded that interventions that are not well developed and implemented may be ineffective and have unintended negative effects. Thus, the
researcher embarked on addressing problems that arose when designing the guidelines and subsequently revised the intervention. According to Stumbo and Peterson (1993, p. 374), “data stemming from a well-designed evaluation is fairly straightforward about the improvements or changes needed”. The following is an outline of the revisions made on the guidelines, based on feedback from eight participants who evaluated the document.

9.5.1.1 Glossary of terms
The definition of the term ‘child’ was adjusted to align it to the South African Children’s Act and the South African Constitution. It now reads “Child means a person under the age of 18”.

9.5.1.2 Objectives of the guidelines
An additional objective (iv) was included and it reads “To help social workers see their role in relation to the network of service providers who deal with child trafficking”.

9.5.1.3 Situational analysis
Six additional signs of child trafficking were included under possible signs of trafficking. They are:

- The child has entered the country illegally;
- The child is registered at a number of different addresses;
- The child is unable to confirm the name and address of the person who is meeting them on arrival;
- The child has had the trip or visa arranged by someone other than their family;
- The child exhibits self-assurance, maturity and self-confidence not expected of a child their age; and
- The child works in various locations.

9.5.1.4 Guidelines for identification
There was a typing error on the flow chat. This was subsequently been adjusted.
9.5.1.5 Guidelines for statutory intervention
Section 6.3 (i) was aligned to the South African Children’s Act and re-worded to read “Mandatory reporting of suspicion of child trafficking based on reasonable grounds is expected from social service professions, social workers as well as from” homeopaths, dentists, immigration officials, labour inspectors, minister of religion, nurse, occupational therapist, teachers, mid-wives, speech therapists, psychologists, traditional health practitioners, traditional leaders and legal practitioners”. This would be vital during reporting of child trafficking cases.

In addition, section 6.3 (xv) was added to deal with possible court preparation during the opening of the Children Court Inquiry (CCI) and should litigation be initiated against the traffickers. It reads “Legal processes are tough for child victims of trafficking and they should be provided with the necessary preparation, support and care during court proceedings”. According to Back, Gustafsson, Larsson and Bertero (2011), it is essential that children are psychologically supported and assisted to take part in the legal processes as equal partners, rather than as passive objects during the process.

9.5.1.6 Guidelines for initial trauma assistance
Section 6.4 (ii) was re-worded to read “Containment and debriefing that is provided should be child-friendly, culturally and language appropriate, age and gender sensitive”.

9.5.1.7 Guidelines towards a social work healing relationship
An additional phrase was added in section 6.5 (ii) and it now reads “A trafficked child’s lack of trust can be understood as a functional coping or survival mechanism for dealing with multiple changes, traumatic losses, uncomfortable questions, high emotional distress levels, betrayal of trust and other challenges that they come across”.

9.5.1.8 Important contacts
In the section on law enforcement services, “TIP provincial task team” was added and in the section on international organisations, “ISS” was added.
9.5.1.9 Format
The font used for the printed document was not adjusted. However, when the user opens the document i.e. if it is an electronic version of the document, the user can adjust the font size. In addition, the footnote referencing has been removed to make the document easier to read.

9.5.2 Revision of guidelines based on the Trafficking Act (2013)
Developmental testing was also influenced by the Trafficking Bill being signed into legislation on 28 July 2013. Thus, in addition to the feedback from social workers as intended users, the researcher also made the following additional changes to the guidelines:

9.5.2.1 Glossary of terms
In the glossary of terms, the definition of 'abuse of vulnerability' was added and the definition of 'trafficking in persons' was amended, as follows:

**Abuse of vulnerability**, means any abuse that leads a person to believe that he or she has no reasonable alternative but to submit to exploitation, and includes, but is not limited to, taking advantage of the vulnerabilities of that person resulting from-

(a) the person having entered or remained in the Republic illegally or without proper documentation;
(b) pregnancy;
(c) any disability of the person;
(d) addiction to the use of any dependence-producing substance;
(e) being a child;
(f) social circumstances; or
(g) economic circumstances.

**Trafficking in persons**: Any person who delivers, recruits, transports, transfers, harbours, sells, exchanges, leases or receives another person within or across the borders of the Republic, by means of-

(a) a threat of harm;
(b) the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion;
(c) the abuse of vulnerability:
(d) fraud;
(e) deception;
(f) abduction;
(g) kidnapping;
(h) the abuse of power;
(i) the direct or indirect giving or receiving of payments or benefits to obtain the consent of a person having control or authority over another person; or
(j) the direct or indirect giving or receiving of payment, compensation, rewards, benefits, or any other advantage, aimed at either the person or an immediate family member of that person or any other person in close relationship to that person, for the purpose of any form or manner of exploitation, is guilty of the offence of trafficking in persons.

Any person who-
(a) adopts a child, facilitated or secured through legal or illegal means; or
(b) concludes a forced marriage with another person within or across the borders of the Republic, for the purpose of the exploitation of that child or other person in any form or manner, is guilty of an offence.

### 9.5.2.2 Legal framework

In the last paragraph of the legal framework, the wording was adjusted to reflect changes in the South African legislative framework. It now reads, “This guideline is set to complement the South African Exploitation Strategy and The South African Guidelines on the Prevention and Responses to Child Exploitation policy documents (DSD, Forthcoming) and the Information Guide on the Management of Statutory Services in Terms of the Children’s Act 38 of 2005 (2013). In addition, the guideline must be read in conjunction with the Children’s Act, regulations, norms and standards for child protection and the recently released Prevention and Combating Trafficking in Persons Act (2013)”.

Guidelines should not be applied from a ‘cookbook approach’. That is, “guidelines are not commands, and providers will always have to call on their experience and judgement when making decisions regarding individual clients” (Bhattacharyya et al. 2009, p. 500). Guidelines’ sensitivity to complexity must allow considerable time and
flexibility in their implementation, which helps in enhancing client-problem fit whilst addressing the importance of the ecological context.

9.6 METHODS TO ENSURE TRUSTWORTHINESS

This section of the chapter briefly outlines and discusses strategies that were used to evaluate the trustworthiness of the pilot implementation phase. A description of the strategies was provided in Chapter 5 (section 5.8).

The application of dual piloting procedures, i.e. triangulation in piloting testing has been referred by Rothman and Tumblin (1994) as a promising concept worth considering during developmental work. Data triangulation was carried out with social workers who had been interviewed initially to collect primary data (to enhance credibility), and with social workers who were invited only to evaluate the guideline. It was interesting to note that the results from both sets of participants purposefully overlapped and/ or reinforced each other.

However, as mentioned previously, the researcher communicated the intervention guidelines to the social workers as users and they were requested to give feedback on it (Cooper et al., 2002; Fraser & Galinsky, 2010; Stecher & Davis, 1987). This ensured credibility (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). That is, findings were presented and confirmed by others to ascertain if the interpretations made are valid, i.e. tested using experts who are familiar with child counter-trafficking initiatives and child protection interventions. Credibility was further achieved by the researcher spending eight weeks in the field whilst pilot testing the guidelines with the social workers.

Reflexivity is a method used within research to enhance confirmability and credibility. In this instance, within reflexive analysis, it is crucial that the role of the researcher is acknowledged and accounted for in the research (Fuller & Petch, 1995). The researcher felt frustrated when the participants set a return date for the feedback but then repeatedly failed to honour these deadlines. The themes that permeated yet again were the high workloads and the crisis mode that the social work participants work under in South Africa. The frustrations were evident in the researcher’s field journal and this might have influenced the researcher’s tone of voice during
telephonic contacts or in the tone of the emails sent. In addition, the positive feedback given by the participants affirmed the need for this research in South Africa and the researcher had several “feel good” moments.

Trustworthiness was also achieved through collaboration, i.e. the lens of the study participants and through peer evaluation (Shenton, 2004). Insights into the researchers’ study were discussed with colleagues, and challenges were presented as a form of debriefing. Peer examination gave the researcher opportunities to present elements of evaluation results for feedback with research colleagues, and to discuss the developing nature of the study. The feedback received from the participants and peers was incorporated during the design work that was done after the guideline pilot implementation. An audit trail (Appendix R) has been attached for external scrutiny and to enhance the study’s dependability. In order to enhance transferability within the study, thick and rich descriptions of the pilot implementation setting and processes and the details of the participants have been explained in detail.

**Table 9.1 Application of trustworthiness during pilot implementation (adapted from Krefting (1991) and Shenton (2004))**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Criteria/ provision made by researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Truth value</td>
<td>Credibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Prolonged time spent pilot testing i.e. eight weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reflexivity/field journal kept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-testing the evaluation form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Triangulation with social workers in practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Member checking and collaboration with social workers as intended users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Applicability</td>
<td>Transferability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dense/thick description of phenomenon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Consistency</td>
<td>Dependability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Thick descriptions of research methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Triangulation in design phase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Neutrality</td>
<td>Confirmability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In-depth methodological descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recognition of shortcoming during design phase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reflexivity/ field journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Audit trail presented i.e. completed evaluation form</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9.7 CONCLUSION

This chapter looked at the development and pilot testing phase of the D&D model and the activities that had to be implemented, namely: developing a preliminary prototype, application of design criteria to preliminary intervention, conducting and reporting on pilot/trial implementation, and development testing.

Developmental practice was applied so as to increase desired outcomes. Aspects of developmental practice included outlining start-up activities, plans to monitor trial use of innovation, and other ways of systematically carrying out trial use. Start-up activities are important for a proper and successful trial to occur. Early contact was made with the potential participants with the purpose of this being three-fold; namely to create a climate of collaboration, for the researcher and the participants to become acquainted, and to provide an opportunity for participants to ask questions related to their participation. The email and telephonic interaction provided opportunities for the researcher to monitor data collection activities unobtrusively. Monitoring of the innovation was done continuously and the researcher ensured that the information coming in was recorded promptly and stored in a confidential, systematic, and easy manner to enable retrieval and use.

What is evident is that guidelines’ formulation process is lengthy as the guidelines needed to be aligned with other social issues or policy initiatives during drafting or implementation. In addition, emphasis during this phase was on the intervention users and user-orientation approach used in pilot testing, with the researcher’s role being that of a collaborator. The users of the intervention guidelines were asked to engage in design work, and their participation was viewed as a collective process where stakeholders can further make contributions. The revised guidelines are presented next.
PRESENTATION OF THE GUIDELINES
CHAPTER 10
SUMMARY, LIMITATIONS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1 INTRODUCTION

Childhood is and continues to be a vulnerable stage of development, yet there is still something magical about it. Children’s vulnerability stems from the fact that they are immature, dependent, physically weaker, they have a limited sense of reality and they are unable to cope with tough emotions. When children are trafficked, they are subjected to the same harmful treatment as adults. Therefore, children’s ages and their developmental stage make them more vulnerable to the harmful consequences of the abusive exploitative practices.

Children victimised by trafficking have had their psychological, spiritual, cultural and social development stolen, which they would have otherwise enjoyed had it not been for the exploitation. Many victims have been known not to self-identify as victims or identify family, relatives and friends as traffickers, which makes identification and service provision challenging. Victims may also not appear to need social services because they have a place to live, food to eat, medical care, and what they think is a paying job. The children’s levels of vulnerability become blinded by their sense of agency and vice versa. The challenge in identification of and assistance provision to child victims of trafficking jeopardises the victim’s recovery and it infringes on their rights as they continue to live lives of perpetual crisis, fear, misery, and uncertainty.

Safeguarding the psycho-socio-emotional well-being of trafficked children continues to pose immense challenges to social workers and policy makers. This study hopes to make a valuable contribution to social workers’ understanding of children’s post-trafficking experiences with regard to rapid identification and initial assistance provision. This will be in line with social work’s professional mandate of developing and applying practice guidelines, which could in turn contribute to the growth and improvement of the profession’s knowledge base and stature based on scientifically derived and tested information. That is, practice-based research that contributes to
the development of problem-solving knowledge and interventions when social workers engage with child victims of transnational trafficking.

The purpose of this chapter is to present the main findings of the study, the limitations of the study, the conclusions based on the key findings, and the recommendations. However, the researcher will first summarise the aim and objectives of the study.

10.2 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY
The main goal of the study was the development of a psychosocial intervention guideline for social workers working with transnational trafficked children. In order to achieve the goal, the following study objectives were formulated:

i) to analyse the nature and extent of child trafficking as a problem in South Africa;
ii) to gather information on how transnational trafficked children experience identification and assistance provision procedures;
iii) to design guidelines for social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking;
iv) to evaluate the feasibility of the guidelines with social workers in the field; and
v) to provide recommendations to social workers working with transnational child victims of trafficking.

10.3 SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS
The key findings in the study are summarised according to the following D&D phases that correlate with the research objectives set:

a) problem identification, analysis, and research planning phase;
b) information-gathering, analysis and synthesis phase;
c) design phase; and
d) development and pilot testing phase.
10.3.1 Problem identification, analysis, and research planning phase

Problem identification, analysis, and research planning was explored in Chapter 4, with the legislative background and context of the study being provided in Chapter 2 of the thesis. Child victims of trafficking are invisible because the exploitation they encounter when they are in the trafficking situation is not always visible. The trafficked children’s invisibility is because traffickers use legitimate fronts to cover up their illegal actions, trafficking cases are not being correctly identified and referred, and there is lack of acknowledgement of victims of trafficking by service providers. Social workers have limited knowledge and awareness about child trafficking, which increases the likelihood of victims falling through the cracks and the victims are then not in a position to access either rights or protection. This finding has also been reported on by Bokhari (2008) and Rigby (2011) when they investigated trafficking of children in the UK.

After escaping from a trafficking situation, the severity and range of symptoms exhibited by the child victim usually indicates the importance of intervening rapidly and appropriately. Without proper identification, referral cannot happen and without referral, timeous assistance cannot be given to the victim. Therefore, the mentioned intervention stages are connected and they form crucial inter-links in the protection of child victims of trafficking. These crucial victim protection intervention links have been identified by Trimikliniotis and Demetriou (2008) and UNICEF (2006), but they have not been explored as such because specific studies research specific intervention strategies, e.g. referral, impact of trafficking, and assistance provision.

What was identified during project identification was the discrepancy associated with child trafficking mainly being viewed as a criminal justice and migration issue and less of a social issue. This means that identification and service provision is then often facilitated from a legal perspective and there is a dearth of psychosocial interventions. It was also quite evident that irrespective of South Africa being a signatory to the UN Trafficking Protocol (2000), the country does not have guidelines to ensure appropriate identification and referral of child victims of trafficking for assistance. During the initial analysis on the state of existing interventions, the
researcher established that were no existing psychosocial intervention guidelines for trafficked children in South Africa. However, the researcher is aware of the recently signed Trafficking Act and the Child Exploitation Strategy (Forthcoming), which was developed by DSD in consultation with several key stakeholders, including the researcher.

When the analysis phase was implemented, it was evident that a problematic human condition exists. The findings from this phase indicate that identification of and service provision to victims is a complex psychosocial process that necessitates social work professional guidance and support for the victims to recover and heal. This is in line with findings from studies by Fong and Cardoso (2010) in the US and Pearce et al. (2009), Pearce (2011), Rigby (2011) and Rigby and White (2013) in the UK. Based on the problem analysis, state of-the-art review, and the results of the feasibility study, it was evident that an intervention guideline for social workers working with child trafficking victims is needed. Therefore, the researcher continued with data collection and the design phase.

10.3.2 Information-gathering, analysis and synthesis phase

The information gathering and synthesis phase has been discussed in-depth in Chapters 5, 6, and 7 of this thesis. Findings in this phase indicate that the identification of trafficked victims is not an event but a process that is highly dependent on the child’s port of entry and context-specific trafficking trends and patterns. The key people identified as being instrumental in the identification of trafficked children include the victims themselves, community members, police officers, and social workers.

The barriers that hinder rapid identification of child victims were identified and they included the nature of trafficking, perceived benefits associated with trafficking, lack of knowledge among professionals, fear in children, and family as the perpetrators of trafficking. The researcher was also able to establish mechanisms for rapid identification, which included social mobilisation efforts in communities, litigation, the harmonisation of child protection protocols, and the development or implementation of prescriptive policies.
Although referral had initially been overlooked during problematisation of the study, its significance was highlighted during the data gathering phase. Chapter 7 illustrated that referral is purely not just about transferring the child from one service provider to the next, but that it is a fundamental mechanism for providing integrated and holistic care to trafficked children as supported by ADB (2009) and OSCE/ODIHR (2004b) studies. There seems to be a dearth of information and research in this area as one of the responses to trafficking. The findings from this research further revealed that in as much as there are formal and informal referral mechanisms in South Africa for child victims of trafficking, these systems need to be improved and better co-ordinated to ensure greater protection for children.

Furthermore, from the data gathering phase, it was evident that trafficked children have various multi-faceted needs ranging from physical, psycho-emotional, medical, social, and legal needs as well. Children who are trafficked transnationally do not only need physical and psychosocial supports and safety, but they also require access to recreation, legal, and medical opportunities. There seems to be a consensus with regard to this finding as it was the most reported on in different studies from various parts of the world (Banovic & Bjelajac, 2012; Burns & Simmons, 2006; Clawson et al., 2009; Deb, 2005; Dottridge, 2004; ILO, 2006, 2007; Rigby & White, 2013).

The best possible integrated manner to return well-being to children who have been trafficked was identified, and the consequences of responding inappropriately to the trafficked children’s needs were linked to re-trafficking, stigmatisation, secondary trauma and victimisation as well as negative issues related to trust. Provision of assistance is not an easy process, and some of the challenges identified include ensuring safety of the children, meeting the children’s diverse needs, matching the lifestyle previously provided for by the pimp/trafficker and pre-mature return and reintegration.
10.3.3 Design phase

The discussion on design phase is in Chapter 8 of the thesis. The aim of this study was to create psychosocial intervention guidelines for social workers working with trafficked children in South Africa and corresponding objectives were also developed. There seems to be a dearth of information and research in the area relating to one integrated design method for social interventions. However, by using a combination of designs suggested by various researchers, one is able to come up with a comprehensive design strategy.

The objectives that were formulated in this study provided focus and direction during the design phase. The findings from this phase indicate that the goal and the design objectives of the study were successfully achieved. The intervention guidelines were developed within the social work practice domain and the prerequisite skills, instruction strategies, and resources were identified for implementation purposes.

10.3.4 Early development and pilot testing phase

The in-depth discussion on early development and pilot testing phase is in Chapter 9. Developmental practice as applied in the study resulted in an increment of desired outcomes. In this phase, emphasis was on the intervention users and user-orientation approach used in pilot testing, with the researcher's role being that of a collaborator. Social workers as intended users of the intervention guidelines were asked to engage in design work, and their participation was viewed as a collective process where they made further contributions to the design and development of guidelines.

The feedback received from social workers was generally positive and it indicated that intervention guidelines are necessary in South Africa. However, although minor amendments were suggested by social workers who evaluated the guidelines, what was apparent was that social workers as the target group were reached, and that pilot testing went according to the objectives set. The guidelines were endorsed by majority of the social workers who felt that it would make a positive difference during social work interventions with trafficked children. The intervention guideline is presented after Chapter 9.
10.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The main limitation of the study discussed is sampling. The researcher used small, purposively chosen population samples that had rich information and which were likely to elucidate responses to study questions, rather than to test hypotheses or identify significant relationships between variables (Patton, 2002). Therefore, the findings in this study cannot be generalised to a larger population. However, the findings can be generalised to specific settings and specific research populations. Nonetheless, it should be noted that the application of the qualitative approach within trafficking research cannot provide population estimates, and this lack of magnitude hampers counter-trafficking efforts.

Selection bias was identified as a limitation since the trafficked children interviewed in this study were in an assistance programme during data collection (Larzelere & Kuhn, 2004). It was observed that in the presence of the interpreter, three children were uncomfortable discussing or providing negative perceptions or opinions about the assistance they had received. Thus, it is important to bear in mind the possible bias in some of the children’s responses. These findings are consistent with those of Surtees (2007) who reported that victims usually feel that the information shared in interviews would have negative consequences concerning their psychosocial support, and result in them being perceived as being ungrateful or harming the image of the organisation. Similar to Surtee’s (2007) study, the children responded when coaxed by the interpreter, or when the interpreter re-assured them that they would not get into trouble and that other children had also been interviewed by the researcher on similar issues.

The limitation during pilot testing of the guidelines was the sample frame bias. The sample was framed according to the purpose of the pilot test (Tuckett, 2004). This meant that the participants chosen for the pilot test were social workers with internet facilities and/ or situated in Gauteng Province. This sample frame subsequently restricted the researcher from sampling other social workers outside Gauteng Province who might be involved in care and protection of trafficked children, but who do not have access to internet facilities. Accessing social workers providing care but lacking internet facilities was not geographically viable for the researcher.
10.5 CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY

The conclusions in the study that emanate from the findings are described and discussed according to the following D&D phases that correlate with the research objectives set:

a) problem identification, analysis, and research planning phase;
b) information-gathering, analysis and synthesis;
c) design phase; and
d) development and pilot testing phase.

10.5.1 Project identification, analysis and research planning phase

A conclusion that can be drawn from this phase is that foreign children are trafficked into South Africa despite laws criminalising trafficking of children. In addition, understanding identification and assistance provision to foreign victims of child trafficking from a social work perspective is lacking in South Africa. South Africa does not have operational standard operating procedures for registered social workers to ensure appropriate identification and assistance provision to child victims of transnational trafficking. The standard operating procedures that are available are brief and are mainly applied during international sporting events being held in South Africa, which jeopardises children’s protection at other times. Little has been done to implement child right’s concerns and strategies into practice, or to use the information to develop practice guidelines relating to trafficking of children. In addition, trafficking of non-South African children seems like a low priority issue among social workers, yet the extent of transnational trafficking in South Africa was found to be widespread.

The research was feasible because the guideline was aligned to South Africa’s child protection legal frameworks and protocols. Organisational feasibility was realised through on-going research and critical engagement with literature on child trafficking and other related aspects. Different levels of support at various stages were garnered from both old and new contacts in the field of trafficking, both in South Africa and internationally. The study is feasible because currently in South Africa there are no formal, clear, and accessible guidelines for social workers working specifically with child victims of transnational trafficking. The guideline is economically feasible
because it is based on the needs of social workers and trafficked children as identified during data collection. The guidelines could further enhance uniformity and assist social workers in decision-making when implementing interventions with child victims of trafficking within South Africa.

10.5.2 Information-gathering and synthesis phase

The conclusions drawn from this phase indicate that identification and service provision are not mere single-events but are processes, which at most times require more than one professional. Protection of children, even against trafficking, is a collective process requiring collective responsibility (Emser, 2013; The Protection Project, 2012; Wessels & Edgerton, 2008).

Without a doubt, anyone can identify child victims of trafficking as long as they have the basic background knowledge on trafficking and the formulation of trafficking indicators. In line with OSCE’s (2011) findings in the European Union (EU) region, the valuable contribution that community members bring to the identification of victims of trafficking is enormous and it should not be underestimated.

It can be concluded that referral is not just about transferring the child from one service provider to the next, but that it is a fundamental mechanism of providing integrated and holistic care to trafficked children. Establishing cooperation mechanisms with various service providers is valuable in the referral and subsequent assistance provision for trafficked children. Failure to facilitate these processes accurately, appropriately and in a timely fashion makes any of the rights accorded to children abstract, theoretical and illusionary, increases the trafficked children’s vulnerability, and decreases their right to protection.

From this study, it can be concluded that child victims of transnational trafficking have numerous multi-dimensional needs that require social work intervention. Furthermore, other identified needs requires that social worker’s form partnerships with other actors in the field to ensure a holistic intervention.
The conclusions also indicate that there are indeed barriers to rapid identification of victims and within social service provision, as previously indicated in studies by Gozdziak and MacDonnell (2007), Pearce (2011) and Rigby (2011). The challenges reported on show that identification and referral does not necessarily lead to all required services being provided to trafficked children, to which they are entitled. Indeed, rapid identification of and service provision to transnational child victims of trafficking in South Africa is still not being seen as priority by the lead departments in government.

10.5.3 Design phase

No guideline on social work interventions with child victims of transnational trafficking could be located in South Africa. Studying previous international trafficking guidelines acted as a foundation for the current guideline, which was formulated, and they were fused in tactfully with contextual sensitivity in the conceptualisation of the design phase. The D&D model in conjunction with Thomas’s (1984) intervention research model provided sufficient structure and procedures to follow in the development of the guidelines.

Creating an intervention guideline for social workers necessitated that the researcher has background training and/or working knowledge in social work, child protection, migration, and trafficking and is able to amalgamate them. The techniques provided include aspects of both direct and indirect social work intervention strategies. In addition, guideline formulation processes were aligned with other social issues or policy initiatives during drafting and implementation.

The researcher's conceptualisation of intervention research design, within Rothman and Thomas’ (1994) D&D model, using the four phases shows that the model can play a significant role in solving social problems. This has also been proven by the use of the model in other South African social work studies (Galloway, 2013; Luck, 2005; Oelofsen, 2012). The design and development phases outlined and discussed may be repeated with various other social issues, as the process involved creating and refining interventions that are vital for the social work discipline.
10.5.4 Early development and pilot testing phase
The conclusion from this phase indicates that the views and the participation of the users of the guideline are important and it ensured that the intervention guidelines were developed with sensitivity and that it was a collaborative process. Including the guideline users by requesting them to fill in the evaluation form, and then triangulating it with telephonic interviews, contributed to systematic evaluation with a specific structure, which further enhanced the pilot testing results. The guideline was generally well-rated and the feedback provided was used to revise the guidelines further, and subsequently make it efficient, effective, and appropriate to the social workers in the child protection field. The peer examinations, migration seminar, and child protection conference contributed to the evaluation of the guidelines on and from different perspectives, which enhanced the guideline development process. The methods of trustworthiness applied, which included data triangulation, collaboration, and reflexivity, were efficient in increasing trustworthiness during evaluation of the guidelines.

10.6 RECOMMENDATIONS
The general recommendations for the study comprise of recommendations for operationalisation in social work practice, social work policy, social work curriculum, and future research with trafficked children.

10.6.1 Social Work Practice
The notion ascertained in the study is that there should be no wrong door or single point of entry for a trafficked child, but rather, wherever a child first interacts with a service provider or concerned community member that the child can be connected to a broad range of child protection services. The identification of trafficked victims is not an event but a process that is highly dependent on the child’s port of entry and the ever-changing trafficking trends and patterns, and thus training of service providers, especially for social workers, should incorporate these ideas.

Without the bridge provided for by the community members, it will be challenging to reach some victims of transnational child trafficking. Thus, training should also be provided for community members as a way of developing sustainable child protection
systems in South African and within communities in the SADC region. The benefits from these community-based child protection systems can be three-fold, i.e. subsequently increase the children’s network and circle of care, integration of local trends and patterns of child trafficking into case management, and acting as a link to social workers and the national child protection system.

The suggested flow chart (See Figure 10.1) of the identification process, is derived from data collected from this study and it incorporates community members.

Figure 10.1: Recommended flow chart for identification of child victims of trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presumed case of child trafficking-based on suspicions of community member(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case is reported to a social worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediately secure the child's safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case is reported to a police officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social work assessment according to Sec. 150 of the Children’s Act and Sec. 4(1)(2) of the Trafficking Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Police assessment according to the National Instruction (TiP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition of child as victim of trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child is not victim of trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition of child as victim of trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct needs assessment for direct assistance, focusing on:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Social and cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Physical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Medical/health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Legal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Psycho-emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Vocational/educational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Other needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Police registers the case and issues a CAS number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Case assigned to investigating police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Investigating officer to inform victim of the investigation to be conducted and keep the victim and guardian abreast with case progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refer for child protection services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Police registers the case and issues a CAS number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Case assigned to investigating police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Investigating officer to inform victim of the investigation to be conducted and keep the victim and guardian abreast with case progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refer case to social worker for further assistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The flow chart can be further adjusted to include identification by other service providers. It was also noted that because victims of trafficking are better at identifying other victims and target areas, social workers and other service providers should involve them in their victim identification endeavours. Outreach efforts, awareness-raising, and education on trafficking should also be facilitated in communities so that families know that their involvement in trafficking has negative implications.

In addition, in verifying identification from various perspectives, different service providers may require trafficked children to repeat their stories. It should be noted that this has the potential to be damaging and could compound fears of further abuse. Thus, a time-sensitive approach that respects the voice of the child should be adopted when gaining evidence, in such a way that trauma is minimised and in line with the best interests of the child. In line with Rigby’s (2011) findings, the changing nature of a trafficked child’s narratives should not be used against them as a way of challenging their credibility, but as a way to understand the complexities and the children’s viewpoints of trafficking experiences. During therapy, social workers can use life stories and memory books to assist children make sense of their trafficking experiences over time, to discuss and explore their feelings, thoughts, and fears as related to their life story.

It was noted that although the safety of trafficked children was considered a major issue, there needs to be a balance between the protection of children who are at risk of being re-trafficked and treating them in a way that is similar to trafficking them. Service providers, social workers specifically, should strive to achieve a balance between safety and normality for the child as much as possible, and in whichever way possible.

There is simply no single correct way to approach and intervene with children who have been trafficked in terms of their multiple needs. Social workers should create carefully-measured assistance programmes and interventions to assist the child victims, because victims require sustained provision of multiple services. The aims of assistance provision should ensure that assistance provision is adapted to the child’s individual needs, that it is supportive of healing and recovery through a child-centred
therapeutic jurisprudence plan, and that it is empowering, participatory, and holistic. These aims speak to social work’s mandate to advance human rights, social change and social justice, and for social workers to be active participants in the fight against child trafficking.

10.6.2 Social Work Policy
Child protection is political, and child trafficking has to be understood within the political contexts. There are no quick fixes and/or easy solutions to identification of and assistance provision to trafficked and exploited children. Therefore, the politics of child protection will influence preferences for rights, care, and support. Child protection systems in South Africa must be further reformed to provide tailored support, care, and protection to trafficked children. However, fulfilment of child protection and children’s rights entails costs. Due to the transnational nature of child trafficking within the SADC region, SADC governments, including the South African government, have an obligation to increase their budgets for children. This is because investing in children is good for children’s growth and development, and it has a high likelihood of contributing positively to the economy, democratic governance, social protection, and social stability. Without this systematic change in child rights budgeting at national and regional levels “child protection programmes may amount to little more than band aids” (Wessells & Edgerton, 2008, p. 11).

Standardised and harmonised protocols, guidelines and procedures for the identification, referral, and assistance provision to child victims of trafficking needs to introduced and supported by a comprehensive training programme within and between the various lead government departments and transnational agencies. Acknowledgement and recognition needs to be given to the different roles and responsibilities each lead department and transnational agency has. However, this should not privilege one department or service provider over the other. In addition, regional cooperation and sharing of best practices is encouraged. The possible implication of these is that they are bound to ensure improvement in the case management system, and the partnerships are bound to bring positive change.
Social policies are crucial for children because they shape the children’s development, access to services, and the children’s well-being. Thus, the ultimate goals of policy-making should also apply to children and not only to adults. Children’s rights and protection were major recurring facets in the international, regional, and local South African counter-trafficking legal frameworks. Therefore, formulating and fully implementing counter-trafficking policies that matter is imperative if trafficked children’s rights are to be achieved. The child rights lens must always accompany political power and authority. Traffickers, including family members, are taking advantage of the loopholes in the South African criminal justice system (Kruger & Oosthuizen, 2012). Therefore, relentless prosecutions and harsh penalties for trafficking perpetrators should be employed to reaffirm government’s determination to prevent and combat trafficking in children in South Africa and across borders.

10.6.3 Social Work Curriculum

The ability to understand the nature and characteristics of transnational child trafficking and to create better intervention strategies relies heavily on the abilities of social workers to improve their knowledge and skill base when identifying and responding to the crime of child trafficking and the child rights violations. This requires a paradigm shift within the lens of social work practice and training in South Africa, and across the SADC region. The internationalisation and the transnational aspects of child trafficking require social workers to engage and address issues beyond family, community, and national boundaries. Indeed, other researchers such as Christie (2003) and Rigby and White (2013) have made similar recommendations regarding how paramount it is that the social work curriculum engages with globalisation of practice.

Social work training can be a crucial driver of or pioneer for change, especially when trafficking concepts are introduced earlier in the social work under-graduate curriculum across South African universities. Sambo (2009) made a similar recommendation regarding trafficking being included in the university curriculum. In addition, there should be training for all social workers already in practice, and mandatory training on child trafficking to social workers in the field of child protection. In the case of the latter, it is in order for them to be able to provide services in
situations whereby they might not have knowingly interacted with child victims of trafficking. It is essential that both the undergraduate and the continuous professional development training programme for social workers must include the following topics:

i) identification of child trafficking i.e. the signs of child trafficking;

ii) protocols on how to communicate with child victims;

iii) assessment of immediate needs of child victims;

iv) available resources to meet the child victim’s needs;

v) South African criminal investigative procedures and the judicial proceedings;

vi) cross-cultural competence; and

vii) the victim’s legal needs and the application of therapeutic jurisprudence.

The test of the social work profession lies in its capacity to generate knowledge for practice, thus broadening and strengthening intervention research must be prioritized. Interventions are significant within social work (Marsh & Fisher, 2007; Mullen & Bacon, 2003; Proctor & Rosen, 2003b; Rothman & Thomas, 1994); therefore, intervention research is fundamental to the profession, and social work curriculums at universities need to start reflecting this. The Trafficking Act (2013) was recently passed in South Africa and the Child Exploitation Strategy (Forthcoming) is not yet available to the public, thus management interventions might be required in the adoption and implementation of the Act and its subsequent policies. In addition, on-going professional development is vital, especially in the translation of trafficking policy to social work practice.

10.6.4 Future research with trafficked children

This study only implemented the first four stages of the Rothman and Thomas D&D model, namely problem analysis and project planning, information gathering, analysis and synthesis, design and early development and pilot testing. Therefore, future research could address the last two phases, namely evaluation and advanced development, and dissemination of the guidelines.

There is anecdotal evidence of child trafficking interventions in South Africa, although most of them are not documented. Future research should investigate the impact of
these counter-trafficking programmes and activities being provided. In addition, future research could also look at the motivations of family members who knowingly traffic and/or allow their children to be trafficked.

10.7 CONCLUDING REMARKS
Childhood is a carefree period full of fun, exploration, and discovery, and child trafficking harms children and violates their rights. In as much as it might be a struggle to provide all trafficked children with the opportunities, services, and assistance recommended, providing high quality social work assistance is a critical issue worth pursuing. Every child deserves a loving childhood and to live freely without fear of being exploited. Trafficked children’s limited capacity to protect and lobby for themselves always means that considerations of age, capacity, and trauma experienced can only suggest stronger rights for protection, never weaker. We all need to honour our obligations toward children and strive towards creating an ideal world where all children are protected.

“Our children are our greatest treasure. They are our future. Those who abuse them tear at the fabric of our society and weaken our nation” Nelson Mandela (1997).
REFERENCES


human trafficking in Southern Africa. A research commissioned by the NPA from the Democracy and Governance Programmed of the HSRC.


ADB. (2009). *The significance of referral systems as a response to human trafficking and unsafe migration*. Mandaluyong City: ADB.


Bokhari, F. (2008). Falling through the gaps: Safeguarding children trafficked into the UK. *Children & Society, 22, 3*, 201-211.


Calitz, K. (2013). The failure of the Minimum Age Convention to eradicate child labour in developing countries, with particular reference to SADC. In M. Olivier, O. Dupper & A. Govindjee (Eds.), *The role of standards in labour and social security law: International, regional and national perspectives* (pp. 125-140). Cape Town: Juta.


Czarniawska, B. (2004). The use of narrative in social science research. In M. Hardy & A. Bryman (Eds.), Handbook of data analysis (pp. 649-666). London: SAGE.


ECPAT-USA. (2013). *And boys too*. An ECPAT-USA discussion paper about the lack of recognition of the CSE of boys in the US. ECPAT USA.


Herman, J. L. (2001). *Trauma and recovery: From domestic abuse to political terror*. Pandora/ Basic Books: London.


National Roundtable on People Trafficking to assist NGO’s (2010). Guidelines for NGO’s working with trafficked people (2nd ed.). Commonwealth of Australia.


APPENDIX A: UJ Ethics Clearance letter

Faculty of Humanities Academic Ethics Committee
University of Johannesburg
5 May 2011

Prof. Hanna Nel
Department of Social Work
Faculty of Humanities
University of Johannesburg

Ethical Clearance:
Research Project Proposed by Ms. A.R. Warria

Dear Prof. Nel,

It is the judgement of the Faculty of Humanities Academic Ethics Committee, based on the documents provided to us, that Ms A.R. Warria has clearly indicated that the standard practice of ethical professionalism will be upheld in the proposed research project with the title: Development of Psychosocial Intervention Guidelines for Trafficked Children. From a research ethics point of view, the Faculty of Humanities Academic Ethics Committee therefore endorses the proposed research.

Yours truly,

[Signature]

Prof. Ria Smit
Chair: Faculty of Humanities Academic Ethics Committee
University of Johannesburg
APPENDIX B: Interview schedule (Children)

Participants profile sheet
Pseudonym/ Nickname:........................................................................................................
Age……………………Gender:……………….Legal status:..................................................
Country of origin:……………….Home language(s):.........................................................

Objective 1: Introduction to the interview and building rapport
1.1 Starting where you like, and in your own words, I would like you to tell me about living in this place.

Objective 2: Exploration of experiences related identification procedures
2.1 What made you stop making money for someone else?
2.2 Once you stopped making money for someone else, where were you staying and who was looking after you?
2.3 Were you able to speak to your parents or family? If you did not, was it because you chose not to, or because you were not able to do so?
2.4 Have the police asked you any questions any time? Explore: If so, did they tell you what they wanted that information for and what they were planning to do about your case?
2.5 Were you told about an adult who was chosen to look after you for a short time?
2.6 Were you at any point told what was going on? Explore

Objective 3: Exploration of experiences related to initial assistance procedures
3.1 Were you ever asked if wanted to stay in South Africa or go back home? Explore: If so, who asked you?
3.2 Since you arrived here, what help have you received? Explore: medical/ psychological/ legal/ social assistance.
3.3 Has any assistance been offered to you which you refused or did not want? Explore: Are there any treatments or care that you wanted but could not have?
3.4 After those first few days, did you want to continue living where you were or did you want to go and live elsewhere? Explore: Where? Reasons why?
3.5 Is there a social worker who is in contact with you regularly? If not, would you have wanted to meet with a social worker to talk about your experience?
Objective 4: Assessment of risk and resilience as perceived by the trafficked children

4.1 Tell me about the greatest difficulties you have faced as a result of trafficking. **Explore**: How did you overcome them? Were these difficulties different for boys and girls? Did it depend on age?

4.2 Tell me about your goals/dreams for the future.

Objective 5: Interview closure

5.1 What would you like to happen to those people who made money from you?

5.2 Has anyone told any person anything that you did not want them to share with other people? **Explore**

5.3 What is the best thing that someone in your community has done/can do to help children like you?

5.4 What opportunities are there for young people like you to participate and express your concerns? **Explore**

5.5 What would you like to be done, and by whom, so that all children affected by trafficking can have their rights respected and protected?

5.6 What are your feelings about this interview with me? (Feeling faces) **Explore**: Do you feel you have been asked questions like these too many times? Did the questions I asked make you feel bad and sad? (Feeling faces). If sad, offer referral for counselling

5.7 Are there any other issues faced by trafficked children that have not been mentioned and should be addressed?

5.8 Re-Contracting: I will share what you have told me with other people without telling anyone that the information came from you. Is that ok?

*Thank you for answering so many questions. I hope all your answers will help make things better other children like you in the future.*
APPENDIX C: Interview schedule (Social workers)

Questions for discussion

1. How do trafficked children end up in your care? Explore: How does the period of exploitation come to an end?

2. How are the children identified as being trafficked? Explore: who does the identification, process, indicators etc.

3. If the identification takes place elsewhere, who contacts you as the social worker? Explore: How does the other person make contact with you, how soon does the child arrive at the shelter/ children’s home, what mode of transportation is used, who accompanies them?

4. Once a child has been placed under your care, do you still consider them to be at risk of being re-trafficked? Explore: Which precautions do you put in place to ensure maximum safety?

5. What are some challenges faced by social workers when trying to identify trafficked children who present to them?

6. Kindly take me through what exactly happens or is supposed to happen once the child arrives at your shelter? Explore: Which assessments are done or should be done, by who and when, what is the child’s involvement in the process?

7. What are some challenges faced by social workers when trying to provide assistance to trafficked children?

8. How involved are the police, immigration officials or prosecution authorities in investigating the children’s trafficking cases and any other related offences? Explore: Have the police or prosecutors given any advice on protecting these children?
9. From your experience, what are some major obstacles faced by trafficked children in South Africa?

10. In your work with trafficked children, which incidents could indicate resilience and how could you nurture it further within these trafficked children?

11. Which present policies address the needs of child trafficking victims after they have been rescued? Explore: Are they adequate, appropriate, accessible?

12. From a social work perspective, what are some best practice responses to:
   i) rapid identification of trafficked children
   ii) initial assistance to trafficked children
   iii) generally empowering child victims of trafficking
   iv) creating effective social work guidelines for working with trafficked children

13. Kindly suggest those whom it would be useful to collaborate with e.g. service providers, organizations etc. in ensuring rapid identification and assistance to child victims of trafficking

Thank you for answering the questions. I hope all your answers will help improve interventions for social workers and trafficked children in the future.

Is there any other information which you think would be useful for me to know about and which you would like to give to me?
APPENDIX D: Interview schedule (Stakeholders)

Questions for discussion

1. What are some major obstacles facing trafficked children in South Africa? 
   **Explore:** Are present policies adequate and appropriate to their needs? What makes them adequate and appropriate or inadequate and inappropriate?

2. What factors impact on a trafficked child’s access and willingness to seek assistance? **Explore:** immigration status, language, literacy, age, ethnicity, sex/gender, geographic location, country of origin, family history etc.

3. Kindly take me through the process of identifying a child victim of trafficking in South Africa. **Explore:** key actors/organizations responsible at different stages, indicators etc.

4. How might fragmented or improper social/ legal identification impact on a child victim of trafficking?

5. What are the next steps, with regards to initial assistance, care and protection, once a child has been identified as a trafficked child? **Explore:** Any documentation with the procedures clearly outlined?

6. Once a child has been identified as a victim of trafficking, what are the repercussions if appropriate initial assistance is not provided?

7. What are some realities faced by children when returned prematurely to their homes of origin, without proper identification and assistance? **Explore:** How might they be (more) vulnerable/ traumatized/ stigmatized and at risk?

8. The National Referral Mechanism is a vital framework that has been adopted by various countries in ensuring that victims of trafficking are protected. State actors form strategic partnerships with civil society organizations to ensure that the rights of trafficked persons are respected and to provide effective ways to refer victims of trafficking to services. How effective would it be in South Africa?
9. In relation to identification and assistance-provision, what is “justice” for a child victim of trafficking?

10. What are some of the best practice responses to:
   i) identification of child victims of trafficking
   ii) assistance provision to child victims of trafficking
   iii) creating an effective guideline for social workers working with child victims.

   **Explore: key focus areas**

*Is there any other information which you think would be useful for me to know about and which you would like to give to me?*

*Thank you for answering the questions. I hope all your answers will help improve social workers interventions with trafficked children in the future in South Africa.*
APPENDIX E: Example of letter requesting permission (Children’s guardians)

10th Sept 2011

For Attention: Prof/Dr/Mr(s). (name of organization’s director)
   (Name of organization)

RE: REQUEST TO CONDUCT RESEARCH AT CHILDREN’S HOME

This letter is a follow up to our telephonic conversation, requesting permission to collect data for a PHD study that I’m currently undertaking. All ethical procedures regarding to facilitating research with children will be adhered to at all times. In addition, the study has been approved by University of Johannesburg Ethics Committee (letter attached).

The purpose of the study is to develop an intervention guideline for social workers working with trafficked children. The duration of the study may vary though data collection is bound to take 7-10 days, between October-December 2011. The researcher would like to interview 15 participants, ranging from the age of 13-17 years, who have been identified as being trafficked. The participants will be interviewed individually, for approximately 45-60 minutes. The questions to be asked are intended to seek information about the child’s views on identification and initial assistance/support they received once rescued from the trafficking situation. Please note that the children will not be asked to relate their trafficking experiences. As the minors are registered with your organization, I would like to request assistance for them to participate in this research study.

As previously mentioned, the information collected will be used to improve and develop psychosocial intervention strategies for trafficked children within social work. This would in turn provide the social workers and those working with trafficked children with evidence-based knowledge on intervention guidelines with trafficked children. By participating in this study, the children’s voices will be heard thus making them ‘active participants’ rather than ‘objects of concern.’ The children’s experiences will subsequently become an essential basis for developing genuine child-centred policies and programmes.

The completed research will be made accessible to the various governmental and non-governmental organizations working with trafficked children with recommendations to assist this population group. It is important to stress that the research report and publication(s) will conceal the identity of the participants and organizations and keep them confidential at all times.
Participation in the research study is voluntary for all participants and they may withdraw from the study any time. Debriefing sessions will be done after the interviews and should a situation arise where the participant feels they need further counselling, this will be arranged free of charge. Should you have further questions, the researcher may be contacted on 072 930 0640 (cell) or awarria@gmail.com (email). The research is being supervised by Prof. Nel (Email: hannan@uj.ac.za) and Prof. Triegaardt (Email: jeant@uj.ac.za), Department of Social Work (Tel: 011 559 2804) at the University of Johannesburg.

Thanking you in advance for your assistance with this project.

Yours Faithfully,

Ajwang’ Warria

PHD Student: University of Johannesburg
APPENDIX F: Example of letter requesting permission (Social workers)

22nd Dec. 2011

For Attention: (Name of organization’s director)

(Name of organisation)

RE: REQUEST FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANT

This letter is a follow up from our telephonic conversation, requesting permission to collect data for a PHD study that I’m currently undertaking. All ethical procedures with regard to conducting research will be adhered to at all times. The study has been approved by University of Johannesburg Ethics Committee (letter attached).

The purpose of the study is to develop intervention guidelines for social workers working with children who have been trafficked, with specific reference to rapid identification and assistance. The duration of the study may vary though data collection is bound to take place in December 2011-January 2012. The researcher would like to interview 15 trafficked children, 5 social workers and 7 key stakeholders. The focus group discussion will last app. 90 minute, with a follow up if all issues are not exhausted. The questions are intended to seek information about identification and initial assistance with regard to trafficked children between ages 13-17. The recommendations from the social workers will go a long way in lobbying, protecting and caring for this vulnerable population. As the social worker is working for your organization, I would like to request assistance for him/ her to participate in this research study.

The information collected will be used to develop a psychosocial intervention guideline for social workers. This would in turn provide the social workers and those working with trafficked children with evidence-based skills and knowledge on intervention guidelines when intervening with trafficked children. The completed research will be made accessible to the various governmental and non-governmental organizations working with trafficked children with recommendations on how to assist this population group. It is important to stress that the names of organizations and key stakeholders participating in the research will remain anonymized since the aim of the research is not to expose professional malpractice but to explore complexities of identification and assistance and hence tap on the fragmented aspects of victim assistance.

Participation in the research study is voluntary for participants and organizations and they may withdraw from the study at any time. Debriefing sessions will be available after the interviews and should a situation arise whereby the participant needs further counselling, this will be arranged (with
their consent). Should you have further questions, the researcher may be contacted on 072 930 0640 (cell) or awarria@gmail.com (email). The research is being supervised by Prof. Nel (Email: hannan@uj.ac.za) and Prof. Triegaardt (Email: jeant@uj.ac.za) of the Department of Social Work at the University of Johannesburg, who can also be contacted on 011 559 2804 (Tel).

Thanking you in advance for your assistance with this project.

Yours Faithfully,

Ajwang’ Warria
PHD Student: University of Johannesburg
APPENDIX G: Example of letter requesting permission (Stakeholders)

22\textsuperscript{nd} Nov. 2011

For Attention: Research Coordinator (Name of organization)

RE: REQUEST FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANT

This letter is a follow up from our telephonic conversation, requesting permission to collect data for a PHD study that I’m currently undertaking. All ethical procedures with regard to conducting research will be adhered to at all times. Furthermore, the study has been approved by University of Johannesburg Ethics Committee (letter attached).

The purpose of the study is to develop intervention guidelines for social workers working with children who have been trafficked, with specific reference to rapid identification and assistance. The duration of the study may vary though data collection is bound to from December 2011-January 2012. The researcher would like to interview 15 former trafficked children, 10 social workers and 7 key stakeholders. The key stakeholder identified in your organization is the victim assistance coordinator. The interview will last app. 45 minutes (interview schedule attached). The questions are intended to seek information about identification and initial assistance with regard to trafficked children between ages 13-17. The recommendations from these stakeholders will go a long way in lobbying, protecting and caring for this vulnerable population. As the stakeholder is working for your organization, I would like to request assistance for them to participate in this research study.

The information collected will be used to develop a psychosocial intervention guideline for social workers. This would in turn provide the social workers and those working with trafficked children with evidence-based skills and knowledge on intervention guidelines when intervening with trafficked children. The completed research will be made accessible to the various governmental and non-governmental organizations working with trafficked children with recommendations on how to assist this population group. It is important to stress that the names of organizations and key stakeholders participating in the research will remain anonymized since the aim of the research is not to expose professional malpractice but to explore complexities of identification and assistance and hence tap on the fragmented aspects of victim assistance.

Participation in the research study is voluntary for participants and organizations and they may withdraw from the study at any time. Debriefing sessions will be available after the interviews and should a situation arise whereby the participant needs further counselling, this will be arranged. Should you have further questions, the researcher may be contacted on 072 930 0640 (cell) or
awaria@gmail.com (email). The research is being supervised by Prof. Nel (Email: hannan@uj.ac.za) and Prof. Triegaardt (Email: jeant@uj.ac.za) of the Department of Social Work at the University of Johannesburg, who can also be contacted on 011 559 2804 (Tel).

Thanking you in advance for your assistance with this project.

Yours Faithfully,

Ajwang’ Warria (PHD Student: University of Johannesburg)
APPENDIX H: Consent/ Assent letter (Children)

Hallo! My name is “Aj.” I would like to hear stories from children who have been used by other people to make money for them. I am inviting you and other children with the same stories to tell me these stories so that social workers can know how to help.

I will ask you some questions for about 1 hour. The questions will be about who brought you here and what happened thereafter. Your story will only be seen by my 2 teachers. When I finish listening and writing about your story, I will destroy this tape. When I write your story, I will not use your name, the name of your family or home or the name of the place where you are staying.

You can ask me questions before we start or after we finish. If you don’t feel nice because of what you have shared with me, you can talk to the social worker here. You do not have to tell me your story if you don’t want to. It is ok to say no. If you decide to tell me your story, you can still change your mind at any time and ask me to stop.

If you tell me about someone who is still doing bad things to you or other children, I would want us to agree on what should be done and who should be told.

If you feel that you want to tell me your story, please sign below.

……………………………………………………………
Name(s) of participant         Age           Date
……………………………………………………………
Name of Researcher             Signature       Date
……………………………………………………………
Name of guardian giving consent Signature       Date
APPENDIX I: Consent to participate in and to record interview

I, ...................................................... (insert name), hereby consent to participate in the child trafficking research project. The purpose and procedures of the study have been explained to me. I understand my participation is voluntary and that I may refuse to answer any particular items of withdraw from the study at any time without any negative consequences. I understand that my responses will be kept confidential and that my name will not be mentioned in the final thesis written.

I agree/ disagree for the interview to be recorded. (Underline)

Name of Participant: ...........................................................................................................
Date: .........................................................................................................................
Signature: ....................................................................................................................

Name of Researcher: .......................................................................................................
Date: ............................................................................................................................
Signature: .....................................................................................................................
“Siphiwe”  (Female, Mozambican)

Aj: Thank you for agreeing to take part in this research today. My first question to you is how long have you been here for?
S: I have been here since 2000, early 2000
Aj: How old were you when you started staying here?
S: I was 9 years old
Aj: For this interview, I would like to take you back to that time when you were 9 years old and the questions that I’m going to ask you are about the first 2 weeks when you arrived here. So it’s not about what has happened this year or last year or the year before last, it’s about back then when you were 9 years old. Is that ok?
S: Yes
Aj: If there is a question that you don’t feel comfortable answering, just let me know and we will move on to the next question. In your own words, tell me how it has been living here.
S: It has been a life of experiencing a lot. I enjoyed staying here. I was once a kid and I’m now working here. It’s good.
Aj: You mentioned to me yesterday that you were also trafficked, right?
S: Ya, it is true
Aj: So what made you get out of that situation, where you were making money for somebody else?
S: Ammmmm (pause)
Aj: How did you get out? Did you run away? Did a social worker help you?
S: Oh yeah, I ran away.
Aj: And why did you run away?
S: Because I felt like it’s too much (shaking head). I suffered a lot (sad facial expression, looking up as if holding tears)
Aj: Was that in South Africa or in Mozambique?
S: It was here in South Africa
Aj: So, when you ran away, where did you go to?
S: I went to my father’s place here in South Africa, where we first arrived, but only to find out that there were other people living there.
Aj: So your father wasn’t there any more?
S: Yes, he wasn’t there anymore. So I was wandering around the streets, so the community called the police and said there is this child and then they took me to (name of place of safety)

Aj: Was that in Malelane or in Nelspruit?

S: It was in the rural area in Block A, Ntonga part in Ntonga

Aj: So those community members brought you here?

S: No. They took me to the police station and then the police are the ones who took me here.

Aj: When you were taken to the police, what kind of questions did they ask you?

S: Like where/s my father, how comes I’m living here and all those questions.

Aj: Did they tell you why they were asking those questions?

S: No

Aj: Did they tell you what would happen with that information?

S: No

Aj: Would you have wanted to know why they were asking you all these questions

S: Noooooo. I was too young to think about that

Aj: At that moment, what was going on in your head? What were you thinking?

S: I was thinking, hey if these people can get me to a safe place to stay that will be fine with me, so that I can continue studying I will be ok.

Aj: So from the police station they brought you here?

S: Ya

Aj: Ok and when you arrived here, did you talk to a social worker or who met you? Who was the first person you met?

S: It is, the first one when I arrived here, there were no social workers. The social workers things began at around 2003 or 2004 back then. So I had a couple of social workers interviewing me, wanting to take me back to where I lived and all that

Aj: in Mozambique?

S: No here in South Africa, but only to find the same situation. No one there.

Aj: Did the social worker explain to you what was happening?

S: No they only explained that they we are no longer allowed to stay here like for more than a year so they’re supposed to take us back to our families or give us for adoption

Aj: Ok. And did they ask you to choose whether, if you wanted to go back home or be given for adoption?

S: No. The first option was to go back to my family. They took me there. I went there with them so they find that there’s no on. I didn’t know what happened but they did not continue with the adoption process.
Aj: At any one time were you told that they will be an older person looking after you, like MamG?
S: Sorry
Aj: You know what MamG does here?
S: Ya
Aj: Were you told that she will be the person, the adult who will be looking after you?
S: Yes. When the police take me here, they arrived here and they introduced me to MamG and they said this is the person that you will be staying with, but for how long I didn’t know.
Aj: So it’s only the social workers who asked you if you wanted to stay in South Africa of if you wanted to go home to Mozambique or was it a situation where because your family was staying here that is where they were going to take you back or to Mozambique?
S: Mmhh (nodding in affirmation). I didn’t remember where about in Mozambique my family was, so they couldn’t take me there. Yes.
Aj: Those first 2 weeks, apart from seeing the social worker, did you go and see a doctor or they didn’t take you to a doctor?
S: No
Aj: But during those 2 weeks that’s when you saw the social worker?
S: Yes
Aj: In those 2 weeks, did they tell you to do something that they you didn’t want to do?
S: No
Aj: Did they ask you what you wanted them to do for you and they did it for you?
S: No
Aj: Would you have wanted them to ask you?
S: Sorry, I didn’t think about it
Aj: You were brought here, yeah?
S: Ya
Aj: After those 2 weeks, did you want to continue staying here of did you want to be somewhere else?
S: Even if I wanted to go somewhere else, there was no where, no place to go, so I had no choice but to stay here, but anyway I begin to like the place
Aj: So what did you start liking about the place?
S: Here they teach us how to clean, you know to wash ourselves and all those chores everyone does, whether you are a boy or a girl in their homes. They teach us the values you know. Yeah, they treat us like their own kids. It’s a home actually.
Aj: So you felt like this became your family?
S: Ya
Aj: And that is what you loved about it?
S: Yes, very much
Aj: After those 2 weeks, did you see a social worker?
S: Yes
Aj: Many times?
S: No (shaking head)
Aj: Would you have wanted to see a social worker more times?
S: No (shaking head)
Aj: To talk about what happened?
S: (shaking head)
Aj: Why not?
S: I didn’t like to talk about what had happened. It was always bringing back those bad memories. So I always hate it
Aj: But you know social workers can help you deal with those bad memories that you have and keep them away forever?
S: Yes
Aj: But you just didn’t want
S: Yes
Aj: You’re happy with those memories just staying there?
S: The past belongs to the past
Aj: Ok. What have been some of the most difficult things that you have faced because of being trafficked? What have you found to be very difficult to deal with because of that experience?
S: (pause) What can I say? (pause). When I first arrived here, I was this child who likes to exclude myself from other, like I was not free. I was not active like the other children. I always felt like this is how I must like. Like I must live alone, just sit there, you know, not eating, didn’t want to go and wash the clothes. It’s a must for me, that’s how I’ve been living all along. I didn’t know what the love of a mother is, you know, until, but as time goes by and with the help of MamG, you know, I started to be like a normal child.
Aj: So you were able to overcome those problems because you had people around, who cared for you?
S: Ya, and they also gave me some counselling
Aj: What would you have liked to have happened to those people who were doing those bad things to you?
S: (pause) What can I say? Because they were my relatives, so I just forgave them. I remember this other year, I just can’t remember which year, I went there to see them, to see how they are doing. I don’t want bad things to happen to them. So I forgave them.
Aj: What if they were not your relatives? For other children, who it’s not their relatives doing that to them, what do you think should happen to those people?
S: Those people should get a life sentence, ya!
Aj: So you think they should be sent to prison for doing those things to children?
S: Exactly! Like forever, no bail!
Aj: Based on that trafficking experience that you had, have you shared something with somebody that you didn’t want them to tell anybody else but those people went and told other people?
S: No, never shared, no
Aj: What do you think is the best thing that people in the community can do to help children like you? That time when you were 9 years old because you mentioned that the good thing that the community did was to take you to the police station. What else can they do?
S: Based on my situation, I think they should have gone there and asked my relatives why did I run away and tried to find out why I’m living on the streets and they are there. What is the problem, you know, and then they take it from there.
Aj: Do you think young people like you are given a chance to talk about what happened to you and what should happen after that?
S: Come again
Aj: Do you think young people like you should be given a chance to express yourselves about what happened in your situation and after that and all that?
S: Ya, I think there’s a lot. I can talk about it. I have been I interviewed a lot, many times and I have been sharing my story with lots of people the media especially, with the media and I have been going for, what do you call this? Conferences, ya.
Aj: What do you think should be done, think back, when you were 9 years old, to children in your situation, can be cared for and protected better. What should be done and by who?
S: Because according to me, people in the rural areas they are still not aware of human trafficking so educating the and letting them know that there’s human trafficking and not that a stranger can just traffic you, even your relatives can traffic you and use you in many ways, ya, all that. They need to know what is trafficking. You know other neighbours and
other people think that no, it’s family issues and we’re not supposed to entertain it whiles someone is suffering you know.

Aj: And who would be the best person to create this awareness? Teachers, social workers, the police?
S: Social workers, the police, everybody
Aj: So everybody and anybody should create awareness?
S: Yes
Aj: Do you feel as if I’ve asked you too many questions?
S: No
Aj: Have any of the questions that I’ve asked made you upset or sad?
S: No, they just take me back to 9 years old, you know, which there is a lot of bad memories but I’m fine.

Aj: Are there other issues that you feel affect trafficked children that we have touched on here? To you, what are the issues affecting trafficked children? (long pause). If you were to be given a platform and told, Siphiwe, tell us the problems that foreign children here in South Africa face, what would you say are the 3 key issues that are problems for trafficked children in South Africa?
S: (sigh) Trafficked children are being used for child labour, prostitution
Aj: So after that, after they have been rescued or ran away, what do you think are the main problems that they face?
S: Lots of people don’t believe us especially when you’re trying to explain that someone has been doing this and that, you know, especially in my case since they have been my relatives. If I went by my father and said my uncle was doing this and that and that, he would believe me. So they think that we’re kind of lysing or something like that, ya, and another thing, we’re not being taken seriously
Aj: What do you mean by that?
S: Like I’ve never, how do I put it? I’ve never heard of a case that they have arrested someone that has been trafficking children, you know. It’s like people who are trafficking are getting away with it, ya.
Aj: What are your dreams for the future?
S: Ohh my God! I want to be a business woman. Currently I’m studying business management, ya.
Aj: When do you finish?
S: 3 years to come (laughter)
Aj: All the best with that. In terms of what you’ve shared with me, I just wanted to let you know that I’m going to share it with other people, but I’m not going to use your name or the name of the organization or the name of (place of safety) or your details. Is that still ok with you?
S: Very fine
Aj: Thank you for answering all my questions and the best for the future!
S: My pleasure!
Aj: Thank you!
APPENDIX K: Transcribed interview (Social worker)

Social worker 2

Aj: Thank you for agreeing to take part in this interview at such short notice (laughter)
G: You’re welcome.
Aj: My first question is, how do trafficked children end up in the care of NGO’s and NPO’s who actually look after them?
G: Generally it’s by referral as prescribed in the Children’s Act, Sec. 110. The Children’s Act always says that people must report any kinds of abuse, neglect or exploitation and since trafficking is a category of exploitation, so they are obliged to report or generally children, if they want assistance they will come to the service providers.
Aj: Generally, how does the period of exploitation come to an end? Do they run away? Are they rescued by the police? Based on your statistics, how does the period of exploitation come to an end?
G: Well it’s the intervention of the social worker, where the social worker provides the necessary care and protection to the child, together with the child and the relevant care giver(s). The child goes through a process of counselling, psychosocial counselling and then the child’s basic needs are also met. You would find that with children who are trafficked, there is always a push and pull factor and we would look at that. An assessment is done on the circumstances of the child and we would look at what is the most presenting problem if the family cannot support the child and often the child is placed in alternative care. And that is how we render the services to the child and then ensure that the child is not exposed to those circumstances again.
Aj: How are the children identified as being trafficked? Is there a document that you use or what is the procedure you use on the ground?
G: Well for now, we are using the assessment tools to identify children who have been trafficked by the guidelines for the response and the prevention of child exploitation identifies, a specific identifying factors that will identify the child as being trafficked.
Aj: May I ask, when do you think the document might come into operation
G: By mid June, by mid-June this year.
Aj: And based on that document, who will be in charge of doing the identification? Is it the social worker? The police or anyone?
G: Well, it’s for all service, the social workers specifically but also the services will also extend to all social service professionals including police officers, because they must be able,
because if the child goes to the police station, the police must be able to identify that the child is a victim of trafficking or whatever.

Aj: And if for example identification takes place elsewhere, who is responsible for contacting the social worker?

G: It’s the person who identifies.

Aj: And generally how long does it take for the child to be brought to the social worker?

G: It just depends on the person who is reporting and the circumstances surrounding that and also the accessibility of the service point. The social worker will be at the service point. If the child is in a community and the community thinks that the child has been trafficked, then the community member can bring the child forward, but if the child is with a person that is preventing that person from bringing the child to the social worker then it is that person’s, that is, community members responsibility to report verbally to the social worker, who will then reach out to the child. So the process might be slightly different.

Aj: Sometimes when children have been placed at a place of safety, would you still consider them to be at risk?

G: Yes, they will still be at risk because when they, remember they have just been removed from a trafficker. Sometimes it’s like they are in debt bondage with the trafficker or they are addicted to substances or they are indoctrinated to believe that they belong to that person. So what happens is that they still have to bond with that person. That emotional, debt bond and as I said addicted to other substances. So they go back for that purpose. It’s like therapy has to be ongoing. Therapy has to be precise, accurate as well. The assessment has to be very accurate to assist the child. So there is always that element of, there is always an element of the child wanting to return to the trafficker.

Aj: And what kind of advice do you give to the social workers in terms of what precautions must the place of safety put in place?

G: Well, we are looking at enhancing the Child and Youth Care facilities. Well the place of safety is not under the ambit of the Child and Youth Care Centres and we have a person who is responsible for that and we are looking at programmes that will address children that are exploited, specifically children who are trafficked. So we are going to develop programmes for them, specifically targeting their issues in terms of security measures because if for any reason the child the risk factors are great. We know that this child is very close to the trafficker or that this child has access to the trafficker, then the security measures have to be put in place. We ensure that the child does not have access to a telephone, the child goes for relevant treatment in terms of substances or whatever is the presenting problem. Then we also
ensure that the child’s details are kept confidential. And simple things like the driver of the institution, if the driver is taking the child somewhere, not to inform anybody where he is taking the child to for example to the doctor or to school. Details of the child are kept secret and the movement of the child has to be kept secret. So these are the measures that will be put into place and programmes address them. So there is also going to be training and capacity building and as I said, also to look at how security measures can be enhanced.

Aj: Based on your interaction with the social workers on the ground, what have they reported to be some of the challenges with relation to identification of these children?

G: Because it is such a sublime type of activity, children present with other problems. When they come in, they present with other problems such as addiction to substances or a child that is commercially sexually exploited. They present with other problems. But when they come in, when there is intervention and assessment, therapy, counselling, then the social worker picks up that this child may also be trafficked. Also the other measure that has been put in place, in the previous question, is that we ensure that the visitation, if we establish who the parents are, we ensure that people who visit the child in the institution are screened and even thorough checking is undertaken with who the parents are, reasons for the child to be trafficked and also access from people outside to the child is controlled.

Aj: In terms of the assessment that is done, how involved is the child in the process?

G: Well our Children’s Act talks about child participation. It emphasizes the principle of child participation. So the child is involved in planning his or her life. The Individual Development Plan is drawn up with the child. The child participates in the planning process. And also the care plan is drawn up.

Aj: And the assessment is done by the social worker?

G: Yes or a psychologist if it is beyond social work control, a referral. There is always an inter-sectoral collaboration approach.

Aj: This could also be similar to a previous question. What are some of the challenges social workers face in terms of assistance provision to the children?

G: Well social workers are not so well trained in the phenomenon, lots of social workers. They are not trained because remember these children are exposed to the harshest conditions and the harshest environments when they are trafficked. So they are also, it is like a psychosocial kind of damage. So our social workers need to be trained to deal with these kinds of children and a trafficking child generally presents with multi-faceted problems. So social workers need to be trained how to deal with all these issues and keep the key issue as a focused issue.
Aj: In the past, how involved have you found the police officers or the immigration officials to be involved in this process?
G: Not really, not much.
Aj: And based on your inter-sectoral approach that you have spoken about, who do you normally collaborate with?
G: It’s the police, the Department of Home Affairs, Department of International Relations, embassies, the consulates, so that’s sectoral. Then there is the Department of Health if child is abused.
Aj: Just generally, what are the obstacles that face trafficked children in South Africa?
G: What is a big challenge is that we don’t have legislation in place, with the exception of Chapter 18 of the Children’s Act. When a child is identified as being trafficked, that child is still dealt with as a child in need of care and protection in terms of Sec. 150. There are no convictions of the perpetrator, statistics are not available, also training and capacity building needs to be enhanced for social workers. As I said, it’s a phenomenon that is growing fast and new to social workers and they need to be updated.
Aj: All these challenges that you have mentioned may affect the child directly or indirectly.
G: Yes, it does, but also the inter-sectoral collaboration, each person who is responsible for dealing with the child needs to know at what point to cut off and hand over especially a trafficked child. If the child, I will use an example, of being addicted to substances, then that child will be in a health care facility, mental health facility, whatever, rehab facility. Then the child, at that point service will be rendered to the child for that purpose. When the child has received that service, then the child can be handed over to social workers for another process to follow, for his or her care and protection. And then if there is a psychological problem, and then those are the key issues that need to be understood, who does what and at what level.
Aj: So how can the inter-sectoral collaboration be strengthened in South Africa?
G: With training and capacity building. If each person knows their roles and responsibilities, then we don’t have a problem.
Aj: Are there enough resources?
G: All resources, financial resources, structural resources because we don’t have Child and Youth Care Centres specifically focused for child who have been trafficked because they need to be in a particular environment even if you are running a support group for these children they need to be in a particular environment. Remember these children are going to a facility that has children with other problems and they require a lot of attention. Not that other children do not, but there is a different focus.
Aj: So would you recommend a Child and Youth Care Centre specifically for trafficked children?
G: Yeah, but not necessarily youth, but also children. That would be ideal. But in terms of financial constraints and whatever, that is going to be a problem.
Aj: One of the policies that you have mentioned, that still has not come into being, but do you think at the moment, the Children’s Act and the Sexual Offences Act are adequately addressing the needs of trafficked children in South Africa?
G: Yes, look at the end of the day, whatever you do, children will still be dealt with in terms of the Children’s Act even in the absence of other legislations; but the other legislation will strengthen the issue of consideration.
Aj: From a social work perspective, what do you think would be a best practice in terms of identification and assistance provision to these children?
G: In terms of best practices…
Aj: It could be something happening in South Africa, in another country or what you would envision to be a best practice in South Africa in the future.
G: For social workers to be able to identify immediately
Aj: like rapid identification?
G: Yes. Yes, and assistance, rapid responses, you know. Response to what the problem is and not looking at other problems because if a child is trafficked, you immediately need to remove that child from the risk factors and place the child elsewhere and deal with other issues that present. But not deal with other issues and then later identify that the child is trafficked. Because remember, irrespective of the child being dealt with in terms of the children’s court, there is also a criminal procedure that has to be undertaken, because the child needs to be brought, the child needs to be supported throughout the whole process and the if the child is trafficked from another country, then all other International Social Services need to, the roles and responsibilities of International Social Services need to, and then the child needs to be repatriated to country of origin or place of origin.
Aj: So, best practice can also be immediate referral
G: Ya
Aj: When appropriate
G: Yes
Aj: And to the appropriate referral organizations and people.
G: Yes. Yes. Yes.
Aj: In terms of creating a guidelines for social workers, similar to what you have worked on, what do you think must be there.

G: I think we need to look at the 4 levels of intervention that a social worker would use. Prevention and early intervention because we at all times want the children to remain with their parents but if we can look at it from a 2-fold effort, if the child has been trafficked and that level of intervention was not utilized, then we have to look at it as a preventative measure not for the child to be re-trafficked for the child not to be exposed to the same circumstances. Then we have to look at the statutory process, in terms of the child receiving the proper care and protection. The child going through the Children’s Court process. The child being placed in alternative care to ensure the child is safe and the necessary services rendered to the child and the reintegration process in terms of the child going to the parents and the child, for the parents capacity also to be strengthened as parents and also for them to take on their roles and responsibilities seriously in terms of protecting the child. But if their circumstances are presenting unfavourably, then we need to look at alternative care and then as we said other services that will support this, but I think as a way forward, we need to look at developing support group for these children. Because once a child is addicted to substances or is a child that is involved in child prostitution for example that child will always feel I can make more money out there. So if you strengthen services and you strengthen support structures, you know, then the child will, you desensitize those kinds of thinking and those kinds of behaviour.

Aj: And my last questions is what do you think could be the impact of a child being repatriated or reintegrated with their family when a proper assessment and assistance hasn’t been given?

G: Well that would be very dangerous. That would be subjecting a child to secondary abuse because if an assessment is not done properly, then you’re putting the child back into the same circumstances that the child was in and the child is gonna become a secondary victim. It may not necessarily be trafficking but then if the child is prostituting herself then the child might think this is an easy way to earn an income for their family if they have financial problems. You know poverty, unemployment, all these key issues will be key issues that will push the child out to earn more.

Aj: G, thank you very much but I’m just wondering if there is anything else that you think will be important for this research, but that which I haven’t asked you about, and you would like to share with me.
G: I think also you need to look at the child per se. We always focus on care and protection. We need to look at the emotional status of the child. We also need to look at the psychological care of the child, and also the physical care because we always place emphasis that irrespective of whether you are poor or rich, if the child has been trafficked, the child is a victim. But we also need to undo the status for that child. If we label the child and then the child sometimes becomes traumatized. So I think services. I think that is a long way which we need to reach a point where we empower these children to believe in themselves, to enhance their self-esteem, basically life coaching. You know, to strengthen their own capacities to fight against this kind of thing. So I think a step ahead would be not life orientation but life coaching.

Aj: And what advice would you give social workers who are working with this particular group of children?

G: I think they need to, social workers working with this group of children also need to be enhanced in their skills. They need to be seasoned social workers, mature social workers who are able to handle because if you have a very young social workers they will be very overwhelmed by the problems that present because these children when you interview them, you find that they talk about one issue, presenting with one issue and as you counsel them, they move to another issue. So they are very erratic in their thinking. They sometimes try to be, to mislead you in your counselling process, but if you are a seasoned social worker than you will be able to control that discussion. And lead it to the point that if you suspect as a social worker you’ll be able to identify with your experiential learning. You will be able to identify where the child is and how the child is responding too.

Aj: Thank you very much

G: You’re welcome.
APPENDIX L: Transcribed interview (Stakeholder)

Stakeholder 7

Aj: Thank you J for agreeing to take part in this interview and well just be talking about child trafficking in South Africa, with specific reference to children from across the border who have been trafficked into South Africa. My first question is, what are some of the major obstacles facing these children in South Africa today?

J: When they cross the border they are very well hidden, especially once they’re taken into the big city areas, so it’s very difficult to find these children and the second thing is we do come across allegations of police corruption and police inactivity that compromise the ability to, say if we can report of maybe child prostitution the police will go, they’ll do a raid, everybody will be taken to the police station, released and in a couple of days, everybody’s back where they were and there seems to be no in-depth investigations of where these people come from, how did they get there, and what kind of intervention definitely prevents us from helping those children effectively and dealing with the issue that they may actually have been trafficked

Aj: Do you think the current child protection policies that South Africa has could adequately deal with the child trafficking aspect in South Africa?

J: You know I think they do, even though our trafficking legislation hasn’t been passed. When you speak to prosecutors with experience they certainly see (interruption) they find ways of prosecuting even in the absence of our specialized legislation. The absence of specialized legislation is often used as an excuse for inactivity because it can be done and we can protect those children. What I think we really need though is resources. Our law and policy is, I think, not perfect, waiting for that trafficking legislation to be passed but it’s doable. Where we will fall down is in the training of service providers, the monitoring of their work to make sure that they’re actually doing what they’re supposed to properly and resources, you know, people who are able to provide the child friendly type services that these children needs.

Aj: And what do you think, though you’ve mentioned some of them, could be some of the obstacles in terms of children being able to access services in in South Africa?

J: Corruption. We come across a lot of allegations of police involvement in prostitution. Lack of interest. I think sometimes people feel quite overwhelmed by their jobs and lack of
resources to enable them to work well and that leads to a terrible loss of motivation and will. Lack of training, because training is essential. You got to have the knowledge of how to intervene and skills to intervene and resources, resource allocation. You know this country is very interesting. We have spoken so much about trafficking and this started 2 years before FIFA and we did a lot of public awareness programmes but resources did not follow and this is very problematic.

Aj: Do you think factors specific to the child, individual factors e.g. immigration status, the age could also impact?

J: Definitely. If they see service providers are being empathic, they would feel more able to approach services but definitely children fear to approach formal services because they anticipate being returned to where they come from (interruption) they fear being returned to where they come from and often although the circumstances of these children have been trafficked out of very difficult circumstances, it’s your very poor children who lack family support, care and love who are vulnerable to being trafficked in the first place. So some of these children do not want to go back to where they have come from. Secondly, the fear of punishment and also children don’t phone up our crisis lines and say I’ve been trafficked. They don’t really understand the concept of trafficking despite all the public awareness that happens in schools and communities. Children are most likely to phone us or adults with concern, they are not likely to phone us because they see a child in their immediate environment or the child is aware that they’re being exploited sexually, usually, but sometimes also for other reasons.

Aj: The organization that you work for, do you have a protocol that addresses child trafficking?

J: We do have a policy and we do have a protocol on these are the steps that should happen if we suspect trafficking or if we suspect any form of child exploitation. Our protocol although doesn’t often work because it demands an inter-sectoral response. And sometimes the system is quite rigid. I’ll give you an example. We had at least 10 calls from a hotel manager in the Durban point area, reporting that in the building next to his hotel children are being prostituted. Ok. We have no idea where these children come from. We have no idea how many are indeed children or young adults because it requires someone to go into that building and start to investigate properly, interviewing each person, each child. So we suspect that a number of them could be trafficked children (interruption) So this is exactly what happens.
We report it, the police go in, they do a raid, having chased everybody out of the hotel, they go away, maybe take a few people with them. The very next day everybody is back there and it’s the same story again. So I then contacted the public prosecutor in Durban who is part of the Scorpions and said to her, specializing in trafficking, what do we do about this? So she consulted with her network and came back to me and said no, here is the name of the police officer who deal with trafficking, so I could get hold of him or her, who says you must report to the local police station and they’ll refer it to me. Well that’s what we’ve been doing all along and nothing’s happened so far you kind of hit an impasse, a dead end. In terms of your protocol, the police protocol, it just doesn’t work for children. You need someone who is pro-active enough to go in and do the job properly and it needs to come from higher up the ladder. It’s no use the local child protection unit saying report to your nearest SAPS and they’ll investigate it. It hasn’t happened in that 10 times.

Aj: How might this fragmentation actually impact on the child who has been trafficked?

J: The child just stays trafficked and exploited. There’s no rescuing of the child. There’s no service delivery to the child. There’s no identification of the child as even a trafficked child. Maybe some of the children there are not trafficked children but we’ll never know until someone goes in there and does a proper investigation.

Aj: So based on your inter-sectoral response, are there several actors that ideally should be part of the process?

J: Indeed. Indeed. There are. Then, to mention something else as well. Sometimes police identify a particular area and they do a raid, that’s carefully planned from their point of view, but there’s no planning on where will they take children if children are found to be there and picked up. It’s kind of a very ad hoc arrangement. They find we enter this brothel, we suspected there were trafficked people and we didn’t anticipate that 6 of them might be children. So suddenly they have 6 children at the police station and nowhere to take them because they haven’t prepared any service provider to stand by to receive those children. And you see the raids in the brothels happen at night, so you can’t say Child Welfare, we’ll take these children to Child Welfare because for those children, Child Welfare is closed. What they need to do is to involve service providers in the NGO sector who are able to provide care to those children, get them standing by overnight. Again, that takes resources so unless there’s inter-sectoral funding for a service like this, it’s very difficult to make it happen. Fortunately, many shelters do accept children under these circumstances and are prepared to do this on an
ad hoc basis without necessarily having to pay their staff. Staff in many NGO’s that we interact with are so committed that they’ll do that, but ideally we should be able to say that we’ve got resources for these kind of services and therefore we’ll do it.

Aj: A follow up question is, when you explore with the police, what reasons do they give you in terms of not involving the service providers? Do they think it’ll compromise their plans, raids

J: There’s a lack of trust which is quite interesting and often these raids are planned very secretly but interestingly enough in our experience, the compromising of the details of the raid doesn’t come from the NGO sector, it comes from within the police themselves and we were once involved in a police raid that was well planned and the NGO sector was very involved because they did anticipate that they would pick up a large number of children and so we went in with the police to help identify who possibly could be children in this situation. One of the children then said to us. You see initially plain clothes policemen went in and mingled with the clients before a little period before the raid happened. One of the children said to us that as soon as these people came in even if they were not in police uniform, we knew we were about to be raided because some of them are our clients. Ok. So we heard that out of a child’s mouth, nothing came of that. We report back on what children say to us, as far as we know, that’s where it stops.

Aj: With regards to assistance, care and protection, once a child has been identified as being trafficked, what ideally should be the next step? Let’s back track, at the moment there’s a contention about who should do the identification. Based on your experience and from your organization, who is best placed to actually do identification?

J: I think you need very skilled interviewers to do, to collect the information out of children. An interviewer who understands adolescents because most of the children are adolescents and the fear and panic that many of them experience is because many of them have been threatened. I can remember 1 girl saying to me once, I was told that if I ever talked about what happened, where I am from now and the situation I’m now in the guy who was head of this illegal trafficking ring would come and throw acid in my face and I’d be burned and scarred for life. Big fear if you’re an adolescent because obviously you know looks are critically important at that age. So I think one really needs partnerships in which police can really bring in people who actually know how to talk to adolescents and adolescents who feel that their backs are on the wall and they’re really frightened. I also think that their needs to be
acknowledged. That many of these children disclose in process so you need to build up a relationship with some degree of trust before a child will tell you everything. So you can’t do an assessment in 1 hour or 2 hours, you need an ongoing relationship with that child. So the assessment needs to begin from the point at which the child is picked up, but the child then needs to be placed in a safe and secure environment in which the child actually feels safe and secure. That is not always easy because these children are often told that wherever you are I’ll find you. I’ll find you, but placing a child in a safe and secure environment as quickly as possible is necessary and then providing that child with also some basic stuff that enables that child to feel that this is a place in which I’ll be cared for, protected and nurtured. You know when these raids happen, the child has no clothes, no toiletries, none of the things that make a person feel I’m valued like a human being and even when children are involved in domestic labour, sexual abuse or exploitation once they have been trafficked there are some personal possessions that they hold dear and often when there are raids, these are left behind. Perhaps that’s another thing, when the police do raids and the child is questioned, we should find out a little a bit about where are the child’s possessions and try and retrieve them because children in this situation definitely need what we call a transitional object. Things that they hold dear, that perhaps have been with them for a while, that if it goes with the child into the care situation, it helps the child feel connected to something, gives a sense of maybe not permanence but has a meaning for them. So I think those are the beginning issues with these children.

Aj: And what could be potentially problematic if this initial assistance isn’t provided especially in those critical moments?

J: The child will just run back. They will just run away. The level of abscondments of children taken out of prostitution into care is extremely high and that totally destroys the police case. A lot of the children run back to where they were being exploited because they know nothing else, which is very well to say why did they go back? It’s the only life they know. Many of the children are drug addicted, so for some of them, there’s a need to get the substance. So I mean it would be an interesting piece of research in itself, to ask police who do trafficking, how many of the witnesses that are important for the cases actually disappear again and where do the police think they go
Aj: And linked to that, what has been in the media is children who potentially have been trafficked are actually being taken back home as soon as possible. How might this impact on a child if proper assistance and care is not given?

J: Indeed, and this is something, often those kids are labeled negatively and often most kids who’re vulnerable to trafficking are the children who are not happy at home. Either because of serious poverty, and deprivation or perhaps because there’s family violence or perhaps because of some of the typical issues associated with adolescents are not being dealt with appropriately. Adolescents is a time when children challenge boundaries and many parents find that very difficult to deal with and sometimes children run, so it’s children who abscond who’re particularly vulnerable to being picked up and taken somewhere where they are going to be exploited. So you can’t place a child at home without service. One needs to assess what is the home environment, what was the situation when the child left home, was this child abducted, was the child in some kind of trouble at home, did this child abscond, what were the reasons and one has to begin a process of service to that family, look at what de-stabilized this family in the first place. To put a child back home, without looking at the history and expect the family to cope is just ridiculous. It’s asking the child to run away again.

Aj: So we’re actually putting the child at greater risk and more vulnerability

J: We’re maintaining their vulnerability, so parents, the caregivers, the child all need some kind of counseling service which unpacks the issues that contributed to the child being trafficked. Obviously if the parent has been involved in the act of trafficking itself I don’t think the child should go home without a very careful assessment of the situation. Look, sometimes it’s not intentional, sometimes someone will approach the family and say I can see you’re battling I’ve got a good job for your daughter and the parent gives up that child because they think this will be a better life for my child but it’s not. So one needs to look at what made the child vulnerable in the first place.

Aj: previously you spoke about an inter-sectoral response, which is what has been adopted by most European countries in terms of the NRM’s which help in the identification and quick referral and assistance to victims of trafficking. How do you think the system can be strengthened in South Africa?

J: I think we also need inter-sectoral committees, at provincial and local levels. National inter-sectoral committees can determine policies and procedure and strategy but they cannot
without being there actually provide service on the ground and so if there’s an inter-sectoral committee it has to be at the level at which trafficking is experienced and this is the problem, if you look at the SOA at the moment, there’s an inter-sectoral committee. It consists of only 5 governmental departments, the CSO’s are totally excluded from that committee and because they are excluded from that committee, they can’t participate in setting up the protocols, discussing their experiences and strategies around sexual offences. It’s ludicrous and it’s interesting that the DoJ when it comes to sexual offences and a lot of trafficking centres around sexual offences, just hasn’t included CSO’s in their inter-sectoral strategy in sexual offences infact CSO’s were excluded from the SOA as role player in the inter-sectoral committee

Aj: According to you, what is justice for a child who has been trafficked?

J: Well in our experience, very little justice! But ideally it would be important to offer that child the kind of service that enables that child to move into a different pattern of living and prepare for adulthood in such a way that they can be well functioning adults in the society and make a contribution to society and this is where we fail. We fail in service provision for these children

Aj: What are some of the best practice responses in terms of identification of child victims?

J: Identification of victims and service provision, an inter-sectoral response, using people with the appropriate skills for the task at hand. So if you want to prosecute the case, a good prosecutor, if you want to offer the child services, then an organization that offer the services with skilled staff who know how to work with adolescents, who are different because these kids are different. They have gone through a lot of stuff it’s not an easy ride. So you need people who’re used to working with adolescents who have behaviour, emotional, psychosocial challenges

Aj: In terms of creating an effective guideline for social workers, what do you think are some of the key things that should be included in the guideline?

J: one, know how to work inter-sectorally. So know your own role but also know the role of others and how you fit in the jigsaw puzzle, because it is a little bit like that, every piece has its place in the picture and it’s pointless just looking at social workers role unless we understand how that interlocks with others. Two, those social workers must be supported. They must be well mentored, well trained, their activities monitored. They are very vulnerable
dealing with a very difficult issue. I mean sexual abuse of children tears at your heart and although we say these are professional people and they should know how to cope, they need support because some of the stories are extremely difficult to listen to and some of the experiences of these children can’t help but touch you, you should be able to relate to them and that involves the use of the self not just the use of technical ways of interacting with children. They must have a very good understanding of adolescents behaviour and working with adolescents with challenges. They must have a very good understanding on how working that child must not compromise the legal processes underway. Somewhere in this country we still have those very old fashioned prosecution who still believe that therapy with the child should not continue until the court cases is finished. That’s absolutely nonsense and totally contrary to the ethos of our Constitution which says the child’s best interest must come first and in actual fact therapy with the child (interruption) are we nearly finished?

Aj: Thank you J, if you remember something else

J: You know something that we haven’t spoken about which is really important is trafficking of children for their body parts. We’ve got a whole report on that which I’ll send you on our research there. We did a research with the human rights Foundation in Mozambique and we have 2 reports that I think are important for you to read for the purpose of this study.

Aj: Is it possible for you to email me your protocol on suspecting that a child has been trafficked

J: Ya, thanks

Aj: Thank you very much.
APPENDIX M: Example of collage by child
## APPENDIX N: Detailed profile of child participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age (now)</th>
<th>Siphiwe</th>
<th>Promise</th>
<th>Anna</th>
<th>Ben</th>
<th>Sibusiso</th>
<th>Maradona</th>
<th>Tavas</th>
<th>Shakira</th>
<th>Privilege</th>
<th>Doria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

|-------------|--------|----------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|----------------|----------------|

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal status</th>
<th>Refugee</th>
<th>Outcome pending</th>
<th>Outcome pending</th>
<th>Outcome pending</th>
<th>Outcome pending</th>
<th>Refugee</th>
<th>Outcome pending</th>
<th>Refugee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home country</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Moz</th>
<th>Malawi</th>
<th>Zim</th>
<th>DRC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SA arrival</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trafficker</th>
<th>Father</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Father</th>
<th>Father</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Sister</th>
<th>Uncle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exploiter</th>
<th>Relatives</th>
<th>Rescued at ‘sale’</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Father’s friend</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Stranger</th>
<th>Relatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

|--------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How rescued</th>
<th>Escaped/ Community members</th>
<th>Community members/ Social worker</th>
<th>Community members/ Police</th>
<th>Escaped/ Community members</th>
<th>Community/ members/ Police</th>
<th>Social worker</th>
<th>Police</th>
<th>Community members</th>
<th>Living on streets</th>
<th>Community members</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guardian</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
<th>Place of Safety</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current grade</th>
<th>College</th>
<th>Grade 6</th>
<th>Informal</th>
<th>Grade 7</th>
<th>Grade 7</th>
<th>Grade 7</th>
<th>Grade 11</th>
<th>Informal</th>
<th>Grade 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language spoken</th>
<th>Zulu</th>
<th>Swati</th>
<th>Shangaan</th>
<th>Swati</th>
<th>Swati</th>
<th>Shangaan</th>
<th>Swati</th>
<th>Shangaan</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Shona</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

- Zulu
- Swati
- Shangaan
- English
- Shona
- English
- Chichewa
- Sotho
- Lingala
- French
APPENDIX O: Evaluation Form

EVALUATION OF PSYCHOSOCIAL GUIDELINES

Childhood is a precious and delicate stage of development, yet child trafficking steals children’s rights. The purpose of this questionnaire is to evaluate the Psychosocial Intervention Guidelines for Social Workers Working with Child Victims of Trafficking. The information you provide will be used to improve the content of the guideline. Kindly mark the appropriate block using “X” and provide written comments.

1. Will the guidelines lead to desired outcomes for trafficked children?
   Yes [ ] No [ ] Unsure [ ]

Comment:

2. Can the guidelines be implemented without excessive investment on the social worker’s time?
   Yes [ ] No [ ] Unsure [ ]

Comment:

3. Were the sources of information used to develop the guidelines valid and credible?
   Yes [ ] No [ ] Unsure [ ]

Comment:
4. Are the techniques in the guidelines described in a manner that will enable social workers intervene appropriately with trafficked children?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................

........................................................................................................................................

5. With your background in social work, are the details provided within the guidelines explicit enough for social workers in practice?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................

........................................................................................................................................

6. Does the guideline protect the rights of trafficked children in South Africa?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................

........................................................................................................................................

7. Would the guidelines contribute towards rapid identification of and initial assistance provision to child victims of trafficking in South Africa?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................

........................................................................................................................................

8. Is the guideline complex in any area(s)?

Yes  No  Unsure
9. Can a social worker easily modify the guidelines to suit their jurisdiction without the guideline losing its fundamental character?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

10. Can the guideline be used with core social work intervention processes namely micro, meso and/or macro practice?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

11. Can the guideline be used with limited or no expenses at all?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

12. Can the guideline be introduced and maintained with the existing financial and human resources at your organization?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

..................................................
13. Does the guideline accommodate the diverse range of trafficked children?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

14. Can the guideline be aligned to South Africa’s child protection legislation?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

15. Are the definitions provided on the glossary of terms adequate?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

16. Are you generally satisfied with the guideline?

Yes  No  Unsure

Comment:

Further suggestions:
Thank you for taking your time and filling in the evaluation form.

Ajwang’ Warria
PhD Candidate: University of Johannesburg
APPENDIX P: Participant information letter (Social workers)

13th June 2013

For Attention: (Name of Social Worker), (Name of Organization)

RE: REQUEST FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPATION

I would like to request you to evaluate a guideline document for social workers that I developed as part of my PhD study. The study was approved by the University of Johannesburg’s Ethics Committee and all ethical procedures with regard to conducting research will be adhered to at all times.

The purpose of the PhD study is to develop intervention guidelines for social workers working with children who have been trafficked, with specific reference to rapid identification and immediate assistance provision (attached). The guideline evaluation period is bound to take place from 10th-20th June 2013, with 10 registered social workers. The questions asked in the evaluation questionnaire are intended to seek information about usability of the guideline. The recommendations from the social workers will go a long way in ensuring that the guideline document is user-friendly and implementable within social work. Kindly fill in the consent form (attached) and the questionnaire (attached) and send me your comments on or by 19th June 2013.

The names of organizations and social workers participating in the research will remain anonymized. Participation in the research study is voluntary and participants may withdraw from the study at any time. Should you have further questions, I may be contacted on 072 930 0640 (cell) or awarria@gmail.com (email). The research is being supervised by Prof. Nel (Email: hannan@uj.ac.za) and Prof. Triegaardt (Email: jeant@uj.ac.za) of the Department of Social Work at the University of Johannesburg.

Thanking you in advance for your assistance with this project.

Yours Faithfully,
Ajwang’ Warria.
PhD Candidate.
APPENDIX Q: Consent Form (Pilot testing guidelines)

CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPATING IN THE STUDY

I, .................................................. (insert name) hereby consent to participate in the research project on child trafficking. The purpose and procedures of the study have been explained to me. I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I may refuse to answer any particular items on the evaluation questionnaire. In addition, I may withdraw from the study at any time without any negative consequences. I understand that my responses will be kept confidential at all times.

Name of participant: .................................................................
Date: 20[Redacted]
Signature: .................................................................

Name of researcher: ..................................................
Date: 04[Redacted]
Signature: .................................................................
APPENDIX R: Evaluation response (social worker)

EVALUATION OF PSYCHOSOCIAL GUIDELINES

Childhood is a precious and delicate stage of development, yet child trafficking steals children’s rights. The purpose of this questionnaire is to evaluate the Psychosocial Intervention Guidelines for Social Workers Working with Child Victims of Trafficking. The information you provide will be used to improve the content of the guideline. Kindly mark the appropriate block using “X” and provide written comments.

1. Will the guidelines lead to desired outcomes for trafficked children?
   Yes [ ] No [X] Unsure [ ]

Comment:
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................

2. Can the guidelines be implemented without excessive investment on the social worker’s time?
   Yes [ ] No [X] Unsure [ ]

Comment:
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................

3. Were the sources of information used to develop the guidelines valid and credible?
   Yes [ ] No [X] Unsure [ ]

Comment:
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................................................................
4. Are the techniques in the guidelines described in a manner that will enable social workers intervene appropriately with trafficked children?

Yes ☒ No Unsure

Comment: 

5. With your background in social work, are the details provided within the guidelines explicit enough for social workers in practice?

Yes ☒ No Unsure

Comment: 

6. Does the guideline protect the rights of trafficked children in South Africa?

Yes ☒ No Unsure

Comment: 

7. Would the guidelines contribute towards rapid identification of and initial assistance provision to child victims of trafficking in South Africa?

Yes ☒ No Unsure

Comment: 


8. Is the guideline complex in any area(s)?

Yes  No  X  Unsure

Comment:
The small print is however difficult to read.

9. Can a social worker easily modify the guidelines to suit their jurisdiction without the guideline losing its fundamental character?

Yes  No  Unsure  X

Comment:
The guideline will be useful for SA, but in other countries their child protection and statutory requirements might be different.

10. Can the guideline be used with core social work intervention processes namely micro, meso and/or macro practice?

Yes  X  No  Unsure

Comment:

11. Can the guideline be used with limited or no expenses at all?

Yes  X  No  Unsure

Comment:

---

413
12. Can the guideline be introduced and maintained with the existing financial and human resources at your organization?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

13. Does the guideline accommodate the diverse range of trafficked children?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

14. Can the guideline be aligned to South Africa’s child protection legislation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

15. Are the definitions provided on the glossary of terms adequate?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

but...

Comment:

**Definition of child:** a person under 18 years

Remove: unless otherwise specified! This is a very important definition and should be in line with

16. Are you generally satisfied with the guideline?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Comment:
Very broad consultations contributed to a very useful guideline. You are also commended for exploring the views of trafficked children.

Further suggestions:
Page 28 of Guideline – Please add International Social Services (ISS) under International Organizations.

Thank you for taking your time and filling in the evaluation form.

Ajwang’ Warria
PhD Candidate: University of Johannesburg

Thanks, Ajwang, I think this is good work that will make a difference in service delivery to victims of trafficking in SA and even in the Southern African region.
CHILD TRAFFICKING
PSYCHOSOCIAL
INTERVENTION GUIDELINES
FOR SOCIAL WORKERS
Ajwang Warria
“Our children are our greatest treasure. They are our future. Those who abuse them tear at the fabric of our society and weaken our nation.”

NELSON MANDELA
CONTENTS

List of Acronyms 5
Glossary of Terms 7

1. INTRODUCTION 11
1.1 Background of the guidelines
1.2 Rationale for the guidelines
1.3 Objectives of the guidelines
1.4 Guiding principles
1.5 Research methodology

2. SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS 13

3. LEGAL FRAMEWORK 15

4. GUIDELINES FOR RAPID IDENTIFICATION 17

5. GUIDELINES FOR REFERRAL 19

6. GUIDELINES FOR INITIAL ASSISTANCE 21
6.1 Guidelines for social work assessment
6.2 Guidelines for immediate care and protection of the child
6.3 Guidelines for statutory intervention
6.4 Guidelines for initial trauma assistance
6.5 Guidelines for establishing a social work healing relationship

7. CONCLUSION 26
Annexures 27
“Our children are our greatest treasure. They are our future. Those who abuse them tear at the fabric of our society and weaken our nation.”

NELSON MANDELA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACRWC</td>
<td>African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoHA</td>
<td>Department of Home Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOJCD</td>
<td>Department of Justice and Constitutional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>Department of Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>International Social Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACSSP</td>
<td>South African Council for Social Services Professions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPS</td>
<td>South African Police Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiP</td>
<td>Trafficking-in-persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCRC</td>
<td>United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children's Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“There can be no keener revelation of a society’s soul than the way in which it treats its children.”

NELSON MANDELA
Abuse in relation to a child, means any form of harm or ill-treatment deliberately inflicted on a child, and includes, but it is not limited to the following:

(a) assaulting a child or inflicting any form of deliberate injury to a child;

(b) sexually abusing a child or allowing a child to be sexually abused;

(c) bullying by another child;

(d) a labour practice that exploits a child; or

(e) exposing or subjecting a child to behavior that may harm the child psychologically or emotionally.

Abuse of Vulnerability, means any abuse that leads a person to believe that he or she has no reasonable alternative but to submit to exploitation, and includes but is not limited to, taking advantage of the vulnerabilities of that person resulting from:

(a) the person having entered or remained in the Republic illegally or without proper documentation;

(b) pregnancy;

(c) any disability of the person;

(d) addiction to the use of any dependence-producing substance;

(e) being a child;

(f) social circumstances; or

(g) economic circumstances

Assessment of Child means a process of investigating the developmental needs of a child, including his or her family environment or any other circumstances that may have a bearing on the child’s need for protection and therapeutic services.

Assistance Provisions are measures put in place to promote victims development, to aid them with recovery and healing, and to limit future vulnerabilities.

Child means a person under the age of 18.
**Child labour** means work by a child which-

(a) is exploitative, hazardous or otherwise inappropriate for a person of that age; and

(b) places at risk the child’s well-being, education, physical or mental health, or spiritual, moral, emotional or social development.

**Commercial Sexual Exploitation** in relation to a child, means-

(a) the procurement of a child to perform sexual activities for financial or other reward, including acts of prostitution or pornography, irrespective of whether that reward is claimed by, payable to or shared with the procurer, the child, the parent or care-giver of the child, or any other person; or

(b) trafficking in a child for the use in sexual activities, including prostitution or pornography.

**Designated Child Protection Organization** means an organization designated in terms of section 107 to perform designated child protection services.

**Designated Social Worker** means a social worker in the service of-

(a) the department or a provincial department of social development;

(b) a designated child protection organization; or

(c) a municipality.

**Exploitation** in relation to a child, includes but is not limited to:

(a) all forms of slavery or practices similar to slavery, including debt bondage or forced marriage;

(b) sexual exploitation;

(c) servitude;

(d) forced labour or services;

(e) child labour prohibited in terms of section 141; and

(f) the removal of body parts.

**Guardian** means a parent or another person who has guardianship of a child.

**Identification** means using established region-specific human trafficking indicators and pre-determined set questions to ascertain whether a child is a victim of trafficking or not.

**Referral** is a mechanism used to ensure that a child victim of trafficking receives an appropriate and timely protection, care and support.

**Referral system** is a support network of agencies and individuals which has been specifically created to provide support and services.

**Social worker** means a person who is registered or deemed to be registered as a social worker in terms of the Social Service Professions Act (Act 110 of 1978).

**Statutory Intervention** involves legal processes and services aimed at securing the safety and welfare of children who have been harmed or are at risk of being harmed, as prescribed in national legislation.

**Trafficker** is a person who engages in trafficking of children, whether related to the child or not.
**Trafficking In Persons** Any person who delivers, recruits, transports, transfers, harbours, sells, exchanges, leases or receives another person within or across the borders of the Republic, by means of-

(a) a threat of harm;

(b) the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion;

(c) the abuse of vulnerability:

(d) fraud;

(e) deception;

(f) abduction;

(g) kidnapping;

(h) the abuse of power;

(i) the direct or indirect giving or receiving of payments or benefits to obtain the consent of a person having control or authority over another person; or

(j) the direct or indirect giving or receiving of payment, compensation, rewards, benefits or any other advantage, aimed at either the person or an immediate family member of that person or any other person in close relationship to that person, for the purpose of any form or manner of exploitation, is guilty of the offence of trafficking in persons.

Any person who-

(a) adopts a child, facilitated or secured through legal or illegal means; or

(b) concludes a forced marriage with another person

within or across the borders of the Republic, for the purpose of the exploitation of that child or other person in any form or manner, is guilty of an offence.
“Our children are our greatest treasure. They are our future. Those who abuse them tear at the fabric of our society and weaken our nation.”

NELSON MANDELA
1.1 Background Of And Rationale For The Guideline

Trafficking in children for whatever purpose, sexual or labour exploitation or for child pornography or prostitution, is a despicable crime in South Africa. The ever growing burden of child trafficking, worldwide and in South Africa, demands that effective and efficient interventions are designed and put into practice to reduce psychosocial challenges and inequalities. The guidelines presented are an attempt to establish minimum standards for practice in social work intervention with respect to rapid identification of and immediate initial assistance to trafficked children in South Africa.

The aim of this guideline is to recommend social work practice components and strategies that will assist social workers activities to be focused, sequential, systematic and more orderly when engaging with trafficked children. However, caution must be taken when using the guidelines and it ought to be noted that these guidelines do not substitute the rigorous professional social work assessment, evaluation and decision-making processes that must be done on each case that presents to the social worker.

1.2 Objectives Of The Guidelines

The objectives of this guideline are:

i) to sensitize and to build capacity of social workers on the issue of child trafficking
ii) to inform social work identification, referral and assistance provision to trafficked children in South Africa
iii) to inform social work, child protection and trafficking policies in South Africa
iv) to help social workers see their role in relation to the network of service providers who deal with child trafficking

1.3 Guiding Principles

The guiding principles to be taken into account when social workers engage with trafficked children in South Africa include:

i) Child-rights approach (incorporating best interests of the child, non-discrimination, confidentiality and child participation);
ii) Victim-centred approach;
iii) Holistic approach; and
iv) Evidence-based approach

These will be complemented by the South African social work ethical principles of:

i) Social justice;
ii) Respect for people’s worth, human rights and dignity;
iii) Competence;
iv) Integrity;
v) Professional responsibility;
vi) Care and concern for others; and
vii) Service delivery.
1.4 Research Methodology

These guidelines are a culmination of a consultative process which included facilitating interviews and discussions with key informants from international, regional and South African child protection and human trafficking agencies. In addition, social workers from CSOs, NGO’s and government entities, who have worked or are currently working with trafficked children, were interviewed as well. In addition, child participation was encouraged and the guideline was informed by meanings that trafficked children attach to their trafficking and service provision experiences. Thus, trafficked children were also interviewed so that their voices can be heard. In this way, they became active participants and these experiences were an essential basis for the development of genuine child-centred child trafficking guidelines. Finally, the content of this guideline was also drawn from a range of international, regional and South African human trafficking, child protection and human/child rights conventions, documents and reports.

An analysis of the guideline’s legal framework was presented and shared with peers and international academics at a Migration-themed workshop in Norway. The preliminary findings from the trafficked children’s narratives were presented at a Child Abuse and Neglect Conference in Turkey. Finally, South African based registered social workers working in the field of child protection and human/child trafficking were invited to share comments on the draft guidelines.
Child trafficking is a multiple-human rights violation and a global public health and social issue. In Africa, it is a phenomenon embedded in socio-economic dynamics, which overlaps with smuggling, refugeeism, prostitution and child labour, making it a complex social development challenge with varied manifestations. Although the exact numbers and demographics of children trafficked in, out of and into South Africa is unknown, reports reveal that 60% of trafficking victims in South Africa are children. It is generally understood and widely reported that trafficking patterns in Africa run from north of Africa to the south, with countries in Central, East and West Africa being referred to as countries of origin whereas the ones in the South are regarded as transit or destination countries. Children from Mozambique, Swaziland and Lesotho have also been known to be exploited on farms in the Free State, Mpumalanga and Limpopo provinces.

South Africa is a country of origin, transit and destination. Successful prosecution rates have always remained very low, especially given the fact that South Africa had no legislation addressing the crime of trafficking. However, in July 2013, South Africa introduced the Trafficking Act to prevent and combat human trafficking, although no prosecution cases have been reported on to-date. This places great responsibility on the country to introduce measures to counter the growing trends of trafficking. South Africa continues to be placed on Tier 2 on the 2013 US TIP Report for the fourth year in a row. This means that the South African government does not fully comply with minimum standards, but it is making significant efforts towards compliance.

The exact number of children trafficked in, out of and into South Africa is unknown. Further research has failed to produce any comprehensive insight and statistics of South Africans being trafficked. However, that does not mean that South African children are not trafficked and/ or that children are not trafficked into South Africa. Molo Songololo, Amazing Grace and ANEX-CDW are three South African child protection organizations which have extensively reported on and worked with child victims of trafficking within South Africa. Anecdotal reports indicate young girls are sold as mail-order brides and that children are sold into gangs or for illegal adoption. Unconfirmed reports indicate that corpses of children are being used to conceal narcotics and bodies shipped to destination countries where the child holds citizenship.

The findings from studies on human trafficking in South Africa report that child victims are of both genders, with a majority being trafficked to South Africa for sexual and labour exploitation. The studies acknowledge that half of the child victims had been abducted whereas the rest were recruited with false promises of employment, marriage and education. This shows
that socio-economic factors play a role in trafficked children’s vulnerability. Minor studies conducted in South Africa have
addressed the role of the social worker in prevention of child trafficking, vulnerabilities surrounding migrant children, general
aspects of child trafficking, trafficking for sexual exploitation and trafficking-related legislation and child protection policies.

Child victims of trafficking are subjected to the same harmful treatment as adults during the different stages of trafficking.
Therefore, their age makes them more vulnerable to the harmful consequences of the abusive exploitative practices. The possible
signs of child trafficking are listed below:

- Evidence of abuse (physical, mental, emotional, financial or sexual);
- Lack of documents because employer has confiscated and is withholding identity and or travel document(s);
- The travel document might have an expired visa;
- Engaging in work not suitable for children and working for unusually long hours;
- Physical and sexual injuries appear to result from control and forceful measures;
- The child being fearful of revealing immigration status;
- The child cannot and is not allowed to speak on their own behalf;
- Being unpaid or being paid very little or another party having control of the victim’s money;
- Absence from school or showing significant gaps in schooling;
- Being forced to work against will, and/or under inhumane, slave-like conditions;
- The child being found in a location that is synonymous with trafficking;
- Living at the workplace or with an employer;
- No time for playing or to play with peers;
- Living with multiple persons who are not related to the child;
- The child exhibiting behaviour or evidence of being controlled or any other person being in control of the child;
- Evidence of an inability to move or freely leave a “job”;
- Substance abuse and dependency;
- The child has a heightened sense of fear and distrust for authority;
- Childhood depression signs and age-inappropriate behaviours and responses;
- The child’s inability to speak local languages or engage with culture in the work environment;
- The child is under perception that (s)he is bonded by culture or inexplicable debt;
- Isolation of children from family members, peers, friends and members of their ethnic/ national and religious
  communities;
- The child has no or limited access to parents or caregivers;
- The use or threat of violence towards victims and or families of victims;
- Threats of shaming victims by exposing their situation to family or community;
- Victims being threatened with imprisonment or deportation for immigration violations if they contact authorities;
- The child is not willing to cooperate e.g. providing incorrect information;
- The child has entered the country illegally;
- The child is registered at a number of different addresses;
- The child is unable to confirm the name and address of the person who is meeting them on arrival;
- The child has had the trip or visa arranged by someone other than their family;
- The child exhibits self-assurance, maturity and self-confidence not expected of a child their age;
- The child works in various locations.

The above-mentioned list is not exhaustive and exceptions exist because of the nature of child trafficking i.e. it is ever changing,
it manifests differently in different regions and the indicators might be influenced by the ultimate purpose of exploitation. It
is essential that the generalized factors mentioned above are not looked at in isolation because an incorrect identification or
misclassification might be reached.

Without a doubt, children victimized by trafficking have had their psychological, spiritual, cultural and social development stolen
which they would have otherwise enjoyed had it not been for the exploitation. They experience neglect, physical, emotional
and sexual abuse and are deprived of typical developmental needs of education, care, affection and safety. Furthermore, though
the trafficked victims feel the direct impact, it is worth noting that the effects of trafficking also extend to the child’s family,
community and country.
The framework of laws, policies, plans and strategies against child trafficking exists at three (3) levels, namely: multilateral, regional and national.

The international frameworks guiding counter-trafficking efforts in South Africa include:

i) The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (1989);
ii) The Optional Protocol to the UNCRC on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography (2000);
iii) The United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (1998);
iv) The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Crime (2000) also known as the UN Trafficking or Palermo Protocol;
v) The ILO Convention No. 182 concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (1999);
vii) The Women’s Protocol;
viii) The Hague Convention on the Protection of Children and Cooperation in respect of Inter-country Adoptions (1993);
ix) The Ouagadougou Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings, especially Women and Children (2006); and

South Africa’s legal response to child trafficking is in the context of ratification of the international conventions and as a signatory to the regional instruments below:

iii) The Ouagadougou Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings, especially Women and Children (2006);
and
These regional frameworks take cognisance of the socio-cultural and economic realities particular to Africa such as challenging traditional African perspectives which are often in conflict with children's rights. However, these documents highly recognize and acknowledge the child’s unique and privileged place in African communities as requiring protection and special care.

In South Africa, national criminal laws are supplemented by various labour and child protection laws to counter trafficking and protect child victims of trafficking, such as:

i)  The Constitution of South Africa (1996);

ii) Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act (32) of 2007; and


This guideline is set to complement the South African Exploitation Strategy and The South African Guidelines on the Prevention and Responses to Child Exploitation policy documents (DSD, Forthcoming) and the Information Guide on the Management of Statutory Services in Terms of the Children’s Act 38 of 2005 (2013). In addition, the guideline must be read in conjunction with the Children’s Act (2005 as amended), regulations, and norms and standards for child protection and the recently passed Prevention and Combating Trafficking in Persons Act (2013).
GUIDELINES FOR IDENTIFICATION

i) The means used in trafficking do not form part of the definition of child trafficking.

ii) The consent of the child to being trafficked is not relevant to their identification as a victim of trafficking.

iii) Identification should not be determined by the arrest, conviction or prosecution of traffickers and/or exploiters.

iv) Identification should not be dependent on the child’s willingness to assist the police with investigations.

v) Identification needs to respond to local trafficking trends and patterns.

vi) Identification should not jeopardize the child’s chances of applying for and securing asylum.

vii) Identification should take cognizance of the child’s characteristics, the trafficking experiences and other factors that might hinder the identification process.

viii) The nationality of the child and their immigration status should not affect the identification process and/or the subsequent social work statutory intervention.

ix) Trafficked children should not be held in detention centres or holding cells, unless for their immediate physical protection, for the shortest time possible and it should be proven that reasonable alternative protection was lacking.

x) Trafficked children should not be arrested, detained, imprisoned or prosecuted for offences they may have committed as a result of trafficking. This places blame on the victim, it enhances the trafficker’s power and it limits the child’s access to justice and relevant assistance.

xi) A trafficked child’s privacy should always be protected and details that might reveal the child’s identity should not be made available to the public except in exceptional circumstances that will lead to securing the child’s well-being.

xii) Victim identification should not take place at the location of exploitation or where the child was found because it has potential to exacerbate trauma.

xiii) On-going training for social workers in child protection is essential towards facilitating early intervention and in keeping up with trafficking trends. Follow up technical assistance ensures that social workers translate training into practice.

ix) Child victims can be instrumental in helping social workers identify other victims, target intervention areas and to create effective intervention programmes.
x) Identification should always lead to service provision.

Recommended Flow Chart For Identifying Child Victims Of Trafficking
i) The social worker should establish a rapid, clear process for referring child victims.

ii) Measures to establish effective referral procedures for appropriate and timely referral should be established.

iii) Referral mechanisms should have a balanced coordination, monitoring and follow up system.

iv) Information obtained from one interview should be made available to other trusted, responsible service providers who need this information, with due regard to child rights principles of privacy and confidentiality.

v) Multi-disciplinary trafficking task teams and coalitions can be a valuable source of information for the social workers.

vi) The community is the largest single source of potential intelligence. Therefore, community policing and partnerships should be encouraged because early warning signs can be readily observed and reported.

vii) Time-sensitive approach should be adopted when gathering information from trafficked children. In this way, trauma is minimized and they can be referred to receive the necessary services on time.

viii) Referral should only be made to a trusted and responsible service provider.

ix) An appropriate referral made in a timely manner has potential to benefit the child and make both the victim and service provider feel empowered, well informed and secure.

x) The agency making the referral should establish which documentation to send to the agency receiving the victim. The information should be limited to what is required for effective care and the victim should have consented to that information being shared.

xi) Security precautions should be observed and the child victims’ privacy should be respected when referral information is exchanged or transferred.

xii) Partnerships are crucial in comprehensively addressing child victims’ multiple needs.

xiii) A child victim’s informed decision not to be referred to a service provider should be respected. Their sense of agency can be strengthened through sharing relevant information with them.

xiv) The perceived immediate needs of the trafficked victim should be prioritized during referral.

xv) Risk assessment addressing the individual risks to the child, strategic or operational risks to service delivery organizations should be conducted prior to making a referral.
“It is a law of life that problems arise when conditions are there for their solution.”

WALTER SISULU
6.1 Guidelines For Social Work Assessment

i) Initial assessment ascertains the needs and circumstances of the child. Assistance and support should be provided as soon as there are reasonable grounds to believe that the child is in need of care and protection.

ii) The child's trafficking situation and immigration status should not undermine their status as a child and their related rights to special protection.

iii) Prior to the assessment, the social worker should inquire whether other interviews have already been conducted by any person or agency.

iv) The best interest determination should be carried out for every trafficked child and procedural safeguards established and put into place.

v) Assessments should be carried out in safe and child-friendly settings by registered social workers who have specialized training.

vi) A trafficked child should be presumed to be a child and given the necessary care and protection in cases of uncertainty about the child's age.

vii) If returning the child to his/her home of origin is not in the child's best interest, appropriate care and assistance plans, which respect the child's rights and dignity, should be established.

viii) Any assessment conducted with a trafficked child should be developmental in nature and should be reviewed and updated regularly taking into account the child's changing circumstances.

ix) Risk and security assessment should be an on-going activity to ensure that any decisions taken do not place the trafficked child in a situation of foreseeable risk.

x) The child victim should be assessed for any psycho-emotional instability which might make them harm themselves or other people, or carry out any illegal actions as a consequence of the trafficking experience.

xi) The trafficked child should be allowed to have a transitional object during assessments if they want to.

xii) The fragile psycho-emotional state exhibited by the child victim as a consequence of trafficking might obscure a complete assessment being completed in one session.

xiii) Child-friendly tools, methods and techniques of assessments should be used, taking consideration of the child's age, gender and literacy levels.

xiv) The child victims should be given time to ask questions or clarify elements that they might not understand during the assessment. In case the child gets emotionally distressed, the assessment should be stopped and continued at a later stage.

xv) Assessments should lead to assistance provision.
6.2 Guidelines For Immediate Care And Protection Of The Child

i) Trafficked children should have access to accommodation, counseling, recreation, legal advice, medical, psychological and other material assistance according to age, gender and cultural orientation.

ii) A “90-day reflection period” should be provided to child victims, taking into consideration their level of vulnerability and developmental capabilities and it should not be used to compel victims to be witnesses or co-operate with trafficking investigations.

iii) Assistance should be non-coercive and provided based on victim’s informed consent, where applicable, and taking into account special needs of children, who are considered to be more vulnerable.

iv) Basic immediate assistance should be provided irrespective of whether the child victim agrees to co-operate in the investigation and prosecution of the trafficker(s).

v) Assistance should be provided in a non-discriminatory manner, consistent with the international, regional and local recognized principles of non-discrimination.

vi) Translation and interpretation services should be made available to child victims, who do not speak any of the South African languages throughout the assistance provision process.

vii) Assistance and support provided to a trafficked child should be appropriate to the child’s age, gender, ethnic/ cultural identity and any other special needs that specific child might have.

viii) Education needs of the trafficked child should not be postponed to such a time when a durable solution is decided upon and implemented.

ix) Provision of new clothing for a trafficked child can have deep symbolic value of shedding the past and starting a new journey of healing.

x) Service provision to child victims is complex and is often linked with pre-existing socio-economic and cultural vulnerabilities anchored in gender and other structural inequalities.

xi) Child victims should be protected from media attention, exploitative research, stigma from family and community members and from threats or any acts of intimidation from traffickers and their associates.

xii) The security protocol established in a place of safety should not make the child feel as if they are being detained or punished. Children should be supervised and monitored in a manner that still gives them a sense of privacy, safety and normalcy.

xiii) Family tracing should establish the appropriateness of reunification, and risk assessment should be conducted prior in order to establish if the child’s return will be in their best interest.

xiv) Child victims should be given similar opportunities and support like other children in the community to avoid the child running back to the trafficker and to avoid stigma, jealousy and anger from the community.

xv) Child victims should be provided with information on what is going to happen next, how the activity will be conducted, who will facilitate it and what the child should expect.

6.3 Guidelines For Statutory Intervention

i) Mandatory reporting of suspicion of child trafficking based on reasonable grounds is expected from social service professions, social workers as well as from” homepaths, dentists, immigration officials, labour inspectors, minister of religion, nurse, occupational therapist, teachers, mid-wives, speech therapists, psychologists, traditional health practitioners, traditional leaders and legal practitioners.

ii) Trafficked children should be given accurate information from the first contact that they have with a competent service provider, without unnecessary delay(s).
iii) Only a social worker and/or the police have authority to remove children from exploitative trafficking situations without a court order.

iv) After removal, a trafficked child should be admitted to a place of safety pending further investigations. An initial assessment will be made by a social worker and (s)he should notify the clerk of the Children's Court and the child's parents/caregivers about the removal within 24 hours.

v) Forensic interviews gathered should ensure that information is provided freely by the child, the data should be recorded accurately and what the child narrates must not be influenced by the social worker or anyone present during the session.

vi) Legal counseling should be provided to the child victims, and their legal rights explained to them in a language that they can understand.

vii) Trafficked children should have access to legal assistance and should be provided with the various options pertaining to legal remedies available.

viii) A guardian should be appointed for each trafficked child to ensure that the child's best interests are upheld and respected at all times and especially in cases where there is a conflict of interest between the child and his/her parents/caregivers.

ix) Trafficked children should not be returned to their countries of origin or resettled in a third country where they will be at risk of prosecution, torture or re-trafficking.

x) Trafficked children can receive international protection in South Africa and they have a right to seek asylum and should be helped by a social worker to access asylum procedures, irrespective of their means and date of entry into South Africa.

xi) A trafficked child is not a migration criminal but a child in need of care and protection, and should therefore be protected from summary deportations.

xii) The safety of the trafficked child, and his/her family should be taken into consideration in all decisions regarding repatriation and return.

xiii) The voluntary and informed return of a child victim to their country of origin, should take place with due regard for their rights, safety and dignity.

xiv) The child should only be returned to their country of origin if they will be provided with the assistance that is necessary for their well-being, which can facilitate their social integration and prevent their marginalization, stigmatization and re-trafficking.

xv) Legal processes are tough for child victims of trafficking and they should be provided with the necessary preparation, support and care during court proceedings.

6.4 Guidelines For Initial Trauma Assistance
i) A trafficked child's sense of safety, power and control over decisions and events need to be restored before any counseling is done.

ii) Containment and debriefing that is provided should be child-friendly, culturally and language appropriate, age and gender sensitive.

iii) Child victims should always be protected from victimization and re-traumatization.

iv) Social workers must be aware that in as much as naming of trafficking is a vital process for recovery, talking about and narrating traumatic experiences emanating from trafficking can be initially difficult for a child victim.

v) The social worker can establish rapport and build trust by initially doing (fun) things which the child is familiar with and talking about things which are not related to trafficking. Keep the atmosphere simple, informal and child-friendly.
vi) Trafficked children's reaction to and symptoms associated with trauma will depend on the child's age, the child's cultural background, period, type and level of exploitation, and who the trafficker was.

vii) Disempowerment and disconnection are core fragmented experiences that a trafficked child might face and recovery entails empowering and helping the child create new connections and or re-establishing trustworthy relationships from the child's past.

viii) The child victims should be allowed to tell their story in as much depth as possible and in whichever way they feel comfortable with their life story telling.

ix) The reconstruction of the child's narrative allows for it to be integrated in the child's life. Social workers exploration of the meaning(s) attached to a child's narrative is invaluable.

x) Direct contact between the trafficked child and the trafficker(s) should be avoided at all times and the child should never be assisted with their trauma in the presence of someone who exploited him/her.

xi) Social workers should be guided by the “do no harm” principle.

xii) The social worker should make sure that the child victim understands the terminology being used in the debriefing session(s).

xiii) Social workers should be aware that the child victim might not so readily reveal information about trauma and its related experiences. However, this does not necessarily mean that the trauma, hurt, abuse and/ or exploitation did not occur.

xiv) Social workers should acknowledge the child victim for being brave enough and thank the child for trusting them and sharing information. The child should feel safe, confident and supported at all times.

xv) Child victims can recover from trauma with social support from peers and social workers should help nurture these relationships. However, social workers must also acknowledge that some child victims find it difficult to function and they might require more long term expert psychological assistance.

6.5 Guidelines Towards A Social Work Healing Relationship
i) Trafficked children may be reluctant to ask for assistance, but this does not mean that they do not want to participate in their healing process. They still have a right to express their views and have them taken into account.

ii) A trafficked child's lack of trust can be understood as a functional coping or survival mechanism for dealing with multiple changes, traumatic losses, uncomfortable questions, high emotional distress levels, betrayal of trust and other challenges that they come across.

iii) The social worker has an intellectual and a relational role which fosters insight and connections. (S)he soothes, smooth's things out, strengthens the trafficked child's resilience and builds the child's trafficking knowledge and life skills.

iv) When children are treated with respect, it creates in them a sense of trust and security and they are able to feel empowered and in control of their lives.

v) The social worker should be aware that language barriers make it difficult for a child victim to relate their problems and concerns and it might result in the child being misunderstood or misdiagnosed. Interpretation services should be made available.

vi) The child victims’ vulnerability does not end when they are rescued, but events such lack of access to services, inappropriate referrals and not believing the children's stories can maintain and increase these vulnerability levels.

vii) Child trafficking is gender-neutral and social workers should embrace non-discriminative approaches to assist child get out of the assistance provision shadows.

viii) Children's active participation makes the child victims feel a sense of ownership, trust and they are more likely to stick to the therapeutic plan and engage with civil proceedings. Children's voices and stories should be heard and listened to.
ix) Therapeutic justice should be encouraged as a framework that speaks to the child’s pain, humanization of legal processes and where fairness and justice are maintained.

x) Child trafficking calls for immediate reaction because the longer a social worker takes to respond to the crisis, the more the child’s recovery process will be impacted upon.

xi) Social workers should show passion and commitment when engaging with child victims because the child’s healing is highly dictated upon by the child-social worker relationships. This relationship builds on the child’s sense of belonging, resilience, identity and continuity of their life story.

xii) Social workers should acknowledge that they cannot respond to all needs that trafficked children have. Therefore partnerships become vital for referral of cases.

xiii) Social workers should be guided by the SACSSP social work ethical principles and code of conduct when intervening with trafficked children and the narratives that they bring with them.

xiv) The complex, sensational and ever-changing nature of child trafficking requires a social worker to be patient, knowledgeable, and skilled in other fields such as migration, child development, trauma and policy.

xv) Social workers should be aware of transference, counter-transference, vicarious trauma and potential safety risks that they might be exposed to when intervening in a child trafficking situation and they should seek help when necessary.
Childhood is a carefree period full of fun, exploration and discovery. Child trafficking is a harms children and violates their rights. Trafficked children can become invisible as a result of violations of their rights to protection, care and development. Although safeguarding children is everyone’s responsibility, child protection has been largely seen as a social work issue. This guideline document is a practical tool for social workers who protect and assist child victims of trafficking.

It acknowledges that trafficked children’s double vulnerability means that they should be given special protection during identification, referral and assistance provision. In as much as it might be a struggle to provide all trafficked children with the opportunities, services and assistance outlined, providing high quality social work assistance has been identified as a critical issue worth pursuing. Every child deserves a childhood and to live freely without fear of being exploited. Indeed, there are many causes worth fighting for, but one of the most important causes in the society is the care, protection and well-being of children.
### IMPORTANT CONTACTS
Adapted from UNODC (2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICE</th>
<th>CONTACT DETAILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Counter-Trafficking Organizations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Telephone Hotlines</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Child-services hotline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Counter-trafficking hotline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shelters</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Children’s place of safety</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Migrant/ refugee shelter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health Services</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Reproductive health services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Drug rehabilitation Centre</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Hospital/ district surgeon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mental Health</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Social worker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Psychologist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Counsellor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NGO/CSO</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Human rights organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Child rights organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Refugee/ migrant services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Religious/ community-based services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Legal services/ legal aid clinic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Law Enforcement Services</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Nearest SAPS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Human trafficking desk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Children’s services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) TiP provincial task team</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Government</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) Department of Home Affairs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Department of Social Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Department of Labour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Department of Justice/NPA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embassy/ Consular Offices</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i) International Organization for Migration (IOM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) International Labour Organization (ILO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) UN Children's Fund (UNICEF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v) UN Office for Drugs and Crime (UNODC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vi) International Social Services (ISS)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NGO's In Other Countries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpreters (Likely Languages)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“The happiness and welfare of the children, at once the most vulnerable citizens in any society and the greatest of our treasures. The children must, at last, play in the open veld, no longer tortured by the pangs of hunger or ravaged by disease or threatened with the scourge of ignorance, molestation and abuse, and no longer required to engage in deeds whose gravity exceeds the demands of their tender years”

NELSON MANDELA

Nobel Lecture